

CI-08/CONF.202/6.
27 February 2008
Original: English

INTERNATIONAL
PROGRAMME FOR THE
DEVELOPMENT OF
COMMUNICATION

EVALUATION REPORTS
ON THE PROJECTS SELECTED
BY THE IPDC BUREAU

INTERGOVERNMENTAL COUNCIL OF THE IPDC
Twenty-sixth session



UNESCO HEADQUARTERS, PARIS
26 - 28 MARCH 2008

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PROJECT N°	PROJECT TITLE	Page
		ASIA AND THE PACIFIC	
		NEPAL	5
1.	PDC/5NEP/19	COMMUNITY RADIO	
2.	PDC/15NEP/01	RADIO SAGARMATHA	
3.	PDC/19NEP/01	MADAN POKHARA COMMUNITY RADIO	
4.	PDC/20NEP/01	STRENGTHENING PLURALISTIC AND INDEPENDENT MEDIA IN NEPAL	
5.	PDC/49NEP/01	CONSOLIDATION OF THE COMMUNITY RADIO MOVEMENT	
		ARAB REGION	
		PALESTINE	28
6.	PDC/48 PAL/01	PALESTINE: LITERARY AUDIO LIBRARY FOR RADIO, EDUCATION AND THE BLIND PERSONS	
7.	PDC/48 PAL/02	PALESTINE: STUDIO FOR CHILDREN'S PROGRAMMES AT THE PALESTINIAN BROADCASTING CORPORATION (PBC)	
8.	PDC/48 PAL/03	PALESTINE: EMPOWERING THE MEDIA SECTOR IN HEBRON	
9.	PDC/49 PAL/02	PALESTINE: GIVING WOMEN A VOICE	
		LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN	
		GUATEMALA	78
10.	PDC/49 GUA/01	CREATION OF A MAYAN COMMUNICATION NETWORK - REFCOMAYA	
11.	PDC/48 GUA/02	TRAINING JOURNALISTS IN FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION AND INDIGENOUS RIGHTS	

Nepal

Report on IPDC community radio projects in Nepal

The aim of this report is to assess the contribution of the International Programme for the Development of Communication (IPDC), to the evolution of community radio in Nepal since the early 1990s. The report deals with four separate IPDC projects over the course of some 15 years. The focus is on the cumulative impact of IPDC work in Nepal rather than individual projects. It therefore deviates somewhat from the standard IPDC evaluation format. While it maintains roughly the same categories of reporting, there is a stronger focus on objectives and impact than on implementation of different projects, the earliest of which date back to the mid-1990s. The report first presents an Executive Summary focusing on key findings as they relate to IPDC objectives. It then examines projects individually in terms of expected results achieved and more generally, outcomes. Finally, it presents major conclusions and recommendations. The Executive Summary of the UNESCO study associated with this report entitled: *Ten years on: The state of community radio in Nepal*¹, is included as Annex 1.

¹ Pringle and Subba (2007) *Ten years on: The state of community radio in Nepal*. An unpublished report made to UNESCO New Delhi

Executive Summary

Nepal's mountainous geography, its lack of infrastructure and low rates of literacy underscore the critical importance of radio as a vehicle for information and communication.

UNESCO and IPDC have long played a catalytic role in the development of independent radio in this country. In spite of a protracted civil conflict that witnessed severe limits on press freedom and other basic rights, Nepal remains one of the most vibrant and resilient media environments in the region, not least for its remarkable experience in community radio.

IPDC support to community radio has been a strategic, defining factor in the growth of the sector. The Programme has regularly supported small, distinct projects which catalysed the growth of the sector at different times by promoting replicable models, establishing precedents and benchmarks, and building the capacity of key organizational players.

Between 1993 and 1997, IPDC played a key role in the establishment of the country's first independent broadcaster, Radio Sagarmatha. In 1999, the Programme was instrumental in setting up Nepal's first rural radio licensee, Community Radio Madanpokhara. In 2002, IPDC provided critical support to Radio Lumbini, the region's first cooperative broadcaster, and Radio Swargadwari, a station in heart of the country's armed conflict. In 2006, IPDC supported the Association of Community Radio Broadcasters in a broad, sector-wise initiative.

Early on, IPDC succeeded in placing media development squarely within the national development agenda. IPDC and UNESCO have conferred a strong sense of legitimacy to the movement for independent and community radio in Nepal, particularly in its early days and subsequently during the period of civil conflict when media operations were extremely difficult to maintain and press freedoms were severely restricted. The association with IPDC has, over the years, encouraged other agencies and donors to support the growth of community radio in Nepal, including Canada, Denmark, the Netherlands and the USA.

IPDC engaged local groups at a critical time in the country's development and was the first international agency to put its weight behind community radio. The establishment of specific stations, supported by IPDC, was interwoven with the growth and development of Nepal's overall media system. The initial project implementers continue to be at the forefront of the movement's growth in Nepal. Radio stations supported by the Programme - Sagarmatha, Madanpokhara and Lumbini - are internationally recognized and the models they offered - for better and for worse - have been widely replicated. Although the sector in Nepal faces many challenges, the IPDC approach of relatively small projects, each building on the outcomes of previous projects and addressing current sectorial needs has contributed to the gradual build up of national capacity - both of individual stations as well as national organizations and associations - which offers Nepal the best possible chance in facing current and future challenges.

Descriptive Summary

IPDC has supported five major community radio projects in Nepal, four since 1990 when the country promulgated a new constitution that acknowledged freedom of expression and thereby set the stage for the first community radio license, which was finally issued in 1997.

1. IPDC projects in Nepal

1. Title: *Community Radio*

- a. Period: 1985-1987

2. Title: *Radio Sagarmatha*

- a. Project number: PDC/15 NEP/01
- b. Period: 1995-1997
- c. Assistance sought: US\$ 117 000
- d. Assistance received: US\$ 60 000
- e. Agency: Nepal Federation of Environmental Journalists
- f. Beneficiary: Radio Sagarmatha

3. Title: *Radio Madanpokhara*

- a. Project number: PDC/19/NEP/01
- b. Period: 1999-2000
- c. Assistance sought: US\$ 29 700
- d. Assistance received: US\$ 29 000
- e. Agency: Radio Sagarmatha / Nepal Federation of Environmental Journalists
- f. Beneficiary: Community Radio Madanpokhara

4. Title: *Strengthening Pluralistic and Independent Media in Nepal*

- a. Project number: PDC/20/NEP/01
- b. Period: 2000-2002
- c. Assistance sought: US\$ 62 700
- d. Assistance received: US\$ 35 000
- e. Agency: Nepal Press Institute, Radio Sagarmatha
- f. Beneficiaries: Radio Lumbini, Radio Madanpokhara, Radio Sagarmatha, Radio Swargadwari, Nepal Press Institute

5. Title: *Consolidation of Community Radio Movement in Nepal*

- a. Project number: PDC/49/NEP/01
- b. Period: 2006-2007
- c. Assistance sought: US\$ 18 900
- d. Assistance received: US\$ 18 000
- e. Agency: Association of Community Radio Broadcasters of Nepal (ACORAB)
- f. Beneficiaries: ACORAB member radio stations

2. Summary of project objectives

Development objectives

Although presented in different ways, all four project documents elaborate a consistent aim in terms of long-term, development objectives, namely to foster media pluralism and people's participation in socio-economic development through the agency of accessible, public interest media and specifically the expansion of local FM radio.

As a long-term objective, project documents aim, both explicitly and implicitly, for a third 'community' sector of radio broadcasting, independent and active in public interest through its journalism and programming.

Project objectives and expected results

Immediate objectives of individual projects have also been consistent insofar as they aim to build local capacity through the establishment of media facilities, the training of personnel, and through the development of normative tools (models, guidelines, codes of conduct, etc.) for community radio.

The objective of the two projects in the 1990s – Radio Sagarmatha and Radio Madanpokhara – was to establish radio stations by procuring and commissioning necessary radio equipment and training staff. In both cases, the applications aimed explicitly to *pilot* new community radio services: in the case of Radio Sagarmatha, the first independent station in the country, and in the case of the Madanpokhara, the first village-based station (and only the second station to be established) outside the Kathmandu Valley. The focus of these two early projects on developing models is significant in that the target of investment has always been viewed by implementing organizations in terms greater than individual stations; for example, the objectives of the Radio Sagarmatha project also included the creation of a set of guidelines for developing community radio stations across the country.

In line with the development and growth of community radio in Nepal, the 2000-2002 project aimed to strengthen the country's community radio stations through training and strategic equipment support to two new stations. In 2006-7, following a major increase in the number of licensees, IPDC approved a project focused on training and policy development for members of the Association of Community Radio Broadcasters. The objectives of these two latter projects were appropriate in that they reflected the sector's changing needs. By 2002, pilots had been run, there was a growing experience of community radio, with established models being adopted and adapted by new licensees. There were more stations on air, both for-profit and not-for-profit, while training, organizational development and sustainability had emerged as strong challenges. Given the hugely increased number of stations and a greater level of donor support, the move towards policy advocacy and capacity building for multiple stations and eventually the whole sector was strategic.

Assessment

Since the current evaluation looks at the sum of IPDC projects across a 12-year period of UNESCO support to community radio in Nepal – 1995 to 2007 – it makes observations about general trends in objective setting and implementation (rather than an evaluation of individual projects), and looks in more detail at the achievement of expected results and objectives, both immediate and more long-term.

1. Objectives and planning

In general, the objectives of the different projects, as described above, have been appropriately formulated and were in line with priorities salient at the time.

In the case of the first two projects, groundbreaking radio services were established, first in the capital, reaching policy-makers and raising awareness among other stakeholders; and subsequently in a village area, showing up the possibilities to support local and rural development. Given that Nepal had never known any independent radio, this was an essential step in demonstrating feasibility towards the larger goal of establishing community radio nation-wide.

In the case of the latter projects, each addressed the needs of the time, gradually moving away from supporting individual stations towards a more sectorial approach, sharing equipment support among community stations and supporting training workshops that benefited multiple stations and simultaneously strengthened national training providers and networking among a range of broadcasters. Of note is the normative objective of the most recent of the four – to enshrine social responsibility and ethics and promote a consistency of approach, issues which continue to be critical for community radio in Nepal.

2. Observations concerning project implementation

Although each of the projects has generally been successfully implemented, there are several factors that have adversely affected implementation.

In two cases, project implementation reflected the challenge of constructive cooperation among local groups and partners. Nepal's community radio groups, local stations as well as national support organizations, have pockets of excellence; they are motivated, dedicated and increasingly have exceptional skills and experience of community radio. On the other hand, organizational capacity overall is weak in some respects (e.g. management, community ownership), again among both individual stations and national organizations. Management continuity at Radio Sagarmatha and the Nepal Press Institute was a problem in implementing IPDC projects in 1999 and 2002. Radio Madanpokhara leveled strong criticism at NEFEJ and Radio Sagarmatha's handling of the project, including decisions on equipment, training and the timeliness of implementation. Implementation was similarly strained during the penultimate project by the Nepal Press Institute and Radio Sagarmatha, which suffered lengthy delays due to poor cooperation. The capacity of ACORAB as a project implementer is unknown, however the association is young and still laying its organizational foundations.

The lag time between different stages (application, approval and funds availability) of the IPDC process, at times 18 months or more, has caused difficulties for project implementers. In the case of the most recent project, the gap between IPDC approval and actual operationalization of the project was ten months.

Achievement of expected results

The IPDC projects covered by the report have largely succeeded in meeting their main objectives and have at times made significant, even remarkable contributions to the achievement of larger development goals, including pluralism, governance and access to information.

Radio Sagarmatha (1995-1997)

In the case of the Radio Sagarmatha project, the project objective was to make operational an “experimental model” of private community radio with a view to the future development of other stations across the country; to this end the project sought to plan and evaluate guidelines for community radio in Nepal and to train a corps of specialists.

The main output was the establishment of the radio station, including technical set-up and the training of staff. Although the granting of a license and the on-air launch of the station were delayed until May 1997, this was beyond local partners’ control and ultimately the delay strengthened awareness of the station’s mission and support among key national stakeholders as well as allowing a relatively long period of time for training. Within two years of going on air, by virtue of its technical facilities and trained human resources, the station was delivering a unique public service to the Kathmandu Valley. The station is popular and recognized for its public service role among both listeners and policymakers. The calibre of its programme training is high, as evidenced by staff recruitment to international broadcasters like the BBC and Radio Beijing not to mention in Nepal itself.

A clear objective of the project was demonstration of the feasibility and possibilities of community radio. Ten years later, Radio Sagarmatha is still in operation with a wide range of dynamic public affairs and cultural programming. The station has experienced difficulties in fundraising and management, but after more than ten years it continues to meet its challenges. The station has inspired a huge number of groups in starting and operating non-profit, public interest radio stations, not just in Nepal but in other parts of South Asia as well.

Radio Sagarmatha’s greatest success is in journalism and public affairs programming: news, current affairs, editorials and discussion shows. Though faced with the ongoing challenge of sustainability, especially in organizational terms, the station continues to thrive in a highly competitive and increasingly commercially-driven environment.

Most problematic in terms of generally accepted standards of community radio has been the lack of community ownership and input to decision-making and a management approach that relies on paid staff, commercial advertising and donor support, factors that tend to discourage a culture of volunteerism and direct community access and service. Radio Sagarmatha is perhaps better described as local public interest radio rather than ‘community radio’ (although even its public focus is at some risk from a greater market orientation). There is no real community representation or participation in decision-making and, like other mainstream Nepali institutions, Radio Sagarmatha is far from representative on caste or ethnic lines.

The station's strengths (investigative journalism, community orientation and public service programming) and weaknesses (management, community ownership and participation, representation of marginalized groups, etc.) tend to be reflected in many other stations. One key area in which the Radio Sagarmatha project failed was the development of written guidelines for community radio; ten years later there is still a serious lack of normative tools and a vastly expanded sector is now facing serious problems in terms of inconsistent practice of community radio.

Radio Madanpokhara (1999-2000)

The second project, the establishment of Radio Madanpokhara in a rural village area, proved highly successful despite early problems during the implementation period.

Like Sagarmatha before it, the Madanpokhara IPDC project aimed to establish the radio station's facilities and to train its human resources; in the process the project sought to demonstrate the feasibility of community radio in a rural area and to offer a model for stations to follow.

Though the technical set-up and studio design reflected the challenge of working in a village area and the limited experience of the engineer-designers, the station was decisively established and local volunteer staff successfully learned the technical and programme skills needed for a radio service.

The strength of the station's local support base and community network is evident in local financial and in-kind support and in the presence of reporters, listeners' clubs and women's groups in every VDC and municipal ward. They bear witness to its success in providing a tangible and valuable service to the community. However, in spite of a mission to serve poor and marginalized groups, even after seven years, the station has only token representation of women and local ethnic and Dalit groups on the decision-making committee, none in management, and a small minority among the staff and volunteers. Although the station's programme schedule is clearly in the public interest, and the content reflects a progressive approach, the station tends towards paternalism; although indigenous Magars make up as much as 45 percent of the population, broadcasting in Magar language is minimal.

The station has clearly demonstrated the feasibility of community radio that is largely volunteer-driven, clearly non-commercial and firmly supported by local interests. The station has been an important source of inspiration and practical experience in guiding the development of community radio in rural areas. Unfortunately, Madanpokhara, like Sagarmatha before it, has also set poor and unfortunate precedents as a model; both stations have limited democratic organization and community representation.

Strengthening Pluralistic and Independent Media in Nepal (2000-2002)

From the outset, the project Strengthening Pluralistic and Independent Media in Nepal represented compromise among community radio groups in Nepal.

The original application was a combination of proposals made by two organizations, the Nepal Press Institute and Radio Sagarmatha; this compromise was reflected in the variety of objectives and activities proposed: strengthening journalism skills through training and materials development, the establishment of a media award fund, advocacy for a new media law, and direct support to two new community radio stations (Sundarpur in Eastern Nepal and Lumbini FM in Western Nepal). The project also aimed to develop practices and tools that would be useful for other groups seeking to join the FM airwaves.

Along with delays in the delivery of funds, local conditions and realities shifted. The proposed objectives lost their original relevance: Sundarpur, the proposed station in Itahari, Eastern Nepal, failed to obtain a license, and Lumbini, which had a license, was already well established by the start of project implementation. There were significant management changes in both of the proposing organizations that made recasting of the project implementation plan a slow process.

In the end, in order to salvage the project, the activities were re-written to suit the needs and circumstances of the day: capacity building in the form of training, resource materials, and upgraded facilities designed to improve services and prospects for sustainability. The Nepal Press Institute translated the UNESCO Community Radio Handbook and ran a series of training workshops outside Kathmandu in several regions of the country (itself a significant development and precedent); funds intended for the establishment of the Lumbini and Sundarpur stations were divided between radios Lumbini, Madanpokhara, Sagarmatha and Swargadwari as support for equipment purchases.

Ultimately, the reworked project objectives represented a positive direction, towards building the capacity of the sector as a whole and supporting a range of stations, a decentralizing trend that would be continued in the IPDC project that followed. However, there were implementation failures: the translated handbook was sadly never widely distributed and the more normative elements of the original proposal, relating to models and policy advocacy, were essentially dropped.

Consolidation of Community Radio Movement in Nepal (2006-2007)

By focusing specifically on capacity building across the sector and the development of a code of conduct, the fourth IPDC project, approved in 2006, supported an important new phase of community radio development. Significantly, the proposal looked to the sector as a whole, rather than to individual stations, and for the first time focused exclusively on capacity and norms rather than equipment investments. Of particular significance was the choice of implementing organization, the Association of Community Radio Broadcasters (ACORAB), established in 2002. The association is the first democratically representative community radio group, bringing together virtually

all of the country's non-profit radio stations, a significant step forward for a sector characterized by multiple, often competing networks of stations.

The aims of the project were to consolidate the community radio movement through capacity building, networking, and the promotion of ethics, social responsibility and a consistency of approach.

The objectives addressed three key needs of the sector: building capacity, developing normative tools and sector-wide networking. A series of five training workshops were executed, significantly, all outside the Kathmandu Valley; technical workshops were done on a regional basis, and a management workshop was done for stations across the country, both raising the level of interaction among stations.

The project also resulted in a code of conduct, essentially 'dos' and 'don'ts' relating to general community radio broadcasting and operations. It was developed in a largely participatory manner through two sets of discussions with managers. It is intended to be a set of broad guidelines that can be adopted by community radio members. The code mentions basic, guiding principles: human rights, freedom of expression, impartiality, peace; that priority should be given to local languages, culture and development needs; management, operation and control should rest with the community; there should be no political affiliation or bias; elections should be free of conflict and peaceful; community radio should be a platform for all political parties; stations should not broadcast content harmful to health, to certain communities or their values, to the environment, to the nation; content should respect religion and gender.

Although the code of conduct is perhaps more of a statement of principles, than a set of rules on how a station conducts its operations and programming, for example during an election, or how an individual conducts him/herself as a community reporter, etc., there is no doubt that the new ACORAB code of conduct is a positive step forward in terms of guiding stations on suitable practices. It is arguably the first written guideline for community radio broadcasters. The challenge lies in how the code and other new guidelines and policies are implemented at the station level.

Outcomes

The impact of the four projects since 1990 go well beyond the specific outputs achieved in one or two years. In addition to helping establish and strengthen four radio stations, contributing major facilities and staff training, the projects established a profile for community radio, particularly among national policy-makers and international development stakeholders, factors instrumental in the remarkable growth of the sector between 1997 and 2007, from one radio broadcaster to some 90 licensees and 40 stations on air.

Based on the sum of UNESCO support, the Organization is recognized as a 'trailblazer,' in essence an innovator and initiator. Into a radio landscape that had known only Radio Nepal, early IPDC projects were critical in establishing the precedent of non-profit, public and community interest broadcasting, both in the capital and rural areas. The models offered by Sagarmatha, Madanpokhara and Lumbini continue to define the sector in Nepal and beyond. All three stations have helped to set benchmarks of quality

programming.

Cost-effectiveness

The four IPDC projects since 1995 represent a total financial contribution of US\$ 152 000, an average of US\$ 35 500 per project with US\$ 60 000 as the largest contribution and US\$ 18 000 the smallest.

Although IPDC's financial contributions are smaller than other players, the Programme has consistently been involved in key developments, often kick-starting larger programmes subsequently supported by other agencies, both international and local; this has been true specifically in pioneering stations such as Sagarmatha and Madanpokhara; the move to a more sectorial approach emphasizing capacity building; and the importance of national democratically representative bodies taking a lead in developing guidelines and policy.

Considering the outputs and outcomes given the financial contribution, the IPDC approach has been exceptionally cost-effective relative to other international development efforts. Outstanding factors include the Programme's emphasis on locally generated proposals driven by real demand and the existing organizational structures of local implementing partners, the absence of overhead support or contributions to large project infrastructures, as well as the focus on equipment and capacity building rather than operational costs (which has, in turn, served to facilitate local contributions, particularly of human resources, and to mobilize additional partners).

Development impact

Media pluralism

Radio Sagarmatha's blend of independent, non-profit ownership and public interest broadcasting set a benchmark, not only for independent private and community radio in Nepal but also for radio initiatives and media advocates across South Asia. From the outset and to the present day, Radio Sagarmatha has worked to present listeners with a combination of issues and entertainment, social discussions and music, and to offer a conduit for the wide range of voices and opinions that were previously unheard on Nepal's radio channels. The success and popularity of Radio Sagarmatha's innovations in public interest programming, from editorials, news and magazines to local music and cultural programmes, spurred private broadcasters to offer more than popular commercial music and entertainment programmes.

Public participation

Beginning with Radio Sagarmatha, community broadcasting in Nepal has given tens of thousands the opportunity to have their voices and opinions heard in public forums. On a daily basis, the country's community radio stations take listeners into the locations of everyday life as lived by listeners themselves. With one of its major goals to reach policymakers, stations throughout the country reach into the corridors of power, in district and village structures and in national government ministries in Kathmandu.

In some cases, the reach and impact of stations' community network extend well

beyond its programming. Community Radio Madanpokhara has radio representatives (community reporters), radio clubs and women's communication groups in each of the districts' 35 village areas and in the headquarters' municipal wards. The station regularly promotes and facilitates community meetings bringing together all local stakeholders, including government and development agencies representatives, teachers, health workers, etc. Other stations have similar networks of members and listener groups.

Transparency and accountability in governance

Public affairs programming on community radio stations across the country have denounced corruption, questioned the use of public funds and the implementation of public projects. The list of examples is long and spans both national as well as local governance. The success of investigative and 'watchdog' public affairs programmes in contributing to transparency and accountability in governance and decision-making are repeated through Nepal. Following in a strong tradition of 'mission journalism', effectively set for radio by Radio Sagarmatha, virtually every community station has concrete examples of how their programming has exposed issues of weak governance, corruption, ignorant and unrepresentative decision-making in public-community spaces and prompted corrective action.

A good example is Radio Sagarmatha's long running and highly successful programme, *Aja ka Kura* (Today's Talk) that started in 2000. Everyday in evening primetime, the hosts take on major social, economic and political issues affecting Nepali society using a mixture of interviews, round table discussions and listener phone calls. An excerpt from a review of the programme in the weekly Nepali Times newspaper is instructive:

Kiran Pokhrel hosts Radio Sagarmatha's best-known prime time radio talk programme *Aja ka Kura* (Today's Talk). He has talked day-in, day-out, seven days a week about everything under the Nepali sun: the dissolution of parliament, life without local governments, mismanagement of hospitals, vehicle emission standards, the martial rape bill, duped Nepali migrant workers, you name it. It's now come to the point where you're nobody unless you have been grilled by Kiran on *Aja ka Kura*. A list of his interviewees is a who's who of Nepali politics: former prime ministers Surya Bahadur Thapa and Lokendra Bahadur Chand, Communist party boss Madhav Kumar Nepal and dozens of his comrades, hundreds of activists, students, all have been heard. Everyone gets a chance to take pot shots at everyone else, and it doesn't matter if you are a senior minister or a migrant worker: you get equal time. Kiran is completely and passionately submerged in the world of radio, and he says it does not matter that salaries in community radio are not very high. "It is the satisfaction of doing it right, money can't buy you that. And the gratification is knowing that the issues we broadcast influence policy decisions".²

² Extracts from an article published in the weekly English newspaper *Nepali Times*, 16-22 August 2002

Contributions to socio-economic development

Although the approach of community radio in Nepal tends to journalism and public interest advocacy by the media, an important contribution to community access and empowerment has been made by rural, village stations, such as Madanpokhara and Lumbini. The stations' focus is on sharing information, raising awareness and motivating action concerning local development. Programmes include local magazine shows as well as regular programming for women and children.

Only making noise or providing information is not a radio. In order to transform society, there must be an organisational and social network. Social mobilization, campaigning, supporting social movements: this is community radio! Radio is the means to realize community development³.

In a good example of how local community radio can take on local issues in a highly concrete fashion, in August 2005, with technical and financial assistance from UNESCO, Madanpokhara began an innovative new educational programme, *Haamro Pathshala* (Our Classroom). The programme is produced by local schoolteachers and provides supplement lessons in subjects that the majority of Palpa students fail: science, mathematics and English. The programme aims to increase the pass percentage from the present dismal rate of 26.43% through weekly tuition by top teachers in the district. Similar programmes have been started by community and commercial stations across the country.

Conclusions and recommendations

1. Locally appropriate development

IPDC has played an important role in realizing a strong sense of local ownership over its community radio. From the outset, the drivers of the movement in Nepal have been local groups and organizations, both at the national and local level. The real growth of the sector is due first and foremost to the commitment, determination and creativity of community radio advocates and practitioners, who collectively have shown a remarkable ability to conceptualise and execute activities relating to media pluralism and journalism.

Perhaps IPDC's most significant contribution has been in focusing and building this local capacity and allowing it to remain naturally at the centre of the sector's growth, which has been gradual, organic and, perhaps most importantly, sustained.

³ Som Nath Aryal (Station Coordinator, Community Radio Madanpokhara); interview: 21 July 2007

IPDC's approach has been highly appropriate in the Nepali context for several reasons:

The Programme's financial contributions are manageable for small organizations with limited administrative and organizational capacity.

IPDC projects are generally implemented by local organizations within their existing organizational and human resource frameworks; in other words, they do not require large additional project staff or infrastructure, which are difficult if not impossible to maintain and tend to skew the local playing field by introducing external structures, international salaries, etc.

IPDC projects have specific objectives and tangible outputs, identified by project proponents, which has emphasized concrete results that clearly contribute to media development in the short term.

Along with financial inputs, IPDC projects are accompanied by the technical support of UNESCO Communication and Information Advisors and other experts who are able to support local planning and implementation without skewing the human resources or budgets of local partners.

2. IPDC as catalyst

IPDC's approach has been catalytic, initiating and facilitating major developments at key times. Factors include the Programme's multilateral profile and its function in conferring legitimacy, as well as UNESCO's recognized expertise in the field of community radio. The Organization is identified as both a 'trailblazer,' pioneering new ideas and innovations, as well as the 'guardian' of accepted community radio principles and practices, a function which has enormous importance at this stage in the sector's development in Nepal.

Growth is impressive and there is a certain maturity to the sector, major challenges notwithstanding. Community radio has gone from one license in 1997 to nearly 90 at the end of 2007. There are multiple networks, a half dozen independent content production groups, distribution systems using satellite and the Internet, as well as a national support and a member-based association of stations.

The IPDC stamp with its multilateral, intergovernmental backing has legitimised the community radio project in Nepal, contributing directly to the government's initial, reluctant agreement and its growing recognition of community radio as a development tool. IPDC's endorsement has also encouraged bilateral support, from donors like DANIDA that have worked with UNESCO in other countries, as well as agencies that have no in-country presence, such as the Communication Assistance Foundation (Netherlands) and the World Association for Christian Communication. The Programme's small project approach, involving short implementation periods and modest financial inputs, has both necessitated and facilitated other donors' involvement.

3. Multilateral support

IPDC's contributions are recognized and respected for their non-partisan, multilateral character. This was particularly important during the long gestation period for the first license in the mid-1990s and during the protracted civil conflict. UNESCO is valued by government and community radio groups as an unbiased source concerning best practices of community from the South Asia region and internationally.

4. Human rights and development goals

With clear goals and objectives of its own, IPDC has effectively promoted a progressive, development-oriented approach to media and its growth and expansion in Nepal. The Programme is known to support public interest media development, explicitly linked to human rights, cultural diversity, education, equity, and participatory development and governance. The role of media in addressing fundamental rights to information and expression must continue to be a core development objective of both IPDC projects and the programme itself.

5. Continuity

Distinctive among international programmes for its emphasis on community media, one of IPDC's basic strengths has been its consistent presence and support for community radio in Nepal. There is a strong awareness of IPDC projects and a clear sense that UNESCO has taken a strategic sectorial approach that has consistently contributed to community radio's development. The Programme has assisted step-by-step and piece-by-piece in facilitating general consensus and a national community radio programme of sorts.

6. Documentation

Nepal's community radio has great potential to further contribute to development and good governance in the country. With more than ten years of experience, Nepal is already a good source of instructive experiences and practices. More resources need to be devoted to research and documentation, particularly the impact of programme content. Though perhaps not the role of IPDC, the Programme should at least ensure serious monitoring and evaluation of its own approved projects and encourage other players to take up the task of in-depth research. A study of how community and other radios functioned during the civil conflict would be useful as would investigation into political influence and the social capital of volunteerism. There are also excellent training and other resource materials in Nepali which UNESCO should consider for translation into English and other relevant languages.

7. Community radio principles and practices

There was a strong sense among informants to the study that external agencies must hold project implementers and beneficiary organizations accountable to the principles generally associated with community radio, and that UNESCO among other agencies has not always succeeded in this regard. The strongest and most felt criticism came from representatives of indigenous and marginalized caste groups, who point to not only the widespread failure of community stations to provide anything close to proportional representation of their communities⁴ in terms of ownership, management and staffing, or content, but the compounding failure of the supporting agencies to address the issue.

UNESCO has for some time observed a worrisome trend that even community radios have a tendency to empower the already empowered in a local area. With 'community media' as one of its major areas, IPDC should actively consider ways to ensure that community radio groups are truly representative and that they directly serve and empower marginalized groups.

⁴ In the case of one well-established community radio, of 17 members of the station's management committee, two are Janjati (indigenous) and one is Dalit (traditionally 'low' caste), compared with some estimates which place the Janjati and Dalit communities at 50-60% of the district population. As with other community radio stations, the degree of imbalance is particularly remarkable given stations' espoused mandate to represent these communities and to fight exclusion of marginalized groups.

Recommendations

1. Ongoing investment in Nepal

Given the evident success of IPDC's support to community radio in Nepal and the catalytic role of Nepal's experiences in other parts of the region and internationally, IPDC should encourage future applications from Nepal. UNESCO should pay special attention to community radio in Nepal, particularly what can be learned of its experiences. Consideration should also be given to larger projects, including extra-budgetary ones, provided they are driven by local stakeholders and remain essentially local projects.

2. Engagement in the sector

UNESCO should consider the often-limited capacity of project implementing agencies and should consequently take a more stimulating role in planning, monitoring and evaluating projects. UNESCO needs to know the sector and the players in it. In many projects, competent and professional partners are called upon by IPDC and other UNESCO projects to go beyond their current expertise in order to innovate, run pilots and develop models. Local partners rarely request technical assistance for project planning execution. Closer monitoring and greater engagement by UNESCO would help local partners to avoid unhealthy competition. Active engagement with proponents during the application process is important since UNESCO support can often be seen to confer legitimacy on an organization or a project. In the case of projects that are approved with less funding than requested, efforts should be made to ensure that project documents are properly revised and that normative and capacity building elements are summarily dropped.

3. Sectorial approach

Given the increasing number of community radio stations and the sector's relative maturity, IPDC should follow its strategic approach and focus on projects in which the primary benefits are sectorial rather than individual. Exceptions are projects deemed to be of unique importance, for example new stations in remote areas or pilots to demonstrate innovation. The innovations tested should be significant to the sector overall and the project outputs should be focused on replication, e.g. documentation, training modules, etc.

4. Policy advocacy

UNESCO is in a unique position to raise awareness of community radio and to advocate for its development with government, civil society and with international agencies. A special attention should be given to UNESCO's role as a guardian of accepted principles of community radio, such as community representation in content, management, staffing, and ownership. Refer to the

associated study report on community radio in Nepal for a more detailed discussion of policy needs.

5. Promoting community radio principles and practices

UNESCO should help project implementers to localize a set of basic principles of community radio by sharing sample policies and guidelines that would assist stations to realize these principles in their day-to-day operations.

Assessment of IPDC applications in future should consider the failure of community radios to adequately represent women, indigenous and Dalit groups, the lack of democratic ownership over community radios and the controversy over locally versus centrally produced content.

6. Trail blaze

IPDC should continue to be a 'trailblazer' and a catalyst by supporting new ideas and innovative practices, for example the ongoing integration of new technologies such as the Internet and mobile phones with community radio (for which there are good, relatively well-documented examples to be found in community multimedia centre pilots at Lumbini, Madanpokhara and Tansen).

Methodology of the study

Research for the report was undertaken as part of a larger study for UNESCO concerning the current state of community radio in the country; in-country research was done in July of 2007; the study findings were finalized and submitted to UNESCO New Delhi in November 2007.

The aim of the study was to assess the situation of community radio and make recommendations to UNESCO concerning the future of the sector, including the Organization's own role.

The study applied three main methods – literature review, including policies and regulations, existing studies, and articles, interviews with key stakeholders across public, private and non-governmental sectors, field observations and interviews with local stakeholders and station personnel. The study team consisted of one external and one local researcher. The team visited five communities⁵ and four commercial broadcasters⁶ representing a reasonable cross-section in terms of size, mandate, and geographic location; and including three of four stations supported by IPDC. Although the study would have benefited from a larger cross section of stations – for example newer stations and those in more remote areas of the Mid- and Far-Western regions of the country – time and resources did not allow for extensive field research or visits to stations in remote locations.

⁵ Radio Lumbini in Rupandehi District, Community Radio Madanpokhara and Radio Muktinath in Palpa, Radio Palung in Makawanpur and Radio Sagarmatha in Lalitpur

⁶ Nepal FM in Lalitpur District, Shreenagar FM and Radio Paschimanchal in Palpa, and Tinau FM in Rupandehi.

Annex 1: Executive summary of the report entitled: *Ten years on: The state of community radio in Nepal (2007)*

Community radio in Nepal

The remarkable growth of community radio in Nepal is significant, both in the national context – a country of isolated, mountainous geography, poverty and under-development and a recent, protracted civil war – and in Asia Pacific, where no country has witnessed comparable growth of community radio.

Alongside exceptional practices in programming, innovative strategies for sustainability and sophisticated examples of networking, there is considerable cause for concern in the unplanned and unmanaged growth of the sector, in the inconsistent application of community radio principles and in increasing commercialisation and politicisation among so-called community radio broadcasters.

Background to this study

Given its long-standing interest in community radio in Nepal and internationally, in mid-2007 UNESCO commissioned a study of the current state of community radio in the country. The aim of the study was to assess the current situation, including directions and trends, and to make recommendations to UNESCO concerning the future of the sector, including the Organization's own role. This summary presents a synopsis of the main findings and recommendations to key stakeholder groups in Nepal.

K E Y F I N D I N G S :
C U R R E N T S T A T U S O F
C O M M U N I T Y R A D I O

There is enormous potential for the expanding community radio sector to contribute directly to addressing Nepal's short- and long-term needs, in particular the transformation of the political system, socio-economic development, greater social inclusion, and the imperatives of improving education, health and governance.

1. There has been remarkable growth in both private and non-for-profit radio in Nepal since 1997: 216 licenses had been issued as of July 2007 with 78 FM stations broadcasting; of 93 licenses issued to non-profit groups, 31 were operational as of May 2007.
2. To its detriment, the FM radio sector has and continues to be largely unplanned and unmanaged. There is technical congestion in the capital region and high redundancy of licensed services, even in some rural areas; there are major policy gaps and limited means to ensure accountability of broadcasters. The current system of regulation does little to promote a diversity of services or to ensure that broadcasters meet public needs or address national development priorities.

3. The application and practice of community radio principles is remarkably inconsistent. Many stations are community radios in name only. Community radio in Nepal is poorly defined and there is no policy framework to guide the development of the sector. Of particular concern are issues of limited ownership, 'capture' by the elite, poor representation of community groups, particularly on gender, caste and ethnic lines. There is a risk that community orientation and the focus on public interest programming will be weakened.
4. In spite of gaps, Nepal's community radio sector possesses a certain maturity and sophistication. There are a large number of stations, increasingly coordinated. There are excellent practices in programming and community participation, many of which are being replicated. There are resource centres and support organizations with high capacity, both private and non-profit. There is an active national association of community stations.
5. There are good examples of networking among radio stations in Nepal, including content sharing, programme distribution, national and sub-national training workshops and exchange of information among stations. Although this aspect of the sector is a major asset, it needs to be carefully managed.
6. There is an encouraging degree of partnership and social collaboration among different groups and sectors in Nepal, particularly in regard to networking; however there are important gaps in terms of awareness among and partnership with government and civil society.
7. The development of community radio has been effectively supported by external agencies and funds, representing a positive local-international partnership. Local forces have generally driven community radio development in Nepal with international agencies and donors in a supporting role, providing for capital investment and helping to develop both local and national capacities. Donors must continue to engage actively in the sector in order to ensure that community radio principles such as representation and local content are respected.
8. Despite a no-mortality rate among community stations, long-term sustainability remains a challenge. Community radios need to develop the social capital they derive from being active 'community' organizations and agents of local development; however many stations are falling into the trap of competing for advertising in small markets.
9. There is a serious lack of management structures and strategic planning; management tends to be spontaneous and *ad hoc*, missing out on existing management experience and resources; there is widespread under-representation of ethnic and caste groups in policy- and decision-making.
10. Community radio stations in Nepal have made effective use of new digital technologies to improve radio programming and operations; of particular note are the use of computers for digital production, satellites for programme distribution, and the Internet for information sourcing.

K E Y F I N D I N G S :
D I R E C T I O N S A N D
T R E N D S

11. As the number of stations, both commercial and community, has expanded, both real and perceived competition have increased, driving stations towards greater market orientation, higher power transmitters and, as a result, higher budgets. At risk are traditional community radio principles and practices, for example, the focus on local content, the value of non-commercial sources of revenue, interactivity, volunteerism and community access, particularly by poor and marginalized groups.
12. There is serious concern that in the current phase of radio growth (concurrent with a critical time in the country's socio-political development) political parties will begin or have already started to exercise more overt influence over FM stations. A clear example is the advent of 'Maoist' stations and a risk that this development will tip the balance among FM stations from affiliation to influence and that increasing competition, both among radio stations and among political parties that influence stations, will ratchet up the politicisation of broadcasting.
13. Syndicated programming, mostly developed by a handful of production houses in Kathmandu and financed by donor funds, now constitutes a significant percentage of community radio programming across the country. Its rise has been facilitated by new distribution technologies, especially satellite. Although this type of programming represents an asset to the sector in terms of quality, access to knowledge and the diffusion and exchange of information and opinion between local and national perspectives, there is a risk that syndicated programming displaces local content and that a major part of its appeal is seen as a source of funding.

K E Y
R E C O M M E N D A T I O N S

The report's main recommendations address the development of a framework of policy. The most fundamental issues for community radio in Nepal are the lack of clear direction and the absence of guidelines for the development of the sector. The situation is acute given the number of new stations.

A. To the Government of Nepal

- Implement recommendations of the High-level Media Commission report (September 2006), in particular the following key points:
 - i. Acknowledgement of the airwaves as public property;
 - ii. The establishment of an independent broadcasting authority;
 - iii. The elaboration of a three tiered system comprising public, private and community broadcasting;
 - iv. Promotion of traditionally under-represented groups, including women, indigenous groups, marginalized castes, people with disabilities, etc;

- v. The need for a clear and transparent licensing process as a key tool in developing a balanced system;
- vi. The need to classify FM stations, including incentives for public and community stations;
- vii. The need to consider broadcasters' contribution to national development.
- Build financial incentives for community radio into new policy frameworks; these should include low license and renewal fees, a full exemption from the payment of royalties or levies, as well as guaranteed inclusion in government advertising contracts.
- Classification of community radio based on:
 - i. Community representation in ownership, management and staffing;
 - ii. Locally relevant programme content.
- Further classification into types of community based on specific criteria, for example:
 - i. Transmission power;
 - ii. Size and geographic spread of target listenership;
 - iii. Degree of remoteness;
 - iv. Number and type of radio services in the local areas, including whether a station is the only FM or community service;
 - v. Type of ownership: cooperative, non-profit organization, local government, educational institution;
 - vi. Approach to programming: proportion and priority of a) community access and volunteerism, b) local news, issues of community/public interest, c) local arts and culture, d) syndicated public interest programming, e) commercial entertainment; f) indigenous languages;
 - vii. Approach to revenue generation: proportion and priority of a) local voluntary contributions (membership, donations, etc.), b) local services (announcements, equipment rental, multimedia services, etc.), c) development contracts, d) commercial advertising and corporate underwriting, e) donor grants.
- Development of means and systems for direct ownership of community radio stations by independent entities rather the current system, which encourages 'proxy' ownership by 'parent' organizations, especially NGOs
- Develop systems to regulate production houses as part of the FM radio sector.

B. To community radio groups

- Community radio groups should increase their efforts to champion community radio as a local tool of national importance. Community radio should be both acknowledged and actively promoted by government and civil society stakeholders alike as a major development platform.
- Community radio advocacy groups need to continue proactive development of policies and guidelines concerning community radio with two key objectives:
 - i. To set standards for community radio stations with model policies to be adopted by broadcasters, and

- ii. To provide government policy-makers with a practical basis for national policy development.
- Proactive development of policies and guidelines should focus on the following areas:
 - i. Ownership of community radio including means of ownership and guidelines on general assemblies, public disclosure, etc.;
 - ii. Proportional community representation in ownership, management and staffing, and content, including indigenous languages;
 - iii. Safeguarding local content;
 - iv. Ensuring editorial independence from political parties;
 - v. Human resources, including guidelines for volunteers;
 - vi. Promoting a holistic approach to sustainability.
- Research key issues to feed policy development and resource materials:
 - i. Volunteerism;
 - ii. Indigenous languages;
 - iii. Diversified income generation.
- Develop a vision and strategic plan for long-term capacity development.
- Address short-term training needs as follows:
 - i. Technical skills and equipment maintenance;
 - ii. Advanced computer skills;
 - iii. Programme development;
 - iv. Management skills and systems;
 - v. Strategic planning, organizational and policy development;
 - vi. Avoiding political bias and broadcasting during elections.

PALESTINE

EVALUATION REPORT

Executive Summary

1. PROJECT TITLE :
Literary Audio Library for Radio, Education and the Blind Persons
2. PROJECT NUMBER :
PDC/48/PAL/01
3. CATEGORY : Radio Broadcasting
4. AGENCY : Birzeit University Media Development Center **BZUMDC**
(formerly the Birzeit University Media Institute **BZUMI**)
- 4.1 BENEFICIARIES:
Radio stations and listeners, school teachers, pupils and blind persons
- 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: Birzeit University Media Development Center **BZUMDC**

Summary/Conclusions

THE OBJECTIVES:

The overall objective of the project has been to contribute to the creation of a strong literary diversity in Palestine so that the general public will perceive life differently and realize that their own culture is rich, and to diversify media content in Palestine by enhancing cultural content for radio stations. Other objectives have been to initiate the establishment of an audio library and provide schools and blind people with an opportunity to listen to excerpts from classical Arabic literature. These objectives have been achieved through the production and distribution of a) a series of radio programs on Arabic literature, including excerpts from major literary works in Arabic, and b) the production and distribution a set of 5 audio CDs containing introductions to and excerpts from major Arabic literary works.

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED:

No major problems were encountered. A slight delay in the recording process was fully justified for reasons of quality.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

BZUMDC could consider producing a similar set of CDs containing more contemporary Arabic and Palestinian literature. BZUMDC could also consider producing a similar set of CDs containing good examples of children's literature from around the world. If future radio series are produced, BZUMDC should ensure that programs are produced in time formats that are suitable for as many radio stations as possible. Perhaps one should also consider developing a regular literary magazine program idea with a radio station that reaches all of Palestine.

EVALUATION REPORT

A DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE :
Literary Audio Library for Radio, Education and the Blind Persons
 2. PROJECT NUMBER :
PDC/48/PAL/01
 3. CATEGORY : Radio Broadcasting
 4. AGENCY : Birzeit University Media Development Center **BZUMDC**
(formerly the Birzeit University Media Institute **BZUMI**)
 - 4.1 BENEFICIARIES:
Radio stations and listeners, school teachers, pupils and blind persons.
 - 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:
Birzeit University Media Development Center **BZUMDC**
-

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES :

- 5.1 ***Overall or development objectives:***
 - to contribute to the creation of a strong literary diversity in Palestine so that the general public will perceive life differently and realize that their own culture is rich.
 - to diversify media content in Palestine by enhancing cultural content for radio stations.
- 5.2 ***Operational or project objectives:***
 - to initiate the setup of an audio library and start the tradition of audio books in Palestine.
 - to provide radio stations with a program series on classical Arabic literature.
 - to provide blind people with a new way to enjoy life and learn about Arabic culture and literature.
 - to provide school teachers and pupils with professionally-produced audio passages from Arabic literature.
- 5.3 ***Results/outputs planned:***
 - a series of radio programs on classic Arabic literature has been produced.
 - a basis for an audio library has been established.
 - blind people in Palestine now have access to high-quality audio recordings of excerpts from classical Arabic literature in CD form.
 - Palestinian schools have proper audio versions of Arabic literary texts.
- 5.4 ***Target groups (beneficiaries):***

Radio stations and listeners, school teachers, pupils and blind persons.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE :

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$33, 470

Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$24, 500

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES :

Other UNESCO sources \$4, 000

Time schedule/project duration: 2005-2006

B ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

The present project's primary purpose has been a) to contribute to the creation of a strong literary diversity in Palestine so that the general public will perceive life differently and realize that their own culture is rich and b) to diversify media content in Palestine by enhancing cultural content for radio stations.

These objectives are sound and in the case of Palestine extremely important. Very few Palestinians on the West Bank or in Gaza read books. This is partly due to the fact that most people cannot afford to buy books, but also because there is still a very strong oral tradition in Palestine, mainly in reciting poetry and story-telling. As Ms. Shifaa' Shekha at the Ministry of Education puts it: "Most people don't read books in Palestine, except in school or if you're born with it." Audio CDs such as the ones produced by this project will awaken people's curiosity and encourage them to read.

Such audio material is especially important for blind people, who for obvious reasons prefer listening to reading. Audio CDs also minimize the cost of Braille production.

Palestine has some 31 radio stations on the West Bank and in Gaza, but none of these stations produce much cultural material, especially when it comes to classical literature. Instead, the stations offer a mix of prayer readings, light entertainment (music) and political propaganda, serving as organs for various political agendas and commercial interests. The radio stations are highly focused on political news, the Israeli occupation and light entertainment. The radio series audio CDs provide the station with cultural material they would otherwise not produce.

In order to build a truly viable nation, there is a definite need to make Palestinians aware of the fact that their national identity is not just a question of political history, occupation and future boundaries, but is also based on a rich and diverse Arab and Palestinian culture.

Short-term objectives :

The project had 4 immediate objectives:

With one exception, these short-term objectives were achieved successfully:

- A series of radio programs on classical Arabic literature were produced on a set of 2 CDs.
- 21 radio stations on the West Bank now have 50 radio programs totaling approx. 12 hours of broadcast material on classical Arabic literary works.
- 13 stations have so far broadcast the entire series at least once, several of them 2-3 times.
- 9 schools for the blind now have 5 sets each of 5 CDs containing 50 hours of excerpts from and introductions to classical Arabic literary works.
- 67 blind students in public schools have received copies of the CDs.

-
- Producing a series of radio programs on classical Arabic literature.
 - Getting these programs broadcast on radio stations.
 - Producing a set of audio CDs containing excerpts from classical Arabic literature.
 - Distributing the audio CDs to schools and 9 institutions for the blind.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities : Implementation of the project began in July 2005. It was supposed to be completed by March 2006, but had to be extended twice to July 2006 for production quality reasons:

• July - August 2005

An evaluation group consisting of 5 people discussed and decided on which works to include in the audio CDs. The criteria for selection of works was that they represent well-known examples of classical Arabic literature.

The group consisted of:

- Aref Hijjawi (BZUMDC's former director and radio unit coordinator)
- Juman Quneis (BZUMDC radio unit coordinator and radio announcer)
- Mahmoud al-Atshan, university teacher and blind person
- Nabil Assaf, school teacher
- Walid Nassar, radio station director, Radio Ajyal

The evaluation group decided on preparing material from the following works:

<u>Title</u>	<u>Author</u>
- al-Ayyam	Taha Hussein
- al-Bukhalaa'	al-Jahz
- al-Hamasa	Abu Tammam
- Excerpts from al Mutanabi	
- Three poetry collections	Fadwa Tuqan Mahmoud Darwish Sami al-Qasim
- The Prophet	Khalil Jibran
- Collected Verse	Abu al-Qasem al-Shabbi
- al-Nazarat	Mustapha Lutfi al-Manfaluti

- Four poetry collections Nizar Qabani
- Arabic curricula material for high-school students was also included in the CDs.

The evaluation group's goal was to present what is considered by Arab literary circles to be the best classical literature in Arab history. This goal took priority over any eventual gender-balance. Almost all of the selected works were written by men for the simple reason that male writers dominate Arab classical literature. The work of one female - Fadwa Tuqan - was included on the list. She is more of a contemporary writer than a classical one, but the evaluation group felt there was a need to provide some female representation.

The evaluation group then recruited a production team consisting of a project coordinator, 2 writers, a coach in "Fusha", Modern Standard Arabic and 8 readers as well as some of the regular technical staff members at the BZUMDC radio unit.

- **September 2005**

The first excerpts were read and recorded and then evaluated by the evaluation group.

- **October 2005 - June 2006** (including 2 extensions of the project)

- 50 hours of excerpts were recorded and evaluated. The evaluation group also decided which excerpts would be included in the radio program series.
- Introductory material for the planned series of radio programs was researched, written, recorded and edited into 50 programs of approx. 15-16 minutes each.

- **June 2006**

The two radio program CDs and the 5 CD set of literary excerpts were completed.

- **July 2006**

- The radio program set of CDs was distributed to the 21 radio stations.
- The Ministry of Education distributed 5 copies each of the audio CD sets to 9 schools for the blind and 67 blind students attending public schools in Palestine.

The Ministry of Education received a total of 580 CDs for further distribution to other schools in Palestine. The UNESCO Ramallah Office received 280 CDs which it could give to visitors and other NGOs working within media and culture, as well as other interested parties. The office also sent CDs as samples to our other regional offices in the Arab States (Beirut, Cairo, Doha, Rabat, Amman).

- **August 2006**

A final report was submitted to UNESCO.

- **July 2007**

A questionnaire was sent to 17 radio stations (16 on the West Bank and one in Amman, Jordan). 13 stations answered the questionnaire.

Project management: The project has been professionally managed by the BZUMDC radio unit. The literary works selected are central to Arabic literature and the cultural history of the Middle East and both reading, recording and editing quality has been of a very high quality. The delays in production were warranted because some of the material was found to be deficient and needed to be re-recorded. Aside from that, the

project progressed smoothly.

Funds management: The project budget and final financial statement show that funds were used wisely and were appropriately accounted for. The BZUMDC also made use of its regular staff at the radio unit, saving the project additional salary costs. As it turned out, the budget lacked sufficient funds for printing booklets, but this evaluation feels that such booklets were not necessary or relevant, considering the two main target groups (radio listeners and blind people).

UNESCO services: The UNESCO Ramallah office processed the grant efficiently and effectively monitored the project through visits to the BZUMDC and by means of the documents and reports submitted by the BZUMDC to the Media Advisor.

Collaboration: There was good cooperation between BZUMDC and the Ministry of Education as well as 21 radio stations. This cooperation could be strengthened further in terms of following-up results of the project and ensuring more effective distribution and broadcasting of the audio CDs.

Project documentation: Aside from 7 CDs of audio material (2 for radio stations and 5 for the audio library), interim and final reports, as well as a final financial report, the project has also produced a survey of what radio stations in Palestine thought of the material produced and what other kind of material they would like to see made. The project is well-documented in a clear-cut manner.

Project monitoring: The project was closely monitored by the BZUMDC director and radio unit coordinator as well as by the UNESCO Ramallah office's Media Advisor.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results :

- (1) 9 schools for the blind now have 5 sets each of 5 CDs containing excerpts from classical Arabic literary works.
- (2) 21 radio stations on the West Bank and in Jordan now have 50 programs on classical Arabic literary works.
- (3) 13 stations have broadcast the programs at least once, several of them 2-3 times.
- (4) The BZUMDC radio unit now has an experienced production team for this kind of material.

Cost-effectiveness: Most of the funds were used to pay reader and technician salaries. The project must be considered cost-effective, given the above-mentioned results.

Development impact: This project should be seen as a first step in developing an audio library in Palestine, so it is still too early to be able to ascertain any definite impact. However, a process has been successfully put into motion and should lead to the production of more such cultural material.

The al-Wataniyah School for the Blind in al-Bireh says its students (age 16 and above) have used the CDs and appreciated them. The CDs have been added to the school's audio library, are used in library classes and students also check them out for private listening in their rooms.

The school would also like to have access to more contemporary material, including children's literature, in order to reach the younger students. The school's management also suggested that an audio encyclopedia be produced, but this is something that lies outside the scope of the present project.

21 radio stations received the literary program series CDs and at least 13 of the stations broadcast the programs either daily, weekly or bi-weekly.

According to a survey carried out by BZUMDC, 9 of the stations have received positive or very positive feedback from listeners, who have also said they would like to hear more such programs on other, more contemporary, literary works. Some listeners even asked if it was possible to purchase the CDs.

Most (10) of the stations surveyed say they have a need for this kind of programming. All of the stations say they would be very willing to broadcast similar material in the future. Some of the stations said the time format of the individual programs (approx. 15-16 minutes) didn't really fit in with their program slot format (10-12 minute slots) and that it would be easier to broadcast the programs if they were made somewhat shorter.

The Palestine Broadcasting Corporation radio station "**Voice of Palestine**" VoP never answered the survey, but broadcast the programs. The fact that the VoP has broadcast the programs must have led to a greater impact as the station has a much larger audience potential than the smaller, local ones.

The **Ministry of Education** says the CDs are a good complement to similar material they have produced and have expressed a desire to distribute the CDs to central libraries. The Ministry pointed out that one problem with sending the CDs to public schools is that many of these schools lack the equipment required to allow students to access the material. For this reason, the Ministry has no concrete plans to send the CDs to all public schools but has expressed a willingness to distribute the CD set to selected schools as a pilot project.

Sustainability: As long as the political situation in Palestine continues to be as unstable as it is at present, it is highly unlikely that the BZUMDC - or any other NGO in the Occupied Palestinian Territories for that matter - will be able to finance projects such as this one themselves. Radio stations cannot yet afford to contract freelancers or institutions to produce cultural programs.

A possible future option would be to produce CDs which could also be sold commercially, both in Palestine and in other Arab countries, but such an operation would require considerable market research and planning.

Another option would be to persuade the PA Ministry of Education to order the production of such material for school and public libraries. This could be an alternative way of financing this kind of activity.

However, the BZUMDC is sustainable when it comes to resources: equipment, facilities and staff know-how. The present project has also led to new ideas for future production of audio literary CDs and programs.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management: BZUMDC project management could consider producing a similar set of CDs containing more contemporary Arabic and Palestinian literature.

Management could also explore the possibility of producing an audio CD of a literary work in its entirety.

BZUMDC project management could also consider producing a similar set of CDs containing good examples of children's literature from around the world.

If future radio series are produced, the project management should ensure that programs are produced in time formats that are suitable for as many radio stations as possible.

Management should also persuade participating radio stations to advertise the programs properly in advance.

Recipient institution: BZUMDC should continue to discuss the national audio library idea with the Ministry of Education in order to secure future funding for this kind of activity. It would be a good idea to present the Ministry and donor organizations with a draft proposal for such a national audio project.

BZUMDC should consider presenting draft program ideas which can be discussed and developed further in workshops together with the stations.

Perhaps one should also consider developing a regular literary magazine program idea with a radio station that reaches all of Palestine.

Member State: The Ministry of Education should ensure distribution of the CDs to as many schools as possible as well as to all public libraries.

The Ministry of Education should involve BZUMDC more in efforts to create a national Palestinian audio library which can be used not only in institutions for blind people, but in grade schools, institutions of higher learning and in Palestinian libraries.

The Palestinian Authority PA should support - or at least actively encourage - the establishment of a local, community-based radio station having a Public Service charter.

IPDC: IPDC could consider supporting BZUMDC in producing a similar set of CDs containing more contemporary Palestinian and Arabic literature.

Another alternative could be a CD set containing children's literature from around the world.

UNESCO: UNESCO should seriously consider supporting continued production of material for a national Palestinian audio library.

UNESCO could also consider supporting BZUMDC and other NGOs in their

aspirations to establish community-based local radio stations on the West Bank. The local stations presently serving the community are all quite small, commercial and lack the vision and organization needed to truly provide the general public with relevant broadcast material.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project : This is a very clear-cut project which has the potential of being developed into a full-fledged national audio library program. Audio literary CDs and radio programs benefit a large number of people in a society in which culture is highly neglected by the media and where few people read books. Being provided with the chance to hear literary works, or excerpts from them, can encourage listeners to actually buy the books in question, thereby promoting reading habits.

Way of cooperation : Cooperation with the Ministry of Education has been good, but it appears to be a better idea to cooperate more with the Ministry's Department of Counseling and Special Education as well as the Ministry of Higher Education in order to ensure distribution to as many schools as possible.

Cooperation with the radio stations has also been good. Most stations broadcast the material on a regular basis and also filled out evaluation forms providing BZUMDC with feedback. However, cooperation could be strengthened further so that they become more involved in program design and content and more committed to broadcasting future literary programs.

Inputs: Project coordinator Aref Hijjawi's input has been invaluable as he is not only a radio journalist but also a specialist on Arabic literature and music. The BZUMI radio unit staff have provided very professional services in both recording and editing material. The readers selected have been thorough, conscientious and done a very professional job. BZUMSC's reputation as a professional media center promoting journalism and media advocacy issues has also been very useful in involving radio stations in the project.

Instruments used:

There were four main instruments:

- (a) A project team of 15 people was established to manage and coordinate the project.
- (b) Meetings with local radio stations, schools, the Ministry of Education and institutions for blind people to present the idea and receive feedback.
- (c) The BZUMI radio unit studios and editing facilities were used to produce the material.
- (d) A survey was carried out on how radio stations used the material.

Outputs/outcomes: There were four major sets of outputs/outcomes:

(a) 50 radio programs totaling approx. 12,5 hours containing introductions to and excerpts from Arabic literature.

(b) 13 radio stations broadcast the programs.

(c) Two audio CDs totaling 50 hours and containing excerpts from Arabic literature were produced and distributed to 9 schools and institutions for the blind as well as 67 blind students attending regular public schools in Palestine..

(d) A production team of studio technicians and readers has grown out of the project.

13. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

Methodology: A mixed method was used consisting of desk research, interviews and a study of the produced programs. Fieldwork was carried out in Ramallah September 16-18.

Key informants:

UNESCO Ramallah Office

Ms Irmeli Seipäjärvi, Adviser for Communication and Information

BZUMI

Ms. Jumana Quneis, radio unit coordinator

Khaldoun Barghouti, project coordinator

Limitations:

The evaluator does not have enough command of the Arabic language to be able to carry out any in-depth analysis of the actual editorial content of the programs produced by the project.

The evaluator was also not able to verify the exact times and dates when participating radio stations actually broadcast the programs, nor was he able to interview any of the audience.

Kalmar, Sweden, December 10, 2007

James Downing

ANNEX 1:

Sources and interviewees

Sources:

- Project description
- The two sets of CDs produced for libraries and radio stations.
- Final BZUMDC project report from July 2007
- Radio station evaluation forms

List of interviewees:

Project production team participants

Khaldoun Barghouti

Jumana Quneis

Iyad al-Rjoub

Fidaa Barghouti

Mohannad Kadaan

Diyala Berro

The al-Wataniyah School for the Blind

Ms. Khawla Musleh

Ministry of Education

Ms. Shiffaa' Sheka

Radio Ajyal

Director Walid Nassar

UNESCO

Irmeli Seipäjärvi, Media Advisor, Ramallah Office

ANNEX 2:

Evaluation Schedule

Literary Audio Library for Radio, Education and the Blind Persons

	10.00 - 11.30	12.00 - 14.00	15.00 - 16.00
Nov 16, 2007	Ministry of Education	The al-Wataniyah School for the Blind	Radio Ajyal, Ramallah
	10.00 - 16.00		
Nov. 17, 2007	Birzeit University Media Development Center Radio Unit Meetings with entire Production Team		
Nov. 18, 2007	Birzeit University Media Development Center Radio Unit Follow-up meeting with Jumana Quneis		

EVALUATION REPORT

Executive Summary

1. PROJECT TITLE : **Palestine: Studio for Children's Programs at the Palestinian Broadcasting Corporation (PBC)**
2. PROJECT NUMBER :
PDC/48/PAL/02
3. CATEGORY : Radio
4. AGENCY : Palestinian Broadcasting Corporation (PBC)
- 4.1 BENEFICIARIES: Children between the ages of 8-15, families and NGOs in Palestine (West Bank and Gaza)
- 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: Palestinian Broadcasting Corporation (PBC)

Summary/Conclusions

THE OBJECTIVES:

The project aims to contribute to Palestinian children's and young people's welfare by producing programs serving as tools for improving their situation, mentally and physically, as an important part of community development. Palestinian youngsters will be responsible for building the future of Palestine and such programs will help them gain self-confidence, acquire positive attitudes and overcome difficulties.

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED:

There were excessive delays in the project due to 3 factors:

- 1- The companies supplying the studio equipment were either late on delivery or delivered the wrong equipment.
- 2- The PBC'S radio station Voice of Palestine (VoP) was moved to a new building.
- 3- A general strike of Palestinian Authority (PA) employees disrupted activities at VoP.

These problems led to an extension of the project into 2007.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The PBC should put more effort and resources into supporting these kinds of children's empowerment activities. Ways to arrange children's training and production workshops in other parts of Palestine should also be investigated.

Staff needs to be increased by two or three people in order to be able to more effectively take care of the children while they're at the station and accompany them when they want to perform field work. The VoP also needs more rooms to accommodate the youngsters, both during theoretical sessions and while they are waiting for their turn in the studio. Some sort of transportation for the children, a mini-bus for example, is also needed.

EVALUATION REPORT

A DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE :
Palestine: Studio for Children's Programs at the Palestinian Broadcasting Corporation (PBC)
 2. PROJECT NUMBER :
PDC/48/PAL/02
 3. CATEGORY : Radio
 4. AGENCY : Palestinian Broadcasting Corporation (PBC)
 - 4.1 BENEFICIARIES:
Children between the ages of 8-15, families and NGOs in Palestine (West Bank and Gaza)
 - 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:
Palestinian Broadcasting Corporation (PBC)
-

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES :

5.1 *Overall or development objectives:*

The main objective of the project is to contribute to Palestinian children's and young people's welfare by producing radio programs serving as tools for improving their situation, mentally and physically, as an important part of community development. This, because Palestinian youngsters will be responsible for building the future of Palestine and such programs will help them gain self-confidence, acquire positive attitudes and overcome difficulties.

5.2 *Operational or project objectives:*

- Training a group of children in how to produce their own radio programs.

5.3 *Results/outputs planned:*

- Training a group of children and youth on children's rights issues and how to produce their own radio programs.

5.4 *Target groups (beneficiaries):*

Children between the ages of 8-12, families and NGOs in Palestine (West Bank and Gaza)

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE :

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$40,000
Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$33,000

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES :

Other UNESCO sources US\$1, 650

Time schedule/project duration: 2005-2006, extended to 2007

B ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

The main objective of the project has been to contribute to Palestinian children's and young people's welfare by supporting the production of radio programs serving as tools for improving their situation, mentally and physically, and to help them gain self-confidence, acquire positive attitudes and overcome

- A fully-equipped children's studio at the PBC Voice of Palestine radio station in Ramallah.
- A specialized library of books and music for children at Voice of Palestine
- Setting up a children's studio at the PBC Voice of Palestine (VoP) radio station in Ramallah.
- Establishing a specialized library of books and music for children at Voice of Palestine.
- Establishing an advisory board and partnerships for the production of children's radio programs.

the numerous difficulties they are facing under Israeli occupation.

Considering how Palestinian youngsters will be responsible for building the future of Palestine, this objective is highly relevant and well-justified:

70% of Palestine's population consists of children and youth under the age of 24. According to World Bank statistics, more than half of the population is living in poverty (\$2 a day or less). Palestine's economy, social service infrastructure and development is in tatters after years of occupation, violence and political instability. Palestine's audio-visual sector has also been hit hard by the situation and - as a result - programming for children is insufficient, to say the least. In a country in which media is highly focused on political news, conflict and occupation, youngsters are definitely a neglected audience.

The role of radio in community development, particularly for youth, is crucial when it comes to developing their personality and social life. Radio is easily accessible and can also serve as an effective educational tool. In addition, the audio-visual sector is an important tool with which the Palestinians can preserve their national identity and cultural heritage.

Short-term objectives :

The project has had 4 immediate objectives:

- Training a group of children in how to produce their own radio programs.

With one exception, these short-term objectives were realistic and implemented successfully:

- Training a group of children in how to produce their own radio programs.
- 5 episodes of programs made by children have been produced and another 7 are in the pipeline.

However, the project has not led to the establishment of an advisory board and/or concrete partnerships for the production of children's radio programs. The reason for this appears to be competition and mistrust, several of the organizations the PBC contacted wanting to have more influence over the project than the PBC was willing to give them. Instead, a sort of informal "ad hoc" advisory network has been set up, but this network does not appear to really function as intended.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities: The project was originally supposed to be completed by the end of 2006, but had to be extended into 2007. All activities had been implemented by September 2007, including the production of children's programs, but the VoP decided to wait with broadcasting them until Ramadan.

- **The children's studio** was first set up at VoP's old premises after months of delays caused by a) the suppliers' inability to provide equipment on time, and b) the suppliers' failure to provide equipment according to the specifications set forth in the purchase agreement. Shortly after the studio was set up, the VoP had to move to new premises. This caused new delays but by the end of 2006 the studio was finally up and running. One advantage of the move was that the new premises provided more space and facilities.

The VoP began using the studio for recording and other VoP training activities in early 2007. The UNESCO-funded studio has served as an important back-up to the station's single remaining broadcast studio (the other studio facilities were earlier destroyed by Israeli forces and VoP's studio facilities had to be closed down when Hamas took over Gaza earlier in the summer).

- **The children's library** of books and CDs was set up in the meantime. The CDs consist of both music and sound effects while the books consist of a variety of educational, publications on history, science, religion and social issues as well as children's literature from the Arab region and abroad (in Arabic translations).

- **Establishing an advisory board**, as mentioned above, was not successful due to rivalry and mistrust between VoP and one of the youth-oriented organizations invited to a meeting VoP held in January 2007. The meeting, attended by PYALARA, the TAMER Institute, UNICEF and UNESCO failed to produce concrete results, primarily because the TAMER Institute wanted to host the children's training workshops and play

a stronger role in selecting candidates for participation. In the end, TAMER wound up implementing another project in Gaza and showed no further interest in the present project.

Instead, the VoP attempted to set up an informal, ad hoc, network of children's organizations to support and advise the project, but no evidence was found that this network really functions.

- **Private, Public and UNRWA schools were visited** by the VoP project staff to present the children's production workshop idea and objectives and discuss its contents. The schools were asked to nominate 3-5 children each as participants after which the VoP project staff selected 20 youngsters 7-15 years of age.

- **30 hours of training workshops** were arranged during the spring of 2007, led by two of VoP's presenters/producers with previous experience of producing children's programs. Two 4-hour sessions were held weekly in which the children were trained in:
 - children's rights
 - social skills such as interacting with others, presenting oneself, time management and teamwork
 - program presentation
 - interview techniques
 - preparing dialogues
 - leading discussions
 - story-telling
 - research and critical analysis of information gathered
 - basic technical skills needed to produce simple radio material

The training sessions were a mix of theory and hands-on production to keep the young trainees actively involved.

- **Twelve episodes of the program "Medinat al-Atfal" - "The Children's City"** were produced by August 2007, based on material prepared by the children during the training workshops. The programs are very well-made and consist of a mix of cultural and musical spots, interviews with other youngsters about everything from favorite hobbies to issues such as pollution, health and children's rights, story-telling, riddles, jokes, animal life and news, etc. The children decided what they wanted to report on and coached by the trainers, who say they saw to it that the children always had "the final cut".

- The programs have been burned onto CDs.

- **A final report** was submitted to UNESCO in July, 2007, but did not include any participant or trainer evaluations.

- Instead, **an evaluation meeting with the children and trainers** was held in connection with this evaluation September 15, 2007. The children were extremely enthusiastic about the project, eager to hear their programs broadcast on VoP and want to continue producing program material. More on this can be found below under Point 10, EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT.

Project management: The bottom line is that the project was effectively managed by the VoP project staff and trainers despite a number of complications. The most

important activities were effectively carried out, albeit with considerable delays and despite major problems with PBC bureaucracy, a general strike, the equipment suppliers' failure to supply ordered equipment on time and a lack of willingness to cooperate on the part of some youth-oriented organizations.

With very limited resources, the project staff and even the VoP director himself also did an excellent job of taking care of the children, both at the station (where the VoP director let the children use his office when they were waiting for studio access) and when they were out on assignment on the streets of Ramallah. This was something which hadn't been considered when the project was being devised.

Funds management: The bulk of the project funds (approx. US\$25,000) were used to purchase and install the children's studio as planned. US\$ 4,560 were used to pay trainer salaries, while roughly \$1,850 were used for administrative costs, stationary, transportation costs for the children, etc. The final financial report shows that funds were used in a proper manner.

UNESCO services: The UNESCO Ramallah office media advisor put a lot of time and effort into assisting the VoP project staff deal with the problems that arose. Her support and encouragement were essential to the project's ultimate successes.

Collaboration: Cooperation with NGOs proved to be a problem and comes as no surprise to the evaluator. Most local NGOs and the PA are heavily dependant on development assistance from abroad and tend to compete with each other in this respect. Cooperation between NGOs on the one hand and PA institutions on the other can therefore be difficult, especially when both parties are so keen on maintaining as much control as possible over projects and funds. The PBC is a PA institution and uses bureaucracy to accomplish this, while NGOs want as little interference as possible from government authorities. The project staff coordinator really tried to achieve cooperation with other NGOs, but it is the opinion of this evaluator that her task was made more unnecessarily difficult by both PBC bureaucracy and some of the NGOs' desire to have more control over the project.

The decision to proceed with implementation of the project without having established a true advisory board was a correct one.

Project documentation: A final project report has been submitted along with a presentation of workshop content and brief descriptions of the material produced by the children. CDs containing the material have also been provided.

Project monitoring: The project was closely monitored by the VoP's project manager as well as by the UNESCO Ramallah office's Media Advisor. Thanks to this, problems were swiftly dealt with when they arose.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results :

(1) The VoP now has a fully-equipped studio for training and production of children's

programs. The studio also serves as a backup for the VoP's only other, broadcast, studio.

(2) 20 children received 30 hours of training on children's rights and radio production.

(3) The material the children produced has resulted in 5 children's programs which will be aired during the autumn of 2007. Another 7 programs are under presently production.

Cost-effectiveness: The project must be considered cost-effective, given the purchase of equipment needed to set up the children's studio, the number of workshop hours held and the children's programs produced. The studio is a great asset to the VoP and has increased its program production capabilities considerably.

Development impact: The total impact of the project cannot yet be gauged as the programs the children produced had not been broadcast at the time of this evaluation, but the enthusiasm of the children who participated is very impressive and the efforts made are a definite investment in the future.

Many of the young participants have gained a considerable amount of self-confidence and a greater understanding of what is right and wrong with the society they live in. Several children told us that the project had taught them how to overcome their shyness, establish contact with strangers and build up relationships. They also felt that their participation in the project led adults to respect them more and take them more seriously.

The older children expressed a desire to become journalists and radio producers and even asked VoP to issue them "cub reporter" press cards!

The children also have a plethora of ideas about programs that they would like to see produced; for instance:

- Debate programs between children.
- Vox pops with young people.
- Programs about and by young people from other cities and regions in Palestine. (As one girl put it: "Media passes through checkpoints".)
- Documentary radio programs for young people.
- Children's interviews with important political and community figures. (One boy told us he wanted to interview PA President Mahmoud Abbas. When asked what he wanted to ask Mahoud Abbas about, he replied: "I'll know when I have him in the studio.")
- More programs where children and adults interact.
- Programs about how we can improve our neighborhoods and community in general.

The children also want to see the project spread to other parts of Palestine outside Ramallah and the children hope that such a project will create a children's journalist collective network which produces radio and TV programs. The trainers, both of them radio producers, have noted these ideas and said they intend to incorporate them into VoP's future programming.

Sustainability: The PBC/VoP suffers from under-financing, but this is a situation which only the Palestinian Authority can do anything about.

With the new studio and the experiences gleaned from implementing the project, the VoP now has the possibility of continuing cooperation with children and young people on producing programs which are of high relevance to youngsters in Palestine.

While the VoP has gained a lot from this project in terms of equipment and staff know-how, it needs to do a number of things in order to ensure a smooth continuation of the project. Some recommendations are presented under point 11 below.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management: In order to ensure as broad a spectrum of participants as possible, efforts to set up an NGO advisory board on children's programming should continue. In order to set up a more sustainable advisory board, the PBC project management team should try to identify and recruit people who are both active and knowledgeable in the fields of youth empowerment and journalism/media and who are respected by a broad segment of civil society.

Ways to arrange children's training and production workshops in other parts of Palestine should also be investigated. For instance, al-Najjah radio in Nablus and the IPYL Multimedia Center in Hebron could be very suitable project partners.

Some form of project and trainer evaluation session with the participants should be arranged in future projects. Minutes can be taken of the session and included in a final report as an addendum.

It would also be good for the project if trainers were provided with an opportunity to study similar activities and share experiences with colleagues working on the same thing in other parts of the world.

Recipient institution: The PBC should put more effort and resources into supporting this kind of activity and be more flexible when it comes to cooperating with other organizations.

Staff needs to be increased by two or three people in order to be able to more effectively take care of the children while they're at the station and accompany them when they want to perform field work. The VoP also needs more rooms to accommodate the youngsters, both during theoretical sessions and while they are waiting for their turn in the studio. Some sort of transportation for the children, a mini-bus for example, is also needed.

Member State: The Palestinian Authority PA should support - or at least actively encourage - the transformation of the PBC from a state-controlled media outlet into a Public Service radio and TV station free from state editorial control and serving the needs and interests of the entire population.

IPDC: IPDC could continue to support this activity, perhaps by providing financial support for the running costs of program production.

Funds could also be granted to enable the project staff to study how public service radio stations in Europe develop and produce programming for young people.

IPDC could perhaps support coupling the present project to the Birzeit University Media Development Center Media Literacy program which is starting up in late 2007.

UNESCO: UNESCO could involve itself more in coordinating efforts to set up a truly active advisory board. UNESCO should also seriously consider supporting any serious attempts to transform the PBC into an independent Public Service media outlet.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project: This project has the potential of benefiting not only children but society at large as it empowers the very people who - in coming decades - will be determining the future of their country.

Working with children has its complications - they not only need training but they also have to be taken care of, kept occupied and, at times, fed, something which the present project's staff quickly learned and worked out ways to deal with.

The participating children were not asked to provide evaluations of the project or the trainers. Considering their age, this is understandable, but the project management team could have held an oral evaluation session with the children and taken minutes of the meeting. The minutes could be included in the final report as an addendum.

Way of cooperation: Attempts at cooperating with other youth-oriented NGOs were not successful due to rivalry and suspicion. This problem definitely needs be dealt with, mainly because a pooling of human resources and funds would greatly increase capabilities on all sides to further the empowerment of young people in the media.

Inputs: Experienced producers of children's programs at VoP provided their know-how and skills to help the participating children develop their own program ideas. A new children's studio was set up to produce the programs. VoP studio technicians helped the children record and edit their material.

Instruments used: There were 5 main instruments:

- (a) A project team of 3 people to manage the project.
- (b) Meetings with schools to find suitable participants in the project.
- (c) 30 hours of training on children's rights issues and radio production.
- (d) A new, fully-equipped children's studio.
- (e) Books and CDs in the VoP children's library helped the participants research and develop program ideas.

Outputs/outcomes: There were 4 major sets of outputs/outcomes:

- (a) A new, fully-equipped children's studio at VoP.
- (b) An enlarged and upgraded children's book and music library at VoP.
- (c) 20 children trained in civic issues and radio production.

(d) 5 episodes of the children's program Medinat al-Atfal have been produced and another 12 episodes are to be completed during the autumn of 2007.

13. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

Methodology: A mixed method was used consisting of desk research, interviews and a study of the produced programs. Fieldwork was carried out in Ramallah September 13-15, 2007.

Key informants:

UNESCO Ramallah Office

Ms Irmeli Seipäjärvi, Media Advisor

PBC

Ms. Hanadi Masoud, Project Coordinator

Limitations:

The evaluator does not have enough command of the Arabic language to be able to carry out any in-depth analysis of the actual editorial content of the radio programs produced by the participating children.

There was no possibility of analyzing the effect of the produced programs as they had not been broadcast at the time of the evaluation.

Kalmar, Sweden, December 10, 2007

James Downing

ANNEX 1:

Sources and interviewees

Sources:

- VoP project application
- Project description by UNESCO
- Interim progress report
- Final PBC/VoP project report from July 2007
- CD copies of 5 episodes of Medinat al-Atfal

List of interviewees:

PBC Project Coordinator:

Ms. Hanadi Masoud

VoP trainer and production team:

Mr. Mazen Hashlamon

Ms. Sahar Tarteer

Project participants:

17 children between the ages of 7-15

PBC:

Mr. Abu Sammaya, PBC chairman

Mr. Jamal Mohammad, director VoP

UNESCO

Ms. Irmeli Seipäjärvi, Media Advisor, Ramallah Office

ANNEX 2:**Evaluation Program**

Date	Meetings	Time	Place
September 13, 2007	PBC Chairman Mr. Abu Sumayya	10:30 AM	PBC HQ Um Sharayet
	Project Coordinator Ms. Hanadi Masoud	11:30 AM	Voice of Palestine Radio al-Irsal
	VoP director Mr. Jamal Mohammad		Voice of Palestine Radio al-Irsal
September 15, 2007	Meeting with children participants in the project	10:30 AM	Voice of Palestine Radio al-Irsal
	Production team members Ms. Sahar Tarteer & Mr. Mazen Hashlamon	12:30 PM	Voice of Palestine Radio al-Irsal
	Final meeting with Ms. Hanadi Masoud	13:30 P;	Voice of Palestine Radio al-Irsal

EVALUATION REPORT

Executive Summary

1. PROJECT TITLE :
Empowering the Media Sector in Hebron
2. PROJECT NUMBER :
PDC/48/PAL/03
3. CATEGORY: Community media
4. AGENCY: International Palestinian Youth League **IPYL**
- 4.1 BENEFICIARIES: 40 professionals of the media sector in the Hebron district
- 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: International Palestinian Youth League

Summary/Conclusions

THE OBJECTIVES:

The overall objective of the project was to establish a community multimedia center (CMC) in Hebron providing free training and empowering services to local TV and Radio stations and journalists so as to encourage them and the civil society organizations to design and run community development programs, thereby enabling the media sector to expand their outreach projects and reach larger audiences and target groups. This was achieved through (a) establishing and equipping a media resource center in Hebron, (b) the recruitment of three media trainers, and (c) training workshops on civic issues, community media and journalism skills for staff members from local radio and TV stations in the Hebron district.

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED:

The participants' work and study schedules and Israeli closures complicated workshop scheduling. The lack of enough equipment also led to some scheduling difficulties in the technical courses.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The IPYL should investigate ways to more actively involve local radio and TV stations in its projects and get them to broadcast the programs the projects produce. The IPYL could also arrange seminars or brain-storming sessions with the local stations to discuss program ideas. The IPYL should continue to investigate the possibility of establishing an independent community-based radio station. The IPYL's Media Center should further develop cooperation with other media institutes on the West Bank, especially the Birzeit University Media Development Center.

EVALUATION REPORT

A DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE :
Empowering the Media Sector in Hebron
 2. PROJECT NUMBER :
PDC/48/PAL/03
 3. CATEGORY : Community media
 4. AGENCY : International Palestinian Youth League **IPYL**
 - Establishing a small media resource center in Hebron;
 - Purchase and use of studio and computer equipment.
 - Creation of 3 new media jobs (gender balanced).
 - 4.1 BENEFICIARIES: 40 professionals of the media sector in the Hebron district
 - 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: International Palestinian Youth League **IPYL**
-

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES :

5.1 *Overall or development objectives:*

Establishing a community multimedia center CMC in Hebron, providing free training and empowering services to the local TV and Radio stations as well as journalists in order to encourage local stations and the civil society organizations to design and community development programs. Such a center will enable the media sector to expand their outreach projects and reach larger audiences and target groups. Developing and building the capacities of the local civil society organizations in the field of media will allow these organizations to raise their voices and exist in areas where they were absent before.

5.2 *Operational or project objectives:*

- Training (transferable skills and civic society issues) of staff members from local radio and TV stations in the Hebron district.

5.3 *Results/outputs planned:*

- A media center was established.
- Radio, and TV and computer equipment was purchased and installed at the center.
- 2 training manuals were produced and distributed.
- 40 media professionals received training in civic issues and community media as well as radio and TV production.
- An opinion poll on people's concerns in Hebron was carried out by the participants as part of the community media workshop.
- 4 documentary radio and TV programs were broadcast by 7 local stations.

5.4 *Target groups (beneficiaries):*

40 media professionals and students of journalism in the Hebron district.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE :

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$43,275
Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$33,500

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES :

The EU contributed € 400.905.

Time schedule/project duration: Approximately 6 months between June - December 2005.

B ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

The present project's primary purpose has been to establish a community multimedia center (CMC) in Hebron, which will provide free training and empowering services to the local TV and Radio stations as well as journalists and thereby encourage local stations and the civil society organizations to design and run community development programs.

These objectives are highly relevant for local TV and radio stations, journalists and civil society organizations and well-justified for the following reasons:

Hebron is a conservative community with traditional values and attitudes and is controlled by a number of local patriarchal clans or "families", all of them traditional and conservative. 8 clans own the city's 9 local radio stations and 2 of the clans own the city's 2 local TV stations. The stations broadcast their respective clans' political and social agendas. People in Hebron see media as mouthpieces for various agendas and commercial interests. Programming consists primarily of prayer reading, music and political propaganda. Media outlets push their respective lines and there's really no experience with independent, non-partisan media.

Palestinian journalists in general see their primary role as being advocates of a national and political cause. The media is therefore highly focused on political news and the Israeli occupation. Civil society issues such as human rights, gender equality, youth, education, health, culture, etc., are neglected, if not ignored entirely.

Consequently, despite the number of media outlets that exist in the Hebron area, its citizens and NGOs have no real voice or forum in which to learn about, debate or exchange experiences on issues and events which concern them most.

Short-term objectives :

The project had 5 immediate objectives:

- Training (transferable skills and civic society issues) of staff members from the local radio and TV stations in the Hebron district.
- Establishing a small media resource center in Hebron.
- Purchase and use of studio and computer equipment.
- Creation of 3 new media jobs (gender balanced).

Establishing community development program departments at local radio and TV

- stations.

With one exception, these short-term objectives were realistic, logical and implemented successfully:

- A media center consisting of TV, radio and computer equipment was set up and has been functioning ever since. Most recently, the center successfully completed a new IPDC project - "Giving Women a Voice" and the center is being used by young media professionals, students of journalism, NGOs and both the Hebron University Journalism Dept. as well as al-Arroub College Media Unit.
- 3 trainers (one woman and two men) were hired from Spain to develop training manuals on civic affairs and media production as well as lead training workshops.
- 120 hours of training in civic affairs and media production were held for 40 participants (31 men and 9 women) - 20 hours more than originally planned.
- 4 programs on civil society issues were produced and distributed to the local stations.

However, the project has not led to the establishment of community development program departments at local radio and TV stations. This is not a fault of the IPYL but due to a lack of economic/technical resources and - in some cases - will on the part of the stations.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities : A final draft of the project contract between UNESCO and IPYL was signed on May 26, 2005 and the project was completed within 7 months between June and December 2005.

- **A chief trainer**, the Spanish communications expert Ms. Maria Uro Graells, was recruited in early June. Her assignment was to:
 - coordinate and develop two training manuals - a first manual on basic journalism, civic issues and community media and a second manual on technical TV and radio training.
 - design and lead a course on civic issues and community media.
 - prepare and evaluate course participant and radio/TV station questionnaires designed to help develop course content and training schedules in accordance with the participants' and stations' needs and expectations.
- **Calls for equipment bids** from local companies were sent out in early June and equipment was purchased in early July.
- **A series of meetings with local TV and radio stations** was held in mid July to present and discuss the project, criteria for course participants and a training program proposal.
- **Questionnaires** were distributed to the radio/TV stations and course applicants and analyzed in late July, after which a list of 40 course participants was finalized.
- **The first manual** on civic issues and community media was completed and distributed (250 CDs) to pertinent parties by the end of July.
- **Two technical trainers** on TV and radio, Spanish experts Mr. David Asensio (video) and Roger Gallardo (audio), were recruited on August 1.
- **The training schedule** was finalized on August 2 at a meeting between the three members of the trainer team and IPYL.
- **A preparatory meeting** between the trainer team and the participants was held on August 8 to present the program.
- **60 hours of training on civic issues and community media** were held between August 9 - 31 for 40 young media professionals and students of journalism.
- **The second manual** on radio and TV training (250 CDs) was completed and distributed to pertinent parties by late August.
- **Installation of the equipment** was completed by early September.
- **55 hours of radio training** were held between September 1-30 for one group of the original participants.

- **60 hours of TV training** were held between September 1 - October 15 for one group of the original participants.
- **4 documentary programs** were produced by the two groups during the above-mentioned technical training:
 - Obstacles Facing Women in the Workplace
 - The Wall
 - Early Marriages
 - Music in Palestine
- The documentaries were broadcast by 7 radio and TV stations in Hebron.
- **Final evaluation questionnaires** were distributed to the participants and analyzed in mid October.
- **Evaluation meetings** with the local radio and TV stations were held in late October.
- **Data collection, analysis and report writing** was carried out during November.
- **Manual kits and project information** was made available on IPYL's website in December.
- **A final report** was submitted to UNESCO in January, 2006.

Project management: The project was professionally managed by the IPYL's 10-person project team. All activities were completed in a timely manner and the final project report and financial statement submitted as required. The IPYL should also be commended for accepting all of the women who applied for the project. Also, the IPYL put a lot of effort into being as transparent as possible with the participants' families, inviting them to visit the center and see with their own eyes what is being done there. This is a very effective way to stop rumors, suspicion and unfounded criticism in a conservative and traditional community.

Funds management: The project budget, final financial statement and auditor's report show that funds were used wisely and were appropriately accounted for. The IPYL also made use of a volunteer interpreter in the courses, saving the project unexpected additional costs. As it turned out, the budget lacked sufficient funds for printing hard copies of the training manuals so only CD copies were made. The project ended with a slight deficit of US\$334 which was covered by IPYL.

UNESCO services: The UNESCO Ramallah office processed the grant efficiently and effectively monitored the project through visits and by means of the documents and reports submitted by IPYL to the Media Advisor.

Collaboration: There was very good cooperation between IPYL and the local radio/TV stations, as well as the Hebron University Journalism Dept. and al-Arroub College Media Unit. IPYL's Media Development Center has obviously become a hub of media activity for previous course participants and other NGOs in the city.

Project documentation: Is both comprehensive and clear. Aside from interim, financial and final reports, the project has produced detailed participant and radio/TV station surveys and analyses as well as a very interesting survey on public concerns in Hebron. The latter should be very useful for serious radio and TV stations when they consider what kind of programs they should provide in the future.

Project monitoring: The project was closely monitored by the IPYL's manager, project coordinator and training supervisor as well as by the UNESCO Ramallah office's Media Advisor.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results :

(1) The CMC is now fully-equipped and capable of continuing to provide services and arrange training activities for the community and local radio/TV stations. It also has facilities capable of providing training in print and Internet journalism.

(2) 3 Spanish trainers led 120 hours of courses on civic affairs and technical radio and TV production for 40 young media professionals. The participants' overall rating of the training has been very high.

(3) 2 training manuals (one on civic affairs and the other on TV/Radio production) have been produced and distributed to interested parties. The manuals only exist in English at present, but were put to good use in the project.

(4) A public survey of people's concerns in Hebron was carried out and published.

(5) 4 radio and TV documentary programs on civic issues were produced by the participants and broadcast by 7 radio and TV stations:
Nawras Radio, Nawras TV, Alhourieh Radio, Marah Radio, Amal TV, Siraj Radio and Radio Dream.

The programs are also available on the IPYL MedHebron website.

(6) The CMC now functions as a hub and meeting point for media professionals, students of journalism and NGO activists since its creation in 2004. Its facilities continue to be used by previous trainees and others as well as the Hebron University Journalism Dept., which lacks sufficient facilities to provide hands-on training for its undergraduate students. al-Aroub College is also cooperating with the center in the same way. It has successfully implemented a second IPDC project, "Giving Women a Voice", in 2007.

Cost-effectiveness: The project must be considered cost-effective, given the purchase of equipment needed to make the center a viable one, the number of workshop hours held, the 4 programs produced and broadcast and the resulting radio station telephone debate shows, the public opinion poll on priority community issues and the production of the 2 training CDs.

Development impact: While the project has so far perhaps only had a modest impact on the big media picture in Hebron, it has had a definite and great impact on the

participants who attended the workshops and produced the programs. The trainees interviewed for this evaluation said that prior to the project, they had no clear perception of the role of media in a democratic society or how it can be used to further human rights, promote development and deal with social problems. The participants were previously unused to working together in mixed groups of women and men and say the project was an eye-opener in this respect - i.e. that it was not only possible, but a very positive experience that changed their views on cooperation and dialogue between the sexes. The MDC is now a place where men and women can meet and interact without fear, no small feat considering how conservative Hebron society is.

The trainers say they were impressed by the quality of the work done and the quickness with which the participants overcame early shyness and dared to openly and frankly voice their opinions in workshop discussions.

One should see the present project as an investment in the future, those people trained in community media will know what to do if they are afforded the opportunity to practice their newly-learned skills and insights in the future.

However, the participating local radio and TV stations have failed to establish community development departments, which was one of the objectives of the project. This is no fault of the project in itself, but is due to a lack of economic resources at the stations, as well as a lack of genuine interest in creating such departments.

Sustainability: Here, we have to differentiate between economic sustainability and sustain-ability in terms of human resources and know-how. As long as the political situation in Hebron continues to be as unstable as it is at present, it is highly unlikely that IPYL or the CMC - or any other NGO in the Occupied Palestinian Territories for that matter - will be able to become economically sustainable. IPYL will continue to be dependant on grants and subsidies in the foreseeable future.

However, the CMC is sustainable when it comes to resources: equipment, facilities, staff know-how and community relations, although there is a need for more equipment in order to accommodate larger groups of workshop participants.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management: In order to ensure as broad a spectrum of participants as possible, the need for interpreters should be taken into consideration when preparing budgets for future projects involving foreign experts. The manuals should perhaps be translated into Arabic so that more people can make use of them.

Recipient institution: IPYL should find ways to more actively involve local radio and TV stations in its projects, persuading them to develop and broadcast current affairs programs such as the ones produced during the present project. IPYL could also arrange programming seminars or brain-storming sessions for the local stations to discuss content.

IPYL's Media Center should further develop cooperation with other media institutes on the West Bank, especially the Birzeit University Media Development Center BZUMDC which is firmly established and highly-respected by Palestine's journalist corps. Both the IPYL and BZUMDC stand to benefit from a closer cooperation as BZUMDC has financial support from Sweden and Germany which covers the cost of hiring specialized trainers but lacks facilities in Hebron while the CMC lacks financial resources to recruit trainers but has adequate facilities and equipment needed to run courses.

Aside from mid-career training in journalism skills, the IPYL/CMC could also benefit from Training of Trainers workshops to strengthen and expand its own local trainer pool.

Member State: The Palestinian Authority PA, Hebron Governate and Municipality should support - or at least actively encourage - the establishment of a local, community-based radio station having a Public Service charter. Private radio stations are at present simply too commercial and not really interested in broadcasting current event programs and material on civic issues.

IPDC: IPDC should continue to support IPYL's Media Center with an aim to lay ground for the establishment of an independent, community-based local radio station.

UNESCO: UNESCO should seriously consider supporting the IPYL/CMC and other NGOs in their aspirations to establish a community-based local radio station in Hebron.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project : This has been a very good project in itself and an impressive example of wise co-financing and cooperation policy. The EU grant was for establishing the IPYL Media Center as such, but did not cover all equipment needs. Not only did the IPDC grant provide the missing financing, it also ensured the implementation of a very important series of activities that have helped to firmly establish the Media Center as an important hub for community media activities and development, involving local media outlets, NGOs and journalism education institutes.

Way of cooperation : Cooperation between IPYL and local NGOs was good, especially when it came to nominating and selecting project participants. Cooperation with the radio and TV stations was also good, especially during the preparatory stage when IPYL met with the stations to discuss their needs and wishes when it comes to programming and staff training.

Instruments used: There were five main instruments:

- (a) A project team of 10 people to manage and coordinate the project.
- (b) Meetings with local radio and TV stations to determine their needs and interests.
- (c) A public opinion poll to determine priority concerns of the people in Hebron.
- (d) Two training manuals on civic affairs, community media and Radio/TV production.
- (e) 120 hours of training on civic issues, community media and Radio/TV skills.

Outputs/outcomes: There were four major sets of outputs/outcomes:

- (a) Upgraded and expanded media production equipment at the MDC.
- (b) 40 media professionals and students of journalism trained in civic issues, community media and Radio/TV production.
- (c) An established network of young media professionals grew out of the project.
- (d) 4 documentary radio/TV programs were produced and broadcast

13. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

Methodology: A mixed method was used consisting of desk research, interviews and a study of the produced programs. Fieldwork was carried out in Hebron on September 9-12.

Key informants:

UNESCO Ramallah Office:

Ms Irmeli Seipäjärvi, Media Advisor

IPYL:

Mr. Adli Daana, Director,
Mr. Bilal Salameh, Training Supervisor

Limitations:

The evaluator does not have enough command of the Arabic language to be able to carry out any in-depth analysis of the actual editorial content of the radio and TV programs produced by the course participants.

The evaluator was also not able to verify the exact times and dates when participating radio and television stations actually broadcast the programs, nor was he able to interview any of the audience.

The evaluator was not able to meet with any of the foreign trainers in this project, but had to rely on the trainer evaluations presented in IPYL's final report.

Kalmar, Sweden, December 10, 2007

James Downing

ANNEX 1:

Sources and interviewees

Sources:

- Project description
- Interim progress reports from IPYL
- Final IPYL project report from January 2006
- IPYL financial report
- IPYL's MedHebron website
- Training kit CDs

List of interviewees:

IPYL Media Center staff Mr. Adli Daana, Mr. Bilal Salameh Ms. Nida' Abu Hamdieh Mr. Mazen Jabari	Radio stations Mr. Yunis Darwish, director as-Sharq Radio Baladna Radio Mr. Abdeljabbar Abu Sneneh, director, Siraji Radio
Project participants Mr. Hamzeh Qawasmeh Ms. Ayah Abu Mayaleh Ms. Jumana Shawar Ms. Lina al-Arjan Ms. Safa' Abu Yousef	Ministry of Information, Hebron District Mr. Ismael Jahshan, Director-General
Trainers: Mr. Bassam al-Haddad Mr. Hamzeh Qawasmeh	Governor 's Office in Hebron Ms. Samia Wazwaz, Director, Media Section Dr. Hussein Aa'raj, Governor of Hebron
al-Arroub College Media Training Center Mr. Bassam al-Haddad, Director	Women's Work Society in Hebron Ms. Sawsan Nasseredin, Director
Hebron University Media Dept. Mr. Ziad al-Jabari, Director	Legal Counseling Center in Hebron Ms. Amal al-Ju'beh, Director
UNESCO Ms. Irmeli Seipäjärvi, Ramallah Office Media Advisor	

ANNEX 2:

Evaluation Program

Sunday, September 9, 2007	
12:00 - 16:00	Meeting with Adli Daana and Bilal Salameh, IPYL
Monday, September 10, 2007	
09:30 - 11:00	Ministry of Information
11:15 - 12:30	Hebron Governor's Office
14:00 - 15:00	al-Arroub College Media Training Center
15.30 -16.30	Visits to radio stations
Tuesday, September 11, 2007	
09:30 - 13:00	Meeting with project participants
14:00 - 15:00	Women's Work Society in Hebron
15:00 - 16:30	Tour of Old City
Wednesday, September 12, 2007	
09:30 - 11:00	Legal Counseling Center
11:00 - 12:00	Hebron University Journalism Dept.
14:00 - 15:00	Meeting with Media Center trainers
	Legal Counseling Center
15:00 - 16:00	Follow-up meeting with IPYL

EVALUATION REPORT

Executive Summary

1. PROJECT TITLE :
Palestine: Giving Women a Voice
2. PROJECT NUMBER :
PDC/49 PAL/02
3. CATEGORY : Community media
4. AGENCY : International Palestinian Youth League **IPYL**
- 4.1 BENEFICIARIES:
31 young women and men (18-35 years of age) in the Hebron district.
Indirect beneficiaries are also local radio and TV stations and the general listening/viewing public.
- 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: International Palestinian Youth League **IPYL** and it's community multimedia center **CMC**

Summary/Conclusions

THE OBJECTIVES:

This grant funded what actually constitutes a second phase of the IPDC-financed "Empowering the Media in Hebron" project implemented by IPYL/CMC in 2005. The objectives have been to a) give Hebron's women a voice through using media production to express their concerns freely to a wide spectrum of the community and to encourage them to participate in decision-making processes and development of their societies, b) encourage the involvement of women in the self-promotion of women's rights and gender equality in all aspects of life and c) create a model for future steps in the promotion of gender equality involving a wider spectrum of national media. These objectives were successfully achieved through a series of workshops on gender issues, public relations and journalism skills coupled with the production of a series of radio and TV programs/documentaries dealing with gender equality and women's rights.

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED:

No major problems were encountered. The project had to be extended by 1 1/2 months to enable the participants to finish production of their programs and documentaries. Israeli closures also caused some delays in carrying out workshops according to schedule.

RECOMMENDATIONS: UNESCO, IPDC, the PA and IPYL/CMC should seriously consider supporting the establishment of a local community-based "Public Service" radio station run collectively by local NGOs, etc. in order to promote human rights in general, women's and young people's rights in particular and provide the Hebron district's population with relevant and unbiased coverage of local and national affairs and trends affecting civil society.

EVALUATION REPORT

A DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE :
Palestine: Giving Women a Voice
 2. PROJECT NUMBER :
PDC/49 PAL/02
 3. CATEGORY : Television, radio and photo journalism
 4. AGENCY : International Palestinian Youth League **IPYL**
 - 4.1 BENEFICIARIES: 31 young women and men (18-35 years of age) in the Hebron district. Indirect beneficiaries are also local radio and TV stations and the general listening/viewing public.
 - 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: International Palestinian Youth League **IPYL** and it's Media Development Center **CMC**.
-

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES :

5.1 *Overall or development objectives:*

- To give Hebron's women a voice through using media production to express their concerns freely to a wide spectrum of the community and to encourage them to participate in decision-making processes and development of their societies.
- To promote gender equality in the territories administered by the PNA as a part of a general democratization process by strengthening and encouraging the involvement of women in the self-promotion of women's rights and gender equality in all aspects of life.
- To create a model for future steps in the promotion of gender equality involving a wider spectrum of national media.

5.2 *Operational or project objectives:*

- To build the capacity and campaigning skills of 30 young female and male leaders by providing them with training in television, radio, photo journalism and public relations.
- To improve the situation of women in the Hebron district by spreading information about women's rights, health, family planning and women's role in democracy and development.
- To increase the amount of broadcast material dealing with women issues at 4 local radio stations and 2 local TV stations in the Hebron district.
- To monitor and report on women's situation in the Hebron district by means of the project's media productions.

5.3 *Results/outputs planned:*

- 31 women and men from marginalized areas of Hebron were trained in media production and women's rights campaigning.
- 100 copies of a training manual in CD-format were produced and distributed.
- 9 radio programs and 4 TV programs dealing with different topics related to women's rights were produced by the participants.
- The radio and TV programs were broadcast by 6 local stations.
- A photo exhibition on women's situation in the Hebron district. was shown to the general public.

5.4 **Target groups (beneficiaries):**

Young women and men in the Hebron district, local radio and TV stations and the general public.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE :

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$47, 000

Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$20, 000

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES :

Development Cooperation of Ireland contributed US \$ 35, 000.

Time schedule/project duration: 7 months commencing in December 2006 and ending in July 2007 with the submission of a final report and financial statement.

B ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

The present project's primary purpose has been to empower women in marginalized communities of the Hebron area by teaching them how to use media production and run awareness-raising campaigns to express their concerns to a wider spectrum of the community, encourage their participation in decision-making and development, and strengthen their involvement in the promotion of gender equality in all aspects of life. These objectives are both highly relevant and well-conceived for the following reasons:

Hebron is controlled by a number of local patriarchal clans or "families", all of them traditional and conservative. Clan elders (all of them men) decide over the rest of the population. As a result, Hebron's women suffer greatly from this situation, some common examples:

- Active female participation in public, social and economic life is very low.
- Domestic violence is a common phenomenon.
- Young women are encouraged, if not outright forced, to marry at a very early age.
- Young women who have separated from boyfriends with whom they've been living together (so-called "legal marriages" which are neither legal nor binding) are

stigmatized and ostracized by the community while the young men go free from criticism or blame.

- Honor killings are still common-place.
- Women lack equal access to higher education and better positions.
- Women still cannot travel freely without being accompanied by a male escort.

Moreover, the clans totally dominate the media in Hebron. 8 clans own the city's 9 local radio stations and 2 of the clans own the city's 2 local TV stations. The stations broadcast their respective clans' political and social agendas,. Consequently, the Hebron area's women have no effective voice or forum in which to debate and discuss issues of relevancy to them.

Short-term objectives : The project had 4 immediate objectives:

- To train 31 young women and men in gender-related Public Relations, TV and radio production and photo journalism.
- To develop a training manual for the workshops.
- To produce 9 radio and 4 TV programs dealing with gender issues.
- Broadcasting the above-mentioned productions on local TV and radio stations.

These short-term objectives were realistic and logical and, as a result, were not only implemented successfully, but actually surpassed expectations.

Arranging 9 knowledge-oriented courses on gender issues, public relations and an introduction to community media and advocacy journalism followed by 2 hands-on, process-oriented technical training workshops facilitated the consequent production of 13 high-quality programs.

Considering how conservative the local radio and TV stations are, the fact that 6 stations broadcast the material produced is not only satisfactory, but remarkable.

IPYL's Media Development Center CMC was able to use its network amongst local NGOs, al-Arroub College's media unit, the Hebron University Journalism Dept. and municipal agencies to attract suitable candidates for the program. Due to the large number of applicants, the original target of 20 participants was raised to 31. Including men as project participants was highly justified - gender is not merely a women's issue, but a matter of concern for both men and women.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities : The project was completed within 7 months between Dec. 12, 2006 and June 30, 2007. This included a 1 1/2 month extension which was needed so that some of the participants affected by rescheduling of the school year could finish their programs.

- **A project management team** (project coordinator, part-time secretary and part-time accountant) was appointed the day after the signing of the contract between UNESCO and IPYL. A trainer team consisting of 5 trainers in gender and media issues was then recruited and set about developing application forms, workshop programs and a training manual for the project. The trainers were selected on the basis of their technical know-how, pedagogical competence and the fact that they all lived in or near Hebron. Hiring trainers from other districts would have led to problems with commuting, due to Israeli checkpoints and closures. As a result, 4 of the trainers were men and one was a woman. The project team also met with Dr. Zahira Kamal at the **Palestine Women's Research and Document Center** in Ramallah in mid-January to discuss topics for gender workshops and gather material for inclusion in the training manuals.

- **Recruitment of participants** was completed by December 30, 2006. The project received a total of 45 applicants, 31 of whom were selected from the city of Hebron and its outlying villages (25 women and 6 men).

- **A joint meeting between trainers and participants** was held in early January 2007 to present the program and work out a workshop schedule that was as convenient as possible to everybody involved.

- **6 workshops on gender issues**, each workshop consisting of 10 hours of training, were then held for two groups of participants between January 20 - March 10, 2007 and consisted of the following topics:

- The International Human Rights Charter
- Women Rights and Gender Equality
- Women's Participation in the Socio-Political System.
- Gender Mainstreaming
- Tradition, Religion and Human Rights
- Agenda-Setting

- **3 workshops on journalism**, (10 hours each), were held during March 2007:

- Journalism Genres and Techniques
- Television Production
- Radio Production

- **2 workshops on public relations** (5 hours each) were arranged in April, 2007:

- Gender Equality Advocacy
- Arranging Public Events

- **9 radio programs and 4 TV programs** focusing on gender issues were produced by the participants during April - May, 2007. Radio programs:

Women's Rights to Education: 9:03 minutes

The Dowry: 7:42 minutes

Women's Rights to Political Participation: 7:48 minutes
Early Marriage: Two programs, 9:39 minutes and 7:41 minutes
'URFY- Temporary Marriage: 7:23 minutes
Women Prisoners: 9:34 minutes
Guards for Heritage: 5 minutes
Violence against women: 8:07 minutes

The following 4 TV programs were produced:

Honour killing: 17:27 minutes
Women between reality and rights: 19:45 minutes
Early marriage: 12:42 minutes
School drop outs: 9:05 minutes

- **A photo exhibition** depicting the everyday life of Palestinian women was also produced by the participants and displayed to the general public in May, 2007.

Project management: The CMC managed the project effectively and made good use of its local community network. As was the case in previous IPYL projects, its management made great efforts to be as transparent as possible with the participants' families, inviting them to visit the center and see with their own eyes what is being done there. This is a very effective way to stop rumors, suspicion and unfounded criticism in a conservative community such as Hebron..

Funds management: The IPDC grant was used to pay coordination and trainer salaries, produce the CD training manual and buy some supplementary equipment needed for the project's effective implementation. Considering the good concrete results of the project, the funds were definitely used in a prudent manner.

UNESCO service: The present project is actually a second phase of the UNESCO-funded "Empowering the Media in Hebron" project implemented in 2005. This is an excellent example of how to develop a more long-term strategy by stringing projects together.

Collaboration: Cooperation between IPYL/CMC and local NGOs, the Hebron University Journalism Dept. and al-Arroub College Media Unit was effective and contributed greatly to the success of the project in spreading word of its existence and reaching potential participants in the project.

Project documentation: Project documentation was comprehensive and provided the evaluator with a clear picture of how the project progressed. In addition to administrative documentation, interim, financial and final reports, IPYL/CMC has also uploaded all the documentaries on its website for viewing/listening. A CD copy of the training manual was also produced.

Project monitoring: The project was closely monitored by the IPYL's manager and project coordinator. The Media Adviser in the UNESCO Ramallah Office was fully supportive of the project and kept herself well-informed about its implementation.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results: The most tangible results are

- 1) the 11 workshops on gender, public relations and media production in which 31 women and men from marginalized areas of Hebron were trained in media production and women's rights campaigning.
- 2) 100 copies of a training manual in CD-format were produced and distributed.
- 3) 9 radio programs and 4 TV programs dealing with different topics related to women's rights were produced by the participants.
- 4) The radio and TV programs were broadcast by 6 local stations.
- 5) A photo exhibition on women's situation in the Hebron district was shown to the general public.
- 6) A nucleus of a network of media professionals interested in promoting gender issues and women's rights has been established.

Cost-effectiveness: The US\$20,000 IPDC grant was definitely cost-effective, given the number of workshops held and programs produced, the number of workshop participants, production of the training CD, the photo exhibit and the purchase of additional equipment needed to implement the project in an effective way.

Development impact: While the project has so far perhaps only had a modest impact on either media and women's situation in Hebron, it has had a definite, strong impact on the young people who attended the workshops and produced the programs. Participants were overwhelmingly positive to course content and quality, want to attend more courses and are also very interested in developing the project further into establishing an independent community-based local radio station.

Course participants, both men and women, also say their attitudes towards working together with the opposite sex have changed dramatically. Prior to the workshops, the participants interviewed say that prior to the project, they could not conceive of working in mixed groups. Now, they respect each other's opinions and perspectives and emphasize that the experience has been very rewarding. The participants have continued to meet and work together. As two of the participants interviewed for this evaluation put it: "We learned that women can make a difference and not just can be active but need to be active."

Two of the participants are teachers and have screened some of the project documentaries for their students, which led to intensive discussions on gender equality. Asked what she learned the most from participating in the project, one of the teachers answered: "Demand the same of boys as you do of girls".

There was also a strong audience response and lively, frank debates when some of the stations arranged phone-in shows in connection with when the programs/documentaries were aired.

Sustainability: As long as the political situation in Hebron and the West Bank continues to be as unstable as it is at present, it is highly unlikely that IPYL or the CMC - or any other NGO in the Occupied Palestinian Territories for that matter - will be able to become economically sustainable. The West Bank's economy is in shambles after years

of occupation and PA corruption. Media companies can barely survive and have no interest in investing in mid-career training, nor can they afford to pay freelancers or the CMC to produce programs for them. Therefore, the IPYL will continue to be dependant on grants and subsidies in the foreseeable future.

However, the CMC is definitely sustainable when it comes to facilities, staff know-how and community relations. The CMC has made a name for itself on the local level and NGOs clearly see the media center as a resource to which they can turn to produce information material in all forms - print, audio, visual and internet-based.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management: IPYL should continue to broaden its network of local NGOs, etc. in order to reach even more potential participants. A project website or e-mail newsletter could be one way of reaching activists and potential participants. If the training kit is only in English it should perhaps be translated into Arabic so that more people can make use of it. The evaluator has only seen the English version.

Recipient institution: IPYL should find ways to more actively involve local radio and TV stations in its projects and get them to commit themselves to broadcast material from the very beginning. For this purpose, IPYL could perhaps try arrange programming seminars for the local stations in order to discuss content development and attractive program ideas. Good current affairs programs can attract larger audiences!

IPYL's Media Center should further develop cooperation with other media institutes on the West Bank, especially the Birzeit University Media Development Center BZUMDC which is firmly established and highly-respected by Palestine's journalist corps. Both the IPYL/CMC and BZUMDC stand to benefit from a closer cooperation. Hebronites have a hard time attending courses arranged in Ramallah due to travel restrictions and lodging costs, so it would be better if BZUMDC held some of its courses in Hebron. BZU has the funding for trainers but lacks facilities in Hebron while the CMC lacks funding to recruit trainers but has the facilities and equipment needed to run courses and workshops.

IPYL could also approach PBC Voice of Palestine about broadcasting the programs produced at/by the CMC.

Member State: The Palestinian Authority should support - or at least encourage - the establishment of a local, independent community-based radio station having a Public Service charter. Private radio stations are simply too commercial, unprofessional and not really interested in/cannot afford producing and broadcasting relevant current affairs material.

IPDC: IPDC could continue to support IPYL's Media Center with an aim to lay the groundwork for the establishment of an independent, community-based local radio station. IPDC could also support competency-building measures at IPYL such as financing Training of Trainers courses for local Hebron talent.

UNESCO: UNESCO should seriously consider supporting the CMC and other NGOs in

Hebron in their aspirations to establish a community-based local radio station. Palestine is in dire need of Public Service TV and radio.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project: Focusing on young media professionals and students of journalism is logical, given that they constitute the future of media in Hebron and are more apt to consider change than older, more tradition-bound counterparts. By having a mix of male and female participants, the project counteracted the wide-spread belief that gender issues are merely women's concerns. It also led to more dynamic discussions and debate during the workshops, something which both male and female participants confirmed during evaluation interviews.

Despite its size and economic importance, Hebron has been a neglected area when it comes to international and national media support efforts. Projects such as this one are really needed and appreciated.

Way of co-operation: IPYL/CMC's close co-operation with local NGOs and schools, etc. effectively spread the word about the project and resulted in a large number of applicants. The CMC's community network is one of its greatest strengths.

Cooperation with the local radio and TV stations hasn't been as successful, but this is due to the fact that the CMC and most of the stations in question have contradictory goals (media advocacy and human rights versus blatant commercialism and self-serving clan-related political agendas).

Inputs: CMC staff has coordinated all activities, contracted trainers and arranged for guest lecturers. The trainers wrote the training manual. Local NGOs nominated applicants or encouraged people to apply. al-Marah Radio ensured that a number of other local stations broadcast project productions.

Instruments used:

- (a) A project management team to coordinate the project, trainers and guest lecturers to lead workshops and coordinate program production.
- (b) 11 gender, PR and journalism workshops.
- (c) A training manual.
- (d) Production workshops for 9 radio and 4 TV programs dealing with gender issues.
- (e) Photo exhibition depicting the everyday life of Palestinian women.

Outputs/outcomes:

- (a) 6 gender, 2 PR and 3 journalism workshops totalling 100 hours.
- (b) 100 copies of the training manual in CD format have been distributed to interested parties.
- (c) 13 radio and TV programs (9 radio and 4 TV) totalling 2.1 hours.
- (d) The programs were broadcast by 6 local radio stations and 2 local TV stations.
- (e) A photo exhibition was produced and displayed for 2 weeks at the Media Center.
- (f) A network of young activists who want to promote gender equality and women's rights has been established.

- (g) The participants continue to use CMC facilities to produce material of their own.
 - (h) The CMC has become a local “hub” for media-related NGO activities in Hebron.
-

13. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

Methodology: A mixed method was used consisting of desk research, interviews and a study of the produced programs. Fieldwork was carried out in Hebron on September 9-12.

Key informants:

UNESCO Ramallah Office

Ms Irmeli Seipäjärvi, Adviser for Communication and Information

IPYL

Mr. Adli Daana, director and Ms. Niba' Abu Hamdia, project secretary and trainer

Limitations:

The evaluator does not have enough command of the Arabic language to be able to carry out any in-depth analysis of the actual editorial content of the radio and TV productions.

The evaluator was not able to verify the exact times and dates when participating radio and television stations broadcast the programs, nor was he able to interview any of the audience.

Kalmar, Sweden, December 10, 2007

James Downing

ANNEX 1:

Sources and interviewees

Sources:

- Project description and workshop programs
- Training manual
- Production workshop CDs/DVDs
- Interim progress reports from IPYL
- Final IPYL project report from July 2007
- IPYL financial report

List of interviewees:

IPYL Media Center staff Mr. Adli Daana, Mr. Bilal Salameh Ms. Nida' Abu Hamdieh Mr. Mazen Jabari	Radio stations Mr. Yunis Darwish, director as-Sharq Radio Baladna Radio Mr. Abdeljabbar Abu Sneneh, director, Siraji Radio
Project participants Mr. Hamzeh Qawasmeh Ms. Ayah Abu Mayaleh Ms. Jumana Shawar Ms. Lina al-Arjan Ms. Safa' Abu Yousef	Ministry of Information, Hebron District Mr. Ismael Jahshan, Director-General
Trainers: Mr. Bassam al-Haddad Mr. Hamzeh Qawasmeh	Governor 's Office in Hebron Ms. Samia Wazwaz, Director, Media Section Dr. Hussein Aa'raj, Governor of Hebron
al-Arroub College Media Training Center Mr. Bassam al-Haddad, Director	Women's Work Society in Hebron Ms. Sawsan Nasseredin, Director
Hebron University Media Dept. Mr. Ziad al-Jabari, Director	Legal Counseling Center in Hebron Ms. Amal al-Ju'beh, Director
UNESCO Ms. Irmeli Seipäjärvi, Ramallah Office Media Advisor	

ANNEX 2:**Evaluation Program**

Sunday, September 9, 2007	
12:00 - 16:00	Meeting with Adli Daana and Bilal Salameh, IPYL
Monday, September 10, 2007	
09:30 - 11:00	Ministry of Information
11:15 - 12:30	Hebron Governor's Office
14:00 - 15:00	al-Arroub College Media Training Center
15.30 -16.30	Visits to radio stations
Tuesday, September 11, 2007	
09:30 - 13:00	Meeting with project participants
14:00 - 15:00	Women's Work Society in Hebron
15:00 - 16:30	Tour of Old City
Wednesday, September 12, 2007	
09:30 - 11:00	Legal Counseling Center
11:00 - 12:00	Hebron University Journalism Dept.
14:00 - 15:00	Meeting with Media Center trainers
	Legal Counseling Center
15:00 - 16:00	Follow-up meeting with IPYL

Guatemala

Evaluation Report

Executive Summary

Project Title:	Creation of a Mayan communication network - REFCOMAYA
Project Number:	PDC/49 GUA/01, 354GUA5051
Category:	Press, radio and television
Agency:	UNESCO San José Office
Beneficiary & Main Implementing Agency:	Academy of Mayan Languages of Guatemala <i>Academia de Lenguas Mayas de Guatemala (ALMG)</i>
IPDC Assistance:	US \$ 20,000
Period of Execution:	November 2006 through November 2007
Evaluated by:	Andrew Lieberman, andylieberman@gmail.com

This project trained Mayan social communicators and organized them into a network in order to strengthen the use of Mayan languages in Guatemalan media, thereby contributing to the building of peace in a multicultural State by means of freedom of expression.

Through this project, 30 social communicators, all employed by ALMG on renewable annual contracts, received 22 full days of training in broadcasting and production techniques. 36% of the participants were female. Approximately 80% were under the age of 25. The participants spoke 15 of the 22 Mayan languages spoken in Guatemala. All of the participants broadcast at least one hour per month on community radio stations, with some having shows on as many as seven radio stations and local cable TV. This was a strategic target population, because the individual participants and the local ALMG linguistic communities they work for will be able to exploit the new skills in multiple ways, including replicating the training locally with the radio stations they partner with and offering other production services to the community at large.

The 160+ hours of training was divided into six (one more than originally planned) multi-day workshops. The contents included:

- Role of social communicators in promoting Mayan language and culture
- Radio broadcasting techniques
- Basic radio production
- Additional radio production techniques
- Audio editing software
- Practice production and peer interchange

Each workshop combined theory and practice, with participants working in groups to produce sample spots for peer review. As a culminating project, each participant produced a five-minute "radio magazine" in both Spanish and their Mayan language, which they broadcast on their shows. Further, based on a request from the government to ALMG, the participants prepared 8 spots about the upcoming elections, which were broadcast nationally. The training curriculum was highly relevant to the needs of the participants and immediately applicable in their communities. The only concern is that most of the software that was used is expensive, commercial software, which will fuel

the use of pirated versions, rather than promoting free alternatives.

The participants also organized themselves into a network, REFCOMAYA, with a governing board made up of its members. This network would ostensibly take responsibility for the sustainability, replication, and application of the training received. However, it appears that REFCOMAYA has not been institutionalized into ALMG, meaning that there is no specific budget to support REFCOMAYA nor other circumstances that will oblige the REFCOMAYA members to formalize the network. For REFCOMAYA to live up to its promise, ALMG or an outside donor will have to provide funding and technical assistance.

While REFCOMAYA may well fall short of expectations as a network, it is more than compensated for by the tremendous impact that the training had in the professional lives of the thirty participants and the multiplier effects in their communities. Participants are actively applying their new skills both in their jobs with ALMG and on their own with other community groups.

When this evaluator visited two of the participants in the Kaqchikel linguistic community office and traveled with them to *Florencia Estereo* and *Radio Ixchel*, there was no question that they are not only applying the skills they learned, but also replicating them to the rest of the radio staff. Augusto Cuj summarized his new way of producing by saying:

Other programs focus on just informing, but we want to communicate. The mass media has shaped our listeners. If the people hear a cultural program, they change the station. That's why we have to entertain the listeners with music. We want to motivate the town's population. We used to produce two-minute spots; now we keep them under thirty seconds.

Silvia Cumez has gone even further by purchasing her own computer and accessories, offering bilingual audio production services to her hometown of San Juan Comalapa, with her clientele including the local campaign committee for now-President, Alvaro Colom. Such social entrepreneurial activities by many of the participants are one of the most effective ways of diffusing innovation in rural Guatemala.

This project was ALMG's first experience in managing international donor funding. Despite challenges of having to comply with sometimes contradicting requirements of UNESCO and the Guatemalan government, ALMG viewed the experience as positive, and National ALMG president, Pascual Martin Domingo Pascual, reiterated his thanks to UNESCO for providing training that would not otherwise be possible.

EVALUATION REPORT

- A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY
1. PROJECT TITLE
- Creation of a Mayan communication network -
REFCOMAYA
2. PROJECT NUMBER
- PDC/49 GUA/01
354GUA5051
3. CATEGORY : Radio, television, and printed press
4. AGENCY : UNESCO San José Office
- 4.1 BENEFICIARY:
- Academy of Mayan Languages of Guatemala
Academia de Lenguas Mayas de Guatemala (ALMG)
- 4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:
- Academy of Mayan Languages of Guatemala
Academia de Lenguas Mayas de Guatemala (ALMG)
-
5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES
- 5.1 Overall or development objectives:
- By training social communicators and creating a network of young Mayan communicators, the use of Mayan languages in Guatemalan media will be strengthened, thus contributing to the building of peace in a multicultural State by means of the freedom of expression.
- 5.2 Operational or project objectives:
- To train one hundred (100) Mayan communicators from various linguistic communities in the various technical aspects related to radio broadcasting in Mayan languages.
 - To train one hundred (100) Mayan communicators from various linguistic communities in the current issues confronted by the indigenous peoples, placing an emphasis on the ways to make the language an instrument of social change.
 - To train fifty (50) communicators in the rights of indigenous peoples and develop dialogues about the current national reality.

- To build a network of young Mayan communicators (REFCOMAYA) formed with one hundred (100) journalists. This network will promote and diffuse the use of the Mayan languages in the media, so as to foster the cultural identity and development of the indigenous population.

5.3

Results/outputs planned:

- One hundred (100) communicators will have updated tools on broadcasting, production, and technical aspects to encourage communication in linguistic communities.
- Radio producers from twenty-two (22) linguistic communities in the country will be able to produce high quality information in Mayan languages, adapted to their cultural context.
- A network of young Mayan social communicators will work actively towards the use of the Mayan languages in the Guatemalan media.
- Experience exchanges with a selective group of fifty (50) social communicators who work in the media, who will define follow-up activities for the strengthening and diffusion of information issued in Mayan languages.
- Mayan communication students will count on updated didactic material on how to broadcast in Mayan languages.
- A filmed report of the experience.

5.4

Target groups (beneficiaries):

- Young Mayan radio communicators already working in legally established media within rural and urban areas located in the twenty-two (22) departments of Guatemala.
- Journalists from rural and indigenous communities who do not have proper access to mainstream media nor the possibility to express themselves in their own language.

6.

IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US \$ 34,300

Assistance approved by IPDC: US \$ 20,000

The approved amount was used for:

- Carrying out the workshops and meetings foreseen.
- Elaborating the training material.
- Filming and producing the TV report.

7.

CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1

Agency contributions

NO

- 7.2 Other
- 7.3 Time schedule/project duration
2006-2007

B - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

This project was designed to implement mechanisms of inclusion of Mayan language and culture into Guatemalan media. This objective, mandated by the 1996 peace accords, is a valuable development objective in its own right and a pre-requisite to obtaining inclusion and development in Mayan communities.

The ALMG has clarity in its mission and the contribution they are making to Guatemala's development. Mayan people have historically been discriminated against for using and promoting their languages. ALMG works to turn the tide by researching, documenting and promoting Mayan languages and culture. From the national ALMG president to the partners in rural communities, this evaluator received the same message: Mayan language is being lost, causing a cultural void and lack of identity and lowered self-esteem for young Mayans, while marginalizing Mayan elders.

Cecilio Tuyuc, President of the Kaqchikel linguistic community, succinctly described the relationship between linguistic inclusion and other development goals by saying, "If my brother identifies himself with his culture, he strengthens his values and stays out of gangs, HIV/AIDS, and other damaging activities."

The role of the media in strengthening and promoting language, culture, and identity cannot be denied. Tuyuc explained the reality of the cultural shift reaching Mayan communities and what ALMG is doing about it: "The children don't eat around the cooking fire anymore. Now they sit around the TV. So, we have to change the way we get our messages to them."

Short-term objectives:

Clearly, local Mayan communicators are the best agents of change for strengthening Mayan language and culture through the media. Of the 22 Mayan linguistic communities, 15 have formal social communication programs and the rest include communication as a crosscutting theme of their activities. The immediate objectives of this project were to strengthen the communicators' technical skills in radio production and to build a network of young Mayan communicators that would continue to support each other beyond the life of project.

The objectives are clear and relevant, with only one conflict of data regarding the number of participants. In the original proposal presented to IPDC, ALMG stated clearly that the project activities would be directed to a group of 35 communicators

already employed by ALMG. However, in the project information presented to this evaluator by IPDC, the objectives mention training that would have reached 100 Mayan communicators. When Victor Paz, Project Coordinator, was asked about the discrepancy, he stated that the project had always been designed with the 35 existing communicators in mind. In this evaluator's opinion, ALMG made a wise decision by investing heavily in its communicators spread throughout the country because the project clearly had a deep impact on them and they are in an ideal position to apply what they learned, replicate the training in their respective communities, and receive further training. Had ALMG attempted to reach 100 communicators with the available funding, the training process would have likely turned into superficial trainings with negligible impact in the participants.

9.

ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities:

This project provided an intensive formation for a group of approximately thirty fulltime staff of the ALMG located throughout the country, with each participant receiving 22 full days of training over a one-year period.

This formation included the following six workshops:

- National reality of indigenous peoples: role of social communicators in promoting Mayan language and culture, formation of REFCOMAYA network (3 days)
- Radio broadcasting techniques: breathing, speaking, voice, microphone use (3 days)
- Radio production: radio formats, script writing, language, voice techniques (4 days)
- Technical radio aspects: Recording techniques, use of Cool Edit and Adobe Audition (5 days)
- Audio editing software: use of SoundForge (5 days)
- Practice production and peer interchange (2 days)

Each workshop combined instruction with practice sessions, in which the participants created spots and other short programs in Spanish and their own Mayan language. Participants received Spanish-language readers, averaging 30 pages for each workshop. Many of the contents, especially those for use of the editing software appear to be downloaded from Internet. Others appear to be training materials developed by the workshops facilitators. The training materials all are well-written, practical, and engaging materials that surely helped keep the workshops on track and continue to serve the participants as reference material.

It is also clear that the workshops followed a natural progression, beginning with the contextual issues of Mayan language and cultural, which all participants were already familiar with to differing degrees depending on how long they had been with ALMG or working in a similar organization. The training then moved into the non-computer technical aspects of radio production, such as selecting a format, scripting, language, and voice. In this area, most participants already had empirical ideas about topics since they already had radio programs. This was new, however, to some participants who were new to ALMG or whose linguistic communities do not have formal social communication programs. The last, and most intense, training focused on use of

commercial computer software to produce radio programs. This was new to all the participants, with some participants having only minimal ability to use a computer.

The facilitators took into account the disparate skills sets of the participants and the limited resources—only about ten computers were available for the thirty participants to share. They grouped participants of different skill levels together, so that the more knowledgeable about a certain matter could share his or her knowledge with the rest of the group. Because of the practical nature of the workshop and the group use of computers, cross-learning among participants was maximized.

Project management:

From this evaluator's fieldwork and document review, the project appears to have been excellently managed. The project work plan was incorporated into the ALMG central office's annual plan and there appears to have been coordination between the central office and each linguistic community to ensure stable participation.

ALMG works on a very structured yearly cycle, with much of the staff, including the workshop participants, having annual contracts that run from February to October. Because the project start date was later than expected, the first workshop was held in November, which put an unnecessary burden on ALMG because it required participants to attend on their own time.

This was ALMG's first experience receiving and executing funds from an outside donor. During this evaluator's field visit, the accounting staff explained some of the challenges this presents—most notably the fact that no payments can be made unless funds have already entered the ALMG bank account. This is a direct conflict of how UNESCO—and most other international donors—operate, because they expect to hold back final disbursement until all the funds have been spent. Had ALMG and UNESCO anticipated this situation, ALMG could have reduced inconvenience by negotiating the smallest possible holdback from UNESCO and by warning its service providers accordingly. Another potential strategy would have been to use a local NGO to administer the funds—although ALMG stated that they felt that were happy to have administered the funds themselves so as to maximize return on investment and keep full control over the project.

UNESCO services:

It appears from the feedback received from ALMG staff that ALMG had a positive experience working with UNESCO. The only inconveniences were the conflicting requirements for financial administration between UNESCO and the Guatemalan government and the differences between the official United Nations exchange rate and the lower rate that Guatemalan banks actually gave. No one interviewed seemed to consider these difficulties as impediments for the project. In fact, Pascual Martin Domingo Pascual, the newly elected national ALMG president, reiterated emphatically his thanks to UNESCO for having funded this project, stating that this type of training is much needed, and that with the 50% budget cut by the Guatemalan government for 2008, that ALMG could not provide such in-depth training without external support.

Collaboration:

This project incorporated collaboration at the local level, with each workshop participant directly or indirectly sharing the training at the radio and local cable TV stations at which they broadcast. Each workshop participant broadcasts at least one hour per month in his or her indigenous language thanks to partnerships with local radio stations, with some participants having shows on as many as seven different stations. As the participants continue to apply their new skills at these local stations, the other broadcasters will surely respect them and learn from them.

This evaluator visited two community radio stations where Silvia Cumez and Augusto Cuuj, two project participants, have regular shows. In each case, it was clear from speaking with the other broadcasters and the station managers, that there is a synergetic relationship between ALMG and the stations they partner with. The stations spoke highly of the ALMG broadcasters and their Kaqchikel language programs, pointing out how the language is being lost by the younger generation, and the need to bring it back by using the same techniques that commercial media uses to sell. If the relationship between these two stations and ALMG is at all indicative of the relationships between ALMG and rest of the local stations it partners with, it is clear that REFCOMAYA has the potential for using media to reach out effectively to Mayan communities.

Project monitoring:

Victor Paz, ALMG Project Coordinator, personally hired and supervised the trainers that facilitated each workshop. By his own estimate, he attended over half the workshops. The ALMG Finance Office staff also approved each expense. From this evaluator's fieldwork, the project appears to have been executed smoothly. Since there were funds left over, a sixth workshop was added.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results:

Undeniably, this project was a catalyst in constructing a network of approximately 30 Mayan social communicators employed by ALMG, representing over 15 Mayan languages. Because of the in-depth nature of the training and the selection process, all of the participants should have experienced large gains in their skills and ample opportunity to apply and replicate these new skills. Further, the REFCOMAYA network has the potential to be a key mechanism for bringing new opportunities to Mayan social communicators across the country.

The workshops clearly provided practical skills that participants put into immediate use. This evaluator was given several CDs with productions done during the workshops and another CD of the work of Augusto Cuuj, one of the participants. Some of the key outputs are:

- Each participant prepared a 5-minute "radio magazine," with versions in their Mayan language and in Spanish. These were broadcast in their communities.
- 8 spots in different Mayan languages were prepared for the government's Election Board (TSE). These spots were aired by TSE throughout the country.

- Participants produced a number of practice spots in which they applied their technical skills by combining music, sound effects, and voice.
- Some participants began to practice with video editing.
- Participants learned to use the free Zara Radio program, which commercial and community radio stations throughout Latin America are adopting as their broadcasting software of choice.

Regarding gender equality of the participants, ALMG's project coordinator did make an explicit effort to include at least one female participant from each linguistic group. However, only 36% of the participants were female, which is still better than may have been expected. For cultural and family reasons, it is often difficult for women to be away from home for multi-day trainings such as these. Further, while no statistics could be obtained, ALMG mentioned that despite its efforts to seek gender equity, the majority of its employees are male.

Regarding linguistic diversity, ALMG encouraged participation of all 22 of its linguistic communities, achieving a stable participation of 15 communities—those that have actual social communication programs.

The project was designed to encourage a high percentage of the participants to be youth, presumably because they would learn faster and would have more initiative in finding ways to apply their new skills in their communities. ALMG could not provide statistics about the ages of the participants, but did mention that "nearly all" were under 25 years of age.

Cost-effectiveness:

In this evaluator's opinion, this project had a much higher than average return on UNESCO's investment. UNESCO contributed less than US\$30 per participant per day of training. This is especially commendable since the participants came from all over Guatemala, including some of the hardest to reach communities that seldom receive training.

A further indicator of the cost-effectiveness of this project is that nearly all of the participants are still working with ALMG and are applying what they learned in their daily professional lives. The ALMG project coordinator considered that only one participant was negative about the workshops, whereas the rest were committed to actively applying all they had learned. When asked if all of the participants had been rehired by ALMG this year, the project coordinator said that he did not have that data readily available, but that he estimated that all had been rehired "with few exceptions, if any."

Development impact:

There is no question that this project significantly increased the quantity and quality of Mayan language broadcasting throughout the country, providing multiple benefits for the Mayan people, who are still struggling to build an inclusive multilingual, multicultural society in which local traditions thrive in a global economy.

Regarding the amount of Mayan language programming on the mass media, as this amount goes up, it gives status to Mayan speakers, and draws in wider audiences. The population that is uneducated is generally the same group of people that speaks little Spanish. Not surprisingly, these monolingual Mayan speakers are disproportionately rural, poor, older, and female. Radio content in their languages is a cost-effective strategy for reaching out to them with social messages.

While many young Mayans are growing up not speaking the Mayan language, a significant—and perhaps growing—percentage later seek to pick up the language as young adults. In this case, these radio programs provide them opportunities to build language skills and increase their cultural knowledge.

Further, by raising the quality of the audio productions in Mayan languages, the ALMG helps to break down the idea that Mayan language content is "second class." In interviews for this evaluation, the Mayan communicators repeatedly mentioned that they must "learn the techniques of the mass media" and "combine entertainment and music with social messages." From the productions reviewed by this evaluator, it is evident that the ALMG communicators are actively applying these principles to their work and producing materials that are on par with other locally produced radio content.

Augusto Cuuj recognizes the need for providing dynamic programming to the audiences they want to reach:

Other programs focus on just informing, but we want to communicate. The mass media has shaped our listeners. If the people hear a cultural program, they change the station. That's why we have to entertain the listeners with music. We want to motivate the town's population. We used to produce two-minute spots; now we keep them under thirty seconds.

Sustainability:

Although the training given through this project created an ongoing positive impact in ALMG's work and the professional growth of the participants, the project did not have specific sustainability mechanisms included in its design. This can be noted in at least two areas: replication of training and continued building of the REFCOMAYA network.

The training curriculum and materials that were compiled for these workshops provide a solid introductory training that ideally could be repeated periodically for new ALMG employees. However, although ALMG "authorized" the materials, they were not formally published nor made available in any ongoing way, such as via the ALMG website, so it is unlikely that the workshops will be repeated.

Also, the REFCOMAYA network was organized, but no specific follow-up has been planned. For REFCOMAYA to really become a functioning network, it will need to develop a plan and budget that can be institutionalized within ALMG. The ALMG Project Coordinator mentioned that the REFCOMAYA board will meet and develop their plans. Although it is too early to determine, in this evaluator's opinion, there is no compelling reason to expect the REFCOMAYA board to meet and develop a plan (i.e.,

no outstanding donor commitment, no funding to execute). With this in mind, unless there is a follow-on activity in the near future, the network is not likely to come to life.

In fairness to ALMG and UNESCO, given the short life of project and small funding amount, the proposed sustainability would likely have been too much to expect.

However, as a side product of the training process, there is strong evidence that many of the participants are actively applying their new skills, even outside their work with ALMG. Victor Paz mentioned that he personally knew of several cases of project participants that had purchased their own computers and microphones and were offering basic audio production services out of their homes to community organizations.

Silvia Cumez of San Juan Comalapa, who began her career with ALMG in 2007, is representative of these young social entrepreneurs that make up REFCOMAYA. She summarized her participation in the workshops by saying, "I love broadcasting, and I did everything I could to learn in the workshops." She recently purchased her own computer and installed the software she learned in the workshops and now offers basic audio production services out of her home. She is the only person that she knows of in her town that offers these services, and has the added advantage of being able to produce in both Spanish and Kaqchikel. Among her growing list of clients is the local support group of presidential-winner Alvaro Colom. She looks forward to building her skills and crossing over into television.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

the project management:

- Use a Yahoo Group or similar online system to support the REFCOMAYA member community.

the recipient institution:

- Identify and promote free software solutions instead of promoting commercial software that will be used illegally (Adobe Audition, Sony Vegas, SoundForge.)
- Continue to strengthen the REFCOMAYA network and look to its members (with further training) as a source of production of programming for the ALMG's soon-to-launch TV station, Maya TV (Channel 5.)
- Continue to seek outside funding from private and public sources because ALMG clearly has capacity to execute and provide counterpart and sustainability.
- Upon negotiating future projects with international donors, anticipate financial reporting requirements and cash flow issues. Negotiate larger early disbursements and the smallest holdback possible, or consider subcontracting a local NGO as an implementing partner.

the Member State:

- Restore the ALMG's budget to at least the 2007 level of funding and provide support for TV Maya (Channel 5).
- Work to find a realistic solution that allows community radio stations to legalize their operations.
- Provide legal and financial support to local community media.
- Simplify processes for receiving and executing funds from international donor agencies.

IPDC:

- Promote the use of free software such as Zara Radio (www.zararadio.com)
- Build private-sector partnerships to allow organizations like ALMG to obtain donations of relevant commercial software like Adobe Audition and Sony Vegas.
- More return on investment can be obtained when a heavier investment is made to provide a meaningful change in a small number of multiplier agents than when many people are reached superficially.
- Consider funding multi-year projects to be able to achieve sustainability.
- Consider funding and partnering to provide permanent, ongoing training mechanisms for indigenous social communicators, such as university certificate or degree programs.

UNESCO:

- Recognize that the duration of the project negotiation phase is difficult to predict for the beneficiary agency, and that many organizations, such as government entities like ALMG, cannot get a head start on project activities until a contract has been formally granted. After the contract is awarded, there will inevitably be a delay in starting, and in the case of ALMG and other entities with cyclical schedules like schools, a project start date that coincides with beneficiary agency end-of-year vacations, will cause significant delays.
- Develop funding mechanisms that allow for more administrative flexibility when working with government agencies.
- Make the implementing agency aware at the outset of the UNESCO administrative requirements and assure that mechanisms are in place to allow for smooth execution. (Review the contract with first-time grantees.)

Lessons learnt with regard to:

the type of project:

- When training responds to detected necessities, there will be deeper commitment and impact.

the way of co-operation:

- ALMG, an autonomous government entity, can effectively and efficiently manage funds from international donors and provide significant counterpart.
- The mismatches in the United Nations exchange rates and the lower exchange rates given by the banks in Guatemala need to be anticipated for by the beneficiary agency.

the inputs:

- Many community radio and cable TV stations will gladly broadcast Mayan language productions such as those produced by REFCOMAYA as long as there is sufficient coordination at the local level.

the instruments used:

- If commercial software is taught in a workshop, participants will seek out pirated copies for their own use, rather than purchase the software or look for a free equivalent.
- When the right free software solution is presented (e.g., Zara Radio), beneficiaries accept it readily and value knowing that they are not using pirated software.

Evaluated by:

Andrew Lieberman
Consulting services to benefit humanity...

115 Cuvier Street
San Francisco, CA 94112
U.S.A.
1-415-404-7341
andyliberman@gmail.com

Period of evaluation:

February 5-8, 2008

Mission itinerary

Work schedule and method:

Date	Location	Partner	Activities
Feb. 5	Guatemala City	ALMG	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ Group interview with project coordination team➤ Coordination of field visits➤ Review of project outputs (training materials, training reports, radio spots produced for TSE, workshop videos, REFCOMAYA documentation)
Feb. 7	Chimaltenango	ALMG	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ Group interview with key staff in ALMG office➤ Interviews with 2 communicators that received the trainings
	San Juan Comalapa		<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ Visit to Florencia Estereo community radio station. Interviews with local team
	Sumpango		<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ Visit to Radio Ixchel community radio station. Interviews with local team

NOTE: On February 6 and 8, the evaluator conducted visits to the beneficiary and partner organizations of another IPDC project, "Training journalists in freedom of expression and indigenous rights." (Project number, PDC/48 GUA/01, 354GUA5041) These visits provided invaluable complimentary information that was also taken into account in this evaluation.

Sources:

- Original project proposal submitted to IPDC
- List of participants in first workshop
- Final report, including:
 - Overall project summary and conclusions
 - Training plan and materials for each workshop
 - Training report from each workshop
- CD of spots produced for TSE (election information)
- CD of workshop sample productions
- CD of Radio Magazine final workshop productions
- CD of spots and programs produced by workshop participant, Augusto Cuj

List of Interviewees:

Name	Function	Organization
Victor Paz	Project Coordinator	Academy of Mayan Languages of Guatemala (Central Office)
Pascual Martin Domingo	President	
Juana Canil Castro	Budget Administrator	
Ventura Batzin	Accounting Manager	
Cecilio Tuyuc	President	Academy of Mayan Languages of Guatemala (Kaqchikel Community Office)
Ana Maria Chonay	Project Coordinator	
Carlos Emilio Guarcax	Communication Manager	
Augusto Cuj Martinez	Social Communicator	
Silvia Cumez Salazar	Kaqchikel Language Facilitator	Florencia Esterio
Edwin Leonel Tzenech	Volunteer Broadcaster	
José Fernando Chalí Chowix	Volunteer Broadcaster	
Pedro Bal	General Manager	
Anselmo Xunic	General Coordinator & Board Member	Radio Ixchel
Maria Rosa Joj	Volunteer Broadcaster	

Evaluation Report	
Executive Summary	

Project Title:	Training journalists in freedom of expression and indigenous rights
Project Number:	PDC/48 GUA/01, 354GUA5041
Category:	Press, radio and television
Agency:	UNESCO San José Office
Beneficiary & Main Implementing Agency:	Presidential Commission against Discrimination and Racism towards the Indigenous Populations in Guatemala <i>Comisión Presidencial contra la Discriminación y el Racismo contra los Pueblos Indígenas en Guatemala (CODISRA)</i>
IPDC Assistance:	US \$ 18,000
Period of Execution:	December 2005 through April 2007
Evaluated by:	Andrew Lieberman, andylieberman@gmail.com

This project was designed to make journalists and media professionals aware of the rights of indigenous communities and of the contribution of social communicators to combating discrimination and racism. Three specific project objectives were defined:

- 1) Organize a high level meeting with Guatemalan media owners to work on communication strategies for combating discrimination and racism.
- 2) Carry out five (5) workshops to improve technical skills of media professionals in the rights of indigenous communities and the contribution of social communicators to combating discrimination and racism.
- 3) Produce one TV spot dealing with the combat against discrimination and racism.

1) High level meeting with Guatemalan media owners

When planning this meeting, CODISRA and its implementing partner NGO, Comunicarte, quickly realized that the proposed objective was too ambitious as a first step in reaching out to the media owners. CODISRA instead hosted three breakfast meetings, one for each of the rival groups that divide the media industry, in which they sensitized the participants to the topics of discrimination and racism. Because these topics have minimal effect on the media companies' bottom lines, the owners took no personal interest, but the program directors, editors, and journalists that participated in their representation were effectively sensitized to the situation. They sought to understand more about communication and media in indigenous communities, and CODISRA leveraged this interest by filming the workshops that followed these meetings and producing a video (described below).

At the end of the project, CODISRA hosted an awards event, recognizing the work of select media leaders in combating racism. This event generated positive dialog, but since the participants are subject to their superiors' commercial focus, CODISRA does

not expect direct changes as a result of these activities. However, they certainly contributed to building relationships that can potentially be built on in future actions.

2) *Five (5) workshops to train journalists*

Five two-day workshops were carried out, with a total of 125 participants (42% female). One workshop was in Guatemala City and the other four were in strategic regional locations in indigenous communities throughout the country. Outside Guatemala City, only 36% of the 94 participants were actual journalists, radio reporters, or correspondents. The rest were community leaders and artists, ostensibly included because of their role as "alternative communicators," but also because the working journalists were too busy "hunting for stories" to commit two full days to the workshop.

Each workshop included two areas of learning. Participants analyzed the topic of "Free Expression and Indigenous Peoples Access to the Media" by discussing a 10-page reader prepared for the workshops. Also, significant time was invested in allowing the alternative communicators to present their art forms (dance, music, story-telling) with corresponding discussion that helped participants value these art forms as important means of social communication.

3) *Production of a TV spot combating discrimination and racism.*

Because the high level meetings with media owners fell far short of the original expectations of being able to engage commitment from the media owners in the fight against discrimination and racism, the idea of production of a TV spot was no longer deemed a priority. Had the spot been created under this project, it is unlikely that it would have been aired because no specific strategies or resources were available to air it.

Under these circumstances, and because of the interest raised in showing media leaders a broader representation of indigenous peoples, a 9-minute video was produced instead of the TV spot. The video gives a rich insight into how artists and community leaders serve as communicators in indigenous communities. It was presented to the Guatemala City high-level media representatives and has since been shown in at least seven other CODISRA workshops. However, due to lack of funding, the video was not distributed to the original workshop participants, nor has it been aired on national or local television stations.

A -	DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY
	PROJECT TITLE
	Training journalists in freedom of expression and indigenous rights
2.	PROJECT NUMBER
	PDC/48 GUA/01 354GUA5041
3.	CATEGORY : Press, radio and television
4.	AGENCY : UNESCO San José Office
4.1	BENEFICIARY : Presidential Commission against Discrimination and Racism towards the Indigenous Populations in Guatemala <i>Comisión Presidencial contra la Discriminación y el Racismo contra los Pueblos Indígenas en Guatemala (CODISRA)</i>
4.2	MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: Presidential Commission against Discrimination and Racism towards the Indigenous Populations in Guatemala <i>Comisión Presidencial contra la Discriminación y el Racismo contra los Pueblos Indígenas en Guatemala (CODISRA)</i>
5.	PROJECT OBJECTIVES
5.1	Overall or development objectives: By making journalists and media professionals aware of the rights for the indigenous communities and of the contribution of social communicators to combating discrimination and racism, the practice of freedom of expression and democratization of the historically privileged media spaces will be ensured.
5.2	Operational or project objectives: ➤ To carry out five (5) workshops to improve technical skills of journalists and media professionals working on national-wide and rural media in the rights for the indigenous communities and in the contribution of social communicators to combating discrimination and racism. ➤ To organize and carry out a high level meeting with Guatemalan media owners to work on the communication strategies for combating discrimination and racism.

- To produce one TV spot dealing with the combat against discrimination and racism.

Results/outputs planned:

- The journalists and communicators involved in the project are trained and made aware of the rights of the indigenous communities.
- Spaces from and for indigenous communities are created in national and local media.
- Guatemalan society has access to more and better information about indigenous communities.
- A TV spot is elaborated and broadcast by the national media.

Target groups (beneficiaries) :

- Journalists and media professionals (men and women; natives and non natives; monolingual and bilingual) based in Guatemala City.
- Journalists and communicators within small communication areas located in the remaining twenty one (21) departments in urban and rural areas.
- Journalists from rural and indigenous communities who have not had proper access to mainstream media nor the capacity to express themselves freely.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US \$ 34,000
 Assistance approved by IPDC: US \$ 18,000

The approved amount was used for:

- Carrying out the workshops and the media owners' meeting.
 - Elaborating the training material.
 - Elaborating the TV spot.
 - Systematizing the experience.
-

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1 Agency contributions

NO

7.2 Other

Time schedule/project duration:

Due to problems that arose in the communication of the fund decentralization, and the difficulties encountered by the beneficiary to redefine the work plan and budget according to the

funds finally granted by the IPDC, the implementation of the project started later than expected.

B - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives :

The project's overall objective combines two inter-related development goals. First, the historically privileged media in Guatemala must improve its portrayal of the indigenous peoples. The media needs to go beyond stories that stereotype the indigenous either as victims of poverty or as elements of folklore. The project sought to foster a broader representation of Guatemala's indigenous population in mass media.

Recognizing the influence of social communicators and local indigenous community media workers, the second objective of this project was to strengthen the work of these local change agents. Local communicators need to improve their skills to be able to reach larger audiences. They also must understand issues surrounding racism, discrimination, and freedom of speech to be able to actively contribute to its reduction.

These goals are clearly a necessity for Guatemala and are mandated in the Peace Agreements signed in 1996. CODISRA's Education, Communication, and Gender unit is the principal government entity tasked with this objective, but given few resources with which to work. To this end, the UNESCO-IPDC funding allowed and obligated CODISRA to take direct actions through this project.

Short-term objectives :

The short-term objectives were all valid and realistic in the conception stage of the project. However, upon implementation, and with the hindsight at the time of this evaluation, we can make interesting reflections about each objective.

The first objective was to improve technical skills of journalism professionals and media professionals. Unfortunately, the reality of media professionals, both those in Guatemala City and in rural communities is that their time is very limited because they are constantly "hunting for stories." Because of the nature of their work, they are generally unwilling to commit to suspending their activities for two full days to receive a workshop.

The second objective, to carry out a high level meeting with Guatemalan media owners, was a worthwhile, although ultimately unattainable, goal. Despite CODISRA's standing as a governmental agency, the theme of indigenous issues and racism is not a priority area for the media, because it does not impact their bottom line. Because there were no financial issues at stake, it was perhaps overly optimistic to expect to personally engage the media owners' attention.

The third objective—to produce and broadcast a TV spot—was a specific action that could have been a uniting thread to the other project actions. However, to ensure that this objective would have been successful, the project would have had to allocate a disproportionately large share of the budget to broadcasting the spot. While we would

like to think that the media owners would have aired the spot as a social benefit, the reality is that Guatemala's private sector sees government and international development organizations as moneyed clients that will pay well for their services.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities :

The three proposed activities were implemented between April and December of 2006, with modifications being made as circumstances dictated.

The five two-day training workshops (four in regional locations and one in Guatemala City) were successfully carried out, reaching 125 participants. However the participant makeup varied significantly from the original proposal. Slightly more than half of the participants work directly with the media in radio, print, or as social communicators. The other half were a mix of local leaders and artists, people CODISRA identified as communicators, because they are a primary source of information for their communities. Interviewees cited two reasons for this shift. First, the Guatemala City journalists wanted to gain a deeper understanding of communication in indigenous cultures. Second, CODISRA had difficulty in recruiting local media professionals for the regional workshops.

Regarding the gender balance of the participants, CODISRA actively sought inclusion of female participants. 42% of the training workshop participants were women. This is commendable, especially in the context of Guatemala, where women generally have fewer opportunities to study and work, not to mention the family and cultural limitations they have on traveling to attend multi-day workshops.

The workshop contents included highly relevant topics, including free speech, media access, and alternative mediums. Further, each regional workshop allowed the artists to present their respective art—dance, music, storytelling—as a catalyst for discussion about how these art forms are also important forms of communication. Because the workshops were dynamic and participative, awareness was built across the different sectors represented. From the point of view of CODISRA and Comunicarte (which facilitated the workshops), another key benefit was the collection of inputs for the video and final Guatemala City events to sensitize the mainstream media.

Regarding the second key activity, a high level meeting of national media owners, CODISRA adopted the best possible strategies to bring the decision-makers to the table. Aware of rivalries among certain media groups, they hosted three separate breakfast events in three consecutive days, one for each group of affiliates. These events reached a total of 50 media professionals, although no owners were reached directly.

As to the third activity, a production of a TV spot to be aired on national TV, the resulting product is a 9-minute video that was aired to the national media leaders and has been distributed to CODISRA's partners and presented in other events. CODISRA opted for this change because it was clear from the high-level breakfast meetings that there was no chance for support for massive broadcasting the proposed TV spot. Further, the video was conceived as a potentially powerful instrument for changing the attitude of the national media leaders, which is a necessary precursor to engaging their active cooperation in changing the way they portray indigenous peoples.

Although not originally planned for, a closure event and awards ceremony was also carried out at the end of the project. In this event, awards were given to select media professionals for their work in combating racism and exclusion. Further, the 9-minute video was presented. This additional event was a strategic follow-on to the breakfasts and workshops.

Project management :

CODISRA is a government entity and must follow all government procedures as well as meeting UNESCO's requirements. These are often contradictory, especially in the financial management. An example is the way the Guatemalan government strictly prohibits spending funds that have not been disbursed, whereas UNESCO requires a holdback of the final disbursement until all funds have been spent and all paperwork has been presented.

Because of these complications, CODISRA made a wise decision in contracting a relevant local NGO, Comunicarte, to administer the funds and lead project implementation. CODISRA was thereby freed of many administrative details while still keeping ownership of the project. This strategy also helped build capacity in Comunicarte and set the ground for follow-on actions that Comunicarte can initiate on its own.

UNESCO services :

Despite the challenges of efficiently executing a small project while complying with all of the requirements of both the Guatemalan government and UNESCO, it appears that CODISRA was satisfied with the relationship with UNESCO. The only difficulty mentioned was that the final disbursement reached Comunicarte nearly a year after the end of the project. This was not necessarily because of any unreasonable delays on UNESCO's part, however, it can strain the cash flow of a small NGO like Comunicarte, especially when the delays are not anticipated.

Further, CODISRA was effective in engaging meaningful cooperation from the local UNESCO office. Katherine Grigsby, UNESCO Representative in Guatemala, spoke personally at most of the Guatemala City events and sent a representative to the events she could not attend. This certainly lent credibility to the events and increased the impact.

Collaboration :

Especially considering the small scale of the project, CODISRA was effective in engaging collaboration of other organizations, although it did not ultimately achieve the desired collaboration of national media owners.

As mentioned, CODISRA involved the NGO, Comunicarte, as an implementing partner. This provided multiple benefits by simplifying the financial administration for CODISRA and supporting Comunicarte in its mission of supporting civil society and media production.

CODISRA also engaged participation of well-respected national and international speakers for its events. In addition to the powerful, focused messages that they delivered, they were also drawn deeper into the themes of free expression of indigenous peoples and indigenous media access.

Project monitoring :

CODISRA's implementing staff, Blanca Estela Alvarado and Rosa Carmela Sosa, participated actively in all events and adjusted the project activities as needed to maximize impact. Key conclusions and recommendations were included in the report presented to UNESCO.

No external monitoring was carried out in the project. While a line item was considered in the original project budget, it was apparently not included in the approved budget.

Results

:

The project clearly achieved meaningful results in training journalists and other social communicators in freedom of expression and indigenous rights. Because the project activities and participants varied significantly from the originally proposed groups and numbers, this evaluator has synthesized the information presented by CODISRA into the following target populations and groups.

Target group	No. Beneficiaries Reached	Result(s) obtained
Directors and owners of mass media	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ No owners of mass media. ➤ 1 Director of a mass media ➤ 5 Directors of mass media programs, mass media editors, etc. ➤ 8 Directors and other alternative media leaders ➤ 36 Reporters, journalists, and others 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Sensitized to the project themes of how indigenous peoples are traditionally portrayed in the mass media and the need for wider inclusion of indigenous people in the media.
Media professionals outside Guatemala City	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ 34 media professionals (reporters, journalists, correspondents, broadcasters, etc.) ➤ 60 "Alternative Communicators" (community leaders and artists) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Sensitized to the reality of the incomplete portrayal of indigenous peoples in the mass media. ➤ Trained in free expression rights and violations in Guatemala. ➤ Sensitized to how community leaders, artists, and other alternative communicators have an important role in informing the local population and their role as communicators.
Media professionals in Guatemala City	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ 31 media professionals (reporters, journalists, editors, radio producers, etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Sensitized to the reality of the incomplete portrayal of indigenous peoples in the mass media. ➤ Trained in free expression rights and violations in Guatemala. ➤ Sensitized to how community leaders, artists, and other alternative communicators have an important role in informing the local population and their role as communicators.

Cost-effectiveness

:

Given the numerous challenges faced to change deeply ingrained cultural and structural factors that limit indigenous peoples' access to the media and the relatively small amount of funding provided by IPDC, this project was clearly an effective initial step in creating new spaces for indigenous in the media and for breaking stereotypes.

Although no immediate impact was made on media owners or the general public, the 175 people that participated directly in the workshops and meetings were surely strengthened in their understandings of relevant issues and strategies.

The roughly US\$100/beneficiary cost of the project can be seen as highly attractive to the extent that the beneficiaries put the workshop contents into practice. Because of the diversity of beneficiaries and the complex and changing context in which they work, it is difficult to predict what percentage will actually have the commitment and opportunity to apply what they learned and concluded in the workshops.

Development impact :

This project clearly had a positive impact on the overwhelming majority of the participants.

Some of the most compelling and credible anecdotal evidence includes:

- For those media professionals already sensitized to the issues, the process validated their beliefs and empowered them to continue their leadership. Haroldo Sanchez, director of the Guatevision TV station, increased his presence as the leader of socially responsible mainstream media. This provides a model for others to emulate. (mentioned by Rosa Carmela Sosa, Armando Cú, and Blanca Estela Alvarado)
- The Guatemala City workshops did lead journalists to accept that they are reproducing racial stereotypes and that the mass media is focused on writing stories that sell, such as violence and disasters. (Armando Cú)
- The 9-minute video that summarized the community work done in the regional workshops impacted the Guatemala City reporters because it convinced them of the value of the rich communication that happens through alternative mediums. (reported by Armando Cú and Blanca Estela Alvarado)
- Ever since the workshops, the newspapers, have been much more responsive about sending reporters to cover activities organized by indigenous organizations. (Blanca Estela Alvarado)
- Many journalists promised to avoid indigenous stereotypes such as automatically naming indigenous characters Juan or Maria, showing indigenous children as dirty and unkempt, and portraying indigenous as speaking Spanish incorrectly. (Rosa Carmela Sosa)
- Journalists from indigenous communities readily accepted and valued the concept that community leaders and artists also serve as social communicators. (Blanca Estela Alvarado)

Meanwhile, there is also evidence that the process had little impact in certain potentially key participants, especially:

- Most of the journalists that participated are not decision-makers in their respective organizations and therefore are limited as to what they report and how they report it. (Blanca Estela Alvarado)
- The producers of two comedy shows that often mock the indigenous declared that they could not change their characters or storyline because they already too large a following. (Blanca Estela Alvarado)

Sustainability :

This project was designed as the needed next step in CODISRA's efforts to create changes at local and national levels. While the project generated many inputs as to further actions that could and should be implemented to reach the proposed objectives, no specific sustainability planning was included in the project design, nor documented in the evaluator's visit. However, follow-on actions are under way.

The 9-minute video is a useful output that CODISRA could potentially push out to media outlets. CODISRA did distribute copies to its regional offices and has shown it in other events. However, due to lack of funding, copies were not sent to all workshop participants, nor were any direct efforts made to have the video aired on national media or local cable TV stations.

CODISRA is now preparing the "National Campaign for Living in Harmony," which will be presented to the media in 2008 through workshops and other activities funded by CODISRA and the Spanish Cooperation. The media sector will see this campaign as a follow-on to the workshops done in 2006 through the UNESCO funding.

This action is pleasantly surprising, especially since the CODISRA leadership changed at the beginning of 2007, just after the UNESCO project finished. As is customary in most agencies, the new commissioners tend to implement new actions, rather than building directly on the work of their predecessors.

In addition to any direct follow-on actions that CODISRA may or may not implement, it is clear that nearly all of the workshop participants are and will be practicing journalism and social communication for many years into the future. To this end, any seeds planted in these agents of change will continue to grow and surely bear fruits far beyond the duration of the project.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

the project management :

- Direct further actions at the journalists that participated in these workshops to provide continuity.
- In future projects with international development agencies such as UNESCO, CODISRA should define the financial administration strategy (subcontracting of a local NGO) at the time of project negotiation to ensure smooth relations among CODISRA, the funding organization, and the implementing NGO.

the recipient institution (CODISRA):

- Direct further training and events at the participants of these workshops to build on the base already constructed, including workshops or other activities that teach interested journalists about Guatemala's indigenous cultures and how to portray them in a non-racist way.

- Design and execute a systematic dissemination campaign for the video produced in this project so that it reaches as wide an audience as possible.
- Design and implement a monitoring system with indicators for the amount of racism and indigenous participation in the mass media, for example, by counting positive and negative references in certain newspapers and TV channels. Statistics presented on a monthly and yearly basis would be beneficial for raising awareness and supporting further training programs and other activities.
- Design and implement a permanent lobbying effort to influence the mass media.

the Member State (Government of Guatemala):

- Work to find a realistic solution that allows community radio stations to legalize their operations.
- Provide legal and financial support to local community media.
- Promote the inclusion of cross-cultural studies and indigenous peoples' right to free expression into the curriculum in all degree programs, especially those relating to journalism.
- Simplify processes for receiving and executing funds from international donor agencies.

IPDC :

- Continue to fund projects that impact multiplier agents.
- Focus funding on projects that increase the potential and impact of journalists and social communicators already working in benefit of marginalized communities such as the indigenous, rather than trying to change the attitude and priorities of mass media. For example:
 - Training in production techniques to raise quality of community programming.
 - Funding for community programming.
 - Production of training materials.
 - Funding for study opportunities for local indigenous journalists and social communicators.

UNESCO :

- Develop funding mechanisms that allow for more administrative flexibility when working with government agencies.
- Make the implementing agency aware at the outset of the UNESCO administrative requirements and assure that mechanisms are in place to allow for smooth execution.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

the type of project :

- Many mass media journalists are reticent to receive training and discuss issues such as discrimination because they have a know-it-all attitude and also there are deep rivalries between certain groups.
- Mass media journalists from the Guatemala City-based national media marginalize and discriminate against journalists from the rest of the country and from the smaller, alternative media.
- Guatemala's mass media have a purely commercial focus, which drives their decision-making.
- There is greater return on investment by strengthening local champions already working in line with CODISRA's objectives than trying to change people and organizations with ingrained mindsets and financial interests.

the way of co-operation :

- UNESCO's administrative requirements do not align well with the administrative requirements of the Guatemalan government.

the inputs :

- Having project actions both in Guatemala City and in indigenous communities resulted in synergy and a building of mutual understanding.

the instruments used :

- When possible, use well-respected local figures to gain credibility and draw in more participants.

Evaluated by:

Andrew Lieberman
Consulting services to benefit humanity...

115 Cuvier Street
San Francisco, CA 94112
U.S.A.
1-415-404-7341
andyliberman@gmail.com

Period of evaluation:

February 5-8, 2008

Mission itinerary

Work schedule and method:

Date	Location	Partner	Activities
Feb. 6	Guatemala City	CODISRA	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ Review of project outputs➤ In-depth interview with assistant project coordinator➤ Coordination of further interviews and visits
	Guatemala City	Comunicarte	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ In-depth interview about project activities, impact, and sustainability
Feb. 8	Guatemala City	CODISRA	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ In-depth interview with ex-commissioner who coordinated the project.
	Nahuala (via telephone)	Nahual Estereo	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ Interview with workshop participant

Because of government restructuring, in the interim between the time of project implementation and this evaluation, the then-project coordinator is no longer with CODISRA and the assistant coordinator is now in another unit of CODISRA. Because of these changes and despite repeated attempts by the evaluator and support from IPDC-San Jose, CODISRA was not able to provide any pre-trip support in planning interviews and visits.

Upon the evaluator's arrival, CODISRA provided a copy of the final project report and training materials and presented the 9-minute video. The project assistant was helpful in clearing up the evaluator's questions about the project implementation. She also attempted to obtain appointments with key Guatemala City media representatives. However, due to conflicting schedules, or perhaps lack of interest on the part of the journalists or lack of follow-through on behalf of CODISRA, these appointments were never confirmed. Further, the evaluator requested participant lists and contact information, so as to be able to contact participants directly, but the CODISRA assistant

said that those lists had been turned in to UNESCO and that she did not have them available.

However, this evaluator feels that through the interviews and documents provided, as well as his own deep understanding of Guatemalan media and indigenous issues, that this evaluation is credible.

Further, on February 5 and 7, the evaluator conducted visits to the beneficiary and partner organizations of another IPDC project, "Creation of a Mayan communication network - REFCOMAYA." (Project number, PDC/49 GUA/01, 354GUA5051) These visits provided invaluable complimentary information which was also taken into account in this evaluation.

Sources:

- Final report, including:
 - Workshop summaries
 - Training materials presented in workshops
 - Breakdown of participants

- 9-minute video on Freedom of Expression

List of interviewees:

Name		Position	Organization
Rosa Sosa	Carmela	Administrative Assistant	CODISRA
Armando Morán	Cú	Training Coordinator	Comunicarte
Manuela Ramirez		Broadcaster	Nahual Estereo
Blanca Alvarado	Estela	Ex-Commissioner	CODISRA