



Tenth E-9 Ministerial Review Meeting

Islamabad, Pakistan – 27-28 November 2014

Session 1

Synthesis Report of National EFA 2015 Reviews for the E-9 Countries

Report compiled by:
EFA and Global Agenda Coordination Team
Education Sector
UNESCO

Author: Clinton Robinson

November 2014

Education for All E-9 Initiative Synthesis Report of National Reviews

Table of contents

A.	Introduction	6
B.	Progress towards EFA goals	6
1.	Context	6
2.	Questions of Data	6
3.	Progress on the six EFA goals.....	7
	Goal 1: Early Childhood Care and Education	7
	Goal 2: Primary education	10
	Goal 3: Lifeskills programmes	13
	Goal 4: Adult and youth literacy.....	15
	Goal 5: Gender parity and equality	19
	Goal 6: Quality of education	21
4.	Current status of EFA goals	25
C.	Successful strategies	26
1.	Equity and access.....	26
2.	Quality	30
3.	Governance	32
D.	Challenges and prospects in education.....	33
E.	Summary comment	35
1.	Numbers	35
2.	Diversity	36
3.	Governance and management.....	36
F.	Annexes	37
1.	E-9 population.....	37
2.	E-9 Gross National Income per capita.....	38
G.	Sources	39
1.	National reviews	39
2.	Other sources	39

Tables

Table 1: E-9 countries: change in primary adjusted net enrolment ratio	11
Table 2: E-9 countries: numbers of out-of-school children at primary level.....	13
Table 3: E-9 countries: proportion of secondary-age learners enrolled in TVET.....	15
Table 4: E-9 countries: progress in national adult literacy rates.....	16
Table 5: E-9 countries: progress in youth literacy rates	17
Table 6: E-9 countries: numbers of non-literate adults	18
Table 7: E-9 countries: gender parity index	19
Table 8: E-9 countries: gender parity index: Adult Literacy.....	21
Table 9: E-9 countries: survival to last grade of primary schooling	22
Table 10: E-9 countries: indicators of quality inputs	23
Table 11: E-9 countries: education share of GNP and of public expenditure	24
Table 12: E-9 countries: overall progress towards quantified EFA goals	25

Abbreviations

CCE	Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation
CLC	Community Learning Centre
ECCE	Early childhood care and education
ECD	Early childhood development
ECE	Early childhood education
EFA	Education for All
GDP	Gross domestic product
GER	Gross enrolment ratio
GMR	Global Monitoring Report
GNI	Gross national income
GNP	Gross national product
GPI	Gender parity index
Ideb	Índice de Desenvolvimento da Educação Básica
ISCED	International Standard Classification of Education
LIFE	Literacy Initiative for Empowerment
NER	Net enrolment ratio
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
SC	Scheduled castes
ST	Scheduled tribes
TVET	Technical and vocational education and training
UIS	UNESCO Institute for Statistics
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

A. Introduction

The 2015 deadline for the achievement of the EFA goals and the Millennium Development Goals focuses the world's attention on what progress has been achieved, how it has been achieved, what remains to be done, and what lessons can be learned from the efforts of the last 15 years. Assessments of this kind will inform the proposed new set of post-2015 Sustainable Development Goals with a likely horizon of 2030.

In this spirit, the nine countries that created the E-9 Initiative in 1993 have undertaken to assess their own progress towards the EFA goals, to draw lessons from their experience, and to consider the nature and scale of the educational challenges they will continue to face in the future. This report thus examines progress in EFA in the nine countries, presents a selection of successful strategies, and discusses the major challenges for the future.

A separate discussion paper, prepared under the same terms of reference, presents an overview of the development of the E-9 Initiative as a mechanism of international cooperation in education and assesses its role and impact on progress towards EFA, with a set of key questions on shaping the future of the E-9 Initiative.¹

The national reviews present data on all the key indicators to assess progress towards the six EFA goals, with much sub-national data that could not be included in this concise synthesis report. In addition, the reviews contain many tables and graphics which render the information easily accessible and informative. All the reviews are frank about the remaining challenges, recognising contextual and circumstantial factors in the broader development of the country, as well as conditions in the wider international environment.

National EFA Reviews of all the E9 countries were available for inclusion in this report: Bangladesh, Brazil, China, Egypt, India, Indonesia, Mexico, Nigeria and Pakistan. Relevant data on the nine countries are shown in tables based on the national reviews, with additional data from the EFA Global Monitoring Report and online databases.

B. Progress towards EFA goals

1. Context

The E-9 countries are diverse, and so the context of pursuing the EFA goals manifests different parameters in each country. Additionally, the national and international contexts have changed since the creation of the E-9 Initiative in 1993, as have the dynamics of international cooperation. At the inception of the E-9 Initiative, the countries focused on the common features of their high population and the large numbers of adult non-literates within their borders. The proportion of global totals of both these measures represented in the nine countries has remained fairly stable over the intervening 20 years (see Annex 1 and Table 6). The nine countries also characterised themselves as 'developing' in 1993; the economic status of the countries has now diverged with radical differences in economic performance (see Annex 2).

2. Questions of Data

Accounting for progress across the six EFA goals in these nine countries raises difficult questions of data:

- Which data to draw on? Differences, sometimes large, exist between the data presented in the country reviews and international sources such as the EFA Global Monitoring Report or the database of the UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS). Using

¹ The E-9 EFA Initiative Beyond 2015: Discussion Paper - October 2014.

the national data given in each country review provides a nationally validated set of statistics, while drawing on international sources enables a consistent presentation across countries.

In this Review Synthesis Report, the data cited in the narrative text on the progress and examples in each country are taken from the national reviews, unless otherwise indicated. The data shown in the tables draw on the national reviews and the EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14. Other data sources are shown where necessary. In some cases, countries supplied updated data specifically for this Synthesis Report as part of their feedback on the draft version – these data have been inserted as representing the most recent, nationally validated data. Where there are large discrepancies between sources, they are signalled under discussion of the relevant EFA goal.

- Partial data: not all nine countries have data on the same indicators for each goal. For instance, some data may be gender-disaggregated, while other data are not. Where data on key indicators for particular countries are not shown, it means there were no data available.
- Differential data sets: countries do not necessarily present data for the same years or sequence of years, making it difficult to present a composite picture of E-9 progress in EFA over time.

It lies beyond the scope of this report to seek to explain the divergences between data sources; apart from presenting data from different years, other reasons for divergences may include the interpretation and application of ISCED levels, and differing sources of population statistics.

This synthesis report is presented not in the spirit of comparison, but of rich national experience. The common factor is that all nine countries are fully committed to meeting the six EFA goals, and the progress made is a function of the particular measures taken in each, very different context. In view of the great diversity among E-9 countries and in the light of the different data sources, a direct comparison among them is not appropriate.

3. Progress on the six EFA goals

Goal 1: Early Childhood Care and Education

Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children.

The Dakar Framework for Action did not specify a quantified target for the goal of early childhood care and education (ECCE),² and so each country set its own targets within the terms of the goal to ‘expand and improve comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for vulnerable and disadvantaged children.’ A snapshot of each country’s progress as detailed in their review is presented below.

Bangladesh: in 2013, the government of Bangladesh approved a new policy of early childhood development, focused on the child’s holistic development. Early childhood education has been provided on a growing scale since the 1990s by a range of providers, including government and non-government primary schools, NGOs, mosques, madrasas and private initiatives. For children up to 5 years old, the net enrolment rate in 2013 was found to be 50.2%. Those enrolled in pre-primary education in government and non-government schools (89% of total number of centres) more than doubled from 0.949 million in 2010 to 2.59 million in 2012. The quality of pre-primary provision is mixed and linked to the need to adopt appropriate approaches for young children, rather than adopting a model

² The designation ‘early childhood care and education (ECCE)’ is used in this report in line with the Dakar Framework for Action; some country reviews use other formulations, such as early childhood education (ECE), or early childhood development (ECD).

based on primary schooling. With the new policy, a comprehensive programme needs to be developed, taking into account the necessary coordination across government departments and services.

Brazil: from 1988 the right to early childhood care and education was enshrined in the constitution, with a care programme targeting children from 0-3 years, and two years of pre-school for 4-5 year old children. In the period 2001-2012, the proportion of children in early child care programmes increased from 10.6% to 21.2%, and in pre-school from 55% to 78.2%. The increase in child care is especially significant, with a tripling of numbers of children enrolled in the programme. Similarly, there have been large increases in numbers in rural areas in both child care and pre-school (+33%), although the relative rural-urban enrolment rates have changed little: in 2000 – urban 87.9% / rural 12.1%; in 2012 – urban 88.2% / rural 11.8%. In 2009, Brazil took the step of redefining the age of compulsory schooling to include children from 4 years. This means that two years of pre-school are now part of mandatory educational provision, and the deadline of 2016 is set for meeting this goal. It is worth noting that Brazil's policy of social care benefits to pregnant women and vulnerable households has been a key element in improving the quality of life of young children.

China: early childhood care and education were priority areas in China's development plans and in the EFA plan 2001-2015. A target of 55% participation in 3-year preschool education was set, and by 2010 the rate reached 56.6%. This progress was underpinned by new government strategies developed by the ten relevant ministries in 2003. Further, private provision (kindergartens) expanded to almost two-thirds of total provision over the same period. From 2004, the numbers of children in pre-school education increased from 20.89 million to 29.77 million in 2010 – an expansion of 42.5%. In parallel, the numbers of ECCE teachers more than doubled, with teacher/pupil ratios improving from 1:37 to 1:26 by 2010. From 2010, further qualification requirements were applied, fostering ongoing professionalization of the ECCE teachers. Despite this significant progress, challenges remain: achieving equitable provision in western provinces, balancing public and private provision, and making the best use of spare school infrastructure capacity to open more ECCE classes.

Egypt: ECCE has the dual aim of enabling the holistic development of the child and preparing her/him for school life. Focusing on children aged 4 to 6 years, pre-school education is provided through kindergartens run by both public and private actors. In 2000/2001 48.4% of enrolled children were in privately run kindergartens – this increased to 74.7% in 2012-2013. Enrolment in pre-school education almost doubled over that period, from a ratio of 12% in 2000/2001 to 23.5% in 2012-2013. This was matched by a doubling of kindergarten teachers. However, this falls far short of Egypt's target – an enrolment rate of 60% by 2017. The review notes that most of this provision will need to come from private initiatives, but also points out that many rural and poor children may continue to be left behind. The review also details a range of specific measures for expanding and improving ECCE, but observes that government funding remains too low to achieve many of them. Through external support, a project to improve ECCE has been implemented in poor areas across 18 governorates. While Egypt's ambitions for ECCE are high, the challenges of realising them will require stronger awareness of the benefits of ECCE, greater civil society participation, emphasis on under-served areas, and improvements in the teaching and learning environment, in addition to increased funding.

India: ECCE is part of an integrated approach to the development of young children, in the context of the government's Integrated Child Development Services which focus also on health and nutrition. Other providers include primary schools (with ECCE sections), NGOs and private initiatives, with the latter found largely in urban centres. The review details expansion of ECCE provision across providers as follows (there are no data for NGO provision):

Numbers of children enrolled in ECCE programmes in India, by provider

	2001/2002 (millions)	2012/2013 (millions)	Increase (%)
Integrated Child Development Services	16.7	35.3	112%
ECCE sections in primary schools	7.1	11.6	63%
Private providers	*0.6	12 – 15 (estimated)	

*2002/2003

Source: Indian National EFA 2015 Review

These increases led to a rise in the ECCE GER from 18% in 1999 to 55% in 2010. As growth in provision continues to increase, the government aims to raise ECCE quality through the development of standards for all providers and to professionalise ECCE by building the capacity of educators and state/district level ECCE councils, within a life-cycle approach to supporting young children.

Indonesia: Early childhood education is part of Indonesia's strategic response to ensuring that the 'demographic bonus' (2010-2035) is of maximum benefit to the country's population and to national development. A presidential decree in 2013 has re-invigorated ECCE, focusing on holistic and integrative early childhood development, aiming to increase coverage, in particular marginalised children. Nationally, the ECCE GER increased from 50.2% in 2001 to 67.4% in 2013, with a target of 72% by 2014. This progress still leaves 6.85 million children aged 3 to 6 years without ECCE opportunities; these children are mostly concentrated in seven provinces where the GER is less than 50%, and it is in reaching them that the challenge lies.

Mexico: Early childhood development is enshrined in the National Development Plan (2013-2018) and the Sectoral Education Programme (2013-2018) as a means of promoting the child's full potential and preparing them to take full advantage of schooling. In 2013, over one million children of 0-3 years were enrolled in 13 533 centres across the country, giving an NER of 12%. A series of special measures were taken to provide appropriate possibilities for indigenous, migrant and Afromexican children, including specific training for teachers/carers of this age group. For the 3-6 year-old children, the enrolment increased by 37% between 2001 and 2012, with the aim of achieving universal coverage. This will require further development of infrastructure and recruitment of personnel. Again, measures for indigenous, migrant and Afromexican children are in focus, such as ensuring that the teachers speak the language of the children in their care.

The Mexican government has strengthened the capacity of the education system to address the needs of migrant children, reaching 70 985 children across the country. From 2014, these services will form an integral part of the Educational Equity and Inclusion Programme.

Nigeria: early childhood education was mandated in the 2004 National Policy on Education, with a focus on the pre-school population of 3 to 5 years of age. In 2003/4, the GER was 14.7%, with 42% of provision through private initiatives. Since then, a comprehensive policy of holistic child development has been adopted and minimum standards set for early childhood care centres. A target of 70% of children entering primary school with at least one year of pre-primary education was set nationally, to be achieved by 2015. Between 2005 and 2009, enrolment increased 30%, and over 10,000 new early childhood centres were opened between 2009 and 2013. In spite of these significant efforts, data from 2013 indicated a pre-primary NER of 18%, far from the national target of 70%. Lack of accurate data hampers planning, and other challenges include: low commitment and funding by state authorities, household poverty, inadequate numbers of qualified early childhood teachers, and a dearth of learning materials.

Pakistan: early childhood education is delivered in two ways: on the one hand, through ECCE classes attached to government primary schools, often without a specifically assigned

or trained teacher. These classes are felt to be of poor quality, sometimes little more than younger children accompanying their older siblings to school. On the other hand, private provision, mostly in urban areas, provides higher-quality, child-centred ECCE. Public ECCE is not funded separately from primary education, leading to a lack of implementation of the ECCE policies that are in place. However, the national ECCE GER has increased considerably: from 28.2% in 2001-02 to 66.4% in 2012-13. Large differences across provinces range from 30.4% to 88.2%. The National Education Policy envisages improvements in the quality of ECCE, adopting the concept of holistic development of the child, identifying the age bracket for ECCE that comprises 3 to 5 years, ensuring one year pre-primary education by the state, attachment of ECCE to primary schools with additional funds and teachers, and specialized training for ECCE teachers. A curriculum has been developed for ECCE which is implemented in selected public schools mostly sponsored by donor agencies. After the measures of 2010 decentralising education responsibility (18th Constitutional Amendment), ECCE is reflected in most of the provincial education sector plans.

Goal 2: Primary education

Ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to, and complete, free and compulsory primary education of good quality.

In order to present an overview of progress in access to primary education³ across the E-9 countries, the following table presents the most complete data available, drawn from the EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14 and from the other sources indicated.

³ The term 'primary education' is used in the EFA goal, but we should note that countries may use other terms, such as 'elementary' or 'basic' and that these phases of education cover different numbers of years of schooling. In addition, 'compulsory' schooling frequently covers parts of secondary education. In this Synthesis Report, 'primary' education is used to indicate schooling between the end of pre-school and the transition to (lower) secondary education, following the usage of the EFA Global Monitoring Report.

Table 1: E-9 countries: change in primary adjusted net enrolment ratio

E-9 countries: change in primary adjusted net enrolment ratio (%)									
	1999			2011			% change		
	Total	M	F	Total	M	F	Total	M	F
Bangladesh	--	--	--	+94.9	+92.7	+97.3	--	--	--
Brazil	++95.8	--	--	++98.2	--	--	2.4	--	--
China	*99.1	--	--	*99.7	--	--	0.6	--	--
Egypt	92	95	88	98	99	97	6	4	9
India	83	90	76	99	99	99	16	9	23
Indonesia	94	94	95	99	--	--	5	--	--
Mexico	**99	99	100	99	99	100	0	0	0
Nigeria	61	67	56	58	60	55	-3	-7	-1
Pakistan ***	58	69	46	68	73	63	14	10	19
World	84	87	80	91	92	90	7	5	10

Sources: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14; +Ministry of Primary and Mass Education ++National Review data 2001/2012; *National report 2000/2010; **National review data 2000; ***Data for 2011 from National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-related MDGs 2013-2016.

The largest gains are seen in India and Pakistan, where efforts to enrol more girls in primary education have been particularly successful. In India, this has pushed the NER close to 100%,⁴ while in **Pakistan**, starting from a lower base, there is still some way to go. In order to increase enrolment and to improve the retention at primary level, incentives have been introduced such as provision of free textbooks in all public schools, abolition of tuition fees and provision of edible oil to girl students with a high attendance level in some selected regions of the country where girls' enrolment is very low. It should be noted that the Pakistan EFA 2015 Review shows that the NER has stagnated since 2011, and even declined in some provinces; it further notes that in the Capital Territory the NER for girls is higher than that for boys. Thus, despite repeated policy commitments, Pakistan continues to lag behind in achieving universal primary education. This is largely due to low budgetary allocation to education (2% of GDP), non-availability of schools for girls especially in less developed and remote areas of the country, shortage of teachers, lack of facilities in public schools, poverty, and law and order situation in some provinces.

In the same sub-region, **Bangladesh** faced a similar gender imbalance at the start of the EFA period, but adopted policies to support girls' education and has shown a girls' NER that has been consistently above that of boys since 2005.

Disparities in **Brazil** have declined over the period, with gaps closing considerably for indigenous populations (NER 87.1% in 2004, 95% in 2012) and for rural children (NER 93.6% in 2004, 97.7% in 2012). Similarly, with regard to household income the enrolment of the lowest quartile improved from 93.9% to 97.5%. With these achievements, the benchmark of universal primary education (>95%) has been reached for these population groups also.

⁴ Note that the Indian national review cites a NER of 91% for 2010, unadjusted.

The **China** EFA 2015 Review indicates that the 9-year basic education cycle have been almost fully universalised, with particular attention to progress among ethnic minorities – bilingual programmes in mother tongue and Mandarin have facilitated increased access and quality. Cooperation with branches of the China Disabled Person association at local level has improved the provision for special needs. School fees and textbook costs were abolished in a phased manner, and subsidies for boarding in rural areas were expanded. Currently, China faces a situation of a declining school population and high internal migration (see also section II.C *Challenges*).

Egypt has an ongoing programme of measures to increase enrolment, both boys and girls (for the latter see also section C *Successful Strategies* below) and has given attention to children with special needs. Thus, educational resources and specially trained teachers are provided, although overwhelmingly in urban areas; the National EFA 2015 Review notes that the risks or stigma attached to disability in rural areas mean that many parents keep these children at home.

In **India**, the elementary stage (6-13 years) is divided into primary (6-10 years) and upper primary (11-13 years). For the whole of the elementary stage the National EFA 2015 Review estimates the NER at 87.5 per cent (86.1 per cent for boys and 89.0 per cent for girls) for the year 2012-13. There is a marked difference between the primary level and upper primary, with NERs at 90.8 per cent in 2012-13 (89.7 per cent for boys and 91.9 per cent for girls) and 64.2 per cent (62.7 per cent for boys and 65.9 per cent for girls) respectively. Both NERs have increased significantly, up from 84.5% for primary in 2005-6, and from 43.1% in upper primary over the same period. We may note that the rate of increase in upper primary demonstrates greater survival in the education system, but that the continuing discrepancy between the levels indicates that some children drop out at that point of transition.

In **Mexico**, basic education covers pre-school, primary and secondary education, representing 73.4% of enrolment in the education system, with 1.2 million teachers in about 228 000 schools. Expansion of schooling coupled with declining numbers of school-age children have enabled high levels of coverage, although for every 100 children entering primary education, only 76 complete secondary education satisfactorily. The Mexican review presents slightly lower figures than those in the table above, but with improvement over the decade 2000-2010; thus girls' enrolment improved from 93.8% to 96.4%, while for boys the change was 93.9% to 96.1%, thus reversing the gender imbalance.

The **Nigeria** review indicates that primary enrolment rose consistently from 2000 to 2005, but then entered a period of fluctuation such that the numbers enrolled in 2008 were only slightly higher than those in 2000 – the relative decline in the NER is evident in the table above. Since 2009, enrolment has once again begun to rise, in part due to a 5% increase in the number of primary schools. However, the review notes that the most recent NER of 63% does 'not represent any significant progress towards the UPE target of 2015'.

The numbers of out-of-school children provide a further perspective on progress towards the goals of universal primary education:

Table 2: E-9 countries: numbers of out-of-school children at primary level

E-9 countries: numbers of out-of-school children at primary level		
	1999	2011
Bangladesh	--	621 000
Brazil	1 039 000	--
China	--	--
Egypt	674 000	222 000
India	20 008 000	1 674 000
Indonesia	1 599 000	262 000
Mexico	59 000	70 000
Nigeria	7 444 000	10 542 000
Pakistan	8 399 000	*6 703 421

Sources: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14; *National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs 2013-2016.

Over the period shown, India has made enormous progress, reducing the number of out-of-school children by 91%. On a lesser scale, Egypt and Indonesia have also seen significant progress, while Pakistan continues to face a major challenge in this area, even after a reduction of 35.3%.

The situation in **Nigeria** deserves particular mention, not least because the country has the largest absolute number of out-of-school children – 10.5 million in 2010, a figure which increased from 8 million in 2005. The review is brutally frank about the failures of the education system, producing a litany of contributing factors: fluctuating enrolment with no steady increase, low quality with poor learning outcomes, large regional differences in overall enrolment at primary level and in gender parity, overlapping educational bureaucracies, rigidly standardised curricula not sensitive to regional contexts, under-utilisation of funding and in some cases its misdirection, poorly implemented language policies, confusion over federal and state authority in education, large numbers of untrained or poorly trained teachers... While some of these problems are characteristic also of other national education systems, the combination of factors appears to have generated an inertia which currently prevents the system from achieving the necessary improvements. There also seems to be a downward spiral where low quality – and hence poor learning outcomes – leads to disaffection, dropout and non-enrolment. The review provides long lists of measures that need to be taken – all relevant and critical to success – but with no clear indication of how fundamental structural changes in the wider body politic may be effected. These lie beyond the scope of the education system itself.

Goal 3: Lifeskills programmes

Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life-skills programmes.

The wide scope of EFA goal 3 with regard to the learning needs of young people and adults is reflected in the National EFA 2015 Reviews which look at one or more of the following three areas: secondary education, youth literacy, and technical and vocational education and training (TVET). For some countries, lower or junior secondary education is included in basic

education or is a seamless extension of primary education. In this regard, we should note that the Pakistan review addresses youth literacy under goal 3 and comments that TVET remains a neglected area. The Mexico review treats the needs of young people under the goals relating to basic education and gender, in particular the needs of vulnerable young women. For this synthesis report, this section deals with lifeskills and TVET opportunities, while youth literacy is addressed under goal 4.

In **Bangladesh**, high dropout from secondary schooling means that less than a third of young people complete 10 years of schooling, but even so only 11% of out-of-school youth participate in work-related training, mostly through informal apprenticeships. A skills development policy (2011) recognises the multiple pathways of learning for work, and adoption of an equivalency policy to certify them is pending. Skills training suffers from a mismatch between skills and jobs, with little attention to the needs of the informal economy which however accounts for over 80% of productive work. Strong preferences for general secondary education mean that a mere 1.1% of enrolments are in structured TVET programmes, but major initiatives are now envisaged to strengthen these opportunities, both formally in the education system and non-formally through Community Learning Centres run by NGOs.

Brazil developed vocational education both within secondary education and in specialised institutions and has seen significant increases across the various options. Enrolment in such courses at secondary level jumped by 129.7% between 2001 and 2013, while places in the Pronatec programme (National Programme for Access to Technical Education and Job Training) saw rapid expansion from 0.9 million in 2011 to over 6.2 million in 2014. Pronatec aims to increase mid-level professional training, initial and ongoing, for youth and adults. Several other programmes offer opportunities to complete basic education combined with vocational skills (see also section C *Successful Strategies* below).

China offers a wide range of vocational and technical education for both youth and adults, for example, vocational training institutions and/or secondary vocational schools, including secondary specialised schools, schools for skilled workers and vocational high schools. The most popular courses at secondary level are manufacturing, information technology, retail and hospitality, and civil engineering. A Vocational Qualification Certificate System was introduced in China in 1993, and this certificate qualifies the holder to set up a business. In addition, courses were developed to offer training to rural to urban migrants in non-agricultural skills (see section C).

In contrast to the low enrolments in TVET mentioned above, **Egypt** manifests strong participation, with 46% of secondary enrolment being in technical education. This is divided into industrial (23%), commercial (18%) and agricultural (5%) tracks. Male and female participation is similar, given strong female enrolment in the commercial track. The reason for strong participation lies in the fact that children who fail to pass the exam for entry into general secondary education are directed to the vocational track. Partnerships with Egyptian companies and European countries are part of efforts to raise the quality of TVET and improve the match with employment opportunities.

Building on more than 25 years of experience, **India** adopted a National Skill Qualification Framework in 2013, with the aim of recognising competencies acquired through all channels of education and geared towards productive work in the formal or informal economy. Ambitious targets for skill development aim to train 500 million people by 2022, through a range of governmental and non-governmental initiatives, including open schooling, adult education, secondary education, and voluntary agencies.

Indonesia implemented a policy of changing the balance of learning for young people towards a vocational track at secondary level, with a target of 70% of learners. In pursuit of the target, formal vocational schools (known as SMK) increased by 50% between 2005 and 2010. Non-formal provision through Community Learning Centres (CLCs) increased with the number of centres expanding almost three times – 6 500 in 2009 to 18 439 in 2011. The focus of CLCs is on life skills for men and women, and 'entrepreneurship literacy'. Both

formal and non-formal opportunities aim to prepare young people for the world of work, recognising that such opportunities may be found in the formal and informal economy.

The government of **Nigeria** took measures to increase the scope of vocational training, by vocationalising the new senior secondary school curriculum in 2011, and by introducing new Enterprise Institutes. Both measures are intended to increase young people's employability. Female enrolment in TVET courses remains low (15.5%), and a national qualifications framework is needed as part of a drive to raise the perceived value of TVET.

For information, the following table shows the relative enrolments in TVET according to the EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14, with a number of differences from the national review data given above. This may be due to varying definitions of what is counted as TVET.

Table 3: E-9 countries: proportion of secondary-age learners enrolled in TVET

E-9 countries: proportion of secondary-age learners enrolled in TVET (2011)	
Bangladesh	3.0%
Brazil	6.0%
China	20.0%
Egypt	17.6%
India	--
Indonesia	--
Mexico	15.9%
Nigeria	--
Pakistan	--
Source: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14	

Goal 4: Adult and youth literacy

Achieving a 50 per cent improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.

At the creation of the E-9 Initiative, the nine countries contained collectively the majority of youth and adults (15+ years) who were without literacy skills, and the same is true today. Two-thirds of non-literate adults live in the countries concerned. Youth and adult literacy has therefore been an ongoing challenge. The table below shows the significant progress that the E-9 countries have made in adult literacy over the past two decades, thus contributing to increasing literacy rates at a global level.

Table 4: E-9 countries: progress in national adult literacy rates

E-9 countries: progress in national adult literacy rates, 15+ years (%)									
	1985-1994			2005-2011			2015 projection		
	Total	M	F	Total	M	F	Total	M	F
Bangladesh	35	44	26	60	64	56	61	65	58
Brazil	--	--	--	90	90	91	92	91	92
China	79	87	68	95	97	93	96	98	94
Egypt	44	57	31	72	80	64	74	82	66
India	48	62	34	*69	*79	*59	71	81	61
Indonesia	82	88	75	96	97	94	98	98	97
Mexico	88	90	85	94	95	92	94	95	93
Nigeria	55	68	44	**71	**79	**63	59	69	49
Pakistan	--	--	--	55	69	40	60	72	47
World	76	82	69	84	89	80	86	90	82

Source: National Reviews and EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14; *National Census 2011. **National Survey 2010.

Some puzzling discrepancies exist in some cases between the data in national reviews and the data in the EFA Global Monitoring Report.⁵ However, three broad categories emerge from the chart above:

- Over 90%: Brazil, China, Indonesia and Mexico.
- Between 69% and 89%; Egypt, India and Nigeria.
- Under 69%: Bangladesh and Pakistan.

Egypt, Nigeria and Pakistan show large differences between male and female adult literacy, of 16 percentage points or more.

The same patterns emerge from the data on youth literacy, but the actual rates are much higher. This is encouraging, as it clearly means that in the long run more young people are acquiring literacy through schooling, even though the change in the overall adult literacy rate will not be seen for a decade or more. This is most strikingly shown in that the female youth literacy rate in Pakistan in the period 2005-2011 is 22 points higher than the female adult literacy rate (see table below).

⁵ For example, the GMR 2013/14 shows an overall adult literacy rate of 51% for Nigeria over the period – this rate would indicate a decline in the literacy rate between the two periods shown in the table above. Egypt uses age 10+ so includes children who may not yet have achieved literacy competence, but who are learning in school, so figures cannot be directly compared.

Table 5: E-9 countries: progress in youth literacy rates

E-9 countries: progress in youth literacy rates, 15-24 years (%)									
	1985-1994			2005-2011			2015 projection		
	Total	M	F	Total	M	F	Total	M	F
Bangladesh	45	52	38	79	77	80	83	81	86
Brazil	--	--	--	98	97	98	98	97	99
China	94	97	91	99	99	99	100	100	100
Egypt	63	71	54	88	91	84	91	93	89
India	62	74	49	+86	+90	+82	90	93	87
Indonesia	96	97	95	99	99	99	99	99	99
Mexico	95	96	95	98	98	99	99	99	99
Nigeria	71	81	62	66	76	58	73	80	65
Pakistan	--	--	--	*70	*79	*62	72	82	72
World	83	88	79	89	92	87	92	93	90

Sources: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14; *National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs 2013-2016. +National Census 2011.

Literacy rates do not however tell the whole story regarding progress in literacy in the nine countries. Even with rising literacy rates everywhere, the absolute numbers of non-literate adults remains stubbornly high in a number of countries and is projected to increase in three countries by 2015: Egypt, Nigeria and Pakistan (see table below). The reduction in Bangladesh is slight. In contrast, China has made enormous progress over the last two decades, even though a large absolute number remains to be reached (52 million).

Table 6: E-9 countries: numbers of non-literate adults

E-9 countries: numbers of non-literate adults				
	1985-1994	2005-2011	2015 estimate	% reduction (increase) 2005-11 to 2015
Bangladesh	40 252 000	44 137 000	43 876 000	0.59
Brazil		13 984 000	12 890 000	7.82
China	182 744 000	52 347 000	41 023 000	21.63
Egypt	16 910 000	15 631 000	16 124 000	(3.15)
India	287 272 000	287 355 000	266 367 000	7.30
Indonesia	21 557 000	12 793 000	11 851 000	7.36
Mexico	6 437 000	5 300 000	5 011 000	5.45
Nigeria	24 489 000	41 845 000	42 127 000	(0.67)
Pakistan	--	49 507 000	51 037 000	(3.09)
Total	--	522 899 000	490 306 000	6.23
World total	880 504 000	773 549 000	742 799 000	3.98
E-9 as % of world total		67.9%	66%	

Source: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14

In terms of efforts to increase adult literacy rates, **Egypt** observes that less than half of those enrolled in literacy programmes between 2000 and 2012 were considered to have achieved literacy competence. In response, Egypt has adopted a strategy of improving delivery through training of adult educators and their trainers, and of adapting instruction to context by cooperating with governmental and non-governmental partners in different regions of the country. In places, literacy instruction is combined with learning related to health, agriculture and livelihoods (see also section C).

The **Brazil** review notes that although the urban literacy rate is higher than that in rural areas, in fact the majority of non-literate adults live in cities (64.4%) – again an indication that tackling the literacy challenge must give attention to the numbers, location and characteristics of non-literate populations, not merely to a national literacy rate. To continue to promote literacy, the Ministry of Education implemented a policy that integrates initial literacy education with later stages of learning, through classes in Youth and Adult Education (EJA) for the people covered by Literate Brazil Programme; since 2012, funds have been channelled through states, municipalities, and the Federal District in order to create and maintain EJA classes.

The **China** review indicates that gender disparity has widened somewhat from 2000 (72% non-literate adults being female) to 2010 (74%). The remaining literacy challenge lies in rural areas, with some improvement over the last decade – 77% rural in 2000, 71% in 2010. Of particular concern is an adult illiteracy rate of over 32% in Xizang (Tibet) Autonomous Region.

The reviews detail multiple ways of offering literacy – through different types of organisation, combined with other kinds of learning, or targeting particular communities (rural women,

nomads, etc). It is rare, however, to find any discussion of the purposes for which adult learners wish to use written communication in their lives and for their livelihoods. Even though countries seek to tailor programmes to perceived needs, the learners themselves are rarely the ones to articulate what use literacy will be. A new approach using some of the known methods to foster community ownership must be deployed in order to achieve sustainable, relevant, and universal literacy use.

In line with the pedagogical principle that efficient and effective literacy learning takes place best through the first language of the learner, India, Indonesia, Mexico and Nigeria recognise the need for mother-tongue approaches, with instruction and materials available in multiple languages of the country.

Goal 5: Gender parity and equality

Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.

This goal envisaged gender parity in primary and secondary education by 2005 and gender equality by 2015. If the meaning of the first target – ‘gender parity’ – was clear, the second – ‘gender equality’ – was less so, but was generally interpreted to mean that all children should be in primary and secondary school with no discrepancies of gender. However, ‘equality’ also implies equality of conditions of learning, of outcomes and of the opportunities afforded through education. Despite the wording of the goal, the question of equality in the broader societal sense goes beyond the scope of education alone. The national reviews largely present progress on this goal, therefore, in terms of gender parity among students, with consideration also of the gender balance among teachers.

The data for primary and secondary schooling are shown below.

Table 7: E-9 countries: gender parity index

E-9 countries: Gender parity index (F/M) in primary and secondary schooling				
	Primary schooling		Secondary schooling	
	1999	2011	1999	2011
Bangladesh	--	1.05	0.99	1.17
Brazil	1.00	1.00	*1.2	*1.2
China	--	**1.05	--	1.05
Egypt	0.93	+0.93	0.91	0.96
India	0.84	1.00	0.70	0.92
Indonesia	0.97	1.02	1.11	1.08
Mexico	1.01	1.01	1.01	1.07
Nigeria	0.84	0.91	0.91	0.88
Pakistan	0.67	**0.86	--	0.73
World	0.93	0.98	0.91	0.97

Sources: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14; *National review data 2004 and 2011; **National review data 2010; +National review data 2012/2013; **National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs 2013-2016.

We should note that figures presented in the national reviews differ to some extent from those in the table above. In part, this is because different years are used, but even so, some differences appear significant, for example:

- Egypt gives a GPI of 1.16 for secondary education (2012/2013), so a much higher enrolment of girls.
- The Indonesian review shows a GPI in primary school of 0.99 and of 1.02 in secondary schooling in 2011, thus a more equal distribution of boys and girls.
- In primary schooling (*elementary stage classes I-VIII*), India shows a GPI in favour of girls from 2008-2009 (1.01), reaching 1.04 in the latest school year (2012-2013); figures for secondary schooling are in the same range (different years cited).

These discrepancies notwithstanding, some overall patterns become clear. Apart from Nigeria and Pakistan, gender parity is achieved, or almost, at primary level, and Pakistan has achieved the greatest rate of progress, starting from a low base. The difficulties of enrolment and the increasing number of out-of-school children in Nigeria are reflected in a GPI that has worsened at the secondary level.

Bangladesh invested in gender equity through a Secondary Female Stipend Program – a conditional cash transfer scheme which required 75% attendance and a commitment to remain unmarried until after the secondary school leaving examination. This program contributed to increasing girls' enrolment from 1.1 million in 1991 to 3.9 million in 2005, and continues to do so, accounting for the high GPI in favour of girls in the above table.

Other countries (China, Indonesia, Mexico) also show GPIs in secondary schooling in favour of girls – an indication of two phenomena found worldwide: first, girls tend to continue further and perform better than boys once they are given the same opportunities, and second, boys may have a greater tendency to leave or drop out of education earlier to go in search of paid work. The Mexican review observes that more girls than boys are in school at every level except in larger urban centres of more than 100 000 inhabitants, where the situation is reversed with slightly more boys than girls at lower primary and secondary levels.

It is instructive to link the data on gender parity in schooling with gender parity in literacy rates. The table below shows a calculation for the two periods used by the EFA Global Monitoring Report.

Table 8: E-9 countries: gender parity index: Adult Literacy

E-9 countries: Gender parity index (F/M): Adult Literacy		
	1985-1994	2005-2011
Bangladesh	0.59	0.85
Brazil	--	1.01
China	0.78	0.96
Egypt	0.54	0.80
India	0.55	0.68
Indonesia	0.85	0.94
Mexico	0.94	0.97
Nigeria	0.65	0.67
Pakistan	0.58	0.65
World	0.84	0.90
Source: Calculated from data of the EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14		

These data clearly show the time lag that exists between children acquiring literacy in schooling and the growth of literacy rates among the adult population: gender parity remains in favour of men (except Brazil), and the GPI is relatively low in Bangladesh, India, Nigeria and Pakistan, given the low starting point in 1999. Strong progress in the GPIs in primary and secondary schooling augur well for rising GPIs in adult literacy, as Brazil, China, Indonesia and Mexico demonstrate.

Goal 6: Quality of education

Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills.

The Dakar Framework for Action put a strong emphasis on the quality of learning by making it a separate goal. Monitoring the goal has been addressed from two angles: learning outcomes and achievements of children in school, and the adequacy of the inputs into learning such as teacher quality, school environment, availability of learning materials, and budget allocations. Data on learning outcomes/achievements is not available in a consistent manner for all countries, and the indicator of survival to the last grade of primary education is often used as a proxy. Even then, as the table below shows, disaggregated and time-sequence data are limited.

Table 9: E-9 countries: survival to last grade of primary schooling

E-9 countries: survival to last grade of primary schooling (%)									
	1999			2010			% change		
	Total	M	F	Total	M	F	Total	M	F
Bangladesh ⁺	--	--	--	67	66	69	--	--	--
Brazil	80	--	--	*88	--	--	8	--	--
China	**95	--	--	**99	--	--	--	--	--
Egypt	92	94	90	99	99	99	7	5	9
India	62	63	60	--	--	--	--	--	--
Indonesia	86	83	89	88	--	--	2	--	--
Mexico	87	86	88	95	94	96	8	8	8
Nigeria	--	--	--	80	77	83	--	--	--
Pakistan ^{**}	--	--	--	70	71	68	--	--	--
World	74	74	74	75	74	76	1	0	2

Sources: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14; ⁺Ministry of Primary and Mass Education; ^{*}UNICEF database; ^{**}National review 2001/2010; ^{**}Data for 2011, from National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs 2013-2016.

Limited conclusions can be drawn from the table, except that progress, where shown, is moving in a positive direction. However, the worldwide estimate shows minimal progress on this indicator which is stuck at 75% of learners. It is noteworthy that, although just over half of children are enrolled in primary school in Nigeria, of those 80% survive until the last grade. The Indian review presents detailed data on learning achievement, disaggregated by gender, state and level. With few exceptions, scores in language and mathematics showed measurable improvement.

The Mexican review acknowledges progress in achieving higher quality learning, but notes that a series of interconnected measures will be necessary to make further progress; they range across infrastructure, management, accountability and targeted strategies for improving reading and mathematics. To this end, the government set up an institute of educational assessment on an autonomous basis. Further high-impact measures include improvements in literacy provision, and reducing educational underachievement. For example, the 'Telesecundaria' programme uses ICTs to reach rural and remote areas enabling indigenous and migrant children and adolescents to complete basic education.

Brazil also recognised the need to improve quality assessment and created a Basic Education Development Index (Ideb) in 2007, setting targets for performance in primary and secondary education until 2021. Targets have been met or exceeded up to the most recent assessment (2011). For Mexico and Brazil, comparison with other countries of the region and internationally through participation in PISA is a further spur to pursue higher quality of learning outcomes. China has increased its participation in PISA to ten provinces for the 2015 round, after the initial participation of Shanghai in 2009. Since education should enable the all-round development of the child, China conducted a study of 'emotional learning' in 2009, examining the extent to which students were 'supported, socially capable, safe, challenged, participating and leading'.

On the input side, the table below indicates progress in the teacher/pupil ratio, and the proportion of trained teachers in 2011.

Table 10: E-9 countries: indicators of quality inputs

E-9 countries: Indicators of quality inputs			
	Teacher/pupil ratio in primary education		Proportion of trained teachers (%)
	1999	2011	2011
Bangladesh	--	1:40	*85
Brazil	1:26	1:21	--
China	1:22	1:17	*99
Egypt	1:22	*1:26	*69
India	1:35	*1:30	--
Indonesia	1:22	1:16	*53
Mexico	1:27	1:28	96
Nigeria	1:41	1:36	66
Pakistan	1:33	1:40	83
World	1:26	1:24	--

Sources: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14; *National review

Teacher/pupil ratios remain higher than the average in Bangladesh, Nigeria and Pakistan, with Pakistan showing a deterioration. Figures for the proportion of trained teachers are patchy and vary widely. While this may be seen as a partial proxy measure for quality input, it is clear that training in itself may or may not result in improved classroom practice.

Brazil's Institutional Programme of Teacher Initiation Scholarships (Pibid) encourages students pursuing their licentiate degrees to continue in their occupations as teachers in public schools in basic education, seeking to merge practice and theory, to bring universities and schools closer together, and to improve the quality of Brazilian education.

With regard to learning materials, **Bangladesh** reports adequate textbook distribution (see also section C *Successful Strategies* below) and India provides free textbooks at primary level (Classes I to VIII). Growing school populations present the challenge of producing an adequate supply of textbooks, for example in Nigeria where a survey revealed that only 34% of teachers reported having textbooks in all subject areas, even though over 1.5 million were distributed each year in 2011 and 2012. Pakistan launched the free distribution of textbooks in 2004, along with the abolition of tuition fees.

Brazil developed a package of measures to address the acquisition and supply of teaching materials and services. These efforts involve the distribution of textbooks through the National Textbook Programme (PNLD); the allocation of resources for decentralized food purchases via the National School Meals Programme (PNAE); resources for the acquisition of vehicles – National Programme for the Support of School Transportation and Path to School Programme; and funds for the maintenance of schools (Direct Funding for Schools Programme – PDDE).

All nine countries have an ongoing programme of building schools and classrooms to meet increasing demand, as well as renovating existing infrastructure. All the E-9 countries seek to provide adequate water and sanitation facilities, including separate toilets for girls. The reviews show progress in this area, but none indicates achievement across 100% of schools. Other infrastructure includes boundary walls, teachers' accommodation, and administrative facilities.

Setting standards and curriculum reform include a package of measures designed both to improve and modernise basic education. Egypt aims at improved pedagogy, as well as increased English instruction and the integration of technology into the teaching process. India sets its curriculum reform process in the context of 'creating joyful learning systems', with a focus on communicating positive values through pedagogical approach and content. In a similar vein, Indonesia aims at a pedagogy that fosters enquiry and questioning on the part of learners, although there is no indication as to how successful the approach has been.

The following table shows the levels of national investment in education, with the world average for comparative purposes.

Table 11: E-9 countries: education share of GNP and of public expenditure

E-9 countries: Education share of GNP and of public expenditure				
	% of GNP devoted to education		% of public expenditure devoted to education	
	1999	2011	1999	2011
Bangladesh	2.3	2.1	15.3	14.1
Brazil	4.0	5.9	10.5	18.1
China	*2.9	*3.7	*13.8	*15.8
Egypt	*1.5	3.7	*4.4	11.9
India	4.4	**4.0	12.7	10.5
Indonesia	2.8	2.8	11.5	15.2
Mexico	4.5	5.3	22.6	--
Nigeria	--	--	--	+13.0
Pakistan	2.6	2.3	9.9	**7.9
World average	4.5	4.8	13.8	14.4

Sources: EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14; *National review data 2000/2011; ** National review data 2011; *National review (2008 data); **National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs 2013-2016.

Note: ¹ Brazil's National Review data give a slightly lower percentage, showing 3.5% in 2000, and 5.6% in 2010 (the latter being compatible with the EFA GMR figure of 5.9% in 2011).

In terms of percentage of GNP, in 1999 only Mexico reached the world average, but by 2011 Brazil and Mexico exceeded it. However, other countries devoted a lower proportion, and two countries far from achieving the EFA goals invested the smallest proportion: 2.1% and 2.3% respectively for Bangladesh and Pakistan. In terms of the absolute amount spent on education, Bangladesh increased funding by a factor of five between 2007 and 2014, according to the national review; although this is a lower percentage of government spending than in 1999, the level is close to the world average in 2011. Egypt is moving

towards the world average, having more than doubled its educational expenditure on both measures. By 2011, Brazil, China and Indonesia exceeded the world average as a proportion of government spending. In 2011, none of the countries with data reached the often cited benchmarks of 6% of GNP and 20% of government spending. All the reviews recognise the need for greater funding, with differing priorities as to where extra funds should be applied.

4. Current status of EFA goals

Assessment of progress in each of the EFA goals shows that huge efforts have been made, resulting in significant strides towards achieving them. However, it is also clear that progress is not positive in every case, and that major challenges remain. Three of the EFA goals had quantified targets whose achievement was set for 2015. In order to measure achievement in a consistent manner, the quantified targets were operationalised by the EFA Global Monitoring Report as follows:

- Goal 2 Universal primary education: primary enrolment of at least 95%.
- Goal 4 Adult literacy rates: reduce illiteracy rates by 50%; note however that the 2013/14 EFA Global Monitoring Report proposes a target of universal youth and adult literacy (at least 95%) and bases its analysis on the new target. Both measures are presented in the table below.
- Goal 5 Gender parity in primary education: GPI of 0.97 to 1.03.

The following table presents data on how close countries are to achieving the three quantified EFA goals:

Table 12: E-9 countries: overall progress towards quantified EFA goals

E-9 countries: overall progress towards quantified EFA goals				
	Goal 2 Primary NER %	Goal 4		Goal 5 Primary GPI
		Reduction in illiteracy rate 2000- latest data %	Adult literacy rate – latest data %	
Bangladesh	95	38	60	1.05
Brazil	98	31	91	1.00
China	99	46	95	1.05
Egypt*	98	34	78	0.93
India	91	40	69	0.94
Indonesia	99	58	96	1.02
Mexico	99	50	94	1.01
Nigeria	58	37	71	0.91
Pakistan	68	17	56	0.86

Sources: National reviews; EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/14 where national data unavailable.
*Egypt measures literacy rates from age 10.

From these data:

- Seven of the nine countries have achieved **Goal 2**, or are likely to achieve it by 2015; the exceptions are Nigeria and Pakistan.
- Five countries have achieved **Goal 5**, three have come close and may well achieve the goal by 2015. It is unlikely that Pakistan will achieve this goal.
- The data on **Goal 4** present a mixed set of data; strictly on the grounds of a 50% reduction in illiteracy, only two countries appear to have achieved it, with China likely to do so by 2015. The rates of progress must however be understood both in relation to the higher or lower starting point in the literacy rate, as well as with regard to the absolute numbers of non-literate adults (Table 6 above).

It is also important to note that the E-9 countries form part of the larger trends across each region and globally. The country reviews adopt such an approach by citing their relative progress in international league tables or, more frequently, with regard to countries of the same region or sub-region. Even though this report presents progress across the E-9 countries as an identifiable group, the national reviews do not set their own progress in that context or compare it with progress in other E-9 countries. Nevertheless, the progress shown in the data and tables above clearly demonstrates the important part that the E-9 countries, taken together, have played in moving towards the global achievement of the six EFA goals. There is no doubt that global progress in the quantified EFA goals on primary education, gender parity and adult/youth literacy is due to a significant extent to the increases, particularly in the Asia/Pacific region, in enrolment rates, measures to get girls into school and persistent efforts to reach out through literacy programmes to youth and adults.

C. Successful strategies

All nine countries have made progress towards the EFA goals, to varying degrees. Hence, successful strategies may be found in each country from the macro level of national political will to the micro level, in terms, for instance, of better performance in individual schools. It is therefore somewhat invidious to single out particular strategies, since it means that others will not be listed. This section presents a number of striking examples of strategies that appear particularly bold, persistent or effective. It is clear that they are not the only ones and that many others can also be identified. The impact of the successful strategy is presented, where data are available.

The selected strategies address equity and access, quality and governance. They are selected on the basis that 1) they addressed the challenges of EFA directly and in a specific way, and 2) they had an impact on achieving some of the EFA goals.

1. Equity and access

Ensuring equitable access to basic education for all children is a central thrust of the EFA movement – getting girls into school, giving them an equal chance to learn, reaching rural populations, the poor, ethnic and linguistic minorities, children with special needs, and other marginalised groups. Targeted efforts must be made to ensure that the education system gives space for such groups and adapts so that they can effectively learn. The national reviews of several E-9 countries evince such strategies.

In **Egypt** in 2012/13 the GPI at primary level was 0.93, having stagnated over the last decade. In particular, girls in rural areas were not enrolling in school. In order to address the problem, measures were designed and deployed in particular regions of the country, recognising that the challenge is multidimensional.

- Where schools were too distant for girls to attend, Egypt developed one-room schools; although open to both girls and boys, in fact they attracted 70% female enrolment. 3 299 such schools now exist across the country. Community and small

schools were also established on the basis of local cooperation, with support from civil society and UNICEF respectively.

- In terms of providing a more suitable environment for girls to learn, Egypt established girl-friendly schools with the support of UNICEF and in partnership with local community organisations. Schooling is free, and children are fed at school.
- In seven governorates with low female enrolment, Egypt implemented a Girls' Education Initiative using the strategy of girl-friendly schools.

In a similar vein, **Nigeria** adopted a multi-pronged approach to bring girls into schooling. This was based on an analysis that girls' education is a socio-cultural issue, not merely an educational one. The measures employed fall into four categories – national policy frameworks; targeted programmes; community and mothers' awareness-raising; and improved school environments. The review details implementation of these measures in states where female enrolment has been particularly low. The impact has been considerable, for instance an 80% reduction in dropout in the schools supported by the African Girls Education Initiative in 2002-2004. Distinctive cultural patterns have been accommodated through the creation of more girl-only schools. Scholarships for training young women from disadvantaged and poor communities as teachers have provided female role models in areas where education has not traditionally been a high value. Conditional cash transfers, training mothers to track girls' enrolment, the formation of clubs to raise girls' confidence – these and other measures demonstrate the need to tackle girls' education from every possible angle. The review points out that current security concerns in the north-east of the country threaten to derail the progress made.

The attempted assassination of Malala and her schoolmates in **Pakistan** in 2012 brought home to the world the socio-political challenges facing education, particularly that of girls. The heightened visibility of girls' education that resulted led to renewed commitments to reduce gender disparities, and the review notes that the fund established bearing Malala's name was expected to reduce a 10% gender disparity to 5% over three years. The Minister of State for Education, Training and Standards in Higher Education re-iterated the Pakistan government's moral, ethical and constitutional commitment to ensure the right to education for every child, both girls and boys. The fund will be used in particular to support access, quality and a 'safe learning environment for girls in the hard-to-reach areas' of the country.

The **Bangladesh** review adopts a broad concept of equity, foregrounding gender, but also encompassing other forms of marginalisation. The review notes that out-of-school children, both boys and girls, are 'proportionately much higher in remote and ecologically disadvantaged districts', and that inequity due to ethnicity, special needs and disability must be addressed. With rapid urbanisation has come an increase of the urban poor, resulting in higher levels of deprivation among 'slum children' than among those in rural areas. This analysis of the structure of inequity has informed multiple initiatives seeking to reach these children, whose circumstances differ. The 'Inclusive Education and Gender Action Plan' provides the national framework for addressing these inequities. In addition to the well-known BRAC schools that serve areas where public schools do not exist, government initiatives supported by the World Bank (*Reaching out of school children*) and the European Union (*Supporting the hardest to reach through basic education*) are among other targeted measures. The review spells out the societal impact:

[...] equity policies and interventions in the education system have contributed to mitigating the deeper inequalities of society. (p.43)

In **Mexico**, the drive for equity and universal coverage has meant giving particular attention to reaching indigenous populations. Faced with lower enrolment and achievement in basic education among the 7.3 million indigenous population (2000 census), the government took measures at each level to enable indigenous children to succeed in school. These measures were based on the dual aim of giving indigenous children the same opportunities as every child, and of validating and affirming indigenous languages and cultures. Thus the

government took an intercultural approach, aware that education is a key factor in combatting discrimination. Learning bilingually in the child's indigenous language and in Spanish was guaranteed, with investment in a culturally relevant curriculum, teaching/learning materials in indigenous languages, certified training of bilingual teachers, and ongoing support to teachers.

- ➔ Impact: validation of local languages and cultures and active use of them in acquiring cognitive skills in school; increased enrolment and retention of indigenous children, particularly girls, in schooling – pre-school, primary and secondary.

With regard to gender equity, Mexico has taken two targeted measures. First, by the end of 2013, the National Grants Programme had provided support grants to 17 094 vulnerable girls – young mothers and pregnant girls. Further support was given by the Health Secretariat and other government departments, particularly in sexual and reproductive health. Second, Mexico published materials starting in 2009 to ensure a sustained and consistent approach from pre-school to secondary levels. Three books – one for each level – provide teachers with strategies to address questions of gender discrimination fight stereotypes and introduce a gender perspective across the curriculum. These materials are in the hands of all teachers, directors and administrative personnel in order to ensure full support for the application of the approach. Furthermore, extra-curricular cultural, sport and training activities were launched in 900 schools to promote gender equity and non-violence.

- ➔ Impact: elimination of the gender gap at pre-school, primary and secondary levels; dedicated gender equity budgets and programmes in the education sector, including for teacher training.

In line with national policies of non-discrimination and affirmative action, the **Indian** review presents data that are disaggregated with regard to Scheduled Castes (SC) and Tribes (ST) and to minorities, principally the Muslim community. The review spells out the strategies adopted to ensure higher enrolment and improved performance of children from these groups in elementary education (primary and upper primary stages):

Measures common to SC and ST:

- Providing adequate infrastructure for elementary schooling in districts with concentration of SC and ST populations;
- Free textbooks to all SC and ST students in Classes I-VIII;
- Provision of financial assistance to each district for special innovative activities to promote education of SC and ST children;

Measures specific to SC:

- Programmes to sensitise teachers to promote equitable learning opportunities and to address issues relating to class discrimination;
- Statutory representation of SC members in Village Education Committees and School Management Committees.

- ➔ Impact: from 2000-01 to 2012-13, the total enrolment of SC children in elementary education increased by 8.9 million (31.9 per cent). The enrolment of boys increased by 2.8 million (17.3 per cent) while the enrolment of girls increased by 6.1 million (52.1 per cent).

Measures specific to ST:

- Special coaching/remedial classes for improving learning outcomes of ST children;
- Recruitment of local tribal teachers;
- Deployment of tribal coordinators at the State level and tribal dominated districts to monitor SSA activities and to help in coordination of activities of the Ministry Tribal Affairs;

- Providing adequate representation of ST members in Village Education Committees and School Management Committees.

➔ Impact: from 2000-01 to 2009-10, the total enrolment of ST children in elementary education increased by 7.5 million (53.2 per cent). The enrolment of boys increased by 2.9 million (35.4 per cent) while the enrolment of girls increased by 4.6 million (78 per cent).

Measures for the minority Muslim community:

- Strengthening the capacity of madrasas to teach all the subjects of the curriculum;
- Training of teachers in interactive pedagogical practices;
- Accrediting madrasas through the National Institute for Open Schooling.

➔ Impact: The estimated number of out-of-school Muslim children decreased from 2.1 million in 2005-06 to 1.1 million in 2009.

Promotion of youth and adult literacy also requires targeted and differentiated approaches. **Indonesia** understood that a national commitment had to translate into a community-based initiative if it was to result in sustainable, relevant and usable literacy competencies. Devolving responsibility to provincial and district governments was the first step, followed by signing memoranda of understanding with religious organisations, women's associations, NGOs and civil society organisations, and private sector entities. Using this approach, localised interventions, often based around Community Learning Centres, could reach coastal, mountain and frontier communities, ethnic minorities and other disadvantaged groups. Building on UNESCO's LIFE initiative (Literacy Initiative for Empowerment), Indonesia adopted the slogan AKRAB!, an acronym derived from words meaning 'literacy creates power'. AKRAB! programmes included the following elements, which can be combined according to the contexts and purposes of learners:

- Functional literacy: use literacy for all purposes of life and livelihood;
- Entrepreneurship literacy: use literacy for entrepreneurial activity to improve the quality of life;
- Family literacy: learn literacy from and with family members, with access to information through Bahasa Indonesia;
- Literacy through folk tales: focused on acquisition and maintenance of literacy in particular communities;
- Local culture literacy: using and strengthening local culture by using it as a learning tool;
- Mother-tongue literacy: giving access to initial literacy in the first language, with the opportunity to learn Bahasa Indonesia subsequently.

➔ Impact: Reduction of youth and adult non-literates: 14.89 million in 2005, to 10.87 million in 2008, to 6.4 million in 2012 – a reduction of 57% in seven years.

Brazil adopted an approach of targeting different groups of youth and adults in its TVET strategy in order to address the challenge of equity and adjust this kind of training to labour market demands and so that learners could find suitable work in the context of their environment and circumstances. Under the *Projovem* banner, four programmes were offered:

- Adolescent: for young people of 15 to 17 years of age, providing them with opportunities re-enter or stay in the educational system.
- Urban: for those of 18 to 29 years who have not completed basic education. The 18-month course includes basic and initial professional education.

- Rural: a programme aimed at teaching its participants “the knowledge of the land”. It is training in agriculture for those who were excluded from formal education and gives them the opportunity to gain a professional qualification.
- Worker: targeting young people between 18 and 29 years who come from families earning the minimum wage and are pursuing or completing basic or secondary education. It prepares them for the world of work and for alternative occupations. The courses lead to a professional qualification.

With migration from rural to urban areas totalling 242 million by 2012, **China** developed training to enable rural workers to acquire new skills and enter the urban labour market. As part of the National Plan for Training Migrant workers (2003-2010), the ‘Sunshine Project’, courses of 3 weeks to 6 months prepared workers for non-agricultural industries – a total of 15.8 million rural workers benefited from this short-term training between 2004 and 2008. From 2009, the project turned its attention to improving skills among agricultural workers, with a focus on processing agricultural produce, rural entrepreneurship and modern agriculture and rural services. Experience with this project and other initiatives led to a new policy for training rural workers in 2010, including transfer training to prepare rural people for work and life in an urban context.

➡ Impact: Trainees who benefited from the ‘Sunshine Project’ saw their monthly income increase by 39% over migrants who had not received such training.

Examining the above strategies to improve equity and access for children in school, young people in continuing education and adults in literacy programmes, it is clear that **the key ingredient common to all of them is targeting** – that is, designing programmes in the light of the needs and aspirations of the learners, and taking account of the social, cultural, and linguistic characteristics of each learning group. This requires adjustments of the education system, offering different ways of learning tailored to particular needs and circumstances. In this regard, it is clear that a standardised, one-size-fits-all approach must be avoided and that only more targeted, nuanced strategies will be effective if equitable opportunities are to be open to everyone.

2. Quality

Quality improvement in education involves a range of interventions, many of which are exemplified in the strategies of E-9 countries highlighted below.

The **Indonesian** review details a range of quality inputs that have been the subject of initiatives during the EFA period, thus exemplifying a comprehensive approach to quality improvement. The inputs include: upgrading teacher skills, evaluation of teaching performance, certification of teachers, disbursing a teachers’ professional allowance, establishing national minimum standards, upgrading of schools to meet recognised standards, universalising accreditation to all educational establishments, financial assistance to schools, free textbooks, and adjusting the pupil/teacher ratio. These measures all required action by the government in terms of legislation and regulation and setting up new institutions.

In many school systems, the lack of teaching and learning materials is a serious handicap in motivating learners and giving them the chance to discover and process knowledge for themselves. One of the first requirements is textbooks. Recognising this, **Bangladesh** implemented a policy of free textbooks at the primary level, involving the production and distribution of over 115 million textbooks to over 111,000 primary level educational institutions every year. Initial management problems have been overcome, and in 2012 virtually all primary school pupils received textbooks, including in remote areas. Such is the enthusiasm that this has generated that schools often hold ‘textbook celebrations’ on receiving the materials. Teachers’ resources include a teacher’s edition of textbooks, a teacher’s guide, a teacher’s aid and annual lesson plans. Distribution reached up to 80% of primary schools in 2011.

Education is not only about knowledge and cognitive development, it is also a process of socialisation, communicating values both implicitly and explicitly. These values emerge from the local context and are reinforced and transformed through education. In this regard, **Pakistan** has given attention to validating local culture and knowledge, identifying traditional ways of peace-making and conflict resolution in a context where education is sometimes under threat from violence in the wider society. With the support of UNESCO, Pakistan has developed a teachers' resource kit *Promoting Peace and Social Cohesion through Heritage Education*. It fosters local craftsmanship and creativity and presents the challenges of sustainable development, including health and food security. This approach is a key contribution to quality learning as it enables learners to apply new knowledge and cognition in relevant ways to their local circumstances, thus embedding education in their daily lives.

As part of a far-reaching reform for increased quality, **Mexico** has restructured teacher services, promoted school-based management, and laid the foundation for a National Educational Assessment Institute as an autonomous body. Further measures include the improvement of school infrastructure, a guide for school improvement and targeted strategies to increase reading and maths levels, as well as promoting accountability for educational achievement. The 'Full Time' school programme, now implemented in 15,349 schools, has increased the length of the school day for the most vulnerable population groups.

A key aspect of quality improvement is establishing processes and indicators to track performance. To do this, **India** has developed a range of assessments for learning outcomes, teachers' performance, and the overall performance of schools and their leadership.

- Learners: under the impetus of the Right to Education Act of 2009, each child's learning process should be tracked, using continuous and comprehensive evaluation (CCE) and addressing all aspects of a child's development – physical, socio-emotional, cognitive – not academic achievement alone.
- Teachers: a set of Performance Indicators for Elementary School Teachers has been developed at national level and shared with states.
- Schools and school leadership: indicators on school performance are under development in order to provide 'a common core and expectations for all schools'. Twelve states have launched this initiative, with expansion to all states in 2014-15.

India's assessment strategy underlines the linkages between leadership, teacher performance and, ultimately, learning outcomes. Quality cannot be addressed piecemeal, but will only improve as the whole of the system adopts recognised standards and is accountable for maintaining them.

The relevance of education and learning is a key element of quality, enabling learners to apply knowledge to their environment and to use the skills they acquire productively. In **Nigeria**, a major policy development was introduced to vocationalize the curriculum at the primary level. The subjects are labelled as 'pre-vocational' and include agriculture, home economics, drawing and handicraft, music and cultural activities, and computer education. In the third stage of basic education in the Nigerian system, junior secondary level, vocational skills are consolidated alongside the academic curriculum. Subjects are still considered as 'pre-vocational' and now include business studies and fine art together with those introduced earlier. The policy was introduced in 2011, and an evaluation of its effectiveness is yet to be undertaken.

Efforts to increase the relevance and coverage of adult literacy programmes led **Egypt** to forge a wide range of partnerships focusing on linking literacy with diverse aspects of life and livelihood. Improvements in health awareness were the focus of literacy cooperation with the private sector within Egypt (*Unified Group* company) and beyond (*RWE* Germany), and agricultural/rural livelihood skills were promoted in cooperation with the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD). Further literacy cooperation included civil society

organisations and foundations in particularly disadvantaged regions of the country. A national campaign was launched in 2011 with the support of UNESCO, focusing on the targets of EFA goal 4 – in particular a reduction of the illiteracy rate to below 10%. The strategy of diverse cooperation with organisations inside and outside the country reflects not only a determination to mobilise energies and resources, but also to adapt literacy initiatives to the particular context and learning needs of specific groups and regions.

3. Governance

The governance of the education system is a central factor in its effectiveness, ensuring that adequate mechanisms for management, accountability and participation of stakeholders are in place and function well.

Promoting universal education was a huge challenge for **China** with its high population, and decentralised approaches have been a key to success. Education management was devolved to provincial and county level, with the added need to address disparities of different kinds in different regions – ethnic minorities, migrants, people with disabilities, rural/urban, gender. Thus, first, strategies were developed for regions facing similar kinds of challenges, and second, a phased, step-by-step implementation process enabled regions to address huge numbers in a steady and systematic way. Four categories for identifying regions with similar characteristics were set up:

- Cities and relatively developed rural areas (accounting for roughly 40% of the total population)
- Moderately developed rural areas (roughly 40% of the total population)
- Relatively underdeveloped rural areas (roughly 15% of the total population)
- Impoverished rural areas (roughly 5% of the total population).

Developing appropriate targets and the phasing of implementation took account of the characteristics and educational situation of these different areas, with strengthened initiatives such as building boarding schools in rural areas, and projects to develop modern distance education in rural primary and middle schools. The central government gave support to these measures by provision of dedicated funds for projects related to compulsory education in impoverished areas, and the establishment of a mechanism for the inspection and appraisal of local initiatives.

Further, more developed regions, such as the eastern cities, were required to move faster in setting new educational standards and then provide assistance to less developed regions in central and western China. The report observes that it was these phased and differentiated strategies that led to significant reductions in disparities.

- ➔ Impact: the primary NER difference between more developed eastern regions and less developed western regions was cut from 1.83 percentage points to 0.58 percentage points; difference in primary graduation rates was reduced from 6.9 percentage points to 0.52 percentage points; difference in the adult literacy rate between eastern and western regions was brought down from 4.8 percentage points to 4 percentage points; gender parity achieved, with slightly higher enrolment of girls.

The **Brazil** review details a selection of 22 government programmes specifically aimed at improving the quality of educational delivery and performance. It also presents the overarching question of the participation and mobilisation of civil society, a feature of Brazil's return to democracy culminating in the 1988 constitution. Civil society groups have played and continue to play a role in determining the future of education. Consultations with civil society at municipal and state levels led up to a National Education Conference in 2010 and hence to a new National Education Plan for 2014-2023. At local level, new training programmes have equipped municipal education councils to foster social participation in the assessment, definition and monitoring of education policy. At school level, participation builds on the long tradition of parent-teacher associations to express the needs of schools

and provide a structure to manage direct supplementary federal funding. These initiatives have increased local support and accountability in education as a key element in ensuring higher quality delivery and improved performance.

D. Challenges and prospects in education

The table on progress towards the EFA goals (Table 12 in section B.4 above) gives an indication the challenges that E-9 countries face as the deadline of 2015 approaches. The national reviews present a perception of the challenges each country faces – often a long list of the parts and functions of the education system that need improvement. This section does not reproduce those lists, but draws on the reviews, highlighting salient country-specific challenges. A final summary comment draws out some generic considerations.

Bangladesh faces the challenge of under-nourished children from poor households, affecting school enrolment as well as the performance of children in school. Nearly two-thirds of the children who were never enrolled in school come from households which are always or sometimes in deficit with regard to staple foods. This is a socio-economic challenge whose impact on education is critical – a number of pilot schemes provide school feeding with the challenge to expand these to all the children who need them. A further challenge is what the review calls ‘silent exclusion’ - children in school, but who are not effectively engaged in learning; this is linked to poor attendance, grade repetition, poor performance in class activities and examinations, and eventual dropout. The review also identifies the annual number of hours of instruction as a factor in achieving quality learning outcomes. The number is set officially at 578 hours per year, but actual hours are often less, well below the international benchmark of 800-1000 hours. In summing up, the review calls for Bangladesh to move away from a ‘low-cost, low-yield’ system and to invest adequately for improved levels of input, better pedagogical processes and higher-quality learning outcomes.

Brazil expresses its future educational challenges in the 20 targets of the National Education Plan approved in June 2014 for the next decade (2014-2023). Central among these targets are the extension of compulsory schooling to nine years (ages 4 to 17), requiring increased enrolments in pre-school, secondary and higher education, and improving quality. The latter target includes teaching all children to read by the end of the third grade, and a series of measures to improve the performance, status and remuneration of teachers. For youth, higher participation in vocational training will require increases in both public and private provision, and for higher education, a net target rate of 33% of 18-24 year-old youth is set. All these ambitious targets will need to focus on including the most vulnerable sections of the population.

Owing to population policies in **China**, the school-age population has declined in the past decade: in primary education 130.1 million children were enrolled in 2000, and 99.4 million in 2010. In junior middle school, numbers peaked in 2003 at 66.2 million children and this reduced to 52.8 million in 2010. China therefore initiated a programme of school merger and closure. However, this has produced some adverse effects and is being reconsidered. For some children, access became more difficult as they had longer distances to get to school or needed to board. Increased dropouts and higher burdens on families were also a consequence. The review cites a study on this phenomenon which in some cases resulted in concerns for efficiency taking precedence over equity, particularly in rural areas. The challenge is now to ensure that every child has equitable access to schooling in a context of lower numbers. In more general terms, China now faces the challenge of extending the benefits of educational opportunities equitably to its less developed western regions, for ethnic minorities, remote rural populations, people with disabilities, migrants and other relatively disadvantaged groups.

A key challenge in **Egypt** is the differential access and quality of education in different regions. Upper Egypt is relatively deprived in educational terms and has higher rates of

poverty. This leads to increased child labour, lower enrolment and higher dropout rates. In the same region, adult literacy is lower, and participation in literacy programmes is constrained by the opportunity cost, as many adults are day labourers. In terms of the school system, two challenges relate to the deployment of personnel. First, in the public schools, over 85% of teachers are qualified, but this drops to 71% in the private schools. As concern for the quality of learning outcomes has grown, the need for increasing initial and in-service training has become more acute. Second, Egypt has an unusually high proportion of administrators in the education system, in relation to teacher numbers, and is beginning to tackle this problem by reducing administrator recruitment. Violence in schools is also a worrying challenge, among and between learners, teachers and parents – the review indicates that there are no current measures to tackle this problem.

EFA goal 4 on promoting adult literacy presents a particular challenge for **India** which has the highest number of non-literate adults of any country in the world. The number remained more or less unchanged from the period 1985-1994 to 2005-2011, thus just keeping pace with population growth – this in itself is a major achievement and is the result of major investment. The remaining challenge is multi-faceted, as the review makes clear:

- Non-literate adults include women, the rural poor, and a number of marginalised groups (scheduled castes, scheduled tribes, minorities, ‘other backward classes’), and school dropouts.
- The provision of literacy may not result in relevant, usable competencies. Programmes have been designed to ‘impart literacy’, frequently with the assumption that acquiring literacy is its own motivation. To counter this, programmes have been designed to go beyond mere reading and writing to more applied uses of literacy in promoting viable livelihoods.

Among other challenges mentioned in the Indian review, that of improving teaching and learning features strongly in the pursuit of higher quality: improving teacher attendance rates, institutionalising active learning approaches, integrating ICTs into learning, balancing teacher deployment, improving teacher education and continuing professional development, and improving learning assessment.

Indonesia displays great diversity of ethnicity, culture and language across its thousands of islands, and the review identifies these regional differences as a major educational challenge. This means that 68.5% of provinces reached a primary NER of $\geq 95\%$, and that the percentage of villages that have at least one formal ECCE centre varied by province, from 100% in the region of the capital city to less than 50% in six more remote provinces. Similarly, increases in the literacy rate are lower and slower in areas of ethnic minorities, with different languages and cultures. Designing literacy programmes using local languages requires much more attention, particularly developing the literate environment in culturally relevant and sustainable ways.

Mexico notes that much progress has been achieved in education since 2000, and the review situates the challenge of improving access to and the quality of education in the context of promoting peace and respect in society, from community to international levels. Thus, those who still face exclusion or reduced opportunity in education need special attention – the review notes that the significant achievements in addressing the needs of people with disability and the gifted will need further reinforcement. Gender equity must receive ongoing attention as part of the promotion of human rights, and the multidimensional challenge of improving quality must be addressed by putting the school at the centre of the action.

Of the E-9 countries, **Nigeria** faces the most demanding and wide-ranging challenges. The review laments the country’s poor progress on most of the EFA targets and acknowledges that in some areas the statistics show a decline rather than progress. Challenges lie therefore in almost every area of educational planning and implementation, and the review presents these at the end of each section with a set of positive measures that should be

undertaken. In reading the review, the question then arises: what would be the most effective area of action to improve the overall situation? According to the review, it is clear that governance and management must be improved if education of quality for all is to be achieved. Across all six EFA goals, seven national institutions are responsible for implementation, with replication of some of them down to state level. This 'unwieldy arrangement' creates overlap, parallel reporting channels and fragmented implementation. Furthermore, the review reports that an external evaluation of institutions responsible for EFA 'found that although these institutions were elaborately staffed, the technical skills of their professional staff and their capacities to respond as professionals to the EFA challenge needs additional support.' Management of budgets also attracts criticism, principally due to the complexity, rigidity and slow pace of accessing and disbursing available funds. While a certain level of misuse of funding has led to increasing administrative controls, one result of the situation is of course that schools and other educational programmes remain chronically underfunded. The review suggests that decentralisation of management and the empowerment of schools and local communities to ensure accountability would be key steps likely to move the EFA agenda, and its post-2015 successor, forward in the coming years.

Pakistan faces large numerical and qualitative challenges to reach the EFA goals, and these challenges range across all six goals. The women's literacy rate remains at a low level of under 50%, and raising it will have a beneficial effect on increasing girls' schooling. The review indicates the strong commitment of Pakistan to improving education, both equitable access and quality, as shown in its efforts to develop policies and frameworks for implementation. The decentralisation of education to the provinces necessitated the development of provincial and district EFA plans, a process that has required persuasion and capacity development to be effective. These plans are now integrated into a National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (2013-2016). Further challenges emerged with regard to the EFA goals on ECCE and adult literacy which had been 'either ignored or totally under-developed in Pakistan'. Beginning with initiatives in certain provinces, new programmes were launched across the country, particularly in adult literacy. The review speaks of 'a paradigm shift in planning practices at the government level' through a number of reform initiatives. It is in these areas, however, that a critical challenge remains. Pakistan has made determined and sustained efforts in policy development, planning, and EFA coordination without being able to follow through to full implementation. While both the intention and the scope of these measures were designed to improve EFA performance, in practice, implementation of these reforms has been difficult, largely because of factors of constitutional changes, financing and external shocks to education. As the review makes clear, real progress cannot be made unless institutional mechanisms function properly at national and provincial levels.

E. Summary comment

As a summary comment, the specific educational challenges presented in the national reviews can be distilled into three major areas: numbers, diversity, and governance, management and organisation.

1. Numbers

The sheer numbers of children, youth and adult learners presents a challenge for the delivery of education. Numbers of schools and classrooms, teachers, textbooks and equipment, and the systems to support putting it all in place, are huge, and likely to remain that way as most E-9 countries have a young population and a relatively high birth rate. However, the reviews demonstrate that this challenge can effectively be addressed through good planning which breaks down delivery to very large numbers of learners into a manageable system; this implies the various modes of decentralisation evidenced in the reviews. Clearly, other populous countries of whatever economic category face similar

issues in this regard. Delivery across large populations is not only a matter of numbers, however, it is also a matter of diversity.

2. Diversity

The national reviews make a point of highlighting regional differences within countries as a key challenge in universalising basic education and improving quality. Relative economic and geographical status – poverty and wealth, rural and urban – is a key determinant of equitable access and quality, but behind that lie many other factors of diversity. In many cases, it is ethnic, cultural and linguistic diversity that have the greatest impact; centrally planned education systems with a standardised curriculum and a single language as medium of instruction are not well adapted to giving diverse learners the best chance to benefit from education. Thus the reviews variously describe both progress and challenges in the area of recognising diversity and changing the education system to ensure equality of opportunity. Once again, this challenge is by no means the preserve of the E-9 countries – most countries, however large and of whatever economic status, face the same challenge.

3. Governance and management

At the heart of delivering quality education to all are matters of governance, management and organisation. In large and diverse countries such as the E-9, the challenges of national coordination of the education system, responsiveness to local conditions and adequate accountability to stakeholders at all levels are critical. Devolution of powers and decentralisation of systems are part of an ongoing debate requiring a sustained political and professional dialogue. Moving management and accountability effectively to the school level is no straightforward matter, given the need for building local capacity among parents and communities. The nub of the issue lies in how the relations between national, state/provincial, community and school levels are articulated and what kinds of responsibility are devolved – curriculum design, teacher recruitment, financial management, quality control, among others. As the EFA Global Monitoring Report on this topic stressed (UNESCO 2008), decentralisation is in itself no panacea; it all depends on how it is implemented. This is a particular challenge for the large systems of the E-9 countries, but all high-population countries must address it, not only those in the E-9 Initiative or those in particular economic categories.

F. Annexes

1. E-9 population

E-9 countries population			
	1993	2010	2014 estimate
Bangladesh	114 898 000	151 125 000	156 743 000
Brazil	157 011 000	195 210 000	202 953 000
China	1 213 104 000	1 359 821 000	1 365 980 000
Egypt	59 308 000	78 076 000	86 922 100
India	921 108 000	1 205 625 000	1 247 560 000
Indonesia	188 019 000	240 676 000	252 164 800
Mexico	91 654 000	117 886 000	119 713 203
Nigeria	103 145 000	159 708 000	178 517 000
Pakistan	120 337 000	173 149 000	188 020 000
Total	2 968 584 000	3 681 276 000	3 798 563 103
E-9 as % of world population	53%	53%	52.9%

Source: "World Population Prospects The 2012 Revision: Highlights and Advance Tables". The Department of Economic and Social Affairs of the United Nations

2. E-9 Gross National Income per capita

E-9 countries: GNI per capita (US dollars)				
	1993	2000	2013	Economic classification 2013
Bangladesh	310	380	900	Low-income
Brazil	2,740	3,860	11,690	Upper middle-income
China	410	920	6,560	Upper middle-income
Egypt	750	1,470	3,160	Lower middle income
India	330	460	1,570	Lower middle income
Indonesia	810	570	3,580	Lower middle income
Mexico	4,420	5,690	9,940	Upper middle-income
Nigeria	190	270	2,760	Lower middle income
Pakistan	440	470	1,380	Lower middle income

Source: World Bank

G. Sources

1. National EFA 2015 Reviews

- Bangladesh: EFA 2015 National Review – Bangladesh (Draft – 2), submitted to UNESCO, prepared under the auspices of Ministry of Primary and Mass Education, Government of Bangladesh. 89 p.
- Brazil: Report: Education for All in Brazil 2000-2015. Ministry of Education: Minister's Office for International Affairs. 117 p.
- China: Achieving EFA and Beyond: Education for All in China 2000-2010. UNICEF / UNESCO / National Commission of the People's Republic of China for UNESCO. 2013. 91 p.
- Egypt: Education for All in Egypt 2000-2015: a national assessment. Prepared by NCERD. Ministry of Education, Arab Republic of Egypt. 205 p.
- India: National EFA Review Report – India. 126 p.
- Indonesia: Review of Education for All in Indonesia. Ministry of Education and Culture. 106 p.
- Mexico: Educación para Todos: Informe México. Subsecretaría de Educación Básica. 66 p.
- Nigeria: Nigeria EFA Review Report 2000-2014: *Strides and Milestones*. Nigeria Federal Ministry of Education. 158 p.
- Pakistan: Pakistan Education for All Review Report 2015. Ministry of Education and Professional Training – Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Islamabad, Pakistan. 44 p.

2. Other sources

- Bibeau, Jean-René, Pamela Kester-McNees and Vijay Reddy. 2003. *Report on the evaluation of UNESCO's E-9 Initiative*. Unpublished report.
- China Ministry of Education. 2012. Report on the Promotion of Universal Compulsory Education and the Eradication of Illiteracy in China. The Ministry of Education, P.R. China. 28 p.
- UNESCO. 2008. *Overcoming inequality: why governance matters*. EFA Global Monitoring Report 2009. Paris: UNESCO.
- UNESCO. 2014. *Teaching and Learning: achieving quality for all*. EFA Global Monitoring Report 2013/4. Paris: UNESCO.
- UNESCO. <http://www.unesco.org/new/en/education/themes/leading-the-international-agenda/education-for-all/coordination-mechanisms/e-9-initiative/> accessed 2 August 2014.
- UNESCO Institute for Statistics.
http://data.uis.unesco.org/Index.aspx?DataSetCode=EDULIT_DS&popupcustomise=true&lang=en# accessed 4 August 2014.
- UNESCO Bangkok – Asia-Pacific Regional Bureau for Education. 2014. *Regional Education for All (EFA) Synthesis Report: Asia-Pacific 2014* [Preliminary draft].
- United Nations. 2013. *World Population Prospects: the 2012 Revision - Highlights and Advance Tables*. New York: UN Economic and Social Affairs.
- World Bank. Global Gross National Income per capita.
<http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GNP.PCAP.CD/countries/1W-BD?page=4&display=default> accessed 12 August 2014.