



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

IPDC THE INTERNATIONAL PROGRAMME
FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF COMMUNICATION

**EVALUATION REPORTS ON
PROJECTS SELECTED BY
THE IPDC BUREAU**

INTERGOVERNMENTAL COUNCIL OF THE IPDC

Twenty-eighth session

UNESCO HEADQUARTERS, PARIS

22 – 23 MARCH 2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | UNESCO CLUSTER OFFICE | PROJECT TITLE BUDGET CODE | PAGE |
|-----|-----------------------------|--|------|
| | | AFRICA | |
| 1. | NAIROBI | SOMALIA: ESTABLISHMENT OF HARGEISA CAMPUS CMC BUDGET CODE: 354 SOM 5071 | 5 |
| 2. | NAIROBI | SOMALIA: STRENGTHENING EAST AFRICAN UNIVERSITY JOURNALISM TRAINING THROUGH COMMUNITY RADIO BUDGET CODE: 354 SOM 5072 | 11 |
| 3. | NAIROBI | SOMALIA: PUNTLAND COMMUNITY BROADCASTER'S TRAINING BUDGET CODE: 354 SOM 5091 | 18 |
| | | ASIA AND THE PACIFIC | |
| | | INTRODUCTION | 24 |
| 4. | NEW DELHI | BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING FOR YOUNG JOURNALISTS BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5071 | 28 |
| 5. | NEW DELHI | BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING FOR INVESTIGATIVE JOURNALISM BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5072 | 33 |
| 6. | NEW DELHI | BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING OF COMMUNITY RADIO PERSONNEL BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5081 | 40 |
| 7. | NEW DELHI | BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLE ON RADIO JOURNALISM AND PROGRAMS PRODUCTION BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5082 | 49 |
| 8. | NEW DELHI | BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING OF WOMEN ON RADIO JOURNALISM AND PROGRAMS PRODUCTION BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5091 | 56 |
| 9. | NEW DELHI | BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING FOR JOURNALISTS OF THREE HILL DISTRICTS BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5092 | 61 |
| | | CONCLUSIONS | 67 |
| | | LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN | |
| 10. | QUITO | REGIONAL: STRENGTHENING THE ROLE OF JOURNALISM IN THE BUILDING OF TRUST BETWEEN NATIONS: COLOMBIA, ECUADOR, VENEZUELA BUDGET CODE: 354 RLA 5095 | 72 |
| 11. | QUITO | REGIONAL: IMPROVING THE MONITORING OF PRESS FREEDOM IN THE ANDEAN REGION BUDGET CODE: 354 RLA 5096 | 82 |
| 12. | QUITO | BOLIVIA: TRAINING ON ACCES TO INFORMATION BUDGET CODE: 354 BOL 5091 | 91 |
| 13. | QUITO | PERU: STRENGTHENING DEMOCRACY BY PROMOTING INVESTIGATIVE JOURNALISM AND TRANSPARENT ACCESS TO PUBLIC INFORMATION BUDGET CODE: 354 PER 5091 | 100 |
| | | ARAB REGION | |
| 14. | BEIRUT | REGIONAL: BUILDING INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY OF THE FEDERATION OF ARAB NEWS AGENCIES (FANA) TO OFFER MEDIA TRAINING BUDGET CODE: 354 RAB 5081 | 109 |
| 15. | BEIRUT | LEBANON: BUILDING NATIONAL NEWS AGENCY'S CAPACITY TO PROMOTE FREE, PLURALISTIC AND DIVERSE MEDIA BUDGET CODE: 354 LEB 5081 | 117 |
| 16. | BEIRUT | LEBANON: CONFLICT SENSITIVE JOURNALISM: EMPOWERING YOUNG JOURNALISTS IN RESPONSIBLE COVERAGE DURING TIMES OF CONFLICT BUDGET CODE: 354 LEB 5082 | 126 |

| | |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
| NAME | Mrs Grace N. Githaiga |
| Nationality | Kenyan |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PhD Candidate/Researcher for MEDIEA (Media, Empowerment and Democracy in East Africa); • Africa President, Board of Directors, World Association of Community Broadcasters (AMARC); • Executive Director, EcoNews Africa |

EVALUATION REPORT

A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

PROJECT TITLE

Establishment of Hargeisa Campus CMC

2. PROJECT BUDGET CODE

354 SOM 5071

3. CATEGORY

Community Broadcaster: Human Resource Capacity Building

4. AGENCY

UNESCO

4.1 BENEFICIARY

University of Hargeisa (UoH) University Community Journalists

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:

University of Hargeisa

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objective:

The Campus CMC is to serve as a reference point for both print and electronic information and knowledge sharing by offering access to an alternative to State and other private media with a diversity of programming, and professional and responsible reporting.

5.2 Operational or immediate objective:

Improvement of Hargeisa School of journalism curriculum through integration of the radio station and media resources into appropriate courses, and provision of hands-on opportunities for direct radio experience for students at the University, both inside and outside the school of journalism.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- Hands-on training in radio broadcasting for 50 certificate and degree students in journalism.

- Establishment of an IT training facility at the University of Hargeisa.
- Increase in IT technical services to the community.
- Training in multimedia development to support communication personnel and extension agents.
- Provide opportunities for online research and documentation.
- Increase a desirable environment for distance education.

5.4 **Target groups (beneficiaries)**

- Journalism students at University of Hargeisa
- Communities living in and around the Capital City of Hargeisa
- The student population at the University of Hargeisa
- The student population in high schools, vocational institutes, and academics near the University of Hargeisa.

6. **IPDC ASSISTANCE**

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$ 45,000

Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$ 35,000

The approved amount was used for:

Procurement of the CMC equipment which includes (as identified and seen by the evaluator):

- Field Reporting kit (3 pieces)
- Microphones (3 pieces)
- Portable recording MP3 (3 pieces)
- Panasonic Headphones (3 pieces)
- Computer Microphones (3 pieces)
- A Server
- A laptop
- 7 PCs
- 2 HP Printer desk jet
- A video camera
- A digital camera
- A scanner
- LCD Projector
- Heavy duty Photocopier.

7. **CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES**

7.1 **Agency contributions**

The World Bank has supported connectivity (Local Area Network) for the last three years (2011 is the third year), while the room housing the Community Multi Media Center (CMC) was renovated using funds from the Islamic Bank as part of an agreement with the University of Hargeisa.

7.3. **Time schedule/project duration**

August 2008 to December 28, 2009

B - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives : The long term objective of the project was appropriate and the idea to establish the radio or rather have a radio in place at the university excellent. This is because the community still needs more supplementary information in particular information that would contribute to awareness and learning of issues that concern them. Hargeisa has only the National Radio, and international broadcasters such as Somali Services of VOA and BBC. But there is no other local broadcaster.

All equipment was purchased and two rooms allocated to house the CMC by the university.

Short-term objectives : The short term objectives were consistent with the development objectives. The curriculum of Hargeisa School of journalism has been improved; students are utilizing equipment at the center, such as the printer, the PCs, the server and the cameras for class work, and using the broadcast equipment for production of radio programs. There has been provision of hands-on opportunities for direct radio experience for students at the University, both inside and outside school of journalism.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities : All equipment was purchased by the University of Hargeisa, besides the Wanton Radio in a box that was delivered from UNESCO Addis office.

The computers have been set up at the CMC and the server is being utilized to distribute emails to students, while the cameras and printers are used to produce the University Newsletter. Some of the production equipment is being used by students for practice (e.g. the voice recorders). The radio is on air.

At the time when the University submitted the proposal to IPDC, it was on the understanding that the University would also make a contribution to the project to supplement what UNESCO would provide. However, before the proposal could go through, there was a change of management at the University which comes with every new government. As a result, the funds that were received from UNESCO were only sufficient for equipment, and other components suffered since the university's contribution was missing. Also, when UNESCO funds were approved and came through, the then management used those funds for salaries of those working under the department. However, when the new management took over, this matter was resolved and UNESCO funds were refunded to the project. This allowed for the purchase of the equipment which is now available at the CMC.

Due to shifting of the budget, the implementation timelines were affected and there was a delay in purchasing the equipment.

Project management:

The project has been managed fairly well. The team works together with defined tasks for example in terms of logistics or pushing for the license. However many in the original team (as shown in UNESCO's Proposal to IPDC) have since left as a result of change in government. They have now been replaced by others who were appointed at the University by the new government.

The previous Chair of the University was very involved in the project. His successor passed away a week before the evaluation took place in a car crash. A project account for the funds has been maintained. The bank signatories are the President of the

University and the Vice President Finance. Of importance is that the Project Director has to authorize any expenditure.

UNESCO services: UNESCO Nairobi Communications Office provided technical advice on the purchase and installation of the CMC equipment, and monitored implementation through email and phone exchanges with the University.

Collaboration: Islamic bank rehabilitated buildings for the University and the University management allocated two rooms that now house the CMC. The World Bank has supported the Local Area Network (LAN) for the last three years.

Project monitoring: UNESCO received a progress (both narrative and financial) report, as well as a final report at the end of the grant period. The project maintained consistent communication with both the Nairobi and Addis offices and provided updates including pictures.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results:

- A CMC that is functional.
- Production of University Newsletter using the equipment at the CMC.
- Students utilizing the equipment for learning purposes e.g. computers, cameras, and printers for practical lessons.

Cost-effectiveness: The CMC serves as a reference point for both print and electronic information and knowledge and sharing. It provides access to an alternative to state-run and international media. Also, given the utilization of the equipment by students for practicals and newsletter production, the project is effective.

Development impact:

- The students have benefited from the computers, internet, and cameras.
- The University is using the facilities to produce its newsletter and other literature useful for the university, such as brochures. This has not only provided experience to those involved but has also cut production costs for the university.
- The facility is functioning as a production studio, providing hands-on training for journalism students.
- The radio offers alternative sources of information which are relevant to local people. It is the only local radio besides the National broadcaster.

Sustainability: There is a plan in place to train students and journalists to produce programs at a nominal fee using the facilities, as well as target companies for advertisement. There are also plans to work with the African Virtual University (AVU) on its distance learning programs.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management: Hargeisa National Radio is not on air 24 hours. The University of Hargeisa should consider negotiating and getting into an agreement with the National Radio to air its programs even if it is just for an hour daily for a country-wide reach. The National Broadcaster has potential times that the University can use. The university could produce its programs using the facilities acquired through UNESCO, and then use the

National Radio for airing the said programs to larger audiences. Programs on issues such as HIV/Aids education and awareness, peace building and culture would benefit the country at large. As of now, it is only the communities around the university that benefit from the broadcasts. The University of Hargeisa radio would be able to target more audiences using the National Broadcaster resources. For example Somalis speak about many topics through songs, dance and drama. Drama programs could be produced and incorporate all the ideas of ordinary people. Collaboration between the two institutions would be beneficial to all the people of Hargeisa.

Recipient institution: The UoH should also explore streaming the content for wider reach and for those who have internet access in Hargeisa.

The equipment should also be utilized for training practicing and upcoming journalists as well as for distance learning at a minimal fee to raise revenue for the CMC.

Member State: The constitution of Hargeisa provides for the national Public radio as the only broadcaster (locally). As such Somalis, who love to listen to Radio, usually tune in to BBC and VOA Somali services as well as other radio stations from Bossaso. The University of Hargeisa Radio's content could be made available to the Somali people all over Hargeisa if the State could allow collaboration with the University. The State should therefore consider forging a partnership with the University so that some of the University's content can also be aired on the National Radio during those times that the National Radio has available airtime. This way, the University's content could fill the gap that Somali people seek from International Broadcasters.

IPDC: Should consider another grant for supporting content production with a view to this also being shared on National Radio.

UNESCO: UNESCO needs to consider Project accompaniment, where it goes with a grantee (for mentorship and capacity building) to ensure that objectives are met, and not leave partners as soon as equipment has been purchased or the grant period is over. There is need for UNESCO institutions to work together. For example there should have been collaboration between the Addis and Nairobi offices with the PEER offices in Hargeisa and Garowe since the Communication office does not have an office on the ground. The PEER office(s) on the ground could help in monitoring the project to determine if it is functional. In other words UNESCO CI should make use of the local offices.

12. **LESSONS LEARNT**

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project: The radio can capitalize on the existing opportunities in Hargeisa. It needs to explore collaborative efforts with the National Broadcaster.

A major lesson is that change of management, as has happened every time there is a new government, has a bearing on the success of a project.

Way of co-operation: Funders should consider that projects in precarious place like in Somalia may have different challenges that may affect faster results. These projects may be limited in their implementation capacity. This should guide funders in particular on timelines of implementation of projects. The UNESCO support is highly appreciated as it is the only one that has supported communication equipment, which is great capital investment.

Inputs: In a country like Somalia where the situation continues to be precarious and at times volatile, it is not always assured that the beneficiary recipient will be in a position to

make a financial contribution toward the project. This is not a fault of the beneficiary recipient but there may be unforeseen realities that may dictate on success of the project.

Instruments used: Review of project documents, key informant interviews with beneficiaries and personal assessment. It was not possible to interview any student since the University was on recess at the time of the evaluation exercise.

Evaluated by: Grace Githaiga¹
Period of evaluation: September 20-October 20, 2011
Meeting on the ground: October 2-4-, 2011

Mission itinerary

Work schedule and method:

- Project document review
- Development of data collection tools
- Field, Interviews with key informants.
- Report writing

Sources :

UNESCO Report on Information n IPDC Projects to be evaluated in Somalia.
 University of Hargeisa Proposal to IPDC on the Establishment of Hargeisa Campus CMC
 List of equipment/Inventory purchased using UNESCO Grant.
 University of Hargeisa End of Project Report

List of Interviewees

| <i>Name</i> | <i>Function</i> |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| Abdirashed Ibrahim Abdirahman | Head of Project and Director of ICT Services and Distance Learning, University of Hargeisa, rashedibr@hotmail.com , Tel: 252 2 4422166 |
| Osman Ali | Ardent Listner of Hargeisa Radio, osali007@hotmail.com |
| Sultan Mohammed | Unesco Hargeisa Office, misultan33@yahoo.com , Tel: 252 2 528697 |
| Zamzam Warsame | UNESCO Hargeisa Office, filfilo@yahoo.co.uk Tel: 252 2 528697 |
| Osman Haider | OIC Mogadishu (evacuated to Hargeisa), osmano114@yahoo.com Tel : 252 5 932032 |

UNESCO

Abdikadir Abdirahman Salah, UNESCO PEER Garowe Office

E-mail: aasahal7@yahoo.com

Tel: 252 5 794074

Lydia Gachungi and Jocelyn Josia, Nairobi CI.

¹ The Evaluator appreciates the tremendous support offered by all UNESCO staff from Nairobi both in CI and PEER, and the PEER offices in Hargeisa and Garowe for providing information on flights, airport pickups and accommodation. Particular thanks go to Abdikadir Abirahman Salah from PEER Office at Garowe, who used the 'traditional communication means' and was able to trace contacts of some of those to be evaluated in Bosaso and coordinated with UNDSS to rescue the evaluator from the immigrations at Bosaso. He also liaised with UNDSS for security and police escort as is required. Abdikadir had to undergo surgery before the evaluator left Hargeisa, and delegated some tasks to Issa Mohammed Issa.

| | |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
| NAME | Mrs Grace N. Githaiga |
| Nationality | Kenyan |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PhD Candidate/Researcher for MEDIEA (Media, Empowerment and Democracy in East Africa); • Africa President, Board of Directors, World Association of Community Broadcasters (AMARC); • Executive Director, EcoNews Africa |

EVALUATION REPORT

A - **DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY**

1. **PROJECT TITLE**

Strengthening East African University Journalism Training Through Community Radio and ICTs

2. **BUDGET CODE**

354 SOM 5072

3. **CATEGORY:**
Radio Broadcasting and ICTs

4. **AGENCY:**
UNESCO

4.1 **BENEFICIARY:**
East Africa University and Puntland Community in Somalia

4.2 **MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:**
East African University Journalism School

5. **PROJECT OBJECTIVES**

5.1 **Overall or development objectives:**

- To strengthen the journalism teaching profession in Somalia and allow democratic participation of communities in Puntland by enabling them to make informed decisions through access to information and knowledge.
- Ensure free flow of information, and free impartial broadcasting of news.
- Training of journalism students.

5.2 **Operational or project objectives:**

- To enhance and diversify radio programming in Puntland,
- Democracy building in Somalia,
- Produce a cadre of well trained journalists,
- Provide an alternative avenue for public information and development support programming in issues of concern to students and the community of the East African University.

5.3 **Results/outputs planned:**

- University Radio Station set up and on air.

- An equipped ICT Center established.
- Hands on training in radio broadcasting for 40 students per year.
- Expansion and improvement of distance education programmes.
- Media professionals in Puntland offered access to information.
- Participation and interaction in radio programs by communities around Puntland.

5.4

Target groups (beneficiaries)

- Certificate and Degree students at the East African University.
- Students in the Online Distance Learning Initiative (ODEL) using VSAT terminals to access internet.
- Media Society
- Puntland and Somali People in General.

6.

IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$ 42,500

Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$ 35,000

The approved amount was used for:

- Procurement and Installation of radio station equipment.
- Acoustic treatment of broadcasting studio.
- Procurement of ICT equipment for telecenter
- Training of the University Community on how the radio works.
- Hands-on training on radio broadcasting for school of journalism students.

7.

CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1

Agency contributions

N/A

7.2

Other

The University continues to meet honorarium for personnel manning the station, which has allowed the station to continue being a training ground for students and therefore contribute to the Curriculum.

The University of Indiana from US used to send lecturers through a grant from the UNDP but that came to an end three years ago.

7.3

Time schedule/project duration

Actual implementation: 2008

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives : The long term objective of the project was appropriate and addressed the needs at the time the project was conceptualized. Students in journalism needed hands on training, and this is the only studio available to them. Establishment of the center was important in particular to train journalists on impartial broadcasting of news, which is key in a country like Somali where the situation is still volatile.

Short-term objectives : The short term objective was consistent with the long term objective in that both ultimately aimed at producing a cadre of well trained journalists as well as providing an alternative avenue aimed at democracy building.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities : The East Africa University in Bosaso purchased and installed all the proposed equipment. The Radio Station *East Africa Radio* broadcasts on 89.8 FM and operates for a limited number of hours (12 noon-2 pm and 6pm-8pm). The other Radio Stations at Bosaso for example run their broadcasts for 16 to 18 hours a day. The Station would want to broadcast for more hours but the University at the moment lacks the resources for expansion.

The Station has a limited reach of Bosaso City. According to the Station Manager, the Station is specifically for educational purposes and therefore has a style and format that is different from other stations in Bossaso. The station has been useful to students and so far two batches of degree and certificate students have benefitted from using it. Content for the radio programs is determined after informal audience surveys with listeners. However, the station has assigned one female volunteer (from the University) to be responsible for gathering information needs and feedback from listeners. The information is then discussed with the rest of the staff and volunteers. This contributes to program ideas and ultimately to programs produced. Listeners also help in evaluating the programs by, for example, calling to say they liked certain programs more than others, and to ask for more information on certain topics.

The Station Manager participated in an HIV/AIDS workshop for community radios mounted by UNESCO in 2007. He has approached several agencies to support some programs on HIV/Aids but the agencies have declined some saying that the hours of broadcast by the Station are too few, while others have based their refusal on the reach, as they would prefer to also target audiences in Garowe and Galkayo.

With the exception of the station manager who is full time, all other members of this station are volunteers and work in other organizations. The Station Manager also doubles up as the Editor of the Weekly Newsletter *Ilays* (sunrise). The station attracts advertisers and the one main supporter is the Phone Company *Golis*.

Apart from educational matters, the station also creates awareness on pertinent issues that affect the community. According to the Station Manager, the station would like to discuss politics as a lot of issues have a political spin to them, but the license obligation is strict on content that the radio should focus on, “and yet a lot of the development and social issues (water and sanitation, access to roads and education, access to markets etc) discussed by the station have a political angle”. The license is

strictly for a training radio. In spite of this, the station has tried a lot to focus on issues of youth.

As a low power broadcasting station, it has a limited reach. This however is not a negative aspect in the sense that it permits community radios to focus on the exact issues of those they serve. However, the Station could also be utilized in the other satellite colleges of the East Africa University at Galkayo and Garowe if it had a wider reach. The station's mixer is basic and presents a challenge for example if it is wished to record an advert. There is a single recorder which is a challenge for example if there are several activities taking place simultaneously and the station wishes to produce news bulletins.

Within Puntland government, there is no department of journalism, which makes it difficult to have a coordinated strategy on government support to the station. One of the greatest tangible outputs is that students trained have joined other media organizations based in Bososo. The running of a radio station and training in radio production requires capital investment. For example, aside from initial installation costs, there are costs that are salary related, and running costs for the Station, as well as consistent training. *The East Africa Station* has struggled to continue running consistently. The Station has to put in a budget to the University for staff salaries and running costs to supplement what the station raises through adverts.

Due to the situation in Bossaso, it was not possible for the evaluator to speak to any listener due to security reasons and due to the fact that she was not allowed to move around easily. This is a requirement by UNDSS which she had to observe.

Project management: The project is proceeding fairly well despite the challenges, a demonstration of the commitment to the station by the University management. There is an executive committee which manages the project, and the project leader is the head of e-learning. The Station Manager is in charge of the radio and is on top of issues at the station. The President and other staff are informed of the happenings at the Station. Monthly meetings are conducted to discuss recent events at the Station and a report of what listeners have said is tabled. This is to keep the management in the loop. Monthly reports are also generated which tabulates any income generated, the expenses, the challenges, and requests from the Station to Management for that month. This is a professional practice that allows all involved to keep tabs on the station.

UNESCO services: The UNESCO Nairobi Communications Office provided technical advice on the purchase and installation of the CMC equipment, and monitored implementation through email/phone exchanges with the University.

Collaboration: The project involved UNESCO and the University of Indiana from the U.S. The University of Indiana had benefitted from a grant from UNDP and would send journalism lecturers on exchange programs to the East Africa University.

Project monitoring: UNESCO Regional Communications office in Nairobi monitored the project through regular consultations and communication.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results: The Station has been on air for three years now, and continues to be a training ground for journalism students, and also provide useful content that touches on people.

Cost-effectiveness: The need for a radio station was necessitated by the need for practice by journalism students who would be exposed to the theories of broadcasting but no practicals. Some of the students from the East Africa University who are beneficiaries are now heading or working in Media organizations such as VOA radio Somali Service and other networks or radio stations. Bossaso has six radio stations, namely:

- Daljir
- Hikma
- One Nation
- SBC
- Voice of Peace
- Horsed Media.

This is a demonstration on the usefulness and practicality of the East Africa Radio not just to the students but to the broadcast sector in Bossaso.

Development impact: Debates on issues which affect people directly do generate a lot of interest. For example, health programs are very popular as they continue to elicit requests for information and suggestions from listeners. The station has been running a health program on how the community needs to protect its skin from the very hot sun in Bossaso, and the implications of not protecting the skin. This is a topic that has generated so much interest and listeners call with specific requests for example on how exactly to protect their skins from the hot sun in their circumstances. Bossaso is very hot and has a desert-like climate. The evaluator learnt that it has only drizzled once in the last ten years. A lot of listeners have been sending requests for more information and would like to be educated more on this issue of skin protection.

Sustainability: The project still needs donor support as it is still difficult to mobilize resources locally and in a volatile environment or one that has to confront possibility of unforeseen conflict.

The station has tried to reach out to UN Agencies for them to use it for outreach programs but this has been met with challenges since these agencies prefer stations with a country-wide reach. However, the station still has its niche since it touches on issues that affect people, and people are able to interact easily with it.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management: The management needs to aggressively market the radio to organizations and companies in Bossaso for support in program production and adverts. Also, some social groups e.g. the youth could be encouraged to utilize the facilities for training at a nominal fee. It should also explore streaming of the content online for its satellite colleges in Garowe and Galkayo.

Recipient institution: The University needs a strategy on resource mobilization from different donors, organizations and partners. The University could forge partnerships along the lines of that with Indiana University, and have exchange visits with other Universities that are training in journalism and running campus radios for further exposure and exchange of ideas. The University could also further explore having a technology component under the education department which should be utilized to teach rural teachers at a minimal fee. This would make the radio useful to such teachers.

Member State: Advocate and request International organizations in particular those that are already in Puntland to support program production at the University. For example UNDP has various support programs in Somalia and could use the radio for its outreach programs. The government can impress upon UNDP and other agencies on the need to also utilize the East Africa Radio.

IPDC: IPDC should consider providing an exit grant to East African University to cater for maintenance, and a technician/manager, as well as some minimal running costs. With all the lessons learnt by the Station and the University Authorities, a grant would provide them some breathing space to plan on resource mobilization, and upscale the station in order to also avail it in the Satellite campuses in Garowe and Galkayo.

UNESCO: UNESCO and UNDP can write to/approach the Government of Puntland and request it to support the East Africa University Radio through programme production. The University acknowledges that the Government is cash constrained, but that it can be an advocate for the Station

UNESCO could also write to UNDP and request it to use the station for its outreach programs (agency to agency talk). UNESCO could still further negotiate with UNDP to support Lecturers' visits to the University, as was the case two years ago.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

type of project: There is need for a long term budget that clearly shows what comes after installation and reflections on what needs to be replaced after what duration (e.g. maintenance costs), and also to factor in the servicing of equipment. The planning should have scenarios and anticipate challenges and how they will be met if and when they arise.

There is need for the media in Bossaso to understand the people's needs and problems. The station will need to continue focusing on issues that touch people's hearts and provide information that is not being generated by other stations. Information provision should be East Africa Radio's niche. This calls for funding, servicing of equipment and training of staff and volunteers in order to continue serving the needs of the marginalized sectors of communities with information needs. The East Africa station understands the community and its needs, but is constrained in production of content. For example the University Station would like to broadcast for ten hours but this is not possible. Those working need remuneration and say a station manager would need US\$ 300 at a minimum.

Planning for the project was short term. A grant to support a project of this nature needs to run for at least three years within which time the project can seek more funds and work on a concrete sustainability plan. Salaries for a minimum staff must be factored into the initial budget.

Way of co-operation: UNESCO should consider a phase-out grant to give room for sustainability plans. Projects in volatile places like Somali should not be treated as those operating in peaceful environments. There needs to be a different criterion that looks at the duration of implementation such project operating in volatile environments, as well as the amounts in terms of the grant. Conflict sensitive areas have unique challenges that make it more difficult for local resource mobilization and yet a radio station is so much needed in particular because provision of objective information is key in conflict areas for peacebuilding.

Inputs: Running a radio station is also dependent on external factors in a place like Puntland for example availability of electricity, locality of news sources, transportation, security

etc. all which require resources that have to be sourced for. It is important to work on ways that can generate some income which could be used to cater for volunteers.

Instruments used: Review of project documents, key informant interviews with beneficiaries and personal assessment.

Evaluated by: Grace GITHAIGA²
Period of evaluation: September 20-October 20, 2011
Meeting on the ground: October 4-6-, 2011

Mission itinerary

Work schedule and method:

- Project document review
- Development of data collection tools
- Field, Interviews with key informants.
- Report writing

Sources:

- UNESCO Report on Information on IPDC Projects to be evaluated in Somalia.
- Proposal to IPDC on Strengthening East African University Journalism Training through Community Radio and ICTs.
- List of equipment/Inventory purchased using UNESCO Grant.
- Program Schedules.

List of interviewees

| Name | Function |
|------------------------|--|
| Mohammed Abdi Adan | President, East Africa University Tel: 252 2 797054 |
| Bashir Ali | UNDSS Bosaso Tel: 252 2 795470 |
| Rumen Atanasov | UNDSS Bossaso Email rumen.atanasov@undp.org |
| Jama Warsame Ahmed | Lecturer, Business School, East Africa University jamawarsame@gmail.com |
| Jamal Hassan Muse | Dean, Faculty of Education and Basic Sciences |
| Omar Issa | Station Manager, East African University Isse80@gmail.com Tel: 252 2 707034 |
| Abdi Rizak Mataan Jama | UNDSS Logistics Office Bossaso Tel: 252 2 755919 |

UNESCO

Abdikadir Abdirahman Salah, UNESCO Garowe Office

aasahal7@yahoo.com; Tel: 252 5 794074

Issa Mohammed Issa, UNESCO Garowe Office

imissa444@yahoo.com; Tel: 252 5 844085

Lydia Gachungi and Jocelyn Josiah, CI Nairobi Office.

² The Evaluator appreciates the tremendous support offered by all UNESCO staff from Nairobi both in CI and PEER, and the PEER offices in Hargeisa and Garowe for providing information on flights, airport pickups and accommodation. In particular he would like to acknowledge the efforts of Abdikadir Abirahman Salah from PEER Office at Garowe, who used the 'traditional communication means' and was able to trace contacts of some of those to be evaluated in Bosaso and Galkayo from his hospital bed in Hargeisa, and coordinated with UNDSS to rescue the evaluator from the immigrations at Bosaso. He also liaised with UNDSS for security and police escort as is required. Abdikadir had to undergo surgery before the evaluator left Hargeisa, and delegated some tasks to Issa Mohammed Issa.

| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
|--------------------------------|--|
| NAME | Mrs Grace N. Githaiga |
| Nationality | Kenyan |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PhD Candidate/Researcher for MEDIEA (Media, Empowerment and Democracy in East Africa); • Africa President, Board of Directors, World Association of Community Broadcasters (AMARC); • Executive Director, EcoNews Africa |

EVALUATION REPORT

A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

3. PROJECT TITLE

Puntland Community Broadcasters Training

2. BUDGET CODE

354 SOM 5091

3. CATEGORY :

Community Media

4. AGENCY

UNESCO

4.1 BENEFICIARY:

Puntland Community Broadcasters

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:

Radio Galkayo

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objective:

Community Broadcast media leads to social mobilization efforts in Somalia for peaceful co-existence, democracy and advocacy for social reintegration & wellbeing.

5.2 Operational or project objective:

Provide high quality radio training through the Training Center at Radio Galkayo supported by the Radio Netherlands Training Center (RNTC).

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

20 Somali Journalists to be trained on advanced reporting and broadcast skills provided by RNTC.

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries)

Somali Journalists in Puntland.

-
6. **IPDC ASSISTANCE**
Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$ 12,700
The approved amount was used for:
- Preparation of training Materials.
 - 10 days advanced Journalism and reporting training workshop for 20 Somali Community Journalists working in Puntland.
 - 3 days field Trip and production of programs.
 - Post training on Program Production.

7. **CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES**

7.1 **Agency contributions**

There was no other contribution from any other agency for this particular project. However, IREX and Oxfam Canada have at different times supported different programs for the stations.

7.2 **Other**

The curriculum benefited from input from PRESS NOW RNTC. The journalists who were trained produced programs based on what they had learned during the training, namely talk shows, and discussion programs on peacebuilding and reconciliation. They continue to do so as a way of their contribution to society and as a result of what they derived from the UNESCO supported training. These are in kind contributions.

7.4 **Time schedule/project duration**

- Initial project period: 2010- 2011
- Actual Implementation period: October 16-26, 2010.

B - **ASSESSMENT**

8. **ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING**

Long-term objective: The long term objective of the training project, which in broad terms is that community media leads to social mobilization efforts, was and continues to be appropriate. The training covered topical issues that are relevant to Galkayo in that they continue to affect the community. The topics can be categorized under two broad themes of good governance and peacebuilding.

The training brought together 20 journalists (6 females and 14 males) drawn from different radio stations in Puntland. Puntland is still in dire need of reconciliation and peacebuilding programs since the community is divided along different clans. Galkayo is still volatile and in need of peacebuilding.

Some beneficiaries of the UNESCO supported training were interviewed for this evaluation, and it can be deduced that the training has influenced the production of programs to be more professional and more sensitive to the needs to the people on the ground and those operating in a conflict sensitive area. The programs produced endeavor to focus on all sides (objectivity) of a conflict and are sensitive not to hype listeners' feelings towards anger or incitement.

Short-term objective: The short term objectives were achieved as a result of the proposed training having been successfully conducted. The training was conducted in conjunction with Radio Netherlands Training Centre (RNTC) - "Press Now" and a local trainer who brought in the perspective of the Puntland Environment. The training was described as very useful by some of the trainees.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities:

The ten day training course was conducted and covered such topics as Conflict sensitive reporting, Journalism Ethics, Journalism safety, Radio Production techniques, audio editing, news writing and reading roles, advanced interviewing techniques, script writing, and management of live interviews and debates.

The training had a practical component where trainees went to the field for three days. This was aimed at testing the skills of the trainees on what they had learnt.

Interviews with three community journalists who had participated in the training session indicated that the topics of conflict sensitive reporting was most useful and most preferred, in that trainees learnt how to write a balanced story, as well as how to manage live debates on radio in such a way that they present all dimensions of a conflict and in a way that does not escalate conflicts.

The second preferred topic by the trainees was audio editing and the art of interviewing. The trainees felt that they are now more confident in handling programs as a result of the skills gained out of the training. They also pointed out that they have already put to use the journalism safety training since in conflict areas like that in which they operate, their safety is not assured as they go about their work.

The evaluation would have been more beneficial if there were more trainees to be interviewed and in particular a female representative, but this was not possible due to circumstances beyond anyone's control. On day two of the evaluator's stay at Galkayo, there was a security threat to the President of Puntland to the effect that there was a likelihood of a bombing by some unknown assailants who would camouflage in UN vehicles. The President of Puntland therefore requested the UN to minimize movements. The UNDSS advised the evaluator against going out into the field and in fact refused that the evaluator should move around based on the security advice.

The evaluator then made a request that UNDSS allow some of the beneficiaries of the UNESCO training come to the UNHCR venue for a meeting. This was allowed but then when the trainees came, some were armed and it is against the UN rules to allow armed people into their premises. However, sufficient information was still gathered from those interviewed which informed this report.

Project management: The management of the project is satisfactory. The Acting Radio Galkayo Manager Abdulahi Hirsi Mohammed is on top of this project. He had all the records that were requested for by the evaluator, for example a list of those trained, the budget and the curriculum. Proper record keeping has been observed by Galkayo.

Galkayo station through the acting station manager is also in touch with some of the training beneficiaries and when the evaluator picked three from the list of those trained randomly, and requested to randomly talk to them, the Station Manager was able to raise them for the purposes of this evaluation.

UNESCO services: The UNESCO Regional Communications office in Nairobi closely followed on the implementation of this project through exchange of emails and telephone communication with the Director Said Abdirahman Jama.

Collaboration: The development of the curriculum and the actual training conducted benefitted from input from PRESS Now Radio Netherlands Training Center (RNTC).

Project monitoring: UNESCO Regional Communications office monitored the project. And since this was a one off grant for the training, the project did not require a midterm evaluation.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results:

A ten day training workshop was conducted that covered various topics that ranged from conflict sensitive reporting, audio editing, to journalism ethics.

- Preparation of training materials was done in collaboration with PRESS Now Radio Netherlands Training Center (RNTC) and a local trainer.
- A three day field visit was undertaken as part a practical component of the training workshop.

Cost-effectiveness: The project was cost effective given the fact that the budget provided by IPDC was utilized for all planned components of the training. The value of the project is evident based on interviews with beneficiaries who now feel more confident in their work. For the majority of the trainees, this was the very first professional training they were getting and all those interviewed requested UNESCO to consider providing them with a second and more advanced training so that they can increase their knowledge. To quote one of the trainees, Awil Mohammed Abdi from Raxaneeb Media (literally translated from Somali language Rasaneeb means a shrub that does not allow many things to pass through it), he used to feel like a ‘child’ before the training. He now feels ‘like a child who can run’ after being equipped with the skills. Evaluating this project, and as someone who has a background in training on various topics in journalism, I did pose some questions to the journalists, and their responses demonstrated that they actually knew what they were talking about and had benefitted from the training.

Development impact: The three journalists who were interviewed pointed out that the training had made them improve their program production skills, their art of interviewing which has to take into account the fact that Puntland is a conflict sensitive area, how they take care of their safety in particular when in the field, and basically how to conduct live debates on radio to ensure neutrality and that all sides of the conflict are considered. They focus a lot on issues of conflict and peacebuilding, which is understandable in an environment where the evaluator on the three nights she spent at Galkayo, heard gunshots every night. The trained journalists indicated that the training had made them more ethical, a fact they were not aware of before the training.

Sustainability: The need for more training is almost always desirable and required on a continuous basis. This training was at beginner’s level. There are now thoughts around developing an advanced module based on the needs on the ground, and designing the training to respond to these needs. Training needs still exist as those 20 journalists trained cannot serve all journalists needs. As such, there is still a need for basic training for those who did not benefit, and those trained at the beginner’s level have been asking for more advanced training. The Manager has managed to stay in touch with some trainees and to keep tabs on how they are performing after the training. He thinks the training was useful and practical.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management: There is a need to engage in further resource mobilization. Radio Galkayo has developed a training center that seems to be the only one in Puntland which has offered this practical training. There is definitely a need for more training to professionalize journalists in this conflict sensitive area. The center requires not just resources financial and material, but also equipment to allow for quality program production.

Since the center is already establishing itself as a training center, and has a curriculum on the training conducted as a result of the grant from UNESCO, it should review this periodically with a view to updating it to incorporate emerging needs. However, it needs to follow up the first training with an advanced module. This calls for some

thinking around developing a training manual. Radio Galkayo could engage other partners and still request UNESCO to support the development of such a manual.

Recipient institution: Since Radio Galkayo has taken on this task of conducting this training in order to professionalize the community radios in Puntland, it must not allow the training to be a one-off event. It must make sure that the training Center is sustainable and able to respond to perceived needs in the field. It must continue to improve professionalism in radio programs. More programs on good governance and peacebuilding must continue to be produced in this fragile land. A lot of Somali people are consumers of radio programs. It is therefore important to have this sustained training and to entrench professionalism in radio programs through sustainable mobilization of resources, and forging of strategic partnerships.

Member State: The government of Puntland is still experiencing challenges of conflict and insecurity. However, it has allowed Radio Galkayo to continue operations without interference. Since the journalists of various community stations have been trained, the government should consider forging a working partnership with them in programming on governance and peacebuilding issues.

IPDC: IPDC should consider another grant to Radio Galkayo, to support a follow up to the first training, which should be more advanced for the same journalists. This training should include a component on training of trainers so that this crop of 20 can now be tasked to start training others, and therefore create a multiplier effect.

UNESCO: UNESCO should continue supporting Radio Galkayo in technical assistance, funding, training and strengthening the training center. It was also suggested that in the larger Somaliland, some organizations like BBC had offered training to journalists in Mogadishu. However, UNESCO should support a training needs assessment and should take lead in producing a training manual based on local needs of Somali journalists. The materials in possession by Radio Galkayo are not sufficient. The Station experiences challenges like most community radio stations and therefore requires training resources.

Since UNESCO Regional Communications office is not on site, there is a need, particularly in humanitarian areas, to collaborate and work with the PEER office since they are sister institutions. UNESCO PEER could monitor the project(s) in the field on behalf of the Communications Office, and could organize field support when there is a need to conduct the end of year evaluation. UNESCO PEER has a presence in Garowe but could easily follow up at Galkayo. The evaluator had challenges and other UN agencies in the field would remind her that UNESCO is not field-based, and should have for example requested officially any of the agencies to support security requirement arrangements (hiring of armored vehicle and police escort), and even little things like just buying drinking water. However, UNDSS was very helpful in providing this support.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project: This training project continues to evolve. For example after the completion of the training, a critical security need for journalists has prompted the desire to hold a security and safety workshop for journalists, as well as journalistic code and ethics to be observed in a fragile/volatile state.

Also, trainees have different levels of education (from basic to advanced). The challenge is how to fit all these in the same training. A lesson learnt therefore is the need to have minimum criteria for participation in such trainings.

Way of co-operation: UNESCO's support has been appreciated and has played a tremendous role in offering basic training to journalists living in a fragile state. However much more is needed as the demand to train journalists is high. Further support would go along way in strengthening the professionalization of these journalists. Collaboration could be sought with UNICEF since as the evaluator gathered, UNICEF would like the Journalists to also understand what the UN does in conflict areas, and in particular UNICEF, and report in a positive and objective manner.

Inputs: In an environment like Puntland, and where only Radio Galkayo has offered this sort of training to local journalists, there is great demand from even members of Radio Galkayo itself who did not benefit, as well as other journalists in Galkayo who have not been trained. There are constant challenges in a conflict environment for example security and this has an impact on journalists. For the three nights that the evaluator was at Galkayo, she heard gunshots every night, which means that the situation is still precarious, and therefore calls for a professional media that can be key in spearheading peacebuilding efforts.

Instruments used: Review of project documents, key informant interviews with beneficiaries and personal assessment.

Mission itinerary

Work schedule and method:

- Project document review
- Development of data collection tools
- Field, Interviews with key informants.
- Report writing

Sources:

- UNESCO Report on Information on IPDC Projects to be evaluated in Somalia.
- Puntland Community Broadcasters Training Proposal to IPDC
- Puntland Community Broadcasters Training Participants List
- Puntland Community Broadcasters Training Program Curriculum
- Budget expenditure for Training Workshop for Journalists.

List of Interviewees

| Name | Function |
|-------------------------|--|
| Patrick | UNDSS Galkayo |
| Liman Husein Dinle, | Radio Galkayo journalist, aftaaboo@hotmail.com Tel: 707698 |
| Abdikadir Mohamed Jamar | Journalist Horseed Media, cumaryare_147@hotmail.com , 090770632 |
| Awil Mohamed Abdi | Journalist Raxanreeb Media, cawil_maxamuud@gmail.com , 252-90-768842 |
| Abdullahi Hersi Iddi | Manager Radio Galkayo, cadde111@hotmail.com , 252-90-759191 |
| Burhan Ahmed Dahir | Media Consultant and Trainer, Media Association of Puntland (MAP) and NUSOJ, burhaandaahir@gmail.com , 252-90-751975 |
| Jeremy Shutterman | UNICEF, Galkayo |

UNESCO

Abdikadir Abdirahman Salah, UNESCO Garowe Office, aasahal7@yahoo.com, 252 5 794074

Issa Mohammed Issa, UNESCO Garowe Office, imissa444@yahoo.com, 252 5 844085

Lydia Gachungi and Jocelyn Josiah, CI Nairobi.

| | |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
| NAME | Mr K. P. Madhu |
| Nationality | Indian |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Programme Manager, Asia-Pacific Institute for Broadcasting Development • Joint Director Consortium for Educational Communication, NSC Campus, New Delhi • Producer, Times Television, Times of India group |

INTRODUCTION

Bangladesh

Bangladesh is a young country, having separated from Pakistan both linguistically and geographically through the nationalist struggle of 1971. With a current population of 164.4 million, Bangladesh is one of the world's most densely populated countries.

Bangladesh is on the UN list of least developed countries (1975 included) but has shown significant improvements in its indicators of health and education in recent years, prompting the United Nations to laud its impressive progress in human development. The country's gradual economic progress is also evident: foreign grants and loans for the country's annual development budget have decreased from 85% (in 1988) to 2% (in 2010). Bangladesh has averaged an annual growth rate of 5% since 1990; the World Bank has cited poor governance and weak public institutions as Bangladesh's chief obstacles to higher rates of growth.

The media plays an important role in good governance and could contribute to strengthening public institutions. It is therefore important to strengthen media's role in Bangladesh. The capacity building of media professionals has been among IPDC's focus areas. This report examines six IPDC projects in Bangladesh, carried out between 2008 and 2011. It is useful to consider these projects in the context of the country's media landscape.

The Media Landscape of Bangladesh

Although Bangladesh's Constitution guarantees press freedom and freedom of expression in practice, the media cannot fully exercise freedom of expression. Some media outlets in Bangladesh are known to have been harassed by the government, and criminal penalties could be imposed for libel, defamation, sedition, and reporting on issues of national security. The Bangladeshi media is ranked 126th out of 178 countries on the Press Freedom Index (Reporters Without Borders, 2010).

At present, there are about thirty laws, rules and regulations that pertain to the press and media. A comprehensive media law was deemed necessary for nearly a decade. But the draft that was prepared more than seven years ago has not yet gone through the legislative processes.

Newspapers: Newspapers in Bangladesh are privately owned, and tend to be diverse in the positions and opinions they represent. Most newspapers are in Bengali. English publications appeal principally to an elite, educated urban readership. The government exercises some influence and control over newspapers through the placement of official advertising, and despite the constitutional guarantee of press freedom, print journalists are prone to harassment and threats from the police and political activists.

Television: Until recently, the principal broadcasters were the state-owned Bangladesh Television (BTV) and Radio Bangladesh, where there is little coverage of political opposition, except in the run-up to general elections when a caretaker government takes control.

BTV is the sole terrestrial television channel. But there are now 17 satellite TV channels in Bangladesh. These channels are distributed through cable along with popular international channels. The Bengali channels from India and international news channels are also easily accessed, particularly by the urban public. The impact of Bollywood on children of cabled homes can be gauged in terms of their easy comprehension of Hindi.

The non-extension of the license to broadcast has closed down some TV channels, and this is acting as a deterrent for other TV channels to make use of the freedom guaranteed by the Constitution.

Radio: The state-run broadcaster, Bangladesh Betar, covers almost the entire country and has a network of stations in divisional headquarters. Private FM stations are also coming up in different parts of Bangladesh. The spectrum available in the FM range has not yet been optimally utilized; there is much potential for growth in this sector.

In 2008, Bangladesh's Ministry of Information adopted the Community Radio Installation, Broadcast and Operation Policy. Under the policy, the installation and operation of **fourteen community radio stations** (CRS) were approved for the first time in the country. Two CRS have already become operational.

Internet: Despite the presence of online Internet service in Bangladesh, its scope is largely underutilized. The reasons include high service charges, lack of awareness, poor telecommunication systems, government policy, low buying power of potential clients, and lack of institutional support.

Media Capacity Building

All media – print, radio, television and the Internet – have witnessed rapid growth in the past one and a half decades. The educational sector has been slow to realize the need for manpower in the fast growing media industries. Presently, about a dozen universities offer media, communications and journalism courses of widely varying quality and standards. But the increase in mass communication and journalism courses has been unable to meet industry demands. Those who graduate from these courses are more attracted to advertising and public relations than to journalism, due to the different salary structures of these occupations. Thus most professionals working in the media today have not been formally educated or trained in journalism or the media.

The Bangladesh Press Council, Press Institute, and National Institute of Mass Communication do conduct some capacity building exercises. But the depth and extent of the work undertaken, and the duration of the exercises vary since they depend on the vision of the people in these organizations' top posts. Unfortunately, sometimes political factors do not permit the right or the best people to occupy these top positions.

The journalists' unions and associations do not undertake any capacity building programmes. But there are about a dozen NGOs involved in capacity building activities. Some, like **Bangladesh Centre for Development of Journalism and Communication** and **News Network**, described in more detail later have worked extensively in this area. The NGOs are supported in their capacity building efforts by different kinds of donor/bilateral/funding agencies. Besides considering Bangladesh's political, economic and cultural environment, the particular capabilities of different actors in the sphere of media capacity building also needed to be considered when assessing and evaluating the six capacity building exercises facilitated by IPDC.

IPDC projects in Bangladesh

IPDC has been involved with the capacity building of media professionals in Bangladesh for a long time. Every year, a few countries are identified by IPDC for the purpose of an external evaluation. In this report, we will examine only six projects implemented in Bangladesh, identified by the fifty-fifth meeting of the IPDC Bureau for external evaluation.

| | Project Title and Budget Code | Project Duration | | USD |
|----|--|------------------|-------------|-------|
| | | | | |
| 1. | Capacity Building for Young Journalists Budget Code: 354 BGD 5071 | Nov 2008 | Oct 2009 | 25000 |
| 2. | Capacity Building for Investigative Journalism Budget Code: 354 BGD 5072 | Nov 2008 | Nov 2009 | 15000 |
| 3. | Capacity Building of Community Radio Personnel Budget Code: 354 BGD 5081 | Dec 2009 | Nov 2010 | 30000 |
| 4. | Capacity Building of Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production Budget Code: 354 BGD 5082 | Jan 2010 | Oct 2010 | 32000 |
| 5. | Capacity Building of Women on Radio Journalism and Programme Production Budget Code: 354 BGD 5091 | Sept 2010 | Nov 2011 | 21000 |
| 6. | Capacity Building for Journalists of Three Hill Districts, Budget Code: 354 BGD 5092 | Aug 2010 | Mar 2011 | 25000 |

All the projects, except Number 3 above, had been completed at the time of evaluation.

As can be seen from the list above, three of the projects were related primarily to community radio. The other three focused on print media with some participation from TV journalists. The six projects were implemented by four partner NGO organisations and were funded through UNESCO New Delhi Cluster Office.

| Project title | Implementing partner |
|---|--|
| Capacity Building for Young Journalists | News Network |
| Capacity Building for Investigative Journalism | Bangladesh Centre for Development Journalism and Communication (BCDJC) |
| Capacity Building of Community Radio Personnel | Bangladesh NGO Network for Radio and Communication (BNNRC) |
| Capacity Building of Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production | Center for Development of Communication (CCD) |
| Capacity Building of Women on Radio Journalism and Programme Production | Center for Development of Communication (CCD) |
| Capacity Building for Journalists of Three Hill Districts | News Network |

The partners

News Network was responsible for 2 projects focusing on capacity building of journalists. Its major activity is a news feature service. Shahiduzzaman started News Network in 1994, focusing on human rights, democracy, education, justice and empowerment of women. It has a focus on training young female graduates in Journalism. It has a large list of alumni and had adequate experience to take up training of journalists in a sample of 3 divisional and 3 district headquarters to create a model for training journalists in Bangladesh.

Bangladesh Centre for Development Journalism and Communication: BCDJC is the oldest of the NGOs with media capacity building as its primary mandate. The organisation was started by Naimul Islam Khan in the early 1990s. As the youngest editor of a newspaper in Bangladesh, and having turned around the prospects of ailing newspapers and establishing new newspapers and magazines, he understood the need for

trained professionals in the media sector. As a senior journalist and editor and owner of a print media house, he does not involve himself in the day-to-day affairs of BCDJC. The responsibility of implementing projects rests with the Joint Director of BCDJC. For some projects, the organisation raises money internally and does not depend on external donors alone. The organisation recognises the need to operate projects in various areas, and has plans to extend its work to the electronic media as well. BCDJC has extensive experience in the capacity building of print media professionals, especially in the area of investigative methods and techniques.

Centre for Development of Communication: CCD is an offshoot of BCDJC. Ghulam Mourtouza the Director of CCD, earlier worked for BCDJC. Initially he wanted to set up a chapter of BCDJC in the town of Rajshahi (in north-western Bangladesh), but when this idea was found to be unacceptable, he started CCD in Rajshahi. Besides understanding the value of having a media NGO at a divisional headquarters, he took the initiative to start a community radio station in Rajshahi. The two IPDC projects implemented by CCD became the foundation for the human resource base of *Radio Padma*, Rajshahi's first community radio.

The evaluation of the six projects was taken up as a single exercise, with a unified itinerary and methodology since all of them deal with capacity building and media development in Bangladesh. In order to avoid repeating the unified methodology and itinerary for each of the six projects evaluated here, a separate section called 'Mission Itinerary and Methodology for the Six Projects' (Section 8, p.73) has been included. In all other respects the evaluation of the individual projects adheres to the predesigned format supplied to this consultant.

The report follows the same order provided by UNESCO - which is based on the temporal order of these projects. However, it might be interesting for the reader to follow a partner oriented listing or a listing based on the type of media.

EVALUATION REPORT

A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE

BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING FOR YOUNG JOURNALISTS

2. PROJECT NUMBER

BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5071

3. CATEGORY: Print and electronic media

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARY: Young journalists in three divisional headquarters of Bangladesh and, indirectly, their employers, and ultimately their readers

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: News Network, Road 5, House 9,
Dhanmondi, Dhaka 1205

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

To motivate journalists, with a sense of responsibility to pursue objective and sensible journalism.
To promote freedom of expression, to enhance the communication skills of journalists.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

To build the capacity of 75 journalists preferably under 35 years
To organise a month-long fellowship programme in three divisional headquarters, outside of Dhaka.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

75 young journalists trained and motivated through one-month long fellowship programmes in three impoverished divisional headquarters - Rajshahi city (North), Sylhet City (north-east), Barisal City (South)

Development of a model programme for the training of young journalists across the country.

Production of a manual for journalists based on the output of this programme and the feedback of journalists

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries): Young journalists working in print and electronic media

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: **USD 38 000**

Assistance approved by IPDC: USD 25 000

The approved amount was used for:

Honoraria for fellows; Daily allowance for fellows and volunteers; Transportation; Venue; Training materials; Resource persons' honoraria; Local coordinators' honoraria;

Telephone, postage

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1 *Agency contributions*

Management costs, office supplies, coordinators' honoraria, training materials, communication costs, audit fee, bank charges

7.2 Time schedule/project duration: 11 months

Preparatory time – one month

Selection of fellows and resource persons – 2 months

Skill development training and motivation – one month each for each location

B - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives: In a developing country like Bangladesh, it is important that the journalists have a sense of responsibility towards their profession, even in the face of temptations like 'envelope journalism' and power and gains of partisan politics. Promoting freedom of expression and improving the reporting and communication skills of journalists are also important, especially in a young democracy. Laudable long term objectives.

Short-term objectives: The long term objectives cannot be achieved through short term courses of one- or even two-week duration. The one-month long fellowship programme, however, allows the time needed for slow changes in attitudes. It is also necessary to build the basic skills of journalists.

The repetition of the same programme in three different cities helped to create a model that is well-tested.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities: News Network has a network of well-wishers and alumni in different parts of Bangladesh and deserves the term network. The selection of the fellows in different divisional headquarters was therefore not a difficult proposition. The co-ordinators appointed in the three divisional headquarters had adequate background in journalism and were well respected members of the local journalists' community. The array of resource people who have very high credibility and long experience and accomplishments in their fields, used for the fellowship programmes, is impressive. The one month programme was closely monitored by the News Network Management team to assure the respect for time and a disciplined approach to capacity building. The participants/fellows interviewed were very satisfied with the programme.

Project management: The process of selection of the fellows, arrangement of venues, trainers and resource people, monitoring of the programme in three cities, evaluation and reporting were quite professional.

UNESCO services: UNESCO has been actively involved in the monitoring and coordinating the implementation of the project in addition to the processing of the project proposal establishment of a contract and disbursement of funds from the IPDC.

Collaboration: There were no organisational collaborations. But collaborations between individuals – senior journalists, experts and local coordinators – were important in the successful completion of the project.

Project monitoring: Project monitoring was done well by News Network and UNESCO to assure that the tasks were done in time and efficiently.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results : 75 young journalists based in three different divisional headquarters of Bangladesh, and working for different media outlets have been trained to carry out their profession more effectively. The manual that has been prepared is short and concise. The manual forms the basis and provides a minimum necessary input into the training provided. The fact that journalists from other cities in Bangladesh are demanding similar workshops provides the testimony needed, to show that the objectives have been achieved and that the project was tuned to the needs of media professionals in Bangladesh.

Cost-effectiveness: The cost of a one-month training of a journalist works out to be less than 335 US dollars. Finances have been managed well.

Development impact: The project has fulfilled the promise of creating a model for such capacity building exercises. The systems are in place to carry out similar exercises in other division headquarters and even at district level. It is not easy to measure the changes or improvements in skills or effectiveness of the work done by the fellows. However, it is clear that the capacity building exercise has helped the young journalists and many of them have moved on to better pay packets and to more established media houses.

Sustainability: There are more divisions where this exercise needs to be carried out. As pointed out later, in the evaluation report on the IPDC project of capacity building of journalists in the hill districts of the Chittagong tracts, carried out by the same implementing agency, the training has been established to be relevant and important for district level journalists also. However, to cover 60 districts the funds required would be about 20 times more than the present one. This would not be easy for the IPDC, though News Network is capable of carrying out the task. To make it sustainable, funds for the effort have to be raised from within the country – at least to some extent.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management: The network of alumni created by consistent efforts in capacity building of various target groups is impressive. Some amount of computerisation of the database of the fellows will help to keep in touch with the earlier fellows, through a list-serve that continues to feed the training needs of the journalists in far-away districts and divisional headquarters. Only this can help News Network to leverage on work that has already been done.

Recipient institution: The two IPDC projects on capacity building of journalists through one month fellowships could be taken as the platform of achievements to bid for a transformation of the media in Bangladesh through a series much wider than the earlier six locations (including the locations for the project on capacity building of the journalists in Chittagong hill tracts). The amount needed could be raised if the UNESCO supports the pitch. Besides, the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank would support

the project if investigative journalism is brought to the fore. As an Islamic country, perhaps the Kuwait Fund, the Islamic Broadcasting Union etc. could also be approached. It is worth a try to get the model accepted by other donor agencies, since the UNESCO alone may not be in a position to be the sole supporter of the exercise.

Member State: Strengthening the capacity of journalists is equivalent to strengthening democracy, to create a citizenry that act on informed choices. The public sector organisations set up to undertake the task are not enough to address the needs created by the expansion of media in Bangladesh during the last one and half decades. Grants to established NGOs with prior experience and expertise to undertake the task may help to stabilise the volatile media in a time bound manner.

IPDC: News Network has been a reliable partner and has established the need for capacity building of journalists at divisional and district levels. The model that has been developed seems to be effective. However, the contents did not include the special skills required for reporting in radio and Television. The project could therefore be repeated in other divisions and district headquarters, including the skills needed for electronic media in the curriculum. This will help to create a model that is even more comprehensive. Since many divisional and district level journalists work for both print and television, this would find a lot of takers.

12. **LESSONS LEARNT**

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project: This type of project is quite useful to the country where there are a large number of young journalists who have received no formal training in journalism. The fact that it is a month-long training offered at divisional headquarters rather than at the capital city makes it easy for local journalists to participate. The fact that media channels are willing to send their employees for such long training is a testimony to the need for such projects in the country. The resistance of the media houses to training of journalists stem mainly from the loss of contributions from the trainees during the training period. The timing of the daily schedule for the capacity building exercise (9 am to 2 pm) ensures that the journalists are productive even during the month of fellowship.

Way of co-operation: News Network has a good relationship with the media channels in the country. So there is co-operation between the NGO and the media. However, there is not much co-operation between the Government and the NGO, as evidenced by the lack of participation of Govt. owned media channels. Not much co-operation seems to have been extended by the UNESCO office in Bangladesh, since the opening and ceremonies in all three locations had no participation from this office.

Inputs: The inputs are very carefully selected resource people, respected in media circles capable of covering specialised areas in journalism, a manual, the venues and facilities. Venues like press clubs are slowly being built up in divisional headquarters and would prove to be very useful in such ventures.

Instruments used: The announcements of the fellowship programme in different places, the registration forms, the manual, the evaluation form, etc. have to be in place to make such a project successful.

Sources:

Project proposal
Activity Financing contract
Revised Budget and workplan
English Summary of Training Manual
Mid term report
Sample evaluation report
Project completion report

List of Interviewees

| Name | Function, Organization |
|--------------------|---------------------------------|
| Shaiduzzaman | Editor, News Network |
| Md.Rezaul Karim | Programme officer, News Network |
| Hossain Shahariar | Trainer, Ecologist& Journalist |
| Julhas Alam | Trainer, Correspondent, AP |
| Ahmed Maruf | Fellow, Reporter Sylhet Songlap |
| Md Amran Ahmed | Fellow, Reporter Kazir Bazar |
| Noor Ahmed | Fellow, Reporter, Sylheter Dak |
| Aftab Mustafa Khan | Fellow, Reporter, The Jalalabad |
| Shiblee Noman | Coordinator, Rajshahi workshop |

UNESCO

Iskra Panevska, UNESCO, Delhi
Ajita Vijayan, UNESCO, Delhi
Nargis Nyma, UNESCO, Bangladesh
Shamim Mohammed – UNESCO, Bangladesh, now on leave, interactions through e-mail

EVALUATION REPORT

A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE

BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING FOR INVESTIGATIVE JOURNALISM

2. PROJECT NUMBER

BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5072

3. CATEGORY: Print and broadcast

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARY: Journalists, editors and reporters of newspaper and TV channels

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: Bangladesh Centre for Development Journalism and Communication (BCDJC)

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

To build the capacity of the media in Bangladesh to investigate and report on corruption, irregularities, anomalies, discrimination, inequalities and nepotism and thus to strengthen the democracy in the country.
To improve the poverty alleviation programmes and justice delivery by reducing corruption.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

To assess the state of investigative reporting in Bangladesh through content analysis research and prepare the tools of training;
To train 60 working journalists, including at least 15 women, in investigative journalism in 12 months;
To sensitize 20-25 gatekeepers (editors, news editors, chief reporters) through a sensitization symposium

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- A report on the state of investigative reporting in Bangladesh
- Training course and curriculum developed for use by trainers 60 Journalists – at least 15 women – acquired new skills on investigative journalism.
- Sensitization of about 25 media gatekeepers.
- Indirect strengthening of news organizations.
- Improvement in number and quality of investigative reporting
- Readers/audience get the benefit of investigative reporting

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries)

Working journalists from both print and broadcast media from within and outside Dhaka.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: USD 20 000

Assistance approved by IPDC: USD 15 000

The approved amount was used for: Research (Newspaper & Magazine content analysis); Training Modules and materials; 4 Training programmes (2 in Dhaka and 1 each in Khulna and Bogra); Sensitization colloquium for Gatekeepers of Newspapers; Honoraria for resource persons

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1.1 *Agency contributions:* Management costs

7.2 Other: None

7.3 Time schedule/project duration: 12 months

3 Nov. 2008 workplan, budget, CV of local coordinator

1 Dec. status report on preparations, training template, resumes of trainers and resource persons, images, list of participants with biodata.

27 Feb 2009 research report, first batch training, drafts of training template, manual on investigative reporting,

30 November 2009 – final evaluation report: 2nd and 3rd batch training, symposium, Manual in English

B - ASSESSMENT

ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives: Creating a cadre of media professionals who are capable of investigating and reporting in-depth stories and motivating them to play their roles as watchdogs for a society, in an ethical and responsible manner, is indeed an important objective in the context of Bangladesh where the perceived level of corruption is very high.

Short-term objectives: To promote investigative reporting, it is important to initially assess the status of investigative reporting to understand the baseline from which it has to be upgraded. Content analysis and understanding of the trends are useful to prepare the appropriate tools for training as well as to convince editors and media gatekeepers about the need for investigative reporting in the country.

Training of 60 working journalists, and to include at least 15 women amongst them, in a country with a deep gender divide, are logical and well considered steps. To state the timeframe to do this within the objective itself, shows that the intention is quite focused. It is evident that no amount of training of journalists will help to improve the quality and quantity of investigative journalism unless the management of media houses are cooperative. The media gatekeepers can become a block in the efforts, since investigative journalism calls for greater allocation of resources than using press releases as sources of news. A sensitization symposium for the gatekeepers is a useful tool to overcome the resistance and to create a peer group pressure to allow the effort, time and money needed to create well investigated reports. In short, the immediate objectives are well-rounded and desirable in the context of Bangladesh media.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities:

The research activity was done through a consultant who is university based. The data collection was done by mass communication students. This will indeed help to build the capacity of the students to do such research in future and also to create the right attitude towards media. Thus there is an indirect impact on future journalists from the project. The report that has thus been generated, however, does not have academic rigour and the style of presentation shows no respect for journalistic principles of clarity, brevity and high readability. Dhaka city has a larger number of media outlets and media professionals than can be found in divisional headquarters of the country. So perhaps locating two workshops in Dhaka is justified. However, the rationale of the choice of other towns to hold the workshops, was based more on convenience and ease. This is of course justifiable since the success of the workshops is dependent on the local conditions.

The number of journalists trained was higher than the projected number. Instead of 60 as mentioned in the proposal and the contract, the project trained 77 journalists. However, the attempt to get at least 15 women journalists could not succeed since the number of women journalists who applied for the training was quite low. Domestic and other responsibilities were identified as the reason for low participation of women in the capacity building exercise. A woman journalist interviewed assessed the value of the training to be quite high in her case. The workshops were not evaluated in a formal manner. Hence the opportunity for continuous improvement in subsequent workshops and to fine tune the strategies, methods and training tools, was missed.

The symposium as an advocacy tool is of limited value when the participants are already converts. There was no tangible outcome – for example, a statement signed by at least some of the well-recognised editors/journalists, on their support for investigative reporting.

Project management: The research report on the status of investigative journalism in Bangladesh seems not to have been reviewed properly. For example, the report mentions studies of similar nature carried out earlier. Yet there is no attempt to make a comparison. Lack of proper referencing makes it academically less useful. The language and style of presentation of the report seems have been executed in a hurry. Managerial processes like supervision, monitoring, review and revision seem to have been ineffective.

The BCDJC has organised workshops on investigative journalism earlier and is quite capable of executing the project again. The background materials, the resource people, a network of co-ordinators in different districts, etc. are all in place. Delegation and responsibility and deadline setting for the different tasks seem to have been well done. However, when four training workshops are organised, it is a good practice to use formal feedback from the trainees to improve the content, style, techniques etc. of the subsequent workshops. This essential feedback loop into quality management has not been used in this project.

It is not that the tool to do this in the form of an evaluation form was not available, but that it was not used. So the data to assess the effectiveness was not easily available in the form of documentation.

UNESCO services: The lack of involvement of the UNESCO in the project is apparent. There has been no feedback to the research report that carries the UNESCO logo. UNESCO officials were not involved even when two workshops and a symposium were conducted in Dhaka city itself.

Collaboration: The human resources required for conducting the capacity building events came from universities, NGO, and media outlets. These could be seen as collaborations. However, these were done on a personal basis and not in terms of institutional linkages.

Project monitoring: The project was completed within the projected time and budget limits.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results : The number of journalists trained is more than the projected outputs. Against the project number of 60 journalists, the project involved 77 journalists. Thus it is clear that there was indeed a demand for the capacity building exercise.

The interviews with a sample of trainees revealed that the workshops were effective in creating an understanding of the techniques and tools of investigative journalism in particular and journalism in general. In Bangladesh, most of the journalists at district

levels do not get training opportunities. Most journalists are self-taught and have other occupations. The workshops were thus very effective in changing their perceptions, attitudes and skills. After the workshops there were instances of the use of these skills, especially by the journalists in district headquarters. From interviews and feedback from the participants, it is interesting to note that the workshops conducted in the capital city itself had much less impact than the workshops in district headquarters. Part of the reason could be that the media outlets in Dhaka are more under scrutiny and indirect controls than the media outlets in far-away districts.

Cost-effectiveness: Against an expense of USD 15000, a baseline study of investigative journalism in Bangladesh Media was done, a set of modules on Investigative Journalism was prepared, the capacity of the resource people to deal with this significant area in journalism improved, 77 journalists were exposed to the what why and how of Investigative journalism over a course of 5 days, a significant number of senior professionals were forced to pay attention to the need for more investigative journalism in Bangladesh. This was possible because of the commitment of the higher level management of the BCDJC that has taken up training of journalists as a mission.

Development impact: Besides igniting aspirations in a few journalists, the capacity building exercise did not have any significant impact in the media scenario in Dhaka. The history of loss of media licenses makes media owners wary of investigative reporting. The extra effort needed is a deterrent for personal initiatives on the part of the journalists. Harassment, threats and even the killing of an editor in the recent past elicit a general cautionary trend in media reporting. Unless adequate legal and other protective measures are in place, the impact of the capacity building exercises on the topic of investigative journalism will not be significant. In a media environment where money and political power play a major role, ideals, ethics and codes are sacrificed.

In fact, the research study was conducted at the time of a caretaker government in Bangladesh and it might have made investigative reporting more feasible in Bangladesh. Perhaps if the same study is repeated now, the results would be even less. In other words, capacity building exercises have to be complemented by an enabling media environment if the impact has to be felt in the long run.

Sustainability: The process of research, module preparation, and delivery of the programme four times has created a resource pool that can be tapped upon. Further training is necessary, especially for the journalists in district headquarters where better impact is seen. This will create enough manpower which can become more effective when the media environment becomes more self-regulating.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management:

- 1) Building feedback systems into execution processes is the main technique behind quality management. This technique if adopted, will establish the BCDJC as the most important media training organization in Bangladesh.

Co-ordinators, trainers, resource people etc. also get more refined through experience. It is important to capture this learning and to use it for improving future activities. Otherwise, when people who are responsible for execution of the projects leave, the lessons learnt are also lost to the organization. This has happened to the BCDJC before.

- 2) The BCDJC has a long history and very high credibility. The vision behind the organisation has to be matched with the missionary zeal and enthusiasm in the management of the projects. Loyalty and amenability to easy control, should take less priority than professionalism (and even some pride in it), as characteristics of the personnel given the responsibility of executing the projects. Culture and tradition may seem to come in the way of developing this attitude amongst project personnel, given the people friendly attitude of the top management. However, there is no real contradiction between friendliness and professionalism.
- 3) The BCDJC has proven again and again, that it is not necessary to get funding from outside to execute such capacity building projects. However, given the growth of media in Bangladesh in the recent past, the needs of the country are much vaster than the BCDJC alone can tackle. Partnerships and collaborations are the best way to reach the goals that the BCDJC has.
- 4) There is a need for more sustained activity in the area of capacity building of media professionals, beyond the one-off projects that the various NGOs can muster from International agencies and foundations. And perhaps here, the BCDJC can be pivotal in bringing the organisations together (at least some of them, given the personal dispositions) to address the unmet training needs of working journalists and media professionals. This consultant would humbly suggest leveraging of the credibility of the top management of the BCDJC for evolving a consensual and synergetic approach between various media training organisations to this end.

Recipient institution: The repetition of a 5-day workshop four times, provides a situation where feedback loop for improvement becomes very significant. Daily feedback on the sessions and final evaluation of each workshop provides the data for this continuous improvement principle of quality management practices. This aspect has not been given adequate attention in the present project. This consultant would request the BCDJC to examine the different feedback and evaluation forms available and adopt / adapt to suit the context and environment. The concept of the feedback loop seems to have not been used in the improvement of the research report also.

Member State: Given a democracy that has seen shifts in the party that holds power, it would be convenient to come to a consensus between the political parties to put the principles of freedom of both information and expression at a level where they are not easily overpowered. This reduces the chances of misuse of media by any party that comes to power. This involves putting in place media laws, regulations, monitoring and feedback. Attempts to control media will not meet with any success considering the huge growth of media industries. Even monitoring the media is becoming an unmanageable task in Bangladesh.

IPDC: There are a lot of unmet needs for training amongst media professionals in Bangladesh. Especially on the subject of investigative reporting. The BCDJC is capable – notwithstanding the minor flaws in execution as pointed to above – of undertaking the task and should be supported.

UNESCO: Keeping the country office in the loop from the time of proposal to the final completion report would be useful. The materials available with the UNESCO CI sector – those that are relevant to the capacity building intended in the country – should be “pushed” to the implementing agencies of IPDC projects. Quite often, the implementing agencies are not aware of the work done by the UNESCO which might be useful in the project. The proposal mentions only development of a manual for training. But the contract demands that it should be printed. Normally, IPDC makes an allocation below the demands in the project. And then when the cluster office of

UNESCO asks for more than the projected tasks, it puts the partner in a difficult situation. It is recommended that the cluster office be ready for reduction in tasks as per the reduction in allocation of funds for the project rather than the other way round.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

the type of project: The combination of research, training and advocacy within the same project is perhaps a practice that is worth emulating in similar projects elsewhere. It is a well-rounded and balanced approach.

Way of co-operation: None

Inputs: The resource people, coordinators etc. are all well respected and capable. The research work done on content analysis would have become an input if adequate time was available for the project. Presently, the research report is merely an output, except when it was used as a part of a presentation in the symposium.

Instruments used: The material on investigative journalism developed by the BCDJC itself is good enough as a starting point. Many relevant resources freely available on the Net were not used as inputs – for further reading by the trainees. See also recommendations to UNESCO above.

Sources:

Project proposal

Activity financing contract

Investigative reporting in Bangladesh: A study conducted by BCDJC

Final report

List of Interviewees

| <i>Name</i> | <i>Function</i> |
|-------------------------------------|---|
| Naimul Islam Khan | Founder, President BNNRC |
| Mohammed Nurul Hassan | Coordinator for IPDC projects, Joint Director, BNNRC |
| Sheikh Md. Shafiul Islam | Author of the study report, DCGCI |
| Khaled Mohinuddin | Resource person, Independent TV |
| Ali Ar Raji | Resource person, Dhaka University |
| Aliur Rahman Hasibur Rahman Bilu | Resource person Coordinator in Bogra, Sr. Correspondent, Daily Star |
| Arzad Hossain Mintu | Editor, Uttaranchal Barta, Bogra |
| Mahfuz Mondal | Trainee, Staff Reporter for Daily Inquilab and The New Nation in Bogra |
| Tansen Alam | Trainee, Staff Reporter, Daily Candinibazar in |

| | |
|-----------------|--|
| Talha Bin Habib | Bogra Trainee, Staff Reporter Financial Express, Dhaka |
| Emrana Ahmed | Trainee, Staff Reporter, Amar Desh, Dhaka |
| Mynuddin | Trainee, Sub-editor, Daily Sun |

UNESCO

Iskra Panevska, UNESCO, Delhi

Ajitha Vijayan, UNESCO, Delhi

Nargis Nyma, UNESCO, Bangladesh

Shamim Mohammed – UNESCO, Bangladesh, now on leave, interactions through e-mail

EVALUATION REPORT

A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE

BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING OF COMMUNITY RADIO PERSONNEL

2. PROJECT NUMBER

BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5081

3. CATEGORY: Community radio (electronic media)

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARY: Community Radios (CR) existing and potential staff/volunteers and Stakeholders

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: Bangladesh NGO Network for Radio and Communication (BNNRC)

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The project aims to build the “capacity of community media broadcasting and management staff among rural and remote communities in Bangladesh. 150 CR broadcasters will be provided with training in radio management, programme production, broadcasting and technical operations; A web portal will be created to encourage sharing of information, content and knowledge among CR operators in Bangladesh; A quarterly newsletter, produced by the BNNRC team, will be uploaded and circulated among the 150 trainees and other stakeholders. A directory of CR stations, their activities and references will be also produced and shared.”

5.1 Overall or development objective:

To overcome the shortage of Community Radio personnel in Bangladesh

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

To enhance the capacity and skills of 150 Community Radio professionals of 50 stations on Community Radio operation, by arranging training courses, annual conference, newsletter and web portal

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- A complete radio studio to be set up in the BNNRC secretariat
- 150 potential Community Radio professionals will have necessary skills on CR operation through three separate training courses
- Production and broadcast of 20 need based Community Radio programmes
- Setting up of the webportal capable of sharing and exchanging of programmes between CR stations
- 4 issues of Community Radio newsletter
- Community radio directory
- Indirect impact on 200,000 people in the coverage area of the Community Radio stations.

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries):

150 potential Community Radio professionals; About 20 million people living in the marginalized and neglected communities will be reached out by the participating CR stations and will indirectly benefit from the project’s activities.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$ 30 000

Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$ 30 000

The approved amount was used for:

Setting up of the a radio studio for demonstration and training

Three training courses for a total of 40 persons from CR stations

Newsletter, CR directory and webportal have not been done so far.

More than USD 20 000 has already been spent.

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1 Agency contributions

Staff costs, management costs, use of available equipment like computer and projector etc.

7.2 Other: None

7.3 Time schedule/project duration - 12 months as per proposal ; 11 months and 15 days as per the contract

B - ASSESSMENT

8.ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives: Bangladesh is in the initial phase of opening up 14 Community Radio stations. The understanding of Community Radio amongst the initiators (the people who applied and received permission for starting Community Radio stations), is very low. Hence it is indeed very important to build the capacity of the potential personnel for community radio in Bangladesh.

Short-term objectives: At a time when Community Radio is at a fledgling state in Bangladesh, training, capacity building, networking and advocacy are all important steps to ensure that the momentum gained is not lost. However, the objective of enhancing the capacity and skills of 150 Community Radio professionals from 50 stations was somewhat over-ambitious. In the process of revising the proposal in consultation with the UNESCO offices in Bangladesh and Delhi, the numbers were brought down to 120 professionals from 40 stations. Even this was an impractical expectation given the limits to the funds available from IPDC for a single in-country project. Once the allocation from IPDC (USD 30000) is clear, the workplan and budget for the project has to be revised. But the contract again, mentions 150 professionals. Though in the original proposal, 20 need-based radio programmes is mentioned as an output, the contract does not mention it. Hence it is assumed that there is no expectation to fulfil this part of the proposal. Considering that a part of the funds were to be allocated for the creation of 12 issues of a newsletter, 20 radio programmes, a directory of Community Radio broadcasters in Bangladesh, a web portal and a CR studio, the figures and expectations were unrealistic.

8. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities: Ultimately, permission for only 14 community radio stations was given by the Govt. of Bangladesh instead of the 50 anticipated in the proposal. This, of course, could not have been foreseen when the IPDC project was sanctioned. The anticipation implicit in the proposal – that permissions to start CR would be given to 20 more organisations – was rather optimistic. So far, only two CR stations have been formally inaugurated - both in the month of the visit for evaluation. Two more are doing test broadcasting. Seven stations are setting up transmission systems. The deadline to start all the 14 stations had been extended to October 2011. It is possible for the Government to cancel the permissions to those stations that do not start operations within the given deadline. Thus, as per project staff, the projection of numbers for the capacity and skills building exercises was severely cut down. Only 40 people have been trained instead of 150. (It may appear that there are more people trained from the lists of participants for

the three workshops. However, some participants were common to all three workshops. Hence the total number is not equal to the sum of the number of participants in the three workshops). However, to make the 14 Community Radio stations operational, there is a need to train adequate number of people who understand the operational and management aspects of radio stations. The number of 150 people is relevant even if the number of stations is only 14. The implementing agency has no previous experience in capacity building exercises in media. A visit to the radio station in Jadavpur University and two 5-day trainings in NIMC is adequate only for *orienting* people to the issues involved with managerial, technical, intellectual and aesthetic aspects of production and transmission of radio programmes not for capacity building. Orientation may be considered a part of capacity building. But the basic knowledge, skills and attitudes have still to be built up, to get the Community Radio system in the country up and running. It is also very interesting to note in this context that the CCD, an NGO in the BNNRC network, has been arranging capacity building exercises for radio production. However, instead of using the expertise existing within the network, the implementing agency used the Government sector facilities and the capacity of the NIMC. This, of course, helps to build up ties between the BNNRC and the Government sector, but is not indicative of an effective network between the NGOs.

The 12 issues of newsletters, as required by the contract, would have helped to build up the network and also to improve the awareness of Community Radio issues in the country –another part of capacity building. But not even one was completed at the time of evaluation – 10 months after the project period ran out. The reason given – that most of the Community Radio stations have not started yet – is not really valid or acceptable under the situation. Data about the initiating organisations of Community Radio stations have been collected by the implementing agency. But the directory was not yet done at the time of this consultant’s visit to Bangladesh. Again, the reason given – that there is a possibility of cancellation of licenses after the deadline on 31st October – is not very convincing, since the data collected has not even been processed for the creation of a directory.

This evaluation offered an opportunity to build the skills sets of the implementing agency. As a media consultant, whatever could be done to initiate the production of the newsletters and directory including motivation, encouragement, clarification of the needs and the target groups or the newsletter, skill building in accessing the right kind of content for the newsletter, basic layout for an 8 page newsletter, methods of conversion of the data to a directory etc. were done.

The idea of a webportal is enchanting. However, the implementing agency has no earlier experience in that either. An NGO that could collaborate to carry out this task was suggested to the implementing agency by the consultant. However, it appears that a commercial firm has been contacted for getting this task done.

It seems, to this consultant, that the implementing agency will not be able to deliver a webportal. Even the fact that radio programmes cannot be shared very easily without adequate amount of metadata was new to the implementing agency. Unless there is a clear vision of what the portal is supposed to do, it will not materialise. Lack of time did not allow this consultant to give inputs on the content and style of even the website that is being planned.

Project management:

“ek second” says a television advertisement in Bangladesh. It is repeated by different people in different circumstances. Literally, it means one second. But *ek second* does not mean just one second only. It refers to much longer period. Culturally this is acceptable. But in project management, it is not. The staff members responsible for the execution of the project were not clear about the deliverables. For example, they were under the impression that only 4 issues of newsletters were needed. The purpose of bringing out newsletters was also not very clear to

them. While the proposal identified the communities in Bangladesh as the target group for the newsletter, the draft that was being formulated was in English. This signals bottlenecks in the communication flow within the organisation. Though the organisation is aware of the UNESCO document on the configurations of radio stations, the equipment bought does not seem to have followed the recommendations in the document. Some pieces of equipment like the field production units are slightly over-engineered versions for the purposes of a Community Radio station, or as equipment for demonstration and training. The equipment is mostly lying idle since demonstrations and trainings are not regular events. Given that the electronic items have a life of about 8 to 10 years and that the life of digital equipment is about 3 years, the investment made on equipment will not be recovered unless strategic steps to do so are initiated. Besides poor time management, the management of the human, financial and technical resources available, there seems to be a lack of delegation and monitoring of tasks, and hesitation to undertake strategic cooperation and collaboration with other NGOs, to leverage on the strengths of those who are supposed to be a part of the network.

UNESCO services:

UNESCO Bangladesh had a hand in the formulation of the proposal. The inputs are evident in the objectives and the vision behind. The concerned officer of the UNESCO has since been on leave. And unfortunately, this vision seems to have not been appropriated or owned by the implementing agency.

Collaboration:

One might look at the 5 day workshops in the NIMC as collaboration with the Government sector – though they have been paid for. Even the participation in trainings, by the staff of NGOs that have permission to start Community Radio, could be viewed as collaboration between the NGOs - though it was a part of the workplan. But the real possibilities for collaboration within the network as well as with other NGOs seem to be overlooked.

The collaboration with the Community Radio station Jadavpur University for the initial training and orientation to management and equipment is “collaboration”, across the administrative boundaries of Bangladesh and India.

Project monitoring:

If there has been any monitoring, it seems to be quite ineffective. The completion of the project would take at least one more year, if not more, by the present pace of work.

9. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results :

40 people have been exposed to different issues related to CR production and transmission through 3 training events. One was of 3 days duration and the other two, of 5 days duration. Beyond orientation, the skills necessary have not been imparted. The numbers are far lower than the promised capacity building of 150 radio professionals.

Basic configurations for demonstrating production and transmission have been bought. Now there are tools of production in the premises of an organisation which has no capacity to use them for production or transmission. Let alone training other people in their use. At the time when the consultant was in Bangladesh, the directory was in draft form. The process for production of newsletters and the creation of a webportal were still in the initial stages - one year after the project period was over.

Cost-effectiveness: The expense made on the radio production and studio equipment will be a waste unless clear cut action is taken. Please see the recommendations.

The BNNRC has been a strong force behind advocacy and lobbying for Community Radio in Bangladesh. The newsletters would have been a great tool to further the cause of Community Radio and to create further involvement of people in the Community Radio movement in the region. However, this part of the work has not shown any results. The same goes with the directory and the webportal/website.

Development impact: Some more pieces of radio/audio equipment are now available in Bangladesh, a developing country.

Sustainability: Please see the recommendations

10. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management :

To run a radio station 14-16 hours a day, day after day, there has to be adequate number of trained professionals in each of the 14 stations. For the management of a community radio station, these professionals have to emerge from the community itself. Capacity building in radio management (HR, Technical, Financial), programming, production, scheduling, audience research and feedback, marketing etc. and ultimately there have to be at least 150 professionals with specialised skills in different areas even if there are only 14 stations. The BNNRC is not yet capable of undertaking the task. It would be better to collaborate with the CCD and Rajshahi University to complete this task. The training of a larger number of people can be achieved easily by the trainers going to location rather than the other way round. Taking the proverbial mountain to Mohammed is too time/energy consuming. It also depletes the funds available. To do this efficiently and effectively, this consultant would give the following suggestions: give the transmitter that has been bought under IPDC funds to Radio Padma and take the transmitter that they are using now. Radio Padma has a box type transmitter, funded by the UNESCO, which is more amenable to the mobility that is required to demonstrate and train about 10 to 12 volunteers on each location. Focus first on the stations that have already started eliciting community participation - like Sagargiri – to motivate the project staff with the results and outcome of their efforts.

The strategies of selection of the volunteers from the community, the sequence of training (Radio Journalism, Radio Production, Editing, etc.) as developed by the CCD and Rajshahi University should be applied as they have been tested for efficacy. This series could then be followed by a short introduction to transmission using the box type transmitter. This would be most valuable in 5 of the stations where even the setting up of the transmitter has not been initiated.

The availability of such manpower trained on the box-type transmitter will come in very handy later. The resource could be effectively used at times of floods and cyclones that Bangladesh is prone to.

After demonstration and training of the present set of initiators, the facility could be extended to those who have applied for permission. Short term hands-on courses could be offered to university departments also. The impact value for the expenses made on transmission and other equipment could thus be optimized. The BNNRC will truly gain in the core area of its expertise, namely advocacy and lobbying, if focused attention is given to the directory and the newsletters. Again, the agency does not have enough internal capacity to undertake the task. To build it up, the BNNRC would need some journalistic skills as well as to develop contacts with contributors, especially from the network of 14 initiator organisations.

The newsletters should be targeted primarily to the communities where the stations are set up and to the staff and volunteers of Community Radio. The secondary target groups should be the various Government departments in Bangladesh and their offices at sub-district, district and divisional levels as well as NGOs in Bangladesh. The international agencies should be seen only as tertiary target groups for the newsletter.

Hence the newsletter should be primarily in Bangla, not in English, as is planned now. Otherwise, the majority from the primary target groups will not be able to read the newsletter. A newsletter which is mostly in Bangla will also make the production of the newsletters easier and faster.

In the long run, it would be necessary to have some skills in page layout and design of newsletters. Internal capacity building is absolutely necessary, for which donors would not be easy to find.

The directory: It would be useful to have the PDF files easily findable on the net, however raw the form. The content is necessary and relevant to the international community interested in Community Radio. Testing the content by making the PDF versions available to the CR network within the country should be the first step. Printing the directory should be the very last step. It may be alright to delay the printing of the directory for another year. But the initial version should be made accessible at the earliest possible day. Otherwise it might even be construed as reluctance to share the available information.

Portal is a notion beyond the capacity of the BNNRC under the present context. But at least a website with relevant information is necessary. This consultant has given the methodology for harvesting and mining the information necessary for the website (and part of the information could also be given in the newsletter). Please use the techniques to populate the website and enrich the contents of the newsletter.

Recipient institution:

The equipment now available with the BNNRC has a cost and it has to be recovered. These are tools of production and unless they are put into productive use, they would become out-dated in 3 years' time just like any other digital equipment. Inviting NGOs, students of mass communication from the nearby universities, especially students who are from the area covered by the 14 Community Radio stations, would perhaps be a part of the solution for idle equipment time. Loaning production equipment to initiators could also provide return on investment. But this evaluator will strongly suggest that the best way to optimise the impact from transmission equipment would be to give it to Radio Padma and to use the box type transmitter for demonstration and training. Since both have come from UNESCO funds – one from IPDC and the other from the country office, this could perhaps be done more easily.

Member State:

Basic courses for Community Radio initiators and for those who have applied, could be given in a subsidized manner through the NIMC. This would prove to be a good platform to make the initiators and applicants understand the positions and apprehensions of the government about the Community Radio movement in Bangladesh. It is very necessary for Bangladesh to become self-sufficient in radio production and transmission equipment. Considering that the number of transmitters for 14 Community Radio stations alone would be of the order of 28 transmitters (including the standby ones), the volume of equipment needed is large. When the commercial radio stations that may yet be set up in different parts of the country come up eventually, the cost of equipment would mean the outflow of precious foreign exchange. Unlike the many digital facilities needed for Community Radio stations (as well as the commercial FM radio stations coming up in the country), there are many electronic items that are easily made in the country itself, reducing the demand for foreign exchange. As a step in that direction, it is recommended that the Government encourage and challenge the various engineering universities and colleges to design and test standby transmitters and such equipment for FM transmission.

The first Community Radio stations to be inaugurated in the country, namely Radio Padma of Rajshahi, and Loko Betar in Barguna, have bought the box type transmitters. These are very useful pieces of equipment at times of disasters like floods and cyclones since they are more easily transportable. They are not meant for Community Radio stations. Not even as standby transmitters for Community Radio stations, which, as per Bangladesh regulations, are allowed to have much wider coverage in terms of the reach of signals. It might be necessary to allow the Stations that have bought this equipment to repurpose them for the important purpose that it should be put to, namely, for use in emergencies like cyclones and floods, which are frequent in Bangladesh. This will mean allowing the initiators to reassign the transmitters and to take the help of NGOs to deal with emergencies as and when required.

Monitoring of signals in the FM spectra is easily done by electronic equipment. But monitoring of content from the FM stations is not easily done without digital technology and human labour. It is impossible to listen to all broadcasts for the purpose of monitoring of content. Content Management Systems and adequate metadata on the programmes will make the task easier. If all the initiators use the same metadata, aggregation and analysis would be simpler. If the people in Bangladesh Betar who have received training on archiving and metadata are used as consultants to advise the 14 stations on the systems they would have to put in place for populating the metadata fields, the Government would be in a better position to set up the monitoring systems.

IPDC:

Many organisations have gained through IPDC projects. Through execution of the projects, many organisations across the world have improved their own capacities. But unless the organisations have some critical attitudes, skills and capacities, this indirect benefit from IPDC projects cannot be accrued. It is essential to have an understanding of the present capacities of the organisations before such ambitious projects are granted.

UNESCO:

- 1) It is also very important to empower the country offices of the UNESCO to make their recommendations, suggestions on the projects before they are put to the IPDC for approval. After the sanctioning of the project, the country office should be kept in the loop so that timely action can be initiated locally. A much larger role could be given to the country office, in monitoring the progress of the projects. The advisors in the cluster offices should not be made solely responsible for the projects – especially for those that are very critical, like this one, in the development of community media of a country.
- 2) There are a large number of publications by UNESCO which are useful as tools for capacity building of media professionals. They are easily available on the net. However, they are not used – not even as handouts in PDF form – in the training events. For example, the book on the use of *ICT tools and Internet by journalists* could have been of use in all the training events. This is not true only of the six projects evaluated by the consultant, but of most training events supported by the UNESCO directly and IPDC. Instead of only the “pull” from interested users of these tools, a mechanism of “push” should evolve such that the trainees get benefit from these sources. The organisations selected for IPDC funding for capacity building of journalists and media professionals could be given the PDF files of all the relevant publications to be distributed to the trainees. This will not increase the costs since they are PDF files shared through e-mail.
- 3) When new partners project tasks that are not exactly in tune with the budget, a discussion and reworking of the project tasks and/or the budget is called for.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project:

Capacity building of Community Radio in Bangladesh: the vision behind the project in terms of the objectives is still valid. In budgeting, planning, execution and monitoring there were some errors, lapses, ineffectiveness and procrastination. This pitfall cannot easily be avoided, especially when it is the first time that the organisation has taken up an IPDC project. However, when a second IPDC project is approved, when the first one is not completed in time, it is indicative of some systemic problem. There is definitely a learning situation here. But this consultant is unable to spell out the lesson, for want of understanding of the processes involved in the approval of the IPDC projects.

The question, who will build the capacity of the capacity-builder, is similar to asking who will watch the watch dogs. Media watch groups that have evolved in some countries are a testimony to the fact that the problem could be tackled. There are about a dozen organisations in Bangladesh involved in capacity

building of media professionals (not including the university departments). An evaluation of their capabilities could perhaps be undertaken so that costly mistakes can be avoided.

Way of co-operation:

NIMC and the BNNRC have cooperated for the training events. The co-operation between the Government and NGO sector is desirable. So though it has been at the cost of co-operation between different NGOs of the Community Radio Network in Bangladesh, it should be appreciated. And, wherever possible, the model may be suggested. This collaboration is useful for both the NGO and the Government sector organizations. The cooperation with the Jadavpur University Radio across the border, is the other commendable effort. Culturally and linguistically, there are quite a few commonalities between Bangladesh and the West Bengal state of India. Perhaps it would be quite revealing to do a comparative study of Community Radio stations on both sides of the border. It might throw some light on the role of regulatory environment in the development of Community Radio.

Though Webel Mediatronics, an undertaking of the West Bengal Government also cooperated in the first training event in Kolkata, the event did not lead to cooperation in terms of equipment and facilities from India (except for the facilities bought by the radio station initiated by the Ministry of Agriculture in Bangladesh). The reluctance of Bangladesh NGOs to deal with a state run organisation across the border also shows promise of lessons to be learnt. This consultant is unable to draw out the lesson since the visit to Kolkata was done at the last stage of the itinerary.

Inputs:

The inputs for capacity building were of the best quality available under the circumstances. But the courses on production and post-production require greater amount of time than what was allocated. Moreover, the principles of journalism were not dealt with. Since Community Radio in Bangladesh is allowed to handle local news, this is a major lacuna.

Instruments used:

Lectures, discussions, demonstrations, and practical work.

Some of the equipment used during the practical work in the training will not be used in later work when the Community Radio stations are ultimately set up.

Tools like thenewsmanual.net, AIBD's interactive CDs on radio production etc. could have been very useful in the capacity building exercises. However, lack of awareness about such tools prevented adoption of cost-effective ways of capacity building.

Sources:

Proposal to IPDC

Contract from UNESCO New Delhi

Status/mid-term report

Configuration of Radio Stations and Media Centres: A practical guide to procurement of technical equipment for Community Media initiatives, UNESCO, In cooperation with DaniCom & Niels Worsoe, available on the web as PDF file.

Final evaluative reports on the three workshops

Data gathered for production of Directory

Draft of the first Newsletter

List of Interviewees

| <i>Name</i> | <i>Function/Organization</i> |
|----------------------------|--|
| Tamanna Rahman | Training Coordinator, BNNRC |
| Md. Kamaruzzaman | Trainee in Kolkata workshop, Project Coordinator, BNNRC |
| Syed Kamrul Hasan | Co-ordinator, Knowledge Management |
| Sohel Mark Manash Saha | Technical Consultant, BNNRC, Trainee in Kolkata workshop |
| Ziau I Haque | Project coordinator, BNNRC |
| Awrangazeb | Initiator, Sagargiri Radio |
| Rezaul Karim Chowdhury | Board Member, BNNRC |
| AHM Bazlur Rahman | Trainee in the workshop in Kolkata, CEO BNNRC |
| Md. Arifur Rahman | Initiator, YPSA |
| Kamurl Hassan Monju | Initiator, Mass-line Media Centre |
| Prof. Nilanjana Gupta | Resource person, convener of Jadavpur University CR |
| Avishek Das | Resource Person, Station Manager, JU Community Radio |
| Abhishek Ghos Dastidar | Resource Person, Webel Mediatronics Limited |
| G M Mourtoza | Trainee in workshop in Kolkata |
| Tauhita Chaudhury | Resource Person, NIMC |
| Md. Masood Manohar Bhuiyan | Resource Person, NIMC |
| Md. Nazrul Islam | Resource Person, NIMC |
| Ismat Jahan Chaudhury | Resource Person, NIMC |

UNESCO

Iskra Panevska, UNESCO, Delhi

Ajita Vijayan, UNESCO, Delhi

Nargis Nyma, UNESCO, Bangladesh

Shamim Mohammed – UNESCO, Bangladesh, now on leave, interactions through e-mail

EVALUATION REPORT

A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE

BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLE ON RADIO JOURNALISM AND PROGRAMS PRODUCTION

2. PROJECT NUMBER

BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5082

3. CATEGORY: Radio

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARY : Young indigenous people of the North-Western region of Bangladesh. Centre for Communication and Development, Rajshahi Radio Station, Radio Invo, the first online radio of Bangladesh specifically for indigenous people also benefited from the project

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: Centre for Communication and Development (CCD)

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives: To contribute to the establishment of freedom of expression and other basic human rights of ethnic minority groups in Bangladesh.

5.2 Operational or project objectives: To build the capacity of 25 young men and women on radio journalism, programme production, editing and broadcasting through a series of 3 workshops of 7 days duration and to produce 25 radio programmes during three-month-long fellowships to the trainees.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- 25 indigenous young people able to produce radio programmes.
- 25 trainees provided three-month fellowship in the Rajshahi Radio Station
- 25 programmes on issues of importance to indigenous people produced and broadcast

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries):

25 Young men and women preferably within the 20-25 age group from indigenous communities of the Southern region in Bangladesh.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: 39 980 USD

Assistance approved by IPDC: 32 000 USD

The approved amount was used for:

- Training 25 indigenous people in basic journalism, radio reporting, production, editing.
- Three-month fellowships for 25 indigenous people
- Operational support
- Equipment for recording and editing of radio programmes

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1 Agency contributions:

Equipment facilities such as computer, projector, screen, TV monitor, Transport for site visits to Rajshahi station etc.

The trainees had the freedom to use equipment, books and publications were issued to participants, staff support to facilitate the capacity building.

The allocation by the IPCD was USD 32000 and USD 3000 was to be absorbed by the CCD as per the revised budget. But as per actuals, the contribution from the CCD rose to USD 5000, besides staff and management costs.

7.2 Other:

Subsidized training hall by university,

Trainers' support and volunteering of time for continued monitoring and mentoring of the trainees after the training (unpaid work).

This was possible only because of support for operational costs of the CCD from other funding sources.

7.2 Time schedule/project duration:

16 months as per the proposal to the IPDC.

30 December 2009 to 30 September 2010 (9 months) as per contract.

Project completed.

B – ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives: The project proposal had identified contribution to the “establishment of freedom of expression and other basic human rights of the ethnic minority groups in Bangladesh” as the long term objective. Like minorities in other regions of the world, the ethnic minorities in Bangladesh have had experiences of not being equal to other citizens. Building capacities related to media can help to enlarge the scope for the freedom of expression of the ‘Adivasi’ people. This is in line with the UNESCO’s attempts to give voice to the voiceless. A desirable ideal.

Short-term objectives: The long term objective is to be reached through capacity building. 25 indigenous men and women were to be trained on radio journalism, programme production, presenting, editing and broadcasting. Giving the skills alone would not have empowered the indigenous people. But having the programmes broadcast and being accepted by their own communities as well as the wider audiences as being capable, brings about a confidence and self-respect - necessary components to be able to express freely and without fear or feelings of inferiority or insecurity.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities: The process of giving wide publicity through various channels of information so that those who aspire can apply as candidates for such training is a necessary condition for the success of the project. This was indeed done – so much so that about 250 people applied. 10 times the targeted number!

An orientation for all those who applied to the project and the clarification of the need for commitments in terms of time and effort reduced the number who registered as candidates for the project. This step is useful to create a sense of commitment from the candidates and as an additional step in the process that could be emulated by others.

Interviewing of the candidates by more than 3 people helped in identifying the potential fellows. More number of participants than projected in the proposal, were taken in, considering the possibility of drop-outs at various stages of the project. Since not many dropped out, the project delivered more than it promised. This aspect, however, has not been mentioned in the reports on the project, since the implementing agency felt that it is not relevant. But then again, this is worth emulating by other organisations involved in capacity building.

The trainers and resource people consisted of a mixture of academics (Mass Communication and Journalism Department of the Rajshahi University) and professionals (Radio professionals from private FM radio stations). The course focussed on principles of journalism in the initial part. And then slowly built up the

understanding of radio as a medium and provided the basic skills to script, record, edit, produce and transmit radio programmes. The programmes produced by the fellows were broadcast through Radio Rajshahi, a station run by the government. This implies that the programmes were of acceptable quality for broadcast. The involvement of the government sector is a good sign. And again, it sets precedence to other Community Radio stations.

Project management: The project was managed very efficiently and effectively. The CCD has had earlier experiences in organising such trainings. The monitoring and feedback of such projects have streamlined the activities. The planning and preparation were detailed. In execution, the needs of the trainees/fellows were taken into account and the management did not hesitate to go beyond what was proposed initially. This consultant found the management to have humane professionalism.

UNESCO services: The project was fully supported by the UNESCO Dhaka and New Delhi offices, from project formulation stage. The project management found the Delhi office very cooperative and friendly.

Collaboration: Radio Rajshahi, a station run by Bangladesh Betar was very cooperative and broadcast the programmes. Radio Invo, an online radio, also helped in the distribution of the media products created through the project by podcasting them. Though radio Invo could be perceived as an outcome of the project, since it is run by project participants, this online radio has to be considered as a distinct entity as far as this evaluation is concerned. The involvement of the Department of Mass Communication and Journalism, Rajshahi University went beyond providing content experts. The faculty was involved in monitoring and mentoring. This should give the department the status as collaborator. The contribution by the Department was an important component in the success of the project.

Project monitoring: A project proposal that asked for 16 months and USD 32000 was completed in 9 months. The monitoring system within the CCD has been effective as well as efficient. The quick turnaround time to increase the number of days as per participants' request and the completion of the project well in time in spite of the fact that project duration was reduced from the time projected in the proposal. The UNESCO contract from the UNESCO Delhi office had an inbuilt monitoring system. The payments were released in instalments against reports and other 'deliverables'.

10.EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results:

According to the approved project, the duration of this training course should have been 7 days. However, to respond to the participants' need the training was extended to 10 days in some parts and up to 15 days in the case of the workshop on editing. The training and the exposure provided through the fellowship programme to the participating men and women from indigenous people were very good, as evidenced by the fact that many of the participants are now gainfully employed in mainstream media houses. The others are working as volunteers in Radio Padma, the first Community Radio to be inaugurated (on 7th October 2011) in Bangladesh. The indigenous voices are being heard not only in Rajshahi, but elsewhere too, because of the project. The programmes have also been podcast through Radio Invo, the first indigenous based online radio of Bangladesh (www.radioinvo.com). A radio station set up by the fellows. This was also not a part of the proposal. Again, the project delivered more than it promised.

Cost-effectiveness:

At a time when Community Radio stations are being established in different parts of the country, this project has once again proved the dictum "teaching people to fish is better than giving them fish". Besides the fact

that more than 25 people were trained, the programmes on the issues of indigenous people were produced and broadcast through the Government run radio in Rajshahi and podcast through Radio Invo (short for Indigenous Voices). It also created a platform for a website on the issues of the Adivasi people – adivasi.com – initiated by one of the fellows. The amount spent for equipment will show social returns in the long run since it is being put to productive use even after the project is over.

Development impact: Radio Padma became the first Community Radio in Bangladesh due partly to this project and partly due to another IPDC funded project for capacity building of women in Community Radio. The empowerment of indigenous people is not easily measurable, but quite evident. A website for addressing indigenous people has been created by one of the fellows after the project was over. The intellectual resources of Rajshahi, considered an educational city in the region, and the slow involvement of health and agricultural services in radio are definite signs of the impact of the project in the long run.

Sustainability: The training provided to the indigenous people (and to women through another project), as well as the establishment and inauguration of Radio Padma has created a situation where a large amount of horizontal transfer of knowledge, skills and attitudes can be created. New volunteers are coming into Radio Padma and getting trained in different aspects of Community Radio without any further inputs, at least in the areas where the core capacity has been built up. Some of the fellows from the project are continuing to work, producing more programmes than mentioned in the project and transmitting it through Radio Padma. There is, however, a point on which this consultant is anxious. The reach of the footprint of Radio Padma extends to a radius of only one kilometre. The station could, as per the regulations in Bangladesh reach up to 17 kilometres if a transmitter with higher wattage of power could be used. Unfortunately, the box type transmitter was chosen unwisely by the station, partly by wrong advice. The box type transmitter is very useful for dealing with issues during emergencies brought about by natural calamities like floods and cyclones. It is not meant for Community Radio stations in Bangladesh.

The low reach, in the long run, would reduce the enthusiasm of the volunteers. Having so low a reach would also seriously affect the ability of the station to get adequate advertising and sponsorship revenue. Which would, in turn, severely affect the sustainability of the station.

While fully realising the difference between sustainability of a project and sustainability of a radio station, given the involvement of the UNESCO and IPDC-UNESCO in the Community Radio issue of the country, it is important that this concern is mentioned here.

11.RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

Project management:

- 1) Training that has so far been provided covers only certain grounds. Without further strengthening of the process of programming (taking into consideration the communication needs of the people of Rajshahi, the different formats of radio programmes and the different types of contents that can be carried by the formats to meet the needs of the audience), scheduling (as per the listening habits of people in Rajshahi and the patterns of sponsorships), Radio Padma will not be able to endear and make itself indispensable to all sections of the communities living in Rajshahi. The cost, effort and time for continued training of the staff and volunteers can be reduced by using the tools and resources available on the Internet. The consultant appreciates the free access to existing books in the CCD to the staff and volunteers. Besides UNESCO, Panos, SciDevnet, Internews, Communication Initiative, CBA, AIBD, ABU etc., there are many institutes and universities that provide free resources and tools. This resource base should be made more relevant to the needs of Radio Padma by the addition of digital tools and resources.
- 2) The consultant would also request the management to put in place the principles of quality management as per the quality standards set up by ISAS 9001. Putting in place appropriate management systems that strive for continuous improvement is easier now, in the early stages of the broadcasting station.

- 3) Database systems for archiving different types of content along with appropriate metadata will ensure the repurposing and reuse of content including sound effects, documentaries, magazines etc. It will also save time, effort and costs in the long run. Again, the earlier the systems are put in place, the less painful. Capturing metadata retrospectively is not easy. But training the staff to populate the metadata fields at different stages of the production process is not too difficult.

Recipient institution:

The training manual prepared for the purpose has gone through adequate testing and should be translated and published in Bengali. The manual could be of use to the trainings that need to be conducted in the other 13 Community Radio stations in Bangladesh as well as in other Bengali speaking areas across the border, in India. If and when new proposals for capacity building are put up to IPDC or other agencies, please consider taking up 12 to 14 people in a workshop. 25 participants in a workshop makes it difficult to give individual attention to all participants. Moreover, it degenerates into a classroom and lectures instead of a workshop that allows discussions and horizontal interactions.

Member State:

- 1) There are many more radio stations that will be established in Bangladesh – both Community Radios as well as private ones. The equipment and facilities for the purpose are imported and will be a drain on foreign exchange available. Especially in the case of transmitters, it should be noted that each station will ultimately need two transmitters to allow uninterrupted transmission during repair and maintenance. Thus Bangladesh will need 28 transmitters, just to fulfil the needs of the permitted Community radio stations. The numbers will skyrocket with the addition of private and more Community Radio stations. It is important that Bangladesh becomes self reliant in radio production and transmission equipment where it is possible at the earliest. As an initial step, the Government could challenge the capable technology institutions to initiate Research and Development to create transmitters, amplifiers and modulators. These are not very high technology equipment and Bangladesh has the manpower adequately educated and trained, to achieve this - if supported by enabling policies.
- 2) The transmitter that is now being used by Radio Padma – the first Community Radio station in Bangladesh – is the box type that allows quick setting up of a transmitter and strategic communication in the event of any cyclone or floods or such natural hazards that the country is prone to. Radio Padma should be allowed to exchange the transmitter with the transmitter available with the BNNRC. The BNNRC can then use it as a tool for training and demonstration. And when needed, the unit could be called in to serve the nation in times of calamities.

IPDC:

- 1) None of the other 13 Community Radio stations in Bangladesh have the personnel required to start, run and sustain production and programming for Community Radio. So the organisation (CCD) should be supported to undertake similar capacity building exercises in the other Community Radio stations in Bangladesh. The CCD has sufficient expertise, experience and enthusiasm to undertake the task. Tools and techniques to carry out the task have been tested. The human resources for the task are also available.
- 2) The transmitter that has been bought by Radio Padma is the box type developed by ABU with support from the UNESCO. This is a very useful piece of equipment for use under emergency conditions after disasters since it is more easily transportable and set up under different conditions. However, for a Community Radio station (especially in a peaceful, educational city like Rajshahi), this was an unwise choice. The regulation allows much higher power. But the transmitter can only reach a radius of one or two kilometres at the most, one tenth of the coverage allowed. This is not sustainable since the radio station can serve only a small part of the community it intends to serve. With a transmitter of appropriate power, Radio Padma, the first ever Community Radio station to be inaugurated formally in Bangladesh and having capability of transmitting throughout the waking hours of the city, has the potential to generate a much larger listenership and hence become sustainable. This consultant strongly recommends provision of a transmitter with adequate power to Radio Padma and to use the transmitter in a box for demonstration and training purposes.

This then, will be of use to catalyse the starting of broadcast in many other Community Radio stations in Bangladesh. Later, the equipment could be kept as a standby for use in emergency situations, especially cyclones and floods, common in Bangladesh.

UNESCO:

The station that now uses the capacity of the indigenous people – Radio Padma uses the “radio station in a box” for transmission. This limits the coverage of population to about one kilometre radius. The regulation allows more than 10 times the present coverage. Thus it is highly inadequate for the purposes of the Community Radio. The transmitter is funded by the UNESCO. The exchange of this transmitter with the one available with the BNNRC, another transmitter funded through an IPDC project, will solve the problem. The BNNRC can use the box type transmitter as a demonstration and training kit. It would, in fact, prove to be better than the set up that they have acquired for the purpose. The transportability of the transmitter will also make it a useful tool in times of emergencies. Is it possible to get the Bengali versions of the training materials that the CCD uses? This could be funded by the UNESCO, Delhi, since the outcome has value to both India and Bangladesh. The UNESCO Bangladesh office may please be kept in the loop on the IPDC projects by copying them the e-mails sent to the implementing agency. It would make it easier for the UNESCO to keep a track on the progress of the projects.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project: As a capacity building exercise, this is a model that can be adopted/adapted by other organisations. The telescoping of a large number of aspirants into trainees, fellows and later into roles and functions in the radio station is something that even private sector radio stations can learn from. The model is an evolution and this consultant has learnt a lot by evaluating the project.

Way of co-operation: The cooperation between the CCD and a university department.

The cooperation between the CCD and Radio Rajshahi.

The cooperation between Radio Invo and adivasi.com. The key to it all was the relationship between people, individuals. Without human relationships, cooperation between organisations is not as simple.

Inputs: The academic inputs from the university, the professional inputs from existing private national and international radio stations. Human resources selected from the community with focus on women and indigenous people. Capacity Building through funds from the IPDC. Equipment from UNESCO and IPDC.

Instruments used: The advertisement, the application/registration forms, background materials for training (primarily done in English, but sensible and short), the evaluation forms. Unless the instruments were in place, one wonders whether the project would have been so successful.

Sources:

IPDC project proposal from the CCD

UNESCO Activity Financing contract no. 4500091175

Mid-term report from the CCD

Participant list with phone numbers

Copies of the tools like the registration form, training materials, evaluation form, etc. used in training.

List of Interviewees

| <i>Name</i> | <i>Function/Organization</i> |
|--------------------|---|
| Mr G M Mourtoza | Director, CCD |
| Mr Mashihur Rahman | Trainer, Mass Comm. & Journalism Dept, Rajshahi University |
| Mr Satil Siraj | Trainer, Mass Comm. & Journalism Dept, Rajshahi University |
| Sima Hasdak | Trainee, now working in Radio Padma |
| Maria Monik Mardi | Trainee, now working in Radio Padma |
| Rosi Rema | Trainee, now working in Radio Padma |
| Prodip Hembrom | Trainee, now working in Radio Padma |
| Manik Soran | Trainee, now working in Radio Padma |

UNESCO

Iskra Panevska, UNESCO, Delhi

Ajitha Vijayan, UNESCO, Delhi

Nargis Nyma, UNESCO, Bangladesh

Shamim Mohammed – UNESCO, Bangladesh, now on leave, interactions through e-mail

EVALUATION REPORT

A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1.PROJECT TITLE

BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING OF WOMEN ON RADIO JOURNALISM AND PROGRAMS PRODUCTION

2.PROJECT NUMBER

BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5091

3.CATEGORY: Radio

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARY: 25 young women from the Northern region of Bangladesh

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: Centre for Communication and Development (CCD)
CR station *Radio Padma* initiated by the CCD

5.PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

To develop a group of young women broadcasters with sufficient capabilities and skills in CR management, programme production, broadcasting and technical operation, who will produce women's issues related weekly radio programmes for giving an expression platform to women.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

Enhance the Community Radio management capacities and radio programme production skills of 25 young women on radio journalism, programme production, editing, broadcasting, CR management and operation.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

25 women acquired necessary capacities and skills on radio journalism, programme production, editing and broadcasting as well as CR management and operation through three separate training courses. Produced 30 women's issues-related radio programmes within 3-month long fellowship 25 women's programmes broadcast through Rajshahi radio and RadioDesh.com

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries)

25 young women preferably within the age group of 20-25 from the Northern region of Bangladesh

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$ 21 090

Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$ 21 000

The approved amount was used for: Basic Radio Journalism training course; Radio Program Production training course; Radio Program Editing and Broadcasting training course; CR Management and Operation training course ; Advocacy Workshop for Promoting Trainees; 3 months long fellowships for producing women issues based radio programs; Broadcasting weekly radio programs; Monitoring the project activities

7.CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1 Agency contributions: Instead of nearly 8000 dollars estimated as the agency contribution in the project proposal, the addition of training on presentation and the extension of the projected duration of some workshops, led to increased spending of the order of 1000 dollars.

7.2 Other: In the advocacy workshops, Women's Empowerment Network was involved.

7.3 Time schedule/project duration:

A 16-month duration was requested in the project proposal

30th August 2010 to 30th November 2011 / 15 months. The project period had not ended at the time of visit for evaluation

B - ASSESSMENT

8.ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives: The number of women working in media is very low in Bangladesh. Some newsrooms are entirely devoid of any women. This leads to less than adequate or even non-representation of issues related to women in media. To empower women through capacity building in radio, thereby giving voice to the voiceless in media, are honourable objectives.

Short-term objectives : Enhancing the diverse skills needed for confidently taking up positions in radio stations such that 25 women are not only empowered, on the one hand, and contributing to the needs of the Community Radio stations that are coming up in Bangladesh, on the other – a well thought out and focused objective.

9.ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities:

The project proposed had four workshops for capacity building and four more for promoting the trained women. The capacity building workshops were projected to be 1) Basic Radio journalism, 2) Radio Programme Production, 3) Radio Programs Editing and Broadcasting, and 4) CR Management and Operation. However, an additional workshop was arranged on the topic of Radio Reporting and Radio Programs Presentation as per the demands from the young women who were selected for the capacity building activity. The workshops were proposed to be 10 days each. However, the number of days were increased as per the demand from the women, who felt that they needed more to feel confident in the work, later. The project had proposed building the skills of 25 women. But the workshops took on 30 women. Given that a few will drop out during or after the workshops, or will fail to deliver, this was a good strategy. The project proposed production of 30 programmes and broadcasting of 25 – this again shows the respect for reality and the understanding that just because a programme is produced, it is not necessarily of broadcast quality. The task of undertaking advocacy workshops in all 16 districts of the northern part of Bangladesh was not really necessary or feasible under the available budget. The project management reworked the tasks to achieve the objectives – namely strengthening the position of the women who were trained. The renaming of the workshops as consultation workshops was also strategic from the point of view of communication – people don't want to be on the receiving end of advocacy and lobbying, but do not mind coming in for a consultation.

Project management:

These above points show that the management used the concept of management by objectives to be reached rather than focus on merely executing the tasks. For the advocacy workshops, Women Empowerment Network was taken as a partner. This shows the CCD's willingness to accept the limitations of its capabilities and powers.

The trainee women of the project have formed Women Empowerment Network (WEN) for using their combined force for empowering women and raising their voice. This is one of the strong outputs of the project. And the CCD involved WEN to successfully arrange the advocacy workshops so that they can enhance their capacity and leadership skills. Besides, the CCD has been helping this forum arrange a number of activities.

UNESCO services:

The UNESCO country office had been involved with the project from its inception. However, the officer concerned had taken off on study leave later. This did not deter the execution of the project in any way. But the CCD has informed the UNESCO country office regularly about the activities of the project.

Collaboration:

In the capacity building workshops, the Journalism and Mass Communication Department of the Rajshahi University played a major role. The relationship between the trainers and the fellows went beyond the training period. The trainers came forward for follow up mentoring and feedback. This was a very fruitful collaboration. Radio Rajshahi, a station run by Bangladesh Betar, was very cooperative and broadcast the programmes. The collaboration with the Women's Empowerment Network (WEN) was strategic in dealing with the advocacy workshops in the other districts.

Project monitoring:

Both the quick turnaround time for increasing the number of days for training and the addition of one extra training event on reporting and presentation, are indicative of a responsible and responsive monitoring system. The contact with the UNESCO office in Bangladesh and the cluster office in Delhi were frequent. The contract had clauses that helped to monitor the project by identifying deliverables within stipulated time periods.

10.EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results:

More than the proposed number of women was ultimately trained. They were trained in additional skills than proposed (reporting and presenting).

The trained women are confident and have demonstrated their skills. The programmes produced were of reasonable quality. They have been broadcast more than once.

The advocacy workshops also seem to have had an impact on the women and opened up opportunities. One was selected go abroad (AMARC Asia Pacific Community Radio Forum in Thailand) to represent the trained women.

Cost-effectiveness: Very cost effective.

Development impact: This has had impact in the number of women's issues presented in Radio Rajshahi. Some of those trained have got jobs in media and some are working in Radio Padma.

Sustainability: The establishment of Radio Padma has given a platform where further capacity building, to a large extent, can take place horizontally, between the trained women and the newcomers.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:**Project management:**

The collaboration between the CCD and the Department of Journalism and Mass Communication, Rajshahi university, has led to a course which is fine-tuned to the needs of Community Radio in Bangladesh. The course has been tested twice, now, and through feedback and evaluation led to visible improvements. Similar courses should be now offered to the other CR stations to build up their human resources.

Recipient institution:

Please see the recommendations given in the evaluation report on the IPDC project "Capacity Building of Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production"

Member State:

Please see the recommendations given in the evaluation report on the IPDC project "Capacity Building of Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production"

IPDC:

The responsibility of building up the required human resources for the Community Radio stations of Bangladesh should be given to the CCD. Please also see the recommendations given in the evaluation report on the IPDC project “Capacity Building of Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production”.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project: The idea of promoting the trained women in other districts through a series of workshops has to be highlighted. This would help the women get employment opportunities in media related jobs especially since there are other Community radio stations in the nearby districts. Please also see the evaluation report on the IPDC project “Capacity Building of Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production”. The points raised there are applicable here too.

Way of co-operation: As mentioned in the evaluation report on the IPDC project, “Capacity Building of Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production”, the role played by the Department of Journalism and Mass Communication, Rajshahi university, has to be commented on. The long term relationship between the department and the CCD has been an important component in the success of the two IPDC projects executed by the CCD. The co-operation between the CCD and the Women’s Empowerment Network also requires mention. The cooperation was quite strategic and gives the project an edge which otherwise would not have been so encouraging for the women who were trained.

Inputs: The input of the resource people and trainers for the workshops calls for special mention. The combination of the academic inputs from a university and the professional inputs from private FM stations is a useful tactic that could be emulated by those who are planning such trainings.

Instruments used: The materials produced and collated by the implementing agency for the capacity building exercise are quite useful in similar situations elsewhere. Please also see the comments in the evaluation report on the IPDC project “Capacity Building of Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production”.

Sources:

IPDC project proposal
Activity financing contract
Mid term report
Project update report
Attendance sheet
Evaluation form
Schedules for the workshops
Training materials
Newspaper advertisement inviting applications

List of Interviewees

| Name | Function/Organization |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Mr G M Mourtoza Mr Mashihur Rahman | Director, CCD Trainer, Mass Comm. & Journalism Dept Rajshahi University |
| Mr Satil Siraj | Trainer, Mass Comm. & Journalism Dept Rajshahi University |
| Shadia Afraj | Trainee, now reporter in Radio Padma |
| Ridita Mizan | Trainee, now producer in Radio Padma |
| Laboni Bristy | Trainee, now presenter in Radio Padma |
| Jayashree Tuli | Trainee, now presenter in Radio Padma |
| Samira Jannat Shetu | Trainee, now co-producer in Radio Padma |
| R I M Golam Rabbani | Producer, Radio Padma |

UNESCO

Iskra Panevska, UNESCO, Delhi

Ajitha Vijayan, UNESCO, Delhi

Nargis Nyma, UNESCO, Bangladesh

Shamim Mohammed – UNESCO, Bangladesh, now on leave, interactions through e-mail

EVALUATION REPORT

A - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE

BANGLADESH: CAPACITY BUILDING FOR JOURNALISTS OF THREE HILL DISTRICTS

2. PROJECT NUMBER

BUDGET CODE: 354 BGD 5092

3. CATEGORY: Print and electronic media

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARY: Print and electronic media professionals in Bangladesh

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: News Network, Bangladesh

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

By enhancing the capacity to do investigative reporting, the project seeks to contribute to democracy and good governance.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

“To enhance the professional journalistic skills (investigating, writing, reporting) of 75 young journalists aged between 27 and 35.”

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

A total of 75 journalists trained under three separate one-month fellowship programmes in three different districts will acquire the capacity of producing quality news, features, in-depth and investigative reports.

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries):

75 young journalists in the Bandarban, Rangamati and Khagrachari districts of the Chittagong hill tracts of Bangladesh.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: USD 39 820

Assistance approved by IPDC: USD 25 000

The approved amount was used for: Honoraria for fellows; Daily allowance for fellows and volunteers; Transportation; Venue; Training materials; Resource persons' honoraria; Local coordinators' honoraria; Telephone, postage

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1 Agency contributions:

Management costs, Office supplies, coordinators' honoraria, training materials, communication costs, Audit fee

7.2 Other – Borrowings

7.3 Time schedule/project duration: 12 months as per the proposal, 8 months as per the contract

B - ASSESSMENT

ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

Capacity building of the Fourth Estate is definitely a part of enhancing transparency and thus strengthening democracy.

Short-term objective:

The population in Bangladesh is primarily young – about one third. There are a large number of new dailies and periodicals that have started emerging from the divisional and even district levels. The mass communication and journalism courses offered in about a dozen universities do not fully prepare the next generation of journalists since the focus is primarily on history and theory and less on the practice of journalism as a profession. Most of the students from the journalism and mass communication departments prefer to take up advertising and public relations jobs rather than journalism, a less well paid profession. The journalists who are presently reporting have other educational backgrounds. It is thus very important that the capacity building of the media professionals focus on practicing journalists. Moreover, the journalists who do end up sending reports from divisional, district and sub-district levels for the newspapers consist mainly of people who have other professions, such as lawyers, teachers, businessmen etc. For most, reporting for newspapers or TV is just another way to survive. Under this situation, it is indeed a necessary step to sensitize, orient and build the skills of the young journalists to satisfy the needs of media industries and media consumers. The project should thus be seen as a forerunner and a necessary part of building the basis for a vibrant democracy. The selection of the districts for the initial foray into district level training was well considered. The Hill tracts are considered disturbed areas. The terrain does pose hindrance to access. Development in this region has been slower than in the rest of Bangladesh. The population is predominantly tribal and the region shares a border with India. The tribal links are sometimes stronger than the respect for the administrative border. These cultural and strategic aspects of the location make it a priority area for responsible reporting. Thus, the need for training and the possibilities for better long term impact, make the choice of districts relevant and important.

ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION***Activities:***

A one month long training is a good method to provide extensive inputs to the journalists on the basics of journalism as well as to create a network between journalists working in the same district. The practice of conducting the training from 9 am to 2 pm allows the journalists to catch up with their profession of reporting and even to practice what they learned during the day. The co-ordinator for the training in each district is a senior journalist. The resource people are well-respected and seasoned journalists from within the country. The contents of the workshops were well developed over earlier series of trainings for other target groups of journalists. The methodology also remained more or less the same: lectures, presentations and discussions. The preparations for the workshops started earlier than the signing of the contract. This shows the extent of the involvement of the management in the project. Even though the workshop was publicised, the co-ordinators in each district had a role in identification and selection of the participants for the workshops. Since only about half the number of active journalists at district level could be accommodated, there was some discontent among some local journalists.

Project management:

The project management gave personal attention, on the one hand, and was extremely disciplined, on the other. Punctuality (considered not very important in Bangladesh) and active participation was ensured by the project management. The participants and the coordinators were also respectful about transparency in the dealings with project management. Monitoring of the project during the execution was not left to the discretion of the workshop coordinators. The management systems and administrative tools were in place, since the implementing agency had enough experience organising such capacity building exercises.

UNESCO services:

The project management has been in constant touch with the UNESCO office in Delhi during the project and report full cooperation and support.

Collaboration:

Press club and other venues were arranged by the coordinators and project management through personal contacts. These could be viewed as collaborations, though not on a formal footing.

Project monitoring:

The monitoring of the project by the implementing agency is evident from the ease with which the project was executed in time, in spite of the fact that the project period was reduced from the duration requested in the project proposal. The UNESCO contract had clauses which helped to monitor the progress of the project in terms of deliverables.

EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT***Results:***

The project proposal and the contract had projected training of 75 journalists. Because of the reduced grant from the IPDC, the number of participants was reduced from 75 to 60 persons in the revised budget and work plan. But the impact on the journalists who did participate was high. All participants interviewed were highly influenced and motivated by the resource people. For most participants, this was the first formal input on the principles of journalism. The inputs were highly useful to them. They claimed improvement in their reporting and were very grateful for the introduction to photojournalism, an area which they had totally ignored earlier.

Cost-effectiveness:

The total cost to IPDC-UNESCO was USD 25000. 60 Journalists received training of one month. Per journalist, the cost is a little more than USD 400. Comparable to salaries in Bangladesh. The journalists could not have had this opportunity without IPDC support. If a numerical value could be put on effectiveness, this consultant would put a much higher figure than the cost.

Development impact:

The hilly districts of Chittagong are troubled areas. The sense of injustices done in the past, tribal linkages across International borders etc. have implications on the stability of the region. To provide voice to the local aspirations and to report independently, responsibly and credibly about this area of the country in National and International media needs some sharpening of skills, attitudes and knowledge. Since about half the number of journalists in the region has been impacted by the workshops, this consultant would rate it fairly good.

Sustainability:

The journalists in the region need further training. Quire a few district level print journalists have started to double up as TV journalists. The demand for training in this area is high. However, repeated trainings are difficult to sustain through funding alone. Internal capacities of the country will have to be explored to meet the needs of district and sub-district level journalists. The use of existing distance education and e-learning tools could have helped except for the fact that most journalists are not comfortable with English. A translation of carefully selected tools for the purpose could perhaps help.

RECOMMENDATIONS**Recommendations addressed to:*****Project management:***

News Network has indeed grown over years in terms of the alumni of its fellowship programmes. The attempt has been primarily oriented to the print media. There is a growing demand for skill building for radio, TV and Internet media. The catchment of the population with the demand is more or less the same as with print media. Trainings in the use of Internet for both access to information as well as to use it as an outlet will empower the journalists to orient themselves to life-long learning and to expose themselves to a wider world than can be reached by district, divisional and national readers/listeners/viewers. It will also

reduce the burden of capacity building in the growing radio and television media to some extent, given that the learning links are identified and provided to the journalists. This can reduce the costs of training in the long run and increase effectiveness.

Recipient institution:

Another proposal to the IPDC may be considered, including some inputs on radio, television and cyber-journalism, taking more developed districts (meaning, better connected) as samples.

Member State:

The growth of media in the country is a good sign. The decision to open up the airwaves and the regulation for Community Radio are changing the media scenario in the country. The cost of technology is coming down. The bottleneck in such a situation is adequately trained manpower for a responsible and responsive media. Opening up the NIMC's expertise and experience to train the practicing professionals in media to address the issue is recommended. This would have two consequences: 1) the human resource in private media who understand/appreciate the point of view of the government 2) a stronger and more dynamic NIMC.

IPDC:

The training needs of journalists at district level in Bangladesh are high. Practicing journalists are mostly untrained, do not have a journalism background in education and quite often take journalism only as an additional income source, since they have other careers as teachers, lawyers, businessmen etc. Some of these journalists working with print media have started doubling up as TV reporters. This tendency will only increase in the coming years. The possibility of some of these people contributing to the growth of Community Radio in the country is also very high, though it has not been explored. A holistic approach to the capacity building of print media journalists should include TV, Radio and the Internet media, given the rather labile and even volatile nature of the media workforce in Bangladesh. The challenge of creating the structure of such a course and the execution of a pilot to test the effectiveness and impact in three districts with adequate broadband connectivity may be suggested to News Network. The organisation has proved to be a reliable partner, having executed two projects in the recent past.

UNESCO:

- 1) The country office in Bangladesh is to be kept in the loop on the progress of IPDC projects in the country.
- 2) The payments to the NGO partners in Bangladesh are in dollars as far as UNESCO is concerned. But the money is received by the partners in *Taka*, as per the existing exchange rates at that time. So the statement of expenses gives an account of money received in *Taka*. And then it is converted to Dollars for the benefit of UNESCO. Exchange rates may vary widely from day to day and from month to month. Between the time of disbursement and the final account statement, the exchange rates would change. It is more accurate to calculate in terms of the exchange rate at the time of disbursement rather than at the time of the final account statement. Otherwise, if *Taka* per dollar is higher during the account statement, the partner suffers heavy losses. If, on the other hand, the rates are lower, the partner will suffer again, as NGOs, since the account will show a profit, which it would be difficult to explain to the Government authorities. It is really a heads-I-win, tails-you-lose situation which puts the NGO partner in a fix. So a slight change is suggested in terms of the calculation of the exchange rates: calculate the exchange rates as per the time of disbursement. Otherwise UNESCO will force the NGOs to adopt wrong accounting practices or else suffer for taking up the IPDC projects.
- 3) There has been a small delay in the disbursement of the final instalment. USD 1000 not yet disbursed, months after the completion of the project. When looking into this issue, it was found that the verification process of bills and invoices took longer time due to insufficient staffing in the administration unit. In the Letter of Intent, sent soon after the approval of the project from the IPDC, a sum of US\$ 24 000 is referred to, whilst in the contract it is US\$ 25 000, (and in the letter to the

Govt. of Bangladesh, it is US\$ 24 000). On further enquiries it was found that USD 1000 was supposed to be held back for evaluation and that later, it was found to be not necessary. It is recommended that the payment may be made as per contract and that a letter be sent to the Government of Bangladesh, referring to the earlier letter and correcting the error, so the partner NGO may use the money with transparency.

13. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

- Type of project:* There were a few things that could work as a model for such capacity building exercises elsewhere.
- Preparation:* The basic content was well prepared, in Bengali, the language of the people. Similar training cum fellowship has been done earlier and so the content was well tested for its usefulness to working journalists. Participation: inviting participation was done through advertisements and through multiple channels of information. The focus was on young people and stress on women journalists.
- Resource People:* All the resource people were well respected and reputed. They were a part of similar workshops earlier and knew the drill. Time and Duration: One month long workshops are rare. But very necessary to build the capacity of young journalist working from remote districts. The sessions started at 9 and ended at 2pm, therefore the journalists could also see to their daily work, with the workshop not becoming a month-long hindrance to their work.
- Way of co-operation:* News Network has extensive contacts in Bangladesh. This helped to bring in some co-operation for the venue arrangements. However, this cooperation remained at the level of people, not in terms of cooperation between organisations.
- Inputs:* The resource people were all professionals, highly respected in media circles. The presence of the stalwarts was a major motivating factor for the young journalists. If they were unknown, yet proficient trainers or even well known university professors, the impact on the participants would not have been so high. The manual was of acceptable quality and brief. (The consultant could only read the summary in English). But to have a continuing impact, the resources on the net for self-learning should have been given as references or further reading.
- Instruments used:* The registration form, attendance sheet, evaluation form etc. were in place.

List of Interviewees

| Name | Function/Organization |
|---------------------|---|
| Sunil Kant Dey | Coordinator of training in Rangamati, President Rangamati Press Club |
| Monsur Ahammed | Trainee, District correspondent of Channel I and Borer dak, Rangamati |
| Nandan Dabnath | Trainee, District correspondent of Rangamati for Banglavisision and Borer Kagoj |
| Tarun Bhattacharjee | Coordinator for training in Khagrachari, President, Khagrachari Press Club |
| Jiten Barua | Trainee, District correspondent, BSS and Samoy TV, Khagrachari |
| Nurul Azam | Trainee, District correspondent, Diganto TV, Khagrachari |
| Abu Daud | Trainee, ATN Bangla, Khagrachari |
| Tamal Das Liton | Trainee, Mohana TV, Khagrachari |

| | |
|---|---|
| Nazim Uddin Dr Hassan Shahriar Julhas Alam Rezaul Karim Shahiduzzaman | Trainee, ITV Khagrachari Resource Person, Representative of Washington Post Resource Person, Correspondent, Associated Press Programme officer, News Network Editor, News Network |
|---|---|

UNESCO

Iskra Panevska, UNESCO, Delhi

Ajitha Vijayan, UNESCO, Delhi

Nargis Nyma, UNESCO, Bangladesh

Shamim Mohammed – UNESCO, Bangladesh, now on leave, interactions through e-mail

CONCLUSIONS: THE PAST AS A MEANS TO PROJECT THE FUTURE

Media Law and Media Development Indicators

As mentioned in the introduction, Bangladesh does not yet have a comprehensive media law. Lawmakers are not yet concerned about the complexity created by the growth of the media industries in Bangladesh, since there is lack of adequate data on the status of the media in the country. The media development indicators (MDIs) developed by UNESCO would enable evidence-based decision-making including the formulation of a suitable law.

The MDIs would also help IPDC to understand more clearly the priority areas for capacity building in the country. Given the present lack of sufficient data, proposals are formulated mostly on the basis of subjective perspectives and prior work. This is not to reject the important role of experience and expertise in the development of IPDC projects, but project plans need to be backed up with credible data.

Bangladesh, like most countries in the Asia-Pacific region, does not have a comprehensive data set on its media. The African, Arab and European exercises in the collection of data on MDIs could perhaps be partly triangulated against the existing data generated by IREX and others. Much of the data from Bangladesh would be fresh, and generated for the first time.

The collection of data from Bangladesh is likely to be slightly more complex than similar exercises that have been conducted in Maldives or Bhutan. It might perhaps be useful to energize the departments of mass communication at universities, the media NGOs, unions and associations and the media themselves through awareness building exercises on MDIs, to supplement the actual exercise of data collection. A project in this direction is recommended.

Television

None of the six projects in this report deal directly with television as a medium. Simply including TV journalists in training programmes for journalists may not be enough since the media is not merely about reporting, but also about communicating. The increase in the number of channels (that share professionals from TV stations) that have closed down is quite natural. It is also natural for people to learn easily by imitation, and channels with sufficient financial backing will evolve their own methods for internal trainings in the competition to grow and survive. Any intervention in the system has to be strategically appropriate to the context of the culture of breaking news and capturing eyeballs. Since the present number of channels is reasonably small, it is perhaps the right time to set up standards – ethical, aesthetic and procedural – for the future.

Community Radio

The projects that focused on community radio were appropriate and timely. A lot more needs to be done given that twelve more stations are yet to begin operations and become an accepted reality. The harshness that might be perceived in the evaluation of the incomplete project should be seen in this light.

Since there is a clear interest in the sphere of community radio among donors and grant givers of all kinds, it might be wiser to examine the kind of projects being run by the media NGOs with support from others, and to co-ordinate with other UN agencies like UNICEF and UNDP and regional agencies like CEMCA to strengthen the emerging community radio scenario in the country. Internal capacity building exercises like the ones implemented by CCD should be supplemented with inputs from international players like Radio Netherlands or Deutsche Welle, particularly in the area of scheduling, metadata, archiving, marketing etc. Quite often, in such cases local embassies and high commissions could be tapped for funding.

The recommendations for immediate action have already been made within the evaluations of the projects themselves.

Gender and Indigenous Voices

Quite often, as a matter of policy, UNESCO insists on adding a clause about the need or preference for women's participation in most projects. As has been seen in the projects relating to the capacity building of journalists, the number of women participants is low, quite often not matching the projected numbers in the proposals. In Bangladesh, the number of women in journalism is rather low and BCDJC and News Network have worked hard to rectify this imbalance.

While getting active women journalists to participate in capacity building workshops may not be very encouraging, the attempts to train 'women only' groups have had some positive outcomes. This is the strategy that both News Network and CCD normally use. Is this a better strategy than including women in the 'mainstream' trainings?

Perhaps the training of indigenous people undertaken by CCD offers us a lesson. The participants (or fellows, as they are called in Bangladesh), felt comfortable and more at ease even with people from other tribes, in their common sense of inequality. And the process of capacity building empowered some of them enough to strike out on their own in the area of radio broadcasting.

Partnerships

The IPDC has created many capable organisations through its partnerships. Each project is a learning experience and the execution of the project gives capabilities skills and knowledge to the partner. Though capacity building of the partner is not usually an explicit intention, their recognition and acknowledgement are merited.

Since the NGO sector is quite strong in Bangladesh, it might prove to be useful to undertake the capacity building of the media NGOs. This might help UNESCO to understand the present capacity of the NGOs, to help strengthen them in their chosen areas and to help in choosing the right partners.

The media has power. And people in the media too are corruptible. Unlike in Pakistan, a strong need to have a media watchdog watch powerful enough to raise a voice against the injustices of and corruption within the media itself has not yet evolved in Bangladesh. Perhaps networking the NGOs could be a part of the solution to create a watchdog to watch the watchdog of society. This step might be helpful in order to reduce the government's control over the media and to create an enabling environment for an independent media, particularly in the absence of a comprehensive media law.

If organisations like FES could step in and strengthen the associations and unions to undertake capacity building exercises, it might prove to be an excellent complementary endeavour. But this consultant would hesitate to request the same of UNESCO.

Digital and Analogue

The media in Bangladesh is slowly going digital. Procurement and processing is primarily digital now. Broadcast however is still primarily analogue. Digital terrestrial broadcasting and digital radio still have a long way to go. The availability of digital receivers at affordable costs for the people of Bangladesh is the factor that would determine the crossover.

The projects on capacity building for archiving undertaken by UNESCO in previous years will have to be re-examined to see if there could be a multiplier effect, with the already trained manpower being used to disseminate technology, techniques and processes.

Bangladesh has seen a steady growth of Internet use. However, both the print and broadcast media are yet to make optimum use of the Internet. Using the Internet to reach out is important for media owners, and that will undoubtedly be taken care of. But, for journalists, the tools, tricks and tips for using the Internet to access information effectively and efficiently have not been provided by the present set of six projects. Perhaps this matter could be addressed in future projects.

Content May Be King, but Without People...?

The majority of people in Bangladesh are involved with agriculture and related activities for a living. Although there has been an improvement in the country's health indices, health remains a major concern given the poverty and poor conditions of hygiene and sanitation. But the mass media channels – print radio and television – do not take into consideration these information needs of the majority adequately. The argument that people are more interested in politics, economics, business, sports, music and entertainment than in matters pertaining to their livelihood and day-to-day lives cannot be defended. Channel O2 in Vietnam ought to be noted as an example of a TV channel that broke even within the first year of its launch, simply because it focused exclusively on health. Entertainment and news channels do not break even that fast.

Just because people do - or sometimes cannot – voice their information needs does not mean that the media understand what people want. But then, even if some maverick does take up the challenge, usually there is not enough manpower to address such content in depth, and in a way that is engaging and meaningful. Health and agriculture reporting, programming and production in Bangladesh require some capacity building.

IPDC–UNESCO, Cluster Office, Country Office

This consultant has the impression that opposing forces (organizational coherence and the need for quick response time) might cause an oscillation between the tendencies of centralization and decentralization in the organizational ecology. Even if the hunch is true, there is no harm setting up systems to weaken the oscillation. While the organizational vision is stronger in Paris and response time is theoretically faster in Dhaka, the cluster office plays an important coordination and monitoring role in the scheme of operation of IPDC projects. The decentralization process that was initiated nearly a decade ago in UNESCO should now get further clarity in terms of delineation of roles and responsibilities at different levels.

ANNEX 1

MISSION ITINERARY AND METHODOLOGY FOR THE SIX PROJECTS

Work schedule and method

The methodology used is based on a few premises:

1. Evaluation, in the present context, is not an exam, not a fault finding mission, not witch hunting. It is an attempt to find what went right and what could be better. It is done in order to improve implementation of future projects.
2. The impact of the observer and the observed goes beyond elementary particles. The Hawthorn effect in social systems called for active involvement of the consultant in improving the efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the projects and their objectives. So the evaluation had to be participatory and non-judgmental, but drawing relevant and necessary conclusions from documents, interviews and observations.

There were 6 IPDC projects being evaluated by this consultant. Three were related primarily to print media (with some amount of participation from TV journalists) and the remaining three were related to Community Radio.

The evaluation of the six projects was taken up as a single exercise, with unified itinerary and methodology since all of them dealt with capacity building and development of media in Bangladesh. Care was, of course, taken to separate out the elements of each of these IPDC projects since there were differences between them. The 6 projects were executed by 4 organisations. News Network responsible for 2 projects, the BCDJC for one, were focusing on journalists. The CCD responsible for 2 projects and the BNNRC for one were focusing on capacity building of Community Radio professionals.

An examination of the project proposals, contracts, mid-term/final reports and other deliverables available from the UNESCO New Delhi office were studied by the consultant. The documents revealed that the projects differ in their objectives, target groups, duration of capacity building exercises, the cities in which they were held, the outputs and outcomes expected and the amount of funding received from IPDC.

Moreover, some of the projects started in 2008, some in 2009 and some 2010. One had not yet finished the project, though the project deadline was passed.

1. News Network signed a contract in Nov. 2008 for USD 25000 for a project of a one month fellowship programme to build the capacity of 75 **Young Journalists**, in Rajshahi, Sylhet and Barisal, 3 important divisional headquarters.
2. The BCDJC signed a contract in Nov.2008 for USD 15000 to promote **Investigative Journalism** and trained 77 journalists through a series of 4 workshops in Bogra, Khulna and Dhaka followed by a sensitisation seminar on investigative journalism targeting media gatekeepers and editors.
3. News Network signed the second contract in Aug.2010 for USD 25000 and the project involved training 60 journalists through a series of 4 week long fellowships for **Journalists of three Hill Districts** - Bandarban, Rangamati, Khagrachari.
4. The CCD signed the first contract in Sept. 2010 for USD 21000 to train 25 young **Women on Radio Journalism and Production** through 3 trainings of 10 days each and a 3 month long fellowship in Rajshahi ending in the production of 25 radio programmes
5. The second contract signed by the CCD in January 2010 for USD 32000 called for the training of 25 **Indigenous People on Radio Journalism and Programme Production**, through 3 ten-day trainings in Rajshahi and a 3 month fellowship with an output of 25 radio programmes.
6. The BNNRC signed a contract in Dec 2009 for USD 30000 that involved capacity building of 150 **Community Radio Personnel**, publication of 12 newsletters and a directory of Community Radio

stations in Bangladesh and the creation of a webportal on Community Radio. This was the only project which was not yet completed.

Besides the study of the proposals, contracts, curricula and schedules and templates of training, Trainer CVs, Participant details, Mid term and final evaluation reports available from the UNESCO Delhi office, the consultant interviewed the people in the CI sector UNESCO Delhi office, the UNESCO country office in Bangladesh, the officials of the 4 NGOs - the BNNRC, the CCD, the BCDJC and News Network - Coordinators, Trainers, Resource People – a sample from the total of 30 people, - Trainees – a sample from a total of about 375 people, besides some representatives of the indirect beneficiaries, the media organisations – print, radio, TV. It is not possible or even necessary to interview all the people concerned and to visit all project locations to do an evaluation. So the sample of trainees was kept to a feasible number possible in each location. In the case of the same capacity building exercise done in three or more locations, two sites were taken up for visit.

The trajectory of the interviews was to find out what could be done to improve the efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the projects. The first draft of this evaluation report was sent to the News Network for suggestions and comments. The feedback was taken from UNESCO offices in Dhaka and New Delhi also before finalising the report on this project.

Itinerary

The itinerary was discussed with the four organisations in Bangladesh and was revised twice. The itinerary as given below is the final actual one.

- 22nd September 2011 – Meeting with Nilanjana Gupta of Jadavpur University Radio, a resource person for the BNNRC project
- 7th Arrival in Bangladesh – Meetings with Shahiduz Zaman of News Network, Muhammad Nurul Hassan of BCDJC, staff members of the BNNRC, a sample of Community Radio initiators, Nyma Nargis of the UNESCO office, Resource people used by the BCDJC and News Network and some trainees as well as some journalists who were not trained and a visit to Independent, a TV station.
- 11th to Sylhet – meeting with the co-ordinator and participants of the News Network project of capacity building of young journalists
- 12th Dhaka – report of findings to the News Network, meetings with the BCDJC and the BNNRC, visit to NIMC and meetings with the resource people used by the BNNRC,
- 19th Rajshahi - Meetings with G M Mourtoza of the CCD, Meetings with resource people from the Dept. of Mass Communication and Journalism, Rajshahi University, sample of trainees from the two projects by the CCD (both young women and indigenous people), trainees from the BNNRC project, coordinator and trainees from the News Network project for young journalists, visit to a local newspaper office
- 22nd Bogra to meet the coordinator and a sample of trainees from the BCDJC project of promoting investigative journalism.
- 23rd Dhaka – meetings with News Network and the BCDJC for reporting the findings and clarifications,
- 24th Rangamati to meet the coordinator and a sample of trainees from the News Network project for the hill districts
- 26th Khagrachari - to meet the coordinator and a sample of trainees from the News Network project for the hill districts
- 27th Dhaka - AH Baziur Rahaman, BNNRC, meetings with more trainees from the BCDJC project, visit to ABC radio to meet resource people used in the CCD project,
- 1st November 2011, Kolkata – to visit the Jadavpur University Community Radio and Webel Mediatronics and to meet the resource people used by the BNNRC
- 4th November, New Delhi

Sources: Proposal to IPDC, Contract from UNESCO Delhi, revised budget and work plan, mid-term status report, final report, expense statement.

| | |
|---------------------------------------|--|
| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
| NAME | Mrs Laura Fährdrich |
| Nationality | Swiss |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Responsible for Communications and Institutional Relations, CERES – Ecuadorian Consortium for Social Responsibility; • Regional Communications Manager for Latin America; Netherlands Development Organization, Quito, Ecuador • Communications Manager, United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR), New York, USA |

EVALUATION REPORT

| | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PROJECT TITLE | STRENGTHENING THE ROLE OF JOURNALISM IN THE BUILDING OF TRUST BETWEEN NATIONS: COLOMBIA, ECUADOR, VENEZUELA |
| BUDGET CODE | 354 RLA 5095 |
| CATEGORY | Promotion of freedom of expression, training media professionals, media pluralism |
| BENEFICIARIES | Colombian, Venezuelan and Ecuadorian media professionals. |
| MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY | MPP: Medios Para la Paz (Media for Peace) |

A - BACKGROUND AND EVALUATION METHODOLOGIES

1. Background of “Strengthening the Role of Journalism in the Building of Trust between Nations: Colombia, Ecuador, Venezuela” Project

Based on documents provided by the UNESCO Office, the project may be described as follows:

- It was conducted during 2010 and early 2011.
- It provided training to media professionals from Colombia, Ecuador and Venezuela.
- Professionals were trained as “Trainers of trainers” so that they could raise awareness of journalists in their respective countries on conflict-related issues in the Andean Region.
- Trainings workshops were conducted with the aim of influencing the information agenda and improve the treatment of border-related issues in the 3 countries.
- Support from IPDC/UNESCO was provided to conduct an exploratory round table to identify the action plan and 2 bi-national training workshops to treat border issues and influence information agenda.

2. Purpose of the Evaluation

This external evaluation has been commissioned by the UNESCO Office in Quito, on behalf of the International Programme for the Development of Communication (IPDC). The IPDC Bureau will present the evaluation report and lessons learned to the next IPDC Council session.

The IPDC promotes media development in developing countries, by facilitating the growth of free and pluralistic media. The project “Strengthening the Role of Journalism in the Building of Trust Between Nations: Colombia, Ecuador, Venezuela” was viewed as in line with the priorities of the IPDC.

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the project funded by IPDC. It will analyze the implementation process and identify results, achievements and challenges, and indicate future perspectives of each project.

3. Scope

This evaluation covered the entire period funded by IPDC. In relation with evaluation criteria, the following aspects were addressed and assessed in this evaluation.

1. Efficiency

- Adherence to the approved work-plan, modifications if any, and an overall assessment of project execution.
- Description of physical outputs, particularly those resulting from IPDC assistance.
- Adherence to the project timetable and problems encountered, if any.
- Sufficiency of financial projections vis-à-vis actual costs incurred; purchasing, staff recruitment, and other services directly administered by UNESCO

2. Effectiveness

- Results achieved by the project
- Overall usefulness of project outputs and results, and effectiveness in the delivery of project inputs
- Problems encountered in meeting project objectives; Inputs and factors (planned or unplanned) which contributed to the efficient implementation of activities, if any.

3. Impact

- Immediate effect on identified target groups and other affected groups, if any, besides those originally identified.

4. Sustainability

- Planned use of project results.
- Future perspectives and recommendations

Evaluation Methods

Conduct interviews and discussions with project officers at UNESCO Quito Office, and with the beneficiaries in the country/countries where the project has been implemented; conduct observation of physical outputs, if any.

The following four main methodologies were used for data collection:

- Desk study – Review of project documents
- Interviews and discussions
- Observations

B - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

This project aimed to train media professionals from Colombia, Ecuador and Venezuela, linked to well-known and respected media as “trainers of trainers” so that they can raise awareness of journalists in their countries on conflict-related issues and have an influence on the information agenda and improve the treatment of topics concerning the relations amongst these 3 countries.

1. PROJECT TITLE

STRENGTHENING THE ROLE OF JOURNALISM IN THE BUILDING OF TRUST BETWEEN NATIONS: COLOMBIA, ECUADOR, VENEZUELA

2. BUDGET CODE: 354 RLA 5095

3. CATEGORY: All types of media (Press, radio, TV, digital)

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARIES: Colombian, Venezuelan and Ecuadorian media professionals.

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: MPP: Medios Para la Paz (Media for Peace)

4.3. BUDGET: Total cost of Project: US\$ 45 370
Amount requested from IPDC: US\$ 38 670

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

- To contribute to a fairer, more balanced and pluralistic information agenda and improved way of reporting on border issues between Colombia, Ecuador and Venezuela.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

- To train media professionals linked to well-known and respected media from Colombia, Ecuador and Venezuela for them to be “trainers of trainers” and allow them to transmit to journalists of their respective countries, a fairer way to report on conflict-related issues and have an influence on the definition of the media agenda and treatment of the issues concerning relations among the Andean countries.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- An exploratory round table in Bogota, to propose an action plan for the two bi-national training workshops for Colombia and Ecuador.
- Two bi-national training workshops for reflection and training of a total of 21 journalists in charge of international issues: 7 from Colombia, 7 from Ecuador, and 7 from Venezuela.
- Creation of a network of journalists to continue collaborating on border issues consideration and reporting after the project is over.
- Two case studies of current regular media coverage of bi-national relations, to be used and studied in future training.
- Minutes of the meetings detailing the initial process and the training sessions.
- Three journalistic reports to collect the main considerations, photos and audio/video interviews.
- A dissemination campaign of the results through MPP’s Network (5,200 members in August 2009) and website (47,000 hits a month), as well as to IDPC, UNESCO and other actors.

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries): Media professionals from Colombia, Ecuador and Venezuela.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$38 670

Assistance approved by IPDC: **US\$33 000**

The approved amount was used for the following activities:

1. A 2-day exploratory round table in Bogotá. The exploratory meeting aimed at helping shape the project. The goal was to define a starting point in the collective construction, and obtain fundamental local support in each country, for the contents and tools to be used in the training stage.
2. Two 2-day bi-national training workshops for media professionals of the 3 countries that took place in Bogotá and Quito.
3. The experience's follow-up, systematization and dissemination. A team of professionals carried out this task which had a double goal: 1) serve as a tool for reflection among participants, and, 2) become future training documents to raise awareness and to share information.
4. Support and evaluation. The entire project was evaluated by participants and experts using forms and face-to-face and/or virtual meetings to exchange perceptions among the instructors, academia and/or organization members in all 3 countries. All this information was part of the reports presented to UNESCO.

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1. Agency contributions

7.2. Other: There were no other contributions.

7.3. Time schedule/project duration: April 2010 – April 2011

C - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

The evaluation assessed the progress, achievements or non-achievements and the satisfaction of the beneficiaries. As recommended by UNESCO, the results, cost-effectiveness, development impact and sustainability of the project were all examined.

Overall all objectives were achieved by MPP as planned. More details about the implementation and results are shared below.

8.1. Long-term objectives:

- To improve journalists' and other key actors' informative agenda related to border issues in the 3 countries.
- To raise awareness about the importance of information as a public good.
- To deepen the way bi-national issues are dealt with by the media.

8.2. Short-term objectives:

- To raise awareness among journalists about priority issues and about their duties and responsibilities.
- To create a common reflection and exchange space for journalists focused on border and/or bi-national issues.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

9.1. Activities:

1. A 2-day exploratory round table in Bogotá. The exploratory workshop aims at helping shape the project. The goal is to define a starting point in the collective construction, and obtaining fundamental local support in each country, for the contents and tools to be used in the training stage. MPP identifies 4 professionals in each country: an editor from a media outlet, a social and political analyst, a journalist

covering international affairs, and a board member from a journalist association, so that they can provide comments on the design of the workshop. In total 12 high-level and respected professionals participate in this activity (4 from each country). This is planned to be a closed meeting. The meeting's participants' responsibility is to produce a fully detailed agenda for the two bi-national training workshops, as well as a work plan and next steps.

2. Two 2-day bi-national training workshops for media professionals of the 3 countries taking place in Bogota and Quito.

Training workshop 1: Attended by 14 media professionals (7 from Colombia and 7 from Ecuador)

Training workshop 2: Attended by 14 media professionals (7 from Colombia and 7 from Venezuela).

MPP proposed to focus on the following topics for these two activities:

- Contexts and actual cases setting the stage (reality situation of the countries from a central and border areas' point of view);
- Case presentation and analysis. Press, radio, television and digital media. Emblematic cases, considering the "visible" and the "invisible" aspects of information shared by the media;
- Role and possibilities of journalists and journalism (duties and responsibilities);
- Working tools; Conclusions. Proposals, possibilities and alternatives (co-creation).

3. The experience's follow-up, systematization and dissemination. A team of professionals carries out this task which will have a double goal: 1) serve as a tool for reflection among participants, and, 2) become future training documents to raise awareness and to share information. The methods used to collect reflections and learnt lessons were:

- The minutes from the 3 meetings (including testimonials, contributions, expectations, conclusions);
- Three journalistic reports including graphic materials from each meeting;
- One final document that will contain the entire process;
- One special report to be spread through MPP's Network (5,200 members in August 2009) and websites (47,000 hits a month), as well as IPDC, UNESCO and other actors.

4. Support and evaluation. The entire project was evaluated by participants and experts using forms and face-to-face and/or virtual meetings to exchange perceptions among the instructors, academia and/or organization members in all 3 countries. All this information was part of the reports presented to UNESCO.

9.2. Project management:

The project's management was very good and, despite the limited resources, the goals of the project were achieved as planned. This was made possible thanks to an excellent management of financial resources.

The pre-work conducted by MPP in order to select the participants to all meetings was vital to ensure the success of the project. The only invitees were the main media professionals (press, radio and television) of the 3 countries, most important actors and key journalists covering border issues or bi-national issues. This targeted selection of the experts/speakers was very important since their wide experience in journalism and media had a direct and significant impact on the workshops' results.

The number of participants was limited due to budget constraints. Therefore it would have been difficult to reach a higher number of trainees. According to MPP this resulted in a very positive outcome since the quality of the debates and the interaction among all participants was excellent. With a larger group it would have been difficult to obtain such dynamism. The goals of the project were reached.

The first event, the exploratory meeting held in Bogota, with the participation of 12 well-respected professionals, was crucial to determine the agenda of the 2 bi-national training workshops and the themes they should focus on. The 2 bi-national training workshops were conducted as foreseen with a slight adjustment in the date for the meeting held in Quito due to incompatibilities of the invited expert's agenda (Francisco Thoumi).

9.3. UNESCO services:

MPP values very positively UNESCO's collaboration, as well as the flexibility and availability of its Quito Office team. Members of UNESCO's team were very helpful in selecting the participants and the experts and key for the logistics coordination. Thanks to UNESCO's Quito Office, the use of resources could be optimized. Common interests between UNESCO and MPP were obvious; therefore, common co-operation was easy and efficient.

9.4. Collaboration:

Collaboration with other actors went smoothly and had an impact on the positive outcomes of the project. Institutions such as UNHCR, the Ecuador's Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Colombia Codhes, and FLACSO, contributed to the meeting's organization, the content of the workshops and to obtaining the best results.

The long experience (13 years) and very good relations of MPP with media contributed greatly to the final outcomes of the meetings. It also facilitated securing the best experts/trainers for each topic.

9.5. Project monitoring:

The project was intended mainly to make an initial diagnostic of the situation and to trigger a discussion about border issues and their media treatment. According to MPP the limited resources did not allow them to include a monitoring component to the project.

The project's beneficiaries evaluated positively all aspects of the courses: contents, usefulness and organization. MPP used surveys at the end of each meeting to obtain participants' feedback. Some of this feedback was filmed and it is available in the online multimedia summary.³

No other evaluation or monitoring activity is planned in the near future.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

10.1. Results:

The project achieved the objectives and reached the target group as planned. The important issue in this project was not the number of participants but the quality of their profiles and their potential to influence the informative agenda in their respective countries.

According to one of the experts/instructors: "Exchanges like this one are indispensable for journalists, so that they can deepen their knowledge about themes they normally cover and also, because it allows them to hear and understand different points of view", Alvaro Sierra, Editor-in-Chief, Semana, Colombia.

Experts and beneficiaries coincide in saying that the best results were obtained thanks to the perfect balance between lectures and debate spaces and also thanks to the diversity of instructors and participants.

10.2. Cost-effectiveness:

MPP used the resources very efficiently. They optimized the use of resources by relying on media partners and UNESCO's team in Quito. Some experts, such as Francisco Thoumi, agreed not to charge their regular fees to be able to participate in the workshops, share their knowledge about the issues treated and benefit journalists attending.

The target group was very well selected and this ensured the positive results of the projects and the influence on the informative agenda of the 3 countries.

³ <http://mediosparalapaz.org/elpapeldelperiodismo>

10.3. Development impact:

Journalists were trained on issues related to bi-national issues, especially on border-related topics. According to MPP, these training activities contributed greatly to the knowledge and awareness of journalists participating. The investigative reports conducted after the workshops were proof of their usefulness. A concrete example of the outcomes and the project's impact is the joint work by NTN24 (Colombia) and TeleAmazonas (Ecuador) on refugees' situation in the Ecuadorian-Colombian border.

A greater positive impact could be achieved if such training activities or projects were carried out for a longer period of time. The results would be more evident and visible to the public opinion.

10.4. Sustainability:

The project was limited in time and funds but according to MPP the contacts among media professionals who attended the workshops are still strong. As an example, in her testimonial featured in the Multimedia tool created by MPP, Ana Marina Roura, Reporter at TeleAmazonas, refers to the active communications and collaboration between reporters at NTN24 from Colombia and TeleAmazonas. MPP thinks that they could probably find new sources of funding to replicate this kind of project.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

11.1. Project management:

Based on the experience of this project, training activities of a similar nature could be conducted in other countries of Latin America. As mentioned earlier, a meticulous selection of participants and trainers, and locations for the workshops would be key to obtain the best results.

Projects of this kind should always have a concrete output. A good way to show the usefulness of these training activities is putting into practice what journalists have learnt, as was the case in this project. MPP could compile the investigative journalism articles and create a case database for future reference in trainings to come.

According to MPP and some beneficiaries, the structure and length of the exploratory meeting and the 2 bi-national workshops was appropriate. Ideally, similar projects should always be accompanied by budgeted monitoring activities.

11.2. Recipient institution:

MPP should take advantage of the contents developed and the experts selected for these training workshops and replicate the model. MPP should continue organizing such activities in the areas of the country where border issues are present.

The beneficiary agency could find new sources of funding and include a larger number of participants. With new funds, MPP could organize new editions of this course, either finding new sources of funding or finding a way to make the project self-sustainable (charging media outlets, charging participants, etc.).

11.3. Member States:

Colombia, Ecuador and Venezuela's journalists and media outlets have clearly benefited from this project. Journalists from the 3 countries have seldom opportunities to access to this kind of specialized training workshops and even less opportunities to meet their colleagues in a neutral and relaxed context. Media professionals of the region need to be encouraged to know the topics affecting their border relations with other countries, to practice investigative journalism and to influence the informative agenda.

11.4. IPDC:

IPDC should continue funding this kind of projects in the region but to design them to last longer. It would have a positive effect on outcomes and would become more visible for the public opinion.

The activities should be organized for a larger number of participants but this could only happen if the budget available was not so limited.

A thorough follow up of the project, with funding specifically allocated to it, is essential. The achievements of such projects should not be “wasted”, they should be used and replicated.

11.5. UNESCO:

UNESCO should continue supporting similar projects in the future. The topic (border relations and media) is interesting to journalists and to public opinion. It should be a priority theme for UNESCO.

Additionally, UNESCO should also consider topics like information ethics, media responsibility and, freedom of expression. Raising awareness and increasing knowledge about these themes is crucial to reinforce democracy in the Andean Region.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

12.1. Type of project:

MPP’s team thinks that the way the participants and trainers were selected was very good and that the way in which the exploratory round table and the 2 bi-national training workshops were organized was correct. According to some MPP staff members and beneficiaries of the project, a virtual component would be very useful to strengthen the contacts among media professionals and keep them active. MPP considers that the project could have been planned for a longer period of time and that it would have had better results. Also, funding for journalistic work (investigative articles and reports) would be very positive for the outcomes and the visibility of the project.

12.2. Way of co-operation:

Co-operation with other actors and organizations was very good and coordinated according MPP and the project’s beneficiaries. All actors, organizations and individuals were satisfied with the way activities were conducted. MPP’s team considers that previous meetings with each actor/institution would have improved results even more.

Co-operation with trainers, in charge of conducting the workshops, was well balanced as a result of the constant exchange of views and priorities with MPP and UNESCO. Also, the commitment of trainers was key for the success of the project.

12.3. Inputs:

The project’s coordinators at MPP pinpointed that input about border-related issues was easier to obtain in the Ecuador-Colombia context. Venezuela’s context is more complicated and information on border issues is less accessible. The project would have benefitted from the views of a Venezuelan expert/institution but budget constrains made the participation impossible.

Beneficiaries from the Bi-national workshop held in Bogotá valued the materials (documents and references) shared by trainers and the new perspectives on border issues.

Each investigative article published after the trainings, with the help of media outlets of the 3 countries, was used as a practical example for the trainees and reinforced the concepts and priorities the trainers wanted to share.

12.4. Instruments used:

The meticulous selection of trainers and participants prior to the meetings and workshops was crucial. The goals were reached and the results were good. Participants of bi-national workshops appreciated particularly the documents and bibliography shared by trainers and organizers.

A virtual component to the trainings would reinforce key concepts, allow constant exchange of views and themes among journalists and would also make a wider participation possible.

The investigative work, which resulted from the trainings, was the perfect complementary tool to the discussions during the workshops and the conclusions of the project.

APPENDIX

Interviewees:

- Marisol Manrique, former Executive Director, MPP
- Rocío Castañeda, former Project Manager, MPP
- Álvaro Sierra, Instructor, Editor-in-Chief, Semana, Colombia.
- César Paredes, journalist at Semana, Colombia (participant at the 2 bi-national workshops).

Project Documents & Materials:

- Final Report to UNESCO, 2011
- Multimedia: <http://mediosparalapaz.org/elpapeldelperiodismo>
- MPP's website.
- Sistematización de las Evaluaciones del Encuentro Exploratorio en Bogotá (Systematized Evaluation Results of Exploratory Meeting in Bogotá)
- Sistematización de las Evaluaciones del Taller Binacional de Bogotá con periodistas venezolanos y colombianos (Systematized Evaluation Results of Bi-national Workshop in Bogotá, with Venezuelan and Colombian journalists)
- Investigative work from participants and results from bi-national workshops:
 - Investigative article: “Refugiados: un asunto pendiente entre Colombia y Ecuador” (Refugees : a pending issue between Colombia and Ecuador), by César Paredes.
 - <http://www.semana.com/politica/refugiados-asunto-pendiente-entre-colombia-ecuador/147511-3.aspx>
 - Investigative article: “El 98% de los refugiados en Ecuador son de Colombia” (98% of Ecuador's refugees come from Colombia), by Diego Alarcón.
 - <http://www.elespectador.com/impreso/internacional/articuloimpreso-236478-el-98-de-los-refugiados-ecuador-son-de-colombia>
 - Investigative work: Brief Note on refugees, on Website of Caracol Radio, Rocío Franco.
 - <http://www.caracol.com.co/nota.aspx?id=1382509>
 - Investigative Article, Colprensa News Agency, by Javier Jules.
 - <http://javierjules.blogspot.com>
 - Media Alliance: NTN24 –RCN Televisión (Colombia) –TeleAmazonas (Ecuador)
 - Media Alliance: Semana.com & Reporteros por Colombia (Reporters for Colombia)

| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
|---------------------------------------|--|
| NAME | Mrs Laura Fährdrich |
| Nationality | Swiss |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Responsible for Communications and Institutional Relations, CERES – Ecuadorian Consortium for Social Responsibility; • Regional Communications Manager for Latin America, Netherlands Development Organization, Quito, Ecuador; • Communications Manager, United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR), New York, USA. |

EVALUATION REPORT

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| PROJECT TITLE | IMPROVING THE MONITORING OF PRESS FREEDOM IN THE ANDEAN REGION |
| BUDGET CODE | 354 RLA 5096 |
| CATEGORY | Freedom of expression, freedom of the press |
| BENEFICIARIES | Civil society associations and institutions working for the defense and promotion of freedom of expression in the Andean Region (Colombia, Ecuador, Peru and Venezuela) |
| MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY | CELE – Centro de Estudios en Libertad de Expresión y Acceso a la Información (Center for Freedom of Expression and Access to Information Studies) University of Palermo, Argentina |

A - BACKGROUND AND EVALUATION METHODOLOGIES

1. Background of “Improving the Monitoring of Press Freedom in the Andean Region” Project.

Based on documents provided by the UNESCO Office, the project may be described as follows:

- It was implemented from August 2010 to October 2011.
- It provided training for civil society associations and institutions working for the defense and promotion of freedom of expression in the Andean Region (Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru and Venezuela).
- Training workshops were conducted with the aim of creating freedom of expression mechanisms in the Andean Region and therefore promote freedom of expression, pluralism and diversity in the media.
- Support was provided by UNESCO/IPDC to conduct 2 workshops to design and create the methodologies for a mechanism for the observation of violations of freedom of expression.

2. Purpose of the Evaluation:

This external evaluation has been commissioned by the UNESCO Office in Quito, on behalf of the International Programme for the Development of Communication (IPDC). The IPDC Bureau will present the evaluation report and lessons learned to the next IPDC Council session. The IPDC promotes media development in developing countries, by facilitating the growth of free and pluralistic media. The project “Improving the Monitoring of Press Freedom in the Andean Region” was viewed as compatible with the priorities of the IPDC. The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the project funded by IPDC. It will analyze the implementation process and identify results, achievements and challenges, and indicate future

perspectives of each project.

3. Scope

This evaluation will cover the entire period funded by IPDC. In relation with evaluation criteria, the following aspects will be addressed and assessed in this evaluation.

1. Efficiency

- Adherence to the approved work-plan, modifications if any, and an overall assessment of project execution.
- Description of physical outputs, particularly those resulting from IPDC assistance.
- Adherence to the project timetable and problems encountered, if any.
- Sufficiency of financial projections vis-à-vis actual costs incurred; purchasing, staff recruitment, and other services directly administered by UNESCO

2. Effectiveness

- Results achieved by the project
- Overall usefulness of project outputs and results, and effectiveness in the delivery of project inputs
- Problems encountered in meeting project objectives; Inputs and factors (planned or unplanned) which contributed to the efficient implementation of activities, if any.

3. Impact

- Immediate effect on identified target groups and other affected groups, if any, besides those originally identified.

4. Sustainability

- Planned use of project results.
- Future perspectives and recommendations

Evaluation Methods:

Conduct interviews and discussions with project officers at UNESCO Quito Office, and with the beneficiaries in the country/countries where the project has been implemented; conduct observation of physical outputs, if any.

The following three main methodologies were used for data collection:

- Desk study – Review of project documents
- Interviews and discussions
- Observations

B - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

This project's goal was to assist the organizations defending freedom of expression (GALI – Andean Group for Freedom of Information, from its Spanish acronym), in keeping track of violations of freedom of expression and of the press in the Andean countries (Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru, Venezuela) in a coherent and concerted way.

1. PROJECT TITLE
IMPROVING THE MONITORING OF PRESS FREEDOM IN THE ANDEAN REGION

2. BUDGET CODE: 354 RLA 5096

3. CATEGORY: Freedom of expression, freedom of the press.

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARIES: Civil society associations and institutions working for the defense and promotion of freedom of expression in the Andean Region (Colombia, Ecuador, Peru and Venezuela)

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: CELE – Centro de Estudios en Libertad de Expresión y Acceso a la Información (Center for Freedom of Expression and Access to Information Studies), University of Palermo, Argentina.

4.3 BUDGET: Total cost of Project: US\$ 44 900
Amount requested from IPDC: US\$ 36 800

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

- To improve press freedom monitoring mechanisms in the Andean Region and through that, promote freedom of expression, pluralism and diversity in the media of Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru and Venezuela. The project's objective is related to category 1 of IPDC's Media development indicators, developed by UNESCO.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

- To create a database that contains more and better information about violations of freedom of expression, freedom of the press and freedom of speech in the Andean Region.
- To develop indicators focusing on violations of freedom of expression.
- To improve data analysis by member organizations of GALI so that they can propose public policies focused on freedom of expression and freedom of the press.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- An initial workshop between CELE and the organizations with two representatives of CELE, and one representative of each of the organizations that make up GALI, totaling seven participants.
- A 6 months analysis report on GALI's monitoring work.
- A final report containing specific recommendations on the improvement of the monitoring instruments; a proposal for legislative changes and promotion of best practices; an evaluation, according to the data obtained, of the state of freedom of the press in the Andean Region during the monitoring process.
- A final workshop for evaluation between CELE and the organizations, with the same number of representatives.

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries):

Civil society associations and institutions working for the defense and promotion of freedom of expression in the Andean Region.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$36,800

Assistance approved by IPDC: **US\$15,000**

The approved amount was used for the following activities:

- Two workshops (initial and final) organized in Quito, Ecuador, between CELE and GALI's member organizations in order to create a common methodology based on each country's specific needs to monitor freedom of expression and press freedom in the Andean Region. During the first workshop (November 2010), the participants designed a pilot methodology with CELE's guidance, based on UNESCO'S Media Development Indicators, particularly the Category 1. This new methodology was put into practice by GALI's member organizations during eight months under the supervision of CELE, as a trial period. In July 2011, CELE organized a second workshop in order to define the final methodology.
- Evaluation and follow-up of alerts and registration of cases reported by organizations using the methodology they contributed to design.

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1. Agency contributions

7.2. Other:

Canadian Cooperation Agency – US\$3,500

Funds were used to finance the attendance of four additional participants from IPYS, (Instituto Prensa y Sociedad - Press and Society Institute, from Peru).

In-kind contribution by CELE, Palermo University

CELE covered Eduardo Bertoni's time/salary and logistics for the meetings.

7.4. Time schedule/project duration:

August 2010 - October 2011

C - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

The evaluation assessed the progress, achievements or non-achievements and the satisfaction of the beneficiaries. As recommended by UNESCO, the results, cost-effectiveness, development impact and sustainability of the project were all examined.

Overall all objectives were achieved by CELE as planned. More details about the implementation and results are shared below.

8.1. Long-term objectives:

- To create a monitoring tool for violations of freedom of expression in the Andean Region.
- To promote freedom of expression, pluralism and diversity in the media of Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru and Venezuela.
- To improve data analysis by member organizations of GALI so that they can propose public policies focused on freedom of expression and freedom of the press.

8.2. Short-term objectives:

- To strengthen GALI and its organizations
- To create a database that contains more and better information about violations of freedom of expression, freedom of the press and freedom of speech in the Andean Region.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

9.1. Activities:

- Assisting GALI in the design and creation of methodologies for the observation of violations of freedom of expression due to the lack of a legal framework or its flaws and the way laws are applied.
- Evaluation and follow-up of alerts and registration of cases reported by organizations using the methodology they contributed to designed.
- Evaluation of the application of new parameters for the monitoring of violations of freedom of expression carried out by the organizations associated to GALI in Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru and Venezuela.
- Improvements and recommendations for the development of the monitoring system.

9.2. Project management:

The project's management was very good and, the goals of the initiative were achieved as planned. The management of financial resources was good.

CELE considers that the project's management was a success thanks to the good attendance and the active interactions among participants, which was key to obtaining a useful monitoring tool to report and document violations of freedom of expression. Proof of the effective management is that some organizations, such as the National Press Association of Bolivia, implemented the monitoring tool after the initial meeting.

9.3. UNESCO Services:

CELE and GALI's members value very positively UNESCO's services, as well as the flexibility and availability of its Quito Office team. Members of UNESCO's team were very helpful in the logistics coordination and also very understanding when additional funds were requested by CELE. Also, thanks to UNESCO's Quito Office, the use of resources could be optimized.

The only thing to be improved, according to one of CELE's collaborators, is that instructions given by the UNESCO Quito Office on how to prepare technical reports could have been clearer. Also, it seems that the amount of taxes paid for wire transfers to Argentina was not clear enough. Nevertheless, common interests between UNESCO, CELE and GALI's organizations are clear and therefore common co-operation, in general, was easy and efficient.

9.4. Collaboration:

Collaboration with other actors went very well and was key to the positive outcomes of the project. All the institutions invited were leaders in their field and very keen in working together in refining the tool as much as possible to make it more useful. As an example, IPYS, the Peruvian Press and Society Institute, mobilized resources to fund the attendance to the meetings of 4 additional participants.

The only organization that contributed less willingly to the joint effort was Fundación para la Libertad de Prensa (FLIP) from Colombia. This organization already had a very developed monitoring tool on violations of freedom of expression. According to CELE the initial idea was for FLIP to share its tool with the participants but this did not happen.

9.5. Project Monitoring:

The project had a monitoring activity after the implementation. Also, to ensure the sustainability of the project through time, CELE had to continue conducting periodic evaluations of the database and to make informal suggestions to the organization.

The best way to make sure that the tool is improved and constantly updated is the regular use of it by GALI's member organizations. Since the end of the project, many of the institutions have continued feeding the database with new cases and reports.

The project's beneficiaries evaluated positively all courses, in terms of content, usefulness and organization.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

10.1. Results:

The project achieved the objectives and reached the target group as planned. The most important aspect of this project was the commitment of participants to create and improve a monitoring system and to use this system to report violations of freedom of expression in their respective countries after the meetings had taken place.

According to the beneficiaries: "The best results of the meetings are: the well-defined indicators and the possibility to compare them within the Andean Region", César Ricaurte, Director, Fundamedios, Ecuador.

"This project has been key to join forces in the work for freedom of expression in the region, we must continue to work together and promote the sustainability of the project", Ricardo Uceda, Director, Press and Society Institute (IPYS), Peru.

CELE and the beneficiaries coincide in saying that the best results were obtained thanks to the collaboration and openness of all the participants and institutions. GALI's member organizations created an online database (<http://elgali.org>) where all alerts are compiled.

10.2. Cost-effectiveness:

CELE used the resources very efficiently although the costs related to logistics (travel, taxes, etc.) exceeded the amount approved by IPDC and CELE had to make a request for additional funding (US\$ 5,000). They optimized the use of resources by relying on the University of Palermo and some of its administrative staff, mainly for logistics' coordination. Also, IPYS' additional funds from the Canadian International Development Agency made possible the participation of four additional people.

10.3. Development impact:

Institutions participated in the two meetings organized in Quito and helped develop and perfect the monitoring tool to report violations of freedom of expression. Thanks to this monitoring system the organizations are able to report all types of violations with the same indicators and are able to compare them among Andean countries.

GALI's members decided to create an online database that is regularly fed and serves as a reference on violations of freedom of expression for the whole Andean Region.

10.4. Sustainability:

The project was limited in terms of time and funds but according to CELE the relations among institutions which attended the meetings and implemented the monitoring tool are still active.

Some of the participants think that a long-term project would have had better results. Also, institutions should have financial and human resources to be able to ensure its correct implementation. One of the beneficiaries thinks that its sustainability depends on the commitment of all GALI's organizations working in the field of freedom of expression. The use of the tool, according to this participant, will help making decisions, taking joint action and carrying out investigative initiatives.

According to CELE and the project's beneficiaries a person working for GALI should follow-up on the project to make sure the tool is always used and alerts continue to be uploaded to the database.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

11.1. Project management:

Based on the experience of this project, activities of a similar nature could be replicated in the same region to reinforce the results obtained or could be conducted in other countries of Latin America. Activities of this kind should always have a concrete outcome, as was the case in the implementation of this project. The progressive use of the monitoring system and the online database clearly show the usefulness of these initiatives. According to CELE and some project's beneficiaries, the structure and length of the meetings was appropriate. But, at the same time, they indicated they would like similar projects to be longer to strengthen the interaction between GALI's member organizations and the network.

11.2. Recipient institution:

GALI should take advantage of the contents developed for the meetings held in Quito and the monitoring tool to replicate the model in other countries.

The beneficiary agency could find new sources of funding and invite more participants/institutions. Also, this funding could help reinforce CELE and its activities.

A regular follow-up by CELE or GALI could help measuring the impact of the project long-term and adjust the monitoring system.

11.3. Member States:

Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru and Venezuela's journalists and media outlets have clearly benefited from this project. Journalists from these 5 countries regularly endure the effects of attacks to freedom of expression. Public opinion and authorities of the region need to be encouraged to report these violations and take action.

11.4. IPDC:

To continue funding this kind of projects in the region but to design them to last longer. It would have a positive effect on outcomes and would become more visible for the public opinion.

The project would have a better chance to be sustainable if GALI's member organizations had enough financial and human resources to carry out a regular follow up on the monitoring tool and its use. According to CELE, GALI should have a dedicated person to ensure the adaptation and perfection of the tool through time.

11.5. UNESCO:

UNESCO should continue supporting similar activities in the future, especially to develop common indicators and tools in the Andean Region.

Additionally, UNESCO should continue raising awareness about violations to freedom of expression, freedom of speech and freedom of the press, which are very needed in this region. Another topic suggested by interviewees is freedom of association, as part of the need of strengthening of civil society.

UNESCO, CELE and GALI should find alternative sources of funding to carry out the new editions of these meetings.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

12.1. Type of project:

CELE defines monitoring activities as being dynamic and easily influenced by external circumstances. The context can have an effect on the implementation. Consequently, it is necessary to have an effective and constant commitment of the organizations. It should have a medium-term or long-term scope.

CELE also stresses the importance of designing this kind of projects for longer periods of time. Some beneficiaries consider these activities as an exploratory or pilot project, but in order to obtain better results they need to be carried out with more depth and receive continuous follow up and improvement.

According to one of the coordinators, the seemingly effortless project's implementation does not reflect the amount of work needed (technical reports, communication with member organizations, carrying out meetings, etc.).

12.2. Way of co-operation:

Co-operation with invited organizations was very good and well coordinated between CELE and the project's beneficiaries. All actors, organizations and individuals were satisfied with the way activities were conducted.

UNESCO's team also helped in perfecting the monitoring tool by giving their feedback.

12.3. Inputs:

According to the project's coordinators of CELE, the input provided by the content of the Annual Report 2010 on Freedom of Expression by the Inter-American Commission of Human Rights, which was published when one of the meetings was held in Quito, was a very important contribution to the discussions and the design of the monitoring tool.

The inputs of GALI's member organizations were key to perfect the indicators and the monitoring system. One of the participants stated that the large experience of the institutions in the field of freedom of expression was crucial to the success of the meetings.

12.4. Instruments used:

The selection of organizations and participants prior to the meetings and workshops was very useful. The goals were reached and the results were good.

According to some beneficiaries, a few virtual meetings were held to continue perfecting the monitoring tool and to define the next steps once the project came to an end.

The setting up of an online database was complementary to the monitoring tool and very useful to see the progress of the project.

APPENDIX

Interviewees:

- Eduardo Bertoni, Trainer, CELE, Argentina.
- Daniela Salazar, Consultant & Coordinator, Ecuador.
- Ricardo Uceda, Director, Institute of Press and Society (IPYS), Peru.
- Paola Aguilar, Project Coordinator, Fundamedios, Ecuador.
- César Ricaurte, Director, Fundamedios, Ecuador

Project Documents & Materials:

- Agenda of Initial Workshop, November 2010
- Technical Report for UNESCO, January 2011
- Activities Schedule, May 2011
- Final Technical & Financial Report for UNESCO, September 2011
- <http://elgali.org>

| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
|---------------------------------------|--|
| NAME | Mrs Laura Fährdrich |
| Nationality | Swiss |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Responsible for Communications and Institutional Relations, CERES – Ecuadorian Consortium for Social Responsibility; • Regional Communications Manager for Latin America, Netherlands Development Organization, Quito, Ecuador; • Communications Manager, United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR), New York, USA. |

EVALUATION REPORT

| | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PROJECT TITLE | TRAINING ON ACCESS TO INFORMATION |
| BUDGET CODE | 354 BOL 5091 |
| CATEGORY | Access to Public Information |
| BENEFICIARIES | Bolivian journalists mainly from press outlets, but also radio and television. |
| MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY | ANP – National Press Association |

A - BACKGROUND AND EVALUATION METHODOLOGIES

1. Background of “Training on Access to Information” Project

Based on a brief from documents in the UNESCO Office, the project may be described as follows:

- It was conducted during 2010 in the main cities of Bolivia.
- It provided training to 309 journalists on Access to Public Information and the existing legal instruments in Bolivia.
- It set the basis for establishing an Access to Information Monitor and Oversight Unit.
- It has received support from UNESCO/IPDC to conduct a series of conferences and seminars.

2. Purpose of the Evaluation

This external evaluation has been commissioned by the UNESCO Office in Quito, on behalf of the International Programme for the Development of Communication (IPDC) . The IPDC Bureau will present the evaluation report and lessons learned to the next IPDC Council session.

The IPDC promotes media development in developing countries, by facilitating the growth of free and pluralistic media. The project “Training on Access to Information” was viewed as compatible with the priorities of the IPDC.

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the project funded by IPDC. It will analyze the implementation process and identify results, achievements and challenges, and indicate future perspectives of each project.

3. Scope

This evaluation will cover the entire period funded by IPDC. In relation with evaluation criteria, the following aspects will be addressed and assessed in this evaluation.

1. Efficiency

- Adherence to the approved work-plan, modifications if any, and an overall assessment of project execution.
- Description of physical outputs, particularly those resulting from IPDC assistance.
- Adherence to the project timetable and problems encountered, if any.
- Sufficiency of financial projections vis-à-vis actual costs incurred; purchasing, staff recruitment, and other services directly administered by UNESCO

2. Effectiveness

- Results achieved by the project
- Overall usefulness of project outputs and results, and effectiveness in the delivery of project inputs
- Problems encountered in meeting project objectives; Inputs and factors (planned or unplanned) which contributed to the efficient implementation of activities, if any.

3. Impact

- Immediate effect on identified target groups and other affected groups, if any, besides those originally identified.

4. Sustainability

- Planned use of project results.
- Future perspectives and recommendations

Evaluation Methods

Conduct interviews and discussions with project officers at UNESCO Quito Office, and with the beneficiaries in the country/countries where the project has been implemented; conduct on-site observation of physical outputs, if any.

The following four main methodologies were used for data collection:

- Desk study – Review of project documents
- Onsite visit
- Interviews and discussions
- Observations

B - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

This project aimed to raise journalists' awareness about their right to access public information as stated in the Supreme Decree in Bolivia and to promote the optimal use of this legal instrument and investigative journalism.

1. PROJECT TITLE: TRAINING ON ACCESS TO INFORMATION

2. BUDGET CODE: 354 BOL 5091

3. CATEGORY: Access to Public Information

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARIES: Bolivian journalists mainly from press outlets, but also radio and television.

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: ANP – National Press Association

4.3. BUDGET: Total cost of Project: US\$73 965
Amount requested from IPDC: US\$23 565

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

- To contribute to journalists' awareness about the Supreme Decree on Access to Information and the not yet approved Law of Access to Information.
- To promote good use of current legal instruments to encourage investigative journalism.
- To set the basis for the creation of an Access to Information Monitor and Oversight Unit in Bolivia, to defend journalists who denounce authorities not complying with the Decree and to offer legal counseling to the media if necessary.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

- To develop activities oriented to inform and train journalists to know and understand the legal norms and mechanisms to exercise their right to access public information.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- To train 260 Bolivian journalists from 9 departments of the country in the use of the Decree of Access to Information and its importance in promoting investigative journalism;
- Twelve workshops at media outlets (6 in La Paz, and another 6 in Santa Cruz de la Sierra) for a total of 180 journalists.
- Two workshops (1 in Cochabamba and 1 in Sucre) for a total of 80 journalists.
- To establish the basis of an Oversight Unit to oversee, report threats and give advice to journalists and media outlets that appeal to the Decree of Access to Information.
- To provide information through ANP's website in order to spread documentation and complaints about any non-compliance detected.

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries):

Journalists based in main cities of Bolivia who work in newsrooms in press, radio and television.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$23,565
Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$22,000

The approved amount was used for the following activities:

- 10 conferences and 2 seminars facilitated by an international expert for more than 300 journalists.
- 2 workshops of 8 hours each, presented by an international expert and for more than 170 journalists, and 2 conferences for 30 journalists each.
- Set the basis for an Access to Information Monitor and Oversight Unit.
- Design of a pilot for investigative journalism.
- Development of a guide to access public information in Bolivia.
- Publication of the magazine "Freedom of Expression and Law on Racism and Discrimination".
- Link for accessing information created on ANP's website to disseminate data and alerts.

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1. Agency contributions

7.2. Other:

Financial contributions:

There were two additional funding entities:

- Spanish International Cooperation Development Agency (AECID): US\$2,000
- AVINA Foundation: US\$3,000

Their funds were used partially to cover the fees and travel costs of international experts.

In-kind contributions: Media outlets agreed in conducting the training activities in their facilities, helping with the venue, logistics, and basic materials. Also, institutions such as CAINCO, Proceso and others helped securing venues and speakers.

7.5. Time schedule/project duration: April 2010 – February 2011

C - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

The evaluation assessed the progress, achievements or non-achievements and the satisfaction of the beneficiaries. As recommended by UNESCO, the results, cost-effectiveness, development impact and sustainability of the project were all examined.

Overall all objectives were achieved including the basis for an Access Information Monitor and Oversight Unit. More details are given below.

8.1. Long-term objectives:

- To contribute to journalists' knowledge about the legal instruments available to them to access public information.
- To create the basis for an Access to Information Monitor and Oversight Unit in Bolivia, and generate a system of defense for journalists who report authorities not complying with the existing Decree.

8.2. Short-term objectives:

- To carry out information and training campaigns for journalists intended to inform them about their right to information.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

9.1. Activities:

- 10 conferences and 2 seminars facilitated by an international expert for 309 journalists.
- 2 workshops of 8 hours each, presented by an international expert and for 177 journalists, and 2 conferences for 30 journalists each.
- Set the basis for an Access to Information Monitor and Oversight Unit.
- Design of a pilot for investigative journalism.
- Development of a guide to access public information in Bolivia.
- Publication of Magazine titled "Freedom of Expression and Law on Racism and Discrimination".
- Link for accessing information created on ANP's website to disseminate data and alerts.

9.2. Project management:

Leadership of Juan Javier Zeballos and its team was key to the success of the project. The optimum management was proven by not only reaching the objectives of the project but also by the excellent management of financial resources. The training programme was conducted as planned with a success that surpassed expectations in terms of impact and reach. The number of trainees exceeded the 180 foreseen and reached 309.

The Access Information Monitor and Oversight Unit was not created because there is not enough funding and staff is needed. ANP calculates the funds needed to create the Unit in approximately US\$45,000.

The success of the project was also proven by the wide coverage of media, especially the conference carried out in La Paz. This positively contributed to encourage debate about freedom of expression and access to public information.

Some external factors, mainly transportation problems (blockage of roads) and weather conditions, complicated the participation of journalists from other cities like Potosí and Tarija.

Also, the local context, particularly the national political situation affected the regular implementation of the project. One of the main issues was the adoption of the Law Against Racism and Discrimination, which had a negative effect on freedom of expression in the country. This national context hinders media's work and contributed to Bolivia's secrecy culture, which is entrenched in the local mentality and institutions. There is a lack of interest of the current government to encourage the adoption of the Law on Access to Public Information.

9.3. UNESCO services:

ANP values very positively UNESCO's services and the flexibility and availability of its Quito Office team. Also, common interests between UNESCO and ANP and UNESCO's suggestions to the project were highly valued.

9.4. Collaboration:

Both AVINA and AECID were very interested in the topic and contributed financially and not financially to the projects and its success.

There is a close collaboration between ANP and all media actors in Bolivia.

In-kind contributions were made by CAINCO and Proacceso to make the conferences and seminar possible.

9.5. Project monitoring:

A follow-up of 12 requests of public information sent by journalists participating in the conferences and seminars was conducted in the weeks and months following the activities. All activities, its topics, experts, usefulness and organization were evaluated by ANP through a simple survey. The conferences and seminars were positively evaluated by the beneficiaries of the project.

No other evaluation or monitoring is planned in the months and years to come.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

10.1. Results:

The project's results surpassed the planned objectives and expectations since it was planned for 180 journalists and finally 309 were trained (132 women and 177 men).

The initial plan was to have journalists only from the press, since ANP is specialized in this type of media but the project's topic and quality attracted journalists from other media like radio and television.

The participants expressed their satisfaction:

- “It was great to get to know our rights and know how to take the first steps to access public information, to prepare the requests and follow up on them”, Elizabeth Arrázola, Editor-in-Chief, Los Tiempos, Cochabamba.
- “We learnt not only about our rights but also about the ethical limits of journalism, for example, not to use it as a personal vendetta, respecting public opinion”, Ghilka Sanabria, Editor, Diario de La Paz.
- “Journalists must know that access to public information is a right but also an obligation towards society”, Grover Yapura, Director, Oxígeno Magazine, La Paz.

The project reached not only the main cities of the country (La Paz, Santa Cruz, Cochabamba) but also smaller cities like Sucre, Potosí, Tarija.

A section on ANP’s website has been fed with complaints/requests from journalists. Also, access to information mechanisms, documents and support information is being shared and disseminated by ANP’s website (www.anpbolivia.com).

Civil servants were invited to attend the conferences and seminars but only a few participated. Succeeding in having a small number of civil servants attending is already a great achievement in Bolivia’s context.

Additionally, ANP managed, with the remaining funds, to organize a conference on the “International Legal Standards on Press Freedom and Freedom of Expression” in La Paz on December 17, 2010. The conference presented the results of a study made by the Uruguayan expert Edison Lanza, on the Bolivian legal framework and was attended by 75 participants. The study focused particularly on the recently approved Bolivian Law Against Racism and Discrimination. One of the main aims of the law is to promote equality among citizens of Bolivia but was formulated in a way that it may jeopardize fundamental rights like freedom of expression and information. The output of the conference is a 40-page publication presenting the main findings of the study.

10.2. Cost-effectiveness:

ANP used the resources very efficiently to the extent of succeeding to carry out new events, such as the conference on the “International Legal Standards on Press Freedom and Freedom of Expression” and produce new materials to complement the activities already conducted.

10.3. Development impact:

The basis for an Access to Information Monitor and Oversight Unit has been successfully set. The first steps have been taken for overseeing, reporting threats and counseling journalists and media outlets that appeal to the Decree of Access to Information, as the first cases presented prove. With proper funding, an Access to Information Monitor and Oversight Unit could be created.

This project has definitely contributed to the awareness and knowledge of journalists about their rights and the legal instruments available to access public information. It has encouraged the development of fact-based investigative journalism in Bolivia.

It has been key to carrying out these conferences and seminars in secondary cities and departments of the country. The project has reached journalists from the main newspapers and media outlets at a national level. This is a rare occasion for journalists outside capital cities to benefit from high-level expertise.

Some beneficiaries mentioned that these training activities have changed the way they practice their profession. Now, they not only know their rights better but also are aware of their responsibilities and duties as media professionals.

10.4. Sustainability:

ANP is an institution funded by its members (25 media outlets). These contributions barely cover the costs of operations (administration and office costs). Consequently ANP depends on International funders and other resources of funding. Any project planned and implemented by ANP will most probably depend on external funding, despite the fact that they are members of IFEX, GALI and other regional organizations.

ANP believes the best way to be sustainable is to create a network of access to public information and being the coordinating institution. That will mainly depend on the approval of the Access to Public Information Law.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

11.1. Project management:

If any similar project should take place in the future, training activities should continue to be organized in the newspapers' editorial newsrooms. That is the best way to ensure journalists participation.

Projects should always have concrete outputs like in this case. By sending requests to access public information and conducting a follow-up to ensure results, it makes the whole process tangible and useful. The results of those requests should be shared with other media even if they did not participate in the training activities.

The section of ANP's website dedicated to share information on access to public information and the publication of the study about the Law Against Racism and Discrimination, are other concrete outputs of this project.

11.2. Recipient institution:

ANP needs to find a way to generate a regular income allowing the institution to cover its costs and ensure its survival. A solution could be to open the Association to other media (not only press) and increase the number of members.

ANP needs to find a committed and charismatic leader, as was the sorely missed Juan Javier Zeballos, CEO of the Association. With his loss, a great part of the memory and history of ANP is missing even though the essential information about projects and activities is well kept by Leny Alcoreza, exceeding her administrative duties.

11.3. Member State:

Bolivia has clearly benefited from this project. Journalists need to be encouraged to request access to public information and be aware of their rights.

11.4. IPDC/UNESCO:

IPDC/UNESCO should make sure that beneficiary agency is aware of what can and cannot be funded by IPDC to avoid misunderstandings.

Some beneficiaries underlined the importance of these training activities and recommended to UNESCO to continue supporting this kind of activities, especially in Bolivia. Additionally, they congratulated UNESCO for not channeling funds through the government and hope the Organization will continue avoiding doing so. Finally, they encourage UNESCO to help creating a network of Access to Public Information in Bolivia with other organizations similar to ANP.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

12.1. Type of project:

The most important lesson learnt with regard to the type of project is that the ideal way to ensure journalists' participation is to organize the seminars in the newspapers' editorial newsrooms.

A pending issue is to make sure this type of training can be carried out in smaller cities and isolated provinces of Bolivia.

12.2. Way of co-operation:

Cooperation was smooth and coordinated according to organizers and beneficiaries. All actors, organizations and individuals were satisfied with the way activities were conducted as the surveys show.

12.3. Inputs:

Juan Javier Zeballos was one of the key speakers during the seminars. His contributions to the training activities and discussions were crucial according to all participants.

The two international experts undoubtedly added significant value to conferences and seminars. All interviewed beneficiaries agree that their input was very useful.

Funding was highly appreciated by ANP and all actors involved in the activities.

12.4. Instruments used:

The most valued instruments by the beneficiaries were the forms especially designed to request access to public information. These are available on ANP's website.

Also, beneficiaries underlined the importance and usefulness of working groups created during the trainings to prepare such requests. This gave them confidence and thus enabled them to act individually and present their own requests.

APPENDIX

Interviewees:

ANP

- Leny Alcoreza, ANP Administrative Assistant/Logistics
- Franz Reynaldo Chávez, ANP Coordinator
- Marco Antonio Dipp, President of ANP
- Marcelo Tedesqui, former Coordinator of Freedom of Expression Monitor and Oversight Unit

Beneficiaries

- Ghilka Sanabria, Editor, Diario de La Paz
- Raykha Flores, Editor-in-Chief, Correo del Sur, Sucre
- Grover Yapura, Director, Oxígeno Magazine, La Paz
- Elizabeth Arrázola, Editor-in-Chief, Los Tiempos, Cochabamba

Project Documents & Materials:

- "Venciendo la Cultura del Secreto" ("Overcoming Secrecy's Culture") – Cainfo, 2010
- ANP's Revista Libertad – Freedom Magazine, Year 2, No 2, 2010
- "Libertad de Expresión y Ley contra el Racismo y la Discriminación" ("Freedom of Expression and Law Against Racism and Discrimination"), 2010

- “Foro Internacional sobre Acceso a la Información Pública y Libertad de Prensa y Expresión” - (“International Forum on Access to Public Information and Freedom of Expression”), 2010
- ANP’s website: www.anpbolivia.com
- Request of Access to Public Information by beneficiary Elizabeth Arrázola, from Los Tiempos Newsletter, titled “Women from Campo Feliz”.
- Powerpoint presentation by Moisés Sánchez, international expert.
- Powerpoint presentation by Edison Lanza, international expert.
- Final UNESCO technical report, 2010
- “Libertad y Responsabilidad Ética en el Periodismo” (Freedom and Responsibility in Journalism”), by Abraham Santibáñez, 2010

| | |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
| NAME | Mrs Laura Fähndrich |
| Nationality | Swiss |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Responsible for Communications and Institutional Relations, CERES – Ecuadorian Consortium for Social Responsibility; • Regional Communications Manager for Latin America, Netherlands Development Organization, Quito, Ecuador; • Communications Manager, United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR), New York, USA |

EVALUATION REPORT

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| PROJECT TITLE | STRENGTHENING DEMOCRACY BY PROMOTING INVESTIGATIVE JOURNALISM AND TRANSPARENT ACCESS TO PUBLIC INFORMATION |
| BUDGET CODE | 354 PER 5091 |
| CATEGORY | Access to Public Information. Private, local and community media. |
| BENEFICIARIES | Peruvian and Ecuadorian journalists. |
| MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY | IPYS – Instituto Prensa y Sociedad (Press and Society Institute) |

A - BACKGROUND AND EVALUATION METHODOLOGIES

1. Background of “Strengthening Democracy by Promoting Investigative Journalism and Transparent Access to Public Information” Project

Based on a brief from documents in the UNESCO Office, the project may be described as follows:

- It was conducted online during 2011.
- It provided training to 60 journalists based in poor and remote areas of Ecuador and Peru on investigative journalism, journalism 2.0., and access to public information.
- It has received support from UNESCO/IPDC to create the content and the platform for 3 online courses and to implement them.

2. Purpose of the Evaluation

This external evaluation has been commissioned by the UNESCO Office in Quito, on behalf of the International Programme for the Development of Communication (IPDC). The IPDC Bureau will present the evaluation report and lessons learned to the next IPDC Council session.

The IPDC promotes media development in developing countries, by facilitating the growth of free and pluralistic media. The project “Strengthening Democracy by Promoting Investigative Journalism and Transparent Access to Public Information” was in line with the priorities of the IPDC. The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the project funded by IPDC. It will analyze the implementation process and identify results, achievements and challenges, and indicate future perspectives of each project.

3. Scope

This evaluation will cover the entire period funded by IPDC. In relation with evaluation criteria, the following aspects will be addressed and assessed in this evaluation.

1. Efficiency

- Adherence to the approved work-plan, modifications if any, and an overall assessment of project execution.
- Description of physical outputs, particularly those resulting from IPDC assistance.
- Adherence to the project timetable and problems encountered, if any.
- Sufficiency of financial projections vis-à-vis actual costs incurred; purchasing, staff recruitment, and other services directly administered by UNESCO

2. Effectiveness

- Results achieved by the project
- Overall usefulness of project outputs and results, and effectiveness in the delivery of project inputs
- Problems encountered in meeting project objectives; Inputs and factors (planned or unplanned) which contributed to the efficient implementation of activities, if any.

3. Impact

- Immediate effect on identified target groups and other affected groups, if any, besides those originally identified.

4. Sustainability

- Planned use of project results.
- Future perspectives and recommendations

Evaluation Methods

Conduct interviews and discussions with project officers at UNESCO Quito Office, and with the beneficiaries in the country/countries where the project has been implemented; conduct on-site observation of physical outputs, if any.

The following four main methodologies were used for data collection:

- Desk study – Review of project documents
- Onsite visit
- Interviews and discussions
- Observations

B - DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

This project aimed to train journalists based in poor and/or remote areas of Peru and Ecuador in methods of investigative journalism, access to public information and how to use digital tools to improve their coverage of public issues. The training workshops were carried out online and were addressed to journalists working in private or community based media.

1. **PROJECT TITLE:** STRENGTHENING DEMOCRACY BY PROMOTING INVESTIGATIVE JOURNALISM AND TRANSPARENT ACCESS TO PUBLIC INFORMATION

2. **BUDGET CODE :** 354 PER 5091

3. **CATEGORY:** Access to Public Information. Private, local and community media.

4. AGENCY

4.1 BENEFICIARIES: Peruvian and Ecuadorian journalists from poor and remote areas.

4.2 MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY: IPYS – Instituto Prensa y Sociedad (Press and Society Institute)

4.3. BUDGET: Total cost of Project: US\$ 88 800
Amount requested from IPDC: US\$ 40 800

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

To provide professional capacity building to support freedom of expression by training journalists who work for private and community-based media in poor and remote areas of Ecuador and Peru in the coverage of public issues using digital tools, the access to public information, and the practice of investigative journalism.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

To train at least 60 journalists working in poor and remote regions of Peru and Ecuador in investigative journalism and access to public information and know how to use digital tools to carry out their investigations.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- Development of a digital guide for journalists on the use of the access to public information law, which includes a compilation of cases as examples of good journalistic practices.
- At least 60 journalists trained in the use of digital tools, investigative journalism and access to public information techniques.
- Projects of journalistic investigation on local public issues making use of the digital tools provided by the training.
- Development of a digital methodological guide on journalistic investigation.
- Development of a digital basic methodological guide on how to use digital tools.
- Two national networks of journalism (Peru and Ecuador)

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries):

Journalists based in poor areas of Peru and Ecuador.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$ 40 800

Assistance approved by IPDC: **US\$ 30 000**

The approved amount was used for the following activities:

- Design of three e-learning courses on the following subjects:
 - (a) Digital Tools for Investigative Journalism;
 - (b) Access to Public Information; and
 - (c) Digital ICTs and Computer-Assisted Research and Reporting.The duration of each course was 2 months.
- Select journalists who work for private and community based media, interested in covering public issues in poor or remote regions of Peru and Ecuador.
- Select relevant cases and information to design methodological guides on the use of digital tools, access to public information, investigative journalism, and Computer-Assisted Research and

Reporting.

- Design, production and dissemination of:
 - (a) A methodological guide on journalistic investigation;
 - (b) A basic methodological guide on how to use digital tools; and
 - (c) A guide for journalists on how to access public information.

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1. Agency contributions

7.2. Other: There were no other contributions.

7.6. Time schedule/project duration: April 2010 – December 2011

C - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

The evaluation assessed the progress, achievements or non-achievements and the satisfaction of the beneficiaries. As recommended by UNESCO, the results, cost-effectiveness, development impact and sustainability of the project were all examined.

Overall all objectives were achieved but the project suffered from a significant delay in its implementation due to external factors. These factors are explained in more detail below.

8.1. Long-term objectives:

- To contribute to journalists' knowledge on investigative journalism, access to public information and digital tools to facilitate their work.
- To create a network of journalists who use digital tools for their investigative work.

8.2. Short-term objectives:

- To carry out online trainings for journalists to transmit basic knowledge notions about investigative journalism, access to public information and journalism 2.0.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

9.1. Activities:

- Activity 1: Criteria development for participants' selection.
- Activity 2: Online course on investigative journalism (8 modules)
- Activity 3: Online course on ICT tools and journalism 2.0. (8 units)
- Activity 4: Online course on Access to Public Information (8 modules)

9.2. Project management:

Management was good but encountered some obstacles mainly with an external provider. The objectives of the project have been achieved but with difficulties due to a partner's poor performance. Nevertheless, there was an excellent management of financial resources.

The contents of the three online courses foreseen were developed as planned. They were conducted according to the schedule (duration of two months). Unfortunately, the project could not respect the initial timeline due to technical problems with the selected partner, Radio Nederland Training Center (RTNC). This can be considered an external factor to IPYS' project management since they depended on the above-mentioned partner. RTNC delayed the starting date of the online courses since it did not deliver the foreseen

inputs on time. After months of miscommunications and delays, IPYS decided to work with another partner, BeezNest (www.beeznest.com), which successfully adapted the course contents to the web and created the online platform. In retrospect, the decision to change providers could have been taken earlier in order to have minor effects on the project's implementation.

Despite the problems, the project was a success. It exceeded expectations in terms of the interest of journalists and their enthusiasm. The final number of trainees was 60 as planned but overall participation in the courses reached a total of 131⁴ trainees (some journalists participated in several courses). In their evaluations, beneficiaries stated that they found the courses extremely useful for journalists of Ecuador and Peru (100% score in terms of usefulness in the final evaluations).

9.3. UNESCO services:

IPYS values very positively UNESCO's collaboration and the flexibility and availability of its Quito Office team. Members of UNESCO's team were very understanding with IPYS when the partner failed to deliver the expected inputs. Common interests between UNESCO and IPYS were evident and common collaboration worked well.

9.4. Collaboration:

Collaboration with the first provider, RTNC, was very poor and disappointing. It had a very negative effect on the project's implementation.

BeezNest on the other hand was very professional and efficient. They were key to the development of the final stages of the project and the launch during the last quarter of 2011.

9.5. Project monitoring:

The project officer conducted a survey of each course. The compiled results are available if needed. Also, the project officer is presenting a final report to UNESCO (January 2012).

The project's beneficiaries evaluated positively all courses, contents, usefulness and organization.

No other evaluation or monitoring is planned in the near future.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

10.1. Results:

The project's results achieved the objectives as planned reaching 60 participants (30 women and 30 men). Since some journalists participated in more than one training course, the combined and final number of participants in the 3 online courses is 131. The detail of participants per course is:

- Online Course on Investigative Journalism: 46
- Online Course on Journalism 2.0: 48
- Online Course on Access to Information: 37

Participants expressed their views regarding the training course:

- "This training is very useful since journalists based in remote areas don't have many opportunities to be trained at this level", Raúl Gutiérrez Jiménez, Diario La Industria, Chiclayo, Peru. Participant in: Journalism 2.0. and Investigative Journalism.
- "The course is allowing me to carry out investigative journalism (...) using the techniques and methodologies presented in the online course", Fernando Rafael Tapia Coral, Semanario Regional La Verdad, Iquitos-Loreto, Peru. Participant in: Investigative Journalism.

⁴ See "EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT" section for detailed number of participants per course and gender distribution.

- “The online training presents tools available to journalists to undertake investigations. (...) With each module, we discover new horizons”, Ximena Margarita Coronado Otavalo, Diario la Hora, Imbabura & Carchi, Ecuador. Participant in: Journalism 2.0. and Investigative Journalism.

The project successfully reached secondary cities and remote areas of Ecuador and Peru. Thanks to the courses an informal network of journalists was created.

The contents of the three courses were developed for online use and they have been designed to be re-used in future editions. These courses were illustrated by examples and cases compiled in IPYS database (Investigative Journalism Database), which were key for the good understanding of the training modules and the application of new concepts.

10.2. Cost-effectiveness:

IPYS used the resources very efficiently even though US\$ 3,000 were “lost” in the initial hiring of RTNC. A new contract had to be signed with UNESCO to extend the duration of the project.

IPYS paid more than planned to BeezNest to have their staff trained on the use of the platform. The motivation to train IPYS’ staff was to be more independent and be able to update, upload information and correct errors by themselves. This can be perceived as a long-term investment in IPYS team. If a new edition of the 3 online courses is carried out, there will be significant savings.

10.3. Development impact:

Journalists were trained in Investigative Journalism, Journalism 2.0. and, Access to Public Information. According to IPYS, these courses can be seen and used as a complement to other training activities carried out by the Institute in remote areas of Peru.

It is clear that online courses create a different interaction than face-to-face training courses as long as they complement each other and that be beneficial for participants. This kind of training activities also allows IPYS to carry out a continuous follow-up of trainees in an easy and inexpensive way.

This project has definitely contributed to the awareness and knowledge of journalists about the existing digital tools available to them to facilitate their investigative work and their access to public information.

10.4. Sustainability:

The platform and the contents of the 3 courses are already developed, therefore a new edition of the trainings could be easily carried out with minor expenses for IPYS (only the platform rental). The team is already trained to manage the contents and the facilitation of the online courses without external support. This makes IPYS less dependent on an external provider and enables them to adapt the content regularly without major difficulties.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

11.1. Project management:

If any similar project should take place in the future, IPYS could take advantage of the contents and modules developed for these training activities. These kind of training courses could include journalists of other countries of Latin America and media professionals based in main cities.

Projects of this kind should always have a concrete output. A good way to show the usefulness of these training activities is putting into practice what journalists have learnt. For instance, IPYS could compile the investigative journalism articles and include them in their case database (Investigative Journalism Database) for future reference. This would make the project’s results more visible.

According to IPYS' team members and some beneficiaries, the online platform should be improved and become more user-friendly and interactive. Sometimes the system was down and beneficiaries could not access the online platform. IPYS should make sure that technical problems preventing trainees to access the platform are reduced to the minimum or non-existent.

11.2. Recipient institution:

IPYS should select its partners better, to avoid problems like the ones encountered with RTNC. Maybe a better selecting process could be to set higher standards and make sure that partners and providers are reliable.

IPYS should take advantage of the platform and the contents developed for these online trainings. Minor adjustments and updates should be made periodically to the 3 online courses to keep them up-to-date and make them as useful as possible. The training activities could be expanded to other Latin American countries and to journalists based in capitals. These online courses could be a potential source of income for the Institute.

11.3. Member States:

Peru and Ecuador have clearly benefitted from this project. Journalists from remote and poor areas have seldom opportunities to access free training. Media professionals of the region need to be encouraged to know the tools available to them to practice investigative journalism, and to request access to public information.

11.4. IPDC/UNESCO:

If UNESCO is to carry out similar projects in the future, they could envisage focusing on training the team members of the beneficiary agency instead of relying on third parties/providers. This way, the know-how will remain with the organization's team and make the whole project more sustainable.

IPYS and some of the beneficiaries would like to include a face-to-face component to the online training to reinforce contacts and interactions amongst participants. This would contribute to the strengthening of journalists' networks in Peru and Ecuador.

Most of the beneficiaries underlined the importance of these training courses and recommended to UNESCO to continue supporting this kind of activities, especially in the Andean Region. They also encourage UNESCO to help creating networks of journalists in the region.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

12.1. Type of project:

For IPYS, the most important lesson learnt in regards to the type of project is the use of e-learning tools and the online platform. Future training courses of IPYS will benefit from this experience and methodology and the Institute will be able to train more journalists. Also, thanks to this project, IPYS improved the way to access the database information and perfected their methodologies. This online platform now can be used for other IPYS training activities such as CAPI and COLPIN.

Another key lesson learnt for IPYS is the need to improve the way they select their partners/providers. The bad experience with RTNC has served as a heads-up.

According to some IPYS staff members and beneficiaries of the project, an in-person component would complement the trainings and make the interactions amongst journalists more sustainable and fruitful. It would be easier to create and maintain a network of journalists if they met personally at least once.

IPYS has learnt a new way to train and interact with journalists, which is extremely positive for the institutions and its employees.

12.2. Way of co-operation:

Apart from the problem with RTNC, co-operation with other actors and organizations was smooth and coordinated according to IPYS' team and beneficiaries. All actors, organizations and individuals were satisfied with the way activities were conducted. Surveys made at the end of each course show that beneficiaries considered the courses very useful.

Co-operation with trainers in charge of developing the contents of the online courses was well balanced as a result of the constant exchange of views and priorities with IPYS' team members. IPYS' staff learnt that they need to give very clear instructions and deadlines in order to obtain the best outputs from trainers.

Constant communication with beneficiaries is key for the efficient development and implementation of the online courses. IPYS team needs to be pro-active and to define the deadlines well.

12.3. Inputs:

Within IPYS, the Investigative Journalism Database was one of the best inputs for the online courses. Each investigative case/article served as a practical example for the trainees and reinforced the concepts the trainers wanted to share. Enrique Flor's input was crucial. He developed the contents and decided on the structure of the online courses, which made them clear and more useful for participants.

12.4. Instruments used:

The web-based platform is a good way to reach certain journalists, especially in remote areas, and also an inexpensive way to train a significant number of trainees. It was a good tool for this type of project.

Some beneficiaries stated that the platform was intuitive enough for participants who had no major technical or IT skills.

Virtual training activities are very useful to complement face-to-face courses. But, in the case of this project, according to IPYS' staff and some beneficiaries the virtual part of the courses was not enough. A face-to-face component has to be added at the beginning of the courses to make them more efficient.

APPENDIX

Interviewees:

- Ricardo Uceda, Director, IPYS.
- Gema Pons, Programme Officer, IPYS.
- Rafael Vereau, Reporter -Trainer of Journalism 2.0., IPYS.
- Raúl Gutiérrez Jiménez, Diario La Industria, Chiclayo, Perú.
- Fernando Rafael Tapia Coral, Semanario Regional La Verdad, Iquitos-Loreto, Perú.
- Ximena Margarita Coronado Otavalo, Diario la Hora, Imbabura and Carchi, Ecuador.
- Carlos Enrique Andrade, Diario La Hora, Machala, Ecuador.
- Enrique Flor, Consultant, Journalist & Trainer.

Project Documents & Materials:

- Guía Metodológica - Curso Virtual de Periodismo de Investigación (Online Course on Investigative Journalism), 2011
- Powerpoint on 8 modules of Online Course on Investigative Journalism, 2011
- First IPYS Report & Annexes, August 2010

- Financial Report, August 2010
- Guía Metodológica - Curso Virtual de Periodismo 2.0. (Online Course on Journalism 2.0.), 2011
- Guía Metodológica – Curso Virtual de Acceso a la Información (Online Course on Access to Information), 2011
- Articles on investigative journalism from Latin America.
- Detail of number of participants
- Results of final survey to beneficiaries

| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| NAME | Mrs Iman Chamas Choucair |
| Nationality | Lebanese |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Media Consultant and Trainer • Teaching “News reporting and writing” in Arabic at the Lebanese American University in Beirut and at Beirut Arab University • Journalist at Assafir a daily political Lebanese newspaper |

EVALUATION REPORT

A DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. **PROJECT TITLE :** BUILDING INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY OF THE FEDERATION OF ARAB NEWS AGENCIES (FANA) TO OFFER MEDIA TRAINING
2. **BUDGET CODE:** 354 RAB5081
3. **CATEGORY:** News Agencies in all Arab Countries
4. **AGENCY:** UNESCO Regional Office-Beirut
- 4.1 **BENEFICIARY:** Federation of Arab News Agencies
- 4.2 **MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:** UNESCO Regional Office - Beirut,

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

This project aims at establishing a self-sustained training Centre, at the Federation of Arab News Agencies based in Lebanon, that would support the rehabilitation of journalists , editors and technicians from 19 Arab News Agencies affiliated as members to the Federation to develop their capabilities and skills through training courses and specialized workshops. The majority of these agencies are attached to the ministries of information of their countries while others operate with certain autonomy. These trainings courses will increase the journalists’ capacities towards a more objective and unbiased Media that will help in enhancing democracy and respect of human rights among others.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

- a) To establish a self-sustained training institute capable of improving journalists' and editors skills in covering and writing news in an objective and unbiased manner, enhancing democracy and respect of human rights issues within 19 Arab News Agencies.
- b) To carry out 5 workshops intended to improve the skills of 48 editors and journalists in covering and writing on Economic, political, Environment, Local Elections and Human Rights topics.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- The establishment of a self-sustained training institute capable of improving the skills of editors and journalists from 19 National Arab News Agencies members of the Federation (FANA) in reporting and writing news on economic, political, environmental, elections' coverage and human Rights topics.
- 48 Arab News`Agencies journalists and editors involved in the project acquired more awareness of business reporting, election coverage processes, environmental issues and human rights topics in three 5-days training workshops conducted to improve their writing and reporting skills on covering these topics:
 - a) 14 Arab editors were trained in 2/5 days workshops with the German Academy DW/AKADEMIE on "Production of news Videos for Television" and "Information media Coverage of Environmental affairs".
 - b) 13 editors and journalists attended a specialized workshop with Thompson Reuters Foundation designed to help journalists prepare for election's coverage in their countries and the media's role in this process.
 - c) 19 Arab editors and journalists acquired in a specialized workshop with Thompson Reuters Foundation more skills on covering, writing and analyzing economic news
 - d) 12 Arab news photographers acquired advanced techniques on photographing during a 5days workshop conducted by Thompson Reuter's chief photographer in Lebanon-Syria

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries):

19 National Arab News Agencies affiliated as members to the Federation of Arab News Agencies (FANA):

- Jordan News Agency (Petra)
- Syrian Arab News Agency (SANA)
- Emirates News Agency (WAM)
- Iraqi News Agency (INA Bahrain News Agency (BNA)
- Palestinian News Agency (WAFA)
- Tunis-Afrique Press Agency (TAP)
- Qatar News Agency (QNA)
- Algerian News Agency (ANA)
- Kuwait News Agency (KUNA)
- Saudi Press Agency (SPA)
- National Information Agency, Lebanon
- Sudan News Agency (SUNA)
- Al-Jamahiriyah News Agency
- Middle East News Agency (MENA)
- Yemen News Agency (SABA)
- Maghreb Arabe Press (MAP)
- Oman News Agency
- Mauritania News Agency

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$44,860

Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$40,000

The approved amount was used for:

Preparation and equipment of the training centre and for the development of its training plan:

TRAINING WORKSHOPS:

Participants' accommodation and hospitality at Hotel Padova, East of Beirut. (16 participants/five days);
Trainer (five days training + five preparatory days at a rate of \$250 per day);
Production of training material and Misc.

TRAINING EQUIPMENT:

20 Computers (\$1000/unit), Server and cabling, Flip chart and overhead projector;
Two translators from the Arabic to the English languages and vice versa

7.1 Agency contributions:

FANA provided training center renovation, contingencies, administrative assistant, project coordinator, communication costs, premises rent and material for two additional workshops.

7.2 Other: Thompson Reuters Foundation offered free training workshops.

7.5 Time Schedule/Project duration : 8 months

B - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

The project's overall objective combines two inter-related goals

1) To establish a training Institute to conduct intensive and specialized workshops aimed at improving and developing the skills and capacities of the personnel of 19 Arab News Agencies affiliated to the Federation of Arab News Agencies (FANA). 2) To develop and foster an independent media agencies performance in Arab countries. The 19 Arab National news Agencies members of FANA are major sources of news and information to newspapers, magazines, and T.V channels. Improving and developing the skills of its whole staff from: editors-in-chief, deputy editors-in-chief, editorial secretaries, to technicians and press photographers, is the ideal venue for the development of an independent media performance in Arab countries and subsequently to the realization of greater freedom and autonomy. This project will also contribute through improving the' skills and capacities of journalists working in news agencies, to enhance the concepts of democracy, freedom of expression and hence to bring them closer to the masses.

Short-term objectives:

The short-term objectives were well-planned and realistic, covered many topics that were of concern to all the 19 Arab News participating agencies. The workshops explored new online journalistic techniques in addition to issues related to economy, politics environment, as well as the issues of elections, human rights and freedom of expression.

The establishment of the self-sustained training institute capable of improving Journalists' and editors capacity in writing news items in an objective and unbiased manner will help in enhancing democracy and respect of human rights within these Arab News Agencies.

Improving 48 editors and journalists skills in covering and writing news on economic, political, environment, local elections and human rights topics will contribute to the development, improvement and independent performance of media in Arab countries

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities :

The Federation of Arab News Agencies (FANA) established, equipped and set up the information training centre and developed its training plan in the aim of training journalists working with various information media in general, and editors, correspondants, reporters and editing secretaries working with Arab National News Agencies in particular.

The training Institute was launched officially on the 19th of October, 2009 under the patronage of the Lebanese Minister of Information Dr Tarek Mitri in presence of FANA Secretary general Dr Farid Ayar, UNESCO Programme Officer –Beirut Mr. Georges Awad and a number of Arab Ambassadors in Lebanon in addition to the directors general of several Arab News Agencies members of the Federation.

Following the opening of the centre, three 5-days training workshops were conducted to improve 48 Arab journalists and editors writing and reporting skills on business coverage, election coverage processes, environmental issues and human rights topics.

The first workshop conducted in collaboration with the German Training Academy (DW/AKADEMIA), included two training courses (each lasting five days), and was organized between 19 and 30 October, 2009 at Hotel Padova in Sin el-Fil : The first course dealt with the “Production of News Videos for Television.” 12 editors working with the national Arabic news agencies from: Morocco, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Yemen, Jordan, Kuwait, Sudan and Egypt attended the course.

The second course dealt with “Multimedia Information Coverage of Environmental Affairs” and was attended by 14 editors working with Arab news agencies from: Morocco, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Jordan, Oman, Kuwait, Sudan, Egypt and Lebanon.

The second 5-day training workshop (12/16 April 2010) on “Human Rights and elections” covered the issue of reporting and editing elections news was attended by 16 editors delegated by the news agencies from: Jordan, Syria, Emirates, Lebanon, Morocco, Saudi Arabia, Sudan, Oman, Qatar, Yemen and Kuwait. Thompson Reuters Foundation conducted this workshop designed to help journalists prepare for elections in their countries with special focus on democracy and the media role in this process.

The third 5-day training workshop was organised between 19 and 23 Sep 2011 and dealt with covering, writing and editing economic news. 14 Editors attended this workshops from Arab news agencies from: Jordan, Lebanon, Morocco, Oman, Sudan, Syria, Saudi Arabia, Egypt, Yemen and Kuwait. The workshop focused on economic developments and how to deal with news related to the activities of big and small businesses, the global economic turmoil, the Islamic Banks, and the stocks markets.

In addition, a five-day workshop between the first of March and 5 March 2010 dealt with photographing skills. 14 photographers from Arab news agencies: Jordan, Morocco, Palestine, Saudi Arabia, Qatar, Sudan, Syria, Kuwait and Emirates acquired advanced techniques during this workshop conducted by Thompson Reuters’ chief photographer in Lebanon-Syria.

Progress reports were submitted to UNESCO Regional office in Beirut. In addition, a final detailed report was also submitted at the end of the project by Dr. Farid Ayar, Secretary General of the Federation of Arab News Agencies.

Project management :

Both FANA and the UNESCO Office in Beirut managed the project efficiently and implemented the activities according to the schedule. The secretary General of The Federation of Arab News Agencies Dr. Farid Ayar has kept in close and regular contact with the participants and maintained regular discussions with the trainers on the topics of the workshops. He even participated in some workshops and later shared his feedbacks. The collaboration between FANA and the German academy DW/AKADEMIE and Thompson Reuters Foundation has been highly productive and brought the necessary expertise to respond to the needs of this project. DW/AKADEMIE provided four professional trainers and experts in topics related to the “Production of News Videos for Television” (Mr. Hanes Ofeh Raha and Mr. Martin Hulbert) and “Multimedia Information Coverage of Environmental Affairs” (Mr. Mathias Fincler and Mr. Hanes Thraw). Thompson Reuters Foundation contributed highly to the success of the workshops by engaging 3 professional trainers and experts in the project: the media trainer and economic analysts Ms. Anatoly Verben conducted the workshop on covering and writing economic news. The Reuters photographer chief in

Lebanon-Syria Mr. Jamal Saidi helped Arab agencies photographers acquire new skills. The Thompson Reuters Foundation media trainer specialist on election coverage Ms Belinda Goldsmith conducted the workshops that focused on covering and writing election news.

UNESCO services:

UNESCO had an important role in the design and implementation of this project. The Programme Officer for the Communication and Information at Unesco Beirut office Mr. Georges Awad was also very helpful in monitoring the different workshops and conducting the activities successfully.

Collaboration:

FANA was effective in engaging collaboration with UNESCO Regional Office –Beirut, as well as by engaging participation of professional national and international trainers and experts from well respected Media organisations like the German academy DW/AKADEMIE and Thompson Reuters Foundation. Involving Thompson Reuters Foundation in implementing almost all the workshops provided multiples benefits by simplifying the financial costs (Thompson Reuters provides free training courses).

Project monitoring:

Monitoring of the project has been undertaken at the end of every workshop. FANA Secretary General participated in almost all events. UNESCO programme officer helped in adjusting the project activities when needed. Key conclusions were included in the report presented to UNESCO.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results:

48 skilled editors and journalists and editors from 19 National Arab News Agencies acquired more skills and knowledge on covering and writing news of economic, environment, local elections and human rights topics. So far, 23 editors have undertaken the “Production of News Videos for Television” and 14 National Arab News Agencies photographers learned advanced photographing techniques.

Cost-effectiveness:

Given the activities undertaken and results achieved from the IPDC contribution, the project was conducted in a cost effective manner.

Development impact :

The information media supported by this project are mainly Arab News Agencies which are considered a major sources of news and information to newspapers, magazines, and T.V. channels. Improving these agencies’ performance by developing and strengthening its staff capacities will lead to the development, improvement and the independent performance of other information media in Arab countries and subsequently to the realization of greater freedom and autonomy.

The trainees’ and trainers’ feedback confirmed that the workshops were organized at a most opportune time. The Arab national news agencies needs to develop and improve their independent performance towards greater transparency,objectivity and autonomy that will eventually lead to the expansion of their role in the market media and in various Arab national and local developments.

The establishment of the training institute in Beirut for the news agencies journalism is a very important project toward making the National News Agencies in the Arab countries independent of their governments.

Sustainability:

The workshops proved that such training for Arab National News Agencies journalists is necessary and in demand. . According to FANA general Secretariat “there is no other alternative to develop the capacities of

personnel attached to these media establishments which are considered the most important sources of news and information in some Arab countries”.

The 38th General Assembly of the Federation of Arab News Agencies (FANA) held in Beirut in December 2010 stressed on support for the rehabilitation of the editors and technicians in the news agencies to develop their capabilities through the establishment of training courses and specialized workshops and recommended the preparation for a new cycle of training sessions and workshops at the Training Institute's media. However, it seems there is a big challenge to raise substantial funding from Arab News Agencies members of FANA to sustain this institute and conduct further training workshops, as secretary general of FANA, Dr Farid Ayar mentioned in his letter to the evaluator (in Arabic) Dr Ayar said in his letter that “The so-called Arab spring and the changes occurred in some Arab countries affected clearly our training programme, so some of the agencies stopped paying their contributions for the Federation budget and thus affected the Federation’s ability to organize training courses as it usually paid all expenses except travel tickets. FANA will probably need additional funding to hold further trainings workshops in the coming year.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

The project management:

FANA should engage in an aggressive resource mobilization for the training institute to reach self-sustaining levels as it stated in its project presentation submitted to be financed by the IPDC in 2009 (The annual meeting of the Bureau of the International Programme for the Development of Communication at UNESCO Headquarters, Paris from 23 to 25 February 2009). FANA stated that it” will contribute in sustaining the training institute, caring for it and preserving its equipment. And that the costs of the training courses that will be held during the following years will be covered by Arab News Agencies” (see the project presentation). FANA may also wish to consider main enhancements to the training workshops in the future:

- a) The practical sessions should include field work assignments that test the participants capabilities in covering and writing news on economic, election and environment issues and encourage them to explore different practices and reporting styles. The suggestion raised by one of the participants (interviewed by the evaluator) in the course on economic coverage, to understand and cover the stock market news is good to consider.
- b) The photojournalism session should go beyond basic photography and deal with on the ground challenging assignments that raise social, political, environmental, humanitarian and economic issues.

Some participants complained about the **selection criteria** of the journalists and editors who attended the training workshops - a fact that undermined the positive impact of the training. One participant said to the evaluator that “there were participants who behaved like tourists, coming to have a good time, not to learn.” FANA should better-manage the selection of participants. FANA should conduct further training workshops dealing with economic issues.

The recipient institution:

The Arab National News Agencies as direct recipient institutions should manage running regular workshops of this nature for their journalists and editors. They should consider that development of the capacities of personnel operating in Arab News Agencies like editors-in-chief, deputy editors-in-chief, editorial secretaries, technicians and press photographers, is the ideal venue for the development of general performance and the realization of freedom and autonomy.

The Member State:

IPDC:

Regarding the changes occurred in some Arabic countries, IPDC should continue supporting and funding such projects that impact multiple agents in multiple countries.

UNESCO:

UNESCO is the ideal organization to lead the development, improvement and the independent performance of information media in Arab countries, and subsequently to the realization of greater freedom and autonomy. This project needs long-term monitoring by the Regional office for Communication and Information.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

Type of project:

This is a good example of the type of project that should be supported by IPDC. It includes 19 National Arab News Agencies which are considered a major sources of news and information to newspapers, magazine, websites and T.V channels on the national and the international level. It benefits many participants and allows them to exchange experiences and skills. It opens the way for a closer and better relations between Arab journalists to share their views and opinions on the political, social and economic developments in their respectively countries. As said the trainee Hasan el-Serhan from the Jordan news agency, at the end of the 5 days workshop on election coverage held at the FANA training center with trainers from Reuters Foundation "Spending almost a week here with other journalists from the region was like being part of mini Arab summit and we all learnt from each other."(Quoted from www.trust.org) Improving these agencies' performance by way of developing and strengthening editors capacities operating in them will lead definitely to the development and improvement of information media in Arab countries. However, the challenge will be to apply the acquired skills in their daily work.

The way of co-operation:

The co-operation was productive and contributed to the success of the event. It leaves the door open for other news agencies to take part in training programme. The collaboration of DW/AKADEMI and Thompson Reuters Foundation is useful and enable exchange of experiences and expertise that will contribute to a better understanding of diversity and plurality in the information market.

The inputs:

Implementing the training activities required the provision of 20 computer sets with their server, flip charts and overhead projectors. Each training session needed two supervisors to conduct it who possess expertise and vast previous experiences in teaching the subjects of writing and editing economic, environmental and political news, besides the preparation of training material.

The instruments used:

The main instruments deployed were three trainers, 3 workshops, in field assignments (on photography), practical exercises, participatory techniques such as group work, role play, audio visual tools, interactive exercises, and analysis of data and writing skills. FANA's decision to collaborate with DW/AKADEMIA (2 media trainers) and Thompson Reuters foundation experts (2 media trainers) was wise .The co-operation has been effective because the participants learned from their experiences and skills.

Mission itinerary

Work schedule and method:

A combination of methods were used : desk research, interviews via face to face meetings or via emails or phone calls, analysis of evaluation questionnaires completed by the trainees, the trainers and the training management, and review feedbacks, periodical reports on project progress, and the comprehensive final report submitted by FANA to the UNESCO Regional Office- Beirut. The evaluator conducted between 20 and 30 January 2012 face to face meetings with UNESCO programme officer in Beirut Mr. Georges Awad, Thompson Reuters trainer chief photographer Mr Jamal Saidi, 2 trainees from National News Agency – Lebanon (namely Ms Antoinette Abou Elias who attended the workshop on election coverage and the media’s role in this process, and Mr. Mouhamad Karanouh who attended the workshop on covering, reporting and writing economic news).

The evaluator asked for a meeting with the Secretary General of FANA, Dr Farid Ayar but he was on annual leave and responded to the evaluator’s questions and questionnaire by email via his assistant Ms Hilda Nassif (see Annex). The evaluator requested a copy of the final FANA’s report about project activities and impact (See Annex II). She also requested participant’s lists and contact information so as to be able to contact participants directly but FANA’s assistant said that those lists had been sent in to UNESCO and that she did not have them available. The evaluator therefore had to limit her interviews to those she conducted with the two Lebanese journalists only. The evaluator sent the evaluation questionnaire with a letter to Thompson Reuters Foundation trainer Ms Samia Tannous who referred her to the other trainer Ms Ghaida Gantous. No response was received. The evaluator reviewed trainers’ and trainees’ feedback which she had gathered via training evaluation questionnaires sent by email or via face to face meetings with the relevant persons. She also reviewed the end-of-training evaluation report submitted by FANA to UNESCO office in Beirut (*see Annex*). Research in some Arab newspapers archives and websites on the media coverage of the training workshops provided complimentary information wich was also taken into account in this evaluation.

Sources:

UNESCO Beirut Office: Mr Georges Awad, Programme Officer
Federation of National Arab news Agencies Secretary General Dr Farid Ayar
Federation Of National Arab News Agency Assistance Ms Hilda Nassif
Thompson Reuters trainer chief photographer Mr Jamal Saidi
National News Agency – Lebanon: Ms Antoinette Abou Elias and Mr Mouhamad Karanouh

Websites:

www.spa.gov.sa/ (Saudia Press NewsAgency)
www.fananews.com (FANA)
www.unesco.org/.../ipdc53_bureau_newly_submitte (UNESCO/IPDC)
www.trust.org/...blog/elections-reporting-in-beirut (Thompson Reuters Foundation homepage)

List of Interviewees

Name

Function

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Mr Georges Awad | UNESCO programme officer in Beirut |
| Dr.Farid Ayar | Secretary General of the Ferderation of Arab News Agencies |
| Mr Jamal Saidi | Thompson Reuters chief photographer- Lebanon-Syria |
| Ms Antoinette Abou Elias | National News Agency –Lebanon |
| Mr Mouhamad Karanouh | National News Agency –Lebanon |

| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
|--------------------------------|---|
| NAME | Mrs Iman Chamas Choucair |
| Nationality | Lebanese |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Media Consultant and Trainer • Teaching “News reporting and writing” in Arabic at the Lebanese American University in Beirut and at Beirut Arab University • Journalist at Assafir a daily political Lebanese newspaper |

EVALUATION REPORT

A- DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

PROJECT TITLE:

BUILDING NATIONAL NEWS AGENCY’S CAPACITY TO PROMOTE FREE, PLURALISTIC AND DIVERSE MEDIA

BUDGET CODE : 354 LEB 5081

CATEGORY: UNESCO Regional Office-Beirut
AGENCY: The National News Agency - Lebanon

4.1 **BENEFICIARY:** The National News agency (NNA)

4.2 **MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:** The National News agency (NNA)

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 Overall or development objectives:

- Empower National News Agency to set up a training facility premises in order to train its staff to acquire skills and knowledge in writing skills and online journalism and editing with emphasis on Media issues (freedom, pluralism, objectivity, etc).
- Improve NNA journalists reporting, online writing and editing skills in order to apply new Media techniques and measures towards a more pluralistic and free media.

5.2 Operational or project objectives:

- To provide pilot training for 15 Journalists working in Arabic NNA desk to improve their online writing and editing skills so as to be ethical and transparent, to make them the nucleus for improving the skills of the rest of the staff.
- To improve 15 NNA Arabic desk journalists online reporting, writing and editing skills in order to apply new Media techniques and measures towards a more pluralistic and free media.
- To train journalists from English (12) and French (15) NNA desks on the interactive and technical ways to deal with writing, editing and translating news in English and French languages.
- To improve the capabilities of the French and English desks staff in the journalistic skills related to news translating/writing and editing in these languages.

5.3 Results/outputs planned:

- Training of 42 journalists/translators working for NNA Arabic, English and French desks on writing skills, online journalism and editing skills improved in order to apply new Media techniques and measures towards a more pluralistic and free media.
- 3 Media training workshops: 5 days each

The first workshop targeted 15 journalists working for the NNA Arabic desk (2 sessions):

One session was to the enhancement of their understanding of « Media laws » and Media ethics in Lebanon, their rights and responsibilities in order for them to provide a fair and comprehensive account of events and issues. The second session attempted to review the elements of good journalistic writing from the use of active sentences to specificity and simplicity of language; while the third session was designed to improve their writing and on-line editing skills through working on several exercises covering: writing and editing news features, news stories, leads (direct and indirect), headlines, full story, use of background, quoted statements, attribution to news sources, breaking - news stories.

The second workshop targeted 12 journalists/translators working for the English Desk at NNA. It aimed to improve their capabilities related to on-line news writing and editing in English through working on several exercises covering: translation/writing, editing news stories, writing leads, headlines, use of background, quoted statements, attribution to news sources, etc.

The third workshop targeted 15 journalists/translators working for the French Desk at NNA. It also aimed to improve their capabilities related to on-line news writing and editing in French through working on several exercises: covering news story writing, style, news story writing, lead writing, headlines, use of background, quoted statements, attribution to news sources, news features..Etc

5.4 Target groups (beneficiaries): 42 Journalists working in Arabic and English and French NNA desks

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: US\$ 23 750

Assistance approved by IPDC: US\$ 15 000

The approved amount was used for:

4 Trainers: Dr Jean Karam and Judge Ziad Macna conducted training sessions for the Arabic NNA desk staff and Dr Mahmoud Tarabay for English staff and Ms Rana Moussaoui for French staff.

Local travel for trainers

Production for 3 Training workshops (5 days each)

5 computers

Preparation of material by 3 experts

Printing training material

Training hospitality: lunch + breaks

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES: None

7.1 Agency contributions

NNA provided office space to house training workshops, project coordinator, 5 PCs, logistic support, communication costs, equipments needed, and administration.

7.2 Other: None

Time schedule/project duration: March 2010-Avril 2010

B - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

The National News Agency (NNA) is a state-owned media and a main source of domestic news on the national and international level. It represents one of the reliable and objective sources of national and international news related to Lebanon. It provides news to Lebanese, Arabic and International Medias. With the fast technology development and the intense competition in the media market, improving and « pluralizing » government Journalism is widely seen as a more promising field than in the past. This factor is among the most important factors behind the need to encourage NNA to play an important role in the information society through improved training and knowledge, insuring higher professional standards and bolstering the skills and self-confidence of all journalists working in this state-owned Media.

Short-term objectives:

There were 4 immediate goals:

- To train 15 journalists from the NNA Arabic desk to be a nucleus to acquire skills and knowledge in online journalism, editing skills as well as computer and internet use with emphasis on media issues (freedom, pluralism, objectivity, transparency..Etc)
- To enhance these 15 journalists capacities to make them the core for improving the skills of the rest of the agency staff.
- To improve online writing and editing/translating skills of 12 journalists working for the NNA English desk.
- To improve online writing and editing/translating skills of 15 journalists working for the NNA French desk.
-

The immediate objectives of the project were well-timed and consistent with the long-term development objective. 42 journalists working for the NNA Arabic and English and French desks acquired more skills and knowledge in online journalism and were capable to use these skills in their daily job through applying new media techniques and measures towards more pluralistic and free media and for more active participation in the media market development.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities:

UNESCO began the implementation of the project by consulting closely with senior editorial staff of the National News Agency (NNA) on the agenda, approach, participants and facilitators for conducting the workshops. Ms Laure Sleiman, the Director of the Agency appointed the principal persons for the training workshops related to the following topics:

- (1) Ethics of Journalism
- (2) Freedom of Mass Media: Definitions and Constraints
- (4) Basic internet online skills
- (5) Sourcing Information from the Internet
- (6) Tips on online News Writing and editing and reporting

Dr Jean Karam, professor at the Faculty of Information and Documentation/Lebanese University and former Director of Annahar Training Media Center, who led the workshop on the first session dealing with “online editing and writing in Arabic”

The Judge Ziad Macna, from the judicial training institute conducted the session on ‘Laws and Ethics of Journalism’. Ms Rana Moussaoui, journalist from Agence France Press (AFP) conducted the workshop dealing with “online editing and writing in French. Dr Mahmoud Tarabay, media training consultant and

Professor at the faculty of information in the Lebanese university(LU) and Lebanese American university (LAU), conducted the session on online translating/writing/editing in English.

The workshops were held in the media training office at NNA from 22 March to 22 April- 2010. The training programme was extensive and included a range of activities. 42 NNA journalists/translators participated in the following workshops:

- Five day workshop/2 sessions on online journalism skills and media laws and ethics for 15journalists working for the NNA Arabic desk.
- Five day workshop on writing and editing/translating skills for 12 journalists/translators working for the Agency English desk.
- Five day workshop on writing and editing/translating skills for 15 journalists/translators working for the Agency French desk.

All these workshops included training on computer and internet use as well as on-the-job training where the trainers worked with the journalists/editors/translators in the newsroom on exercises from the daily news bulletins.

Project management

The project has been managed effectively by the director of National News Agency and The UNESCO programme officer in Beirut. They both undertook project daily supervision, monitoring the day by day training courses attendance, preparation, implementation and outcomes. NNA director selected 4 respected professional trainers and she submitted as well as the trainers the implementation and evaluation reports requested

UNESCO services:

The UNESCO Communication Officer in Lebanon prepared the training project with the director of the National News Agency. Progress reports by workshop and a final report were submitted to UNESCO programme officer in Beirut Mr. Georges Awad who was also present at the closing ceremony of the training.

Collaboration:

The project involved both the IPDC and the NNA as contributors.

Project monitoring:

The project was closely monitored by the UNESCO Regional Communication Office in Beirut and the NNA director through daily visits and regular consultations.

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results:

The project conducted 4 workshops. Activities succeeded in training a total of 42 journalists working for the Arabic, English and French NNA desks, mostly women, to acquire more skills in computers and internet use, and to enhance their online journalism skills: writing, reporting, editing, and translating news.

They comprised the following:

- 15 selected journalists from the Arabic NNA desk were well trained to be a nucleus for improving the skills of the rest of the staff. They received advanced training and expert consultancy on how to contribute to the improvement of all the Agency staff.
- 12 journalists working for the NNA English desk have acquired more online writing and editing/translating skills.
- 15 journalists working for the NNA French desk have improved their online writing and editing/translating skills.

The trainees enhanced their understanding of Media laws and ethics. And they were more capable to apply the online journalism writing and editing advanced skills. They learned from their training to move towards a more pluralistic and free media and to have more competitive edge in the media market.

Improving the capacities of those journalists helped to enhance their self- confidence and their appreciation and understanding and respect of their jobs as a whole. Enhancing the skills of those journalists will empower the leading role of the NNA since the improvement will appear through the quality of news delivered by the agency during and after the training sessions.

The concerns of all participants were well addressed through discussions with the trainers. As one trainer said “The dynamics were very positive and fruitful”. The project management had daily meeting with the trainers to discuss the trainees’ progress, especially because the training workshops consisted mainly of “on-the-job” training where the trainers worked with the Agency journalists and editors in the newsroom. The news written and edited and translated by NNA trainees were diffused directly online on the Agency webpage. This encouraged the trainees to take a close interest in the workshop and they showed that they had benefited from the training.

Cost-effectiveness:

The project was conducted in a cost effective manner. The US\$15 000 IPDC contribution was used as expenses connected to the 4 training workshops (5/3days each) and technical consultancies. The 4 Trainers fees have been budgeted initially by the project identification submitted to the IPDC about US\$250 for each trainer. But because these fees changed internationally between the period of the project preparation and submission in July 2008 and the period of it implementation in March-April 2010, NNA director Ms Laure Saab Suleiman explained to the evaluator that she used the savings derived from the use of only 3 trainers in the conduct of the 3 workshops to add to their fees. An amount of US\$10 000 was used for hospitalities (lunches+breaks+local travel for trainers) and production of training material. The amount of US\$5 000 was used to complement the training lab equipment provided by the Agency with 5 more computers. All these expenses seem to be reasonable and justified.

Sustainability:

The project focused on the challenge of NNA improving its quality news. The NNA is a main source of local news on the national and international level. In August 2008, 82 million hits were registered on the NNA website. The National news Agency has a reputation for integrity and objective reporting, but with the actual fast technology development , and the challenges faced in a very competitive market, the only sustainability NNA could achieve as a state-owned Agency in the near and long term would be to focus on providing the best training programme to its staff to enhance their skills and keep the lead in the media sector through its website as a well-established online media organization that can attract a large audience and provide them with the best quality output.

The staff of NNA is however still using much of the outdated printing media standards. NNA’s own assessment of its current situation showed shortage of skills in the use new information technology aimed at delivering news to media organizations in an up-to-date, free and pluralistic approach. According to Agency journalists interviewed who participated in the training programme, more intensive training workshops on using internet and computer as well as online writing and editing will bring them up to recognize international standards which they can apply in their daily tasks to improve their news productions and enhance their appreciation for their jobs , and this will be reflected in the delivery of a better updated quality of news to a larger audiences, and would insure therefore a better standing for the NNA in the national and international media market. For that, NNA will need additional funding to hold similar training in the future to achieve its own sustainability.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

The project management:

NNA should continue and expand the training workshops. The number of trainees could also be increased to include all Agency's journalists : 45 working in the Arabic desk : editors in chief and editors in the newsroom, reporters room, department of radio bulletin, and 140 others working as heads of regional offices or correspondents and reporters in the thirty Agency offices in the various provinces of Lebanon. Such training for rural correspondents is necessary and in demand. NNA's management should consider organizing a "time management" training programme for the Agency online-editors/journalists who must often juggle several different stories at one time to help them get better organized on how to use their time wisely, and become more productive achievers and to make sure their work gets done by the publication's deadline.

The recipient institution:

NNA should continue expanding the training workshops. The training programme should include all NNA journalists in the Arabic, French and English desks; 30 journalists working for the department of radio bulletin, and all 140 NNA journalists working in the thirty Agency offices in the various provinces of Lebanon as heads of regional offices or correspondents. The trainees should have sufficient time attending their training workshops, recommended the trainer Rana Moussaoui, (AFP journalist).

The Member State:

NNA is a Lebanese official agency directed by the Ministry of Information. Thus the Ministry should provide financial support to this main source of domestic news on the national and international level, and work to find funds from different international donor agencies.

IPDC:

IPDC should consider providing its leadership towards raising endowment fund for more training workshops for the National News Agency to provide its entire staff with up-to-date knowledge in the new media technologies.

UNESCO:

UNESCO should continue to assist the National News Agency, and enhance its development through providing it with consultancies and advice to help it achieve progress in the new media market.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

The type of project:

NNA journalists have limited opportunities to both formal and on-the-job training due to their affiliation to the Ministry of information. This project met a training need among an important segment of the press .The project design covered comprehensively the full range of issues required and the length of the workshop seems to have matched the list of topics covered. 5 days/each workshop seem about the right.

The way of co-operation:

The training activities that were the most successful undertaken by the project were those that involved on-the-job training where the trainers worked with the Agency journalists and editors in the newsroom. Those activities enjoyed the support and close interest of the trainees. As one interviewee put it "it was a test of their skills".

The inputs:

Many of the NNA journalists' participants in the workshops worked for long time on print NNA bulletin on editing news in office in isolation of other journalists. They lacked training on online media techniques. The

training they received was an opportunity they have had in learning about online news gathering /writing/editing in an organized manner. The emphasis on plurality of media is particularly helpful with this group of journalists because the NNA is an official agency. A fact that allowed them fewer opportunities to appreciate the diversity and pluralism of editorial processes and approaches.

The instruments used:

The trainers adopted a number of methods:

- PowerPoint presentations on “new online writing and editing news techniques/tips” and lectures on “media laws and ethics”,
- The trainers presented examples of judicial case- studies on media issues to analyze and discuss with the trainees.
- Activities involved on-the-job training where the trainers worked with the Agency journalists and editors in the newsroom.
- Several drills and exercises to strengthen the participants’ online news writing and editing skills.
- Hands-on work on 15 Internet-enabled computers including online research and reporting news.
- The participants practiced writing and reporting based on methods they had learnt.
- The trainers reviewed the news delivered from the field exercise.

Outputs/outcomes:

A total of 42 journalists were trained:

- 15 selected journalists from the Arabic NNA desk were well training to be a nucleus for improving the skills of the rest of the staff.
- 12 journalists working for the NNA English desk have acquired more online writing and editing/translating skills.
- 15 journalists working for the NNA French desk have improved their online writing and editing/translating skills

The 42 trainees enhanced their understanding of Media laws and ethics. They were more capable of apply the online journalism writing and editing advanced skills. They acquired from their training to move towards a more pluralistic and free media and to have more competitive standing in the media market.

CONCLUSION

Analyzing the responses to the evaluation questionnaires sent to trainers, trainees and training managers’ shows:

Trainees: On the question of the motivation to attend the training by the Agency journalists, many of them indicated that the topics of the training helped them in understanding the new online technology. Some trainees said they gained insights on the national and international media laws and ethics. Responses indicated that participants had active interest in attending such training programs. They said they were encouraged to maximize the return on their media training investment by making use of the best practices learnt. Participants gave the workshops activities a "very useful" rating. About the content covered by the workshop, the majority rated it as "Excellent". Regarding the knowledge of the trainers, participants rated them as "excellent" and "fair". They indicated that trainers had excellent training skills, used news breaking techniques, group work, brain storming, utilized interactive training and had a balance between theory and practice, involving trainees in the discussion. The training methods seem to have enabled trainees to enjoy training and to apply directly many of the tips learnt in the training and helped them to appreciate the importance of their own job.

On the question of how the training influenced positively the trainee’s attitude towards the issues of the training, they indicated that they became more attentive of editing lead-news, more responsible and objective when dealing with conflict’s issues, they learned to be a more enthusiastic and critical media person and improved their skills in editing and reporting online-news that can have better impact.

However, majority of trainees indicated that the training workshops were too “short” and “restricted”. Few declared that training should have focused more on skills development and less on theories. The timing and place of training were perceived as suitable by all persons interviewed.

Trainees interviewed recommended increasing applied training. they felt that training could have been better should if it is “longer “and more “frequent “, can involve all NNA journalists and bring more diversified trainers.

Media trainers: The trainers declared that training objectives were achieved in great extent. They indicated trainees gained skills and knowledge that will help them improve their production of news. The 4 trainers were reported to have found their participation very rewarding.

Trainers suggested promoting the sustainability of this program. They affirmed NNA should continue efforts to build the technical and online journalistic skills and capacity of its entire staff. They recommended that IPDC/UNESCO should continue to support financially this state-owned Agency in promoting pluralism and diversity.

Training managers: The NNA directory declared that 42 Agency journalists/editors/translators gained skills and knowledge that will help them improve their production of news. But the challenge now lies in translating the learning into long term positive outcomes in the workplace. For that further training workshops are “a must” to ensure NNA reaching better competitive standing and more wide audience and impact.

UNESCO services:

NNA Directory was very satisfied with the cooperation from the UNESCO Regional office in Beirut, represented by Mr. Georges Awad, Program officer. This collaboration provided multiple benefits by administrating the funds and leading the project implementation, and supporting the project main objective.

Mission Itinerary

Works Schedule and methods:

A combination of methods was used: desk research, face to face meetings, emails, interviews and a set of evaluation training questionnaire (attached).

The evaluator conducted between 28 December 2011 and 10 January 2012 face to face meetings with UNESCO programme Officer, Mr Georges Awad, NNA Director Ms Laure Sleiman, the editor in chief of NNA Arabic Desk Mr. Ali Laham, and 4 trainees: Najwa skandarani (53 years); Josiane Aziz (39 years) both have worked on the NNA Arabic desk from more than 16 years; Elissar Nadaff, journalist/translator (aged mid-thirties, working on the Agency’s French desk for 7 years); Lyn Waked (25 years, working in the NNA English desk for 2 years).

The evaluator also had face to face meeting and email interviews with trainers: Dr Mahmud Tarabay, Ms Rana Moussaoui, and sent the questionnaire to Dr Jean Karam.

The evaluator reviewed trainers’ and trainees’ feedback gathered via training evaluation questionnaires she prepared and sent by email or had via face to face meetings with the relevant persons.

The evaluator also reviewed trainers’ feedback gathered from the end-of-training evaluation reports submitted to UNESCO programme officer Mr Georges Awad.

Sources:

UNESCO Beirut Office: Mr. Georges Awad, Programme officer

National News Agency Director: Ms Laure Sleiman

Agence France Press in Beirut: Ms Rana Moussaoui

Media training consultant– Professor in LU and LAU: Dr Mahmoud Tarabay

Media Trainer and Professor: Dr Jean Karam

Judicial training center: Judge Ziad Macna

NNA journalists: Najwa Skandarani, Josiane Aziz, Elissar Nadaff and Lyn Waked

Feedback from the NNA director and the trainers submitted to UNESCO Regional office in Beirut at the end of the project.

List of Interviewees:

| Name | Function |
|---------------------|--|
| Mr Georges Awad | UNESCO programme Officer- Beirut |
| Ms Laure Sleiman | National News Agency Director |
| Ms Rana Moussaoui | Journalist - Agence France Press -Beirut |
| Dr Mahmoud Tarabay | Media training consultant, Professor in LU and LAU |
| Dr Jean Karam | Media Trainer and Professor |
| Ms Najwa Skandarani | NNA/ Arabic Desk Editor |
| Ms Josiane Aziz | NNA /Arabic Desk Editor |
| Ms Elissar Nadaff | NNA French Desk Editor/translator |
| Ms Lyn Waked | NNA English Desk Editor/translator |

| EVALUATION REPORT PREPARED BY: | |
|--------------------------------|---|
| NAME | Mrs Iman Chamas Choucair |
| Nationality | Lebanese |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Media Consultant and Trainer • Teaching “News reporting and writing” in Arabic at the Lebanese American University in Beirut and at Beirut Arab University • Journalist at Assafir a daily political Lebanese newspaper |

EVALUATION REPORT

A – DESCRIPTIVE SUMMARY

1. PROJECT TITLE

CONFLICT SENSITIVE JOURNALISM: EMPOWERING YOUNG JOURNALISTS IN RESPONSIBLE COVERAGE DURING TIMES OF CONFLICT

2. **BUDGET CODE:** 354 LEB 5082
3. **CATEGORY:** Television, Radio, Newspaper
4. **AGENCY:** UNESCO
- 4.1 **BENEFICIARY:** MAHARAT Foundation
- 4.2 **MAIN IMPLEMENTING AGENCY:** MAHARAT Foundation

5. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

5.1 *Overall or development objectives:*

This project aims at empowering young journalists in responsible coverage during times of conflict leading to a conflict-sensitive journalism, thus, leading to a more peace promoting media sector in Lebanon.

5.2 *Operational or project objectives:*

- To raise the awareness of the new generation of journalists so they could understand the purpose of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives through non-violent forms, internal peace and subjects like which will help build a better society.
- To help young journalists acquire more skills and experience by expanding the culture of peace through their journalistic work and to acquire these skills to raise the awareness in national development especially in their surroundings.

5.3 *Results/outputs planned:*

This plan will be achieved by conducting:

- Motivational sessions for media executives for up to 15 media executives for a one day awareness seminar about conflict sensitive journalism that would allow them to be more comprehensive of their staff reporters and journalists, and would positively influence their institution's policy.
- Three two-day workshops that would hold extensive training on the concept and techniques of conflict-sensitive journalism provided by a team of expert trainers on conflict resolution.
- Production of a Newspaper Supplement (after the completion of the three workshops) that would give the opportunity for the students to work in groups and write an extensive story or report pertaining to conflict and that would be compiled and edited by experts.

5.4 Target groups (Beneficiaries):

- One hundred and six students from different Lebanese universities: Lebanese University (branch 1 & 2), U.S.J, A.U.B, JINAN University, AUST, USEK, Antonine University and NDU.
- Thirty young journalists capable of applying the newly acquired concepts and skills of conflict sensitive journalism and able to produce a newspaper supplement with their own stories by the end of the training workshop.

6. IPDC ASSISTANCE

Assistance sought from IPDC: **US\$ 20 000**

Assistance approved by IPDC: **US\$ 20 000**

The approved amount was used for:

- Five 2-day training workshops in AN-NAHAR training center to raise the awareness of the new generation of journalist. The workshops were implemented on the 9th-10th, 16th-17th of April 2010, and on the 7th-8th, 14th-15th and 28th-29th May 2010 respectively.
- In total, one hundred and six students attended the sessions from different Lebanese universities such as Lebanese University (branch 1 & 2), U.S.J, A.U.B, JINAN University, AUST, USEK, Antonine University and NDU. (Expenses included lunches and breaks)
- Production and Publication of a pamphlet containing the articles of the students distributed with An-Nahar newspaper.
- Hotel venue rental + lunch for the awareness seminar for Media executives the 27th of May 2010 at Phoenicia Hotel – Beirut in the presence of 15 Media Executives from several major Lebanese Media Organizations.
- Trainers: (5 trainers/ 6 training days/seminar): Aline Farah, Ghassan Hajjar, Joe Haddad, Tony Mikhael and Walid Abboud

7. CONTRIBUTIONS FROM OTHER SOURCES

7.1 Agency contributions:

MAHARAT Foundation provided office rent (An-Nahar training center) to house training workshops, project coordinator, expert fees for follow up and final editing on reports, training manual production, documentary production, reproducing copies of documentary, students transportation expenses and stipend, communication costs, equipments needed, and administration.

7.2 Other: None

7.3 Time schedule/project duration:

During the period of December 2009 to May 2010, Maharat implemented several workshops and conferences in collaboration with UNESCO regional office in Beirut related to the role of media in building a culture of peace and the role of media in the national dialogue:

The training workshops were conducted over five /2 days from 9-10 April 2010 to 29 May 2010, details below:

9th – 10th of April: 19 students
16th – 17th of April: 20 students
7th – 8th of May: 28 students
14th – 15th of May: 20 students
28th – 29th of May: 19 students

The seminar regarding the “Role of Media in the National Dialogue” was organized on the 27 of May 2010 at Phoenicia Hotel – Beirut in the presence of 15 Media Executives from several major Lebanese Media Organizations.

B - ASSESSMENT

8. ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES AND PLANNING

Long-term objectives:

The overall and longer-term objective of sensitizing and educating the new generation of journalists on issues relating to “Conflict Sensitive Journalism” is very relevant to the development of the national press in Lebanon where the media plays a major role in shaping citizens’ opinions and impacting their choice. Thus, the need to educate media bodies in order to be agents of peace is very critical and vital. Conflict Sensitive Journalism would help bridge gaps by finding common grounds on which to report instead of reporting subjectively. This project aims at empowering young journalists in responsible coverage during times of conflict so they could understand the purpose of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives through non-violent forms, internal peace and subjects like economic and social issues which will help build a better society where journalism has an important role to play.

Short-term objectives:

The immediate objective of this project is to empower young journalists in responsible coverage during times of conflict. This objective is particularly responsive to the vital need to educate media bodies in Lebanon in order to be agents of peace. The emphasis on empowering media students in responsible coverage during times of conflict is particularly helpful as they will lead the new generation of journalists to a more peace promoting media sector in Lebanon. The training they received at the workshops is an excellent opportunity for them to broaden their knowledge in core journalistic issues such as the freedom of expression, an independent and pluralistic media, and to learn about responsible news gathering and writing in a time of conflicts.

4 immediate goals were defined:

- To conduct 5 two-day workshops that would hold extensive training on the concept and techniques of conflict-sensitive journalism.
- To produce a Newspaper Supplement (after the completion of the workshops) that would give the opportunity for the students to work in groups and write an extensive story or report pertaining to conflict and that would be compiled and edited by experts.
- To organize for up to 15 media executives for a one day awareness seminar about conflict sensitive journalism that would allow them to be more comprehensive of their staff reporters and journalists. The immediate objectives of the project were well-timed and consistent with the long-term development objective. 106 Media students acquired more knowledge on conflict-sensitive journalism so they could understand the purpose of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives. And thirty young journalists acquired more skills and experience by expanding the culture of peace through their journalistic work and were able to produce a newspaper supplement with their own stories by the end of the training workshop.

9. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION

Activities:

The three proposed activities were implemented between April and May 2010:

Regarding the “role of media in building a culture of peace, Maharat Foundation, in collaboration with UNESCO regional office in Beirut implemented five 2-day training workshops in An-Nahar training center.

The objective of these workshops was to raise the awareness of the new generation of journalists so they could understand the purpose of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives through non-violent forms, internal peace and subjects like economic and social issues which will help build a better society where journalism has an important role to play. Moreover, the workshops aimed at helping journalists acquire more skills and experience by expanding the culture of peace through their journalistic work and to acquire these skills to raise the awareness in national development especially in their surroundings.

Maharat foundation contacted the media department in the private and public universities to invite the students to participate in the workshop. The workshops were implemented on the 9th-10th, 16th-17th April 2010, and on the 7th-8th, 14th-15th and 28th-29th May 2010 respectively. In total, one hundred and six students attended the sessions from different Lebanese universities such as Lebanese University (branch 1 & 2), U.S.J, A.U.B, JINAN University, AUST, USEK, Antonine University and NDU.

All Sessions were introduced by Maharat Foundation and UNESCO welcomed the participants and explained to them the aim of the workshop. The 4 trainers used participatory techniques such as group work, role play, audio-visual tools, interactive exercises, and analysis of data and writing skills.

The main topic introduced on the first day of the training was the role of the media in covering conflict, identifying its problems and propagating a culture of peace. Dealing with conflicts by analyzing information models was introduced by using pictures of the events of the Israeli war of 2006, Nahr el Bared conflict of 2007 and the internal conflict of May 7th 2008. The trainer implemented an activity with the participants where he showed the student pictures of conflict scenarios and asked them to provide a definition. After that, a 20-minutes documentary “Photo and Echo” was projected on how the Lebanese media has covered the event of May 7th, 2008 followed by a group discussion.

On the second day of the training, the trainers worked with the participants on analyzing the concepts and methodologies of conflicts by implementing practical exercises. Finally, students discussed the themes of the projects they choose to work on following the workshop. They wrote articles that dealt with different subjects such as the Israeli war of 2006 on Lebanon, the inflation of the Lebanese economy and the new political division in Lebanon after the events of 2005.

A pamphlet was produced containing the articles of the students, published and distributed with An-Nahar newspaper.

Regarding the “Role of Media in the National Dialogue”, Maharat Foundation organized a seminar, in collaboration with UNESCO regional office on the 27th of May 2010 at Phoenicia Hotel – Beirut in the presence of 15 Media Executives from several major Lebanese Media Organizations to discuss what was done and what can be done in order to reinforce the role of media in maintaining and supporting the National dialogue. During this seminar, the media executives shared their organizations’ experience while giving their opinion on the matter defining the problems they are facing and suggesting solutions. At the end, media executives agreed on the existence of a structural problem in our organizations, related to several reasons, such as funding and political affiliation, while there’s a lack of citizenship culture, and a weak sense of professionalism while be being directed by those who are responsible for the organizations policy.

Project management:

MAHARAT foundation managed the project efficiently and implemented the activities according to schedule.

UNESCO services:

All workshops activities were introduced and monitored by Maharat Foundation and UNESCO Regional Communication Office in Lebanon. UNESCO's Communication and Information officer, Mr Georges Awad, spoke at most of the workshops to introduce the International Programme for the Development of Communication" explaining that "the programme includes a wide range of projects in many developing countries in order to promote freedom of expression and to teach reading and writing, and to contribute to a climate of democracy in these countries. Awad spoke about the importance of the project "The target is the youth journalists being the future and therefore we look forward to make a positive impact on them."

In the conference/seminar regarding the "Role of Media in the National Dialogue" organized in collaboration with UNESCO regional office on the 27th of May 2010 at Phoenicia Hotel – Beirut, Mr Awad stressed the significance of this conference in gathering media executives from major Lebanese media organizations to discuss what has been done and what can be done in order to reinforce the role of media in maintaining and supporting the National dialogue in Lebanon.

Progress reports by the workshop and a final evaluation report, a financial report, were submitted to UNESCO Regional Communication Office in Lebanon at the end of the project.

Collaboration:

The project involved both the IPDC and Maharat Foundation as financial contributors. There was good cooperation between Maharat foundation, UNESCO Communication and Information office in Beirut and "An-Nahar" newspaper- training center as well as the Media departments in public and private Lebanese universities engaged in the training process through the selection of the students invited to participate in the workshops.

Project monitoring:

The project was closely monitored by the UNESCO Communication and Information officer in Beirut, Mr. Georges Awad and Maharat's executive director Ms. Roula Mikhael through daily visits and regular consultations. Key conclusions and recommendations were included in the report presented to UNESCO (See Annex).

10. EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT

Results:

The project achieved meaningful results in training young journalists and media students in responsible coverage during times of conflict so they could understand the purpose of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives through non-violent forms, internal peace and subjects like which will help build a better society. 106 young journalists and Media students acquired concepts and skills of conflict-sensitive journalism improving their ability to produce a newspaper supplement with their own stories by the end of the training workshop

To implement this approach Maharat involved in the training plan several major Media executives as well as young journalists and Media students This plan was achieved by conducting:

- Motivational sessions for up to 15 media executives in a one day awareness seminar about conflict sensitive journalism to allow them to be more understanding of their staff reporters and journalists and to discuss what has been done and what can be done in order to reinforce the role of media in maintaining and supporting the National dialogue.
- Five two-day workshops that held extensive training to 106 Media students from different private and public Lebanese universities on the concept and techniques of conflict-sensitive journalism. The

objective of these workshops was to raise the awareness of the new generation of journalists so they could understand the purpose of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives through non-violent forms, internal peace and subjects like economic and social issues which would help build a better society where journalism has an important role to play. Moreover, the workshops aimed at helping journalists acquire more skills and experience by expanding the culture of peace in their journalistic work and to acquire those skills that should raise the awareness of major issues in national development especially in their communities.

- Production of a Newspaper Supplement (after the completion of the workshops) that gave the opportunity for the students to work in groups and write an extensive story or report pertaining to conflict. The articles written by the participants that dealt with different subjects such as the Israeli war of 2006 on Lebanon, the inflation in the Lebanese economy and the new political division in Lebanon after the events of 2005 were published in a pamphlet distributed with An-Nahar newspaper. (See Annex)

Cost-effectiveness:

The project must be considered cost-effective, given the several extensive training workshops implemented within few days to allow 106 Media students and young journalists to acquire more knowledge of the concepts, techniques and reporting skills of conflict-sensitive journalism, and to apply what they learned by producing a newspaper supplement with their own stories at the end of the training workshops.

Maharat's plan to implement this approach by reaching out to both Media executives as well as young journalists by organising a day awareness seminar about conflict sensitive journalism, was an effective initiative to discuss what has been done and what can be done in order to reinforce the role of media in maintaining and supporting the National dialogue in Lebanon.

The cost of the project can be seen as highly attractive to the extent that the beneficiaries put the workshops' content into practice by producing a newspaper supplement with their own stories at the end of the training workshops.

Development impact:

Interviews with most of the training programme participant's, media students as well as trainers and media executives, showed that the project clearly had a positive impact. The media students realized that the media can play a critical role in defusing tensions and forging peace. Their enthusiasm was very impressive and the efforts they made at the end of the training workshops by producing a newspaper supplement with their own stories are a definite investment in the future. They said they have gained a considerable amount of self-confidence and a greater awareness and understanding of what is right and wrong with the society in which they live. The workshops, they affirmed, helped them to acquire more skills and experience by expanding the culture of peace in their journalistic work.

Media students told the evaluator that they had a good understanding of the role media can play in helping prevent conflicts from escalating. The beneficiaries also clearly understood the link between balanced reporting in the media and democratic dialogue. They demonstrated awareness that in Lebanese society, conflict sensitive journalism can help in bridging gaps by finding common grounds on which to report instead of worsening the already existing tensions by reporting subjective and highly politicized stories.

The project achieved a number of positive impacts, including: 106 media students/young journalists who have gained exposure to conflict sensitive journalism techniques, through the training provided within media outlets, workshops and seminar held by Maharat trainers.

The 106 participants coming from various public and private Lebanese universities have gained more awareness of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives. The training has also reinforced the expectations of some young journalists about the role that media can play in democratic debates. a growing number of trainees argued that the 'media and conflict' debate is not about taking sides in reporting conflict (except the side of peace and peace-building) but about journalists already being a third party in any conflict they are covering.

The training workshops allowed students to learn about the writing skills they can use in their work field, particularly in the service of national development and a culture of dialogue and peace. After completing the training workshops, the students were capable to apply the newly acquired concepts and skills of conflict-sensitive journalism. They were able to produce a newspaper supplement with their own stories and investigations related to conflict “based on objectivity, transparency and honesty” as they said. This supplement was published with UNESCO support and distributed with An-Nahar newspaper. Many of the stories given in the publication stressed on the need for all Lebanese to deny conflicts avoid blood and learn from the mistakes of the past”. One of those stories was titled” Yes, Lebanon will live”.

Media executives who participated in the seminar were almost unanimous that "the problem of fragmentation of the media lies with both the politicians and the media pointing to a relationship of dependency between media and politics with a lack of media freedom, a lack of citizenship culture, and a weak sense of professionalism, underscoring the importance of disseminating the culture of human rights through compliance with the standards of ethical media. As trainer Walid Abboud reported, “the seminar was an opportunity for them to share their organizations’ experience while giving their opinion on the matter defining the problems they are facing and suggesting solutions.”

Finally, the participants, media students as well as media executives, gained more awareness about the priorities of UNESCO/ IPDC program thus: strengthen freedom of expression and media pluralism, development on the level of information and human resources, and promote international cooperation or international partnership in addition to developing local and regional media.

Sustainability:

The main goal of this project is to implement a sense of conflict-sensitive journalism in young journalists thus leading to a more peace promoting media sector in Lebanon.

The project, as Maharat noted in it presentation submitted to UNESCO Regional Office-Beirut, was designed in a time “where the media institutions in Lebanon are part of the political disputes and often play a major role in them”. But while the training workshops conducted contributed to establishing a critical mass of young journalists aware of the role of media in building a culture of peace and national dialogue in the Lebanese society, helping them acquire more skills and experience by expanding this culture of peace through their journalistic work, the need is to implement further actions “ to reach the proposed objectives. Sustainability would be better achieved by more systematic engagement with more young Lebanese journalists. Maharat will probably need additional funding to hold similar training courses in the future.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations addressed to:

The project management:

Maharat should direct further actions at the young journalists that participated in these workshops to provide continuity. It should expand the training workshops to include more media students and young/beginners journalists.

The recipient institution:

Maharat should direct further training and events/seminars that help interested journalists to gain more awareness of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives through non-violent forms, internal peace and subjects like economy and social issues which will help build a better society where journalism has an important role to play. Maharat should also work to provide funds to produce and help publishing the media students’ stories who will participate in its training workshops.

IPDC:

IPDC should consider continuing financial support to similar actions that impact multiplier beneficiaries.

UNESCO:

UNESCO may wish to consider supporting Maharat in the conduct of an annual workshop of this nature and funding the publication of the trainees' articles and stories related to the project's objective.

12. LESSONS LEARNT

Lessons learnt with regard to:

The type of project:

This is a good example of the type of project that should be supported by IPDC. It benefits a large number of people and holds the potential of being up-scaled to include the majority of media students and organizations. The focus on "empowering young journalists in responsible coverage during times of conflict leading to a conflict-sensitive journalism" is responsive to the need to "educate media bodies in Lebanon in order to be agents of peace". Raising the awareness of the new generation of journalists about the purpose of the culture of peace, its principles and its perspectives through non-violent forms, internal peace and subjects like economy and social issues will clearly help leading to better media in Lebanon thus leading to a better society.

Implementing this approach by reaching out to both Media executives as well as young journalists was productive and had a positive impact on both participants. Projects of this nature must continue to ensure that they stand the best chance of succeeding. Maharat noted clearly in its "Periodic Report: Dec 2009-May 2010" (See Annex) that one of the challenges that faced the trainers during the workshops conducted under this project, was the ability of young journalists to approach and analyze a conflict situation in their society. For example, when they were asked to discuss a documentary on the internal conflict of May 7th 2008, the participants had subjective opinions regarding media coverage of these events. They underlined the fact that the media coverage was divided according to the political parties in conflict; nevertheless, they took part of this political division during the discussion of the documentary. This was shocking in the sense that it clearly showed the need for efforts to promote the culture of a conflict sensitive journalism.

The way of co-operation:

Inviting the Media students in private and public Lebanese universities to participate in the workshops and holding these workshops in "An-Nahar training center" helped to contextualize the issues addressed by the project and contributed to its success. The co-operation with "An-Nahar" newspaper was also productive. The articles written by the participants that dealt with different subjects such as the Israeli war of 2006 on Lebanon, the inflation of the Lebanese economy and the new political division in Lebanon after the events of 2005 (See Annex) were published in a supplement distributed with the newspaper.

The inputs:

IPDC's contribution supported the involvement of 5 trainers: Aline Farah, Ghassan Hajjar, Joe Haddad, Tony Mikhael and Walid Abboud, the participation of 106 media students in five 2/day workshops, and the production and publication of the newspaper supplement. It also supported organizing, in collaboration with UNESCO Regional office in Beirut represented by UNESCO's Communication and Information officer, Mr. Georges Awad, a one day conference on the "Role of Media in the National Dialogue" the 27 of May 2010 at Phoenicia Hotel – Beirut, in the presence of 15 Media Executives from several major Lebanese Media Organizations. This activity was useful and enabled exchange of experiences.

Maharat's executive director Roula Mikhael organized and managed all the workshops activities.

The instruments used:

The training used participatory techniques such as group work, role play, audio-visual tools, interactive exercises, and analysis of data and writing skills. Dealing with conflicts by analyzing information models was introduced by using pictures of the events of the Israeli war of 2006, Nahr el Bared conflict of 2007 and the internal conflict of May 7th 2008. The trainer implemented an activity with the participants where he showed the student pictures of conflict scenarios and asked them to provide a definition. A documentary "صدى و صورة" was produced on how the Lebanese media has covered the event of May 7th, 2008.

Mission itinerary

Work schedule and method:

A combination of methods was used, including desk research, interviews via face to face meetings or via emails or phone calls, analysis of evaluation questionnaires completed by the trainees, the trainers and the training management, and review feedbacks, periodical reports on project progress, and the comprehensive final report submitted by Maharat to the UNESCO Regional Office - Beirut.

The evaluator conducted between 9 and 20 January 2012 face to face meetings with UNESCO programme officer in Beirut, Mr Georges Awad, as well as Maharat's executive director and trainer, Roula Mikhael, and the trainers: Aline Farah (Journalist at An-Nahar newspaper since 1993 and trainer with Maharat for the past 3 years) and Ghassan Hajjar (Managing editor at "An-Nahar" newspaper since 2009, and supervisor of "An-Nahar Center for Training and Research" and professor in the Faculty of Advertising and Media, Antonine University since 2008 and in the Faculty of Information and Documentation, Lebanese University since 2007)

He also met with the following five trainees:

- **Pina R. Ghossoub** (21 years) MA in journalism student at Notre Dame University, NDU (Zouk Mosbeh -Faculty of Humanity, Department of mass communication).
- Pina received her B.A. in CA-journalism in summer 2011, and since 2009 has worked as a journalist volunteer for her university magazine (WE magazine). She has done an internship at RLL (Radio Liban Libre) on reporting and writing news. After training, she worked for a period at Lamasat Magazine.
- **Hussein Kassab** (22 years), third year Communication Arts with emphasis on Journalism at AUST and fourth Semester at AUB (Journalism Training Program Certificate Diploma). He is not yet working in any media institute.
- **Reine Bou Moussa** (20 years), Qualified in Radio-TV from Antonine University-Baabda, Advertising and Media Faculty, Radio TV department. She works at An-Nahar newspaper.
- **Marie Abdallah** (21 years) who this year will get her MA in journalism and communication from University Saint Esprit-Kaslik (USEK). Not working now but she did some training before (in 2008 with Alsharqawsat-Beirut newspaper & 2009 at RLL radio).
- **Petia Lteif** (22 years) continuing her Masters at Antonin University. Not currently working in any institution.

The evaluator requested participants' lists, contact information, a copy of the periodic and final Maharat's report about project activities and impact and the financial report (See Annex II). She conducted interviews with some workshops participants, reviewed trainers and trainees' feedbacks gathered via training evaluation questionnaires she prepared and sent by email or via face to face meetings with the relevant persons.

The evaluator also reviewed trainers' feedback gathered from the end-of-training evaluation reports submitted to UNESCO office in Beirut.

Sources:

UNESCO Beirut Office: Mr Georges Awad, Programme Officer

Maharat's executive director Roula Mikhael

An-Nahar newspaper: Aline Farah (Journalist and trainer) and Ghassan Hajjar (Managing editor)

An-Nahar newspaper archives

An-Nahar Center for Training and Research

Maharat website: www.maharatfoundation.org

Maharat Project identification

Maharat periodic report: Dec 2009-May2010

List of one hundred and six students attended the sessions from different Lebanese universities such as Lebanese University (branch 1 & 2), U.S.J, A.U.B, JINAN University, AUST, USEK, Antonine University and NDU.

List of Interviewees

| Name | Function |
|--------------------------|---|
| Mr Georges Awad | UNESCO programme officer in Beirut |
| Ms Roula Mikhael | Maharat's executive director and trainer |
| Ms Aline Farah | Journalist at An-Nahar newspaper and trainer with Maharat |
| Mr Ghassan Hajjar | Managing editor at "An-Nahar" newspaper Supervisor of "An-Nahar Center for Training and Research" Professor Advertising and Media, Antonine University Faculty of Information and Documentation, Lebanese University |
| Pina R.Ghoussoub | Notre Dame University-NDU-zouk mosbeh pina.ghoussoub@hotmail.com |
| Hussein Kassab | AUST and AUB Journalism Training Programme hussein-kassab@hotmail.com |
| Reine Bou Moussa | Antonine University-Baabda, Advertising and Media Faculty, Journalist at An-Nahar newspaper. reine_bou_moussa@hotmail.com |
| Marie Abdallah | University Saint Esprit-Kaslik (USEK) marie.abdallah@live.com |
| Petia Lteif | Antonine University-Baabda petia.lteif@hotmail.com |