United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Good Practices in TVET Reform

February 26th, 2010

Example of Reform in Technical and Vocational Education and Training	
1. Title/Country	A title refers to project or programme (executed either by a Government, single agency project or joint programme)
Kazakhstan, Kyrgistan, Tajikistan: Skills Development for Poverty Reduction (in rural areas)	
2. Start/Duration	Please give the dates of implementation of the project.
2006 - 2008	
3. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The goal of the project was to develop a better understanding of the role of skills development in the framework of poverty reduction in order to promote policy options and VET reform initiatives towards poverty reduction. New VET policies supporting training relevant to the labour market and/or income generation which respond to the needs of rural communities are important issues in this context.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	• What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address? (Examples) A problem could be a legislation or policy gap. It could be a certain type of capacity constraint to deliver services. It could be a financial constraint, a lack of proper financial allocation or irregular expenditure patterns.
The vast majority of the population in Central Asia lives in rural areas. Many of them face poverty. In the case of Tajikistan in 1999, 80% of the population lived below the national poverty line. The government aims to reduce this to 50% by 2015. It was placed 127 out of 182 countries in the 2007 Human Development Index. Kyrgyzstan was placed 120. In some C. Asian countries 20% of the labour force migrates in order to find employment opportunities and to sustain their families with remittances. The rural population is under-employed and uses production methods with low levels of productivity. It does not have the skills to extend rural businesses to other areas, work on a higher level of productivity, or apply for and manage micro credits for further investments in their business. The VET systems have no polici8es to systematically provide such skills for rural adults.	
4.2. Result of the project	• Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
The project revealed clearly that targeted VET programmes lead to diversified economic activities, increased income and self-employment opportunities. Beneficiaries increased their income and could extend their businesses to other areas (such as bee-keeping or animal breeding), thus providing a strong argument for staying in the rural area and building on local businesses. As a consequence of the success of the project, the countries involved are presently re-focussing their VET policies towards higher productivity, income generation and better employability. These policies will promote decentralization, financial contributions by beneficiaries and will take account of labour market needs and the qualification gaps of rural dwellers and migrants.	

4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
Workers in rural areas and their families.	

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The project was launched in three Central Asian countries with the aim of improving the socio-economic conditions in rural areas through targeted training of adults. Training programmes were designed locally to close skills gaps, support higher productivity and thereby generate additional income. Policies for more cohesion and partnership between micro-credit institutions and the rural target groups were part of the programme.

Evidence-based learning events were run aimed at redirecting VET reform policies towards poverty reduction. The VET policy decision-makers discussed in cross-country conferences the advantages and disadvantages of systematically integrating non-formal adult training in initial VET schools and the consequences of the project outcomes for VET policy reforms.

Implementation varied slightly between countries:
- In Kazakhstan, initial VET schools co-operated closely with the local social partners in the design and implementation of non-formal VET programmes.
- In Tajikistan, non-formal adult training was scaled up and the decision was made to establish country-wide training centres for adults to provide life-long learning opportunities.
- In Kyrgyzstan, initial VET schools provided targeted non-formal training programmes for adults.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

- The project used existing education infrastructure (rural schools for initial VET) for the training of rural workers.
- Social partners and local government promoted the training activities in the schools.
- The VET staff in the schools were supported with further training in order to enhance their capacities to design and implement tailor-made training programmes.
- Capacity development for VET staff and managers built on national know-how.
- Local coaches and peer learning methods were used to train and supervise the implementation and evaluation of new training activities and adult learning methods.
- The VET schools and the beneficiaries of the training programmes contacted the local business community in order to obtain micro-credits.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

- VET policy which promotes greater autonomy for schools in delivering adult training, is a precondition for new and sustainable training programmes.
- Evidence of higher earnings by the beneficiaries of the training is the best way of motivating others to get involved.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
social partners; local government; VET schools; local businesses	

9. Funding/Financing	Describe whether donor-financed, jointly financed, locally funded; if possible give indication of budget sums
10. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
Manfred Wallenborn, VET Specialist, European Training Foundation, mwa@etf.europa.eu tel: +39 011 6302378	
11. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)
ETF (2006) *Skills Development for Poverty Reduction*, ETF Yearbook 2006, Luxembourg, Publication Office ETF (2009) *Innovative Training for Poverty Reduction in Central Asia*, in ETF:Inform, No.1, Turin Wallenborn, M. (2009) *Skills Development for Poverty Reduction (SDPR)*: *The Case of Tajikistan*, in: International Journal for Educational Development, vol.29 no. 6, Amsterdam	

<table>
<tr><td colspan="2" align="center">**Example of Reform in Technical and Vocational Education and Training**</td></tr>
<tr><td>**1. Title/Country**</td><td>A title refers to project or programme (executed either by a Government, single agency project or joint programme)</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">The Training for Rural Economic Empowerment (TREE) programmed in Philippines and Pakistan</td></tr>
<tr><td>**2. Start/Duration**</td><td>Please give the dates of implementation of the project.</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">2002 - 2007</td></tr>
<tr><td>**3. Outcome**</td><td>What were the goals of the project?</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">Using the TREE methodology, to systematically identify employment and income-generating opportunities at the community/local level; design and deliver appropriate training programmes; and provide the necessary post-training support, for instance, access to markets.</td></tr>
<tr><td>**4. 1. Objective (problem statement)**</td><td>• What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address?

(Examples) A problem could be a legislation or policy gap. It could be a certain type of capacity constraint to deliver services. It could be a financial constraint, a lack of proper financial allocation or irregular expenditure patterns.</td></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>**4.2. Result of the project**</td><td>• Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">• In Pakistan, 185 saving and credit group were organized (98 by women; 87 male groups); 7 business associates were formed; 32 teachers were trained to run the literacy centres; TREE became a component of the national skills development strategy: Skilling Pakistan.
• In Philippines, 41 corporate community groups were formed (342% more than the 12 planned); August monthly incomes of beneficiaries increased by 105%.</td></tr>
<tr><td>**4.3. Beneficiaries**</td><td>Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">The poor, the underemployed, the unemployed, informal economy workers and the otherwise disadavantaged.</td></tr>
<tr><td>**5. Synopsis**</td><td>Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">TREE is a programmed conceptualized under the principles of community-based training. It promotes income generation and local development, emphasizing the role of skills and knowledge for creating new economic and employment opportunities for the poor, the underemployed, the unemployed, informal economy workers and the otherwise disadvantaged towards sustained economic activities.

The TREE methodology consists of a set of processes to guide the articulation of local development initiatives and identification and implementation of income generation opportunities. It starts with institutional arrangements and planning among partner organizations at the national land local levels. TREE differs from</td></tr>
</table>

conventional vocational training programmes in three main ways:

- by identifying potential income-generating activities and related training needs before designing the content and modalities of specific training programmes;
- by involving the local community and social partners directly in each phase of the identification, design and delivery process;
- by facilitating access to credit, assistance in group formation, etc. to ensure that individuals or groups can initiate and sustain income-generating activities and also raise productivity in trade areas for which training was provided.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

- Projections of future short-term and long-term labour market needs based on comprehensive data.
- Co-operation between governments and social partners.
- Locally-designed training programmes.
- Development of a variety of modes of delivery of training.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.
8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.
9. Funding/Financing	Describe whether donor-financed, jointly financed, locally funded; if possible give indication of budget sums

Donor funded

10. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

Skills and Employability Department of the ILO www.ilo.org.skills

11. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

Pakistan and Philippines Fifth Technical Report (October 2004 – March 2005)
Pakistan and Philippines Seventh Technical Report (October 2005 – March 2006)
http://www.ilo.org/skills/what/projects/lang--en/WCMS_103528/index.htm
Related ILO publications:
1. Productivity, decent employment and poverty: conceptual and practical issues related to small enterprises – (pdf 394 KB)
2. World Employment Report 2004-2005: Employment, productivity and poverty reduction
3. Training for rural economic empowerment (TREE) Project (Mid-term Evaluation Summary) – (pdf 476 KB)

Example of Reform in Technical and Vocational Education and Training	
1. Title/Country	A title refers to project or programme (executed either by a Government, single agency project or joint programme)
Hungary: Step One Forward	
2. Start/Duration	Please give the dates of implementation of the project.
November 2005 – September 2007 (Round One) September 2007 – xxxxxxxxxxxxx (Round Two)	
3. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
To integrate into the labour market as well as into the educational system, those populations most at risk from exclusion. In Hungary, these are the long-term unemployed, early school-leavers, the Roma and people with special needs.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	• What were the problems that the project/programmed (or policy) was meant to address? (Examples) A problem could be a legislation or policy gap. It could be a certain type of capacity constraint to deliver services. It could be a financial constraint, a lack of proper financial allocation or irregular expenditure patterns.
1. Tackling the problem of the long-term unemployed as well as the inactive job-seekers is one of the major challenges faced by the Hungarian labour market. In 2007, 48% of the unemployed were jobless for more than one year. This is a consequence of the radical transition from a planned economy to a competitive economy. Many of the qualifications obtained during the communist era, particularly agricultural qualifications, have become obsolete and acquiring new qualifications was difficult for many people because of a lack of incentives and trust in future work possibilities. 2. It is estimated that 7-8% of young people never finish primary school, remain unskilled and never gain regular work. The share of early school-leavers is particularly high amongst the Roma people who are among the main losers of the economic transition from a communist to a market economy. Following the transition, the majority of them entered a vicious circle: without any opportunity to earn money their housing conditions have worsened to a considerable extent, which has had a negative impact on the educational opportunities of their children and made their emergence from a disadvantageous situation even more difficult. 3. The tendency in Hungary has been to offer financial support to people with disabilities, rather than equal treatment or the possibility to integrate into the labour market. Social employment centres work in all regions but only offer a limited range of working opportunities. However, the elements encouraging employment of disabled people are increasingly emphasized within active labour market programmes.	
4.2. Result of the project	• Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programmed (or policy intervention)
An interim evaluation showed: • 98% of the participants were very satisfied with the training and willing to return for more training; • 2 months after finishing the training 60% of the skilled unemployed participants had found a job.	

However, the low response rate in the evaluation questionnaire raises doubt about the extrapolation of the results so the above figures should be treated with caution.

4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

long-term unemployed; early school-leavers; people with disabilities.

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

Step One Forward was launched as a labour market measure in conjunction with the restructuring of the VET system. The Government of Hungary offers free training, through an EU-funded programme to those people who did not finish basic education and to those who did but who do not have a vocational qualification. In addition, the training is available to individuals with unmarketable qualifications and those already in employment seeking advancement.

The programmed was launched after only 6 months of programme design and development. It took a top-down approach, although stakeholders at national, regional and local levels played a key role in the implementation phase. The programme was designed in a way to respect regional labour market specificities and the needs of the target groups. Nine regional training centres co-ordinated the delivery of the training to the participants although approximately 40% of the training was delivered by private providers. Regional employment and training institutions were involved in order to profit from regional networks and to better reach the target groups. The integration of a large number of stakeholders – including training centres, Roma representatives, municipalities, employers and employees – aimed to attract the maximum number of participants.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

- Through the use of mentors, who could make the link between the local governments, civil organizations and the training centres, and key Roma representatives who could influence their communities, it was possible to overcome the difficulties foreseen for recruitment onto the programme. 15,000 people participated in the 1st round of the programme and 20,000 are expected to participate in the 2nd round.
- The training responded to the needs of employers and took the expectations of participants into account. These expectations included both the types of courses offered as well as adapting the timing and location of the training to best serve the population.
- The training was also available to those already in employment. In order to accommodate their needs some courses were organized in the evening or at weekends. This enabled those who are *under*employed to improve their chances to retain their job or increase their income. Teachers, participants and employers all confirmed that they appreciated this.
- Financial support was a serious incentive for potential participants and this was improved in the second round. Nor did participants in receipt of a scholarship lose their entitlement to other social benefits. This was an important distinction from the standard programmes offered by the regional labour offices and cited as a main factor in the successful retention of participants.
- A major success factor was the design of the training courses and the appropriate use of teaching strategies and learning forms. Regional training centres were accustomed to training adults with different educational and professional backgrounds but were able to introduce new didactic forms. This was only possible in a dynamic and continuous self-evaluating and monitoring framework.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

- The importance of including the different stakeholders on different levels.
- The integration of VET training centres which already deal with adults.
- The importance of flexibility to define local needs and local opportunities.
- Only 6 months for the planning phase was a limiting factor and led to various practical and logistical problems.
- 60 days waiting time between registration and the beginning of the programme was a barrier to keeping participants motivated and available.
- Supporting IT software needs to be trialed and tested beforehand and users trained before implementation.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The programmed was initiated by the government, through the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, which commissioned the National Institute of Vocational Education and Adult Training (NIVE) and the Employment and Social Office (ESO) to assess the feasibility and the organization of such a programme.

9. Funding/Financing	Describe whether donor-financed, jointly financed, locally funded; if possible give indication of budget sums

The first round was financed 75% by the EU and 25% by the Hungarian Government. The total costs were approximately €20m. In the second round the costs were shared equally between the EU and the Hungarian Government. The training centres took over the development costs on their own, but received a per capita contribution according to the length of training.

10. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

11. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

OECD/CERI *Study of Systemic Innovation in the Hungarian VET System: Country Case Study Report*, 2008
OECD *Learning for Jobs: OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training – Hungary,* 2008
www.oecd.org/publications

Example of Reform in Technical and Vocational Education and Training	
1. Title/Country	A title refers to project or programme (executed either by a Government, single agency project or joint programme)
1. Mexico: Reform of the Technological Baccalaureate	
2. Start/Duration	Please give the dates of implementation of the project.
2. 2004-2007	
3. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
3. The goals of the project were: • to create greater transparency of the rationale for upper secondary vocational education, the existence of pathways into tertiary education and the need for key skills to achieve higher level competences (e.g. learning to learn); • to create a technical route through which these competences could be acquired, thus catering to the proportion of the population not engaged in general education; • to incorporate the teaching of key skills and competences to enable graduates to change sectors within the labour force and to facilitate lifelong learning.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	• What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address? (Examples) A problem could be a legislation or policy gap. It could be a certain type of capacity constraint to deliver services. It could be a financial constraint, a lack of proper financial allocation or irregular expenditure patterns.
4.1 The reform responded to a number of shortcomings: • the diversity and disconnection in the way the BTe was organised made it difficult to manage and created difficulties in student transfers between different types of BTe and different locations; • inefficiency in the design of the programmes of study resulting from both a lack of integration of their curricular components and excessive length; • a lack of relevance of the BTe programmes in relation to labour market needs, resulting in low appreciation by employers and consequently low returns for graduates; • the focus of the programmes on inputs rather than on learning outcomes, making it difficult for graduates to move occupational sector within the labour market. • perception of VET as a second-class education; • low recruitment to VET and poor prospects in the labour market for drop-outs from secondary education.	
4.2. Result of the project	• Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
4.2 Results achieved included: • Curriculum change from a focus on learning inputs to a focus on learning outcomes. • Change in pedagogic methods from teacher-centred to student-centred and a transformation of the teacher's role from transmitting knowledge to facilitating learning. • Greater reliance on problem-solving exercises, simulations, team-work and case studies. • Curriculum change to being based around three components – basic, general and professional –	

with an exit qualification at the end of each cycle that is relevant to the labour market.
- Introduction of new evaluation methods which have enhanced monitoring and formative evaluation methods for schools.

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

5. This case study covers the 2004 reform of the Mexican Technical Baccalaureate (BTe) which introduced substantial changes in vocational education and training and led to more extensive reforms in general secondary education in Mexico in 2007. The decision to initiate reform was taken by the Federal Government, which felt the need to reform the BTe to ease the movement of students across the different sub-systems and between secondary and tertiary education, and to make the BTe more responsive to the needs of industry.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

6. The 2004 reform was informed by international experiences, from both Latin America and Europe (in particular France), and the results of international benchmarking, based on data from international initiatives such as PISA and administrative data collected by international organizations. The information was borrowed more successfully than in past occasions by ensuring that these experiences were taken into account but not accepted uncritically for transposition to the Mexican context. A process of policy learning in relation to the use of international experiences could therefore be identified in this respect.

An interesting aspect of the reform is that it worked as an un-planned pilot for a subsequent reform (Reforma integral del Bachillerato, 2007) of the whole of upper secondary education in Mexico, which scaled-up several of the core aspects of the 2004 reform and aimed to produce greater integration within the secondary education system. The BTe reform made other components of the system aware of the need for change in aspects such as the focus on learning outcomes.

The reform approach adopted accelerated the process of implementation through developing the confidence of the government of the need for change and the direction to take. It also showed how, as teachers became more familiar with reform they also became more accepting of it. Some structural aspects of the innovation (e.g. curriculum changes) are in place whereas work is ongoing in other aspects (such as capacity building for teachers by means of teacher training and the introduction of stronger evaluation methods).

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned, whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

7. Lessons learned include:
- more emphasis should have been given during the design of the reform to develop, within the Secretaría de Educación Pública (SEP), the necessary know-how in relation to the implementation of reform;
- examples of institutional inertia suggest that the use of knowledge should move still further to the centre in decision-making;
- importance of the gathering and use of knowledge not only at the time of design of reform by central administration, but also at the time of implementation by frontline staff;
- the establishment of knowledge management tools such as National Qualifications Frameworks and

the enhancement of information, advice and guidance systems could be of help;
- monitoring and evaluation exercises should be strengthened;
- greater consideration could have been given to the involvement of a fuller range of relevant stakeholders to gather further knowledge and achieve greater support for the implementation of the initiative;
- during the implementation phase, co-operation between schools could have been of benefit both for exchange of good practice and for collaboration on delivery;
- collaboration with employers at the local level is of great importance given the concerns around employability of those BTe graduates who do not choose to undergo higher education studies.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

- OECD's Centre for Educational Research and Innovation
- Government of Mexico's Secretaría de Educación Pública' (SEP)

9. Funding/Finance	Describe whether donor-financed, jointly financed, locally funded; if possible give indication of budget sums.

10. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information including tel. and e-mail

- Beñat Bilbao-Osorio and Vanessa Shadoian from the OECD/CERI Secretariat
- Manuel Souto, Beñat Bilbao-Osorio and Francesc Pedró, from the OECD Secretariat

11. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

- *Systemic Innovation in the Mexican VET System: Country Case Study Report*, OECD/CERI, June 2009
- www.oecd.org/publications
- *Learning for Jobs: the OECD policy review of vocational education and training in Mexico. Mexico Questionnaire.* OECD, 2008
- *Reforma integral de la educacion media superior en Mexico.* SEP, Mexico, 2008

Example of Reform in Technical and Vocational Education and Training	
1. Title/Country	A title refers to project or programme (executed either by a Government, single agency project or joint programme)
Mexico: Upper Secondary Education Integral Reform (which goes beyond, but encompasses, VET)	
2. Start/Duration	Please give the dates of implementation of the project.
2007 – 2009	
3. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The overall aim of the reform is that upper secondary education better responds to the needs of today's world, understood as enabling effective social, political and labour market participation, so that individuals possess the critical thinking and problem solving abilities required to function in a knowledge-based plural society.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address? (Examples) A problem could be a legislation or policy gap. It could be a certain type of capacity constraint to deliver services. It could be a financial constraint, a lack of proper financial allocation or irregula

In 2006 upper secondary education was the part of the Mexican education system where the majority of drop-outs occurred. At that point, enrolment went from around 80% of the age cohort in the first year to less than 50% in the third year of upper secondary education. These high drop-out rates are mainly linked to economic issues as students leave education to enter the workforce. Therefore the three main challenges to which the reform aimed to respond were coverage, quality and equity (in particular addressing difference by socio-economic background).

More specifically, the three main principles that articulated the Reforma Integral de la Educación Media Superior (RIEMS) were related to the need of the new upper secondary education model to be:
- universal for all modalities and sub-systems of upper secondary education (which would start from a common core of knowledge, skills and attitudes for upper secondary school graduates, to be covered in a 'core curriculum' for all upper secondary education; this greater connection between all modalities of upper secondary education would be reflected in the issuing of a common certificate for all upper secondary);
- relevant and adequate, with a competence-based curriculum and having a common core of knowledge;
- portable (facilitating transit between schools and subsystems, by means of part-qualifications which are to be recognised in different schools and subsystems).

The reform also aimed to increase the coverage of upper secondary education from 58% to 68% in the period 2007-12, with almost 700,000 new students enrolled in the system, in order to reach 4.5 million. (A particular target for the VET strands of upper secondary education has not been fixed.)

4.2. Result of the project	• Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
Results achieved include:	

- potential for the beginning of a new culture of wider dialogue within upper secondary education in Mexico; it is not yet clear whether this will become institutionalized;
- a wealth of information being generated by the Government of Mexico's increased emphasis on the collection of monitoring information on the characteristics and performance of institutions and on improving assessment mechanisms and strategies.

However, at the time of writing, it is too early to pronounce a judgement on the implementation of the reform. Many of the elements of the reform are considered by stakeholders to be steps in the right direction. It remains to be seen whether the SEP and other stakeholders will be able to make available the human and financial resources to fully implement the reform so that it may reach the final objective of changing classroom practices to enhance the attractiveness and relevance of upper secondary education.

4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

Beneficiaries include upper secondary students, teaching and administrative staff, employers.

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

This reform was influenced by several previous reforms which had established the relevance of emphasising basic skills and competences (as opposed to learning inputs and memorization), the definition of basic common elements to all programmes within a sub-system, curriculum flexibility (through an emphasis on transversal knowledge), and learning-centred approaches to teaching (including increasing the importance of tutorials and dynamic elements in teaching).

The implementation of the reform needed to occur against the backdrop of the complex Mexican upper secondary education system, made up of a plethora of delivery institutions operating within 25 different sub-systems between which there was low permeability. Therefore the reform sought to change the relationship between the Federal government, State governments, universities and the whole range of upper secondary schools that operate in the different sub-systems of upper secondary education available in Mexico (which, until this reform, had seldom established a dialogue).

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

The reform organised the competences to be acquired in upper secondary education into generic (key, transversal across disciplines and transferable as they enable a wide range of further learning), subject-specific or disciplinary (divided into basic and extended) and professional (also divided into basic and extended) competences. Generic and basic disciplinary competences are common to all strands of upper secondary education and form the core of the Common Curriculum Framework (CCF) of upper secondary education in Mexico. The design of the reform was careful in the staging of its different elements. The reform endeavoured to find common points between different upper secondary education systems and did not try to completely substitute previously operating systems, but rather to provide them with coherence and transparency at the national level, while developing certain elements that were lacking.

A range of support mechanisms were put in place to help in the implementation of the reform for all strands of upper secondary education, including:
- guidance, tutoring and individual student support (important in particular to prevent drop-out);
- teacher training, as a key initial step for the reform to materialise in the classroom. It covers training on the production of didactic materials, assessment of competences and pedagogic strategies amongst other topics;

- increased investment in equipment and schools;
- training for school principals and a reform of their selection procedure;
- integral evaluation of learning, teachers, school principals, sub-systems and specific programmes;
- pathways for transitions between state and institutional systems of upper secondary education;
- the introduction of a single national diploma in addition to that provided by educational institutions.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

Lessons learned include:
- the importance of adopting a holistic view in order to improve the result on the bottom line (access, retention, relevance) of upper secondary education in Mexico, including its VET strands;
- greater use of pilots would have added to the knowledge base used in the final design of the reform;
- the need for clarity in relation to the resources necessary for implementation, both in terms of budgetary allocations and human resources required;
- the need for more development of know-how by teachers to implement the reform in the classroom;
- it would have been of benefit to have included clear institutional representation for teachers during the reform design in order that their views were more tangibly articulated.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

Secretaría de Educación Pública (SEP)

9. Funding/Financing	Describe whether donor-financed, jointly financed, locally funded; if possible give indication of budget sums

10. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

- Secretaría de Educación Pública' (SEP)
- Beñat Bilbao-Osorio and Vanessa Shadoian from the OECD/CERI Secretariat
- Manuel Souto, Beñat Bilbao-Osorio and Francesc Pedró, from the OECD Secretariat

11. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

- *Systemic Innovation in the Mexican VET System: Country Case Study Report*, OECD/CERI, June 2009
- www.oecd.org/publications
- *Learning for Jobs: the OECD policy review of vocational education and training in Mexico. Mexico Questionnaire.* OECD, 2008
- *Reforma integral de la educacion media superior en Mexico.* SEP, Mexico, 2008

Example of Reform in Technical and Vocational Education and Training	
1. Title/Country	A title refers to project or programme (executed either by a Government, single agency project or joint programme)
Indonesia: Access to TVET by marginalized groups	
2. Start/Duration	Please give the dates of implementation of the project.
2002-2005	
3. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The goals were to: • develop integrated training approaches using formal and non-formal education that would contribute to national poverty alleviation efforts; • demonstrate strategies towards achieving the third EFA Goal 'ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life skills programmes'. (Pilot projects were implemented in Cambodia and Nepal as well as Indonesia. All projects generated lessons for better programme and policy formulation.)	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	• What were the problems that the project/programmed (or policy) was meant to address? (Examples) A problem could be a legislation or policy gap. It could be a certain type of capacity constraint to deliver services. It could be a financial constraint, a lack of proper financial allocation or irregular expenditure patterns.
The objective was to challenge gender-biased perceptions of technical and vocational training. Girls and young women in poor societies are often deprived of various learning and income-earning opportunities that could improve their social status and living conditions. Vocational skills training is considered to be an effective way to help empower such marginalized populations. Yet existing technical and vocational education institutions often do not cater to the needs of those girls and women with limited basic educational qualifications. Various non-formal educational training programmes targeting women exist, but they can fail to consider specific needs of the target population and potential decent income-earning opportunities available. Such programmes thus result in having a limited or even negative impact on the trainees' lives that only reinforces female biases associated with their secondary position in families and society.	
4.2. Result of the project	• Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programmed (or policy intervention)
1. The Indonesian experience was successful in demonstrating how formal and non-formal education can be integrated to equip out-of-school girls (15-20 years of age) from poor marginalized families with practical, occupation-oriented, technology-based vocational skills training. Such skills development opens up the potential for improvements in how girls and young women contribute to the basic needs of their families and communities. Of particular interest is the integration of gender and empowerment perspectives. The participants develop positive attitudes about themselves and their roles in the community and explore the	

potential for meaningful employment or self-employment as a viable route out of poverty. This also helps raise their status in society and, in addition to improving their economic position, raises their potential for lifelong learning. In so doing, they gain access to other rights and make improvements in their quality of life.

2. Publication of a manual containing 7 training modules for building capacity of education officials, headmasters, teachers, local businesses and NGOs to expand the role of technical and vocational schools to include shorter-term, non-formal, vocational and technical skills development for marginalized out-of-school girls and young women.

4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

- Poor, out-of-school girls and young women who possess only primary or lower secondary schooling and live in marginalized, impoverished communities within easy transport range of the participating vocational secondary school.
- Planners and policy-makers for TVET within Ministries of Education and Employment.
- Headmasters and teachers of upper secondary technical and vocational schools who want to broaden their mission to serve as TVET learning centres for marginalized members of local communities by embracing both formal and non-formal education activities in co-operation with NGOs and local businesses.
- Provincial, district and city government officials who wish to broaden their educational mission in local communities to encourage and support schools, NGOs and local businesses to provide skills development opportunities for marginalized out-of-school girls and young women.
- Existing and potential local NGO and research partner staff and institutions.

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

From 2002-2005, pilot scientific, technical and vocational education skills development activities for impoverished, out-of-school girls and young women were undertaken at four upper secondary vocational schools in West Nusa Tenggara Province of Indonesia. The programme model set out to assist them to become self-reliant by sharpening their current skills and developing new ones, as well as increasing their self-confidence. The programme was judged sufficiently successful to develop a guidance manual for spreading the approach taken to other regions.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

- A participatory approach must be applied with a wide range of governmental, non-governmental, community and business partners involved in all stages.
- All skills development activities must be tailored to the specific geographical, social, cultural and economic context of the relevant community and participants.
- The programme approach must integrate gender, empowerment and reproductive health perspectives into course content and methodology.
- The training methodology needs to be learner-centred, participatory and flexible, and focus on building trainees' self-confidence.
- Curriculum content should focus on technical, entrepreneurial and life skills development (critical thinking, problem-solving, risk-taking, etc.) and also be competence-based and incorporate on-the-job internships or production learning opportunities.
- Monitoring and evaluation, as well as tracking of graduates and follow-up support and networking, are

integral in order to ensure periodic assessments of progress and achievements by measuring impact on graduates, as well as to ensure on-going support to them through local networks and institutions that provide further education and business services.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

- Based on experience in the pilot locations, a successful partnership includes full participation and commitment from: the relevant vocational secondary school by becoming more of a local community TVE learning centre embracing gender empowerment and using non-formal education methods as well as formal ones; the relevant district/city education office; community leaders; an external researcher.
- The importance of partnering with an experienced local NGO cannot be over-emphasised.
- The involvement of local businesses is critical.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The programmed was implemented in close co-operation with a women's development NGO, Mataram University, the local district and city education offices and the home communities of the girls and young women. Local businesses also participated in the programme by offering apprenticeships, teaching and material assistance. It was supported by:

- Education Policy and Reform Unit, UNESCO Asia & Pacific Regional Bureau for Education, Bangkok
- UNESCO Jakarta
- Ministry of National Education of the Government of Indonesia

9. Funding/Financing	Describe whether donor-financed, jointly financed, locally funded; if possible give indication of budget sums

UNESCO funded.

10. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

11. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

http://unesdoc.unesco.org for a copy of the manual
www.bps.go.id/index.shtml for BPS Statistics Indonesia
www.adb.org/gender.cga.asp for Asian Development Bank's Indonesia: Country Gender Assessment 2006
UNESCO, Bangkok 2008 *Technology-based Vocational Skills Training for Marginalized Girls and Young Women*
National Development Planning Board of the Government of Indonesia's Education Sector Assessment Concept Note, May 2008
Mason, A. and King, E. (2001) *Engendering Development – Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources and Voices*, New York: Oxford University Press

Example of Reform in Technical and Vocational Education and Training	
1. Title/Country	A title refers to project or programme (executed either by a Government, single agency project or joint programme)
Support for Revitalising Technical and Vocational Education (TVE) in Nigeria	
2. Start/Duration	Please give the dates of implementation of the project.
Phase I 2002 - 2004 Phase II 2007 - 2009	
3. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The goals of the project were to set up a continuing staff development system for training technical and vocational education teachers, revise and update TVE curricula for technical colleges and polytechnics and to introduce ICT and entrepreneurship education into the TVE system.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	• What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address? (Examples) A problem could be a legislation or policy gap. It could be a certain type of capacity constraint to deliver services. It could be a financial constraint, a lack of proper financial allocation or irregular expenditure patterns.
The first goal of the Millenium Development Goals is the eradication of extreme poverty and hunger. The key to poverty alleviation is economic growth and the creation of employment for all. However, poor people without employable skills cannot benefit from the growth process. Young unemployed people without any productive usage of their time are easily enlisted into crime and violence and desperate acts of survival. The risk is greatest with unemployed youth in conflict or post-conflict areas where poverty represents a constant threat to national stability and good governance. TVET offers opportunities for the acquisition of employable and entrepreneurial skills that facilitate entry into the world of work, leading to gainful employment, sustainable livelihoods and meaningful participation in the political and democratic space of nations. Technical books, critical to the provision of quality TVET, are scarce in general and very expensive to buy from abroad and they do not necessarily suit the Nigerian curricula. Technical textbooks have never been produced in Nigeria.	
4.2. Result of the project	• Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
• During Phase 1: updated and reviewed the curricula for TVET at the secondary level for technical colleges and post-secondary level for polytechnics. Subjects covered were: engineering, business studies, science disciplines and hospitality and tourism. 57 programmes were completed and produced on CDs for distribution in Nigeria and other countries. • Also in Phase 1: 7 Zonal Staff Development Centres were set up and a core team of 84 trainers were trained. They, in turn, trained over 5,000 teachers – 40% of technical teachers in Nigeria. • During Phase 2: further curricula developed; 247 textbooks produced for 7 disciplines in engineering and science; 140+ technical teachers trained. • The capacity to continue to develop and update teaching materials and textbooks in Nigeria. (In the next phase of the project a further 200 textbooks for 6 more disciplines (business studies,	

tourism and hospitality) will be produced and the curricula for 20 more programmes updated.)
- Creation of an evidence-based knowledge framework to share with other countries in the region.

4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?

- young people in post-secondary education, and their families
- technical teachers

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

The 2008 African Economic Outlook jointly published by the African Development Bank (AfDB) and the OECD Development Centre identifies TVET as a key response to the challenge of training a skilled and globally competitive workforce. In 2007 the AfDB High Level Panel on Skills Development recommended that AfDB focus on vocational training, higher education and science and technology, noting that private investments in Africa are often constrained by the lack of local skilled labour.

The African Union (AU) has developed a strategy for revitalizing TVET in Africa. In its Plan of Action for the Second Decade of Education (2006-2015), the AU admits that TVET has been under-served in the past and has therefore rated it as one of the 7 priority areas for investment on the continent. The Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) has identified TVET as one of its five priority areas for action in the sub-region. Among the objectives of the ECOWAS Plan of Action on TVET is the revision of curricula to ensure quality and relevance and the upgrading of the knowledge and skills of TVET teachers. The ECOWAS Plan also recommends the sharing of curricula and best practices within the sub-region.

The curricula, developed with the support of international consultants, are competency based and are composed of more than 50% practical content. The weekly activities and learning outcomes are detailed for the theory and practical parts as well as teachers' activities, required resources and assessments. The textbooks are written in digital format with a view to the introduction of e-learning in the future.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

- All textbooks have been produced in digital format ready for 'blended learning', to be loaded on the NBTE website for sharing by all polytechnics and technical colleges in Nigeria.
- Use of cascade approach to teacher development.

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

- The potential for eventual harmonization of TVET provision within ECOWAS, standardized certification and mutual recognition of skills competencies, the establishment of a regional qualifications framework and the mobility of skills within the sub-region.
- A good publicity campaign is required to make all students and teachers aware of the new material.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

National Board for Technical Education (NBTE), Nigeria
UNEWSCO

9. Funding/Financing	Describe whether donor-financed, jointly financed, locally funded;

	if possible give indication of budget sums
The total cost of the project was US$2.362m provided in part by the Nigerian Government (US$2.01m) and by UNESCO extra-budgetary funding from the Japanese Government Funds-in-Trust for Capacity Building of Human Resources (US$361,000).	
10. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail
11. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

Example of Reform in Technical and Vocational Education and Training	
1. Title/Country	A title refers to project or programme (executed either by a Government, single agency project or joint programme)
Investment in Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in the Philippines	
2. Start/Duration	Please give the dates of implementation of the project.
2002 - 2004	
3. Outcome	What were the goals of the project?
The goal of the project was to generate new knowledge on cost and financing with a view to informing policy decisions and guiding further research.	
4. 1. Objective (problem statement)	• What were the problems that the project/programme (or policy) was meant to address? (Examples) A problem could be a legislation or policy gap. It could be a certain type of capacity constraint to deliver services. It could be a financial constraint, a lack of proper financial allocation or irregular expenditure patterns.
A major concern of governments in recent years has been to ensure an adequate level of investment in skills formation to sustain economic growth and maintain international competitiveness. Much thought has been given to ways of developing the TVET sector without excessively increasing public sector financial burdens. As a result, efforts to encourage private spending and efficiency in public spending have been pursued in many countries. Yet, it is usually difficult to obtain a comprehensive measure of the total investment in skills formation. A better understanding of cost levels and structures is a prerequisite to increasing cost-effectiveness. As an economic activity, TVET can be measured on a macro-level using national accounting principles. Some countries are now producing national education accounts on a regular basis. Yet in the field of TVET, information on costs and expenditures is generally still limited. The complexity of the sector, due to the wide diversity of providers and types of courses, constitutes an obstacle to financial analysis. The poor level of development of information systems in TVET, compared to general education, often represents an additional problem.	
4.2. Result of the project	• Please describe the result achieved by the above project/programme (or policy intervention)
• Provision of new financial information to TVET planners and managers in the Philippines. • Input to the TVET financial information system and towards the development of national TVET accounts. • Methodology developed for classifying TVET activities and measuring training expenditure, which can be applied beyond the Philippines.	
4.3. Beneficiaries	Who benefitted/benefits from the project, directly and/or indirectly?
Educational planners and policy makers.	

5. Synopsis	Please give a brief description of the project in a maximum of 3 paragraphs.

In an effort to better capture and analyse the overall level of expenditures in the TVET sector in the Philippines a survey was conducted of 262 institutions covering the various types of TVET providers and various modalities of delivery. The survey was undertaken to obtain a comprehensive measure of the total investment in TVET by measuring expenditures on a macro-level using national accounting principles. In order to provide an overall picture of the situation on a national scale the study projected the results elaborated from the sample of providers with the aim of bringing together, within a coherent framework, the overall expenditures for TVET.

The survey sought to:
- assess the level of public and private expenditure on TVET;
- analyse the costs of TVET in absolute and relative terms;
- compare the costs of TVET according to categories of providers, duration of courses, training areas and modes of delivery;
- measure the funding of TVET and the contribution from public sector, companies, individuals and external development assistance;
- provide a detailed review and analysis of TVET activities in the country, in both the public and the private sectors;
- propose a methodology for classifying TVET activities and measuring training expenditures in the Philippines.

6. Key elements of success	What were the critical elements that contributed to "scalability"? Or what was the particular approach to capacity development or approach that led to policy impact/changes?

7. Lessons learned	Please include any lessons-learned whether or not they were originally envisaged at the inception of the project.

8. Implementation partners	Please include line ministries that undertook the implementation as well as donors or agency partners.

The Technical Education and Skills Development Agency (TESDA), Philippines
International Institute for Educational Planning / UNESCO

9. Funding/Financing	Describe whether donor-financed, jointly financed, locally funded; if possible give indication of budget sums

10. Contacts:	Provide contact details for further information, including tel. and e-mail

11. Sources, links and publications	Provide references and links to allow access to more detail on the content of the project (preferably concise Internet URLs)

- information@iiep.unesco.org
- www.tesda.gov.ph - official homepage of the Technical Education & Skills Development Authority
- www.gov.ph – official portal of the Government of the Philippines
- www.nscb.gov.ph – official homepage of the National Statistical Co-ordination Board
- www.dole.gov.ph – official homepage of the Department of Labour & Employment, Philippines
- www.deped.gov.ph – official homepage of the Department of Education, Philippines
- www.census.gov.ph – official homepage of the National Statistics Office, Philippines
- Peano, Serge; Vergel de Dios, Benjamin; Atchoarena, David; Mendoza, Ursula; *Investment in technical vocational education and training (TVET) in the Philippines*. Published 2008, iiep/web/doc/2008/05