

**MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE OF THE REPUBLIC OF
KAZAKHSTAN
ASSOCIATION “EDUCATION FOR ALL IN KAZAKHSTAN”**

**NATIONAL REPORT ON COMMUNITY LEARNING CENTRES IN
KAZAKHSTAN**



Almaty, February 2004

Introduction

This report was prepared by experts of the Association “Education for all in Kazakhstan” jointly with the representatives of the Ministry of education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Association “Initiative schools in Kazakhstan”.

The report briefly describes the situation on community development initiatives in Kazakhstan implemented with the support of UNESCO, Soros-Kazakhstan Fund as well as other community based NFE programmes supported by the government and other organisations (GTZ, Kazakhstan Government, etc.).

Information was collected through study of published reports and documents, web-sites, monitoring of CLCs activities, conducting interviews, questioning of community people, study of statistical data. The list of information used is given in Annex 3. Information was gathered, classified, analysed, main positions accentuated and conclusions made.

Section 1. Background and overview for CLCs

1.1 A brief overview on socio-economic and cultural situation in the country

Kazakhstan is the second largest country in the CIS and the ninth biggest in the world. Having the territory of 2,7 square kilometers it stretches for 2800 kilometers from the east to the west and for 1600 kilometers from the north to the south. The republic is divided into five geographic regions: West, East, South, North and Central Kazakhstan, has 14 oblasts, 160 raions, 22 cities with population over 100.000 people. The total number of population is 15 mln. people. State language is Kazakh; Russian is used as official language.

Indicators of social and economic development of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the late 90-s reflect a situation characterised by the aftermath of economic recession in 1998 followed by a raising economic activity in 1999 and onwards. Thereafter, the country entered a period of economic recovery, resulted in a GDP of 9,8 % growth in 2000; 13,5 % in 2001; 9,5% in 2002 and 9.2% in 2003. GDP growth was primarily due to an increase in gross agricultural output (by 28,9 %) and industrial production (2,2 %).

The high economic growth rates of the last years are attributed mainly to the enhanced performance of oil, energy, metal and chemical industries. The agricultural sector is also gaining some ground: in 2003-2005 the Government is planning to invest more than 150 billion Kazakh tenge (approximately 150 million US dollars) in the development of the agricultural sector.

It is intended to foster the development of a competitive environment in iron, steel nonferrous industries and raw material processing, including agricultural raw materials, with a view to diversify the economy and reorient it from raw materials to processing. In the medium term plans special attention is given to mechanical engineering, particularly, oil and gas machinery, and transport development. The National Programme of Innovative Industrial Development envisages that by 2015 GDP growth will be 3.5 times higher compared to its level of 2000.

In 2000, Kazakhstan was granted market economy status and its long-term international credit rating was upgraded. Together with a growth in economic activity it helped to enhance the social sector. The average monthly wages and salaries rose by almost **20 %**.

Demographic developments

According to the latest census, carried out in 1999, the population of Kazakhstan was more than 14,900,000 people, with 55,2 % urban population. As of the beginning of 2002, the

country's population was 14,820,900 people, of which 51,8 % were women, 56,3 % lived in urban areas and 43,7 % - in rural areas. The number of deaths declined from 154,300 to 147,600. The number of marriages and divorces decreased from 96,000 to 92,900 and from 35,500 to 26,600 respectively.

Economically active population of working age (in thousand)

	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002
Economically active population – total	7052,6	7055,4	7107,4	7129,0	7400,3
Including:					
Employed population	6127,6 (86,8%)	6105,4 (86,5%)	6201,0 (87,2%)	6361,9 (89,2%)	6709,6 (90,6%)
Wage and salary workers	3783,0 (61,7%)	3354,2 (54,9%)	3504,4 (56,5%)	3826,5 (60,1%)	4030,3 (60%)
Unemployed population	925,0	950,0	906,4	767,1	690,7
Unemployment rate, %	13,0	13,5	12,8	10,8	9,8

(source: Statistics Agency of the RK)

1.2 Educational situation with reference to literacy and continuing education

The strategic development plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan until the year 2010 defines the priority objective for the education system as expanding access to quality education of different levels and types of education. Efforts are being made to create a quality assurance system based on the principle of continuity. The objectives of the education system, along with providing knowledge, are to teach skills that make use of this knowledge and facilitate continuing learning. The education system is viewed not as an autonomous structure, but as a part of the socio-economic system capable of addressing issues of human resources development in the context of economic growth.

1.3 Locations of Community Learning Centres supported:

by UNESCO:

<i>Nº</i>	<i>CLC name</i>	<i>Address</i>	<i>Contact details</i>	<i>Facilitator name</i>
Almaty oblast				
1.	Amanbokter village	Building 8, Lenin street, Amanbokter village, Sarkand rayon, Almaty oblast, 489232	8 (32839) 22481 Sarkandclc@nursat.kz	Zhanna A. Zhunusova
2.	Karabulak village	Building 65, Orazbekov street, Karabulak village, Eskeldy rayon, Almaty oblast, 489130	8 (32836) 30235 Eskeldiclc@nursat.rz	Svetlana N. Safonova
Zhambil oblast				
3.	Kordai village	Building 48, Tole bi street, Kordai village, Kordai rayon, Zhambyl oblast, 485610	8 (32636) 21249 Kordaicomc@mail.kz	<u>Sholpan M. Tikenbayeva</u>
4.	Nogaibai village	Building 8, Kozhakhmetuly street, Nogaibai village, Kordai rayon, Zhambyl oblast, 485620	8 (32636) 27219 Nogaibaicomc@nursat.kz	Saule S. Nakyspekova
5.	Sortobe village	Building 152, Lenin street, Sortobe village, Kordai rayon,	8 (32636) 24524 Sortobecome@nursat.k	Amina M. Esra

		Zhambyl oblast, 485624	z	
6	Taraz city	Micro raion 7, Building 14, ap. 2, Taraz city, 484048	8 (3262) 76948 Tarazclc@nursat.kz	Zhanar S. Khairusheva

Supported by Soros Kazakhstan Fund (SKF):

#	Location of CLC	Number of CLCs
1.	North Kazakhstan oblast	4
2.	Aktobe oblast	1
3.	West Kazakhstan oblast	1
4.	Atyrau oblast	1
5.	Karaganda oblast	1
6.	Kostanai oblast	3
7.	Kzyl Orda oblast	4
8.	Pavlodar oblast	3
9.	Zhambil oblast	1
10.	Almaty oblast	3
11.	Akmola oblast	1
12.	South Kazakhstan oblast	1
13.	East Kazakhstan oblast	2
Total:		26

As we can see the geographic coverage of CLCs supported by SKF is wider, they are located in 13 oblasts (the total number of oblasts is 14). Out of 26 CLCs 13 are located in rural regions, the others are in cities. A few are located in remote rural localities.

The concept of CLCs supported by SKF (the project was launched in 2000) differs from UNESCO concept in some details. The principal difference is that SKF CLCs are usually located in schools or other education institutions which are selected based on the competition. The assumption is that in rural regions only schools can unite the community and organise social activities, only schools have premises and almost the whole population in the villages are parents and due to this it is easier to involve them in various activities. At the initial stage the intention was to set up Community Education Centres, but in the course of time this title was changed into Community Oriented Schools (or Schools as Centres of Community Life).

Another difference is that SKF does not explore needs of local communities. They select those education institutions who have already started interesting initiatives and have become visible on the local level. Having identified the schools SKF organises training for them followed by developing project proposals. Some of them are funded depending on its importance for the local community needs. Funding includes the cost of equipment as well. A case study on the experience of an institution supported by SKF is given below.

During the interview the representative of SKF Galina Kuznetsova has underlined that it was difficult for schools to coordinate big social activities, especially those aimed at improving the quality of life, setting up small business, organise needs assessment and tailor made training for the population. A separate autonomous organisation or unit was needed to manage this

important work. At the moment all Centres have registered themselves and are named Community Foundations. They have the status of NGOs and can act on behalf of community members. At present SFK is increasing its support to Community Foundations. A new competition was announced and around 20 new institutions have joined the initiative. SFK is going to organise training for these newcomers.

Case study “Activity of the Pervomai Training Centre (East Kazakhstan oblast)”

Pervomai Training Centre has been set up in 1982 as a state training centre. In 1997 its funding from the public sources was closed and a group of staff members decided to set up a self-supporting non-public organisation. Using the premises of a kindergarten they started up training of unemployed youth in “farm hostess” and “governess” occupations.

Due to increasing unemployment many students couldn't pay for their training. To survive it was decided that parents who couldn't afford to pay were invited to cover the cost of training through working and producing goods which could be then sold. Some of them could work in a sewing shop. Through sewing and selling of uniforms and bed cloths the team managed to cover the cost of electricity supply, purchase heating equipment. Installing of the equipment was also made by parents and students themselves. The second step was setting up relationship with the Employment Centre and receiving funds for training unemployed.

Later on the Pervomai Training Centre overtook also the functions of a cultural and methodological centre. Society “Kazakh language”, Clubs “Blue bird” and “Hostess”, “Ladies’s school”, music band, youth club «HI-FI» were opened in the premises of the Training Centre. Among other activities can be mentioned English language training, discoteque and thematic evenings with the involvement of lectures on healthy life style, evening meetings for youth and adults dedicated to holidays.

The team explored fund raising opportunities and managed to receive several grants from «Eurasia» Foundation which was used for preparing training shop for training farmers. This work resulted in emerging of small farms (around 25) and made a good impact on improving the social situation in the community. Over 100 specialists were trained during 1998-2001 within this training programme.

The computer equipment received within the framework of this grant enabled the staff to have trained 500 village young people and students.

The second grant (1999) received from Soros Kazakhstan Fund «Development of civic initiative of youth» made it possible to open a House for Aged People, receive funds for repairing and restore the activity of Palace of Culture, etc. At present the Pervomai Training Centre is a recognised Community Centre. It organises charity activities, learned to involve volunteers and raise funds. In summer 2000 и 2001 they organized Summer Camp for children to develop self-government skills using resources allocated by local businessmen.

In the Sunday school in 2000-2001 around 40 representatives of the local community learned various skills, like sewing, dancing, aerobics, communication skills, etc.

In 2000 Pervomai Training Centre participated in the competition “School as a centre of local community” announced by Soros Kazakhstan Fund and is continuing its activities. In August 2002 they registered their Public Fund «Pervomai Charity Fund of continuing education», which successfully participates not only in the SFK «Community Education» project, but also in the projects and programmes initiated by other international organisations.

1.4 Other community based NFE programmes supported by the government and other organisations such as NGOs.

There is no coordination and therefore no structured information on such programmes. From what could be found we can say that there is a variety of programmes which can be split into several groups:

- Ecological community based programmes.
- Programmes implemented by youth and children' organisations (12 %),
- Gender focused programmes (12 %),
- Charity and social protection programmes (12 %),
- Art and culture programmes (10 %)
- Protection of human rights (7 %),
- Programmes covering medical services and protection of invalids (14 %),
- Support to public initiatives (6 %),
- Education and science, including entrepreneurship training (20 %), etc.

Some of the initiatives are initiated and managed by grassroots and local NGOs, others initiated and steered by central government agencies and donors, but implanted in defined territories. Below are given some examples.

1.4.1 Entrepreneurship training.

This is mainly organised through associations and business centres. For instance, Aktobe Public Fund "Business Centre" is a non-governmental non-for-profit organisation set up in 2000. Its mission – provision of practical support to entrepreneurs, protection of their rights, development and implementation of programmes aimed at development of small and medium business, organisation of training activities for them. Within the framework of the project "Setting up social agency for training basics of entrepreneurship with young people" they organise training activities to help young people to generate business ideas and realise them through training. The project is politically and financially supported by the government. Funds were allocated by the Ministry of culture, information and social concord of RK.

1.4.2 Assistance to "Development of Model Economic Promotion Structures in the selected regions of Kazakhstan" implemented by GTZ (German Agency for Technical Cooperation).

Its main objective is strengthening continuing education in Kazakhstan. Among its components are: training for entrepreneurs and start-up, support in establishing and developing local entrepreneurial self-help organizations and micro-financing. Geographic coverage: Kostanai, North-Kazakhstan, West-Kazakhstan, Kyzylorda and Zhambyl oblasts. The GTZ successfully completed project in Pavlodar (1997 - June 2003). As a result, Association Business ("AB") has been established with the support of the GTZ project which currently provides a wide range of services to entrepreneurs and start-ups in the Pavlodar city and oblast. In addition to consultancy and training Microcrediting Fund has been established by the "AB" with support of GTZ which continues to give grants to start a business in Pavlodar (GTZ contribution is 230 thousand EUR). Another important aspect is that "AB" consultants and trainers continue to provide training courses for start-ups and entrepreneurs using the GTZ methodologies and materials without external assistance. In the other regions named the project is on-going.

1.4.3 Agronomical project supported and funded by Philippe Morris Tobacco Company.

The training activities are located directly in the field of activity, in the Headquarters of the company in Iliisky rayon, Alma Ati oblast and abroad, in other company centres.

Target group A : technicians – agronomists: Tobacco production, protection, selection, productivity, quality assurance, planning.

Target group B : local tobacco producers - farmers: tobacco production and selection (full production cycle), protection. Ancillary subjects: marketing, financial and record keeping aspects of the activity, basics of small business. 5,000 farmers are involved with their families

The content of training :

- For the target group A) technicians – agronomists: 1) Technical subjects: tobacco - production, protection, selection, productivity, quality assurance, planning, marketing, pricing. 2) Methodology: mentoring, control and follow-up of farmers.
- For the target group B) local tobacco producers - farmers: tobacco production and selection (full production cycle), protection. Ancillary subjects: marketing, financial and record keeping aspects of the activity, basics of small business.

The programme strongly builds on after-training support and consolidation actions, such as individual advise and support for problem solving, mentoring and control and follow-up of the practical activity in the field. In view of the inherent motivation effect, study tours for exchange of experience are also organised, particularly in countries with certain similarities (Turkey).

The effectiveness of the project is measured through production indicators - Productivity and quality of the tobacco sorts comply with standards. Farmers' capacity is appraised regularly and the production process controlled to ascertain the highest likelihood of good results.

26 agronomists received specialisation in improved tobacco production methods and work with stability in the project. The project aims to organise the necessary factors for stable and controlled levels of tobacco production complying in qualitative terms (tobacco sorts and quality) and quantitative (productivity, and production of the sorts). To reach this objective the project blends an economic package of services to target groups (production inputs in credit; secure sales of the product; timely cash payments), with a technical assistance package. The latter includes the above described focused skills development programme for the involved farmers. In addition the project includes a package of social benefits to farmers (health and education, rewards, access to certain company benefits and activities, participation in new training directions such as computer skills).

The positive effects of this project are obvious for all involved parts:

- The company – it was able to organise the production of the needed raw material within local conditions, in profitable form. Although the local tobacco production does not cover the totality of sorts needed for the good blends (the company has to import sorts from other countries), the present situation represents, reportedly, a significant progress.
- The involved farmers have a stable source of activity and revenue, as well as a new skills professional basis that represents a reward as well.
- The local economy: the multiplier effect of the large enterprise in the local market is witnessed by the number of small firms that started and / or enhanced operations and diversified production in view of the supplies for the tobacco company. These include tobacco-packaging producers, designers, transporters and catering, among others of less scale.

- The local authorities: some of the interviewed in the local Akimat recognised the relative importance of the company for the local economy and budget.
- The company participates as sponsor in a number of social initiatives in the region and countrywide: education and youth, equipment for orphanages and rehabilitation of certain infrastructures.

1.4.4 Assistance to rural women starting own business provided by the Association of Women-Entrepreneurs.

The programme is focused on strengthening economic sustainability of women, their adaptation to the market environment, development of entrepreneurship skills. A microcrediting organisation «Vozrozhdenie (Revival)» has been set up to facilitate giving credits to women. Credits are accompanied by training seminars.

1.4.5 Project «Development of ecological tourism in the community» implemented by the «Wild nature» community based NGO supported by the UNDP Global Ecological Fund.

The project made a good impact on the social situation in the community. Using the allocated grant six families were able to have their houses refurbished, set up water supply and sanitation systems, purchase water heaters to start up village mini-hotels. The mini-hotel owners were selected among the unemployed against agreed criteria - accuracy, responsible, having good cooking skills. In parallel the community people opened a music school where children can learn Kazakh folk music instruments. Music band set up familiarises the guests with the Kazakh music traditions, introducing a peculiar national flavour into the ecological tour. Another group demonstrates the process of brewing «kumis» - national Kazakh drink made of horse milk. Villagers who have their own cars are invited to work as taxi drivers. Another villager renders horse riding services. A group of villagers cleaned up a spring and now tourists can drink clean water while walking on the route. A shop was opened where tourists can buy Kazakh national souvenirs.

The community centre is planning to purchase decorated horse harness to make the horse riding more attractive. A shop is to be opened to produce Kazakh traditional folk art, set up a learning and cultural centre, restart kindergarten using the premises of a former kindergarten.

Section 2: Policy and legislation concerning CLCs

2.1 Policy statement and/or legislation concerning CLCs

One of basic human rights is the right to have unions and associations and it is impossible to develop communities without the involvement of civil society organisations or self-government. In Kazakhstan there are laws regulating the activity of various groups, associations, communities and their relations with authorities.

The breaking down of the centralized soviet system forced people to come together in order to develop a network of non-formal mutual assistance, provide that their social and economic needs are properly addressed in the process of dying out of the old system of social protection. The first civil society organizations came into being due to the necessity of solving serious common problems (like death of the Aral sea, functioning of nuclear testing areas, etc.).

The legislative base of local self-government in Kazakhstan is made of the following principal documents:

- **Constitution** of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 30.08.1995. Article 89 p. 1 stresses the importance of local self-government to ensure that population can resolve local problems independently on their own.

With the development of new economic relations and course for the democratization it became possible to establish various public associations, political parties, movements, volunteer organisations. It necessitated the adoption of special normative-legislative acts to support the activity of emerging public organizations and groups. According to the data of the Ministry of justice between 1991 and 1995 559 public organizations were registered. A year later in 1996 the number of them reached 3050 and as of October 2003 there were around 4 500 NGOs. Among them 15% are ecological NGOs, youth and children' organisations (13, 6%), gender (13,3%), social protection (13, 1%), art, culture, education and science (12, 5%), protection of human rights (7,6%), medical (6,8%), support to public initiative (6,0%), multi-profile (4,7%), association of invalids (4,4%), rehabilitation of children-invalids (4,0%).

The Law **“On public associations in the Republic of Kazakhstan” (1996)** has made the basis for functioning of public organizations. According to the law all organizations had to pass through state registration in the Ministry of justice or its local departments.

In 2000 and 2001 there were some amendments introduced in the mentioned law. The law covers the activity of all public associations initiated by citizens except for religious associations, organs of local self-government and public initiatives whose activity is regulated by specific legislative acts.

- Law **«On local administration in the Republic of Kazakhstan»**, (adopted in January, 23, 2001 and amended in April, 2001) regulates relations in the field of local administration, defines the scope of competence, organization, rules of activity of local organs and elective bodies as well as legal position of members of local public elective bodies (maslikhats).

The title of the law already assumes that local administration should be regulated by the state. The term “organs of local self-government” is used in the law; however the definition of the term is not given though Article 29, para 7, Article 33 para 6, Article 35 para 15 declare that governors (akims) of various levels (oblast, city, raion) should interact with organs of local self-government.

The term “local community” is used in the mentioned above Law though not defined as well as it doesn't define the term “local self-government” though in para 4 of the Article 6 it points out that solving of issues of local administrative-territorial structure and identification of borders of local communities is referred to the competence of local elective bodies (maslikhats).

The current economic situation in the country and in the regions, availability of excess people of working age due to high unemployment rate necessitated the adoption of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan **“On employment of population”** which regulates legal, economic and other relations in the sphere of employment. The law gives the definition of target groups who need social protection, clarifies the term “employment of the population”, defines the rights and responsibilities of the government in the field of employment. A new article on **“Labour mediation”** has been introduced to facilitate and widen opportunities of citizens for job seeking. The Law provides for distinct clarification of the difference between the national economic policy, employment policy, social policy and labour market policy. In this connection the Law “On employment” is directly related to “local communities” and “bodies of self-government”, as the introduction of the Law ensures that in the field of employment citizens have equal rights in terms of protection against any form of discrimination, provision of equal opportunities in obtaining job and necessary training, social protection against unemployment, assistance in finding a job and job placement.

National Conception of State Support of NGOs adopted in 2002 foresees that NGOs can be funded from the public sources through participating in the tender. In the past projects implemented by NGOs is funded mainly by foreign organisations. This support was big and made a considerable impact on the development of non-governmental sector, but this external assistance is decreasing. Another aspect is that grant issuing organisations have own objectives

and priorities which are not always in line with local community needs. The adoption of the Conception enables NGOs to more flexibly respond to urgent needs of communities.

As seen from the analysis, the normative-legislative acts do not provide concrete mechanisms to involve organs of local self-government, representatives of local communities in solving their problems. According to the present legislation representatives of local communities have to go through the process of juridical registration, regulate their relations with tax authorities, overcome various constraints and all this actually hampers their activation.

A significant breakthrough in this regard was conducting of the **Civic Forum** on 15 of October 2003 initiated by the President N. Nazarbaev. In his presentation he emphasized that in the history of our country there has never been an experience of a civil society. Early democratic forms of civic life of Kazakhs has been destroyed by the totalitarian soviet regime. Having started building democratic society we still feel the pressure of the past. Estrangement from the property and power have resulted in appearing of paternalistic behaviour, social dependence, fear of initiative. Unlike other countries where democracy was developing based on civil society involvement we have to develop democracy, civil society and state in parallel. Today the relations between NGOs and the state should be developed on a principally new basis. In this model the state and NGOs should be viewed as equal partners to provide sustainable economic and political development, and a strong civil society.

President Nazarbaev underlined that Law on NGOs is in process and will be finalized with the involvement of NGOs themselves. NGOs should be eligible for receiving funds from the public sources and for this 42 million tenge has been allocated to fund 20 projects. Socially focused projects will be regularly funded in the future based on tender.

Summarising we can say that:

- Development of local communities is reflected in a number of legislative documents though there are no documents directly related to community development. In the documents these issues are covered by the concept of self-government;
- The so called self-government organisation. i.e. community organisations are not independent from local authorities as they need to have an institutional status and registration in order to operate.
- The years 2002 and 2003 can be considered to be a new stage in the development of community organisations as the importance of civil society organisations in the socio-economic and cultural development of communities is recognized on the highest political level.

2.2 Inclusion of CLCs in the national education plans, in particular EFA national action plans and UN Literacy Decade

Development of community organisations is included in the EFA National Action Plan. Section 3.2.6 *“Measures for improving the quality of education and ensure that recognised and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills”* in Mid-term objectives envisages “support to regional training centres (community learning centres) and centres for social and psychological adaptation for both young people and adults, especially for women, as well as for the population from the regions with depressive economy and those from rural area”.

As for UN Literacy Decade – the launching of the Decade was announced in Kazakhstan later than the EFA National Action Plan was developed and due to this the concept of CLC is not directly included there. There is no specific national plan related to UN Literacy Decade either.

2.3 Budget allocation for CLCs by the government and financial and other assistance from external agencies.

In the past there was no practice of allocating funds for community organisations. Since 2002 and especially prior and after the Civic Forum government allocated 42 million tenge to fund 20 socially focused projects and it was announced that socially focused projects will be regularly funded in the future based on tender. Local authorities (oblast and raion levels) also allocate funds to support community organizations. Unfortunately there is no data available as there is no coordination of activities related to the community organizations. We can judge only from the scattered information available from various sources. However it allows us to make a judgment that there is a tendency for supporting community organizations from the public sources. For instance, Akim of Taraz city, Zhambil oblast B. Sauranbaev allocated 420 thousand tenge for the Taraz CLC for repair works, maintenance and purchase of furniture. In addition the Akimat also allocated salaries for 10 staff members working in this CLC. More examples can be described in other regions as well, however due to the non-availability of official data on this issue we cannot give any concrete figures.

Section 3: Main activities of CLCs

Contents, target groups (esp. disadvantaged groups) and number of participants of activities carried out in the CLCs covered by the report content.

The content of training :

- Computer skills, language skills, production of carpets, folk art goods;
- Training of farmers: tobacco and other agricultural goods production, protection, selection, productivity, quality assurance, planning, marketing, pricing.
- Marketing, financial and record keeping, basics of small business;
- Amateur art and theatre training ;
- Cooking, training of tourist guides, welders' training, etc.

Target groups:

- Unemployed, including youth and girls;
- Women, including single mothers;
- Farmers, including tobacco producers;
- Adult population, including elderly and pensioners;
- Youth and school children;
- VET students;
- Entrepreneurs;
- Invalids;
- Children of preschool age;
- Children from disadvantaged families, including families with many children and with one parent.
- Civil servants, teachers, staff of local authorities;
- Representatives of minority ethnic groups, repatriants.

Number of participants of activities carried out in the CLCs covered by the report content.

Information on this aspect is available only for the CLCs supported by UNESCO.

#	CLCs	Trained		
		Since October 2003	2004	Total
1.	Kordai	48	49	97
2.	Sor-Tobe	97	27	124
3.	Nogaibai	46	28	74
4.	Karabulak	98	75	173
5.	Amanbokter	64	16	80
6.	Taraz ¹	47	70	117
Total.				665

Section 4: Effective implementation of CLCs

The CLC in Kazakhstan have been set up recently and during this short time it is difficult to analyse their activity as all of them are in the situation of conceptualising and learning. However some analysis can be made.

1. Community participation.

Community members willingly participate in the activities organised by CLCs. In the localities where CLCs were set up as elsewhere in the country there is a well developed system of formal education. However it is not always adequate to the rapidly changing circumstances. Besides though all secondary general and vocational schools are equipped with computers and have access to Internet the number of computers available is not enough for all those who would like to learn computer skills if not to mention other skills needed. All CLCs established with the support of UNESCO do not charge money for training and therefore their services are available for and demanded by representatives of disadvantaged groups. So, there is no problem with community participation, but a problem with availability of equipment, resource people, trainers. The more advanced are CLCs the more community members need sophisticated skills, like entrepreneurship, setting up and developing small business, generating ideas, etc. Such training requires external support as can be delivered by qualified people.

Monitoring has shown that in the Taraz CLC the target groups are mainly children from disadvantaged families. All of them attend secondary schools. They come to the CLC to learn various skills. The most demanded are computer and foreign language skills. The facilitator is a qualified informatics teacher who can organise training computer skills. But the number of children who would like to participate is bigger than the schedule will permit. A similar situation with foreign language training. Recommendation was made to involve more volunteers.

2. Resource mobilisation

From the very first day of CLCs operating managers and facilitators were oriented towards providing their sustainable development based on mobilising resources. Some of the CLCs, namely Taraz city and Kordai village CLCs (two out of six) were successful in doing so.

¹ Set up in December 2003.

Case study on the experience of the Taraz Community Learning Centre supported by UNESCO

The Taraz city CLC was strongly supported by the city authorities as well as by the community members. The CLC was initiated by the Public Fund for Support of Youth Education whose leaders have played a big role in mobilising resources. As a result of their efforts the premises were provided for free by the local Council of Cooperative of Apartment Owners. Costs of heating, electricity, water and sanitation supply as well as cleaning services are covered also by this Council. The Chairperson of the Council is a member of the CLC Committee.

The promoter in agreement with the CLC Committee appointed the CLC facilitator and trainers. At the beginning these people were working as volunteers, but later (end of 2003) the CLC Committee managed to get funds from the city authorities to cover a modest salary for their work.

In addition the CLC Committee succeeded to get more funding for salaries from the city authorities – for ten trainers beginning with January 2004. This core group of full time personnel supported by volunteers will enable the CLC Committee to organise a wider variety of training for community members based on needs assessment.

There is a wide range of training and social services provided, namely, computer training, painting, foreign language courses, tourist activities, biking, meetings of community people, etc. This CLC is planning to purchase sport equipment to set up a sport centre to involve more teenagers who have behavioural problems.

The Kordai CLC is also working towards sustainability of the CLC. Their target group are unemployed women. The CLC Committee managed to get resources from from the promoter of the CLC – Raion department of labour and social protection whose head allocated salaries from the fund for public works. This CLC is making preparation for being registered. The new status will enable them to have access to the funds allocated for retraining unemployed.

Two more CLC Committees (Sor-Tobe and Nogaibai) are seeking for funds from the public sources and have a good chance to succeed.

The mentioned above examples are a good evidence of political and financial support of CLCs provided by the local authorities. However for sustainable development the CLC managers and facilitators need further training to be able to raise more funds and not only for salaries, but to utilise other sources of funding and support.

A very important aspect – learning resources. In order to be responsive to the changing needs of the clients CLCs need to have flexible curricula and learning materials and this is a big problem, especially materials and software in the Kazakh language.

3. Capacity building

Staff training proved to be of utmost importance for successful operation of CLCs. Training is needed for CLC facilitators, volunteers as well as CLC Committee members and local authorities. Facilitators need training in adult learning methodologies, presentation skills, resource management, marketing skills, entrepreneurship skills, needs assessment, development

of tailor made programmes, etc. Managers also need financial management skills, monitoring and evaluation skills, resource mobilisation skills, establishing linkages and networking, etc.

Some training was organised prior to the establishment of CLCs for future managers and facilitators. It was very successful and valuable. However once it was not based on their own experience and at the moment when people have many questions and due to staff turnover there are new CLC facilitators additional training is very essential.

Trainers also need training enabling them to develop clients' needs based training materials and this kind of training is difficult to organise internally. It is high time to set up a National Resource Centre aimed at coordination and organising training activities for various target groups. CLC facilitators need their skills to collect and analyse statistics be developed as well.

Another aspect is raising awareness of local authorities, familiarising them with the successful experience gained already by the CLCs to disseminate it further.

4. *Establishing linkages and networking*

This is a very topical issue which also requires further training. We can say that a good start has been made in some CLCs, but more needs to be done. Good links have been established between CLC Committees and local authorities which resulted in the allocation of funds and political support of CLCs. There is a feeling of ownership from the government authorities and community members who accepted the concept of CLCs as not something external, but rather as very useful and relevant for the local context. Some examples have been given above as to the good relations and support provided to the CLCs in the two oblasts.

The Sor-Tobe and Amanbokter CLCs link their activities with formal education institutions inside the community.

For instance, Sor-Tobe CLC has established partnership relations with the neighbouring vocational school. The CLC can use the VET school facilities and sewing machines for training women and VET school students can have training computer skills and access to Internet in the CLC.

The Amanbokter CLC has close partnership with the Central Asian University funded by Aga-Khan Foundation. The executive director of the university, R. Sisikenova jointly with CLC facilitator Zh. Zhunusova carried out a survey of the local people needs in terms of opportunities to arrange the seminars for adult people (business-programme). It is planned to implement 2 business programmes in the first half of 2003.

The next step is to further develop this aspect of their activity, help them to establish good links between the CLCs operating in Kazakhstan, in other countries – both close neighbours and far ones – to enable them to learn from each other. They should also learn to explore and use the potential of other agencies outside the community – government and private sector ones as well as NGOs - who can also service their needs. A new for CLCs is exploring and using the potential of other networks.

5. *Monitoring and evaluation*

This aspect is extremely important for providing successful operation of CLCs and their sustainable development and improvement. Monitoring of their activity is implemented internally by the CLC Committees and externally by the Association "Education For All in Kazakhstan". As a result the monitoring mission reports were prepared and discussed with the people concerned, recommendations made, their timely implementation controlled.

The CLCs in Kazakhstan have been set up recently and for the moment we can talk only about the first steps. Monitoring helped to identify some strengths and weaknesses in their activity, but the main conclusion was that all CLCs with limited physical, technical and human resources available are doing their best to adjust their activities to the needs of local communities. The emphasis should be made on further regular training of CLC facilitators, involving them in the activities, equipping them with necessary knowledge and skills relevant for their work, considering them as “change agents” on lifelong learning raising their awareness on its various aspects.

It is still rather early to conduct evaluation – it is planned for the second half of 2004 when CLCs gain some experience and have some history to be analysed.

It again raises the issue of a Coordinating Body which could accumulate the information on CLCs and other relevant community based organisations, develop and print training materials, organise training various skills for CLC facilitators, facilitate networking and exchange of experience and information, enhance cooperation between the existing CLCs and other organisations, etc. It could also serve as a Resource Centre on LLL for Central Asian region.

6. *Documentation and dissemination*

During the training seminar organised in July 2003 in the course of the discussion CLC facilitators underlined the importance of this aspect of their work as being necessary to increase the visibility of CLCs and their activities. Monitoring missions have shown that the majority of CLCs have done a lot to implement this recommendation. From the start up of CLCs they succeeded to involve mass media to publicise this event. Information letters are prepared and press briefings organised regularly to inform about new developments in CLCs, good relationship is established with mass media. Records and photos of CLC activities, study visits, seminars are exhibited in the front burners, publications collected and filed. Telephone and e-mail communication is established between the Association “EFA in Kazakhstan” and monthly activity reports and plans of activity are sent via fax or e-mail.

To raise awareness of various groups and authorities concerned CLC managers and Committee members visit local authority agencies, organise and participate in seminars, conferences to attract attention of policy makers to the problems CLCs face.

However much is still to be done in this regard. Collection of statistical data, its analysis and keeping record, presentation skills are weak points in the activity of CLCs. They also need to be trained to publicize themselves through booklets and information bulletins (this at the moment is done by the Association “EFA in Kazakhstan” for all CLCs), conduct needs assessment, develop training materials and set up own web-sites. All this requires additional resources – both human and physical which are still limited.

Section 5: Strengths and future challenges

1. *Impact of the CLCs at the grassroots and national levels*

The number of CLCs is limited, only 6 have been established recently – in October 2003. The period of their existence is very small to make any evaluation of their impact. We can use only the information available and make very conservative estimate of their impact.

On the national level their impact is small as the CLCs are located only in one raion of each of the 2 oblasts firstly due to the mentioned above reason – too little time and too little information on the outcomes. The scope of activities during this period was also limited; these were mainly installing equipment, connecting to Internet, training of staff, setting up communication channels, networking. This was mainly the period of conceptualising their own

role and mandate, involving community members, getting recognition from the community members as well as from the authorities. This stage was successful for all CLCs.

On the local and community level the impact is stronger. Their establishment itself has made a big impact on the community people as they perceived them as a sign of attention to their needs. All of them were set up in the disadvantaged areas and people were happy to get skills training responsive to their needs, use Internet and e-mail facilities, be able to socialise as for a long time there was no space for common social activities. It was a new concept for our people – to have the Centre which belongs to all people and where everything is organised based on a participatory approach, which is not a business enterprise where they have to pay money.

The strongest impact was of the Taraz city and Amanbokter village CLCs as in these localities the number of people involved was bigger and the scope of activities wider. An evidence of the effect of their establishment and its impact is the fact that raion Akims² were very much interested in opening of such Centres in their localities and were ready to provide all necessary support.

The next step is advocacy of this concept on the national level to raise awareness of policy makers, government agencies and ordinary people, familiarise them with the national and international experience related to providing various learning opportunities for community development and improvement of people's quality of life.

2. *Main challenges encountered by the CLCs at the grassroots and national levels*

- The mentality of some of government representatives. Many were used to decide on their own (top-down approach) what community people need. They were not ready to cooperate and assist in the establishment of CLCs. However this challenge was overcome after the senior officials (namely Akims of the Zhambil and Almaty oblasts) have expressed their political support.
- Lack of understanding of some of the community officials of the concept of CLC, their resistance to making it really a Centre belonging to the community and managed by the community.
- Lack of qualified human resources able to unite the community, develop the community through lifelong education and learning. It is not easy to involve committed facilitators who perceive community development as an on-going holistic process and care for the people.
- Lack of funds limiting the scope of CLC activities.
- Lack of coordination, networking and cooperation of CLCs which results in their isolation and detachment from the external world, existing national and international experience and new ideas. Inability of CLC personnel to go beyond the existing local framework, provincial thinking.

3. *Possible solutions to overcome the challenges*

- To organise advocacy and awareness raising campaigns for officials at various levels on the issues of lifelong learning and community development;
- Training of CLC staff and volunteer trainers to strengthen their abilities to use interactive methods, assess participants' needs, develop and use ICT based learning materials;
- Organise study visits, conferences, workshops, set up web-site to widely disseminate success stories and CLC models to promote broader use of the concept in other regions;

² Akim is a head of oblast or raion/city administration.

- Set up National Resource Centre on LLL to accumulate knowledge and information on lifelong learning, adult education, non-formal education and community development as integral parts of the holistic concept of LLL;

4. *Plans to strengthen CLCs as part of national EFA strategies*

- Provide that community development concept is included in all political documents related to education, poverty alleviation, HIV/AIDS prevention, promoting healthy life style, etc.;
- Involve the existing CLCs in conducting EFA Weeks, Literacy activities, project implementation, etc.;
- Provide that CLCs become a part of monitoring process of EFA National Action Plans.

5. *Suggestions for UNESCO, other UN agencies and international organisations to support CLCs*

- Assist in setting up Resource Centre on LLL and capacity building of its staff through involving in training activities in the field of adult and non-formal education and other aspects of LLL.
- Facilitate enhancing partnership and exchange of information and experience between CLCs and other networks, including setting up individual web-sites.
- Support fund raising and sustainable development of CLCs through skills training and registration of interested CLCs as non-commercial organisations.

6. *Key lessons learnt*

CLCs are a powerful mechanism for empowering communities. They need to be further developed and strengthened. The problem of community development should be viewed as a long-term activity and results cannot be obtained quickly – it takes time and requires investments - human, financial, technical and capacity building.

We shouldn't undervalue the long-term impact of the post-soviet mentality resulting in the tradition to live circumspectly looking back at the authorities. The local authorities should be actively involved at all stages of setting up and operation of CLCs.

In selecting future CLCs it is worth to locate the CLCs using the NGOs who have gained experience and visibility on community development issues.

Annexes

1. List of country report preparation team members.

(i) Ishchanova Mairash – Ministry of education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Department of secondary education, Unit for out-of-school activities, chief specialist; Secretary of the EFA National Thematic Technical Group on (i) life skills and (ii) adult education.

(ii) Tasbulatova Shaizada – Association “Education for all in Kazakhstan”, President; APPEAL RTC Team Leader, Coordinator of the EFA National Thematic Technical Group on (i) life skills, (ii) adult education, CLC project coordinator in Kazakhstan.

(iii) Belosludtseva Valentina - Association “Education for all in Kazakhstan”, President; APPEAL RTC, expert.

(iv) Kadirova Saltanat - Association “Education for all in Kazakhstan”, APPEAL RTC, CLC project coordinator for Zhambil oblast

(v) Akhimbekova Shamen - President of the Association “Initiative schools in Kazakhstan”, CLC project coordinator in Almaty oblast

2. Work schedule of the report preparation

#	Activity	Deadline
1.	Agree with the Ministry of education and science the composition of the team	January, 15, 2004
2.	Develop plan of country report preparation and send to UNESCO, Bangkok	January, 19, 2004
3.	Collect information and documents	February, 2, 2004
4.	Study and analyse the information	February, 9, 2004
5.	Prepare draft report	February, 16, 2004
6.	Discuss the report with the team	February, 18, 2004
7.	Send report to UNESCO, Bangkok for comments	February, 22, 2004

3. List of reference materials

- Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- The Law “On public associations in the Republic of Kazakhstan” (1996);
- Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On employment of population”;
- Law «On local administration in the Republic of Kazakhstan», (adopted in January, 23, 2001 and amended in April, 2001) ;
- National Conception of State Support of NGOs (approved by decree of the Government of Kazakhstan, January, 23, 2002, # 85) ;
- Materials of Soros Kazakhstan Fund on Community Education, Almaty, 2002;
- Materials of the Civic Forum, newspaper “Kazakhstanskaya Pravda”, October, 16, 2003;
- “Education For All” National Action Plan, Almaty, 2003;

- Draft report «Training Strategies for Local Development», European Training Foundation , 2003;
- Information on technical cooperation between the governments of Kazakhstan and Federative Republic of Germany in the area of developing small and medium enterprises”, Almaty, 2004;
- Report “Establishment of Community Learning Centres in Kazakhstan”, Almaty, 2002;
- Monitoring report prepared by Association “Education For All in Kazakhstan”, Almaty, 2003.
- Women and men in Kazakhstan. Gender statistics, Almaty, Agency for statistics of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2002;
- Short statistical yearbook of kazakhstan – Almaty: Agency for statistics of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2003 ;
- Socio-economic development of the Republic of Kazakhstan – Almaty, Agency for statistics of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2003 ;
- Statistical Yearbook of Kazakhstan – Agency for statistics of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty, 2002 ;
- www.Kazakhstan-Current projects.htm

4. Photos and resource materials



Installation of equipment in the Kordai CLC



Opening of the Taraz CLC



Computer training in Sor-Tobe CLC, Zhabil oblast