



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Executive Board

Hundred and eighty-second session

182 EX/9

PARIS, 3 August 2009
Original: English

Item 9 of the provisional agenda

REPORT BY THE DIRECTOR-GENERAL ON THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION OF THE RESULTS ACHIEVED BY THE TEACHER TRAINING INITIATIVE IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA (TTISSA)

SUMMARY

By 34 C/Resolution 18, the General Conference requested the Director-General to undertake a full external evaluation in 2009 of the results achieved by the Teacher Training Initiative in Sub-Saharan Africa (TTISSA) and to report on its findings to the Executive Board at its 182nd session.

This document therefore summarizes the main findings of the external evaluation and sets out a number of recommendations for action.

The financial and administrative implications of the recommendations fall within the parameters of draft document 35 C/5 – paragraph 6.

Action expected of the Executive Board: proposed decision in paragraph 7.

1. At its 34th session, the General Conference reaffirmed the importance of the Teacher Training Initiative in Sub-Saharan Africa (TTISSA) in achieving the six education for all (EFA) goals and recognized that progress made to date towards achieving the expected TTISSA results as set out in document 171 EX/8 required careful measurement and assessment (34 C/Resolution 18). It further requested the Director-General to carry out an internal evaluation of TTISSA and to report on its results to the Executive Board at its 179th session, as well as to undertake in 2009 a full external evaluation and report on its results to the 182nd session of the Board.

2. The conclusions of the internal evaluation are set out in document 179 EX/5, Section VIII. The evaluation found, in particular, that all countries involved in the first phase of the initiative had benefited from UNESCO support to their teacher policy and practices, and that activities had been targeted to respond to the particular needs of each country as defined in the national TTISSA action plans. However, questions concerning the implementation of TTISSA were raised, in particular: ambiguity over the division of labour between the different UNESCO entities involved (the Section for Teacher Education at Headquarters, the Regional Bureau for Education in Africa (BREDA) and the UNESCO Institute for Capacity-Building in Africa (IICBA); insufficient human and financial resources; and the need to improve the profile of the initiative through better communication of its objectives and results.

3. The Director-General took immediate steps to respond to these concerns. In his Draft Programme and Budget for 2010-2011, he identified “teachers” as one of three “building blocks for Education for All”, which together will receive almost 40% of the total activity budget.¹ Furthermore, he determined that management of TTISSA will be decentralized from Headquarters to BREDA. Moreover, IICBA, whose financial allocation from UNESCO’s regular programme will be increased by some 20%, will focus exclusively on providing technical backstopping to the implementation of TTISSA. Finally, work is under way to scale up communication of the aims and impact of TTISSA, with a significant number of relevant documents being available on the UNESCO website and the “members-only” TTISSA portal. In 2010-2011, a databank on innovations in teacher training will also be established in order to contribute to the exchange of good practices and policies.

4. The external evaluation of TTISSA was undertaken concurrently with many of these decisions being taken. It makes several key recommendations concerning the future implementation of TTISSA, a number of which echo the concerns voiced in the internal evaluation. These include the clear delineation of roles and responsibilities of the UNESCO units involved in the Initiative’s implementation, “optimization” of funding and increased levels of human resources. In addition, the external evaluation identified the need for clarification of relationships with external stakeholders, updating of the Logical Framework and strategy, enhanced monitoring and reporting focused on impacts rather than outcomes, and close work with national ministries of education. Further details are available in the table below. The full report is available on the UNESCO website.

5. The Director-General takes note of these recommendations and is pleased to observe that, as set out in paragraph 3, he has already taken action on a number of them. Furthermore, he is currently taking steps to implement each of the additional recommendations made by the external evaluators. In particular, he endorses a continued relationship with key external stakeholders, clearly delineating the links between TTISSA and the programmes of these partners. He also supports the need for written guidelines concerning the delineation of roles and responsibilities within UNESCO, review of the Logical Framework and strategy, updating of the latter in order to take into account current priorities, and strengthened work with development partners at the country level. However, the Director-General notes the difficulty in implementing certain recommendations, such as those concerning impact-focused monitoring, which is challenging when applied to upstream interventions such as those of TTISSA, and common reporting mechanisms, which are not always possible due to the demands of different partner organizations and UNESCO units.

Financial and administrative implications

6. As noted in paragraph 3, “optimized funding” from the regular programme budget for TTISSA has been addressed through the designation of “teachers” as a priority area in draft document 35 C/5 for Major Programme I. Furthermore, efforts will be made to ensure that assignment of staff is adjusted to reflect this priority area. However, the Director-General notes the need for increased levels of extrabudgetary resources, particularly for national-level TTISSA interventions. He therefore encourages Member States to consider making voluntary contributions to the Initiative.

Action expected of the Executive Board

7. In the light of the foregoing, the Executive Board may wish to adopt the following decision:

The Executive Board,

1. Recalling 34 C/Resolution 18,
2. Having examined document 182 EX/9,

¹ Excluding the financial allocations to UNESCO’s education institutes.

3. Welcoming the external evaluation of the Teacher Training Initiative in Sub-Saharan Africa (TTISSA),
4. Takes note of its findings and the observations of the Director-General thereon;
5. Invites the Director-General to implement the recommendations within the scope of the limited financial resources available to him;
6. Encourages Member States to consider making voluntary contributions to support the implementation of TTISSA.

Evaluation of the Teacher Training Initiative in Sub-Saharan Africa (TTISSA)

Brief description of the activities evaluated/reviewed

The acute shortage of qualified teachers, particularly in Africa, has been identified as one of the biggest obstacles to the realization of the Education for All (EFA) goals by 2015. The Teacher Training Initiative for Sub-Saharan Africa (TTISSA) is the 10-year UNESCO response to the request by African Member States, confronted with huge quantitative and qualitative challenges in this regard, to implement a teacher-focused initiative. It was launched in January 2006 in 17 first phase countries and is now rolling out to cover all sub-Saharan African countries before 2015. The overarching aim of TTISSA is to increase the quantity and improve the quality of the teacher workforce in sub-Saharan Africa. The Initiative advocates a holistic approach to addressing issues concerning teachers and teaching personnel in sub-Saharan Africa. This recognizes that the establishment and maintenance of an effective, motivated teaching force is dependant on a number of factors – issues relating to policy, structures, management, working conditions and the overall status of the profession.

At the 34th session of the General Conference, Member States requested that an internal evaluation be carried out with a report submitted to the 179th session of the Executive Board (October 2007), and that this be followed by a full external evaluation with a report to be submitted to the 182nd session of the Executive Board.

Budget

During the 33 C/5 period, the overall regular programme budget for TTISSA (ED/HED/TED, BRENDA and field offices) was \$2,225,946. For document 34 C/5, this amount was reduced to \$813,300, primarily because field offices were no longer given a specific budget for TTISSA-related activities. In addition, extrabudgetary resources from several sources (EFA Capacity-Building, Spain, Italian Funds-in-Trust and Japanese Funds-in-Trust) have totalled \$8,600,499 over the two biennia, at best estimation. The budget for the external evaluation of TTISSA totals \$48,850 all-inclusive. This covers inputs from three consultants, two South studies, and a series of interviews in Paris.

This evaluation

The primary focus of the external evaluation is to assess the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and impact of TTISSA. In addition, the evaluation has explored the Initiative's model of implementation and its implications in relation to the upstream mandate of UNESCO with regard to support to Member States. Recommendations concerning the model of implementation and its significance to UNESCO as a whole have been made. The key questions of the evaluation consider four major areas: (1) relevance; (2) efficiency; (3) effectiveness and impact; and (4) sustainability.

Findings and conclusions	Recommendations
<p>1. Achievements: To a certain extent, the results achieved within the framework of TTISSA are difficult to document due to inconsistent reporting and the fact that many of them are not reflected in the indicators of the TTISSA Logframe or in the targets set out in documents 33 C/5 and 34 C/5. The following can, however, be stated regarding the four <u>main thematic issues of the TTISSA Logframe</u>:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • regional and national forums continued to support the review and dissemination of materials on <u>teacher management</u> issues; • advocacy activities continued to highlight and raise awareness on <u>teacher status and working conditions</u>, and support for strengthening UNESCO chairs has been developed; • advocacy on <u>teacher policy development</u> is evident through development and piloting of a policy tool kit containing tools for analysis, policy development processes and reference documents providing support to developing holistic teacher policies; and • <u>teacher quality</u> has been improved through a series of national interventions on development of modular approaches to teacher training and regional seminars have been conducted in order to promote awareness on the importance of teacher quality. <p>In relation to UNESCO's main roles, it is found that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • after an initial focus on <u>downstream</u> activities, TTISSA has in recent years adopted an increased focus on linking implementation on the ground with <u>upstream</u> policy changes at the national, regional and international levels. Results achieved include involvement of a growing number of international stakeholders in issues linked to teacher development and development and piloting of a teacher policy package. • As an example of this move towards more upstream work, activities involving direct teacher capacity development have been minimized in recent years, with greater emphasis on using TTISSA to develop and promote new ideas for teacher development (laboratory of ideas function), enhancing cooperation on teacher development (catalyst for international cooperation function), disseminating studies (clearing-house function) and setting standards. 	
<p>2. Challenges:²</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relationships established with a high number of external partners, but lack of follow-up may weaken potential tangible outcomes of collaboration with these stakeholders. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Catalogue and clarify roles of external partners so as to ensure their strategic involvement in South-South and triangular North-South-South cooperation. • Clarify the partnership with the Task Force on Teachers for EFA in the process of being established with its Secretariat at UNESCO.

² Challenges Nos. 2 to 4 based on monitoring on development on findings in 179 EX/5 report of Internal Evaluation.

Findings and conclusions		Recommendations
3.	<p>Challenges:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TTISSA information is not sufficiently shared and distributed. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop a Communication Strategy to strengthen communication e.g. via an upgraded website and continued flow of updates to stakeholders on achievement of the TTISSA results and thereby better draw out lessons and impact of activities, encouraging Member States to enhance communication with their development partners.
4.	<p>Challenges:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Several Member States have expressed concern about the lack of clarity and understanding of roles and communication of different UNESCO units and institutes involved in TTISSA implementation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In relation to the new role of BREDA in the decentralized paradigm, clarify roles of and communication channels between Headquarters, BREDA, IICBA as well as Cluster and National offices. • Publish guidelines endorsed by ADG/ED on clarified roles of key UNESCO stakeholders and prepare guidelines and manual on operations of TTISSA.
5.	<p>Challenges in relation to relevance.³</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TTISSA Logframe serves as an overall framework for TTISSA but does not reflect current changes in TTISSA. • Current monitoring processes are inadequate to ensure national needs are met. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regularly review and update the TTISSA Logframe to ensure that it is reflected in UNESCO biennial planning documents and reflects changes in actual implementation as documented in country reporting. • Develop responsive monitoring systems at country level that focus on TTISSA contributions to national objectives and results. • Capitalize on knowledge generation for capacity development to further shape the TTISSA framework.

³ Challenges Nos. 5 to 8 derive from analysis of the foci of this external evaluation.

Findings and conclusions	Recommendations
<p>6. Challenges in relation to efficiency:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Insufficient funding level for TTISSA, as regular budget over the last two biennia has decreased while extrabudgetary resources have remained substantial, although not equally distributed among countries. • Insufficient staffing level within UNESCO to coordinate activities and report on results achieved. • Risk of ineffective use of existing scarce resources due to unclear strategic focus as the present TTISSA Logframe is rather far reaching and with very diversified sets of outputs and activities. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Source for additional extrabudgetary funding options and ensure the optimization of the regular budget for TTISSA. Funding could be enhanced by UNESCO being able to demonstrate and catalogue good practice and successes to funders. • UNESCO should ensure appropriate HR levels for TTISSA to demonstrate its high priority to teacher development. This entails appropriate staffing at BREDa to take up its new coordination function for TTISSA as well as adequate staffing at IICBA and TED, since they will continue to play key roles. Mechanisms for ensuring involvement of key stakeholders at national level should be explored. • Develop clear strategic focus for TTISSA to focus on key issues such as upstream themes linked to the newly developed and piloted teacher Policy Toolkit. Ideally, the rather scarce funds from the regular budget should be used to ensure continued delivery of key strategic upstream issues, while extrabudgetary funding could be a source for national application of these themes.
<p>7. Challenges in relation to effectiveness and impact:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improve documentation of results achieved under TTISSA and to move from activity to outcome reporting. • UNESCO's current monitoring is inadequate to demonstrate results. • To demonstrate TTISSA impact and provide feedback for improved project design, increase international recognition of UNESCO's role with regard to teacher development and thereby attract a higher level of extrabudgetary funding. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reinforce common reporting mechanisms so UNESCO can report on results and achievements and demonstrate best practice within teacher development, which in turn should also contribute to better ability in generating extrabudgetary funding (see 6). • Greater emphasis on incorporating impact level in monitoring systems and reporting guidelines as to document international best practices in relation to teacher development.

8.	<p>Challenges in relation to sustainability:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To foster national ownership by ensuring that TTISSA initiatives are incorporated into country sector strategies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Work closer with national ministries of education and development partners at country level to ensure that support for TTISSA interventions is generated and TTISSA's four focus areas are embedded in national teacher policies, education sector plans and SWAPs.
<p>Action taken/to be undertaken by the Director-General</p>		
<p>The Education Sector agrees with all the recommendations of the evaluation and is taking steps to implement each recommendation.</p>		