



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Executive Board

Hundred and ninety-ninth session

199 EX/14 Part I

PARIS, 8 March 2016
Original: English/French

Item 14 of the provisional agenda

IMPLEMENTATION OF STANDARD-SETTING INSTRUMENTS

PART I

GENERAL MONITORING

SUMMARY

Pursuant to 197 EX/Decision 20 (I), this document contains an overall report on the conventions and recommendations of UNESCO that the CR Committee is required to monitor, and an analysis of specific measures adopted by the Secretariat within the framework of the monitoring of the implementation of standard-setting instruments and the difficulties encountered for each of the instruments.

This document also contains a revised timetable of work of the CR Committee for 2014-2017, as well as a timetable for submission of Member States' reports on measures taken to implement conventions and recommendations for 2016-2017.

The implementation of 197 EX/20 (VIII) on the strategy to improve visibility, ratification, implementation, monitoring and cooperation concerning education-related standard-setting instruments is the subject of a separate information document (document 199 EX/14 INF.)

This item has no financial or administrative implications.

Action expected from the Executive Board: Proposed decision in paragraph 61.

1. By means of 197 EX/Decision 20 (I), the Executive Board requested the Director-General to ensure the implementation of the legal framework for the implementation of the conventions and recommendations the CR Committee is required to monitor, as approved by the Board at its 177th session (177 EX/Decision 35 (I) and (II)) and amended at its 196th session (196 EX/Decision 20).
2. This document therefore contains, following a brief report on the status of ratification of the conventions (and the 1962 Protocol), an assessment of the measures taken by the Secretariat for the implementation of that framework and an analysis of specific measures adopted by the

Secretariat as part of the monitoring of the implementation of standard-setting instruments and any difficulties encountered for each of those standard-setting instruments.

Status of ratification of the 1960 and 1989 Conventions

3. As at 1 January 2016, the *1960 Convention against Discrimination in Education* had been ratified by 100 States and 17 States had ratified the *1989 Convention on Technical and Vocational Education*. In comparison with the document submitted at the 197th session of the Board, no new States have ratified these conventions.

4. The table below shows the number of ratifications per UNESCO electoral group for the two conventions, together with the percentage of ratifications of those instruments within each of the six electoral groups. A full list of States Parties and non-Parties per electoral group has been posted on the webpage devoted to CR activities on the UNESCO website.¹

Conventions	Number of ratifications per electoral group (percentage of ratifications within each electoral group)					
	Group I	Group II	Group III	Group IV	Group V(a)	Group V(b)
1960 Convention ²	16 (59.26%)	22 (88%)	19 (57.58%)	11 (25%)	22 (46.81%)	10 (52.63%)
1989 Convention	0 (0%)	3 (12%)	0 (0%)	3 (6.81%)	5 (10.64%)	6 (31.58%)

Analysis of the specific measures adopted by the Secretariat within the framework of the monitoring of the implementation of standard-setting instruments and the difficulties encountered for each of the instruments

5. The information contained in paragraphs 6 to 56, below, was provided by the programme sectors concerned and by the UNESCO Institute for Statistics. The sectors' contributions have been posted online, in full, on the UNESCO website page on the activities of the CR Committee.

- **1960 Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (ED)**

6. Based on the analysis of challenges encountered by Member States in implementing the 1960 Convention and Recommendation, the Secretariat's action, during the period under review, sought to continue addressing the difficulties reported. Efforts towards reinforcing the monitoring and enhancing advocacy in relation to State's legal obligations under the Convention continued. Regarding the main activities carried out, in terms of monitoring, the Secretariat worked on the launching the ninth Consultation on the 1960 Convention and Recommendation. As requested by

¹ http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=48363&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html.

² The 1962 Protocol instituting a Conciliation and Good Offices Commission to be Responsible for seeking the Settlement of any Disputes which may arise between States Parties to the Convention against Discrimination in Education has been ratified by 34 States, distributed by electoral group as follows: Group I: 12 (44.44%); Group II: 0 (0%); Group III: 7 (21.21%); Group IV: 4 (9.09%); Group V(a): 7 (14.89%); Group V(b): 4 (21.05%). Following the appointments to the Commission at the 38th session of the General Conference, the Secretariat has initiated the procedure for the election of a new Chair and Vice-Chair of the Commission. To date, the Commission has never been called upon to use its good offices or exercise its conciliatory functions. For more information on the Commission:

http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=23762&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html.

the Executive Board, the reporting guidelines were finalized after a formal consultation with the Members of the Executive Board, organized in November 2015. The formal launching took place through a circular letter by the Director-General (CL/4147 dated 3 February 2016), and the launching of the online platform for Member States reporting, developed in order to encourage the participation of the maximum of Member States, to facilitate the submission process and for cost-effectiveness. Follow up to the eighth Consultation on the 1960 Convention and recommendation also continued. After the publication of three thematic mappings, the second publication of the compendium of practical examples in implementing the right to education is being published. In parallel, follow-up to the ratification campaign launched by the Director-General was ensured in order to increase the mobilization. A series of practical tools and material on the ratification process was prepared in three languages in order to encourage Member States and assist them in the process. Moreover, the Secretariat pursued the implementation of the strengthened approach adopted in terms of reporting, notably in the context of participating in the Universal periodic review. This will be even further reinforced in the framework of the implementation of the Strategy on standard-setting instruments. In terms of promotion, advocacy and reinforcement of capacities, within the context of assisting Member States in strengthening the foundation of the right to education in national legal systems, and after the publication of the Guidelines for reviewing national legislation and policies in the field of right to education, this tool was tested in two countries, including series of national-level consultations for the preparation of reports. A third country in Africa is now envisaged for the pilot testing. Regarding the research component, significant work on privatization of education and its impact was carried out in collaboration with partners. In addition, a policy paper on the challenges of private education in light of the existing international legal framework (entitled: Investments in private education: undermining or contributing to the full development of the human right to education) was published to contribute to the global discussions on this issue. Regarding the database on the right to education, during the reporting period, approximately 15 country profiles have been updated. Interesting inputs for the updating are also received notably from Members States and field offices. An action plan for the updating and further development of the database (notably the upgrading to an observatory on the right to education) is being defined. Finally, work on the protection of the right to education of refugees and asylum-seekers has been initiated.

7. All these activities seek to respond to the challenges raised by Member States. They are likely to have sound impact: the review guidelines would help create a demand from Member States for education law reform; the database would help ensure accountability and transparency and foster regional and international cooperation; its development into a global Observatory would help promote further the right to education; the ratification campaign will help maintain the momentum built up over the past few years; the tools based on the eighth Consultation are highly important for information-sharing and advocacy; all the awareness raising activities are key to the role that the right to education and normative action would play in the implementation and monitoring of Education 2030; the participation in UPR is crucial in ensuring a reinforced monitoring of the right to education; finally the Strategy would help provide more visibility and ensure a better monitoring and implementation of standard-setting instruments in the context of Education 2030. They are conceived in such a way that there are mutual benefits and all are intended to assist Member States to address the challenges that the implementation of the right to education generates.

- **1989 Convention on Technical and Vocational Education (ED)**

8. Pursuant to 190 EX/Decision 24 (III), the monitoring of the 1989 Convention and the 2001 Revised Recommendation had been delayed pending a possible revision of their texts. The 37th session of the General Conference had invited the Director-General to submit to it, at its 38th session, a draft revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education, reflecting new trends and issues in technical and vocational education and training (37 C/Resolution 17).

9. The General Conference at its 38th session adopted the Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training, which supersedes the 2001 Revised Recommendation, and recommended that Member States apply the provisions of this Recommendation by taking appropriate steps, including whatever legislative or other measures may be required, in conformity with the constitutional practice and governing structures of each State, to give effect within their territories to the principles of this Recommendation. The General Conference further recommended that Member States bring this Recommendation to the attention of the authorities and bodies responsible for TVET, and also other stakeholders concerned with TVET, and requested the Director General to report to the 40th session of the General Conference, on the status of Member States' implementation of this Recommendation (38 C/Resolution 14).

10. The two normative instruments concerning TVET will be formally associated for monitoring, which has now resumed. As provided for in the Strategy on standard-setting instruments in the field of education (2015-2021) adopted by 197 EX/Decision 20 VIII, the new Recommendation being the most up-to-date normative instrument concerning TVET, the monitoring of the implementation of the 1989 Convention will be conducted with reference to the provisions contained in the new Recommendation. The draft guidelines for the preparation of reports by Member States on the application of these normative instruments will be submitted to the Executive Board in 2018.

11. The adoption of the Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training is timely as it will inform Member States' implementation of the 2030 Agenda. The Strategy on standard-setting instruments in the field of education and the new Strategy for TVET (2016-2021), submitted to the present session of the Executive Board, should support the visibility, implementation and monitoring of the Recommendation. Indeed the Recommendation will inform UNESCO's work with Member States, including TVET policy reviews and capacity development. The monitoring of the implementation of the Recommendation will inform the mid-term review of the new Strategy for TVET.

- **1960 Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (ED)**

12. (See paragraphs 6 and 7, above).

- **1966 Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers and 1997 Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (ED)**

13. The report of the 12th session of the joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendations concerning Teaching Personnel (CEART) and the Committee's most recent interim report which deal with allegations received from teachers' organizations regarding non-observance of the Recommendations are submitted to the Board at the present session (document 199 EX/14 Part II).

- **1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ED)**

14. In accordance with Stage 3(b) of the specific multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided, as amended by the Executive Board at its 196th session (196 EX/Decision 20), the Secretariat is to seek the advice of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations (CR) prior to the collection of information from Member States, National Commissions, research institutions and civil society organizations in order to prepare the next consolidated report of the 1974 Recommendation. The document 199 EX/14 Part III presents draft guidelines developed to guide the reporting on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation.

- **1974 Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers (SHS)**

15. In accordance with Stage 3(b) of the specific multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided, as amended by the Executive Board at its 196th session (196 EX/Decision 20), document 199 EX/14 Part IV presents the proposals on the 2013-16 monitoring exercise prior to collection of information from Member States, National Commissions, research institutions and civil society organizations in order to prepare the next consolidated report of the 1974 Recommendation.

- **1978 Revised Recommendation concerning the International Standardization of Educational Statistics (UIS)**

16. The third round of the annual Survey of Formal Education was launched in January 2016. This is the first survey in which the new fields of education and training (ISCED-F 2013) have been used. This marks the end of the adaptation of the UIS's international surveys to the revised classification. During the first two rounds of the survey in 2014 and 2015 nearly 190 countries and territories (90% of those targeted) have succeeded in submitting at least some data according to the ISCED 2011 revision of levels of education.

17. The French and Spanish versions of the joint Operational Manual compiled by UNESCO-UIS, OECD and Eurostat were published electronically in December 2015. The manual provides guidance to countries on mapping their national education systems to ISCED. Over 60 such mappings have now been published by the UIS with more to follow.

18. The Institute's staff, including Regional and Cluster Advisors based in the field, provides advice and guidance to countries during training workshops and missions to countries on the use of ISCED for international data reporting. Regional workshops on education statistics which take place every two years provide an additional opportunity to review ISCED mappings and resolve problems in data reporting.

19. Pursuant to 196 EX/Decision 17, the Secretariat will submit at the 201st session of the Executive Board a further progress report on the work accomplished in the implementation of the 2011 and 2013 revisions of the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED) and ISCED Fields of Education and Training (ISCED-F) respectively.

- **1980 Recommendation concerning the Status of the Artist (CLT)**

20. A survey to measure the implementation of the Recommendation was developed in consultation with international artists associations and was sent by the Secretariat in October 2014 to UNESCO Member States and to relevant civil society organizations. A good result emerged, with 60 Member States and 55 civil society members responding to the survey, which drew particular focus to four contemporary issues: digital technologies and the Internet; transnational mobility of artists; social protection of artists; and freedom of artistic expression. These issues are addressed by both the Recommendation and the 2005 Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions, and the Secretariat pursues synergies between the two instruments. For example, Parties to the 2005 Convention in their quadrennial periodic reporting provide information on the mobility of artists. Additionally the UNESCO Aschberg Programme for Artists and Cultural Professionals, which was reoriented in 2015 to strengthen priorities under the 2005 Convention, promotes the mobility of artists. These allow the Secretariat to monitor implementation of certain aspects of the Recommendation.

21. The information gathered through the survey and 2005 Convention periodic reports was useful to develop the consolidated report on the implementation of this Recommendation, which was examined by the Executive Board at its 197th session and the General Conference at its 38th session. After examination of document 38 C/30 and its Annex, the General Conference invited the

Director-General to pursue synergies in the monitoring of the Recommendation with the 2005 Convention, and to transmit at its 40th session the next consolidated report. The governing bodies of the 2005 Convention also recognized the need to pursue synergies with the implementation of the Recommendation.³

22 The consolidated report demonstrates that while there is activity in some Member States supporting the status of the artist, more attention must be drawn to the Recommendation to increase its implementation. During the General Conference a side event was organized by Denmark, Norway and Sweden with the Secretariat entitled “The Status of the Artist and Artistic Freedom” which included high-level speakers and raised awareness of the Recommendation and its relevance today. To further visibility of the Recommendation, the Secretariat has established on the 2005 Convention website a dedicated space where relevant documents are available, including the full analytic report of the results of the survey, which includes best practices and recommendations, available at <http://en.unesco.org/creativity/monitoring-reporting/status-artist>.

23. At the fourth Conference of Parties of the 2005 Convention (June 2013), the question of artistic freedom and the social and economic status of the artist was discussed in relation to the periodic reporting on the implementation of the Convention. The Conference of Parties requested the Secretariat “to update its strategic and action-oriented analytical summary of the quadrennial periodic reports received each year, including a thematic focus on the status of the artist” (paragraph 7 of Resolution 4.CP 10). The Framework for Periodic Reporting helps collect information on the policies and measures adopted by countries to address various aspects of the status of the artist, including the measures specifically targeting women artists.

24. The Secretariat will, within the means possible, follow up on collection of data and good practices to monitor the impact of the Recommendation in areas of digital technologies, freedom of expression, transnational mobility and policies to support the social and economic status of artists. Currently the Convention Secretariat is developing a project to build capacities at the national and international level to monitor and evaluate measures to implement the 2005 Convention to support artistic creation and the freedom of artistic expression.

- **1993 Recommendation on the Recognition of Studies and Qualifications in Higher Education (ED)**

25. UNESCO assesses the implementation of the 1993 Recommendation on the Recognition of Studies and Qualifications in Higher Education primarily through monitoring the implementation of the five regional and one inter-regional conventions.

26. Following the adoption in December 2014 of the Revised Convention on the Recognition of Studies, Certificates, Diplomas, Degrees and Other Academic Qualifications in Higher Education in African States (also known as the Addis convention), a meeting was held in July 2015 at UNESCO to prepare the implementation of the revised convention. Sixty-four experts from 30 African Member States and the Holy See, representatives of six international, regional and subregional organizations, Permanent Delegations to UNESCO and the African Union Commission adopted at the close of the meeting a communiqué which recommends the establishment of an Informal Working Group for the implementation of the Addis Convention and asks UNESCO and the AUC to take steps to set up Group.

27. During the period under review, the first meeting of the Informal Working Group was organized on 12 and 13 January 2016, to discuss and adopt the mandate of the Group, its structures, working modalities, initial work plan and calendar of work. The proposal is that the Group works in 2016-2017 to support Member States to prepare for the implementation of the

³ Decision 9.IGC 5 of the Intergovernmental Committee for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (see document CE/15/9.IGC/Dec.), and Resolutions 5.CP 9b and 5.CP 14 of Conference of Parties to the Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (see document CE/15/5.CP/Res.).

Addis Convention through the operationalization of the modalities decided upon in the text of the Convention.

28. In line with the Regional Convention on the Recognition of Studies, Diplomas and Degrees in Higher Education in Asia and the Pacific (1983 Convention), the Secretariat at UNESCO Bangkok continues to support Member States in the application and monitoring of the regional convention. During the period October 2015 through January 2016, UNESCO Bangkok focused on three main areas of support: (i) regional capacity building activities; (ii) developing policy advocacy materials; (iii) preparing for the 14th session of the Regional Committee.

29. During the 13th session of the Regional Committee on the Recognition of Higher Education Qualifications in Asia and the Pacific, held in August 2014 in Colombo, Sri Lanka, Member States called on UNESCO to provide technical guidance on ratification procedures and, more broadly, to help raise awareness about the strategic importance of the Asia-Pacific regional conventions on the recognition of qualifications in higher education, including the 1983 Convention and the 2011 Revised Convention, which was adopted in Tokyo, Japan on 26 November 2011.

30. As a result of the 13th session, from October 2015 through January 2016, UNESCO Bangkok conducted a series of activities to support the monitoring and application of the regional conventions. These activities include: hosted a Regional Capacity Building Workshop on the Recognition of Higher Education Qualifications in Asia and the Pacific (21-23 October 2015); Convened a regional policy forum on The Promotion of ASEAN Integration through Open and Distance Higher Education (23-24 November 2015); conducted a mission to Phnom Penh, Cambodia on the recognition of qualifications in higher education in Asia and the Pacific at the invitation of the Director General of Higher Education, Ministry of Education Youth and Sport, Cambodia (20-22 January 2016).

31. UNESCO Bangkok began preparations for the 14th session of the Regional Committee meeting which will be hosted by Australia in Sydney on 17 and 18 August 2016. Planning meetings are under way to further support regional cooperation and the recognition of higher education qualifications in Asia and the Pacific.

32. Within the framework of the Lisbon Recognition Convention, UNESCO continued supporting the work of the Bureau of the Convention, in its capacity as Co-Secretariat together with the Council of Europe. During this period, several documents that will be tabled with the seventh Meeting of the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee (UNESCO, 29 February 2016) were finalized and transmitted to States Parties and relevant stakeholders in Europe for review in view of their adoption at the meeting. These include the draft Revised Recommendation on the recognition of joint degrees; the report on the implementation of the Lisbon Recognition Convention; and a Statement of the LRC Committee on the recognition of qualifications held by refugees, displaced persons and persons in a refugee-like situation.

33. This issue is also addressed by a Working Group established in November 2015. Comprised of UNESCO, the Council of Europe, the European Commission, student and university associations and other relevant stakeholders, the Working Group will: take stock of the recognition of qualifications held by refugees, displaced persons and persons in a refugee-like situation in cooperation with the ENIC-NARIC; foster the exchange of information and good practices; discuss how to ensure that, once their qualifications are recognized, the realities of refugees are taken into consideration in education processes; finally, will prepare a conference on all these issues (i.e. recognition of qualifications; intercultural challenges; and actions against radicalization) and will discuss the feasibility of a standard-setting instrument or a political recommendation on these issues.

34. UNESCO contributes to the work of the Bologna Follow-up Group, in particular the Advisory Group on the revision of the Diploma Supplement, whose establishment was requested in the Yerevan Communiqué. The Advisory Group is mandated to support UNESCO, the Council of

Europe and the European Commission to revise this document in cooperation with stakeholders. The first meeting of the Advisory Group will be hosted by Romania on 22 January 2016.

35. IESALC convened a high-level ministerial meeting in Brasilia, Brazil (8-9 October 2015). Representatives of 18 Member States, as well as regional bodies working on recognition issues such as Convenio Andrés Bello, Organization of Ibero-American States and Organization of American States participated in the event. Also present were several university networks; RIACES (the regional quality assurance network); and some higher education institutions including the University of Chile, the University of Health Sciences of Porto Alegre and the University of Puebla.

36. The high-level ministerial meeting had positive outcomes, most notably the creation of a Working Group responsible for the revision and updating of the regional convention. The Working Group has been established and its first meeting will be held in La Havana (Cuba) on 17 and 18 February 2016, during the biannual congress “UNIVERSIDAD 2016”. It is expected that the Working Group will complete its work before next session of the General Conference of UNESCO (2017).

37. Pursuant to 37 C/Resolution 15 and in accordance with the Rules of Procedures concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, the Director-General submitted the preliminary report 38 C/26 “Draft preliminary report Concerning the Preparation of a Global Convention on the Recognition of Higher Education Qualifications” to the 38th session of the General Conference. The General Conference took note of the Draft Preliminary Report (38 C/26) concerning the preparation of a Global Convention, recalled the 37 C/Resolution 15 and took note of the 197 EX/Decision 8.

38. As a follow-up, UNESCO is establishing a Drafting Committee, which will have the status of an expert committee, category VI, according to the *Regulations for the general classification of the various categories of meetings convened by UNESCO*. A category VI committee is set up on an ad hoc basis to submit suggestions and advice to UNESCO on the preparation of a programme/project in a specific field. The report of the expert committee will be submitted to the Director-General. According to the rules and regulations set out in the basic texts, members of the expert committee shall serve in their private capacity. They will be appointed individually by the Director-General after consultations with the governmental authorities of Member States. Members of expert committees shall, as a general rule, be nationals of Member States or Associate Members of UNESCO or nationals of states which are not members of UNESCO, but members of the United Nations. The Director-General may invite other specialists to join the committee.

39. For the purpose of this Drafting Committee, each electoral group will be invited to nominate three representatives. From the suggested nominees, the Director-General will appoint the members of the Drafting Committee, taking into account gender, expertise and geographical balance.

40. The first meeting will be organized early spring 2016 to discuss the terms of reference, a roadmap and working modalities. Three face-to-face meetings are foreseen and some online consultations between the members of the Drafting Committee. The outcome of the Drafting Committee will be a report that will be handed over to the Director-General late spring 2017.

• **2003 Recommendation concerning the Promotion and Use of Multilingualism and Universal Access to Cyberspace (CI)**

41. UNESCO undertook several measures aiming at facilitating its implementation by Member States into national policies, legislation and strategies:

- The third consolidated report has been endorsed by the General Conference in 2015. The fourth consolidated report will be prepared in 2018. For this purpose, the Director-General will request each Member State to prepare and submit to the Secretariat a

report on the action taken to implement this Recommendation. Based on these reports, the Secretariat will prepare and transmit to the General Conference, at its 40th session, the fourth consolidated report.

- In order to reinforce the implementation of the Recommendation, the Secretariat has also prepared an information document on its plans to develop UNESCO World Atlas of Languages for the examination at the 199th session of the Executive Board. The World Atlas of Languages will be designed as an interactive online platform to monitor language diversity around the world with special emphasis on the cyberspace and encourage collaboration among different stakeholders.
- In November 2015, the Secretariat organized the Regional Conference “Multilingualism in Cyberspace: Indigenous Languages for Empowerment” in San Jose, Costa Rica. The regional consultations served for the preparation of the Roadmap to develop a Regional Atlas of Languages and mobilization of the partners.
- UNESCO in cooperation with the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN) and the International Information Centre for Terminology (INFOTERM) finalized the Internet Governance Glossary in Arabic. It will promote use of Arabic language on the Internet and facilitate involvement of Arabic speakers in the multi-stakeholder international cooperation processes.

- **2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, including a glossary of definitions (CLT)**

42. The General Conference examined the status of implementation of the Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape at its 38th session (document 38 C/71). It recalled the importance of this standard-setting instrument and its implementation by Member States, in the context of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (particularly Goal 11 “Sustainable cities and communities”), invited Member States to take the necessary measures to implement the Recommendation and encouraged them to submit their reports on its implementation.

43. Following on from activities implemented since the adoption of the 2011 Recommendation, which are reported on in detail in document 38 C/71 and its annex, the World Heritage Centre is continuing to develop initiatives designed to promote the historic urban landscape approach and provide technical support to Member States in the implementation of the Recommendation.

44. This instrument will be a key element in the preparation of the report on the role of culture in sustainable urban development which will be presented by UNESCO at the third United Nations Conference on Housing and Sustainable Urban Development (Habitat III) in October 2016.

45. The World Heritage Centre has started to establish a timetable for the submission by Member States of their reports on the implementation of the Recommendation with a view to the session of the General Conference in 2019.

- **2015 Recommendation on Adult Learning and Education (ED)**

46. The revision of the 1976 Recommendation proceeded as planned. It was done in coordination with the revision of the 2001 Revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education to ensure that the instruments will be mutually reinforcing in addressing key policy issues in particular on lifelong learning and adult continuing education, as well as other contemporary issues, in a consistent manner. The General Conference, at its 38th session in November 2015, adopted the Revised Recommendation on Adult Learning and Education, and Member States expressed their satisfaction with the consultation processes.

47. The General Conference further recommended that Member States bring this Recommendation to the attention of the authorities and bodies responsible for Adult Learning and Education, and also other stakeholders concerned with Adult Learning and Education, and requested the Director General to report to the 40th session of the General Conference, on the status of Member States' implementation of this Recommendation.

48. The text of the Recommendation concerning Adult Learning and Education was authenticated by the signatures of the President of the General Conference and of the Director-General and transmitted to Member States.

49. The definition of ALE reflects this shift while preserving key elements of the previous definition; e.g. concerning the different understandings of the concrete age that defines adulthood in different cultures. It highlights the function of ALE as a major building block of a learning society and for the creation of learning communities, cities and regions. The text refers to the concept of lifelong learning and underlines the overall aim of ALE, namely to ensure that all adults participate in their societies and the world of work. It takes into account the three key domains of adult learning and education: literacy and basic skills; continuing education and professional development; and education and learning opportunities for active citizenship, variously known as community, popular or liberal education, to empower people to engage with a wide range of social issues. The potential and supportive function of information and communication technologies (ICT) is underlined.

50. The foundational role of literacy as a continuum of learning and proficiency levels, providing the essential building block for a learning society, is reiterated together with its function for solving problems in an increasingly technological environment. The need for a cross-sectoral approach to adult learning and education is underlined, requiring cooperation between various ministries beyond education, not least in relation to health and employment. The Recommendation also reflects principles of adult learning, that learning should be based on partnership, represent a crucial means for inclusion of vulnerable and marginalized groups, and apply participatory approaches. The areas of action described in the set of concrete recommendations follow the logic of the Belém Framework for Action. This is helpful for further monitoring since the established mechanisms of the CONFINTEA process, including the Global Report on Adult Learning and Education (GRALE) based on triennial national reports, will serve as the principal instrument to monitor implementation of the Recommendation.

51. The consultation process revealed that the Recommendation is understood as a crucial instrument to highlight the role of adult learning and education in the post-2015 agenda of the United Nations. The text reflects this key purpose by relating to the principles of sustainable development, as already underlined by the previous World Conferences on Adult Education (CONFINTEA V, 1997) and VI (2009). In a seminar on skills for life and work at UIL in summer 2014 which was organized by UIL together with the International Council of Adult Education (ICAE), the function of UNESCO'S Global Report on Adult Education (GRALE) for monitoring the recommendation was reiterated by stakeholders. In June 2015 the draft text was discussed together with the relevance of a revised normative UNESCO instrument for the European ALE community with input from the UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL), in a conference organized by a network of the European Society on Research on the Education of Adults (ESREA) in Ljubljana (Slovenia). Participants praised UNESCO's rights-based approach to ALE.

- **2015 Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training (ED)**

52. (See paragraphs 8 to 11 above).

- **2015 Recommendation concerning the Protection and Promotion of Museums and Collections, their Diversity and their Role in Society (CLT)**

53. At its 38th session, the General Conference adopted the Recommendation concerning the Protection and Promotion of Museums and Collections, their Diversity and their Role in Society (38 C/Resolution 49).

54. The Secretariat has started to establish a timetable for the submission by Member States of their reports on the implementation of the Recommendation with a view to the 40th session of the General Conference in 2019.

- **2015 Recommendation concerning the Preservation of, and Access to, Documentary Heritage including in Digital Form**

55. At its 38th session, the General Conference adopted the Recommendation concerning the Preservation of, and Access to, Documentary Heritage including in Digital Form (38 C/Resolution 55)

56. The Secretariat has started to establish a timetable for the submission by Member States of their reports on the implementation of the Recommendation with a view to the 40th session of the General Conference in 2019.

Timetable for submission of Member States' reports on measures taken to implement the conventions and recommendations for 2016-2017

57. By means of 196 EX/Decision 20, the Executive Board approved the amendments made to the Specific multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided (177 EX/Decision 35 (I)). Some of these amendments were intended, in particular, to ensure better planning of future consultations in order to draw Member States' attention to an exercise that arose out of their obligations under the UNESCO Constitution, in particular by specifying the dates by which Member States must submit their respective reports.

58. Accordingly, pursuant to the new second paragraph of Stage 1 of the specific multi-stage procedure, the CR Committee secretariat submits in Annex I the timetable for submission of Member States' reports on measures taken to implement the conventions and recommendations for 2016-2017.

Revised timetable of work of the CR Committee for 2014-2017

59. The CR Committee secretariat transmits in Annex II a revised timetable for the coming sessions of the Executive Board (from the 199th (spring 2016) to the 202nd session (autumn 2017)) at which the CR Committee will examine the preparations for forthcoming consultations on recommendations, the draft guidelines for the two conventions concerned, and the reports on the standard-setting instruments concerned. This timetable also shows the General Conference sessions at which the reports will be submitted on the monitoring of the effective implementation of these conventions and recommendations.

Strategy to improve visibility, ratification, implementation, monitoring and cooperation concerning education-related standard-setting instruments

60. Pursuant to 197 EX/Decision 20 (VIII) of the Executive Board, the Education Sector is presenting at the present session (document 199 EX/14.INF), the roadmap and a provisional timetable to guarantee the implementation of the Strategy, as well as detailed information on the implementation thereof and on the financial, personnel and procedural aspects of the proposed observatory on the right to education.

Proposed decision

61. In the light of the foregoing, the Executive Board may wish to adopt a decision along the following lines:

The Executive Board,

1. Recalling 15 C/Resolution 12.2, 23 C/Resolution 29.1, 165 EX/Decision 6.2, 32 C/Resolution 77, 170 EX/Decision 6.2, 171 EX/Decision 27, 174 EX/Decision 21, 175 EX/Decision 28, 176 EX/Decision 33, 177 EX/Decision 35 (I) and (II), 34 C/Resolution 87, and 195 EX/Decision 15, 196 EX/Decision 20 and 197 EX/Decision 20 (I) and (VIII) relating to the first aspect of the terms of reference of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations (CR), which concerns the implementation of standard-setting instruments,
2. Having examined documents 199 EX/20 Part I and 199 EX/14.INF. and the report of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations thereon (199 EX/..),
3. Urges Member States, once again, to fulfil their legal obligations under Article VIII of the Constitution of UNESCO regarding periodic reports on the action taken to give effect to the conventions and recommendations;
4. Takes note of the timetable for submission of Member States' reports on measures taken to implement the conventions and recommendations for 2016-2017 contained in Annex I to document 199 EX/14 Part I;
5. Requests the Director-General to ensure the implementation of the legal framework for the enforcement of standard-setting instruments, as adopted at its 177th session and amended at its 196th session, by the programme sectors and the UNESCO Institute of Statistics (UIS), which have responsibility for the conventions and recommendations monitored by the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations;
6. Decides to continue consideration of the matter at its 200th session.

ANNEX I

TIMETABLE FOR SUBMISSION OF MEMBER STATES' REPORTS ON MEASURES TAKEN TO IMPLEMENT THE CONVENTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PERIOD 2016-2017

Conventions and recommendations that the CR Committee is required to monitor	2016												2017													
	January	February	March	April	May	June	July	August	September	October	November	December	January	February	March	April	May	June	July	August	September	October	November	December		
1960 Convention against Discrimination in Education (ED)		Consultation of Member States from 3 February to 30 June 2016																				202 EX ER	39 C PR			
1960 Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (ED)		Consultation of Member States from 3 February to 30 June 2016																					202 EX ER	39 C PR		
1966 Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (ED)				199 EX ER CEART											201 EX ER* CEART											
1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ED)				199 EX EPC	Consultation of Member States from 2 May to 30 October 2016																		202 EX ER	39 C PR		
1974 Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers (SHS)				199 EX EPC	Consultation of Member States from 2 May to 30 November 2016												201 EX ER								39 C PR	
1976 Recommendation on the Development of Adult Education replaced by the 2015 Recommendation on Adult Learning and Education (ED)															201 EX EPC	Consultation of Member States from May to end October 2017										
1978 Revised Recommendation concerning the International Standardization of Educational Statistics (UIS)															201 EX ER									39 C PR		
1997 Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (ED)				(with 1966 R.)											(with 1966 R.)											

EPC : Examination of the preparation of forthcoming consultation by the Executive Board (recommendations)
 EG : Examination of guidelines by the Executive Board (conventions)
 ER : Examination of reports by the Executive Board (conventions – summary of reports - or recommendations – consolidated report -)
 PR : Presentation of reports at the General Conference (conventions or recommendations)
 * : CEART interim report, if necessary)

ANNEX II

REVISED TIMETABLE OF WORK OF THE CR COMMITTEE FOR 2014-2017

UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided and for whose monitoring the CR Committee is responsible	2014-2015					2016-2017				
	194 EX (2014)	195 EX (2014)	196 EX (2015)	197 EX (2015)	38 C (2015)	199 EX (2016)	200 EX (2016)	201 EX (2017)	202 EX (2017)	39 C (2017)
1960 Convention against Discrimination in Education (ED)			EPD*						ER	PR
1989 Convention on Technical and Vocational Education (ED)	<i>The 1989 Convention and the 2015 Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training (which replaces the 2001 Revised Recommendation) will be monitored jointly (EPC: 204 EX; ER : 207 EX ; PR : 40 C)</i>									
1960 Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (ED)			(with 1960 C)*						(with 1960 C)	(with 1960 C)
1966 Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (ED)				ER (CEART)		ER (CEART)		ER** (CEART)		
1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ED)						EPC			ER	PR
1974 Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers (SHS)						EPC		ER		PR
1976 Recommendation on the Development of Adult Education (ED)	<i>At its 38th session, the General Conference adopted the 2015 Recommendation on Adult Learning and Education (ED) which replaces the 1976 Recommendation</i>							EPC		
1978 Revised Recommendation concerning the International Standardization of Educational Statistics (UIS)								ER		PR
1980 Recommendation concerning the Status of the Artist (CLT)				ER	PR					
1993 Recommendation on the Recognition of Studies and Qualifications in Higher Education (ED)			ER*		PR					
1997 Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (ED)				(with 1966 R.)		(with 1966 R.)		(with 1966 R.)		
2001 Revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education (ED)	<i>The 1989 Convention and the 2015 Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training (which replaces the 2001 Revised Recommendation) will be monitored jointly (EPC : 204 EX ; ER : 207 EX ; PR : 40 C)</i>									
2003 Recommendation concerning the Promotion and Use of Multilingualism and Universal Access to Cyberspace (CI)			ER*		PR					
2011 recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, including a glossary of definitions (CLT)				ER	PR					

- EPC : Examination of the preparation of forthcoming consultation by the Executive Board (recommendations)
- EG : Examination of guidelines by the Executive Board (conventions)
- ER : Examination of reports by the Executive Board (conventions – summary of reports - or recommendations –consolidated report-)
- PR : Presentation of reports at the General Conference (conventions or recommendations)

* : At the 196th session, the Executive Board decided to defer to its 197th session discussion of this item, upon a recommendation by the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations (CR), which did not have the time needed for its consideration.

** : CEART interim report, if necessary)



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Executive Board

Hundred and ninety-ninth session

199 EX/14

Part II

PARIS, 1 March 2016
Original: English

Item 14 of the provisional agenda

IMPLEMENTATION OF STANDARD-SETTING INSTRUMENTS

PART II

APPLICATION OF THE 1966 RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING THE STATUS OF TEACHERS AND THE 1997 RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING THE STATUS OF HIGHER EDUCATION TEACHING PERSONNEL

REPORT BY THE DIRECTOR-GENERAL ON THE TWELFTH SESSION OF THE JOINT ILO/UNESCO COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON THE APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS CONCERNING TEACHING PERSONNEL (CEART) AND ON ALLEGATIONS RECEIVED BY THE CEART

SUMMARY

In accordance with 192 EX/Decision 20 (IV), the Director-General submits to the Executive Board a summary of the findings of the twelfth session of the Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendations concerning Teaching Personnel ([CEART], Paris, 20-24 April 2015), as set out in the Committee's report (CEART/12/2015/14).

Furthermore, in accordance with 154 EX/Decision 4.4 and 157 EX/Decision 6.3, the Director-General hereby submits to the Executive Board a summary of the CEART interim report (CEART/INT/2016/1) on allegations received from teachers' organizations regarding non-observance of the Recommendations.

Financial and administrative implication related to the present document is borne within the framework of 38 C/5 Approved.

Action to be taken by the Executive Board: proposed decision in paragraph 7.

Introduction

1. The Joint ILO-UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendations concerning Teaching Personnel (hereafter CEART) includes 12 independent experts appointed by the Director-General of UNESCO and the Governing Body of the International Labour Organization (ILO). Every three years, CEART holds a work session focused on the monitoring and promotion of the 1966 Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers and the 1997 Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel. The experts review the extent to which Member States have applied the two Recommendations and produces a report making recommendations to the Executive Board of UNESCO and the Governing Body of ILO on how to enhance the application of these two standard-setting instruments. The full report (CEART/12/2015/14) of the twelfth session held at UNESCO Headquarters (Paris, 20-24 April 2015) is found online.¹

2. During work sessions and throughout the subsequent three years, the CEART also examines communications in the form of allegations from international and national teachers' organizations regarding the extent to which provisions of one or both standards are not being applied in Member States. The CEART's procedures allow for the preparation of interim reports on these cases between its regular work sessions so as to ensure a more timely response in the treatment of allegations and their resolution in support of constituents in Member States based on the principles of social dialogue. The latest interim report (CEART/INT/2016/1) of 2016 is found online.²

Programmatic conclusions and recommendations

3. The report of the CEART's twelfth session highlighted major issues affecting the status of teaching personnel worldwide at all levels of education as covered by the two Recommendations and made suggestions to UNESCO and ILO on how to improve the implementation of these Recommendations. Main issues addressed in the CEART twelfth session refer to social dialogue in education; the appraisal of teaching personnel; the professionalization of early childhood education personnel; changing employment relationships in the teaching profession; the impact of information and communication technologies in the teaching profession; quality of teaching in the context of increasing non-public providers of higher education; and maintaining professionalization of teaching in higher education. Recommendations provided by the Joint Committee pertain to activity priorities of both organizations, and appeal to Member States, educational institutions and teacher unions on how to best address the above issues in relation to the provisions of one or both Recommendations. Also, the CEART adopted a communique on the education goal of the Sustainable Development Goal which was addressed to the World Education Forum held in the Republic of Korea in May 2015.

Allegations relating to the 1966 and 1997 Recommendations on the Status of Teaching Personnel

4. Both the report of the CEART's twelfth session, and the interim report, dealt with allegations of non-application of provisions of the 1966 and 1997 Recommendations made against governments by teacher organizations and provide relevant recommendations to the parties involved. The CEART's twelfth session addressed an allegation presented by the Tokyo-to-Gakko Union in Japan. The case concerns the violation of principles related to academic freedom; participation of teachers in the development of courses and textbooks; and fairness in disciplinary proceedings against teachers. Recommended measures were provided for consideration by the Government of Japan and the Tokyo Metropolitan Government. The CEART also reviewed a case presented by the Cambodian Independent Teachers' Association (CITA) concerning the lack of a consultative framework for teacher and teachers' organizations to participate in the development of education policies, the selection of teaching materials, and the setting of salaries and hours of work. Recommended measures pertain to Cambodia's need to respond to the allegation and to

¹ http://www.ilo.org/global/industries-and-sectors/education/WCMS_399569/lang--en/index.htm

² http://www.ilo.org/gb/GBSessions/GB326/pol/WCMS_450499/lang--en/index.htm

engage in dialogue with CITA. Two cases previously examined by CEART and reviewed again during the twelfth session were closed due to lack of information from the parties involved: Denmark (Dansk Magisterforening); and Japan (All Japan Teachers and Staff Union). A case from Portugal (National Teachers' Federation) was also reviewed with the recommendation of keeping the CEART apprised of new developments. A detailed review of these allegations can be found in Part II A and B of the CEART's twelfth session's report.

5. The interim report presents a new allegation received by ILO on 8 January 2014 and submitted by the All Japan Teachers and Staff Union (ZENKYO). Sufficient information has now been received by ILO from the parties involved in order for the case to be reviewed by the CEART. The case pertains to the non-observance of the provisions of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (1966) by the Government of Japan in relation to the overtime work of the teaching personnel and temporary appointments in public schools. Recommended measures encourage the parties involved to engage in specific policy dialogue relevant to contract and working time issues, to consider joint fact finding and to keep the CEART apprised of further developments within one year. The attached interim report is submitted for consideration by the Executive Board of UNESCO. This interim report will be submitted to the Governing Body of ILO in March 2016.

Comments by the Director-General on the report of the CEART's twelfth session

6. The Director-General notes with satisfaction the focused work of this Committee, which continues to provide its expertise in education and labour issues. She appreciates the holistic approach to these major teacher issues and the strengthened inter-agency monitoring mechanism. She also commends the relevance of the report to critical matters affecting the teaching profession and the pragmatic recommendations to redress such trends. Furthermore, the Director-General acknowledges the sustained efforts of the Committee to promote adherence to the 1966 and 1997 Recommendations and its valued assistance in resolving allegation issues.

Proposed decision

7. In the light of the above, the Executive Board may wish to adopt the following:

The Executive Board,

1. Recalling 154 EX/Decision 4.4, 157 EX/Decision 6.3, and 192 EX/Decision 20 (IV),
2. Having examined document 199 EX/14 Part II and the report of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations thereon (199 EX/...),
3. Appreciating the work of the Joint Committee in stimulating action to promote greater awareness and wider application of the two Recommendations concerning the status of teaching personnel,
4. Takes note of the report of the twelfth session of the Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendations concerning Teaching Personnel (CEART/12/2015/14) including Part II A and B, relating to allegations and needed actions on the non-observance of certain provisions of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation (1966) or of the UNESCO Recommendation (1997) in Cambodia, Denmark, Japan and Portugal;
5. Invites the Director-General to assist the Joint Committee in carrying out its next cycle of work and report on its work to the Executive Board in 2019;
6. Requests the Director-General to communicate the report of the twelfth session of the Joint Committee together with the observations of the Executive Board, if any, to Member States and their National Commissions, international teachers' organizations

and other relevant international organizations having relations with UNESCO, inviting their consideration, action and comments on the policy recommendations of the CEART that concern them and encouraging them to continue to apply all provisions of both normative instruments, as well as to take the necessary follow-up action as recommended in the report;

7. Takes note of the CEART interim report (CEART/INT/2016/1) presenting the analysis and recommendations pertaining to the allegation from the All Japan Teachers and Staff Union (ZENKYO); and
8. Invites the Director-General to communicate the CEART's interim report to the Government of Japan and to All Japan Teachers and Staff Union (ZENKYO), and to invite them to take the necessary follow-up action as recommended in that report.



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Executive Board

Hundred and ninety-ninth session

199 EX/14 Part III

PARIS, 1 March 2016
Original: English

Item 14 of the provisional agenda

IMPLEMENTATION OF STANDARD-SETTING INSTRUMENTS

PART III

APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, CO-OPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS (1974)

DISCUSSION OF PREPARATIONS FOR THE NEXT CONSULTATION

SUMMARY

Pursuant to 37 C/Resolution 90 and in compliance with the timetable adopted at its 195th session (195 EX/Decision 15), the next consolidated report on the implementation of the Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1974) (the 1974 Recommendation) should be submitted to the 202nd session of the Executive Board in 2017.

In accordance with Stage 3(b) of the specific multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided, as amended by the Executive Board at its 196th session (196 EX/Decision 20), the Secretariat is to seek the advice of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations (CR) prior to the collection of information from Member States, National Commissions, research institutions and civil society organizations in order to prepare the next consolidated report of the 1974 Recommendation. This document presents draft guidelines developed to guide the reporting on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation.

The financial or administrative implications related to this document are covered in document 38 C/5.

Action expected of the Executive Board: Proposed decision in paragraph 9.

1. The Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (the 1974 Recommendation) adopted by UNESCO's General Conference at its 18th session on 19 November 1974 aims to promote world peace through international understanding, solidarity and cooperation, also enshrined in UNESCO's Constitution.
2. Under Article VIII of UNESCO's Constitution, Member States are required to submit a report on the legislative and administrative provisions and any other measures they have taken to implement the conventions and recommendations adopted by the Organization. In accordance with the specific multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided, as adopted by the Executive Board at its 177th session (177 EX/Decision 35 (I)) and amended at its 196th session (196 EX/Decision 20), the frequency for submitting the reports is set for an interval of four years. The reporting process aims to monitor progress on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation, which includes highlighting the results achieved and the difficulties encountered.
3. UNESCO has so far conducted five consultations of Member States on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation. The consolidated report of the fifth and latest Consultation (2009-2012) was examined by the 192nd session of the Executive Board (document 192 EX/20 Part III) and resulted in 37 C/Resolution 90, adopted by the General Conference at its 37th session in November 2013. The consolidated report was presented by the Secretariat, highlighting the steady progress in Member States' development of constitutional, legal, policy and/or administrative frameworks but also the continuing gaps between policy and practice. Furthermore, the report underlined the efforts made by Member States to translate the principal values of the 1974 Recommendation into specific competencies in order to support the development of learners' knowledge, skills, values and attitudes.
4. The sixth consultation (2013-2016) of Member States will be launched following the 199th Executive Board's approval of the draft guidelines presented as an annex to this document.
5. At its 177th session (2007) the Executive Board also adopted framework guidelines for the preparation of reports on the implementation of the different conventions (177 EX/Decision 35 (II)). The framework guidelines were amended in 2015 by 196 EX/Decision 20. Based on these, the Education Sector prepared the "Draft guidelines for the preparation of reports by Member States on the application of the 1974 UNESCO Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms".
6. To encourage the participation of a maximum number of Member States and for cost-effectiveness, the Secretariat suggests that the sixth consultation be made available online. Where the online submission of country reports is not possible, Member States will have the option to complete the questionnaire electronically and submit the hard copy to UNESCO. In order to facilitate the reporting from Member States, the format of the guidelines has been revised to include more multiple-choice questions and less open ended questions. This format is also expected to facilitate the analysis, synthesis and presentation of the findings of national reports.
7. In light of the Education 2030 Agenda, the monitoring of the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation is of crucial importance in order to ensure that education contributes to the advancement of peace, human rights, justice and freedom. As the content and principles of the 1974 Recommendation are closely aligned with Target 4.7 of the Education Sustainable Development Goal, efforts have also been made to ensure that the related concepts reflected in Target 4.7, including Global Citizenship Education and Education for Sustainable Development, are included in the guidelines and that the guidelines also serve as a monitoring tool for measuring progress made towards Target 4.7.

8. After the guidelines have been adopted by the Executive Board, they will be sent by May 2016 to national authorities in charge of preparing the reports on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation, establishing 30 September 2016 as the deadline for submission of reports to the guidelines. The consolidated report will then be examined by the Executive Board at its 202nd session in autumn 2017 and by the General Conference at its 39th session.

Proposed decision

9. In the light of the above, the Executive Board may wish to adopt the following draft decision:

The Executive Board,

1. Bearing in mind Member States' obligations under Article VIII of UNESCO's Constitution and Article 17 of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution,
2. Recalling 177 EX/Decision 35 (I) and 196 EX/Decision 20 on the specific multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided,
3. Further recalling 37 C/Resolution 90, 195 EX/Decision 15,
4. Having examined document 199 EX/14 Part III,
5. Also bearing in mind the importance of the Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1974) as a means to support the implementation and monitoring of the Education 2030 Agenda, especially Target 4.7,
6. Approves the guidelines for the preparation of reports by Member States on the application of the 1974 Recommendation as annexed to document 199 EX/14 Part III;
7. Requests the Director-General to invite Member States to submit to UNESCO reports on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation;
8. Further requests the Director-General to submit to it at its 202nd session the next consolidated report the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation, with a view to transmitting that summary, together with the Executive Board's comments thereon, to the General Conference at its 39th session.

ANNEX

DRAFT GUIDELINES FOR THE PREPARATION OF REPORTS BY MEMBER STATES ON THE APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, CO-OPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS (1974)

I. Introduction

A. About the 1974 Recommendation

1. The UNESCO Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1974 Recommendation) aims to promote world peace through international understanding, solidarity and cooperation. It was adopted on 19 November 1974 by the General Conference of UNESCO at its 18th session.
2. The General Conference “recommends that Member States should apply” the provisions included in the 1974 Recommendation “by taking whatever legislative or other steps” that provide institutional (e.g. policies and systems) and pedagogical (e.g. teacher training, educational materials, equipment, etc.) support for its implementation, based on the “objectives”, referred to in paragraph 4 of the 1974 Recommendation, “regarded as major guiding principles” such as a global education perspective, cultural diversity, interdependence, communication, rights and responsibilities, international solidarity and cooperation, and, problem solving, as well as other principles¹ including:
 - cultural diversity and tolerance
 - equality and non-discrimination
 - peace and non-violence
 - justice and fairness
 - human rights and fundamental freedoms
 - human survival and well-being
 - caring for our planet/sustainability
3. The 1974 Recommendation is applicable to formal, non-formal and informal education and to all levels, from pre-primary to higher and adult education and life-long learning. It concerns areas such as civics and ethics education, education for international understanding, solidarity and cooperation and/or other related subjects, such as peace education, human rights education or other areas of study that focus or include the teaching and learning of the above principles. Over time, these areas have evolved to include other topics² related to education on sustainable development, climate change, global citizenship, preventing violent extremism, or others, which are also closely related to the original principles of the 1974 Recommendation.

B. Reporting obligations

4. The General Conference, at its 18th session, “recommends that Member States submit [...] reports concerning the action taken by them in pursuance of this recommendation”. Moreover, in accordance with Article VIII of UNESCO’s Constitution “Each Member State

¹ These are principles that are included throughout the 1974 Recommendation and which are grouped here to guide the reporting process.

² These include topics that are closely related to the principles of the 1974 Recommendation and which are frequently mainstreamed in national education systems. They are also used as a reference in the questionnaire.

shall submit to the Organization [...] reports [...] on the action taken upon the recommendations and conventions referred to in Article IV, paragraph 4.”

5. All Member States, given the political commitment to and moral force of the 1974 Recommendation and their reporting obligations, should provide information on legislative measures that have been taken pursuant to the 1974 Recommendation and the ways in which national education policies and programmes correspond to its provisions. Information supplied by Member States should demonstrate how laws and practices comply with the commitments under the 1974 Recommendation, describing legal norms as well as actual implementation.
6. For the full text of the 1974 Recommendation please follow this link:
http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=13088&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

II. How to fill in the questionnaire

- The following questionnaire has been updated to guide and assist Member States with their reporting. It aims to collect, in a simplified manner, information on the extent to which Member States have mainstreamed the principles of the 1974 Recommendation in their education systems, focusing on institutional, content, teachers, assessment, materials/resources, experiential opportunities and overall implementation issues. Responses to this questionnaire will be considered as the official national report for each Member State.
- Only one questionnaire per country should be submitted, which will represent the official country report.
- Prior to completing the questionnaire, Member States are encouraged to organize necessary consultations within and outside the Ministry of Education/Government, including with key, relevant civil society partners to collect the information/data.
- Member States have two options for submitting the questionnaire:
 - (i) Online: the questionnaire can be completed and submitted online through this link;
 - (ii) Hard copy: the questionnaire can be completed electronically and the hard copy should be sent to the Assistant Director-General for Education, UNESCO. It is recommended that the questionnaire be filled by the Ministry responsible for education.

III. Information about the respondent

1. Country:

2. Name and title of the respondent:

3. Institution/Department:

4. Email address:

5. Mailing address:

6. Telephone:

7. Date of submission:

8. Signature: Minister of Education or other designated official (e.g. Director-General of Education, Secretary-General of the UNESCO National Commission or other)

IV. Questionnaire

1. To what extent are the guiding principles of the 1974 Recommendation (e.g. cultural diversity and tolerance, equality and non-discrimination, peace and non-violence, justice, human rights and fundamental freedoms, human survival and well-being, caring for our planet/sustainability, etc.) reflected in your constitution or domestic legislation?

Not at all 1 2 3 4 5 Fully

2. To what extent are the principles of the 1974 Recommendation reflected in your country's current education policy/ies and frameworks?

Not at all 1 2 3 4 5 Fully

3. Please provide any additional information on the measures taken by your country to incorporate the principles of the 1974 Recommendation in constitutional, legal and policy frameworks.

4. Has there been an increased emphasis on the principles of the 1974 Recommendation in an education/curriculum reform or policy development that took place in the last five years?

(a) Yes. Please specify below:

- (b) No
- (c) No information available

5. If yes, please indicate the principles and topics on which there has been increased emphasis in the last five years. (*please tick all that apply*)

Peace and non-violence

- (a) Friendly relations among nations
- (b) Preventing violent extremism
- (c) Preventing other forms of violence including bullying, gender-based violence, school-related gender-based violence, etc.

Human rights and fundamental freedoms

- (a) Equality, inclusion and non-discrimination
- (b) Justice and fairness
- (c) Ethics/morals/values

Cultural diversity and tolerance

- (a) International understanding, solidarity and cooperation
- (b) Intercultural and interreligious dialogue
- (b) Global citizenship

Human survival and well-being

- (a) Climate change
- (b) Environmental sustainability, caring for the planet
- (c) Sustainable development, consumption, and livelihood
- Other principles/topics. Please specify below.

6. Has there been any specific taskforce, working group, office or other mechanism set up in the last five years within the government to facilitate the implementation of the above mentioned principles/topics within education?

- (a) Yes. Please specify below (e.g. name, department, topic, tasks, etc.)

- (b) No
- (c) No information available

7. Which of the following, or similar, principles and topics are taught in your formal educational system as part of the curriculum? *(please tick all that apply)*

Peace and non-violence

- (a) Friendly relations among nations
- (b) Preventing violent extremism
- (c) Preventing other forms of violence, including bullying, gender-based violence, school-related gender-based violence, etc.

Human rights and fundamental freedoms

- (a) Equality, inclusion and non-discrimination
- (b) Justice and fairness
- (c) Ethics/morals/values

Cultural diversity and tolerance

- (a) International understanding, solidarity and cooperation
- (b) Intercultural and interreligious dialogue
- (c) Global citizenship

Human survival and well being

- (a) Climate change
- (b) Environmental sustainability, caring for the planet
- (c) Sustainable development, consumption, and livelihood
- Other principles/topics. Please specify below.

8. In which school subjects are these principles and topics mainly taught? *(please tick all that apply and number them in order of importance)*

- (a) Arts
- (b) Civics, civil or citizenship education

- (c) Ethics/moral studies
- (d) Geography
- (d) Health and Physical Education and Sports
- (e) History
- (f) Languages
- (g) Religious education
- (h) Science
- (i) Social studies
- (j) Other. Please specify below.

9. Please indicate the school levels at which these principles and/or topics are taught. (*please tick all that apply*)

- (a) Pre-primary
- (b) Primary
- (c) Secondary
- (d) Post-secondary/Tertiary
- (e) Other. Please specify below (e.g. adult education. TVET, etc.)

10. Please indicate the implementation approaches applied to teach these principles and topics. (*please tick all that apply*)

- (a) Integrated approach (e.g. making connections across all disciplines, connecting the curriculum with learning experiences in the community and life outside school)
- (b) Cross-curriculum approach (e.g. principles and topics are taught across more than one discipline/subject of the curriculum)
- (c) Whole-school approach (e.g. integrating the principles and topics in the school ethos, management, curriculum, teacher training, teaching practices, learning environment)
- (d) As a separate subject. Please indicate the subjects below (e.g. civics education)

11. Overall, are the number of teaching hours for the principles and topics mentioned earlier estimated to be sufficient?

Not at all 1 2 3 4 5 Fully

12. To what extent are the principles and topics mentioned earlier reflected in the curriculum of pre-service teacher training?

Not at all 1 2 3 4 5 Fully

13. Teachers for which level of education received training that reflects the principles and topics mentioned earlier? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Pre-primary
 (b) Primary
 (c) Secondary
 (d) Post-secondary/Tertiary
 (e) Other. Please specify below (e.g. adult education. TVET, etc.)

14. Please indicate the overall percentage of teachers estimated to have been trained on these principles and topics through in-service training and teacher professional development.

- (a) 0 - 20%
 (b) 21 - 40%
 (c) 41 - 60%
 (d) 61 - 80%
 (e) 81 - 100%

15. Are the principles and topics mentioned earlier included generally in student assessments/examinations?

- (a) Yes
 (b) No
 (c) No information available

If yes, please indicate which of the following dimensions of learning were included in the last student assessments/examination. *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Knowledge
 (b) Skills and competencies

- (c) Values and attitudes
- (d) Behaviours
- (e) None
- (f) No information available

16. Which of the following dimensions of learning is your country planning to reinforce in student assessment/examinations in the next five years, in relation to the principles and topics mentioned earlier? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Knowledge
- (b) Skills and competencies
- (c) Values and attitudes
- (d) Behaviours
- (e) None
- (f) No information available

17. If the principles and topics mentioned earlier are not included in student assessments/examinations, please indicate the main reasons (e.g. not a priority, lack of funds/expertise, etc.)

18. To what extent are there adequate teaching and resource materials (including ICTs and audio-visual materials) to teach/deliver the principles below and engage learners? *(please tick all that apply)*

- | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|------------|-----------------------|---|-----------------------|---|-----------------------|---|-----------------------|---|-----------------------|--------------|
| (a) Peace and non-violence | Not at all | <input type="radio"/> | 1 | <input type="radio"/> | 2 | <input type="radio"/> | 3 | <input type="radio"/> | 4 | <input type="radio"/> | 5 Adequately |
| (b) Human rights and fundamental freedoms | Not at all | <input type="radio"/> | 1 | <input type="radio"/> | 2 | <input type="radio"/> | 3 | <input type="radio"/> | 4 | <input type="radio"/> | 5 Adequately |
| (c) Cultural diversity and tolerance | Not at all | <input type="radio"/> | 1 | <input type="radio"/> | 2 | <input type="radio"/> | 3 | <input type="radio"/> | 4 | <input type="radio"/> | 5 Adequately |
| (d) Human survival and well-being | Not at all | <input type="radio"/> | 1 | <input type="radio"/> | 2 | <input type="radio"/> | 3 | <input type="radio"/> | 4 | <input type="radio"/> | 5 Adequately |
| (e) Other. Please specify below. | Not at all | <input type="radio"/> | 1 | <input type="radio"/> | 2 | <input type="radio"/> | 3 | <input type="radio"/> | 4 | <input type="radio"/> | 5 Adequately |

19. Has a textbook revision been carried out in the last five years to reflect the principles and topics mentioned earlier?

- Yes. Please specify (e.g. to include which principles and topics in which subject, level of education, etc.)

- (b) No
- (c) No information available

20. Please indicate which of the following pedagogical approaches/learning principles have been applied with relation to the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation. (*please tick all that apply*)

- (a) Learner-centred
- (b) Innovative and creative
- (c) Participatory and interactive
- (d) Whole school
- (e) Research and experimentation
- (f) Education through arts and sports
- (g) Child-friendly schools
- (h) Other. Please specify below

21. What kind of programmes and practices are implemented that allow students to experience other cultures and interact with people of different backgrounds (e.g. culture, ethnicity, religion)? (*please tick all that apply*)

- (a) Student exchange programmes
- (b) Twinning with other education institutions (regional/international level)
- (c) Linking schools/classrooms with those in another country through the Internet/social media
- (d) Collaborative projects
- (e) Community work/participation in community/local activities/events
- (f) Other. Please specify below

22. Has there been an increase in the number of these programmes and practices, implemented in the last five years?

- (a) Yes. Please specify (e.g. new pedagogy/ies introduced, in which subject, cross-curriculum themes/projects, etc.)

- (b) No

- (c) No information available

23. What opportunities are provided at school level for students to participate in decision-making processes that concern them? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) School governance/decision-making

- (b) Student council or similar bodies

- (c) Student clubs

- (d) None

- (e) Other. Please specify below

24. Please indicate whether the principles and topics mentioned earlier are reflected in programmes provided outside the school system. *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Non-formal education

- (b) Informal education

- (c) Adult education

- (d) Media-based education

- (e) No information available

- (e) Additional information

25. How would the current overall implementation of the principles 1974 Recommendation be rated?

None/Poor 1 2 3 4 5 Excellent

26. Compared to five years ago, how would the current status of the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation be rated?

Not improved 1 2 3 4 5 Improved

27. If there has been little or no progress with relation to the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation, what have been the major obstacles? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) No political/policy priority
- (b) Lack of education/curriculum/pedagogical initiatives
- (c) Insufficient resources (financial, technical, human)
- (d) Competing demands
- (e) Other and/or additional comments on your choice:

28. If progress has been made, what have been the enabling factors? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Political/policy priority
- (b) Education/curriculum/pedagogical initiatives implemented
- (c) Increased demand (by parents, the community, policymakers, etc.)
- (d) Availability of resources (financial, technical, human)
- (e) Other and/or additional comments on your choice:

29. Please enter below any other information on the country's implementation of the 1974 Recommendation that you would like to report on. You may provide additional information on any question or include any other issue that has not been covered by this questionnaire.

Thank you for your kind collaboration.



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Executive Board

Hundred and ninety-ninth session

199 EX/14

Part IV

PARIS, 22 February 2016
Original: English

Item 14 of the provisional agenda

IMPLEMENTATION OF STANDARD-SETTING INSTRUMENTS

PART IV

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION ON THE STATUS OF SCIENTIFIC RESEARCHERS (1974)

DISCUSSION OF PREPARATIONS FOR THE NEXT CONSULTATION

SUMMARY

Pursuant to 37 C/Resolution 91 and in compliance with the timetable adopted at its 195th session (195 EX/Decision 15), the next consolidated report on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers should be submitted to the 201st session of the Executive Board in 2017.

In accordance with Stage 3(b) of the specific multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided, as amended by the Executive Board at its 196th session (196 EX/Decision 20), the Secretariat is to seek the advice of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations (CR) prior to the collection of information from Member States, National Commissions, research institutions and civil society organizations in order to prepare the next consolidated report of the 1974 Recommendation. This document presents the proposals on the 2013-16 monitoring exercise prior to collection of information.

This item has no financial or administrative implications.

Action expected from the Executive Board: Proposed decision in paragraph 6.

Background

1. Based on the results of the monitoring exercise of the implementation of the Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers (hereinafter “the 1974 Recommendation”), which was carried out by the Secretariat in 2011-2012 and reported to the governing bodies (189 EX/Decision 13 (III), 190 EX/Decision 24 (IV) and 37 C/Resolution 91), the General Conference, at its 37th session in 2013, decided to undertake the revision of the 1974 Recommendation (37 C/Resolution 40). Furthermore, the General Conference underlined that the overall scope and purpose of the 1974 Recommendation appear unobjectionable and relevant, and requested that the next monitoring report on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation be submitted to it at its 39th session, with prior consideration by the Executive Board at its 201st session.

2. In November 2015, the General Conference, at its 38th session, considered the progress report (38 C/27) on action carried out in 2014-15 to revise the 1974 Recommendation and, in its 38 C/Resolution 45, noted with satisfaction the work initiated to prepare this revision. It was noted that the various consultations held with partners confirmed the importance of current issues, such as challenges linked to sustainable development, the emergence of new technologies and new areas of research and issues in areas such as global justice, gender equality and human rights. The timeliness of the revision was underlined because it would revalue the status of scientific researchers in society, and the spirit of scientific freedom and truth, contributing to the knowledge-based societies promoted by UNESCO. The General Conference appealed to Member States and potential donors for extrabudgetary funding to enable more in-depth consultations with Member States and other stakeholders, as well as to convene a special committee (pursuant to Article 10, paragraphs 4 and 5, of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4 of the Constitution) with a view to drafting a revised Recommendation. However, if the necessary extrabudgetary funding is not available, the General Conference authorized the Director-General to prepare a final draft of the revised Recommendation in consultation with Member States and other stakeholders through various cost-effective means, without convening a special committee.

Consultation on the 2016-17 monitoring exercise prior to collection of information

3. With regard to the monitoring of the 1974 Recommendation, in accordance with Stage 3(b) of the amended multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided, the Secretariat indicated at the 197th session of the Board (document 197 EX/20, Part I) that it will seek the advice of the CR Committee prior to the collection of information from Member States, National Commissions, research institutions and civil society organizations, in order to prepare the next monitoring report that is due in Spring 2017.

4. The call for the collection of information by the Secretariat from Member States and scientific research organizations and relevant civil society organizations will be launched by 2 May 2016, establishing 30 November 2016 as the deadline for submission of replies to the 2016 monitoring questionnaire. The next consolidated report on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation will be submitted to the 201st session of the Executive Board in spring 2017 and will then be transmitted to the 39th session of the General Conference in autumn 2017, with any recommendations of the Board and comments of the Director-General.

5. The questionnaire will contain several questions focused on the impact of the 1974 Recommendation on the measures taken on the:

- (i) formulation of national science, technology and innovation (STI) policies;
- (ii) formulation of STI human resources policies;

- (iii) encouragement of scientific research careers;
- (iv) encouragement of mobility of scientific researchers;
- (v) promotion of the respect for the autonomy and freedom of research;
- (vi) protection of scientific researchers in their working environment;
- (vii) guarantees of scientific researchers' right to associate, and their organizations' right to support their justified claims;
- (viii) prizes and prestigious accolades conferred to scientific researchers; and
- (ix) proposals with regard to the issue of how the monitoring of the 1974 Recommendation may be reinforced in future.

Proposed decision

7. In the light of the above, the Executive Board may wish to adopt the following draft decision:

The Executive Board,

1. Bearing in mind Member States' obligations under Article VIII of UNESCO's Constitution and Article 17 of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution,
2. Recalling 177 EX/Decision 35 (I) and 196 EX/Decision 20 on the specific multi-stage procedure for the monitoring of the implementation of UNESCO conventions and recommendations for which no specific institutional mechanism is provided,
3. Further recalling 37 C/Resolutions 40 and 91, 38 C/Resolution 45 and 195 EX/Decision 15,
4. Having examined document 199 EX/14 Part IV,
5. Approves the proposals on the 2013-2016 monitoring exercise on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation on the Status of Scientific Researchers, as contained in document 199 EX/14 Part IV;
6. Requests the Director-General to invite Member States to submit to UNESCO reports on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation;
7. Further requests the Director-General to submit to it at its 201st session the next consolidated report on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation, with a view to transmitting that summary, together with the Executive Board's comments thereon, to the General Conference at its 39th session.