



26 C/31
7 October 1991
Original: English

Item 6.3 of the provisional agenda

FIFTH CONSULTATION OF MEMBER STATES ON THE IMPLEMENTATION
OF THE CONVENTION AND RECOMMENDATION AGAINST
DISCRIMINATION IN EDUCATION

SUMMARY

This document contains the report of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations regarding the Fifth Consultation of Member States on the implementation of the Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education. It is submitted pursuant to resolution 2.5 adopted by the General Conference at its twenty-third session in 1985. The report consists of: (i) an analytic summary based on the reports presented by 71 Member States (out of the 172 States consulted), of which 46 are parties to the Convention; (ii) conclusions and recommendations, including a Secretariat study on possible modalities of the Sixth Consultation; and (iii) three Annexes.

Decision required: paragraph 112.

16 OCT. 1991

CONTENTS

Page

PART ONE

Introduction	3
--------------------	---

PART TWO

A. The current context	4
B. Overcoming discrimination in practice	5
C. Discrimination concerning particular segments of the population	6
D. Equality of educational opportunity throughout the educational system	11

PART THREE

A. Conclusion	21
B. Recommendations	22

ANNEXES

- I. Questionnaire
- II. List of Member States which participated in the Fifth Consultation
- III. List of States Parties to the Convention against Discrimination in
Education

PART ONE

INTRODUCTION

1. The procedure adopted for the Fifth Consultation of Member States on the Implementation of the Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education, including the timetable for the preparation of a new Questionnaire by the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations and the approval of the Questionnaire by the Executive Board, was recommended by that Committee in its report on the Fourth Consultation (23 C/72, August 1985, para. 361 (i-vi)). The General Conference subsequently adopted the Committee's recommendations, including the timetable proposed for the Fifth Consultation the findings of which will be submitted to the General Conference at its twenty-sixth session in 1991 (23 C/Resolution 2.5).

2. The Executive Board at its 125th session approved the Questionnaire drawn up by its Committee on Conventions and Recommendations for the Fifth Consultation. The Questionnaire, on which the Fifth Consultation is based, was dispatched to all Member States and other signatories of the Conventions (172 States altogether) in October 1987. The Director-General requested Member States to send their replies by 15 March 1989 at the latest. The present report was drawn up and approved by the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations at its meeting on 14 May 1991. It was then submitted by the Committee to the Executive Board at its 136th session which unanimously approved it and took the decision which is cited in Part III.B, Recommendations.

3. Seventy-one reports were received, of which 46 were presented by States party to the Convention and 25 by States reporting on their implementation of the Recommendation. [Summaries of these 71 reports are available with the Secretariat for consultation.] Of the 77 Member States (as of January 1985) who are a party to the Convention, 46 have taken part in this consultation. Seven Member States have this time participated in a consultation for the first time. Since the last consultation, no further country has become a party to the Convention. The rate of response has decreased in relation to the most recent consultation, but this need not necessarily signify a downward trend overall: in the Fourth Consultation, 84 Member States took part, 49 of them a party to the Convention; respective figures for earlier consultations are all lower, at least in absolute terms. Indicative figures are: First Consultation - 61 responses with 25 a party; Second Consultation - 54 responses with 35 a party; and Third Consultation - 54 responses with 38 a party.

4. A disproportionate part of the responses is still supplied by the Europe region, both with respect to numbers participating and to the amount of information supplied. As an approximation, two thirds of the Member States in the Europe region, a quarter of those in Asia and the Pacific, a third from both the Latin America/Caribbean and the Africa regions and two thirds from the Arab region have taken part (i.e., the respective number of those having participated is: Europe 26, Asia and Pacific 7, Latin America and Caribbean 11, Africa 17, Arab States 10). These rates correspond roughly with those in the Fourth Consultation, except for the Asia/Pacific region, where last time almost twice as many Member States reported.

5. Even this simple glance at the figures highlights the advisability of considering ways in which the consultations could become more useful, especially to those among the Member States who face in general quite substantial obstacles in pursuing growth and assuring equity in their educational systems. The opportunity to do so would seem to be growing, since now the removal of legal discrimination in education has been achieved

virtually everywhere; this could make it possible to use the Convention in a new and different spirit. The 'policing function' which might be perceived as a characteristic of an instrument that fights legal infringements of threatened human rights can be partially de-emphasized in favour of Member States pursuing a joint search and mutual experience exchange function that aids in making a reality the fuller and more widespread enjoyment of the human rights flowing from the Convention. This certainly would not imply weakening in any way the obligation which requires Member States to ensure by all means that discrimination is kept out of education and to keep the Committee informed of this fact. Attention is in this context again drawn to the provisions offered by Article 6 of the Convention.

6. Apart from the unevenness of the response to the consultation according to geographical regions, it needs also to be observed that replies vary greatly in qualitative detail. This makes much information uncertain and all generalizations somewhat tentative, possibly with the exception of the confirmation that discrimination in education has been removed from participating Member States' legislation. This report nevertheless reflects tendencies and challenges, and thus can be of assistance in the promotion of equality of opportunity and treatment in education.

7. A number of reports did not keep to the order of the questions in the new Questionnaire. The Secretariat has attempted to adopt a common format in presenting the summaries, so as to make it easier to examine the replies provided. This practice had been adopted since the second report (cf. 17 C/15, Annexes C and D; 20 C/40, Annex C; 23 C/72, Annex D). The Questionnaire for the Fifth Consultation on the implementation of the Convention is annexed to this document. The version concerning implementation of the Recommendation, which contains essentially the same questions but in a legal framework reflecting the position of Member States not party to the Convention, has been omitted here. In summarizing Member States' reports, the Secretariat has taken account of indications in certain reports to the effect that the information supplied for the previous consultation is still valid.

8. Recently, however, there have been a number of profound changes in several countries, including eastern parts of the European continent. The status of Member States reflects the position at the time of responding to the Questionnaire. Furthermore, it is not known what if any changes these developments have entailed in the validity of the responses.

PART TWO

A. THE CURRENT CONTEXT

9. Legal provisions now exist in all the Member States which have responded to the Fifth Questionnaire on the Implementation of the Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (hereafter referred to as the Questionnaire). Not a single country reports upholding legal provisions in support of discrimination in education. Several give particular credit to the Convention and Recommendation. They agree that the growing attention to the avoidance of discrimination is due to the awareness brought about by the existence of the Convention and Recommendation. This achievement itself is renewed proof that the Convention and Recommendation continue to hold the potential for stimulating the promotion of equal opportunity and treatment in education.

10. Although all the countries agree that the legal basis for discrimination in education has been eliminated, some state that their legislation needs to be refined and improved further in order to eliminate unintentional

discrimination in the education system. Others say that legislation which is not meant to be discriminatory can nevertheless have that effect. An example of such legislation can be seen in zoning regulations. These could stand in the way of a fully non-discriminatory educational practice as long as financial means remain too scarce to even out physical and human resources for education throughout the country.

11. A further complication is inherent in legal measures introduced specifically to overcome discrimination. 'Justified preference', also referred to as 'affirmative action', seeks to compensate for disadvantages a person suffers because of his or her unfavourable starting or living conditions. Some countries argue that the preferential treatment in favour of one segment of the population creates the feeling of being discriminated against for other segments of the population since they do not have an opportunity of benefiting from the measures.

12. Even where the last traces of discriminatory legislation have now been removed, a society may still have to be concerned by the weight of its discriminatory heritage. This applies, in particular, to countries formerly under colonial rule where an educational infrastructure had the purpose of treating different groups of people differently. An illustration of this is given when one country mentions that members of a particular section of the armed forces have retained some special privileges for their children's access to education.

B. OVERCOMING DISCRIMINATION IN PRACTICE

General features

13. Creating the legal foundation against discrimination in education is an essential pre-condition if such discrimination is to disappear from the society. However, this itself does not automatically assure the absence of discrimination in practice or the avoidance of situations which might lead to unequal treatment of one kind or another. A few responses state that there can be no discriminatory practices or situations, for the simple reason that they have been ruled out by law; others accept imperfection in human nature and capacities. Among the features that can cause legal stipulations to not always be effective, two in particular emerge from the responses. They are at different levels, lack of resources and the underlying concern of prejudice, and not all societies are affected.

14. The best intentions laid down in legal statutes and guidelines, and efforts to subdue individual inclinations to act in a discriminatory manner often face difficult obstacles: the means to carry out well-defined programmes are, in some countries, simply not available. In many cases lack of resources means that priorities have to be set. This often leads to conditions in which at least part of the population tends to experience being discriminated against. The report from Ecuador expresses it very strongly: 'In practice, discrimination occurs when, due to financial constraints, the programmes and the system itself, instead of being universal, are directed at a single group'.

15. Even when discrimination may not have been intended, there are occasions when it is hard to avoid the suspicion that discriminatory selectiveness is guiding the distribution of scarce resources. One can even observe a pattern: when resources such as money, teachers, and construction capacity run out, those who are affected the most by cuts in services belong frequently to the same categories, namely, women, children in rural areas and the handicapped.

16. Yugoslavia and the Ukrainian SSR have, in the past, given much care to the ethnic and linguistic educational requirements of their rather diverse population groups. Recently, however, people have begun to move more freely within these countries. As a consequence, it may become difficult in the near future with the limited resources available to offer to all the widely dispersing members of the many nationalities the customary mother tongue instruction.

17. Even more ominous threats exist when full support to education programmes will take away funds needed for vital areas of economic development. This implies difficult choices for educational management and aggravates existing disparities. In Uganda, for example, a decentralized radio network has been broadcasting in a number of languages. When the system can no longer afford to keep stations throughout the country, the centralized and almost monolingual network remains. Decentralization is usually welcome as an important step towards catering in fairness to the range of culturally distinct aspirations within a country. Lack of sufficient resources, however, is a serious constraint to carrying out such plans.

18. Most commonly, lack in resources is mentioned in the context of an urban-rural differential. It will be difficult to prove intentional discrimination against rural populations. Yet, a sizeable factor for perpetuating rural disadvantage lies with the general infrastructure. The existence of this shortcoming is too prevalent among countries to cite any in particular. Nevertheless, some countries, such as Burundi, note that the government is formulating a policy which will increase the attractiveness and effectiveness of rural (out-of-school) education.

19. Several responses indicate that prejudice itself traditionally results in disadvantaged groups. Prejudices often stem from the stereotypes and the biased misconceptions of certain groups of people. Several countries mention strategies for national education to explain and dislodge these biased misconceptions. Canada takes extensive measures in all provinces to eliminate stereotyping from school textbooks and teaching materials. In Finland and Norway educators are active to watch out for stereotypes in the practice of school life. New Zealand is taking steps to raise consciousness, also among women themselves, by providing 'Gender Equity Kits' for use in schools. Explicit remedial activities have only been reported by the countries which can afford to expend additional resources. Yet there are some areas in which legal action is difficult. Australia is aware of race and sex stereotypes in material which can be used for non-formal education outside of the responsibility of public education authorities. Available data from other sources indicate that many countries are making efforts to eliminate stereotypes in preparing teaching materials.

C. DISCRIMINATION CONCERNING PARTICULAR SEGMENTS OF THE POPULATION

20. A society's viability is founded primarily on the equal treatment of its citizens, but it is moulded by the interplay of the different voices and actions of individuals and groups asserting the right to be treated as equals and the right to express themselves differently, and acquiring the means to do so.

21. The Questionnaire sought to explore the nature of provisions made for some traditionally disadvantaged groups. Among the variety of groups identified in the responses, the following segments of the populations were highlighted: girls and women; persons living in rural areas; minority groups; immigrants and refugees; and persons with special education needs.

Girls and women

22. Some countries are aware that sizeable discrepancies still exist in the manner in which girls are likely to benefit from education when compared with boys. Traditional roles for women, together with a certain convenience that can be derived from leaving social customs unchanged, do not readily support a role for a girl as a student who acquires her self-defined personality. One country admits and regrets that the practice of early forced marriages persists, together with a scepticism directed against a 'cultural environment in the school that is felt to nurture new ideas, attitudes and a behaviour alien to the tradition that also might contain situations that lead the young girl to reject and revolt against their role as a daughter, wife and woman'.

23. It is, however, noteworthy that in some countries where, within families, educational opportunities went more often to boys at the expense of girls, some progress in remedying the situation is seen in the activities of various organizations (youth, women and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in general). These organizations have been raising the moral sensibility of all sectors of society in favour of effective women's emancipation, including access to schooling.

24. Many countries have come to adopt a policy of co-education. Indeed some indicate clearly that they consider the system of co-education as a stepping stone in the society's development on the way to facilitate the further equalization of opportunities in society at large. Out of 63 replies, 23 report a fully co-educational system from kindergarten through university. Further, even in the face of the current educational debate on the virtues of single sex versus co-educational schools, none of these countries mention any plans to reintroduce single-sex schools.

25. Strictly separate educational provisions for girls and women beyond the age of ten have been established in only eight of the 63 responses to the Questionnaire item. They are all Islamic nations. It is, however, stressed that access, quality of teaching staff and equipment are equivalent in schools for both sexes and that supervision is equally thorough. Various factors and considerations are adduced to make the position understandable to outsiders. They include the Kuwaiti response of 'tradition, environment and cultural heritage; religious beliefs that discourage co-education; social customs and cultural pattern...'. None of the countries relying fully on single-sex education refer to plans to consider co-education. Conversely, in one of the countries a recent revolution had made it possible for those responsible to abolish the earlier co-educational provisions.

26. Just half of the respondents (32 out of 63) report that there are a certain number of single-sex schools in a system mainly characterized by co-education. As prevailing reasons for their existence, the authorities cite tradition and parental preference. One country reports that the practice of separate secondary education still exists simply because no one has yet felt the need to question it. In all cases, the responses stress the serious attention given to enforcing the equality of educational standards throughout the public realm and beyond into the private.

27. One reason why single-sex education does not stand out as a major issue is because this type of schooling is optional. In principle, parents, if not the students themselves, can choose whether to opt for co-education. Furthermore, in all these cases co-education is promoted in the public system while retaining only a diminutive number of girls' schools. The main users are then the clients of private education and thus, discussion tends to seize on private education rather than on single-sex education.

28. The information which was presented does not lead to any hard and fast conclusion whether any particular form of education for girls and women still contains within itself any discrimination. In general, it would seem that new provision tends to be co-education. Further, among the countries which responded, educational provisions beyond the second level for women were rare. The only one reported on was a teacher training college although the existence of women's universities in some countries is known. Finally, there are two areas which in some countries are still not open to women - clerical and military education.

Rural population

29. The large size of the problem to be faced here stems in many countries mainly from the stark contrast existing between urban areas and rural areas. Much of the population may live in rural and often less densely populated regions while a substantial portion of available resources in human, physical and financial terms is concentrated on urban areas. Such situations have been recognized as one of the most significant barriers to equality of educational opportunity. In seeking a rational preparation for breaking down such hindrances, many countries have put great stress in their educational planning on the placement and nature of schools being developed in the rural areas. This has led to an increased network of schools, many of them built with foreign aid and loans.

30. A number of countries reported additional specific measures to improve the educational opportunities for rural populations. Among these are the involvement of parents in the building and maintenance of schools and improved incentives for teachers to go to rural areas. In addition, the success of literacy efforts in some countries has led to an environment where attendance of children in schools is encouraged. However, as one report states, 'on certain large estates, the education for people living and working there is the owner's responsibility' and legislation guaranteeing certain rights to education may be difficult to enforce.

31. Finally, many countries turn special attention and resources to rural, remote and border regions. When listing particular population groups entitled to preferential treatment, 15 responses point to rural population and a considerable number of others refer to efforts towards regional equalization.

32. A deep and underlying concern for many countries is well captured in the reply of Ecuador:

It may be said that in general terms, curricula content does not reflect the special requirements of the rural sector. Schools do not relate to the social context in which they are located nor do they maintain channels of communication with the community; consequently they are divorced from the practical needs and conditions of the social, economic and cultural environment which they ought to serve. Teacher training does not cover the qualitative aspect of the needs of the environment in which they are going to work. There is no in-service training provision either. There are no basic studies defining the psycho and physical needs of [these] children ... well-meaning principles and aims laid down in legal provisions and in planning documents [are prevented] from being implemented successfully.

Minority groups

33. It is clear that education of different linguistic or ethnic groups is a major concern of many educational systems. Yet, just under a third of the 71 respondents take up this issue. Sixteen mention provisions which apparently

or explicitly refer to the use of the mother tongue in public primary and, sometimes in secondary education. Especially detailed arrangements are reported from Ukrainian SSR, Yugoslavia and Romania, which comprise groups of various linguistic and ethnical backgrounds.

34. Within a unified education system teaching is given in the various languages of the peoples constituting that society, sometimes offering instructions in several languages within one school. In the countries where more than one language is recognized as official languages, such as Finland, Cyprus and Canada, the language of instruction adapts accordingly. However, the facilities accorded to minorities are less uniform. They often cannot but experience themselves as disadvantaged groups. The Australian report formulates it cogently: 'The obstacles associated with the provision of educational resources for disadvantaged groups are several and include such factors as other competing interests; fiscal restraint brought about by economic factors and the lack of political support often associated with people on the margin of society'. An additional complication is pointed out by Burkina: while minorities in the country may be in need of specific education provisions, it is felt that their problems cannot be solved by using the means at the disposal of existing education systems.

35. Some support and means for minority populations have been found by a number of prosperous countries. State and federal authorities in Australia aid Aboriginal and Torres Strait communities with learning arrangements in their mother tongues. New Zealand encourages Maori and Pacific Islander communities to initiate appropriate learning environments. Throughout the Canadian provinces relevant provisions are spreading in step with the acknowledgement of native Indians' right to self-determination, at times as part of the public system and at times intending to complement it.

36. It is also encouraging to see other countries' attempt to respond using available means. Ecuador has developed methods to comply with constitutional requirements to allow for wider use of indigenous languages in the classroom. The Intercultural Bilingual Education Programme is an interesting example. The programme provides 'bilingual education so that children may learn Quechua and Spanish in the teaching-learning process, preparing them to integrate with confidence in the mestizo environment without looking down on their own language'.

37. In some countries, geography plays a central role in hindering access by nomads and their children from education. Seven countries speak of special measures for bringing education to nomads, though they do not always differentiate between this group and children in sparsely populated areas. One country indicates that the pupils are brought together into homes to receive education. Vastness and remoteness together are factors inducing education authorities to allow and support children financially to receive their education at home by their guardians.

Refugees and immigrants

38. The after-effect of conflicts and disasters and the growing ease of transportation and communication have brought the most diverse population groups to more and more countries. Western Europe and the Gulf States offer the most visible examples for wholesale importation of work forces; almost every day more refugees and ever whole refugee populations are brought to the world's attention.

39. Traditionally, there have been provisions for accommodating the presence of refugees and immigrants in a country. However, there are a few references in the response to the Questionnaire about their right to attend national

schools or to obtain valid and equivalent certificates. Although there are extensive laws, rules and regulations about immigration, such arrangements are inadequate in general to deal with the numbers of people moving into a country. Only a few nations see themselves as being in a position to look after the education of refugees and immigrants adequately.

40. Finland and Sweden use educational arrangements to help refugees and immigrants to integrate into society. Germany refers to some educational relief offered to foreign workers' children who may use their mother tongue to fulfil the curriculum requirements of studying a foreign language. Six other countries report on similar initiatives.

41. Initiatives by the richer countries on their own territories may diminish the anguish of the uprooted and preserve an equitable society at home. But the extent of the need worldwide and its seemingly relentless growth resist satisfaction by such measures, however well meant and thought-through they may be. They can bring partial and localized relief only, and do not halt the stream of people moving from unsupporting or hostile surroundings into an unprotected future. Action on their behalf is primarily needed in less prosperous regions of the globe, where nations can hardly manage to care sufficiently for their own citizens.

42. No reference to this aspect of discrimination is contained in the responses since. It is not a problem accessible to solution within any one nation's anti-discriminatory framework. Furthermore, the problems that become visible in this context touch on discrimination, or even educational discrimination, almost as if by accident; obviously they go much deeper. Thus, the problem itself has so far not been covered comprehensively in any national code of law since it concerns difficulties beyond the control of any one nation's capacity for prevention or cure. It may be that an answer can only be found by strengthening international co-operation.

Special education

43. The Questionnaire suggested (Question 7) a rather exhaustive list of special populations to which the country replies have not been able to add very much (except for the inclusion of those children whose aptitudes deviate somewhat from the mean). Almost two thirds of the country responses concerning equal educational opportunities and treatment (46 out of 65) refer to the education of special groups, foremost among them disabled students (35 of these 46). Countries that only recently have found the means to provide access to disabled persons to attend schools tend to create special institutions for the blind or the mentally handicapped. Those who have already catered for such educational needs for a longer period are now making it one of their priority concerns to aim for the integration of disabled students into normal classes while providing additional help when and where needed. Some countries are now in a position to educate virtually everybody irrespective of a person's specialized requirements. This finds its expression in legislation in, for example, provinces in Finland and Canada that altogether abolishes exemptions from attending education, forcing education systems to accept the disabled students.

44. In several countries the provisions are offered to facilitate the learning of the students whose capacity for study deviated from the average - slow learners and the gifted children. Three countries list slow learners among those entitled to preferential treatment; five mention the existence of special education support to encourage the full development of gifted students.

45. Many countries state that some, generally unspecified, measures have been taken particularly to encourage girls and women to participate in education. Other special groups have been identified to varying degrees as in need of encouragement, whether by promoting their being treated and considered as 'normal' children or by extending preferential treatment to them so that they may come to see themselves as equal members of their societies. Seven countries count orphans among the special groups accorded preferential treatment. Not mentioned in any of the responses are the 'street children' who are now part of everyday life in many of the world's large cities. It would seem that actions on their behalf by NGOs and international aid organizations are qualitatively inadequate by far and suffer from the often isolated nature of the various projects.

46. There is certainly a growing awareness concerning the need for providing equal opportunity of education to those segments of the population mentioned above and for recognizing their rights. Reporting in this area may be so slight because some countries are afraid to admit that in any situation of scarcity of resources it remains likely that those segments of the population will lose the allocation of resources unless they gain attention in a wider context.

D. EQUALITY OF EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITY THROUGHOUT THE EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM

47. The structure and functioning of the formal system of education is an important indicator of educational opportunities within any country. Almost all countries report that the promotion of equal educational opportunity and treatment is an active concern. This was highlighted earlier with respect to certain groups. In this section a brief report is given on the various levels and types, noting in particular access and the quality of education offered.

48. The effects of a difficult economic situation provide the backdrop against which the performance of education systems, especially in developing countries, is to be considered. Indeed, the effects of structural adjustment on educational policies and practice have been a significant factor. Unfortunately, however, the responses from the countries which have been most seriously affected have been few.

Pre-primary education

49. Sixty out of the 71 countries in the consultation offer information on pre-primary education. At the time of the consultation, one third (21) indicates that no more than 10 per cent of children of the age group thought appropriate for pre-primary education do actually attend. Another third (26) speak of a participation rate that lies between 50 and 100 per cent. The remaining countries have achieved a coverage in between the two groupings or have not specified it.

50. One reason for the divide is obvious. Pre-primary education may be seen as just another layer of education that makes claims on scarce or insufficient resources. Additional reason may be that pre-primary education has not yet established its position within the education system. In some countries this issue is recognized as relatively new, but there is widely shared official concern. Indeed, this is the first occasion that it has been added as an explicit topic to the Questionnaire on discrimination in education.

51. Among the responses, one country explains a relatively large private pre-primary sector with the fact that children start pre-primary school at the age of four. Cuba and Yugoslavia see pre-primary education the first and integral part of education and of social welfare. Pre-primary education can

help very young children from diverse socio-cultural and economic settings start schooling equally. It thus becomes the means to accord equal educational opportunity and treatment to a person at the very beginning of his or her life.

52. Although pre-primary education is much more restricted in its contribution to promoting equal educational opportunity and treatment in countries where primary education is not yet complete, innovative examples exist. Zimbabwe has created pre-primary educational opportunities by establishing crèche and nursery centres at practically every primary school. In Ecuador a kindergarten pilot project for indigenous populations has its roots in Quechua history. Peru similarly reports giving priority in establishing a pre-primary education system in and out of school to deprived areas.

53. In many countries, however, the pre-primary institutions that do exist cannot be said to assist the promotion of equal educational opportunity and treatment. They reproduce the pattern of distribution of educational facilities in a much more exacerbated manner. For example, kindergartens are located only in the capital or kindergarten enrolment in rural areas is less than a sixth of total. Furthermore, hardly any pre-primary education can be offered truly free of charge. In the public pre-primary education system generally no fees are charged, but parents are expected to shoulder certain expenses. There are responses labelling pre-primary education as élitist.

Primary education

54. Primary education is the foundation of any education system and often constitutes by far the largest part of this system; the issues under consideration here will in practice be dealt with at the level of primary education. Thus, when the Questionnaire inquires about problems of equal opportunity and treatment in primary education, a large part of the information has already been provided in the previous section dealing with aspects of an education system more generally. In consequence, responses to Question 10 are brief. Conversely, since primary education in many instances is the most visible part of education, much effort is expended at this level to eliminate educational discrimination and to improve opportunities for education. The entire level, according to the Convention and Recommendation, should be free and compulsory. Altogether, primary education enjoys, relative to the other levels of the system, the most straightforward achievements in eliminating discrimination and promoting equal access to education.

55. Among the respondents, 62 out of 71 have commented specifically on the subject of primary education. Of these, eight state that primary education is not compulsory. In two of these countries (Saudi Arabia and Zambia) education is nevertheless free and attendance rates indicate primary school enrolment is close to universal. Other countries explain that primary education cannot be compulsory because they are obliged to charge fees. It is pointed out repeatedly by Rwanda and others that while education may be legally compulsory, insufficient infrastructure as well as other shortfalls prevent the country from making primary education universal. El Salvador mentions that no means exist to enforce compulsory schooling.

56. Several countries draw attention to the importance of making a difference between education being compulsory and being universal. They all regret the fact that the way from compulsory education to universal education is still considerable, caused mainly by poverty. Although they honour the individual right to education, access to education for everybody is unavailable because adequate infrastructure is lacking, not only within the education system (such

as lack of school buildings or insufficiently developed human resources) but also beyond it (such as absence of accessible roads to remote areas or no water supply). In short, to a large degree the reasons lie in insufficiency of public funds.

57. Another obstacle to compulsory and free education for every student is poverty, primarily among rural and marginalized urban populations. Parents may make decisions of not sending children to school simply because they need to rely on their children's work at home or for wages. The obstacles which parental poverty and disadvantage create for the education of their children is recognized in many of the responses. Statements from two large countries which involve minority groups may be illustrative here. Australia reports the difficulty 'to ensure the attractiveness and relevance of primary education such that populations not enamoured of it or which find it irrelevant have provided for them appropriate educational opportunities'. In Ecuador, the obstacle is described as 'lack of awareness of need for education among groups whose experience has shown them that their attendance at school has not changed their life-style and who fear that their children will have the same experience'.

58. Even though the Questionnaire seeks information with regard to free education, the level and meaning of free education in each country's context varies widely in country responses. For instance, Zimbabwe mentions that: 'Parents are requested to build and maintain their own school without a subsidy from central government and support the children in every other way'. Another point made by some less prosperous countries stresses that a non-fee paying primary education does not at all imply that education is without significant costs to parents.

59. A few responses include references to economic recession and the effects of adjustment policies. Ecuador, for example, noted that although it was agreed that there should be an increased budget allocation for education, it has in fact decreased over the past four years. Yugoslavia reports that the education budget amounted to 5.5 per cent of public expenditure in 1978, but sank to 3.7 per cent in 1987; this means that it becomes necessary to abandon completely or partially free primary education on a temporary basis. For several countries the concern about the socio-economic situation is heightened by the rapid growth of population. Cameroon refers to 'le boom démographique', and El Salvador faces demographic growth while severe armed conflict engulfs the country and scatters its population.

60. In spite of these difficulties, countries where access to primary education opportunities are still unevenly distributed report on their plans to make the complete compulsory education accessible to all throughout the country. There also seems to be a general acceptance that compulsory education ought to be lengthened. It is repeatedly indicated that compulsory education should or will extend to nine years. This generally implies that primary and lower secondary education are brought closer together.

61. There is virtually universal agreement that equality of opportunity through access and treatment in primary education can still be further improved. The Questionnaire had indicated a wide range of areas in which action might be considered. None of the items on the list is judged inappropriate by any respondent. Most countries plan to implement or aim for activities of a legislative, administrative and participatory nature if they have not yet been able to report successful programmes.

Secondary education

62. It is no easy task to let secondary education perform all the functions expected of it. Constraints imposed by lack of physical, human and financial resources, and infrastructure are much more pronounced here than at primary level. The task becomes even more complex if the functioning of this level is monitored from the perspective of overcoming discrimination and of actively promoting equal participation in the educational process. However, the challenge is being accepted virtually everywhere. In this consultation, 61 of the 71 responding countries offer views on secondary education.

63. Thirty-six out of 61 countries have included part of secondary education as compulsory, and an additional eight countries are planning to do so. The basic idea behind extending compulsory education is reported as being to introduce children to a common core, though not to an identical curriculum. A few richer countries report on the extension of compulsory education to lower secondary level and thus the demarcation between primary and secondary level was minimized. One country mentions difficulty when attempting to entice what had been 'secondary' teachers to join what they considered 'only primary' level institutions. Belgium regrets that there exists a gulf between the two levels and searches for better integration of curriculum contents.

64. In countries able to extend compulsory education beyond primary level, access to lower secondary education is typically granted by automatic promotion. This means that equal chances to benefit from educational opportunities and options are kept open for students to a more advanced age. In other countries which cannot afford extended compulsory education, selection influences their lives several years earlier. Frequently, they have to pass entrance examinations which as a rule distribute them into various streams.

65. The non-discriminatory standard, namely to make secondary education 'generally available and accessible' can no longer be fulfilled by avoiding selection, but it is still possible by applying fair criteria to the selection process. Traditionally, selection has been done by administering an examination for entering the level at which a differentiation of students is first practised. Several countries have abandoned this procedure and prefer other methods of evaluating the capability and suitability of each student by more or less complex and individualized methods. But it is clear that most of the 20 countries which start differentiation in the first cycle of secondary education use entrance examinations. Much could be learned from the procedures that have been developed for the selection process assigning students to this level of education and social status. There is still a general shortage of practical experience about how to blend selection criteria so that they may take account equitably of a person's aspirations and capabilities, and the requirements of society at large.

66. The Convention and Recommendation seem to watch carefully how chances of access to and progress in the various types of secondary institutions are distributed. The existence and functions of several instruments referred to in the Questionnaire provide this information: counselling, transfer between secondary courses, remedial teaching, upgrading vocational schools and encouraging female students.

67. The existence of provisions for counselling is reported by just above half of the responses. Various means are used for this purpose to let students know what branches and courses of secondary education exist. Mass media and other forms of information distribution are common. Counselling on an individual basis, for example, with an educator exploring together with a future secondary student his or her options and opportunities, is mentioned by

several countries. Career guidance was also given some attention in the replies and 35 countries report on it. It is mentioned frequently as being addressed explicitly, if not exclusively, to the students in technical-vocational education.

68. Although many countries offer counselling activities, when it comes to changing courses of study during secondary education, some obstacles seem to exist. Less than half of the responses contain a mention to the possibility of changing from one kind of secondary course to another. Overall, it appears rarely used to reopen educational horizons by revising previous decisions unfavourable to a student's educational career. There are a few instances that permit transfers between different types of secondary education. On occasion, however, it is stated that it is possible only 'in theory' since in practice such attempts tend to falter in the face of 'bureaucracy'. Four countries implicitly presume a hierarchy of courses: transfers are possible, but only 'downward'. A realistic evaluation of conditions is contributed by Burkina: 'A transfer is not easy between the different types of secondary education and the streams within such types; that is so because each of them carries with it a particular positive or negative valuation differently'.

69. About half of the countries state that remedial teaching is or will be available in one form or another, although quantitative and substantive details are not given. The means most commonly used is assistance by the teachers during school hours or in separate sessions. Other means include summer classes and distance and correspondence courses. Poland entrusts the task of remedial assistance to the youth organization. Finally, several times in this context reference is made to evening classes or night school as an alternative setting for remedial work.

70. Technical and vocational education has taken over the task of initiating students to practical skills directly related to their later working life. As a consequence, technical and vocational education acquires its own characteristics by not only making curricula different from those for general education, but often by leading to physical separation as well. That, at times, has created a status problem, and there still exists such a tendency in many countries. A straightforward statement by Cuba explains that the 'technical and vocational education system is responsible for training the lower salaried work-force the country needs for its economic development'. There is hardly a country expressing itself against upgrading of vocational and technical education. Virtually all countries state that they are interested and/or active in strengthening the links between vocational and technical education and general education. Germany agrees that upgrading certainly is appropriate and necessary measures for improving and modernizing technical and vocational education. However, no alterations have been made to this proven system for a long time since there exists a rather long tradition of a dual system. Some of the other more prosperous countries have made attempts to improve the status of the vocational and technical sector. For this purpose, important aspects from outside the education system usually have been drawn into the process of renewal. An instructive example originated in New Zealand. Every young person is eligible to receive the same grant, irrespective of whether the person is in secondary or tertiary education or training schools or even unemployed as part of the process of upgrading technical and vocational education.

71. In these reports on secondary education, many countries make special mention of actions undertaken for special groups. Twenty-four countries report that special attention is given to girls and women at this level of education. Many confirm that they encourage girls and women to take up technical and vocational education. Germany, for example, improved and strengthened technical courses offered in a girl's school so that they have

more opportunities to be exposed to this kind of education. Two countries report that technical subjects are not at present available to girls. Minorities were also concerned and, judging from the responses, it seems that minority languages also receive special attention in the context of technical education. For example, in Nordic countries speakers of a minority language may receive assistance with technical training in their mother tongues.

Private education

72. Private education is widely recognized: 68 out of 71 countries taking part in this consultation comment on the issue. At one end of the spectrum, private education may not be allowed at all. At the other end, a commercial private school system is functioning seemingly without any of the restraints that regulate the public school system. In between these extremes, the arrangements for co-operation and mutual support between those in charge of education for the public and the private sector vary widely. Three different types of private schools are mainly mentioned in country responses: (1) schools which receive government subsidies; (2) schools which attract special clientèle and are therefore financially independent from government; and (3) schools established for commercial purposes and where the quality of education is often rather low.

73. In the present context, it is a principal interest of many countries how and whether the existence of private education affects discrimination. In order to look after compliance against discrimination, the public authorities have institutionalized inspection and supervision to verify admission requirements and the comparability of the relevant standards such as curriculum, teacher training, physical facilities and the like.

74. In many rather prosperous countries, private schools strongly support government authorities in maintaining high standards of education. Public authorities have a strong tool at their disposal with which to control performance in the private education sector as far as discrimination is concerned. Without recognition, a school cannot receive subsidies; without subsidies a school may face difficulty to maintain or reach standards needed to obtain recognition.

75. Country responses report that there are schools which can attract a clientèle sufficient to ensure independence of public funding, and hence freedom from public supervision. Generally, private education in countries such as Canada, New Zealand, Australia, the Netherlands, Belgium and the Scandinavian States offer alternative, equivalent curriculum and teaching techniques combined with their own particular *raison d'être*. However, various precautions are taken to prevent an excess of exclusivity in such schools. For example, private denominational schools may have to accept at the very least a certain percentage of students from other denominations.

76. Private schools often function in close co-operation with individual school boards, public authorities, parents' associations and the community in general. Reservation about such close co-operation is mentioned only once (Republic of Korea). While stressing the importance of the continuing efforts to overcome discriminatory trends in a society steeped in tradition, concern is nevertheless expressed about the potential loss of autonomy by private institutions occasioned by their acceptance of public assistance.

77. The situation is more serious and pressing at the other extreme, especially in countries where even a minimum standard of education for a large proportion of a country's population is at risk. A lack of public funds to subsidize part of the private education sector will deprive a government considerably of its ability to influence conduct. Such power is restricted

further when the education budget is insufficient to maintain even an adequate public education system. There, the need to broaden the education to be offered beyond its own capacity leads the government to applaud the foundation of new as well as the continued existence of traditional private establishments.

78. Countries formerly under colonial rule are particularly ambivalent about what they have inherited. Very often, a major part of a country's private education has been created by the activities of various missionary groups. On the other hand, it is acknowledged that they have brought education to regions for which the government even today cannot always provide adequate resources. One response from an African State says it cautiously: '...quite a few private schools can in practice be distinguished by the religious or ethnical background of the school authorities and children'.

79. An uneasy awareness that educational goals may suffer from some distortion accompanies the function of private schools created primarily for commercial purposes. The cause for concern is described most directly by a West African country: Given that the state cannot provide enough places in public schools and that demand is constantly increasing, the establishment of private schools mainly aims at making considerable profit. While supposedly complying with standards, the instruction offered does not pretend to compete on qualitative grounds; the State has no means or system of controlling it at all. Similar preoccupations are voiced by other African and Latin American countries.

80. Private schools are, in the vast majority of cases, fee charging institutions. This characteristic creates various forms of difficulties. The legal ground for the existence of private education is to allow for parents' and students' right to the free choice of a form of education congruent with their academic potential and aspirations. But they may not coincide with the financial capabilities demanded for admission in those countries which have achieved a reasonably equal distribution of income. Reference is made to those nations as already mentioned in the context of subsidizing private education as an institution complementing and interacting fully with the public education system (Canada, New Zealand, Australia, the Netherlands, Belgium and Scandinavian nations). There, material and financial assistance is offered directly to parents and students.

81. Greater disparities between private and public education may become pronounced in countries where rich and poor strata are much more separated. There, top private schools tend to be better equipped than the public counterpart; the fees and study costs correspondingly are high. Consequently, those who are able to benefit from such high quality education are very limited. In some countries subsidies to the institution of private education do exist, even when subsidies to individuals for attending these schools are scarce. In Ecuador, the State pays a subsidy to private schools based on enrolment figures which amounts to about 50 per cent of the unit cost in the public sector. Thus, 'setting aside funds for élitist education at the expense of popular education for the masses'.

82. What appears to emerge from the Questionnaire is the variety of conditions characterizing private education in different countries, and the many forms in which private and public education seek to work together, often very successfully, for the benefit of the students' education. For a consultation on the elimination of discrimination, the overall conclusion emerging from the study of responses is that much effort has already been and is continually spent to ensure that eventually private education, an expression of freedom of choice, will incorporate the same guarantees as public education concerning the realization of the constitutional obligation to avoid discrimination.

Religious instruction

83. The information provided indicates that segregation on religious ground has virtually disappeared from the public system of the 39 responding countries. In addition there are no obvious qualitative differences between schools. Although in two of German Länder and several Canadian provinces Protestant, Catholic and multi-denominational school boards and respective schools exist side by side, in these cases comprehensive arrangements and strict supervision ensure the equivalency in quality and access in the multiple branches of the whole system.

84. The support of religious institutions is more common at the secondary and post-secondary levels. Protestant seminaries, Catholic colleges, Islamic academies and other theological schools whose purpose is traditionally to ensure the training of personnel for the needs of the various religions exist in many countries. It was not possible, however, to establish their numbers or to what degree they are financed and maintained by public authorities.

85. The right to enjoy religious freedom without discrimination can lead to the demand for religious instruction. It can also provoke accusations of an infringement of freedom when religion is taught in public schools. Even where religious instruction has been excluded from the public curriculum by long-standing tradition, the problem re-emerges when decisions have to be taken about how to teach moral conduct and ethical principles.

86. A public system concerned about fostering tolerance will need to find the acceptable balance which offers the desired form of denominational instruction while avoiding compulsion. This is recognized as a problem mainly by some of the more prosperous countries. Industrialization and the lure of wealth set in motion the modern population migrations, often from distant regions and cultures. In Finland religious studies must be provided if at least three students so request. In Sweden students may be excused from attending religious instruction if they can learn about their faith or participate in ethnic courses elsewhere.

Quality of education

87. When the Questionnaire inquires about measures taken to improve the quality and efficiency of education, virtually all countries refer in general terms to recent efforts to achieve improvements in education generally. There would seem to be agreement that equality of educational opportunity does not mean homogeneity of education. Many responses indicate the importance of taking the social, economic and cultural environment in which education is offered into consideration. Several countries show that they have been considering personalized teaching consistent with each pupil's learning pace. Other measures mentioned to improve quality include consistent evaluation of curriculum seminars to promote effective methods of teaching (Syrian Arab Republic), private tutors at school (Malta) and polytechnical education (Bulgaria).

88. Many countries mention their extensive efforts to provide and strengthen pre- and in-service training and retraining for teachers. They also indicate various incentive measures to attract teachers, especially for rural areas. Some countries offer better living conditions and better salaries in rural areas; others provide measures to upgrade the status of teachers.

89. Several countries report better teacher/student ratios and reduced class sizes, but actual ratios and sizes vary from country to country and it is difficult to judge whether the figures show effectiveness and quality of teaching.

Higher education

90. The Convention and Recommendation in their desire to overcome discrimination in education stipulate that higher education 'should be equally accessible to all on the basis of individual capacity'. Higher education, at the top of the education pyramid, is even less universal in character than is secondary education. In virtually every country far fewer than those who are willing and capable of benefiting from university studies will be able to enter higher education. Almost all countries, however, report continued and even considerable increases in admission capacity. The great majority of countries report successes over recent years concerning the increase of the number of places that can be offered at this level. The majority of responses indicate that further growth is still their concern in this context even though in recent years there had been an increase in the number of places available. This has been achieved not only through construction projects which expand existing or create new spaces, and more efficient use of facilities, but also correspondence programmes and the use of mass media such as print, radio, television and radio telephone. Another major issue at the level of higher education is the cost to students. Slightly short of half the countries, 27, report that higher education is free, often coupled with additional financial assistance. In addition, many different and imaginative approaches are taken by Member States to lighten the financial burden of the students. For example, there are arrangements where fees are charged, yet many, if not almost all, students receive scholarships that cover tuition and living expenses. Another example is that authorities offer loans to all or part of the student body depending on the evaluation of their later prospects in the labour market.

91. A third issue is the conditions and procedures regulating admission to higher education. It is normally expected that selection and screening procedures are being used widely. Indeed, less than a quarter of respondents indicate that no higher education entrance examinations exists. The secondary school certificate is in principle sufficient for admission. Nevertheless, it is common to learn of the existence of some further conditions laid down by particular institutions or for certain courses. In the majority of higher education systems, entrance examinations with or without further selection procedures are the norm.

92. Many countries continue to elaborate specific measures that assist in improving equality of access by encouraging a pattern of participation in post-secondary education that better reflects the overall composition of society. Several respondents have linked the expansion of facilities explicitly to pursue better geographical distribution. Algeria refers to the use of a 'carte universitaire' (school mapping for the tertiary level); Poland's expansion is to include more cities; Ecuador regrets that there still are only very few establishments in rural areas. A few of more prosperous countries, including Scandinavian nations, report an even coverage of their territory. Many of the countries engaged in extension programmes are likely to take account of regional differences when deciding on new locations.

93. In a few cases, reference is made to quotas reserved for inhabitants of certain regions or members of minorities. In Finland quotas are reserved to ensure that persons belonging to language minorities are trained for professions such as lawyers and doctors in their mother tongue. One of the respective programmes in the province of Nova Scotia (Canada) offers a comprehensive approach with a 'transition year programme' which is to encourage native students interested in attending university to attempt a first or transition year. The major components include, besides financial incentives, subsidized housing for students in the form of boarding and

residences. Support to minority populations in Australia also appears to comprise several components so as to bridge any unfamiliar aspects of the transition to academic life.

94. Many countries state that female participation rates are close to that of male rates overall, but there are generally still gender imbalances in the enrolments for specific courses. One country mentions the use of different admission criteria for women to promote their attendance to higher education. When countries report that women are encouraged to go on to higher education, they emphasize the area of science, technology and engineering as well as other areas. In a similar manner, the existence of measures to encourage disadvantaged persons is also expressed.

Other tertiary education

95. The treatment of teacher training in this consultation shows a few remarkable differences from other branches of upper secondary or post-secondary education. One is the greater likelihood of no fees being charged in teacher training. Indeed, in a sizeable number of countries student teachers may receive a pre-salary or other financial incentives specific to the teacher training. This fact or trend may reflect an official reaction to the worsening situation for teachers in many countries as regards both the financial situation and status within the community.

96. One may presume that the stipulation of the Convention and Recommendation that 'training for the teaching profession shall/should be provided without discrimination' is being adhered to when 'personality assessments' are part of a country's screening procedure. Since it was listed in the Questionnaire, it has been mentioned by a number of countries, without further explanation.

97. Information was also requested on the conditions regulating 'studies abroad'. Responses had to be uneven. There are societies, whose citizens can go abroad without great formality and control, but these generally are not dependent on educational institutions abroad. Other countries do not overly encourage travel abroad for various reasons. Some restrict movement out of the country mainly to save foreign currency; these countries are often dependent on sending persons abroad for studying. Since because of the scarcity of the types of education everybody dreams about, the pressure to be selected can be almost deforming. On the subject of study abroad, one of the less prosperous countries observes: 'that the selection process is neither ideal nor just: opportunities are not widely publicized, thereby denying possible candidates the chance to take part'.

Adult education

98. The Convention and Recommendation take a position also on the educational needs of those who did not benefit from the formal education system. While credit is given to the continuity of efforts by Member States, these accept an obligation to further encourage and intensify opportunities for all those in need of making up for some or all benefits of schooling forgone at an earlier age in their lives. Sixty-one out of 71 respondents have commented on their activities in the broader area of adult education. There is more evidence that countries have devised methods than there is concerning the application of these methods.

99. Countries have shown that formal education draws very heavily on available resources. After providing compulsory education and other areas of priority, little is left for adult education. It can happen that the greater part of a country's educational needs are left to the devices of adult or non-formal or out-of-school education but at the same time only a rather small

amount of human, physical and financial resources can be spared for them. The only area covered by adult education which is reported on in detail is literacy.

100. Thirty-one out of 61 countries are much concerned about that part of the population that have not been to school at all. Literacy training, conceived as making people learn how to read and write, demands the centre of attention. Most responses record advances in the spread of literacy. Some report that plans to embark on literacy campaigns are under way, though, in a few cases implementation is dependent on funds being mobilized.

101. Nevertheless many countries referred to including literacy training among the obligations on the authorities responsible for the education of the public, often by integrating it into the administrative structure. They report that they are undertaking or planning activities in favour of the illiterate. Almost all the responding countries include one or another form of literacy training among the means used to bring education to everybody. A wide range of methods from evening literacy classes through radio and television broadcasting to the use of satellites, have been reported.

102. Some countries express concern that participants may not be able to continue their education at the next higher level; in others, literacy work is described as more immediate. In Uganda, for example, the aim is the elimination of 'three enemies, namely, ignorance, disease and poverty'.

103. Two or three decades ago, several countries could announce very successful literacy campaigns, at times leading to the virtual disappearance of illiteracy. No such large-scale achievements have been reported for recent years. It can hardly be doubted that in several countries the overall literacy rates have risen in recent years. Yet only one country, Turkey, quantifies its progress; the overall literacy rate among its population rose from 67 per cent in 1981 to 88 per cent in 1988.

104. Part of the substantial advances is often attributable to having sought out groups or sectors in the population that seem particularly vulnerable because they previously had been forgotten. Specific mention is made of the rural and the female population. Minorities are of somewhat more explicit concern of many countries. Finally, the widespread use of national and local languages has been the basis for the increase in and success of many of the reported literacy activities.

PART III

A. CONCLUSION

105. The Fifth Consultation would appear to be a watershed in the reports on the Convention and Recommendation. All reporting countries have legislation in place which makes discrimination in education illegal; some countries nevertheless state that the legislation needs to be refined so as to eliminate unintentional discrimination. Furthermore, 71 of the 172 countries to which Questionnaires were sent replied and the responses were not evenly spread over the regions. These situations seem to indicate that the nature and focus of the questions asked as well as the method(s) of collecting the data should be somewhat changed in future consultations.

106. The Questionnaire sought replies about specifically identified groups which tend to be disadvantaged as well as reports on actions and activities at the various levels of the education systems which seek to provide equal educational opportunity and treatment. The responses have presented a variety

of strategies which have and are being adopted but most are faced with a serious problem: the serious reduction in the resources devoted to education in many countries and the brake on development. Indeed the most affected are those groups which are disadvantaged and those programmes which offer equality of educational opportunity.

107. The reports show that primary/basic education is well covered. They show, however, a common problem in many secondary systems in both developed and developing countries - the problem of upgrading technical and vocational schools and consequently, the difficulty of transfer between different types of courses. Among the positive aspects found in the replies are improved access to and participation by girls and women in first level and general second level education. They still experience greater difficulties of participation in science and technology studies and in higher education. The report indicates that teacher training (both pre-service and in-service) has been the focus of attention in many countries. These efforts were in the context of a dominant concern in many countries to improve the quality of education.

108. Pre-service education was included for the first time in this consultation. When it is widespread, it can assist in providing equal opportunity. However, where it is limited to a small group, it may have the effect of reinforcing the comparative disadvantage of those groups not benefiting from it.

109. The Convention has been and still is an important stimulus to alerting countries to provide equal opportunity and treatment in education. Yet this report can only be a partial reflection of the prevailing state as responses are not well spread between countries at different levels of development and regions. It would require a study of external sources, documents from research institutions and official sources, especially from those countries which did not respond, to give a rounded picture. If such an extension of source materials could be an element of the Sixth Consultation, it should be possible to prepare a broader and more representative report.

B. RECOMMENDATIONS

110. The Committee was pleased to note that there was legislation in most countries which provided for access to educational opportunities for all persons. The concern now was that the democratization of education should be viewed more in terms of the quality of education. It was felt that a comprehensive picture would result if future reports of the Committee could benefit from the breadth of information available about educational developments in Member States (e.g. national reports to the International Conference on Education (ICE), national reports to Advisory Committees, etc.). These reports would also be useful to provide information about those countries which do not reply during the Consultation.

111. In the light of the concern which was expressed, no timetable is proposed in this report for the Sixth Consultation. Rather, a recommendation is included here to present a report to the twenty-seventh session of the General Conference on possible modalities which could be used for the Sixth Consultation. In addition the next Consultation will also take into account the results of a Secretariat survey on the relevance of the standard-setting instruments of UNESCO to present needs.

112. The decision of the Executive Board, based on the recommendation of the Committee and with a special recommendation addressed to the General Conference, is reproduced below.

The Executive Board,

1. Having examined the Report of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations regarding the Fifth Consultation of Member States on the implementation of the Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education based on replies to the questionnaire provided by Member States before 31 December 1990,
2. Recognizing the value of the effort made by those Member States which have transmitted the said replies,
3. Notes that the periodic consultation of Member States on the implementation of the above-mentioned Convention and Recommendation is intended to enable the Organization to ascertain both the extent to which Member States are giving effect to these instruments and the obstacles which they encounter, and regrets that in general more countries do not reply;
4. Considers therefore that the possible need for changes to the monitoring and reporting mechanisms connected with the consultation process should be looked into;
5. Recalls that the submission of periodic reports by Member States concerning the implementation of conventions and recommendations adopted by the General Conference is a constitutional obligation, and that the States Party to the above-mentioned Convention have further assumed the obligation, under the terms of Article 7 thereof, to submit such reports periodically to the General Conference;
6. Further recalls that information concerning general aspects of discrimination in education submitted, in accordance with the usual procedure, by international non-governmental organizations having consultative status with UNESCO and concerned with education, might provide the Committee with useful additional material;
7. Expresses its appreciation of the work done by the Committee in the course of preparing this report, and endorses the conclusions contained in the Committee's report;
8. Nevertheless expresses its concern regarding the uneven nature of the information provided by the questionnaire method;
9. Authorizes the Director-General to look into more focused in-depth ways of assessing progress, exploring problem-areas and assisting Member States;
10. Recommends that the General Conference:
 - (a) invite Member States which have not yet done so to become Parties to the Convention;
 - (b) strongly urge Member States to implement the Convention and Recommendation and to co-operate to the fullest with the Secretariat's study into the modalities of the Sixth Consultation, it being understood that the Secretariat will report back to the General Conference at its twenty-seventh session concerning proposed modalities and a timetable for the next report;

- (c) invite international non-governmental organizations and in particular those of the teaching profession to assist the Organization by making known the provisions of the Convention and Recommendation and by supporting the efforts of the competent authorities to implement them.

ANNEX I

FIFTH QUESTIONNAIRE ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF
THE CONVENTION AND RECOMMENDATION AGAINST
DISCRIMINATION IN EDUCATION

Aims which the Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in
Education set for action by Member States

In adopting the Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education, the General Conference of Unesco at its eleventh session (1960) recalled in the preamble thereto that 'the Universal Declaration of Human Rights asserts the principle of non-discrimination and proclaims that every person has the right to education' and emphasized that, consequently, the Organization, 'while respecting the diversity of national educational systems, has the duty not only to proscribe any form of discrimination in education but also to promote equality of opportunity and treatment for all in education'.

Both instruments are therefore based on two fundamental and complementary principles: the elimination of discrimination, on the one hand, and the adoption of measures to promote equality of opportunity and treatment in education, on the other.

In accordance with the first principle, the States Parties to the Convention undertake 'to abrogate any statutory provisions and any administrative instructions and to discontinue any administrative practices which involve discrimination in education' (Article 3.a).(1)

As regards the action to be taken to ensure equality of opportunity and treatment in education, which in many countries requires complicated and difficult measures and substantial budgetary expenditure that must be spread out over time, both instruments provide for the formulation, development and application by States of 'a national policy which, by methods appropriate to the circumstances and to national usage, will tend to promote equality of opportunity and of treatment in the matter of education' (Article 4).(1)

The Convention and the Recommendation also define the aims of education, which they formulate as follows: '...education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms; it shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace' (Article 5.1.a of the Convention and Section V.a of the Recommendation).

I. ELIMINATION OF DISCRIMINATION

Article 1 of the Convention and Section 1 of the Recommendation define discrimination in education as follows:

(1) Identical but not legally binding provisions are contained in the Recommendation.

'1. For the purposes of this Convention/Recommendation, the term "discrimination" includes any distinction, exclusion, limitation or preference(1) which, being based on race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, economic condition or birth, has the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing equality of treatment in education and in particular:

- (a) of depriving any person or group of persons of access to education of any type or at any level;
- (b) of limiting any person or group of persons to education of an inferior standard;
- (c) subject to the provisions of Article 2/Section II of this Convention/Recommendation, of establishing or maintaining separate educational systems or institutions for persons or groups of persons; or
- (d) of inflicting on any person or group of persons conditions which are incompatible with the dignity of man.

2. For the purposes of this Convention/Recommendation, the term "education" refers to all types and levels of education, and includes access to education, the standard and quality of education, and the conditions under which it is given.'

1. Are there any statutory provisions or regulations which involve or might involve discrimination in education as defined in Article 1/Section I of the Convention/Recommendation?

If so, please give examples and specify the steps taken by your Government to abrogate such provisions.(2)

2. Are there any practices or situations which involve or might involve discrimination in education?

- (1) It should be noted that the report of 10 December 1960 which accompanied the Draft Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education submitted to the General Conference and adopted by it on 14 December 1960 specifies the following: 'There is no unjustified "preference" when the State takes measures to meet the special requirements of persons in particular circumstances, such as backward children, the blind, populations to whose illiteracy it is desired to put an end by suitable teaching methods, immigrants, etc.' (11 C/PRG/36, para. 13). This was reaffirmed by the Executive Board's Committee on Conventions and Recommendations in its third report on the implementation of the Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (see document 20 C/40, Unesco, Paris, August 1978, para. 271).
- (2) States which have replied to questions 1-5 in previous consultations may simply give a reference to the corresponding passages in their report, unless the legislation or situation has changed or evolved. Their attention is drawn, however, to the more comprehensive wording of these questions.

- 2.1 With regard to the possible existence of discriminatory practices or situations, account should be taken of the development of non-formal educational activities and programmes since the adoption of the Convention and Recommendation in 1960. Please indicate whether such programmes, in particular those conveyed by the mass media in your country, may involve discriminatory stereotypes based on sex, race or the social, national or other origin of a person or group.
- 2.2 Please give details of such situations and/or practices, if any, the steps taken or planned to remedy them and, where appropriate, the results achieved.
3. Are educational systems or institutions separate for pupils of the two sexes?(1)
- 3.1 If so, for what reason?
- 3.2 If separate schools are provided for boys and girls, by what means are the following ensured:
- equivalent access to education by all pupils;
 - equitable distribution of teaching staff with qualifications of the same standard;
 - the opportunity for all to take the same or equivalent courses of study?
4. In your country are there separate educational systems or institutions established or maintained for religious or linguistic reasons?(2)

-
- (1) According to Article 2.a of the Convention and the corresponding section of the Recommendation, the establishment or maintenance of such systems or institutions do not constitute discrimination if they 'offer equivalent access to education, provide a teaching staff with qualifications of the same standard as well as school premises and equipment of the same quality, and afford the opportunity to take the same or equivalent courses of study'.
- (2) According to Article 2.b and c of the Convention and the corresponding section of the Recommendation: 'When permitted in a State, the following situations shall not be deemed to constitute discrimination, within the meaning of Article 1 of this Convention: (...) b. the establishment or maintenance, for religious or linguistic reasons, of separate educational systems or institutions offering an education which is in keeping with the wishes of the pupil's parents or legal guardians, if participation in such systems or attendance at such institutions is optional and if the education provided conforms to such standards as may be laid down or approved by the competent authorities, in particular for education of the same level; c. the establishment or maintenance of private educational institutions, if the object of the institutions is not to secure the exclusion of any group but to provide educational facilities in addition to those provided by the public authorities, if the institutions are conducted in accordance with that object, and if the education provided conforms with such standards as may be laid down or approved by the competent authorities, in particular for education of the same level.'

If so,

- 4.1 On what criteria are they based?
- 4.2 Is participation in such systems or attendance at such institutions optional?
- 4.3 What proportion of school age children at each level of education is enrolled in such systems or institutions?
- 4.4 Does the education provided in such systems or institutions conform to standards laid down or approved by the competent authorities for education of the same level?

5. Are there any private educational systems or institutions in your country?(1)

If so:

- 5.1 For what reasons?
 - linguistic or religious reasons;
 - pedagogical reasons;
 - other reasons.
- 5.2 What are the criteria for admission to private schools?
- 5.3 Does the education provided in private schools conform to such standards as may be laid down or approved by the competent authorities?
- 5.4 What are the forms of collaboration between private schools and the public authorities?

(1) According to Article 2.b and c of the Convention and the corresponding section of the Recommendation: 'When permitted in a State, the following situations shall not be deemed to constitute discrimination, within the meaning of Article 1 of this Convention: (...) b. the establishment or maintenance, for religious or linguistic reasons, of separate educational systems or institutions offering an education which is in keeping with the wishes of the pupil's parents or legal guardians, if participation in such systems or attendance at such institutions is optional and if the education provided conforms to such standards as may be laid down or approved by the competent authorities, in particular for education of the same level; c. the establishment or maintenance of private educational institutions, if the object of the institutions is not to secure the exclusion of any group but to provide educational facilities in addition to those provided by the public authorities, if the institutions are conducted in accordance with that object, and if the education provided conforms with such standards as may be laid down or approved by the competent authorities, in particular for education of the same level.'

II. EQUALITY OF EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITY AND TREATMENT

6. What are the measures provided for within the framework of your country's education policy to promote equality of educational opportunity and treatment?

- 6.1 Is it aimed particularly at eliminating regional disparities in education?
- 6.2 Was this policy adopted in the light of the conditions prevailing in, and the characteristics of, the communities and of the demands of the environment and/or context to which it applies?
- 6.3 What legislative measures or regulations have been adopted to give effect to this policy?
- 6.4 How are functions and responsibilities distributed between the central, regional and/or local authorities?
- 6.5 What role are the following required to play in the formulation and implementation of education plans?
 - parents;
 - students;
 - teachers;
 - administrators;
 - social workers;
 - other groups.
- 6.6 How is the education system financed and what is done to ensure the equitable distribution of the financial resources allocated to education and to the different levels of the education system?

7. Have legislative measures, regulations or social or financial measures been adopted in your country entitling particular population groups to receive preferential treatment?(1)

If so:

7.1 Please identify those groups:

(1) It should be noted that the report of 10 December 1960 which accompanied the Draft Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education submitted to the General Conference and adopted by it on 14 December 1960 specifies the following: 'There is no unjustified "preference" when the State takes measures to meet the special requirements of persons in particular circumstances, such as backward children, the blind, populations to whose illiteracy it is desired to put an end by suitable teaching methods, immigrants, etc.' (11 C/PRG/36, para. 13). This was reaffirmed by the Executive Board's Committee on Conventions and Recommendations in its third report on the implementation of the Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (see document 20 C/40, Unesco, Paris, August 1978, para. 271).

- girls;
- rural populations;
- children of nomads, ethnic or linguistic minorities, refugees, immigrants or orphans;
- disabled persons;
- other groups.

7.2 What are the aims of this preferential treatment?

- to offset socio-economic and cultural disadvantages;
- to offer educational services that meet special needs;
- other aims.

8. To what extent does your Government give effect to the right of members of national minorities to carry on their own educational activities, including the maintenance of schools, as set forth in Article 5.1.c of the Convention (Section V.c of the Recommendation)?

- 8.1 Are languages of national minorities used or taught in such educational activities?
- 8.2 Is the standard of education of such activities equivalent to the general standards laid down or approved by the competent authorities?
- 8.3 Is participation in such activities or attendance at such schools optional?

9. Pre-primary education

Since the adoption of the Convention and Recommendation in 1960, which contain no reference to pre-primary education, the importance of such education in promoting equality of opportunity for access to education and for success at school has been widely recognized, particularly for children from modest socio-economic and cultural backgrounds.

- 9.1 What types of pre-primary educational institutions exist in your country? What is the percentage of children of pre-primary school age attending such institutions?
- 9.2 Have such institutions been established in rural areas and marginalized urban areas?
- 9.3 Are they public and/or private institutions?
- 9.4 Is pre-primary education free? If not, please state whether payment may be waived in the case of children from under-privileged families.

10. Primary education(1)

Article 4.a of the Convention/Section IV.a of the Recommendation stipulate that primary education shall/should be free and compulsory.

- 10.1 Please supply detailed information on the scope of this provision in regard to free education, covering for instance:
- school fees;
 - school textbooks and supplies;
 - additional classes;
 - meals at school canteens, if any;
 - school transport;
 - school uniforms or any other items of clothing and footwear;
 - medical and dental expenses;
 - boarding fees, where applicable.
- 10.2 If primary education is not free, is financial or any other form of assistance granted to needy families by the competent authorities in your country?
- 10.3 If education is not compulsory or is not generally available, please indicate the obstacles which prevent it being so.
- 10.4 What measures do the competent authorities intend to adopt to implement the aforementioned principles of the Convention/Recommendation?
- (a) legislative measures;
 - (b) administrative and practical measures, for instance:
 - increasing the number of education establishments, particularly in rural and/or geographically disadvantaged areas;

(1) Questionnaire No. 1 which served in the preparation of the 39th session of the International Conference on Education (1984) contains the following clarifications:

'In terms of the International Standard Classification of Education "primary education" corresponds to "education at the first level" which usually begins at age 5, 6 or 7, and lasts for about five or six years. (Unesco, Office of Statistics, Division of Statistics on Education. International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED). Paris, 1976. Introduction, paragraph 17)'

'Attention is drawn to the fact that, taking into account the variety of national structures of education, the term "primary education" may be understood differently in various national situations. Information on national concepts of primary education is requested'.

In some Member States where compulsory secondary education is provided in the same schools as primary education, the authorities replying to the questionnaire are requested to specify to which years of study (grades) the questions concerning primary education are applicable.

- fitting up existing school buildings and providing them with furniture, equipment for practical work, libraries, etc.; in this connection, please specify, if appropriate, whether the community participates in the building and maintenance of schools and/or the purchase of equipment;
- amalgamating schools to serve several communities;
- measures to encourage parents to take an interest in the education of their children through close collaboration between parents, teachers and members of community social services, etc.;
- special allowances to needy families to offset any loss of income resulting from children's attendance at school;
- bringing curricula into line with family aspirations and community needs;
- use of the mother tongue during the first years and a gradual move towards the teaching of, and instruction in, the official language(s) of the country;
- introduction of compensatory educational services in the form of adjustment and make up classes and remedial teaching for those in need of it;
- establishment of school transport service to facilitate commuting between school and home;
- use of non-formal means to supplement the formal education system at the primary level;
- measures to persuade parents to send their children to school if they refuse to do so despite a legal requirement regarding compulsory school attendance.

10.5 What are the main difficulties, if any, that have been encountered in the provision of compulsory, free primary education, and what measures have been taken to overcome such difficulties?

11. Secondary education

Article 4.a of the Convention/Section IV.a of the Recommendation stipulate that secondary education in its different forms shall/should be generally available and accessible to all.

11.1 What measures have been taken to make the various levels and types of secondary education more widely accessible?

For instance:

- introduction of a common core covering primary education and lower secondary education;
- extension of compulsory schooling to cover the three or four first years of secondary education;

- free schooling;
 - financial or other forms of assistance to families;
 - material incentives for working pupils who wish to pursue their studies without stopping work.
- 11.2 How do pupils enter secondary education? For example:
- automatic transition from one level to another;
 - competitive or other examination.
If there is any selection, please specify the selection criteria and methods.
- 11.3 Are tutoring sessions, special language classes, evening classes or correspondence courses provided for those needing remedial teaching?
If not, please state the reasons why.
- 11.4 What provision is made for counselling or information on the choices open between different courses of study in secondary education?
- 11.5 Do existing structures make it possible to move from one course of study or type of secondary education to another?
- 11.6 Have efforts been made to upgrade technical and vocational education through, for example:
- stronger links between it and general education;
 - stronger links between training and employment;
 - specific measures to encourage girls to choose this type of education.(1)
- 11.7 What language is used for vocational education, particularly in a bilingual or multilingual community?
- 11.8 Is an examination held or a certificate or diploma awarded to mark the completion of secondary education?
If so, please specify whether this applies to all the types of education at this level which exist in your country.
- 11.9 Do the State, employers and post-secondary educational institutions and/or universities recognize the equivalence between such certificates or diplomas as may be awarded at the end of secondary education and at the end of equivalent training received through non-formal programmes?
- 11.10 What are the main difficulties that have been encountered in making secondary education generally available and what measures have been taken to overcome such difficulties?

12. Higher education

Article 4.a of the Convention/Section IV.a of the Recommendation stipulate that higher education shall/should be equally accessible to all on the basis of individual capacity.

(1) Where possible, please give the rates of enrolment of girls in technical and vocational education over the past five years.

12.1 What measures have been taken to improve access to higher/post-secondary education provided in public or private institutions for full-time and/or part-time studies?

For instance:

- expansion of the admission capacity of existing institutions or establishment of new institutions;
- diversification of curricula;
- use of the media.

12.2 What measures have been adopted to increase the participation of girls and women in higher education and to ensure access to such education by disadvantaged groups such as disabled persons, linguistic minorities, rural populations and adults wishing to pursue higher studies in later life?

12.3 What are the criteria for admission to higher educational institutions? For example:

- presentation of a secondary-school leaving certificate;
- success in an entrance examination;
- work experience gained after completion of secondary education or another specified level of education;
- completion of compulsory national service;
- candidate's nationality;
- regional quotas;
- other criteria.

Article 3.c of the Convention/Section III.c of the Recommendation stipulate that States shall/should not allow any differences of treatment by the public authorities between nationals, except on the basis of merit or need, in the matter of school fees and the granting of scholarships of other forms of assistance to pupils and necessary permits and facilities for the pursuit of studies in foreign countries.

12.4 If higher education is not free of charge, can the expenses to be borne by students vary according to the higher educational institution, the students' place of residence and/or the chosen courses of study?

If so, please describe the effect of such measures on access to higher education.

12.5 Is financial or any other form of assistance offered to persons apt for higher education, including those who continue to work while being enrolled in evening classes or correspondence courses?

12.6 If higher education can be pursued only in an institution abroad, what are the conditions governing the granting of scholarships, if any, and the necessary authorization to pursue studies abroad?

13. Quality of education

Article 4.b of the Convention/Section IV.b of the Recommendation stipulate that States shall/should ensure that the standards of education are equivalent in all public educational institutions of the same level, and that the conditions relating to the quality of the education provided are also equivalent.

Have measures been taken to improve the quality and efficiency of primary and secondary education?

For instance:

- progressive replacement, especially in rural areas, of incomplete schools(1) or schools offering a shorter period of schooling than in urban areas;
- development and improvement of the initial and in-service training of teachers;
- incentive measures to attract qualified teachers to rural areas (salary supplements, more rapid promotion, provision of free housing by the local authority, or other advantages in kind);
- improvement in the pupil/teacher ratio;
- reduction of the number of pupils per class;
- improved teaching methods;
- personalized teaching consistent with each pupil's pace of learning;
- taking account in the educational process of pupils' personal experience and the environment;
- introduction, as far as possible, of practical, technical and scientific components into curricula from the primary education level.

14. Adult education

Article 4.c of the Convention/Section IV.c of the Recommendation stipulate that States shall/should intensify the education of persons who have not received any primary education or who have not completed the entire primary education course and the continuation of their education on the basis of individual capacity.

- 14.1 What measures have been taken to that effect at the national/regional and/or local levels by the public authorities?
- 14.2 If a literacy campaign has been undertaken in your country or literacy courses have been organized, please specify the languages used in the literacy campaign/courses.

(1) i.e schools in which pupils cannot benefit from all the courses available in other schools in the country.

- 14.3 What methods are used for literacy and post-literacy training and for adult education, and at what levels is adult education provided?

For example:

- intensive courses corresponding to a certain number of years of basic education;
- courses organized by firms;
- special courses for adults;
- training activities for qualified adult education personnel;
- evening classes provided by educational institutions;
- self-directed learning programmes;
- correspondence courses;
- radio or television broadcasts or films;
- courses transmitted by satellite, computer-programmed courses.

- 14.4 Since out-of-school or non-formal education not only constitutes an extension of formal education but also affords wider educational opportunities for the population as a whole, including adults (men and women), are efforts being made to reach underprivileged or marginalized groups of the population? If so, please specify the groups concerned, such as:

- physically or mentally disabled persons;
- nomads;
- ethnic or linguistic minorities;
- immigrants;
- refugees;
- persons who have relapsed into illiteracy;
- migrant populations who have not adjusted to the environment in which they live;
- young people who have left school before reaching the minimum legal age for entering employment;
- unemployed adults needing vocational retraining;
- other.

- 14.5 Does out-of-school/non-formal education come under the responsibility of the public authorities and/or private initiative?

- 14.6 Are non-formal education courses or programmes accredited by certificates or diplomas recognized by the State, employers and/or post-primary institutions?
- 14.7 Are there any co-ordination arrangements to enable pupils to move from the formal to the non-formal system and vice versa?
- 14.8 Have measures been taken in respect of education and training to enable immigrants and/or refugees to return to and be reintegrated into the community of their country of origin? If so, please specify the nature and scope of such measures.

15. Training for the teaching profession

Article 4.d of the Convention/Section IV.d of the Recommendation, stipulate that training for the teaching profession shall/should be provided without discrimination.

- 15.1 What are the criteria for admission to institutions where such training is provided? For instance:
- success in an entrance examination or tests;
 - qualifications acquired through self-teaching and/or distance education (television or radio);
 - sex;
 - personality assessment;
 - academic level;
 - other criteria.
- 15.2 Is training for the teaching profession provided free of charge? If not, please specify whether any financial or other form of assistance is available to student teachers, in particular those who are economically and geographically underprivileged.(1)
- 15.3 If post-primary teachers can only be trained in an institution abroad, what are the conditions governing the granting of scholarships, if any, and of necessary permits to pursue studies abroad?

III. AIMS OF EDUCATION

Article 5.1.a of the Convention/Section V.a of the Recommendation sets out certain principles as guidance for the educational activities of Member States. In particular, it states that 'education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms; it shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace'.

(1) Where possible, please give figures on the average percentage of pupils/students successfully completing their studies in teacher-training institutions.

16. What lessons have you learned from your efforts to ensure the application of these principles? Please give examples of positive results achieved.

ANNEX II

List of Member States which participated in the Fifth Consultation

- (C)* Algeria
- (C) Australia
- Bahrain
- (C) Barbados
- Belgium
- (C) Benin, The Republic of
- (C) Brunei
- (C) Bulgaria
- Burkina Faso
- Burundi
- (C) Byelorussian S.S.R.
- Cameroon
- Canada
- (C) Central African Republic
- (C) Chile
- (C) Congo
- (C) Costa Rica
- (C) Cuba
- (C) Cyprus
- (C) Czechoslovakia
- (C) Ecuador
- El Salvador
- (C) Finland
- Gambia
- (C) German D.R.**
- (C) Germany, Fed. Rep. of**
- (C) Guinea
- Guyana
- Honduras

* Member State having ratified the Convention

** This represents the status when the replies were received

- (C) Iran
- (C) Iraq
- Ireland
- (C) Italy
- (C) Jordan
- Korea, Rep. of
- (C) Kuwait
- (C) Luxemburg
- (C) Malta
- (C) Mauritius
- Mexico
- Nepal
- (C) Netherlands
- (C) New Zealand
- (C) Norway
- Pakistan
- (C) Peru
- (C) Poland
- (C) Portugal
- (C) Romania
- Rwanda
- Samoa (Western)
- (C) Saudi Arabia
- (C) Senegal
- (C) Spain
- (C) Swaziland
- (C) Sweden
- Syrian Arab Republic
- (C) Tanzania
- (C) Tunisia
- Turkey
- (C) Uganda
- (C) Ukrainian S.S.R.
- United Arab Emirates
- Uruguay
- (C) U.S.S.R.

- (C) Venezuela
- Yemen
- (C) Yugoslavia
- Zambia
- Zimbabwe

ANNEX III

List of States Parties to the Convention
against Discrimination in Education

The Convention entered into force on 22 May 1962. As at 31 August 1991, the 74 following Member States, together with Brunei and the Solomon Islands which are not members of UNESCO, had deposited instruments of ratification or acceptance of the Convention against Discrimination in Education.

Albania	Liberia
Democratic and Popular Republic of Algeria	Luxembourg
Argentina	Madagascar
Australia	Malta
Barbados	Mauritius
Belize	Mongolia
Benin, The Republic of	Morocco
Brazil	Netherlands
Bulgaria	New Zealand
Byelorussian Soviet Socialist Republic	Nicaragua
Central African Republic	Niger
Chile	Nigeria
China ¹	Norway
Congo	Republic of Panama
Costa Rica	Peru
Cuba	Philippines
Cyprus	Poland
Czechoslovakia	Portugal
Denmark	Romania
Dominica	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines
Dominican Republic	Saudi Arabia
Ecuador	Senegal
Arab Republic of Egypt	Sierra Leone
Finland	Socialist People's Libyan Arab Jamahiriya
France	Socialist Republic of Viet Nam
Germany, Federal Republic of	Spain
Guatemala	Sri Lanka
Guinea	Swaziland
Hungary	Sweden
Indonesia	Tunisia
Iran	Uganda
Iraq	Ukrainian Soviet Socialist Republic
Israel	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
Italy	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland
Jordan	United Republic of Tanzania
Kuwait	Venezuela
Lebanon	Yugoslavia

1. Instruments of ratification deposited by the authorities representing China in its relations with UNESCO at the time of the deposit (12 February 1965).