



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

GLOBAL EDUCATION MONITORING REPORT

2019

Migration, displacement and education:

BUILDING BRIDGES, NOT WALLS



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization



Sustainable
Development
Goals



Global
Education
Monitoring
Report

UNDER EMBARGO
UNTIL 20/11/2018

#EducationOnTheMove



UNDER EMBARGO
UNTIL 20/11/2018

INTERNATIONAL
MIGRATION

DISPLACEMENT

HIGHLY
SKILLED
PEOPLE

INTERNAL
MIGRATION
FROM VILLAGES
TO CITIES

Executive summary

Leave no one behind. This is among the most aspirational global commitments of the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Migration and displacement are two global challenges the agenda needs to address in achieving the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), including SDG 4: 'Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all'.

Migration and displacement interact with education in many ways. These links affect those who move, those who stay and those who host immigrants, refugees or other displaced populations. Internal migration mainly affects many rapidly urbanizing middle income countries, such as China, where more than one in three rural children are left behind by migrating parents. International migration mainly affects high income countries, where immigrants make up at least 15% of the student population in half of schools. It also affects sending countries: More than one in four witness at least one-fifth of their skilled nationals emigrating. Displacement mainly affects low income countries, which host 10% of the global population but 20% of the global refugee population, often in their most educationally deprived areas. More than half of those forcibly displaced are under age 18.

Migration and displacement affect education. They require systems to accommodate those who move and those left behind. Countries are challenged to fulfil the international commitment to respect the right to education for all. They must often act quickly, under severe constraints or even opposition from some constituencies. They need to address the needs of those cramming into slums, living nomadically or awaiting refugee status. Teachers have to deal with multilingual classrooms and traumas affecting displaced students. Qualifications and prior learning need to be recognized to make the most of migrants' and refugees' skills.

Education also affects migration and displacement. It is a major driver in the decision to migrate. Domestically, those with tertiary education are twice as likely to migrate as those with primary education; internationally, they are five times as likely. Education

affects not only migrants' attitudes, aspirations and beliefs but also those of their hosts. Increased classroom diversity brings both challenges and opportunities to learn from other cultures and experiences. Appropriate education content can help citizens critically process information and promote cohesive societies; inappropriate content can spread negative, partial, exclusive or dismissive notions of immigrants and refugees.

COUNTRIES ARE INCLUDING IMMIGRANTS AND REFUGEES IN NATIONAL EDUCATION SYSTEMS

Governments have taken increasingly bold steps to assume education responsibilities previously provided for only in international agreements. In recent years, the world has moved towards including immigrants and refugees in national education systems. Exclusionary practices are being abandoned as a result of forward-looking decisions, political pragmatism and international solidarity. Countries party to the 2018 Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration and the Global Compact on Refugees, which extensively refer to education, recognize education as an opportunity.

Historically, assimilation was the norm in most high income countries hosting foreign workers in the post-war period. Among 21 high income countries, Australia and Canada had adopted multiculturalism in their curricula by 1980. By 2010, it had been adopted in Finland, Ireland, New Zealand and Sweden as well, and partly adopted in over two-thirds of the countries.

Historically, most governments also provided parallel education to refugees, but such systems usually lacked qualified teachers, examinations were not certifiable, and funding risked being cut at short notice. Rather than keeping the hope of return alive, parallel education during protracted displacement diminished the chance of a meaningful life in first countries of asylum. Today, however, countries such as Chad, the Islamic Republic of Iran and Turkey shoulder substantial costs to ensure that Sudanese, Afghan, Syrian and other refugees attend school alongside nationals. In the

2017 Djibouti Declaration on Regional Refugee Education, seven education ministers from eastern Africa committed to the inclusion of education for refugees and returnees into sector plans by 2020. Uganda has already fulfilled the promise.

Education for the internally displaced is vulnerable to intractable conflicts. Colombia, with the world's second-largest internally displaced population, suffers the continued operation of armed groups. Yet, for the past 15 years, it has taken measures to ensure displaced children are treated preferentially in terms of access to education.

Internal migration is also challenging inclusion in education. Rural migrant workers constitute 21% of the Chinese population following the largest wave of internal migration in recent history. Residence permit restrictions introduced in an attempt to control the flows led the majority of migrant children in cities including Beijing to attend unauthorized migrant schools of lower quality. Since 2006, the government has progressively revised the system, requiring local authorities to provide education to migrant children, abolishing public school fees for them and decoupling registered residence from access to education for migrants. In India, the 2009 Right to Education Act legally obliged local authorities to admit migrant children, while national guidelines recommend flexible admission, seasonal hostels, transport support, mobile education volunteers and improved coordination between states and districts.

MAJOR BARRIERS TO EDUCATION FOR IMMIGRANTS AND REFUGEES PERSIST

Immigrants may be nominally included but practically excluded. They may be kept in preparatory classes too long, for instance. In Austria's Styria state, children above age 15 not deemed ready for secondary school are not entitled to attend and, after assessment, are transferred to special courses. Some countries separate students with lower academic ability, often those with immigrant backgrounds, into less demanding tracks, which compromises subsequent opportunities. Moroccan and Turkish second-generation immigrant students in Amsterdam were five times as likely as natives to enter lower secondary vocational tracks at age 12. Tracking starts as young as age 10 in Germany. In addition, immigrants tend to be concentrated in specific neighbourhoods and in schools with lower academic

standards and performance levels, which negatively affects their education achievement. Segregation is exacerbated when native students move to wealthier neighbourhoods or their families evade policies to maintain a diverse student body.

Barriers to immigrant education may persist despite efforts towards inclusion. In South Africa, education legislation guarantees the right to education for all children irrespective of migration or legal status, but immigration legislation prevents undocumented migrants from enrolling. School gatekeepers may insist on complete documentation, believing the law requires it, as with Central Asian immigrants in the Russian Federation. In the United States, anti-immigration raids led to surges in dropout among children of undocumented immigrants wary of deportation, whereas an earlier policy providing deportation protection had increased secondary school completion.

Immigrant children may advance relative to peers in home countries but lag behind peers in host countries. In the United States, children of immigrants from eight Latin American and Caribbean countries had 1.4 more years of education, on average, than those who had not emigrated. Yet their attainment and achievement often lagged behind those of host country peers. In the European Union, twice as many foreign-born youth as natives left school early in 2017. In 2015, in Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development countries, first-generation immigrants were 32% less likely and second-generation immigrants 15% less likely than natives to attain basic proficiency in reading, mathematics and science. The point in the life cycle at which people ponder or undertake migration is a key determinant of their education investment, interruption, experience and outcomes. In the United States, 40% of Mexican immigrants who arrived at age 7 did not complete secondary school, compared with 70% of those who arrived at age 14.

Asylum-seeking children and youth are detained in many countries, often with limited or no access to education, including in Australia, Indonesia, Malaysia, Mexico, Nauru and Thailand. In Hungary, asylum-seeking families with children, and unaccompanied children above age 14, stay in one of two transit zones without access to education, except that provided by civil society organizations (CSOs), while their applications are processed.

The degree and evolution of refugee inclusion in national education vary across displacement contexts, affected by geography, history, resources and capacity. Concentration of refugees in remote camps, as in Kenya, may result in only partial inclusion and geographical separation. Resources can be a key constraint: Lebanon and Jordan, with the most refugees per capita, have adopted double-shift education, producing temporal separation. In several contexts, refugees continue to be educated in separate, non-formal community-based or private schools, the largest recent displacement of Rohingya fleeing Myanmar for Bangladesh being a prominent case. Such schools may be initiated and supported by international organizations or refugees and local communities themselves, and may or may not be certified. In Pakistan, the primary net enrolment rate of Afghan refugee girls was half that of boys and less than half the primary attendance rate for girls in Afghanistan.

Refugee education remains underfunded. Although the two main databases are inconclusive, this report estimates that US\$800 million was spent on refugee education in 2016, split roughly equally between humanitarian and development aid. That is only about one-third of the most recently estimated funding gap. If the international community employed humanitarian aid only, the share to education would have to increase tenfold to meet refugees' education needs.

Improving refugee education funding requires bridging humanitarian and development aid in line with commitments in the New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants. Implementation of the Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework since 2016 to operationalize these commitments in 15 countries is generating useful lessons, although the withdrawal of the United Republic of Tanzania has drawn attention to improvements still required. The Education Cannot Wait fund for emergencies, and its potential to mobilize new, predictable, multiyear funds, should support closer cooperation between humanitarian and development actors and the inclusion of refugees in national education systems.

EDUCATION IMPROVEMENTS CAN HELP MIGRANTS AND REFUGEES FULLY REALIZE THEIR POTENTIAL

Curricula and textbooks often include outdated depictions of migration and displacement, despite broad public support for change in some contexts: 81% of

respondents in EU countries agreed school materials should cover ethnic diversity. By not addressing diversity in education, countries ignore its power to promote social inclusion and cohesion. A global analysis showed that social science textbook coverage of conflict prevention and resolution – e.g. discussion of domestic or international trials, truth commissions and economic reparations – was low at around 10% of texts in 2000–2011.

Teachers affected by migration and displacement are inadequately prepared to carry out the more complex tasks this entails, such as managing multilingual classrooms and helping children needing psychosocial support. In six European countries, half of teachers felt there was insufficient support to manage diversity in the classroom; in the Syrian Arab Republic, 73% of teachers surveyed had no training on providing children with psychosocial support. Teacher recruitment and management policies often react too slowly to emerging needs. Germany needs an additional 42,000 teachers and educators, Turkey needs 80,000 teachers and Uganda needs 7,000 primary teachers to teach all current refugees.

Schools with high immigrant and refugee populations need targeted resources to support struggling learners. Only a handful of high income countries explicitly consider migration status in school budgets. Other dimensions of disadvantage, including the neighbourhood deprivation and limited language proficiency often associated with these students, typically trigger higher per-student funding in schools with higher concentrations.

Adult migrant and refugee education needs are often neglected. Non-formal education programmes can be critical for strengthening a sense of belonging, and much rests on municipal initiatives. Literacy skills support social and intercultural communication and physical, social and economic well-being, but significant barriers limit access to and success in adult language programmes in some countries. A 2016 survey of asylum-seekers in Germany showed that 34% were literate in a Latin script, 51% were literate in another script and 15% were illiterate. Yet the latter were the least likely to attend a literacy or language course.

Financial literacy can protect migrants and help households make the most of remittances. Remittances increased education spending by over 35% in 18 countries in Africa and Asia and by over 50% in Latin America.

Reducing transaction costs to 3%, from the current global average of 7.1%, could provide an additional US\$1 billion for education every year.

Recognition of qualifications and prior learning can ease entry into labour markets, especially concerning professional qualifications. If migrants and refugees lack access to employment that uses their skills, they are unlikely to develop them further. However, less than one-quarter of global migrants are covered by a bilateral qualifications recognition agreement. Existing mechanisms are often fragmented or too complex to meet immigrants' and refugees' needs and end up underutilized. Countries also must harmonize tertiary education standards and quality assurance mechanisms to recognize academic qualifications at the bilateral, regional or global level. Adopting the Global Convention on the Recognition of Higher Education Qualifications, expected in 2019, will be key.

The two new compacts on migrants and refugees recognize education's role and set objectives aligned with the global commitment to leave no one behind. This report makes seven **recommendations** that support implementation of the compacts:

- Protect the right to education of migrants and displaced people
- Include migrants and displaced people in national education systems
- Understand and plan for the education needs of migrants and displaced people
- Represent migration and displacement histories in education accurately to challenge prejudices
- Prepare teachers of migrants and refugees to address diversity and hardship
- Harness the potential of migrants and displaced people
- Support education needs of migrants and displaced people in humanitarian and development aid.

THE INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY IS HONING ITS SDG 4 MONITORING TOOLS

SDG 4 not only sets an ambitious education agenda but also poses the challenge of monitoring targets that include multiple learning outcomes, inequality dimensions and curricular content. While some criticize the monitoring framework as too ambitious, its key role is to be formative, drawing countries' attention to core issues absent before 2015. It should trigger investment in robust national monitoring mechanisms of education equity, inclusion and quality. Several initiatives by countries, CSOs and multilateral institutions ensure the education sector is well placed to report at the first formal review of SDG 4 at the 2019 High-Level Political Forum. The following are a few highlights based on the most recent available data.

■ TARGET 4.1:

Primary and secondary education. Completion rates in 2013–2017, which can serve as a baseline for the SDG period, were 85% for primary, 73% for lower secondary and 49% for upper secondary education. This report proposes a new method to synthesize completion rate estimates from multiple sources. Progress has been made towards defining minimum proficiency in reading and mathematics. Regardless of the form this definition takes, results from selected middle income countries taking part in the Progress in International Reading Literacy Study in 2001–2016 show that progress will be slow. While the percentage of grade 4 students who met the low benchmark in 2015 varied from 22% in South Africa to 86% in Georgia, the average progress has been about one percentage point per year.

■ TARGET 4.2:

Early childhood. In 2017, about 70% of children participated in organized learning one year before the official primary school entry age. While consensus on a common measure of early childhood development may prove hard to reach, it is important for countries to invest in strong national systems for monitoring cognitive, linguistic, physical and social-emotional development.

- **TARGET 4.3:**
Technical, vocational, tertiary and adult education.
The tertiary gross enrolment ratio reached 38% in 2017. There is growing consensus on ensuring that the global indicator captures all adult education opportunities, work or non-work related, formal or non-formal.
- **TARGET 4.4:**
Skills for work. Only a handful of upper middle income countries report on information and communications technology skills, but the available data indicate just one in three adults employs elementary skills, such as copying and pasting or attaching files to emails.
- **TARGET 4.5:**
Equity. In many low and middle income countries, rural students have half the chance – and often much less – of completing upper secondary school, compared with urban peers. Estimates may need to be reassessed in view of new definitions of urban areas being developed by the international community.
- **TARGET 4.6:**
Literacy and numeracy. The latest global literacy rate estimate, 86%, indicates 750 million adults are illiterate. There are almost 40% more illiterates aged 65 and above than illiterate youth. In relative terms, the elderly are more likely to be isolated illiterates, living in households with no literate members, in richer than in poorer countries.
- **TARGET 4.7:**
Sustainable development and global citizenship. Between the fifth and sixth consultations on the 1974 UNESCO Recommendation, the percentage of countries adopting its principles in student assessment rose from just under 50% to almost 85%. Yet only 21% of countries reported that teaching hours dedicated to the principles were 'fully sufficient'.
- **TARGET 4.a:**
Education facilities and learning environments. In 2016, two-thirds of schools had basic drinking water, two-thirds had basic sanitation and half had basic hygiene services. In 2013–2017, there were over 12,700 attacks on education, harming over 21,000 students and education personnel.
- **TARGET 4.b:**
Scholarships. The volume of scholarships funded by aid programmes has been stagnant since 2010 at US\$1.2 billion. In 2017, there were 5.1 million mobile students, corresponding to an estimated outbound mobility ratio of 2.3%, up from 2% in 2012.
- **TARGET 4.c:**
Teachers. Using national definitions, 85% of primary school teachers globally were trained in 2017, a decline of 1.5 percentage points since 2013. The rate is lowest in sub-Saharan Africa, where the pupil/trained teacher ratio is 60:1.
- **EDUCATION IN THE OTHER SDGs:**
Decent work, cities, police and justice. Education affects other SDGs, notably through professional capacity development. Lack of trained social workers, urban planners, law enforcement officers, judges and other legal professionals jeopardizes progress towards the respective goals and targets.
- **FINANCE:**
An estimated US\$4.7 trillion is spent on education worldwide annually: US\$3 trillion (65%) in high income countries and US\$22 billion (0.5%) in low income countries. Governments account for 79% of total spending and households for 20%. Aid to education, despite reaching a high in 2016, accounts for 12% of total education spending in low income countries and 2% in lower middle income countries.

© UNESCO, 2018
First edition
Published in 2018 by the United Nations
Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
7, Place de Fontenoy, 75352 Paris 07 SP, France

Infographic by Housatonic Design Network
Graphic design by FHI 360
Layout by FHI 360
Typeset by UNESCO

This publication is available in Open Access under the Attribution-ShareAlike 3.0 IGO (CC-BY-SA3.0 IGO) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/igo/>). By using the content of this publication, the users accept to be bound by the terms of use of the UNESCO Open Access Repository.

The present license applies exclusively to the text content of the publication. For the use of any material not clearly identified as belonging to UNESCO, prior permission shall be requested from: publication.copyright@unesco.org.

This executive summary and all related materials are available for download here: <http://bit.ly/2019gemreport>