Working Group 1:
Indicator Development

Terms of Reference

Background

1. With the adoption of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) at the UN General Assembly in September 2015 and the Education 2030 Framework for Action (FFA) at the UNESCO General Conference in November 2015, greater attention has turned to the processes which aim to set out an appropriate plan for monitoring progress towards the targets associated with SDG 4 on education. At the level of global monitoring, the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on the Sustainable Development Goal Indicators (IAEG-SDGs) developed a global indicator framework which was agreed by the UN Statistical Commission in March 2016. A slightly refined version was agreed in March 2017 and formally adopted by the UN General Assembly in July 2017. At the level of sectoral thematic monitoring, the Technical Advisory Group on post-2015 education indicators (TAG), established by UNESCO, set out a proposal for 43 thematic indicators that was included in the Education 2030 Framework for Action.

2. In this context and to lead the development and implementation of the thematic indicators for education, the UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS) and the UNESCO Education Sector's Division of Education 2030 Support and Coordination (UNESCO ED/ESC) convened the Technical Cooperation Group on the SDG 4-Education 2030 Indicators (TCG) in May 2016. The TCG provides a platform to discuss and develop the indicators used for monitoring the Education 2030 targets in an open, inclusive and transparent manner, involving the main stakeholders. It will make recommendations on the necessary actions to improve data availability, as well as the design and development of methodologies for the production of thematic monitoring indicators. Additionally, it should guide the production of technical documentation needed for clear communication of the thematic indicators to monitor SDG 4 - Education 2030. It includes experts from 28 Member States, international partners (OECD, UNESCO, UNICEF and the World Bank), civil society (Education International and the Collective Consultation of NGOs), and the Co-Chair of the education 2030 Steering Committee representing Member States.

3. The proposed 43 thematic indicators on education are at different levels of methodological development and have varying degrees of availability. While some of the indicators have a solid methodology and data are available for the majority of countries, others require further methodological development and/or increased data availability.

4. To facilitate the implementation of the thematic indicators for education, during the first TCG meeting (Washington, D.C, in May 2016) the creation of working groups was proposed to diagnose implementation difficulties of specific indicators and to provide recommendations. Ultimately, the working group on indicator development is expected to deliver recommendations to the whole TCG group regarding indicators that require further resources to develop or strengthen methodologies and to suggest suitable data collection approaches.

5. Based on the results of the Open Consultation of TCG Thematic Education Indicators (launched in August, 2016) and the discussion during the second TCG meeting (Madrid, Spain, in October 2016), the TCG meeting participants agreed on a list of 29 thematic education indicators to be reported in 2017. They also identified 22 indicators, including seven related to learning outcomes, that need further review and development. The list of indicators is presented in Annex I. The TCG Working Group on Indicator Development will be responsible for making recommendations on the 15 indicators that are not related to learning outcomes and on other areas identified for further development. The seven learning outcomes indicators will be developed further by Task Forces of the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning (GAML).

Objectives and tasks

6. The objectives of the Working Group on Indicator Development are to (a) diagnose implementation difficulties of specific indicators; and (b) produce a report with a recommended work plan for methodology development and/or data collection approaches to the implementation of each indicator or group of indicators under consideration. If appropriate, the Working Group may also conduct a public consultation on its proposed work plan for indicator development to seek feedback from other experts and data users including countries, civil society, regional and international organizations. The Working Group will report on the progress of its work at future meetings of the TCG.

Membership

7. The Working Group is expected to consist of six to eight members, including three or four member countries of the TCG, two or three representative from civil society or multilateral partner agencies that are members of the TCG, and representatives from the UIS. Regional and organizational diversity is desirable.

8. The countries that are not presently members of the TCG but are members of the SDG-Education 2030 Steering Committee can be invited to join the Working Group.

9. The Working Group will be chaired by a member country elected by the members of the Working Group.

Roles and responsibilities of members

10. The roles and responsibilities of the Working Group members include:
    a. Commit sufficient time and effort to achieve the tasks described in the terms of reference and additional tasks proposed by the Working Group and by the TCG
    b. Contribute towards successful communication and positive motivation among the Working Group members
    c. Link, harmonise, and coordinate with other TCG Working Groups to improve outcomes and efficiency

11. The Chair the Working Group and the UIS representative(s) are responsible for meeting agendas and for supplying any necessary background information needed for discussion and decision making. The Chair can request support from the TCG Secretariat – the UIS.

12. As secretariat, UIS will ensure communication and coordination between this Working Group and the others. The representative of the UIS in the Working Group can assist in communicating with and disseminating notes to other TCG Working Groups and the TCG.

Governance

13. The Working Group will work under the auspices of the TCG and work closely with the designated UIS representative(s). The Working Group will report regularly to the whole TCG.

Organization of the work

14. The Working Group may work via electronic exchanges (e.g., emails, conference calls, UNESTEAM--a UIS maintained online workspace). The group should conduct its work in an open, inclusive, transparent and coordinated manner. The group may invite or consult other experts, as appropriate, to contribute their expertise and experience on the different areas covered in the indicators.

Annex I: Summary of the indicators agreed by the TCG for monitoring in 2017 and the indicators that need further development

**In the table, dark grey shading indicates global indicators, whereas red font indicates modifications to original list of 43 thematic indicators

Primary and secondary education	Target 4.1 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Learning	4.1.1	Proportion of children and young people (a) in Grade 2 or 3; (b) at the end of primary education; and (c) at the end of lower secondary education achieving at least a minimum proficiency level in (i) reading and (ii) mathematics, by sex	YES	YES
	4.1.2	Administration of a nationally-representative learning assessment (a) in Grade 2 or 3; (b) at the end of primary education; and (c) at the end of lower secondary education	YES	
Completion	4.1.3	Gross intake ratio to the last grade (primary education, lower secondary education)	YES	
	4.1.4	Completion rate (primary education, lower secondary education, upper secondary education)	YES	
Participation	4.1.5	Out-of-school rate (primary education, lower secondary education, upper secondary education)	YES	
	4.1.6	Percentage of children over-age for grade (primary education, lower secondary education)	YES	
Provision	4.1.7	Number of years of (a) free and (b) compulsory primary and secondary education guaranteed in legal frameworks	YES	
Early Childhood	**Target 4.2 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education**		**For monitoring in 2017**	**Requires further development**
Readiness for primary school	4.2.1	Proportion of children under 5 years of age who are developmentally on track in health, learning and psychosocial well-being, by sex	YES	YES
Participation	4.2.2	Participation rate in organized learning (one year before the official primary entry age), by sex	YES	
Readiness for primary school	4.2.3	Percentage of children under 5 years experiencing positive and stimulating home learning environments	NO	YES
Participation	4.2.4	Gross **early childhood education enrolment ratio in (a) pre-primary education and (b) and early childhood educational development**	YES	
Provision	4.2.5	Number of years of (a) free and (b) compulsory pre-primary education guaranteed in legal frameworks	YES	

TVET and Higher Education	Target 4.3 By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Participation	4.3.1	Participation rate of youth and adults in formal and non-formal education and training in the previous 12 months, by sex	YES	YES
	4.3.2	Gross enrolment ratio for tertiary education **by sex**	YES	
	4.3.3	Participation rate in technical-vocational programmes (15- to 24-year-olds) **by sex**	YES	
	Additional areas for development	**Affordability, quality**	not applicable	YES
Skills for work	**Target 4.4 By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship**		**For monitoring in 2017**	**Requires further development**
Skills	4.4.1	Proportion of youth and adults with information and communications technology (ICT) skills, by type of skill	YES	YES
	4.4.2	Percentage of youth/adults who have achieved at least a minimum level of proficiency in digital literacy skills	NO	YES
	4.4.3	Youth/adult educational attainment rates by age group, economic activity status, levels of education and programme orientation	YES	YES to simplify
	Additional areas for development	**Measures of a broader range of work-related skills than ICTs, other employment-related indicators**	not applicable	YES

Equity	Target 4.5 By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Policy	4.5.1	Parity indices (female/male, rural/urban, bottom/top wealth quintile and others such as disability status, indigenous peoples and conflict-affected, as data become available) for all education indicators on this list that can be disaggregated	YES	
	4.5.2	Percentage of students in primary education whose first or home language is the language of instruction	NO	YES
	4.5.3	Extent to which explicit formula-based policies reallocate education resources to disadvantaged populations	NO	YES
	4.5.4	Education expenditure per student by level of education and source of funding	YES	
	4.5.5	Percentage of total aid to education allocated to ~~low income~~ **least developed** countries	YES	
Literacy and Numeracy	**Target 4.6 By 2030, ensure that all youth and aa substantial proportion of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy**		**For monitoring in 2017**	**Requires further development**
Skills	4.6.1	**Proportion** of population in a given age group achieving at least a fixed level of proficiency in functional (a) literacy and (b) numeracy skills, by sex	YES	YES
	4.6.2	Youth/adult literacy rate	YES	
Participation	4.6.3	Participation rate of illiterate youth/adults in literacy programmes	NO	YES

Global Citizenship	**Target 4.7 By 2030, ensure all learners acquire knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including among others through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship, and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development**		**For monitoring in 2017**	**Requires further development**
Provision	4.7.1	Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in: (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment	YES	YES
	4.7.2	Percentage of schools that provide life skills-based HIV and sexuality education	NO	YES
	4.7.3	Extent to which the framework on the World Programme on Human Rights Education is implemented nationally (as per the UNGA Resolution 59/113)	NO	YES
Knowledge	4.7.4	Percentage of students by age group (or education level) showing adequate understanding of issues relating to global citizenship and sustainability	NO	YES
	4.7.5	Percentage of 15-year-old students showing proficiency in knowledge of environmental science and geoscience	NO	YES
	Additional areas for development	**Attitudes and values, life-long learning/non-formal, qualitative indicators**	not applicable	YES
School Environment	**Target 4.a Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all**		**For monitoring in 2017**	**Requires further development**
Resources	4.a.1	Proportion of schools with access to: (a) electricity; (b) Internet for pedagogical purposes; and (c) computers for pedagogical purposes	YES	
		Proportion of schools with access to: (d) adapted infrastructure and materials for students with disabilities		YES
		Proportion of schools with access to: (e) basic drinking water; (f) single-sex basic sanitation facilities; and (g) basic handwashing facilities (as per the WASH indicator definitions)		

Environment	4.a.2	Percentage of students experiencing bullying, corporal punishment, harassment, violence, sexual discrimination and abuse	NO	YES
	4.a.3	Number of attacks on students, personnel and institutions	NO	YES
	Additional areas for development	**Expenditure, national quality standards**	not applicable	YES
Scholarships	**Target 4.b By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training, information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes in developed countries and other developing countries**		**For monitoring in 2017**	**Requires further development**
Numbers	4.b.1	Volume of official development assistance flows for scholarships by sector and type of study	YES	
	4.b.2	Number of higher education scholarships awarded by beneficiary country	NO	YES
	Additional areas for development	**Support for marginalised students**	not applicable	YES
Teachers	**Target 4.c By 2030, substantially increase the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing States**		**For monitoring in 2017**	**Requires further development**
Trained	4.c.1	Proportion of teachers in: (a) pre-primary education; (b) primary education; (c) lower secondary education; and (d) upper secondary education who have received at least the minimum organized teacher training (e.g., pedagogical training) pre-service or in-service required for teaching at the relevant level in a given country, by sex	YES	
	4.c.2	Pupil-trained teacher ratio by education level	YES	
Qualified	4.c.3	Percentage of teachers qualified according to national standards by education level and type of institution	YES	
	4.c.4	Pupil-qualified teacher ratio by education level	YES	
Motivated	4.c.5	Average teacher salary relative to other professions requiring a comparable level of qualification	NO	YES
	4.c.6	Teacher attrition rate by education level	YES	
Supported	4.c.7	Percentage of teachers who received in-service training in the last 12 months by type of training	NO	YES