

# Final Report

## UNEVOC Networking and Capacity Building in Technical and Vocational Education and Training and Education for Sustainable Development in the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS)

*Ufa, Republic of Bashkortostan (Russian Federation)*

*June 29 – July 1, 2011*



# Contents

Acronyms.....	5
Executive Summary.....	6
1. Introduction .....	8
1.1. Background .....	8
1.2. UNESCO- UNEVOC strategy and actions in TVET and ESD.....	8
Participants.....	9
1.3. Objectives of the meeting and expected outcomes.....	9
Expected outcomes: .....	10
1.4 Preparatory work .....	10
1.5. Programme.....	10
2. Plenary session presentations and discussion.....	12
Welcoming addresses.....	12
2.1. Plenary session 1. TVET Development in CIS .....	14
Keynote presentations .....	15
2.1.1. Minister Alfys Gayazov, Minister of Education of Republic of Bashkortostan “Development of the TVET system in the Republic of Bashkortostan: problems, solutions, challenges:” .....	15
2.1.2. Mr. Umarov, Programme Specialist in Education, UNESCO Moscow Cluster Office for Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, the Republic of Moldova and the Russian Federation: “CIS countries cooperation in implementation of the UNESCO Strategy on TVET Development” .....	15
2.1.3. Ms. Olga Oleynikova, Director of the Center for Vocational Education and Training Studies and of the National UNEVOC Center (Russia): “Tendencies of Technical and Vocational Education and Training Development in the CIS Countries” .....	16
2.1.4. Summary of the Plenary Session.....	17
2.2. Plenary session 2. Keynote Presentation on TVET: ESD, ICTs use and rural education.....	19
2.2.1 Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, Head, UNESCO-UNEVOC International Center (Germany): “Role of UNESCO-UNEVOC in Global Networking” .....	19
2.2.2. Prof. Khoroshilov, National Programme Officer, Capacity Development Team Leader, UNESCO IITE (Russian Federation): “Use of ICT in TVET: problems, challenges and lessons learnt” .....	20

2.2.3. Dr. Wang Li, Deputy Director, INRULED (China) “Rural Education and TVET: increased employment opportunities for marginalized groups” . . . . .	20
2.2.4. Mr. Harry Stolte, Head of Division, GIZ (Germany): “ International cooperation in TVET and UNEVOC – GIZ Perspective. Green TVET and ESD” . . . . .	21
2.2.5. Summary of the Plenary session . . . . .	22
2.3. Plenary session 3 . . . . .	24
Country Presentations . . . . .	24
2.3.1 . Mr. Aram Avagyan, Global Developments Fund, UNESCO-UNEVOC Centre in Armenia “Recent TVET Developments in Armenia and the Role of National UNEVOC Centre” . . . . .	24
2.3.2 Mr. Elchin Gasanov, Head of Unit, Center for Vocational Education Development, Ministry of Education of Azerbaijan, and Mr. Emil Bakhshiyev, Teacher Institute, UNEVOC Center (candidate): “TVET Development in Azerbaijan and the role of the UNEVOC Center” . . . . .	25
2.3.3. Mr. Arkady Shklyar, Rector of the Republican Institute for Vocational Education (RIPO), UNEVOC Center: “TVET Development in Belarus and the role of the UNEVOC Center: follow up to the International Conference on TVET and ESD in Minsk 2009” . . . . .	26
2.3.4 Ms. Gulzhana Teshebaeva, Forum for Educational Initiatives, UNEVOC Center TVET: “Development in Kyrgyzstan and the role of the UNEVOC Center” . . . . .	27
2.3.5 Mr. Vasilachi Octavian, Head of Secondary and Post Secondary Vocational Education Department, Ministry of Education of the Republic of Moldova and Ms. Violeta Mija, Director of Republican Center for Vocational Education Development, UNEVOC Center (candidate): “TVET Development in the Republic of Moldova and the role of the UNEVOC Center” . . . . .	28
2.3.6 Mr. Tamara Pushkaryova, Institute of Innovation Technologies and Content, Ministry of Education of Ukraine, UNEVOC Center (candidate): “TVET Development in Ukraine and the role of the UNEVOC Center” . . . . .	29
2.3.7 Mr. Khikmatulla Rashidov, Rector, Institute for Training and Retraining of Personnel of Secondary Specialized and Vocational Education System, UNEVOC Center and Mr. Uktamjon Khudayberdiev, Head of the Academic Lyceums Department of the TVET Centre of Uzbekistan, UNEVOC Center “TVET Development in Uzbekistan and the role of the UNEVOC Center” . . . . .	30
2.3.8. Summary of the Plenary Session: major topics covered . . . . .	30
2.4. Plenary session 4. TVET Development in the Russian Federation . . . . .	32
2.4.1 Mr. V. Demin, President of the Union of VET Principals, Director of Krasnogorsk State College: “TVET Development in Russia: legislation, trends, challenges and future scenarios” . . . . .	32
2.4.2. Ms. Ludmila Nugumanova, Deputy minister of Education and Science of Republic of Tatarstan (RF): “TVET Development in the Republic of Tatarstan” . . . . .	33

2.4.3. Mr. Nikolay Babanov, Vice Minister of Education, Nizhny Novgorod Region: “Regional TVET Development in the Russian Federation” .....	33
2.4.4. Ms. Svetlana Chistyakova, Academician-Secretary, Vocational Education Department, Russian Academy of Education: “Scientific research in the field of continuing vocational education in the Russian Academy of Education” .....	34
2.4.5. Ms. Tatiana Sizova, Director, Moscow State Research Institute for the Development of Vocational Education: “Multilevel TVET – innovative practices in vocational education and training of qualified workers in the megacity setting”	34
2.4.6. Ms. Tatiana Lomakina, Director of "Continuing Education" Department, International Center of Educational Systems, UNEVOC Center (Russian Federation): “The role of the UNEVOC Center: Networking and cooperation on the level of the Russian Federation regions” .....	35
2.4.7. Summary of the plenary session: major topics covered.....	36
2.5. Working Group Sessions .....	37
Presentations.....	37
2.6. Conclusions of the working group sessions: issues and recommendations.....	45
Working Groups 1 and 2. TVET in CIS and Ukraine: a) The role of the UNEVOC Network and of the CIS regional Network in the TVET development in CIS, b) TVET Policy review.....	45
Working Group 3. TVET Development and ICT .....	46
2.6. Conclusions .....	48
2.6.1 Outcomes reached and fulfillment of objectives .....	48
2.6.2. Resolution .....	49
Annex .....	52

## ***Acronyms***

**CIS:** Commonwealth of Independent States

**EFA:** education for all

**EU:** European Union

**ICT:** Information and Communication Technologies

**IVET:** initial vocational education and training

**SVET:** secondary vocational education and training

**LLL:** lifelong learning

**NQF:** national qualifications framework

**SME:** small and medium-sized enterprise

**TVET:** technical and vocation education and training

**UNDESD:** United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development

**UNESCO:** United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

**UNESCO-UNEVOC:** UNESCO International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training

**UNECE:** United Nations Economic Commission for Europe

**VET:** vocational education and training

## Executive Summary

The sub-regional meeting devoted to the networking and capacity building in technical and vocational education and training and education for sustainable development in the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) was organized jointly by the Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan, the RF Commission for UNESCO, the UNESCO ICT Institute (Moscow, RF), UNESCO International Center for TVET (UNESCO-UNEVOC) in Bonn, the German Cooperation Agency (GIZ), the Intergovernmental Foundation for Humanitarian Cooperation of the CIS States, Bashkir Institute for Social Technologies (BIST) and the Committee of the Republic of Bashkortostan for UNESCO, the UNESCO Moscow Cluster Office (Russian Federation). It took place in the capital of the Republic of Bashkortostan (Russian Federation) on June 29 – July 1, 2011. The meeting brought together over 53 TVET representatives from ministries of education, NGOs in TVET, national UNEVOC centers, TVET institutions, from such CIS countries as Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Moldova, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Russia, and from Ukraine. The meeting focused on the trends and key aspects of TVET development and modernization in the context of enhanced interaction, sharing and mutual learning in the field of TVET across the CIS and Ukraine under the framework of the network of UNEVOC Centers. The use of CVT in TVET was discussed as a separate issue, given its high modernisation potential.

The participants also finalized the issues relating to the preparation of the TVET Policy national Stock-taking reports they have been involved in developing.

The meeting ended with adopting a Resolution that reflects the participants' common vision of the key issues of TVET and ESD development and maps the agenda for the future.





# 1. Introduction

## 1.1. Background

The sub-regional meeting devoted to the networking and capacity building in technical and vocational education and training and education for sustainable development in the Commonwealth of Independent States and Ukraine as a follow-up of the Bonn meeting in September 2010. During the 2010 meeting the performance of the UNEVOC Network in CIS in relation to ESD and TVET were reviewed; demands and areas of innovation in TVET and ESD in CIS were identified; and the role of the UNEVOC Network in fulfilling the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (UNDESD) with reference to TVET and ESD were discussed. Through the presentations of 14 case studies the discussions were set around three thematic areas: strategies to strengthen performance and effectiveness of the UNEVOC Network in CIS; demands and areas of innovation in TVET and ESD in CIS; networking and dissemination of best practices in CIS. More specifically, the discussions focused on: how to respond to a sustainable labour market through TVET; how to increase ESD understanding and involvement of TVET stakeholders; and how to regionalize the UNEVOC Network and coordinate the integration of ESD into TVET. Among other challenges, building an individual and institutional capacity for the national UNEVOC Centres remains the main priority for the UNEVOC Centres in CIS. A set of recommendations was thus proposed to revamp the UNEVOC Network in CIS through the creation of a CIS Regional UNEVOC Network and to strengthen UNEVOC National Centres' contributions to tackle these issues and challenges.

Both the previous and the given meeting were built on the policies and decisions adopted by the World Conference on ESD (Bonn, 2009) and by the XV CIS Ministers of Education Conference (Minsk, 2009). Thus, the focus of the UFA meeting was to seek ways to enhance interaction between the national UNEVOC centers, and specifically those in the CIS and Ukraine, to ensure their sustainable networking, sharing and exchanges in the interest of capacity-building and effective development in line with the UNESCO TVET Strategy and international trends with regard to TVET development.

## 1.2. UNESCO- UNEVOC approaches and actions in TVET and ESD

The UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre emphasizes TVET for sustainable development through its programme activities and publications and as part of the [United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development \(DESD\)](http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=27234&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html) [↗](http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=27234&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html) ([http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL\\_ID=27234&URL\\_DO=DO\\_TOPIC&URL\\_SECTION=201.html](http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=27234&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html)).

TVET affects attitudes towards sustainability held by future workers. The changing nature of the world of work, especially due to globalisation and technological change, demands that TVET develop a skilled, committed and motivated workforce that understands how global changes impact upon local opportunities for business and



industry and how these changes impact upon the quality of local social, economic and environmental conditions.

The greater the exposure of trainees to sustainability concepts, practices and examples, the more likely the desired workplace culture change will take place in the future. The delivery of sustainability practices must happen in pre-service TVET as well as on-the-job and in worker upgrading and retraining. Continuing TVET will continue to predominate in the future, in order to accommodate both technological and job change.

TVET is a consumer and producer of resources and therefore has many different concerns about sustainability. The over-exploitation of natural resources, ill-health and grinding poverty threatens the ability of future generations to satisfy their needs and wants. TVET needs to re-orient its curricula to imbue students and trainees with the conservation and sustainable use of resources, social equity and appropriate development, as well as with competencies to practice sustainable tasks at the workplace. It was one of the main themes examined at the UNESCO international experts meeting [Learning for Work, Citizenship and Sustainability](#), Bonn, October 2004 and subsequent regional and international meetings that focus on the various aspects of TVET and ESD.

### **Participants**

The meeting was attended by over 70 people representing ministries of education of CIS countries, the Russian Academy of Education, the Russian Union of TVET Principals, International UNESCO-UNEVOC Center (Germany), the UNESCO INRULED (China), GIZ (Germany), national UNESCO-UNEVOC centers from CIS, the UNESCO Institute (Moscow), TVET education institutions. The participants came from such countries, as, Azerbaijan, Armenia, Belarus, China, Germany, Kyrgyzstan, Moldova, Russia, Tajikistan, and Ukraine (See Annex 1 for full list).

### ***1.3. Objectives of the meeting and expected outcomes***

The sub-regional meeting aimed to enhance the networking and capacity building in technical and vocational education and training and in education for sustainable development in the Commonwealth of Independent States and Ukraine by means of the activities of the national UNEVOC centers.

The objectives of the meeting were manifold.

The first cluster of objectives aimed to provide a forum for exchange and sharing to

- identify common ground and critical issues and challenges to address in the future networking of the UNEVOC Centers in CIS and Ukraine, for the sake of
- enhanced capacity in TVET modernization and to this end
- to formulate roles of UNEVOC Centers in CIS and Ukraine and
- a clear strategy for their networking,

The second cluster of objectives dealt with the use of ICT in TVET and sharing of practices in this area.

The third cluster of objectives dealt with the finalization of issues relating to the preparation of the national TVET policy stocktaking reports.

**Expected outcomes:**

- vision of the future development of the network of UNEVOC centers in CIS and Ukraine formulated and agreed on
- issues for future networking identified, based on the sharing during the meeting
- mutual trust and dialogue between international, CIS and Ukrainian partners enhanced and strengthened
- TVET modernization issues specified on the national level for the participating countries, with a focus on the use of ICT in TVET
- contribution made to further TVET internationalization and to building international TVET discourse
- clear understanding of the national TVET policy stocktaking reports structure, content and methodology ensured

### ***1.4 Preparatory work***

CIS and Ukrainian participants brought with them presentations reflecting key TVET modernization issues and achievements in their countries with a special emphasis on the use of ICT in TVET. International participants prepared materials reflecting the international and UNESCO perspectives. The programme of the meeting was developed in agreement with all the participants, to reflect multiple interests and perspectives.

### ***1.5. Programme***

The programme of the meeting offered ample opportunities for participants to present, reflect, discuss and share. The plenaries envisaged space for questions and answers. Working groups 1 and 2 were meant to offer opportunities for in-depth exchanges and reflection on the future of the Network of CIS UNESCO-UNEVOC Centers, and for the finalization of the structure and content of the national TVET policy stocktaking reports developed by Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Moldova and Russia. Working group 3 was aimed as a platform for the discussion of issues relating to the use of ICT in TVET.

Discussions in both groups yielded concrete proposals that made up the content of the Resolution of the meeting.



## 2. Plenary session presentations and discussion

### Welcoming addresses



The meeting was honored by the welcoming address from the President Khamitov of the Republic of Bashkortostan that was presented by the Deputy Prime Minister of Bashkortostan **Ms. Rakhmatulina**. The Presidential address stressed the important role of UNEVOC for the education community and the long history of the Republic's cooperation with UNESCO in the framework of cultural, education and ecological projects. The growing role of TVET in the overall development of education was also emphasized, as well as its role in the innovative development and modernisation of the economy.

The President emphasized the importance of the new UNESCO strategy to promote TVET and supported the idea of creating a regional UNEVOC network in the CIS countries that will considerably contribute to the development of the national TVET systems and address the needs of sectors in qualified personnel.

The situation in the TVET in Bashkortostan was presented by the Minister of Education **Mr. Alfic Gayazov**. The TVET programs in technical occupations of the secondary VET level are implemented at universities (50%), and secondary VET institutions. Initial VET programs are implemented in 93 vocational lyceums. Like the other RF regions, Bashkortostan is concerned with putting in place effective mechanisms of labor market anticipation and with the optimization of the network of VET institutions. Other critical issues comprise the development of TVET cooperation with businesses, improved governance and management of TVET institutions, attraction of investments in TVET, improvement of quality assurance mechanisms, to mention but some. In addressing these goals the cluster/sector approach has been introduced to enhance TVET – labor



market cooperation. To the same end, multilevel VET institutions have been established. Currently, the Republican government is giving special attention to the development of the agro-industrial sector, and the President of the Republic has issued a Decree "On Measures of State Support to the Development of Human Capital in the Agro-industrial Sector of the Republic of Bashkortostan".

The welcoming address of Mr. Ordzhonikidze, Secretary of RF Committee for UNESCO, presented on his behalf by **Mr. Mahklakov**, member of Coordinating Committee of UNESCO Chairs in RF, carried high appreciation of the initiative of the organizers of the given meeting and stressed the role and relevance of TVET in the building of

the knowledge-based economy and in ensuring effective transition of the youth from education to the labour market, as well as the role TVET for the well-being of the population.

It was also emphasized that in the current situation new TVET standards must be set that would address the environmental protection issues. It was stressed that today the supply of the work force fails to address the labour market needs, and there is a growing overproduction of university graduates, which is a destabilizing factor (e.g. training of workers in chemical, food, textile, footwear industries has dramatically fallen, in some sectors, like metallurgy - by 2.5 times). Hence, today it is of primary importance to put in place an effective system of labour market anticipation, and to enhance effectiveness of activities relating to finding jobs for graduates from education institutions, including systemic tracer studies, enhanced cooperation between education institutions, enterprises and employment services. Parallel to the improved policies and practices on the level of education institutions, the policy of the state is to change and improve to

ensure that employment of the population becomes a key priority for the state.



On behalf of Mr. Dendev, Director of UNESCO Bureau in Moscow and Director of the UNESCO ICT Institute, the welcoming address was presented by **Mr. Umarov**, Education Program Officer of the Moscow UNESCO Cluster Office. The welcoming address carried words of gratitude and appreciation directed to the organizers of the meetings. It also

stressed the meeting's contribution to the preparation of the UNESCO International Congress planned for early 2012 in Beijing, and to the further development of TVET cooperation across the CIS in line with the UNESCO goals and strategies for TVET and ESD. The address welcomed the establishment of new national UNEVOC centers in Azerbaijan, Moldova and in Russia.

On behalf of the Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies the participants were welcomed by its Director, **Ms. Nigmatullina** who stressed the value of ICT for education and training and specifically for the implementation of the UNESCO's motto "Education for All". The Institute of Social Technologies sees its goal as a contribution to the modernization of the socio-cultural education in the Republic of Bashkortostan. This contribution takes the form of various projects, including international ones.



The participants were also greeted by **Mr. Stolte** (GIZ) who wished the participants fruitful work and success and stressed the importance of working together in the globalized world.

## ***Opening Remark by Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, Head of the UNESCO- UNEVOC International Center***

Recalling the past series of meetings with the UNEVOC National Centres which have been organised jointly by UNESCO - UNEVOC International Centre and the UNESCO Moscow Cluster Office, the most notable ones held in Moscow in 2004; in Baku in 2006; in Minsk in 2009 and in Bonn in 2010, Mr. Shyamal Majumdar thanks organizers for relazing the meeting in UFA which provides an opportunity for the National UNEVOC Centres in the CIS member countries to enhance better cooperation and enable information exchange in the field of TVET for mutual benefit . Mr. Shyamal Majumdar further encourages CIS UNEVOC Centres' involvement and commitment in regional cooperation and networking and mobilize non- CIS UNEVOC Centres into further collaboration. He invited the participants to take part in the meeting effectively to fulfill the meeting's aims and objectives.



## **2.1. Plenary session 1. TVET Development in CIS**

### **Keynote presentations**

#### **2.1.1. Minister Alfys Gayazov, Minister of Education of Republic of Bashkortostan “Development of the TVET system in the Republic of Bashkortostan: problems, solutions, challenges:”**



The presentation focused on the challenges to TVET in the context of the goals of innovative development of the Republic.

The regional system of education is made up of 225 TVET institutions, with the student cohorts amounting to 280,000 people. Technical occupations are implemented at 36 secondary VET schools, 93 initial VET schools and lyceums.

One of the major challenges is to balance the supply and demand of skills. As of now, the labour market needs 80% qualified workers and 20% specialists, while the TVET system turns out 27% workers and 13% middle level specialists, and - incidentally – 60% higher education graduates. To remedy the situation the monitoring of the skills demand is undertaken in conjunction with the Republican Ministry of Economics, and the LM anticipation up to the period 2020 has been prepared.

TVET is developing under the Concept of TVET Development and the Activity Plan approved by the Regional Government. One of central objectives is the optimization of the network of education institutions by integrating them in clusters and by levels of delivered curricula. To improve governance in TVET education institutions form associations.

Due to the concerted efforts of the stakeholders, the production of graduates in such occupations as geology, natural resources exploration, energy sector, energy machine-building, electrical technology, aviation and space technology, electronics, chemistry and biotechnologies, construction and architecture has increased.

Considerable impetus to the TVET system was given by the National Education Project that envisaged supplementing state grants by local funds, or funds provided by enterprises. Such scheme was conducive to further fostering social partnership both on the institutional and policy levels.

The achievements in social partnership result in extending opportunities of work placements for TVET students at enterprises. An example of best practice is social partnership in the agricultural sector.

Currently a system of certification of qualifications is developed by the Chamber of Trade and Commerce. Among other priority issues are CVT development and enhancement of attractiveness of TVET.

#### **2.1.2. Mr. Umarov, Programme Specialist in Education, UNESCO Moscow Cluster Office for Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, the Republic of Moldova and the Russian**

## **Federation: “CIS countries cooperation in implementation of the UNESCO Strategy on TVET Development”**

In his presentation Mr. Umarov spoke about the new UNESCO Strategy for TVET that focuses on new objectives as compared to the previous period during which the key issues were education for all, literacy, etc. The new period features such priorities as analysis of TVET systems in CIS countries, development of strategic concepts, establishment of a reliable data collection system to ensure reliable bench-marking internationally.

Another development vector is strengthening the UNEVOC Centers, building on their existing potential and targeting development towards thematic issues and capacity building.

### **2.1.3. Ms. Olga Oleynikova, Director of the Center for Vocational Education and Training Studies and of the National UNEVOC Center (Russia): “Tendencies of Technical and Vocational Education and Training Development in the CIS Countries”.**



The presentation carried an overview of tendencies of development of technical and vocational education and training placed in the context of key conceptual issues relating to the role of education in contemporary society.

The contemporary situation is characterized by the accelerated pace of changing and updating knowledge and technologies which requires that people should be ready for continuous development and learning.

All of these factors to a varying extent impact the systems of technical and vocational education and training on the national, regional and cross-regional level and they characterize the TVET landscape in the CIS countries that had a common past, but for the recent two decades have been actively exploring and forming national models adequate to their country contexts.

Apart from the global impact factors, other factors are at play in the CIS countries, such as factors of the transition period, including the development of the market economy and of the democratic society. Also, each country has a national specificity that reflects the national context that, in its turn, is characterized by differences in the pace of economic development. Among other impact factors is the international cooperation in the field of TVET in the form of diverse external donor aid programs.

Cooperation within the CIS in the field of education is progressing. The start to this cooperation was given by the Multilateral Cooperation Agreement in the Field of Education signed in Tashkent (Uzbekistan) in 1992. On January 17, 1997 the CIS countries adopted the Concept of Forming the Common Education Space that would be characterized by common principles of the public policy in education, by compatible national education standards and programs (curricula), requirements to the in-service



training and certification of researchers and teachers, by equal opportunities and by a free implementation of the rights of citizens to acquire education at any education establishment on the territory of CIS member-states.

In the CIS Strategy of Economic Development for 2009 – 2011, a prominent place is given to such areas as research and science, innovations and education. In the sphere of education cooperation is viewed from the perspective of integration processes that include building a common education space, as well as conditions for academic and labor mobility and for recognition of diplomas and degrees.

As of today, all CIS countries have formed national TVET systems that are in accord with the international education development tendencies, with up-to-date requirements of innovation-based society and with the national goals and objectives. In all countries TVET is recognized as an objective need for citizens in a situation of shrinking sectors of the low qualified labor markets.

#### **2.1.4. Summary of the Plenary Session**

The Plenary was devoted to the presentation of the overview of TVET development in the CIS countries. The situation in TVET in Bashkortostan was introduced by the Minister of Education of the Republic Mr. Gayazov, who also outlined the major achievements ( strengthened links with employers, introduction of new curricula, institutionalization of the system of certification of qualifications, optimization of the network of TVET institutions), development vectors conditioned by the important role attached to education by the government of the Republic, and problems that are largely common to all countries participating in the meeting.

Mr. Umarov from the Moscow UNESCO Cluster office stressed the key provisions of the new UNESCO Strategy for TVET, such as the analysis of TVET systems in CIS countries; development of a common understanding of key concepts, and establishment of a system of collection of information to ensure international bench-marking. Another goal is to strengthen UNEVOC Centers.

Director of Center for VET Studies Olga Oleynikova spoke about cooperation in the field of TVET in CIS countries, the regulatory documents adopted in CIS, the development prospects that would be in line with the UNESCO goals and strategies.





## **2.2. Plenary session 2. Keynote Presentation on TVET: ESD, ICTs use and rural education**

### **2.2.1 Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, Head, UNESCO-UNEVOC International Center (Germany): “Role of UNESCO-UNEVOC in Global Networking: ESD and TVET Development”**



In his speech Mr. Majumdar deliberated on the activities and goals of the UNESCO-UNEVOC that contribute to the overarching UNESCO goals in TVET. These goals aim at assisting member states in improving and integrating TVET in the global Education for All Campaign, and also to foster education for sustainable development.

Mr. Majumdar explained the work of UNESCO-UNEVOC which is the hub of a world-wide network, consists of 282 specialised TVET institutions - the UNEVOC Centres - in 167 UNESCO Member States. He further stressed that the UNEVOC Network of specialised technical and vocational education and training institutions is the most prominent network of the UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre and has been created to share knowledge and expertise about innovative and best practices worldwide. In accordance with the UNESCO Strategy for TVET, UNESCO strengthens its assistance to the Member States through UNESCO Regional Networks and the UNEVOC Network worldwide in order to facilitate regional cooperation as well as bilateral and trilateral institutional cooperation between national education ministries, including South-South, South-North and South-South-North cooperation, as a means of maximizing impact. Through the UNEVOC Network, UNESCO-UNEVOC intends to maximise its contribution to achieve high-quality, relevant, lifelong and cost-effective TVET for all, enhance its role as a resource centre and increase its responsibility in the implementation of the UNESCO Strategy for TVET.

Mr. Majumdar stressed the role of UNESCO-UNEVOC aiming to support Member States and key stakeholders in addressing global sustainability challenges through education in the context of the UNESCO Strategy for the Second Half of the United Nations (UN) Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (DESD). In line with the strategy for UNDESD, the speaker further highlights that efforts must now be redoubled, in particular as regards the mobilization of resources, formulation of national policies, promotion of ESD in non-formal and informal education, enhancement of national and international networks and partnerships, and advocacy.

In the context of the above, the Network of UNEVOC Centers in the CIS countries occupies a prominent position and has shown graphically its efficiency and capacity for growth. He concludes that CIS Network is a unique platform for supporting TVET through promoting UNESCO normative instruments and standards, best and innovative practices in TVET; sharing knowledge and mobilizing expertise and resources; and intensifying partnerships with other relevant agencies and partners.

### **2.2.2. Prof. Khoroshilov, National Programme Officer, Capacity Development Team Leader, UNESCO IITE (Russian Federation): “Use of ICT in TVET: problems, challenges and lessons learnt”**

The presenter stressed that fostering ICT in TVET is in line with the goals of building the information society that is a facet of the knowledge society. It is also in line with the UNESCO philosophy of the work without borders. He also emphasized that UNESCO is working towards making quality education a reality for all human beings perspective of their ages. To this end TVET is to become part of the continuing education and training paradigm that will contribute to the well-being of the people and offer them opportunities to acquire ICT skills that are an inherent in the culture of the information society. TVET should also take advantage of ICT to enhance the efficiency of learning, with a focus on providing learning opportunities to people with special needs, to the disadvantaged and problem groups.



The speaker stressed that the responsibility for TVET should be shared by the governments, employers, occupational associations, local communities and NGOs. He also made a special point of the need to enhance quality of teachers in TVET.

In the context of the above, the Moscow UNESCO Institute for Information Technologies in Education is planning for 2011-2013 to further contribute to the implementation of the UNESCO goals and policies. To this end, policy meetings, development and publishing of conceptual documents, events to share experiences in the use of ICT for learning purposes and comparative studies are envisaged.

The Institute sees its central role in the development of ICT competence standards for teachers and educators, with a focus on key, or generic competences in line with UNESCO activities in this sphere. Also special attention is given to developing e-learning programs and resources for people with special needs.

Currently, the Institute is implementing a project “Promoting the Use of ICT in TVET in the CIS Countries and Ukraine” that will result in recommendations for TVET players in the field of using ICT in TVET viewed from the ESD perspective and enhanced inter-regional cooperation and networking. The project is also expected to yield an answer to the question: What is the TVET school in the knowledge-based society supposed to look like?

### **2.2.3. Dr. Wang Li, Deputy Director, INRULED (China) “Rural Education and TVET: increased employment opportunities for marginalized groups”.**

The presentation addressed the issue of skills development in rural communities in developing countries in the contexts characterized by urbanization, man-made disasters, unemployment and economic adjustment shocks. All of the above contextual factors



result in rural areas in poverty and hunger, education backwardness and increasing marginalization.

The speaker considered two possible solutions of this situation: positive and negative. The negative ones may be doing away with urbanization and industrialization; confining rural people to rural areas and promotion of mythical autarky or self-sufficiency of rural communities. While the positive ones mean enhancing people's capacities through skills and quality education and empowering them by equipping and upgrading their skills.

According to the INRULED experience, that the speaker presented, there are three factors that contribute to the positive scenario, namely an innovative strategy for developing skills, training and education for poverty alleviation; experimental approaches to learning and functional literacy programs. In practical terms it means facilitation of the development of a comprehensive national policy on skills development for the youth and adults in rural areas; strengthening mechanisms for economic and livelihood skills development of rural people in developing countries; improvement of planning, management and administrative capacities of personnel for rural transformation; and further studies in the Asia-Pacific and Sub-Saharan African regions in skills development programs. It also means preparation of technical guides and training manuals for introducing the diverse life, livelihood and vocational skills, and equipment for the development of ecological and environment-related skills; developing teaching and learning materials for the youth and adults in rural areas; organization of capacity-building and training workshops.

The expected outputs from these measures may include formulation of a medium-term skills development policy; strengthened links between skills development programs and adult literacy programs at the community level.

The expected impact is an improved knowledge base and quality of life of the youth and adults. Hence, the direct beneficiaries of the proposed policies embrace out-of-school youth, adult illiterates, basic education planners, project managers, practitioners, teachers, headmasters, NGO partners. The indirect ones - key policy decision makers, trainers, representatives of NGOs and community leaders.

#### **2.2.4. Mr. Harry Stolte, Head of Division, GIZ (Germany): “ International cooperation in TVET and UNEVOC – GIZ Perspective. Green TVET and ESD”.**

The speaker placed the issues under consideration in the context of complex global trends the implications of which yielded new priorities in the areas of education & training for the German International Development Cooperation, such as a New Education Strategy; extended financial resources in 2011; extended cooperation in all education areas (primary and secondary education, TVET & higher education).



The main focus currently is on consultancy and capacity development with a view to improving structures, processes and financing models in and for education systems, with TVET a main area within the new Education Strategy in the International Development Cooperation. The main targets and approaches here embrace positioning of existing German expertise, e.g. in

environmental technologies; involvement of German industry; initiating new “modes of delivery” such as “trilateral” cooperation schemes (North-South-South), co-financing, delegated cooperation; stronger international networking, exchange and cooperation.

The expected areas of action, thus, comprise education / TVET for sustainable development, education & training for migrants for their integration in the labour markets; non-formal training/inclusive training; dual and/or co-operative training; dual education & training in post-secondary/tertiary education (BA); private - public partnerships; decentralization in education (systems); improvement of education & training for teachers and management staff; support of international Networks for Knowledge Transfer; combining education & training with labour market orientation, active labour market policies, etc.

In the above context the green TVET is an overarching perspective. To illustrate his point the author presented an overview of history of green economy initiatives and their implications for ESD. After that the GIS learning platforms was presented. The GIS electronic learning platform is a cross-departmental professional forum established in 05/2010 and structured as a specific intranet storage system located in the document management system (DMS). The goals of the platform include the development of an implementation-oriented consulting strategy and of a coherent, cross-departmental service offer on Green Economy/Green Growth with a view of strengthening skills, developing expertise, enhancing service offer, generating qualified and coherent consulting.

Implementation levels in TVET embrace integration of ESD in all training regulations; setting the main focus in relevant occupations; provision of additional qualifications on the advanced training level. Organization-wise it may result in developing ESD TVET-Schools / Training Centres, a Global TVET-Academy for Sustainable Development (a proposed joint initiative/project by InWEnt – UNESCO-UNEVOC).

### **2.2.5. Summary of the Plenary session**

In his speech Mr. Majumdar presented a global perspective focusing on the activities and goals of the UNESCO-UNEVOC that contribute to the overarching UNESCO goals in TVET that aim at assisting member states in improving and integrating TVET in the global Education for All Campaign, and also to foster education for sustainable development.

Prof. Khoroshilov spoke about the importance of fostering ICT in TVET to build the knowledge society. He also emphasized UNESCO's efforts to make quality education a reality for all individuals irrespective of their ages.

Dr. Wang Li addressed the issue of skills development in rural communities in developing countries in the contexts characterized by urbanization, man-made disasters, unemployment and economic adjustment shocks, and brought to the attention of the audience alternative development scenarios..

Mr. Harry Stolte, placed the issues of international cooperation in TVET in the context of complex global trends the implications of which result in new priorities in education and training for the German International Development Cooperation.

## **2.3. Plenary session 3**

### **Country Presentations**

The keynote presentations were followed by presentations on the TVET development of the CIS countries and Ukraine.

#### **2.3.1. Mr. Aram Avagyan, Global Developments Fund, UNESCO-UNEVOC Centre in Armenia “Recent TVET Developments in Armenia and the Role of National UNEVOC Centre”**



The speaker presented an overview of the recent developments in TVET in Armenia. The presentation started by the introduction of the structure of the TVET system in Armenia that comprises initial (craftsmanship) vocational education that trains qualified workers/craftsmen at 28 vocational schools and 15 colleges; secondary vocational education that trains mid-level managers, with a qualification of “specialist”, at 79 public and 21 private colleges and at 5 universities. Of late, non-formal education has shown signs of growth, even though its graduates are not awarded a certificate that is recognized by the state, which indicates a growing perception of the value of education by the population. The official statistics is lacking for non-formal education, however according to expert estimates, the network of non-formal education comprises over 200 providers

training about a couple dozen thousand trainees.

Recent positive developments in TVET comprise the introduction of competency-based curricula, establishment of 13 sectoral committees (involving employers) to review the draft TVET standards; development of about 80 qualification standards based on learning outcomes complete with modules, teaching, learning and assessment materials; training of over 200 VET college principals and their deputies and of over 2,000 teachers in the methodology of competency-based teaching and learning; publishing of around 40 textbooks and manuals for the new curricula; and a National Database of the new qualification standards.

Another strand of achievements relates to TVET governance and management. Namely, the National Council for VET Development, a tripartite body with an equal representation of the government, employers and trade unions, was established in 2009. On the institutional level since 2009 college boards have been introduced at all VET colleges (2009); 12 multifunctional regional VET Centres (1 per region and 2 in Yerevan) have been opened.

On top of that, two TVET support structures have been set up – the National Centre for VET Development (2008) and the National Training Foundation (to be enacted by the end of 2011).



Special attention is given in the country to enhancing quality in TVET. To this end the National Qualification Framework has been adopted by the Government; the National Centre for Quality Assurance in VET has been established (2009); internal systems of quality assessment are being set up at VET colleges.

The presenter devoted part of this presentation to the he National UNESCO-UNEVOC Center stressing that it plays a tangible role in the process of TVET modernization by: providing policy advice to the MoES and other stakeholders; making available international expertise and information on modern TVET developments and good practices; providing support in establishing links and cooperation with different partners within the country and abroad and in the development of legal documents, etc.

However there is potential for enhancing the role of the UNEVOC Center, namely by strengthening their visibility; enhancing information and experience exchange among national UNEVOC Centres and other structures; as well as within the network of CIS centers and beyond to ensure peer learning.

**2.3.2 Mr. Elchin Gasanov, Head of Unit, Center for Vocational Education Development, Ministry of Education of Azerbaijan, and Mr. Emil Bakhshiyev, Teacher Institute, UNEVOC Center (candidate): “TVET Development in Azerbaijan and the role of the UNEVOC Center”**



The speaker stressed that the stable political situation in the country has contributed to the steady economic growth and to the successful development of education. Education is considered a priority of the country’s Strategy of Sustainable Development. The education budget has grown 5 times since 2003.

The network of TVET institutions embraces 108 TVET institutions offering programs in 110 occupations. An important role in TVET development is given to the introduction of ICT in TVET (under the Strategy of ICT Development, the National Program “Electronic Azerbaijan”, the State program for Introduction of ICT in the System of Education for 2008-2012). The Ministry of Education has set up an integrated electronic data base of TVET teachers and students, an a web-site of the State Program for Development of TVET. 44 TVET institutions are connected to the Internet. Distance learning is widely fostered. PCs are provided to children from disadvantages families.

TVET development is carried out under the State Program of TVET Development adopted in 2007. To enhance TVET links with the labour market a National Coordinating Council has been established to address TVET issues.

TVET development is widely supported by international donors. For example, by the EC Program “Strategy of reforming TVET in Azerbaijan and its pilot implementation in one

region” for 2008-2011. Other donors include the British Council, UNESCO, Korean companies, the German Government, the Knauf Construction Company, etc.

The country is successfully implementing the Program “Education for the Future” aimed at upskilling teachers.

Despite the visible and tangible achievements, the presenter emphasized that the country faces a number of problems, including the outdated material and technical base of TVET institutions, a shortage of teacher skills, overproduction of university graduates and their unemployment, low prestige of TVET, lack of jobs for TVET graduates, insufficient links with the labour market, outdated mechanisms of financing TVET schools. The problems are enhanced by the forced migrants who are often housed in school premises and hostels. These problems shape the agenda for the future.

### **2.3.3. Mr. Arkady Shklyar, Rector of the Republican Institute for Vocational Education (RIPO), UNEVOC Center: “TVET Development in Belarus and the role of the UNEVOC Center: follow up to the International Conference on TVET and ESD in Minsk 2009”**



In his presentation Mr. Shklyar focused on key issues of TVET development in Belarus and on the role of the national UNEVOC Center. TVET development is implemented in the context of the sustainable development perspective and as integral part of the economic, employment and human resources development policies. The development objectives include enhancing quality of TVET and increased returns from

investments in human resources. To this end it is envisaged to ensure balance between the demand and supply of skills.

Currently there are 104 occupations of training in the vocational-technical sector that result in the award of 425 qualifications. In the secondary specialized education training is delivered in 162 occupations that lead to the award of 162 qualifications.

The key areas of TVET development embrace: a wider range of provided services, updating the list of occupations of training, improved methods of teaching, sustainable mechanisms of TVET – labour market interaction, professional upskilling of teachers and administrators in TVET.

The new innovations-oriented strategy adopted in Belarus requires new skills, including those for SMEs and external economic activities. To address the new challenges the Republican Institute for Vocational Education sees its role as a link between the education and labour market stakeholders. In the period of 1998-2010 the Institute carried out 74 projects in the field of TVET development (including development of the TVET strategy, methodological support packages for adult education, organisation of teaching and learning at TVET institutions, upskilling of teachers and administrators, to

mention but a few). The Institute also participated in the development of the Education Code, and of legislation on vocational-technical and higher education and on education for people with special needs.

In Belarus, special attention is given to education for target groups with special needs which is regarded an inherent part of the national social policy. To this end centers of vocational and social rehabilitation and mainstreaming groups are established. In-house provision of education for learners with special needs is also common practice.

An important development vector is adult education that includes upskilling, re-training and training of the employed and unemployed population.

In all segments of TVET ICT are introduced and TVET institutions are united in the Profnet Information Network.

#### **2.3.4 Ms. Gulzhana Teshebaeva, Forum for Educational Initiatives, UNEVOC Center TVET: “Development in Kyrgyzstan and the role of the UNEVOC Center”**

The TVET system in Kyrgyzstan embraces 180 institutions (60,000 students) employing 5,000 teachers and instructors of practical training. Curricula embrace 160 occupations of training. The number of adult learners increases annually (compared to 2004, in 2010 adult cohorts have grown 3 times).

The TVET system is made up of initial and secondary VET. Initial VET is under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Labor, Employment and Migration, while secondary VET is affiliated to the Ministry of Education.

About 88.4% of IVET schools graduates are employed upon graduation. In the IVET sector special attention is given to the disadvantaged target groups (the disabled, orphans, etc.) for whom 20 specialized centers have been opened.

IVET has witnessed considerable modernisation, including transition to competence-based standards, establishments of mechanisms of TVET-labour market cooperation and modernization of the information support system, etc.

However, there are many challenges and problems that have to be addressed, including the low quality of provided services; limited involvement of enterprises in TVET; a rigid system of financing; ineffective governance and management system in TVET.

In the above context the priorities identified for the future embrace improving the legal framework, updating the material base in TVET and the content of training of teachers and instructors for TVET; improvement of quality of TVET by introducing effective methods aimed at sustainable development, as well as of vocational orientation and extended involvement of initial VET schools in training adults.

TVET modernization is closely linked to international cooperation. Currently 10 international projects in TVET are implemented with support from such donors as GIZ, ETF, ILO (to mention only some). In 2011 a large-scale 2-year EU project is launched.

The UNESCO UNEVOC Center is an active player in the TVET reform. It is operating under the aegis of the “Forum of Education Initiatives” and is a catalyst of modernization

processes as a platform for national, regional and international interaction of TVET stakeholders. The mission of the UNEVOC Center is to promote sustainable development and poverty reduction in Kyrgyzstan by supporting vocational education development and by strengthening dialogue between key stakeholders on the national, regional and international level.

The UNEVOC Center is working in such areas as quality assurance, social partnerships, lifelong learning, youth employability and human resources development. Thanks to the support from the UNESCO Cluster Office in 2010, a project to update the legal framework for TVET was implemented. Apart from that over 23 projects were implemented, including 12 international ones.

### **2.3.5 Mr. Vasilachi Octavian, Head of Secondary and Post Secondary Vocational Education Department, Ministry of Education of the Republic of Moldova and Ms. Violeta Mija, Director of Republican Center for Vocational Education Development, UNEVOC Center (candidate): “TVET Development in the Republic of Moldova and the role of the UNEVOC Center”**

The presentation began with an overview of the TVET system, that was followed by the analysis of the current situation and problem setting.



TVET development in Moldova is regulated by the Labor Code (2005), the Law “On Education” (1995), the National Strategy “Education for All”, the Concept of secondary vocational education development, the Program of stabilization and revival of economy in the Republic of Moldova for 2009-2011, the National Development Strategy for 2008 – 2011, the National Employment Strategy for 2007 – 2015.

The annual demand for the work force in 2011 – 2015 is estimated at the level of over 2,000 people with secondary specialized education; and about 800 people with secondary vocational education.

Achievements to date include: the updated Education Code that now includes proposals for the modernization of secondary vocational education; establishment of the National Council for Occupational Standards and Certification of Qualifications; establishment of the Republican Center for Vocational Education Development and two sector committees (in the agrarian and construction sectors); the development of the format and methodology for occupational standards; development of pilot occupational standards in a number of sectors; on-going optimization of the network of TVET institutions. The Concept of Reforming the System of Secondary Vocational Education is under development.

The achievements are offset by problems and challenges that embrace a low prestige of TVET, shortage of qualified workers and specialists on the labor market, high level of

unemployment among graduates from secondary vocational institutions, a low level of employment of graduates of secondary vocational education, inadequate upskilling of TVET teachers and instructors, lack of a legal framework to regulate on-the-job/workplace learning; lack of sustainable non-formal education opportunities.

Given the above, the agenda for the future encompasses improvement of the TVET legal framework and of institutional mechanisms to foster social partnership; granting autonomy to secondary vocational institutions to promote quality of training qualified workers; modernization of the system of qualifications, development of modular programs based on competences.

For 2011-2012 it is envisaged to develop the national qualification framework and occupational standards, TVE standards and curricula for technical occupations and to institutionalize mechanisms for recognition of qualifications acquired via non-formal learning.

### **2.3.6 Mr. Tamara Pushkaryova, Institute of Innovation Technologies and Content, Ministry of Education of Ukraine, UNEVOC Center (candidate): “TVET Development in Ukraine and the role of the UNEVOC Center”**



According to the speaker, the current priorities in TVET in Ukraine aim to implement innovative technologies and projects. Together with the Confederation of Employers of Ukraine and with support from international experts a concept of the national system of qualifications has been developed.

Specifically for 2011 in the field of TVET such objectives are set as quality improvement, improvement of the financing system, updating the legal framework, enhancement of the prestige of TVET.

The field of TVET research an analysis of European practices in the field of NQFs and of mechanisms of their adaptation to the national context is envisaged. Other research areas embrace quality in TVET, development of competence-based standards and of innovative methods of teaching; decentralization processes in TVET governance; vocational orientation from the perspective of psychology and pedagogy.

The Institute represented by the speaker attaches great importance to international cooperation that is viewed as a catalyst of the national TVET modernization.

### **2.3.7 Mr. Khikmatulla Rashidov, Rector, Institute for Training and Retraining of Personnel of Secondary Specialized and Vocational Education System, UNEVOC Center and Mr. Uktamjon Khudayberdiev, Head of the Academic Lyceums Department of the TVET Centre of Uzbekistan, UNEVOC Center “TVET Development in Uzbekistan and the role of the UNEVOC Center”**



The presentation focused on the training of the work force in the system of secondary specialized vocational education in Uzbekistan. The overall number of secondary specialized vocational institutions in the country amounts to 1,536 (1,394 vocational colleges and 142 academic lyceums) that are united in a network. Training is delivered in 225 specialisms and 578 occupations. Teachers and instructors of

SSVIs are regularly upskilled, including abroad, due to developed international cooperation and extensive donor support.

The priority objectives for the future embrace full-fledged coverage by vocational education of general school leavers; improvement of the system of SSVE and of the quality of teaching. It is also planned to assign enterprises to colleges and to establish an “enterprise – college” links to ensure work placements and further employment opportunities for graduates.

In the recent years, there has been a growing demand for the work force in such occupational sectors, as oil and gas sector, mining, chemical, energy, machine-building, light and food industry, agro-industrial sector, construction, service sector, etc.

The meet the changing demand in graduates training in 34 occupations (education, economics, law, culture and arts) has stopped at 343 colleges, while at 576 colleges 133 new occupations of training have been introduced (e.g. in metallurgy, railroad maintenance, repair of TV and radio equipments, wood processing and furniture manufacture, road and bridges building, construction, etc.).

Beginning from 2011/2012 colleges are beginning to deliver multi-profile training instead of the mono-profile training.

To enhance quality of training the Classification of Occupations of Training has been updated jointly by the Ministry of Education, Ministries of Economy, Labor and Social Protection and other stakeholders. To the same end the upskilling of teachers and instructors is carried out at 46 universities and 68 vocational colleges, and Coordination Councils and Boards of Trustees are established at colleges.

### **2.3.8. Summary of the Plenary Session: major topics covered**

The major topics covered the achievements, problems and challenges for TVET in the countries participating in the meeting. It turned out that problems and challenges are

common to all participants from CIS and Ukraine and can be summarized as a need to enhance attractiveness of TVET, introduce effective mechanisms of labor market anticipation to ensure employment of TVET graduates and a balance of the demand and supply of skills; develop national qualifications frameworks and institutionalize mechanisms of recognition/certification of qualifications; to develop and implement lifelong learning strategies and to integrate the concept of sustainable development in all TVET curricula .

It was stressed by all presenters that UNEVOC has a huge potential to assist the countries in developing, reforming and modernizing their TVET systems. In this context the role of networking of UNEVOC national centers was emphasized.

## **2.4. Plenary session 4. TVET Development in the Russian Federation**

### **2.4.1 Mr. V. Demin, President of the Union of VET Principals, Director of Krasnogorsk State College: “TVET Development in Russia: legislation, trends, challenges and future scenarios”**



The speaker began his presentation by stressing the link between the quality of the work force and that of VET, after which he enumerated current challenges to VET in Russia, such as the diversification of the economy, the aging of the population, the growing competition on the labor market, and the competing VET segments. The situation is also characterized by a gap between the output of students from the VET system and needs of the labor market (supply by the SVET system – 13%, against the demand of 32%; supply by IVET – 18%, against the demand of 27%). The gap is conditioned by the low prestige of VET as against higher education.

According to the speaker, the only way out for VET in this situation is to radically enhance its attractiveness and quality.

Among other problems the speaker mentioned the inability of VET institutions to adequately respond to the negative demographic changes, the low pace of integration in the international VET dimension, and a lack in the country of a comprehensive program of VET modernization and a strategy of its development.

Currently the VET system is undergoing decentralization, with VET schools transferred to the regional jurisdiction. (49% - in secondary VET, 100% - in initial VET).

The positive developments of late include the close attention to the VET system of the President and the Prime-Minister of the country who, among other things, stress the need to put in place a system of medium-term labor market anticipation, enhance prestige of workers occupations, develop a national strategy for VET development, draft presidential program for upskilling VET teachers and administrators, develop national qualification framework, and occupational standards and enhance cooperation between VET and employers.

As of date, the major achievements in TVET in Russia include adoption of VET standards of the new generation based on competences that are developed with involvement of employers (over 295 IVET and 234 Secondary VET standards have been approved). To carry the modernization efforts further the infrastructure of IVET and SVET will be optimized, an independent system of quality assessment of qualifications will be put in place, regional VET development programs will be implemented and regional VET grant support will be provided to VET institutions via tenders of projects. Given the modernization goals, it is planned to increase the volume of training in nanotechnologies and other innovative sectors, as well as in IT and information



protection areas. Also special attention will be given to training migrants to a labor market relevant qualification.

#### **2.4.2. Ms. Ludmila Nugumanova, Deputy minister of Education and Science of Republic of Tatarstan (RF): “TVET Development in the Republic of Tatarstan”**



The speaker analyzed the situation and prospects of the development of TVET in the Republic offering numerous examples and samples of best practices. In the Republic of Tatarstan TVET is given priority attention and support by the Regional Government. TVET Institutes and institutions develop and pilot innovative TVET models (content of programs, methods of teaching and learning, development of competences and practical skills relevant for local enterprises and serving a solid foundation for further learning and career development).

#### **2.4.3. Mr. Nikolay Babanov, Vice Minister of Education, Nizhny Novgorod Region: “Regional TVET Development in the Russian Federation”**



The speaker stressed that TVET development in the region follows the trends of the economic development that envisage fostering research-intensive and high-tech sectors, ICT, nano and bio-technologies, and infrastructure development. Special attention is given in this context to human resources development.

The regional VET system embraces 25 initial VET schools and 84 secondary VET institutions (of which 52 are of regional affiliation, and 3 are private).

The key target for the regional VET is to train high quality work force, improve regulation of supply of skills for the labor market, and to make VET more sensitive to the needs of the innovative economy. To address these challenges a Coordination Council has been established by the regional Governor to manage human resources development; VET institutions are restructured to form a network of multilevel multiprofile institutions; and mechanisms of public-private partnership are put in place

in the format of partner councils, governing councils, coordination councils (on the level of VET schools), as well as of joint projects addressing the needs of enterprises.

Many VET institutions are adopting quality management systems to both national and international ISO 9000 standards.

#### **2.4.4. Ms. Svetlana Chistyakova, Academician-Secretary, Vocational Education Department, Russian Academy of Education: “Scientific research in the field of continuing vocational education in the Russian Academy of Education”**



The presentation bears a theoretical character and a theoretical view of the new education standards adopted in Russia. The speaker started the presentation with the definition of the concept of continuing training and related notions, and then deliberated on the importance of continuing education and training both for citizens and for the society at large, laying special emphasis on the concept of learning outcomes as a foundation of the new education standards that respond to the country’s development needs.

The speaker stressed that acquisition of competences is critical for individuals to effectively perform on the labor market (at least for a certain period of time until the labor market requirements change) and presented her classification of key competences.

#### **2.4.5. Ms. Tatiana Sizova, Director, Moscow State Research Institute for the Development of Vocational Education: “Multilevel TVET – innovative practices in vocational education and training of qualified workers in the megacity setting”**



The speaker presented certain key aspects of VET development in the Russian capital. Moscow VET, though in full agreement with the national VET policy and practices, shows certain differences that are a result of the unique position of Moscow as the city the size of a country. Moscow VET is built on the principle of continuity and aims at implementing innovative content to match the needs of the economy and social sphere. The innovative content results from the situation on the labour market, from the integration of content of initial and secondary VET and that of general and vocational education, from the occupational standards. This innovative content is implemented in the format of flexible programs that meet the needs of the diverse

end users who often require supplementary training programs that are in essence, CVT programs. The target groups for CVT comprise the retired military, pensioners, women, the unemployed population, the disabled, etc.

VET in Moscow is in the jurisdiction of the Moscow Department of Education that also has in its jurisdiction the Research Institute for VET Development, the Center for Quality, the Training and Methodological Center and 91 VET institutions including 13 teacher training and 78 profile colleges.

**2.4.6. Ms. Tatiana Lomakina, Director of "Continuing Education" Department, International Center of Educational Systems, UNEVOC Center (Russian Federation): "The role of the UNEVOC Center: Networking and cooperation on the level of the Russian Federation regions"**

According to the speaker, the contemporary context calls for new qualities of the human resources and for providing the work force with lifelong learning opportunities. The latter call for new content of programs, for broad access to education and training for all target groups of the population, for new skills of teachers, for diversified learning opportunities and up-to-date methods, to respond quickly to the new demands and needs in the economy and society.



The presenter stressed that vocational training in the globalized society should aim at becoming open to the world. Openness presupposes cooperation, that is at the heart of the work of the National UNESCO/UNEVOC Center in the Russian Federation, created in 1994 by the Secretary of UNESCO on the initiative of the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation and of the RF Commission for

UNESCO.

The National UNESCO/UNEVOC Center in the Russian Federation contributes to the development of pedagogical, cultural, scientific, technical and business cooperation between Russian, international and foreign organizations. It provides training and re-training to the professional staff and experts in Russia and abroad; organizes exhibitions, conferences, seminars and other activities on the national and international level, and implements projects and programs.

The Centers' experience shows that national education systems across the world are characterized by an accelerated pace of development, accompanied by global problems which can be solved only through cooperation within the international community; by enhanced competition; by decreasing demand for unqualified and low qualified work force; by deep structural changes in the sphere of the employment that require continuing upskilling and new opportunities for labor mobility; and by a growing recognition of the value of human capital.

The analysis of the re-structuring processes in the education networks in our country has shown a growing number of innovations and of the academic freedoms in TVET, both on the regional and institutional level. The on-going processes have served a basis for the new structure of the National UNESCO/UNEVOC Center in Russian Federation that was established in November, 2010. The central office of the Center is in Moscow, with regional branches opened in the Republic Tatarstan and in the Leningrad region.

The activity of the National UNESCO/UNEVOC Center in the Russian Federation aims at developing of a new activity concept comprising both educational/methodological and project work.

The National UNESCO/UNEVOC Center has prepared the first issue of the journal carrying most significant UNESCO materials on issues of vocational training, as well as examples of teaching practices from Russia and the countries of far and near abroad.

#### **2.4.7. Summary of the plenary session: major topics covered**

The Plenary session centered on the consideration and discussion of divers aspects of TVET development in the Russian Federation. The overall picture of TVET in Russia was presented by Mr. Demin, who spoke of TVET priorities and its contribution to the development of human capital in line with the targets of fostering innovations and of development of high-tech and research-intensive sectors in the country. Mr. Demin's presentation also highlighted the attention given to TVET by the country's leaders.

The points made by Prof. Demin were further exemplified with regional cases and practices in the presentations of the Deputy Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Tatarstan, of the Deputy Minister of Education of the Region of Nizhny Novgorod and of the Director of the Moscow State Institute for Education Development.

This Plenary was also devoted to the activities of the National UNEVOC Center in fostering TVET modernization and international cooperation and exchange and sharing both within the CIS and beyond it. These issues were highlighted in the presentation by Ms. Lomakina with a special emphasis on open education.

The presentation by Ms. Chystyakova featured the relevance of theoretical research for the developing of competences in the system of continuing vocational education and training.

## **2.5. Working Group Sessions**

### **Presentations**

**Ms. Dzhumakhonova Manuchekhra**, Head of Department of Information Systems for Education Management, Ministry of Education (Tajikistan) “Networking and capacity development of TVET and education for sustainable development in Tajikistan”

The speaker introduced the TVET system in Tajikistan and stressed both the achievements and problems. In Tajikistan secondary VET embraces 49 schools, and initial VET – 66 schools. TVET modernization objectives include establishment of new types of VET institutions, improvement of the TVET legal framework and introduction of ITs.

VET is regulated by such legal documents as the Law on Education (2004); the Law of Initial; VET (2003); the State Concept of Reforming the IVET System (2004); the Government Order “On approval of the National Action Plan to Reform IVET in Tajikistan for 2006 – 2015 (2006); State Standards for IVET and a List of Occupation of IVET Training (2010).

The modernization of IVET is performed with extensive support from international donors. Currently 4 projects are under way: “Support of VET in Tajikistan, phase 2” (DVV/EU); “Support of VET in Tajikistan” (GTZ), “Poverty reduction in Tajikistan by means of education and non-formal training (EU/DVV); “Regional teacher training network” (GTZ).

Due to the undertaken efforts, the demand for initial VET is growing; the legal framework for IVET has been updated; curricula have been updated and modular curricula are introduced; correspondence departments have been established at IVET schools to train workers; short-term courses for the adult population have been introduced in 56 occupations.

The agenda for the future envisages the development of on-the-job practical training of students; upskilling of teachers; updating of qualifications standards and adoption of the state program for computerization of the IVET schools.

**Ms. Tanzilya Nigmatullina**, Director, Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (BIST) “ICT and their role in the personality development”

In her presentation the speaker dwelt on the use of ICT in education and training and on the work in this area of Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies.

The presented laid special emphasis on the role of ICT in fostering active citizenship, social responsibility, value systems in the youth. Effective addressing these goals requires not only investments, but also qualified personnel capable of effectively using ICT in teaching and learning, and of developing e-learning materials. Also these goals can be better addressed under the cluster perspective. To this end, the Institute is contemplating opening a college that would provide grounding in all areas relevant for the future employment. The foundation for such college was laid in 2008 with the

opening of the CVT Resource Centre “Leader” that offers diversified programmes for general and high school children (pre-profile training and profile training aimed at fostering key competences and at personality development, opportunities to participate in thematic events and acquire hands-on on-the job experience at legal and financial companies, etc.), Following the establishment of the Resource Center another project was launched, namely the ‘Socio-cultural modernization of the education and ICT environment in the Republic of Bashkortostan’.

In line with the set goals, the Institute has created an effective e-environment both for students and teachers (data bases, e-textbooks and teaching materials, presentation, quality control tools, forums, etc.). The Institute is actively involved in delivering upskilling programs in ICT-based learning for regional teachers and methodologists. The web-sites of the Institute aim at fostering IT skills, on the one hand, and on the other – on promoting cultural and social development of the young generation ([www.ufabist.ru](http://www.ufabist.ru), [www.aksakov.info](http://www.aksakov.info)),([www.deti.ufabist.ru](http://www.deti.ufabist.ru)).

The agenda for the future envisages more sites for diversified target groups to involve not only the youth, but the adult population.



**Ms. Gordeeva Irina**, Head of Analytic Department, TVET Agency of the Ministry of Labour of Kyrgyz Republic: “Use of ICT in Kyrgyz Republic”

The speaker began by stressing the roles of ICT in contemporary society, and then introduced the legal framework for the use of ICT in education and training in Kyrgyzstan. This legal framework includes the Law on Informatization (1999), the Program for Development of ICT (2001), the State Activity Plan to Implement the Program for ICT Development (2002).

The state measures in fostering ICT are complemented by international projects in the field of ICT in education, such as, for example, the World Bank project under which 9 pilot centers were established, the project of the German Society for Technical

Cooperation “Regional Teacher Training”, the project of the Asian Development Bank “Vocational education and skills development” (training in ICT literacy for accountants and financial directors).

In 2010, the Ministry of Labor, Employment and Migration concluded and Mutual Understanding Memorandum with ECDL Foundation on the award of the computer driving license.

To implement the ICT policy, the public Internet Portal has been established housing data on services provided by the public administration bodies; all central government bodies have launched their web-sites; sector information systems are under development; an education register has been developed in the e-format, etc. In 2003 the Presidential Council for ICT adopted the program "Kyrgyz Vision 2007" to establish e-government, e-education, economics.

21 public access information centres have been established.

Output of ICT specialists has grown 6.4. times in the past 10 years (as against a 2.9. growth of university graduates at large). Training in ICT occupation is performed at 30 education establishments. New ICT occupations of training have been introduced (Web administrators, web-designers, data base administrator).

The government lays special stress on ensuring equal access to ICT resources for women and target groups with special needs. For example, to this end in 2009 end training in web-design for women was introduced at the Kyrgyz – Turkish Women Lyceum. Training in the occupation “PC operator” for children with hearing disabilities is provided in one TVET school.

Despite the undertaken efforts there remain many unresolved issues, such as a lack of comprehensive and systemic character of the adopted reforms, lack of computers at VET schools, inadequate control of the outcomes of the reforms, etc.

According to the presenter, to address the problems it is necessary to: develop a national program on the use of ICT in education and training; institute strict state control of the outcomes of the reforms and of international projects; provide extensive training opportunities in ICT skills.

**Ms. Malyukova Inna**, Director, Ukrainian Institute for Information Technologies in Education of National Technical University "Kyiv Polytechnic Institute", IITE Governing Board Member (Ukraine): “Enhancing the use of ICT in TVET in Ukraine”

The presentation highlighted the joint project of the Institute for Information Technologies in Education of the National Technical University and the UNESCO Institute in the field of ICT in education and training.

Use of ICT in TVET is a national priority in Ukraine. ICT is viewed as a means to enhance attractiveness of and to broaden access to TVET by introducing ODL and e-learning.

As of date, the student – PC ratio is 14.9. TVET schools largely use Windows and diverse Microsoft modifications, Microsoft Office, and for ODL – the Model based software.

91% of public TVET schools are connected to the Internet. 69% have web-sites.

11 electronic textbooks have been developed of late in such subjects as metallurgy, machine-building, construction, communications, agriculture.

To further modernize TVET, the teachers' ICT skills must be improved and appropriate opportunities for their upskilling provided. (25% of TVET principals, 60% of their deputies for academic affairs and 85% of deputies for methodological activities have PC user skills). Currently only 8 institutions have the right to deliver teacher upskilling programs.

The situation is aggravated by the fact that many TVET administrators lack a vision of the added value of the use of ICT in the teaching and learning process.

To remedy the situation the Ministry of Education has supported the Intel Program "Education for the Future", under which in 2004 -2010 over 10 thousand TVET teachers (65% of the overall number) were trained; and the Microsoft-funded programme "Partnership in Education" aimed at training TVET institutions personnel.

To further foster the use of ICT in TVET, appropriate investments must be provided, the introduction of ICT in education and training must acquire a systemic character, software must be developed for practical training in technical subjects. Also, the expertise and knowhow developed and tested in other countries must be made use of.

**Mr. Peshkov Sergey**, National UNEVOC Center in the Russian Federation, International Centre of Education Systems, President Emeritus of ICES: "Important role of UNEVOC in Education for Sustainable Development (ESD)"

In his presentation the speaker highlighted the activities of the International Center of Education Systems (ICES) undertaken in conjunction with other international organizations, such as UNESCO, the ILO, the Council of Europe, the European Training Foundation, and others. These activities focus on such issues as education standards, legal and economic support of TVET, TVET acute problems in the context of the transition to sustainable development, continuing ecological education and attitude development, CVT development, people and culture in contemporary society, etc.

According to the speaker, the future agenda in the context of ESD should focus not only on the problems of education, science and technology, but also some environmental, cultural and social issues that should be included in TVET programs, curricula, teaching materials and textbooks. The above requires joint efforts of various institutions to ensure integrated interdisciplinary training of professionals to make them capable of competent key decision-making with regard to the world experience.

The experience of various countries shows that it is not enough to implement one ESD component in the curriculum. Hence, there is an urgent need of strategic planning of sustainable development at the regional and interregional levels that would embrace education, technological, social, economic and environmental aspects. Post-graduate training should focus on instructing executives and legislators of all levels, as their lack of understanding of short-term, and especially, long-term goals and objectives of



sustainable development, and ways of dressing them is, according to the speaker, one of the main impediments to sustainable development.

The relevant ministries should coordinate all activities in the TVET and ESD fields. As a long-term goal, creation of a common European education space including the CIS countries is proposed.

Education for sustainable development must be accompanied by extensive information support aimed not only at professionals but also at the public at large. The Russian-language edition of the UNEVOC Bulletin could serve this purpose for the CIS countries. And the UNEVOC International and national centers, the UNESCO cluster offices, the UNESCO national commissions, ministries and departments should provide broader information about their activities, publish and distribute information about most significant developments in TVET and ESD.

**Potapenko Natalya**, Head of Center for Information Technologies, Republican Institute for Vocational Education (Belarus): “Enhancing the use of ICT in TVET in Belarus”

In Belarus, the introduction of ICT in TVET is regulated by a multitude of documents, such as the “Strategy of Developing Information Society in the Republic of Belarus for the period up to 2015”, “On measures to improve the use of the public segment of the Internet” (Presidential Decree); the Education Code of the Republic of Belarus (adopted in 2011).

The central goal is to develop up-to-date education technologies taking advantage of digital resources and of ICT and to provide access to them.

To date, 51 electronic teaching materials (6 – in occupation-specific subjects), 2 national Internet resources, 7 methodological web-sites and 6 automates systems have been developed.

A republican bank of teaching and methodological resources for vocational-technical and secondary specialized education has been established.

In 2011, it is planned to connect all vocational technical schools to Internet and to create conditions for gradual transition to a new level of education based on ICT; to promote ODL opportunities; to enhance and certify ICT competences of teachers, administrators and staff in TVET, and to organize networking of experts.

To date 1,165 regional IT tutors have been trained. 2,539 informatics teachers have been upskilled, a package of teaching materials and tests has been developed to perform certification of the education and training staff, and 7,425 specialists have already been assessed; 9 packages of teaching materials for upskilling in the field of IT have been developed.

ITs are extensively used in the education of students with special needs at 77 TVET institutions (ODL format, multi-media courses, education radio and TV).

To further enhance the use of ICT in TVET it is envisaged to promote the information and learning environments, to connect all TVET institutions to the Internet; to train, re-train and upskill TVET personnel in the field of ICT, to introduce the SMART-EDUCATION

system, to provide personal mobile access to the Internet and to digital resources; to improve the legal framework regulating the use of ICT in TVET in line with the provisions of the Education Code and the National Program for Accelerated Development of Services in the Field of ICT for 2011-2015; to update in-service teacher training curricula to integrate ICT, to introduce compulsory upskilling in ICT every three years with ensuing certification of IT skills; to establish resource centers to develop e-learning teaching and learning materials, etc.

**Mr. Vladimir Maklakov**, Institute of Government Problems named after Trapeznikov (Russian Federation): “System of Education as an Instrument of Governing Society”

The presenter focused on the role of education in contemporary knowledge-based society, stressing the misbalance between the supply and demand of skills on the labour market, the overproduction of economists and managers, and the dramatic shortage of engineering specialists badly needed in the economy. Currently there is also overproduction of higher education qualifications, while qualified workers and midlevel graduates are below the required level.

Thus, the balance between the demand and supply of skills is an urgent need. To this end, stressed the presenter, an effective system of labour market anticipation is needed.

To address the above problems, appropriate decisions must be taken of the national policy level and employability of graduates must become a priority in the social and economic policy.

**Ms. Yulia Stakyan**, Director, “ORITANTA” LLC Computer and e-Learning Company (Armenia): “Enhancing the use of ICT in TVET in Armenia”

According to the speaker, in Armenia introduction of ICT in education is a national priority, with ODL acquiring a growing importance. In preparation to the presentation a survey of 40 TVET schools was carried out. The results of the survey revealed that 25 % respondents use e-learning materials, however these materials do not belong a complete course. The majority of TVET schools do not have an Internet address and a web-site.

At the same time, TVET schools would like to use ICT in teaching and learning, but are not aware of basic concepts relating to such use.

The development of ODL is largely carried out with the support of international organizations, such as UNDP, OSI, InWEnt – Capacity Building International, Germany.

Development of electronic teaching and learning materials presupposes creation of appropriate software, procedures and technical tools. To this end highly qualified specialists are needed. Also, a full-fledged ICT introduction in TVET requires open access to servers. The presenter stressed that to ensure success all of the above functions should be vested with the TVET Development Center and the Education Institute of Armenia.

To build the national education network, an integrated data base of teaching and learning materials and information resource centers must be envisaged.

The speaker stressed that e- learning and ODL are of special importance for the rural areas, to keep the people from migrating to the cities and to other countries. It is also critical to boost attractiveness of TVET for students, especially for students with special needs, and to involve employers in TVET.

In conclusion the presented pointed out that a national strategy of ICT-based education and training is needed that would comprise goals, objectives and priorities, distribution of roles and function , social partnership factors and a marketing strategy.

**Mr. Rashidov, National Expert: “Promotion of the ICT use in TVET in Uzbekistan”**

For Uzbekistan an accelerated modernization of teaching and learning is critical, as the potential of the national education system is the key social resource that can ensure an innovative breakthrough to a higher level of economic development. To this end the Presidential Decree was issued in 2002 “On the further development of computerization and introduction of ICT”, and the respective program was approved by the Cabinet of Ministers for 2002-2010. In 2003 the Law “On Informatization” was adopted. In 2005 under the Presidential Order, the public education information network ZiviNET was established to meet the needs of students of all education sectors and segments in the education and information resources; to foster ODL, to provide e-mail connection to education establishments.

As a result of the above, the national information base has been established, together with a market of information resources; students are trained in the use of ITs; conditions are created to ensure access to national and international information networks for diverse target groups of the population; ICT are introduced in TVET institutions. Over 131 e-textbooks have been developed. Over 1,100 teachers have been upskilled in ICT skills abroad. Under the framework of investment projects supported by ADB, JBIC, KfW, GTZ 3,708 teachers have been trained in ICT skills. Under the project with Germany, 545 computer classes have been equipped.

The national network “Electronic learning” is being finalized to which in 2011 all universities will be connected, to be followed by academic lyceums and vocational colleges.

Information about activities in vocational education can be found on the web-site of the Center for Secondary Specialized Education. The Ministry of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education has established a corporate computer network.



## ***2.6. Conclusions of the working group sessions: issues and recommendations***

Drawing on the findings and lessons learned from the past activities conducted in Minsk (2009) and in Bonn (2010), the meeting explored ways to further CIS UNEVOC Centres' involvement and commitment in regional cooperation and networking. Through working group sessions, the participants addressed priorities, issues and challenges to ensure a meaningful contribution and the potential role of UNEVOC CIS Regional Network to the TVET for sustainable development. The participants engaged in open, friendly, and enthusiastic discussions on key issues of common interests; they reached excellent consensus on major objectives of the UNEVOC Network, which include collaborative efforts on the creation of a Regional UNEVOC Network to promote sustainable practices and principles in the field of TVET.

### **Working Groups 1 and 2. TVET in CIS and Ukraine: a) The role of the UNEVOC Network and of the CIS regional Network in the TVET development in CIS, b) TVET Policy review.**

The Working group session was attended by representatives from the National UNEVOC Centers and by Experts preparing national policy reports.

The first part of the discussion focused on the role of the UNEVOC Centers, and the CIS regional Network's contribution to TVET development in CIS Thematic Area I and III).

The participants approved the idea of setting up the regional UNEVOC Network in the CIS countries. It was decided to identify thematic leaders within the Network, whose role will be to provide technical, financial and coordinating support. The leaders of the CIS UNEVOC Network will be part of the global UNEVOC Network. The regional CIS UNEVOC Network will meet once a year.

To ensure the smooth functioning of the Network all necessary internal regulatory documents will be developed (the logo, Charter, cooperation agreement, organizational structure, coordination and reporting mechanisms, activity plans, etc.).

The Centers will coordinate their work with the central and regional education administration bodies, and with TVET schools.

For the coming two years the two key areas of cooperation comprise a) Education for sustainable development and b) ICT in TVET.

It was also decided that the Republican Institute for Vocational Education in Belarus will coordinate the ESD area, including the development of programs in ecological education. The Network will define the mechanisms for promoting ecological education. As a first step it was proposed to develop a program in "Green construction".

The participants proposed to develop materials for the next UNESCO TVET Congress (i.e. "Skills for the marginalized groups").

The Institute for Innovative Technologies and Content of Education affiliated to the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine will coordinate the ICT in TVET activity segment.

The participants also looked into a possibility of cooperation of the UNEVOC Centers in the sphere of TVET in rural areas and decided to include this field in their activities later.

It was specifically stressed that education and culture are the two factors uniting the National UNEVOC Centers in the CIS. It is thus necessary to integrate resources and organize effective sharing and exchange of best practices, which will help address and resolve common problems.

Another issue discussed was about joining the CONFINTEA.

It was agreed that the efficiency of the CIS Network will largely depend on its visibility, to ensure which it was proposed to develop a common communications strategy, create web-sites that could be accessed from the UNEVOC web-site, and to create a common logo.

The send part of the discussion focused on the preparation of the TVET Policy Review (Thematic Area II). The participants agreed on the structure and methodology of preparation of the policy reviewed proposed by Prof. Oleynikova.

### **Working Group 3. TVET Development and ICT**

The participants discussed the ICTs' use in TVET (Thematic Area I); country cases (Thematic Areas II and III) and the recommendations on promotion of ICT use in TVET in CIS and Ukraine.

Having familiarized with the presentations made, the participants agreed on the critical importance of the use of ICT in TVET to promote lifelong learning and enhance quality of training and its relevance for the labor market. The issues identified in the presentations were largely common to all CIS and Ukrainian participants (ICT skills of TVET teachers, software issues, connection to the Internet, etc).

It was agreed to prepare a final report on the use of ICT in TVET in the CIS to be presented to the Conference of the Ministers of Education of the CIS countries. It was also agreed to develop competency standards for TVET teachers based on the UNESCO competency\ framework and to develop a concept of cooperating with employers on the issues of using ICTs in TVET.





## 2.6. Conclusions

### ***2.6.1 Outcomes reached and fulfillment of objectives***

The participants agreed that all the planned outcomes have been reached and the set objectives met. The participants exchanged views and perspectives on the ways to enhance quality and efficiency of TVET based on the wealth of international, CIS and national practices. They agreed on concrete ways to strengthen the Regional Network of the CIS UNEVOC Centers. Also final agreement was reached as to the structure and methodology of national TVET policy reviews.

In all the presentations challenges to the TVET development and mechanisms to address these challenges were highlighted. These mechanisms embrace closer links with the labor market and flexible and prompt response by the TVET system to the labor market demands. It was also stressed that to ensure objective bench-marking, assessment and comparison of the implemented reforms in the sphere of human capital development, objective and transparent indicators are required.

The common objectives were identified in addressing which the National UNEVOC Centers are to play a key role in each country. They are:

- To enhance attractiveness of TVET and workers occupations;
- To ensure employability of TVET graduates that is closely linked to the quality of labor market anticipation data and to the quality of TVET;
- To develop the national qualifications systems and institutionalize mechanisms of recognition and certification of qualifications;
- To develop and introduce in CIS and in Ukraine the concept of lifelong learning;
- To integrate the ESD concept in the TVET curricula.

It was stressed that on all of above issues UNEVOC has a wealth of information and samples of best practices. The issue is to ensure access to this information for individual countries.

The participants agreed that enhanced networking of National UNEVOC Centers will contribute to improving their efficiency and will strengthen their impact on TVET development in CIS. The corporate links will help develop diverse cooperation forms and formats in TVET on the regional and national level. These formats may include joint projects, conferences, video-forums, publications, etc.

Participants of the meeting expressed readiness to closely cooperate within the UNEVOC CIS Network, to join national resources in the interests of sustainable development and capacity building in TVET in the CIS countries.



## **2.6.2.Resolution**

At the end of the meeting the participants adopted a Resolution.

The Ufa Resolution of the International Meeting of the CIS Regional UNEVOC Network “ Networking and Capacity Building of TVET for Sustainable Development of the Commonwealth of Independent States. Ufa, Republic of Bashkortostan, June 29 – July 1, 2011.

While welcoming and accepting the UNESCO Strategy on TVET Development and the UNESCO Strategy for the Second Half of the UN Decade on Education for Sustainable Development (UNDESD) through fostering regional cooperation between UNEVOC National Centres in the CIS and strengthening the CIS Network members’ performance;

Fully aware that the overall strengthening of the national technological base is regarded as a top priority and a strategic goal in the context of economic and social processes, and human resources development, and that the CIS TVET system does not yet fully comply with the current and medium-term labour market requirements and is not yet efficient in terms of attracting private investments;

Based upon the aggregate results of the CIS Network meetings in 2009 (Minsk) and 2010 (Bonn), and with the intention to ensure access to education for all, to create up-to-date curricula, to provide opportunity for lifelong learning, to mobilize knowledge, experience and resources, to support compatible education standards, to create systemic cooperation among the CIS countries, to improve and enhance the use of ICT in TVET and to foster TVET in rural areas, as well as ESD in TVET;

The Ufa meeting of the CIS Regional UNEVOC Network, taking into account the forum discussions;

**HEREBY RECOMMENDS** to take the action in the following areas:

### **I. Establishment of the regional UNEVOC Network uniting the CIS countries and Ukraine:**

To identify thematic leaders within the Network, whose role will be to provide technical, financial and coordinating support

To hold regional CIS UNEVOC Network meeting once a year.

To focus in the coming two years on two key areas of cooperation: a) Education for sustainable development and b) ICT in TVET

To entrust the Republican Institute for Vocational Education in Belarus in the coming two years (with subsequent rotation) with coordination of activities in the ESD area, and with developing programs in ecological education, define the mechanisms for promoting ecological education. As a first step – to develop a program in “Green construction”.

Develop materials for the next UNESCO TVET Congress (i.e. “Skills for the marginalized groups”).

To entrust, for the period of two years (with subsequent rotation) the Institute for Innovative Technologies and Content of Education affiliated to the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine with coordination of the ICT in TVET activity segment.

Appoint the UNESCO Institute for Information Technologies a key resource center for the CIS UNEVOC Network that will provide information, analytical and program support in promoting ICT in TVET.

To identify and approve the principles of the CIS UNEVOC operation that will envisage close interaction with national education administration bodies.

To integrate resources and organize effective sharing and exchange of best practices, which will help address and resolve common problems

To consider a possibility for the CIS Network of joining the CONFINTEA.

To enhance visibility of the CIS Network (to develop a common communications strategy, create web-sites that could be accessed from the UNEVOC web-site, to create a common logo, etc.).

## **II. Finalization of the TVET policy national stock-taking reports:**

To include in the reports the themes of ESD

## **III. Promotion and strengthening cooperation:**

To publish the News Bulletin of the Regional CIS Network (to ask the National UNEVOC Center in RF coordinate these activities).

To develop a core “green” curriculum that will be interdisciplinary and relevant for all occupations of training.

To include in the activities of the Regional CIS Network situational modeling of education to ensure TVET quality, mobility, and flexibility of programs,

To make the results of the meeting known to the national governments, the RF UNESCO Committee.

## **IV. ICT in TVET:**

To prepare a final Report on the Use of ICT in TVET in CIS and in Ukraine to be presented at the the Conference of Ministries of Educaiton of the CIS Countries.

To place and update on the portal of the UNESCO Institute ofr Information Technologies data on the use of ICT in TVET in CIS and Ukraine, based on the analytical data provided by the national experts.

To form a CIS-Ukrainian expert community on ICT in TVET to share best practices and develop recommendations.

To develop competency standards for TVET teachers based on the UNESCO competency framework

To develop a concept of cooperating with employers on the issues of using ICTs in TVET.





**Annex**

**Meeting of the**

**UNEVOC CIS Regional Network:  
Networking and Building Capacity for TVET and ESD  
in the Commonwealth of Independent States**

*Ufa, Republic of Bashkortostan (Russian Federation)*

*29 June – 1 July 2011*

**AGENDA**

**Objective of the Meeting:** enhancing the role of TVET to meet educational, economic and social needs of the CIS countries in line with the UNESCO Strategy on TVET Development and the UNESCO Strategy for the Second Half of the UN Decade on Education for Sustainable Development (UNDESD) through fostering regional cooperation between UNEVOC National Centers in the CIS and strengthening the CIS Network members' performance.

This meeting will inaugurate the UNEVOC CIS Regional Network through constructive dialogue, exchange of experiences, mobilization of expertise and resources, and elaboration of policy recommendations on priority issues such as: TVET development in CIS, TVET contribution to UNDESD, ICTs use in TVET and rural TVET.

**Organizers:** Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan, Commission of the Russian Federation for UNESCO, UNESCO Moscow Office, UNESCO Institute for Information Technologies in Education (IITE), UNESCO International Center for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (UNESCO-UNEVOC), German International Cooperation (GIZ), and Intergovernmental Foundation for Educational, Scientific and Cultural Cooperation (IFESCCO), the Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (BIST) and the Committee of the Republic of Bashkortostan for UNESCO.

**With the participation of:** Federal and regional Ministries of Education (and Science) of the Russian Federation, INRULED - UNESCO International Research and Training Center for Rural Education (Beijing, China), Russian Academy of Education, 14 National UNEVOC Centers from the CIS and Europe.

**Venue:** Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (branch of) the Educational Institution of Trade Unions "Academy of Labor and Social Relations" (74/2, Prospect Oktyabrya, Ufa , 450054, Russian Federation)

**Tuesday, 28th June 2011**

Arrival to the airport and transfer to the hotels – “President Hotel” (2, Aurora str., Ufa, Tel.: +7(347) 279-80-08) and “AMAKS Tourist Hotel” (17, Zorge str., Ufa, Tel.: +7 (347) 282-46-72)

**Wednesday, 29th June 2011**

Venue: Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies

09:00	Depart from the hotels
09:30 - 10:00	Registration of the participants
10:00 - 10:45	<p><b>Opening Session</b></p> <p><b><i>Chaired by Ms. Zugura Rakhmatullina, Deputy Prime Minister of the Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan and Chairperson of the Committee of the Republic of Bashkortostan for UNESCO and Mr. Alisher Umarov, UNESCO Moscow</i></b></p> <p>Welcome Addresses (5 minutes each):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan - Ms. Zugura Rakhmatullina</li><li>- Commission of the Russian Federation for UNESCO (on behalf of Mr. Gregory Ordzonikidze) – Mr. Vladimir Maklakov</li><li>- UNESCO Moscow and UNESCO IITE (on behalf of Mr. Badarch Dendev) – Mr. Alisher Umarov</li><li>- GIZ (Germany) – Mr. Harry Stolte</li><li>- IFESCCO – Mr. Alexander Khoroshilov</li><li>- BIST – Ms. Tanzilya Nigmatullina</li></ul> <p>Opening Remark (10 minutes) by Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, Head of the UNESCO-UNEVOC International Center</p>
10:45 - 11:30	<p><b>Plenary Session 1: TVET Development in the CIS (15 minutes each)</b></p> <p><b><i>Chaired by Ms. Zugura Rakhmatullina, Deputy Prime Minister of the Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan and Chairperson of the Committee of the Republic of Bashkortostan for UNESCO, Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, UNESCO-UNEVOC International Center and Ms. Tanzilya Nigmatullina, Director, BIST</i></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Bashkortostan progress on TVET Development: past, present and future by <i>Mr. Alfis Gayazov, Minister of Education of the Republic of Bashkortostan</i></li><li>- CIS countries cooperation in implementation of the UNESCO Strategy on TVET Development by <i>Mr. Alisher Umarov, Programme Specialist in Education, UNESCO Moscow Cluster Office for Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, the Republic of Moldova and the Russian Federation</i></li><li>- TVET Development in the CIS countries: access, quality and equity by <i>Ms. Olga Oleynikova, Director of the Center on Vocational Education and Training Studies and the National UNEVOC Center (Russia)</i></li></ul> <p>Reporter: Mr. Aram Avagyan, UNEVOC Center (Armenia)</p>
11:30 - 12:00	Photo Session and Coffee & Tea break
12:00 - 13:30	<p><b>Plenary Session 2: Keynote Presentations on TVET: ESD, ICTs use and rural education (20 minutes each)</b></p> <p><b><i>Chaired by Mr. Alisher Umarov, UNESCO Moscow and Mr. Victor Demin, President of</i></b></p>

	<p><b><i>the Union of Directors of the Secondary Specialized Educational Institutions of Russia</i></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Role of UNESCO-UNEVOC in Global Networking: ESD and TVET development by <i>Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, Head, UNESCO-UNEVOC International Center (Germany)</i></li> <li>- ICTs use in TVET: issues, challenges and lessons learnt by <i>Mr. Alexander Khoroshilov, National Programme Officer, Capacity Development Team Leader, UNESCO IITE (Russian Federation)</i></li> <li>- Rural Education and TVET: increased employment opportunities for marginalized groups by <i>Mr. Wang Li, Deputy Director, UNESCO INRULED (China)</i></li> <li>- International cooperation in TVET and UNEVOC – GIZ view by <i>Mr. Harry Stolte, Head of Division, GIZ (Germany)</i></li> </ul> <p>Reporter: Ms. Naing Yee Mar, UNESCO-UNEVOC (Germany)</p>
13:30 - 14:30	Lunch
14:30 - 16:00	<p><b>Plenary Session 3: TVET Development in the CIS countries and the role of the UNEVOC Center in each country</b> (10 minutes for each presentation)</p> <p><b><i>Chaired by Ms. Naing Yee Mar, UNESCO-UNEVOC and Mr. Harry Stolte, GIZ (Germany)</i></b></p> <p><u>TVET Development in Armenia and the role of the UNEVOC Center</u> by <i>Mr. Aram Avagyan, Head of the UNEVOC Center, Director of the "Global Developments" Fund</i></p> <p><u>TVET Development in Azerbaijan and the role of the UNEVOC Center</u> by <i>Mr. Elchin Gasanov, Head of the Unit Center for Vocational Education Development, Ministry of Education of Azerbaijan and Mr. Emil Bakhshiyev, Specialist of the Teachers' Institute, UNEVOC Center (candidate)</i></p> <p><u>TVET Development in Belarus and the role of the UNEVOC Center: follow up to the International Conference on TVET and ESD in Minsk 2009</u> by <i>Mr. Arkadiy Shklyar, Rector of the Republican Institute for Vocational Education (RIPO), UNEVOC Center</i></p> <p><u>TVET Development in Kyrgyzstan and the role of the UNEVOC Center</u> by <i>Ms. Gulzhana Teshebaeva, Assistant, Forum for Educational Initiatives, UNEVOC Center</i></p> <p><u>TVET Development in the Republic of Moldova and the role of the UNEVOC Center</u> by <i>Mr. Vasilachi Octavian, Chief of Secondary and Post Secondary Vocational Education Department of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Moldova and Ms. Violeta Mija, Director of Republican Center for Vocational Education Development, UNEVOC Center (candidate).</i></p> <p><u>TVET Development in Ukraine and the role of the UNEVOC Center</u> by <i>Mrs. Tamara Pushkarova, Institute of Innovation Technologies and Content, Ministry of Education of Ukraine, UNEVOC Center (candidate)</i></p> <p><u>TVET Development in Uzbekistan and the role of the UNEVOC Center</u> by <i>Mr. Khikmatulla Rashidov, Rector of the Institute for Training and Retraining of Personnel of Secondary Specialized and Professional Education System, UNEVOC Center and Mr. Uktamjon Khudayberdiev, Head of the Academic Lyceums Department of the TVET Centre of Uzbekistan, UNEVOC Center</i></p> <p>Q &amp; A ( 15 minutes)</p> <p>Reporter: Mr. Edward Kalitsky, UNEVOC Center (Belarus)</p>
16:00 - 16:15	Coffee & Tea break

16:15 - 17:45	<p><b>Plenary Session 4: TVET Development in the Russian Federation</b> (10 minutes for each presentation)</p> <p><b>Chaired by Mr. Alfis Gayazov, Minister of Education of the Republic of Bashkortostan and Ms. Olga Oleynikova, UNEVOC Center (Russia)</b></p> <p><u>TVET Development in Russia: legislation, trends, challenges and future scenarios</u> <i>by Mr. Victor Demin, President of the Union of Directors of the Secondary Specialized Educational Institutions of Russia, Director of the College of Krasnogorsk (Russian Federation)</i></p> <p><u>TVET Development in the Republic of Tatarstan of the Russian Federation</u> <i>by Ms. Ludmila Nugumanova, Deputy Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Tatarstan., Vice Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Tatarstan</i></p> <p><u>Regional TVET Development in the Russian Federation</u> <i>by Mr. Nikolay Babanov, Vice Minister of Education, Nizhny Novgorod region</i></p> <p><u>Scientific research in the aspect of continuing professional education in the Russian Academy of Education</u> <i>by Ms. Svetlana Chistyakova, Academician-Secretary of the Vocational Education Department of the Russian Academy of Education</i></p> <p><u>Multilevel TVET – innovative practices in vocational education and training of the qualified workers in megacity settings</u> <i>by Ms. Tatiana Sizova, Director, State Research Institute for the Development of Vocational Education in Moscow (Russian Federation)</i></p> <p><u>The role of the UNEVOC Center: Networking and cooperation on the level of the Russian Federation regions</u> <i>by Ms. Tatiana Lomakina, Director of the Department "Continuing Education", International Centre of Educational Systems, UNEVOC Center (Russian Federation)</i></p> <p>Q &amp; A ( 30 min)</p> <p>Reporter: Mr. Alexander Khoroshilov, UNESCO IITE</p>
17:45 - 18:15	<p><b>Wrap-up of the first day</b> (5 minutes for each presentation)</p> <p><b>Chaired by Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, UNESCO-UNEVOC and Mr. Alisher Umarov, UNESCO Moscow</b></p> <p>Briefing by Reporters</p> <p>Q &amp; A ( 15 min)</p> <p>Reporter: Ms. Olga Oleynikova, UNEVOC Center (Russia)</p>
19:00	<p><b>Welcome Reception following by a dinner</b> hosted by UNESCO and BIST</p>
<p><b>Thursday, 30<sup>th</sup> June 2011</b> <u>Venue:</u> Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies</p>	
08:30	<p>Depart from the hotels</p>
	<p><b>Parallel Three Working Group Sessions (each working group should nominate a reporter who will report on 1 July 2011 about the results of these sessions)</b></p>
	<p>Session Times: 09:00 - 10:30; 11:00 – 13:00; 14:00 – 15:30 and 16:00 – 17:30 <i>with Coffee &amp; Tea breaks at 10:30 -11:00 and 15:30-16:00 and Lunch at 13:00 – 14:00</i></p>
	<p><b>1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group Session</b></p>

	<p><b>(participants - UNEVOC Centers and experts on TVET policy review):</b></p> <p><u>Thematic Area I (09:00 - 10:30):</u>  Second Half of UNDESD and Strategic Actions: The Role of the UNEVOC Network  Moderators: Ms. Naing Yee Mar, UNESCO-UNEVOC and Mr. Harry Stolte, GIZ (Germany)</p> <p><u>Thematic Area II (11:00 – 13.00):</u>  TVET Policy Review and Recommendations: trends, challenges and best experiences,  Moderators: Ms. Olga Oleynikova, UNEVOC Center (Russia) and Mr. Alisher Umarov, UNESCO Moscow</p> <p><u>Thematic Area III (14:00 – 15:30):</u>  UNEVOC CIS Regional Network’s contribution to the TVET development in CIS  Moderators: Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, UNESCO-UNEVOC and Mr. Alisher Umarov, UNESCO Moscow</p> <p><u>Thematic Area IV (16:00 – 17:30):</u>  Rural TVET and the UNEVOC CIS Regional Network: joint project development  Moderators: Mr. Wang Li, Deputy Director, UNESCO INRULED (China) and Mr. Vasilachi Octavian, Ministry of Education (Republic of Moldova)</p>
	<p><b>3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group Session (participants – experts on ICTs use in TVET review):</b></p> <p><u>Thematic Area I (09:00 - 10:30):</u>  ICTs use in TVET: global, regional and national perspectives  Moderators: Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, UNESCO-UNEVOC and Mr. Alexander Khoroshilov, UNESCO IITE</p> <p><u>Thematic Area II (11:00 – 13.00):</u>  Comparative Review of the ICTs use in TVET: CIS country cases  Moderators: Mr. Alexander Khoroshilov, UNESCO IITE and Mr. Arkady Shklyar, Rector of the Republican Institute for Vocational Education (RIPO) (Belarus)</p> <p><u>Thematic Area III (14:00 – 15:30):</u>  Comparative Review of the ICTs use in TVET: CIS country cases (continued)  Moderators: Mr. Alexander Khoroshilov, UNESCO IITE and Mr. Khikmatulla Rashidov, Rector of the Institute for Training and Retraining of Personnel (Uzbekistan)</p> <p><u>Thematic Area IV (16:00 – 17:30):</u>  Discussion of the analytical report and finalization of the list of recommendations on promotion of ICT use in TVET in CIS and Ukraine  Moderators: Mr. Alexander Khoroshilov, UNESCO IITE and Ms. Inna Malyukova, Director of the Institute for Information Technologies in Education of the National Technical University "Kyiev Polytechnic Institute", IITE Governing Board Member (Ukraine)</p>
17:30 - 18:15	Dinner
19:00 -	Visit to the Tatar Drama Theater “NUR”
<p><b>Friday, 1<sup>st</sup> July 2011</b>  <u>Venue:</u> Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies</p>	
08:30	Depart from the hotels



09:00 - 09:30	<p><b>Plenary Session 5: Development of TVET System of the Republic of Bashkortostan – Primary, Secondary and High Professional Education (each 10 minutes)</b></p> <p><b><i>Chaired by Ms Ludmila Nugumanova, Deputy Minister for Education and Science (Republic of Tatarstan), Mr Nikolay Babanov, Deputy Minister for Education of Nizhny Novgorod Region (Russian Federation) and Mr. Alisher Umarov, UNESCO Moscow</i></b></p> <p>Mr. Murat Guzairov, Rector of Ufa State Aviation Technical University</p> <p>Mr. Saifutdin Kunsbaev, Chairman of the Board of Directors of the Secondary Professional Education Institutions of the Republic of Bashkortostan, Director of Ufa College for Statistics and ICT</p> <p>Ms. Tanzilya Nigmatullina, Director, Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (BIST)</p>
09:30 - 11:00	<p><b>Plenary Session 6: Wrap-up of previous days and Reports of Working Groups (each 20 Minutes)</b></p> <p><b><i>Chaired by Ms. Naing Yee Mar, UNESCO-UNEVOC and Mr. Harry Stolte, GIZ (Germany)</i></b></p> <p>Working Group 1</p> <p>Working Group 2</p> <p>Working Group 3</p> <p>Wrap-up by Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, UNESCO-UNEVOC, Mr. Alisher Umarov, UNESCO Moscow, and Mr. Alexander Khoroshilov, UNESCO IITE (each 10 minutes)</p>
11:00 - 11:15	Coffee & Tea break
11:15 - 13:00	<p><b>Official Closing and Certificate Awarding Ceremony:</b></p> <p>Summary outline of emerging issues, challenges, and proposed actions in relation to CIS UNEVOC Network future</p> <p><b><i>Chaired by Ms. Zugura Rakhmatullina, Deputy Prime Minister of the Government of the Republic of Bashkortostan and Chairperson of the Committee of the Republic of Bashkortostan for UNESCO, Mr. Shyamal Majumdar, UNESCO-UNEVOC, Mr. Alisher Umarov, UNESCO Moscow and Ms. Tanzilya Nigmatullina, Director, BIST</i></b></p>
13:00 - 14:00	Lunch
17:30 -	City Tour “Ufa – Capital of the Republic of Bashkortostan” (visit of the Monument of Friendship, Salavat Yulaev Square, Ethnographic Museum and Museum-House of Russian writer Aksakov)
19:00 -	Dinner
<b>Saturday, 2<sup>nd</sup> July 2011</b>	
	Departure of participants