

**Minutes of the Meeting of
the Sub-Committee on Technology of
the International Advisory Committee for
the UNESCO Memory of the World-Programme:**

Paris, 6 and 7 February 2004

Those Participating:

Members of the Sub-Committee: Julià Bescòs, Adolf Knoll, Fernando Osorio, Jonas Palm, David de Roure and Dietrich Schüller.

Guests of the Sub-Committee: Marie-Thérèse Varlamoff and Jean-Marc Fontaine

UNESCO Programme Officer: Abdelaziz Abid

Apologies for their absence have been received from George Boston and Michael Alexander.

An address list is attached as Annex 2.

Opening of the Meeting: Dietrich Schüller, Chairman of SCoT, welcomed those members able to attend. He informed the members of SCoT that Michael Alexander had announced his resignation due to a change in his field of specialisation within the British Library. Michael's resignation was accepted with regret. He had been a founder-member of SCoT and his expertise had substantially supported the work of the sub-committee. It was decided to write him a letter of thanks for his work and to express the sub-committee's view that he will be missed as a colleague and friend.

Dietrich welcomed Professor Fernando Osorio as a new member of SCoT. Fernando briefly introduced himself and informed SCoT members about his background as a film preservation specialist. His work at Radio Educación in Mexico City has recently expanded to include audio preservation and digitisation.

Additionally Jean-Marc Fontaine was welcomed as a guest - specifically for item 4 of the Agenda. Dietrich expressed the Committee Members' thanks for the hospitality they enjoyed the afternoon before the meeting at Jean-Marc's Institute, the Laboratoire d'Acoustique Musicale, where he had demonstrated *inter alia* his advanced research into CD and DVD integrity.

1 Minutes of the Previous Meeting and Matters Arising

The Minutes of the previous meeting were approved and all matters arising were included in the Agenda (see Annex 1).

Item 6 of the Agenda was deferred until after item 10.

2 Introduction by the Chairman - Dietrich Schüller

In his introductory remarks Dietrich reminded members of the role of SCoT that has developed during the life of the sub-committee. Digitisation was emphasised at the beginning of the Committee's work because of the need to improve access to documents as well as their preservation. It must be noted, however, that the Memory of the World is a programme that employs the techniques and technologies which serve to best enhance preservation of and access to documents of all kinds. Dietrich also stressed that, because of the constant growth of literature and websites related to the aims of MofW, at its last meeting SCoT considered its role to be that of an observatory of existing literature rather than a writing group. This change in emphasis is also reflected in the Agenda of the Meeting.

There is a new task, however, that SCoT has been charged with: the evaluation, from a technical viewpoint, of the Projects nominated for the Memory of the World logo and possible assistance. The need for such a technical review emerged during the IAC Meeting in Gdansk, summer 2003. The IAC came to the conclusion that the level of technical complexity of a number of the projects proposals meant that they could not be properly evaluated without specific expertise. It was decided, therefore, that these projects should be first screened by SCoT before the IAC and the secretariat make a final decision.

3 Statement from UNESCO - Abdelaziz Abid

Abdelaziz Abid welcomed the group, and addressed his thanks Renée Herbouze and the Bibliothèque Nationale de France for offering the opportunity to meet within their premises. Aziz gave a brief account of the Memory of the World Programme within the framework of sister programmes within UNESCO, namely the World Heritage and the Intangible Heritage Programmes. He stressed the different legal basis that applied to Memory of the World vis-à-vis the other two programmes. They are based on International Conventions, the strongest legal tool for such programmes, while Memory of the World is not. It may well be that, in the course of further development, a stronger legal framework for Memory of the World will be required.

Aziz informed about recent Memory of the World-activities in the context of UNESCO, and beyond:

- The World Summit for the Information Society (WSIS) favourably commented on the initiatives taken to safeguard the digital heritage;
- the project to safeguard the manuscripts of Timbuktu recently has received substantial support from Luxembourg.
- A Memory of the World Prize, sponsored by the Republic of Korea, is being established. The prize of USD 30.000 is granted for outstanding preservation projects. SCoT will be involved with the evaluation process.
- CLIR has issued a web based tutorial available on the internet www.clir.org/webtutorial. This tutorial will be published on CD-ROM and translated into other UNESCO languages. Members are asked to look at this tutorial with a view to giving it the formal approval of the sub-committee.

4 Recordable CDs and DVDs.

Dietrich introduced the matter by referring to the last Meeting of SCoT in June 2002 which also included a meeting with the media manufacturers. The situation has technically not changed. Mainly because of the ever increasing writing speeds, problems of compatibility occur between CD burners and CD blanks which substantially influence the initial quality of the freshly recorded CD-Rs. Increasingly, newly recorded disks contain a large number of errors which absorb a considerable part of the error correction capability which reduces the life expectancy markedly. It is also not uncommon for newly recorded disks to be unplayable at all.

The quality problems of disk burning were impressively demonstrated the previous day by Jean-Marc Fontaine. He reported that the same make of disk burned by 8 different recorders resulted in 50% acceptable and 50% unacceptable disks. In another experiment, when several different blanks were recorded on the same recorder, again about 50% of the disks were found to have an unacceptably high initial error rate. The careful testing of burner-to-blank compatibility is a crucial factor in achieving optimal/acceptable results. Such testing requires considerable technical, strategic, and financial means. The successful use of CD-R as a digital target media for archival purposes is impossible without such testing. Further details of the tests are under preparation for publication in the *IASA Digitisation Guidelines* (item 7c on the Agenda).

The problem is aggravated by the fact that CD-Rs are widely used in digitisation projects because institutions lack adequate funding and suitably trained personnel. Thus, many of the digital objects produced, whether they be made for preservation or for access reasons, may be lost within a comparatively short time or not be readable at all. Dietrich also noted that CLIR has recently published, in co-operation with NIST (National Institute of Standards and Technology), a brochure by Fred R. Byers: *Care and Handling of CDs and DVDs - A Guide for Librarians and Archivists*. This otherwise very useful publication does not mention the importance of the recording quality as a major factor in maximising the life expectancy of recordable optical disks. Appropriate measures are about to be taken by the IASA Technical Committee.

After a lengthy discussion, the sub-committee felt that UNESCO should take action. It was decided to draft a one page document to be published on the Memory of the World website. A first draft will be made by Dietrich. It was unanimously agreed that this warning should not try to deter people from the use of CD-R but simply make users aware of the problems.

5 Report on the Meeting and Co-operation with Manufacturers

In his report, Dietrich drew a pessimistic picture of the possibilities of further co-operation with media manufacturers. He reminded members of the favourable reaction of the representative of CD-R manufacturer Verbatim at the June 2002 meeting who had mentioned a product specifically designed for longevity. Shortly after the meeting, Verbatim ceased production of this type of disk. No attempts were made by Verbatim to offer the remaining stocks to the archival community. On the other hand, Jean-Marc reported that MAM, the successor of Mitsui, a manufacturer not present in the meeting in 2002, is currently offering a CD-R blank called "Medical" which, according to its producers, is designed with longevity in mind.

Dietrich also reported that EMTEC, successor of BASF and Agfa, is in financial trouble, and it is unknown whether, and to what extent, production will be continued. This is especially disturbing as Mr. Gerd Cyrener of EMTEC had offered assistance in matters related to CD-R and magnetic tape life expectancy. The economic situation of EMTEC has also brought the production of magnetic test tapes to an end. There are few other products left on the market. Magnetic test tapes, however, are indispensable for the calibration of analogue replay machine and will be required for as long as there are analogue magnetic holdings to be transferred to the digital domain. In view of the very great importance of these calibration tools, it was agreed that UNESCO should take action in case EMTEC go totally out of production. Calibration production machines should then be passed on to an institution which could possibly arrange the further production of test tapes. It was also agreed that, in the case of a total withdrawal of magnetic tape production, UNESCO should intervene to try to safeguard technical data about magnetic tape production which would greatly assist preservation research. It was suggested that the AES (Audio Engineering Society)- Historical Committee could be a possible recipient of such production data.

6 (originally 7) Charter on the Preservation of the Digital Heritage

Aziz briefly introduced the issue and the underlying philosophy in the production of UNESCO documents. In view of the ever increasing importance of born-digital documents, as well as digital substitutes of analogue originals, UNESCO decided to produce two documents: One is the Digital Charter, which is a brief statement of the problem and the basic principles. Detailed methodological advice for the implementation of digital preservation is given in a second document which has been produced by Colin Webb from the National Library of Australia (*Guidelines for the Preservation of Digital Heritage*, cf agenda 7a). This document is the basis for further actions, specifically workshops, and it will be revised in future as appropriate. The text of the Digital Charter has been widely circulated and has been swiftly agreed upon by the archival community and beyond.

The Sub-Committee unanimously welcomed the document in its final shape and commended Aziz for this major achievement.

In a longer discussion, however, concerns were expressed that the high visibility of digital preservation may distract attention from classical preservation. It was agreed that classical as well as digital preservation should be seen as one entity. In this context, it was considered that the visibility and the efficiency of Memory of the World may be enhanced by elevating its status to a Convention like the World Heritage and Intangible Heritage Programmes. It was agreed that the Sub-Committee should bring this issue to the IAC.

7 (originally 8) **Publications to be Considered for Inclusion on the MofW Programme List of References**

7a: *Colin Webb: Guidelines for the Preservation of Digital Heritage:*

In general this publication was highly appreciated by Sub-Committee members. The following observations, however, have been made:

Over-friendliness to CD-Rs (pp 120 and 121) and a lack of sufficient reference to scientific data. Jonas, Dave and Dietrich were invited to give their respective comments in writing.

7b: *ICA/IFLA Guidelines:*

It was mentioned that the document has seen no major revisions since SCoT has commented on it at its June 2002 Meeting. There was agreement that the publication should be taken as it is. In addition, it was noted that more publications of this kind are becoming available.

7c: *IASA Guidelines:*

Dietrich reported that the draft is in an advanced state and it is expected to be available later this year. The document covers *in extenso* the analogue to digital conversion of all audio carriers. It also deals with the choice and the production of digital substitutes for analogue originals, with Digital Mass Storage Systems and solutions for small institutions. A chapter deals specifically with the problems of using recordable optical disks as digital target formats.

7d: *Additional publications:*

Jonas pointed to the publication of the European Commission Project SEPIA, which is a comprehensive collection of recommendations related to the preservation of the photographic heritage. Aziz will look into the possibility of promoting these documents within UNESCO. Marie-Thérèse Varlamoff points to a similar publication on photographs by Marc Roosa, Library of Congress.

In the course of the further discussion it was stated that similar (recent) documents on film and videography should be encouraged. SCoT should contact the CCAAA (Co-ordinating Committee for the Audiovisual Archive Associations) on this matter. Also the need for guidelines on the preservation of documents on traditional materials such as palm leaves has been expressed. Aziz pointed to the earlier mentioned CLIR tutorial and asked sub-committee members for their comments.

In conclusion, there was unanimous agreement that a small technical leaflet on preservation for screen and print for the work of Memory of the World should be drafted by the group. It would summarize the most important issues related to the preservation of documents of all kind and point to a list of (approved) literature and websites related to this field. Jonas volunteered to outline a first draft.

8 (originally 9) Revision of Safeguarding the Documentary Heritage

It was confirmed that a revised second edition of the publication is needed. It should include the principles on the care and handling of documents of all kind, as well as the management of preservation. The various chapters related to the different types of carriers will be updated. The chapter on electronic publications, however, one of the earliest account on this topic, should be deleted because of the various other publications now available in this field. Translation into - preferably all - UNESCO languages should be envisaged. George Boston will be asked to coordinate this revision.

The CD-ROM version, now also available in Spanish as well as in English and French, should be revised in accordance to the print version.

9 (originally 10) Safeguarding the Documentary Heritage of Cultural and Linguistic Diversity

Dietrich briefly introduced the document which he had drafted a year ago. He reported that this document has already been approved by CCAAA, the MofW IAC (in Gdansk), and - more recently - by the Board of ICTM (International Council of Traditional Music). Aziz reported that he has discussed the paper with his colleagues of the Culture Sector. Although its importance has not been denied, more concrete actions should be proposed.

A Survey of Endangered Audiovisual Carriers has recently been completed. This was a joint project between IASA and UNESCO co-ordinated by George Boston which targeted libraries and archives. After some debate it was recommended that the Survey be expanded to include collections which are outside the realm of libraries and archives. For this purpose, contacts shall be made with ICTM, IUAES (International Union of Anthropological and Ethnological Societies), and other scientific societies and NGOs related to disciplines which are active in the field of audiovisual data gathering. Such action should reveal hitherto unknown collections in small research institutions, and in private possession of researchers. The outcome of this survey will then be the basis for further actions.

10 (originally 6) Consideration of Project Proposals Nominated for the Memory of the World Logo and possible assistance.

The evaluation of Memory of the World Projects is a new task for ScoT. It results from decisions made at the International Advisory Meeting in summer 2003 in Gdansk. The IAC found that the technical complexity of several of the Memory of the World project nominations was very high and that an evaluation of the nominations by SCoT prior to the decision of the IAC and the Secretariat would be advisable.

The projects have been discussed in the numbering they were given in the course of the preparation of the Meeting. The results of the discussion are found in Annex 3 to the Minutes.

The following general decisions and recommendations have been made:

1 As a matter of routine Memory of the World Project proposals should report in detail on measures planned for the preservation of the original objects, and of the digital substitutes, be they made for preservation or access purposes.

2 The Projects will be sent to the Secretary of SCoT as they come in, who will circulate them to members for their comment within reasonable time. It is estimated that annually about five projects will be submitted.

11 Future Projects of SCoT

Aziz reported in some detail about the Memory of the World prize that has been funded by the Republic of Korea. As with the Memory of the World projects, SCoT will be invited to evaluate the nominations for technical consistency and rigour.

Triggered by a question of Jonas, Aziz explained the activities of UNESCO modelled on the first programme of this kind - the World Heritage Programme. These are the Intangible Heritage Programme, the Memory of the World Programme, and the Digital Heritage, which is part of Memory of the World. He repeated the legal differences between the programmes (cf Agenda item 3) and also spoke of the different resources in terms of funds and personnel which these programmes enjoy. An upgrade of Memory of the World to a higher level legal instrument has been frequently considered. Recommendations to increase the Memory of the World funding, specifically to increase the number of personnel, in order to increase its efficiency have been made by the MofW IAC in each of its Reports. The urgent need for such an increase in resource allocation has also been frequently expressed by member states at the General Conferences with, however, little success.

As an outcome of the Gdansk IAC Meeting a better harmonization of criteria for the eligibility of nominations to the respective Programmes (World Heritage, Intangible Heritage, and Memory of the World) is envisaged.

12 Any Other Business

Following the resignation from SCoT of Michael Alexander, the membership of SCoT was discussed. After some debate, it was agreed that considerable expertise for electronic/digital documents remains available within the sub-committee. A replacement of Michael Alexander by another expert in electronic documents was, therefore, not recommended. It was felt, however, that the group lacked expertise for some types of traditional documents, eg palm leaves. This expert should, ideally, come from a non-European region. Jonas and Marie-Thérèse will look into the matter.

13 Closure of the Meeting

Dietrich thanked members for their concise input. In summary, he said that not only had the meeting completed its business but it had done so within one and a half days, shorter than originally expected. He reminded delegates to keep the momentum by promptly responding to the Minutes as appropriate and specifically by looking into the Memory of the World-Projects as they were circulated.

On behalf of the members of SCoT, Dietrich thanked Renée Herbouze and the Bibliothèque Nationale de France for their hospitality. Speaking for the Secretariat of UNESCO, Aziz thanked the sub-committee for its work.

The Meeting was closed at 12.25 pm on Saturday 7 February, 2004.

Annex 1

Draft Agenda for the Meeting of the Sub-Committee on Technology of the International Advisory Committee for the UNESCO Memory of the World Programme to be held in Paris on February 6th and 7th 2004

1. Minutes of the Previous Meeting and Matters Arising not otherwise included in this Agenda
2. Introduction by Chairman - Dietrich Schüller
3. Statement from UNESCO - Abdelaziz Abid
4. Recordable CDs and DVDs - can they be recommended for use by archives and libraries?
There are increasing reports of less than satisfactory recordings on modern optical disc blanks because of low quality control in manufacture. Should UNESCO be asked to issue a warning?
5. Report on Meeting and Co-operation with Manufacturers
6. Consideration of Project Proposals Nominated for the
Memory of the World Logo and Possible Support.
7. Charter on the Preservation of the Digital Heritage
Comments on the final text.
8. Publications to be Considered for Inclusion in the MofW Programme List
 - a. Guidelines for the Preservation of Digital Heritage - UNESCO Document written by National Library of Australia Working Group (with particular reference to section 3.2)
 - b. Guidelines for Digital Projects
(the ICA/IFLA Working Group publication)
 - c. IASA Practical Guidelines for Audio - report by Dietrich Schüller
 - d. Additional Publications to be Commissioned by MofW
9. Revision of "Safeguarding the Documentary Heritage" - written by SCoT in 1997
10. Safeguarding the Documentary Heritage of Cultural and Linguistic Diversity
(Discussion paper drafted by Dietrich Schüller).
11. Future projects
12. Any other business
- 13 Publications to be Considered for Inclusion in the MofW Programme List.
14. Closure of the Meeting

A visit to the Laboratoire d'Acoustique Musicale has been arranged for members of SCoT on the afternoon of Thursday February 5th.

Annex 2

Address Details for Members of SCoT

Members of the Sub-Committee

Julián Bescós

Informática El Cortes Inglés
Department of Computerisation
of Historical Archives

Travesía Costa Brava 6 - 3B
28034 Madrid
Spain

Tel: +34 (1) 387 4700 Ext 5362

FAX: +34 (1) 372 1864

E-Mail: archbib@ibm.net

George Boston (Rapporteur)

168A Overwoods Road
Hockley

Tamworth
Staffordshire B77 5NF
United Kingdom

Tel: +44 (1827) 285 292

Fax:

E-Mail: keynes2@aol.com

Adolf Knoll

National Library of the Czech Republic
Deputy Director

Klementinum 190
110 01 Praha 1
Czech Republic

Tel: +420 (2) 266 160

FAX: +420 (2) 2422 7796

E-Mail: adolfnknoll@nkp.cz

Fernando Osorio

Calle Selva 23 apt. 502
Cuicuilco Insurgentes
Del. Coyoacan

Mexico D.F. 04320
Mexico

Tel:

Fax:

E-Mail: haluro@prodigy.net.mx

Jonas Palm

Arkivråd (Director, Head of Division)
Riksarkivet (National Archives)

Bevarandeyrån (Division of Preservation)

P.O. Box 12541
SE-102 29 Stockholm
Sweden

Tel: +46 (8) 6301 545

Fax: +46 (8) 6309 233

E-Mail: jonas.palm@riksarkivet.ra.se

Dave de Roure
Department of Electronics and Computer Sciences
University of Southampton
Highfield
Southampton
SO17 1BJ
United Kingdom

Tel: +44 (1703) 592 418
Fax: +44 (1703) 592 865
E-Mail: dder@ecs.soton.ac.uk

Dietrich Schüller (Chair of Sub-Committee)
Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften
Phonogrammarchiv

Liebiggasse 5
Tel: +43 (1) 4277 29 601
A-1010 Wien
Austria

FAX: +43 (1) 4277 9296
E-Mail: dietrich.schueller@oeaw.ac.at

Invited Guests

Jean-Marc Fontaine
Universite Paris 6 CNRS
Laboratoire d'Acoustique Musicale
11 rue de Lourmel
75015 Paris Cedex
FRANCE

Tel: +33 (1) 5395 4330
FAX: +33 (1) 4577 1659
E-Mail: jmfontai@ccr.jussieu.fr

Marie-Thérèse Varlamoff
Director, IFLA PAC Programme
Bibliothèque Nationale de France
2 Rue Vivienne
75084 Paris CD 02
France

Tel: +33 (1) 4703 8726
FAX: +33 (1) 4703 7725
E-Mail: marie-therese.varlamoff@bnf.fr

UNESCO Officer

Abdelaziz Abid
Division of Information and Informatics
UNESCO
1 Rue Miollis
75015 Paris
France

Tel: +33 (1) 4568 4496
Fax: +33 (1) 4568 5582
E-Mail: **Error! Reference source not found.**

Annex 3

Evaluation of Nominations for Approval as MofW Projects

Project 1-03: *Musical Vestiges of Ancient Peruvian Civilisations.*

This project nomination should be passed to the Culture Sector as it focuses on archeological artefacts/objects. The comparison of the artefacts with written and iconographic sources is scientifically challenging but, in the Sub-Committee's opinion, does not justify a MofW project.

Project 2-03: *Nesvizh - a Cultural Centre of Europe and a National Monument*

The Sub-Committee was unable to reach a clear view of this project proposal because of a lack of information. Information about the following aspects in particular was missing:

- the quantitative dimension of the project;
- technical details of the intended digitisation process;
- a plan to ensure preservation of and access to digital substitutes in the long-term

The Sub-Committee also discussed whether to recommend making photographs of the collection first and to use those as the basis for scanning.

Project 3-03: *Central American Image Archive Project*

The project erroneously suggests that

- DVD is archival - which it is not, as it is a substantially data-reduced format,
- DVDs are non-degradable - in fact they are amongst the most fragile media available at this time.

Further, the project fails to give clear information about the quantity of material to be copied. From the 1200 tapes held by the Military History Centre alone, it may be assumed that the total number of video tapes would be much higher. Given the presumably poor state of the original tapes (e.g. sticky shed syndrome) and the consequent time-intensive preparation before transfer, the project is probably over-ambitious in its time-scale. The Sub-Committee also suggested that the project should be based on formal agreements with participating institutions both within and outside Nicaragua.

Project 4-03: *Ethiopian Manuscripts and their Oral Commentaries*

This project is well prepared and may already be under way. Still, there are some questions/remarks:

- Microfilms: The microfilms obviously suffer from vinegar syndrome. The cheapest way to safeguard them is copying to polyester films.
- Oral memory: Does the project intend to record the oral memory of the last informants or to preserve already existing audiovisual documents. A recording project would be part of Culture/Intangible Heritage.
- There is no information about how digital data will be preserved.

Project 5-03: *Digital Archive of Selection of Manuscripts of the Works of Persian Poets: Firdousi, Hafez and Saadi*

The term "Archive" for this project is misleading. An archive is a repository holding unique documents aiming at safeguarding them for the long term. The project proposed by CENTRICA is rather a "digital library" or a "data base", if not just a publication.

Technically, information is missing on how the digital data will be preserved.
cf also Project 10-03

Project 6-03: *Registering the Documentary Heritage of Latin America and the Caribbean*

The inclusion of preservation practices in such a data base is most important. No further technical implications at this stage.

Project 7-03: *Union Catalogue of Ancient Mexican Collections*

The submission is dated November 2000. It was suggested that the technical aspects of this project proposal should be updated.

**Project 8-03: *Uzbekistan - Navoi State Library,*
Project 14-03: *Uzbekistan - Al Biruni Institute***

Both projects are similar as they have microfilming of text documents of various kind at the core of their planned activities. Both are requesting expensive microfilm equipment but with no obvious intention to co-operate (perhaps they do not know of each other). Contact between the two projects is suggested with the aim to possibly co-operate. Failing this, the two institutions should be asked to demonstrate the need to have two similar sets microfilm equipment. Additionally, the following points have been raised:

- If two sets of equipment are indeed needed, would it not be better to have the same product?
- The aspects of digitisation are too vaguely formulated, no details of preservation of, and access to, digital objects are given.
- What kind of training is required ?

Adolf was asked whether the Czech National Library could send an expert to explore the problem

Project 9-03: *Documentary Heritage Preservation and Access in Tajikistan: Support for National Capacity Building*

Marie-Thérèse recommended that the National Library of Kazakhstan be included in the Project. No technical implications.

Project 10-03: *Tajikistan - Digital edition of the manuscript of Ubayd Zakoni's "Kulliyat" and Hafez Sherozi's "Gazalliyt"*

A plan for the preservation of the digital objects is missing. A joint venture between UNESCO and CENTRICA should make CENTRICA responsible for the preservation of the digital objects until they can be preserved by Tajikistan. *(This could also be applied to Project 5 – Persian Poets)*

Project 11-03: *Tamil Palm Leaf Manuscripts*

The project is of high professional level. The technical details require, however, work to update them.

Project 12-03: *Ukraine - Preserving and Publishing the Manuscripts of A. Krymsky*

This aim of the project is obviously the publication, and not the preservation of the works of Krymsky. If preservation is an issue, a more articulate project should be forwarded.

Project 13-03: *UNESCO Club Yekaterinburg*

This project covers both Tangible and Intangible Heritage and should be referred to the Culture Sector.

Project 15-03: *Support for Education about Digitisation for Serbian Information Specialists*

This proposal is for training about digitisation and not the preservation of specified documents. The project does not, therefore, meet the requirements for a MofW-Project.

Project 16-03: *Images of an Invisible Country - Teleanalysis and Recovery of Chile's Audiovisual Memory*

The project is of high historical interest. Technically, however, the nomination is totally inadequate. It proposes to "preserve" 47 U-Matic tapes of the Pinochet era by transferring them to DVDs.

- DVD is not archival - as it is a substantially data-reduced format,
- DVDs are amongst the most fragile media available at this time. *(cf Project 3-03)*

It is recommended that the work be out-sourced to a professional video preservation specialist. Regardless of the choice of appropriate technology, this would most probably be cheaper than 16.000 USD, the project's budget estimate.

Project 17-03: *National Library of Kazakhstan*

The project proposes the microfilming of 4300 pages of newspapers at a cost of 6500 USD. This was felt to be expensive and it was suggested that the UNESCO office in Almaty be asked to assist by looking into this matter.

UNESCO Memory of the World Programme

Sub-Committee on Technology

Meeting held in Paris on February 6th and 7th 2004

Action Points Arising from the Meeting

Agenda Point 4 - Recordable CDs and DVDs

The SCoT agreed to write a one page document to warn about the dangers posed by inferior quality blank discs. **Dietrich Schüller** to prepare a first draft.

The IASA Technical Committee to be asked to discuss with the U.S. National Institute of Standards and Technology the lack of a mention of the importance of recording quality in its the publication *Care and Handling of CDs and DVDs - A Guide for Librarians and Archivists*. **George Boston** to approach IASA.

Agenda Point 5 - report on the Meeting and Co-operation with Manufacturers

Discussion with the Audio Engineering Society Historical Committee required about the AES being the recipient of technical production data from companies that have ceased to make magnetic tape products. **George Boston** to make initial contact with the AES and **Dietrich Schüller** to make contact with the companies.

Agenda Point 6 - Charter on the Preservation of Digital Data

The elevation of the status of the Programme to that of a Convention to be raised with the IAC by **Dietrich Schüller** with the assistance of **Abdelaziz Abid**.

Agenda Point 7 - Publications to be Considered for Inclusion on the MofW Programme List of References

7a - Colin Webb: Guidelines for the Preservation of Digital Heritage

Jonas Palm, Dave de Roure and Dietrich Schüller to prepare comments about the lack of scientific data and over-friendliness to CD-Rs.

7d - Additional Publications

Abdelaziz Abid to investigate the possibility of UNESCO publicising the European Commission Project SEPIA.

A need for similar documents on film and videography was identified. **George Boston** to approach the CCAAA for their assistance.

A need for guidelines for the preservation of documents on traditional materials including palm leaves. A volunteer to prepare a first draft needed or a suggestion for a possible author.

A small technical leaflet on preservation for screen and print for the work of the MofW. **Jonas Palm** to prepare a first draft.

Agenda Point 8 - Revision of Safeguarding the Documentary Heritage

The authors of the various chapters of the first edition are asked to read their work and to update it. **George Boston** to co-ordinate the first drafts. He would like to receive them drafts by July 1st 2004.

Agenda Point 9 - Survey of Endangered Audiovisual Carriers

The scope of the Survey to be enlarged to include a wider range of institutions. **George Boston and Dietrich Schüller** to discuss.

Agenda Point 12 - Any Other Business

Marie-Thérèse Varlamoff and Jonas Palm to suggest an expert on traditional materials such as palm leaves to join the sub-committee.