



MINISTRY OF  
EDUCATION

# TRANSFORMING EDUCATION



Produced by:

The Education System Transformation Programme (ESTP)

5th Floor, Building One

Ministry of Education

2-4 National Heroes Circle

Kingston 4

Printed by Hot Off the Press



2004-2015



NOTES



# TRANSFORMING EDUCATION—

SUMMARY REPORT



2004-2015

## NOTES

**Report prepared by:** Jean Hastings - Director, ESTP

**Book Design:** Toni Ann Rankine & Conrad Hamilton

**Publisher:** ESTP, Communications Team

**Printers:** Hot Off the Press

**Photographs:** Anthony Thomas

**Acknowledgements:**

The writer acknowledges the dedicated and proficient staff of the Change Management Unit (CMU) of the ESTP who have worked tirelessly to enable the achievements of the aims and objectives of the ESTP towards transforming the education system. The staff of the Ministry who were involved in the design, and development of various areas of the transformation, either in the modernisation, legislative change or curriculum and assessment or other change initiatives are here recognised and commended for their hard work which has brought us to this juncture in transforming our education system. All are encouraged to stay the course.

To our Ministers and Permanent Secretaries who have lead the process, we wish to say thank you for staying the course over very trying circumstances and changing economic fortunes. There is light at the end of the tunnel, we are not yet where we want to be, but we have not been standing still, progress has been achieved. There is much for us to celebrate.

**Copyright:** © Ministry of Education, ESTP, 2015

## NOTES



**The newly constructed Cedar Grove Academy in St. Catherine.**

"As is expected in an undertaking of this magnitude several challenges were encountered; however, there was a momentum to stay the course. This momentum was sustained by the groundswell of public support for a transformed educational system and the political will to chart a new direction as evidenced by the Joint Parliamentary Resolution, which was signed in October 2003."

*-Dr. Rae A. Davis, Chairman of the 2004 Task Force*

An excerpt from the 2004 Task Force Report on Educational Reform Jamaica

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	Transforming Education	1
2.0	World Bank Loan: 7815-JM Education Transformation Capacity Building Programme	2
3.0	Implementation Status and Factors Affecting Implementation	3
4.0	Government of Jamaica Financing	5
5.0	IDB Loan: 2301/ OC– JA Education Sector Reform II	5
6.0	Project Management, Operations Plan & Governance Arrangements	6
7.0	Factors Affecting Implementation & Impact	6
8.0	Project Finance	7
9.0	Actions for Sustainability—Post Completion Operations	7
10.0	Lessons Learned	8
11.0	Assessment of Outcomes	9
12.0	Risk Assessment	10
	APPENDICES	11
i.	Status of the Recommendations of the Task Force on Education Reform	
ii.	Task Force Report on Education Reform 2004 Targets for 2015	25

## 2. TASK FORCE REPORT ON EDUCATION REFORM 2004 TARGETS FOR 2015

MEASURES	TARGETS BY 2015	BASELINE	ACHIEVEMENTS
Percent of children achieving mastery at Grade 4 Language Arts	85%	57%	77.4%
Percent of children achieving mastery at Grade 4 Numeracy	75%	38%	58%
Mean Score at GSAT for each subject	85%	Maths – 44.9%, LA – 47.98% Science 46.09% Social Studies 50.24% Comm. Task 53.42%	60% 62% 68% 63% 75%
Percent of cohort attaining Grades 1 – 3 in 5 CSEC subjects including Math & English	60%	30.4% (2008)	38.6%
Percent enrolled in Tertiary & post-secondary	50% - 100%	32.8%	28.9%
Number (Percent) of citizens with internationally recognized & portable certificates, diploma etc.	100%	48097	65646
Percent of Primary schools providing at least 4 co-curricula activities	100%	Data not collected	77%
Percent of secondary schools providing at least 8 co-curricula activities	100%	Data not collected	87.3%

141. The allocation of resources should be demand driven rather than by reference to employment levels in schools.	Yes	J-TEC has been established to monitor labour force needs and ensure that the education system is demand driven
142. Conduct a detailed analysis on the model for funding student instead of institutions to determine, inter alia, mechanisms for disbursement and amount of funds per student at the various levels of the education system	Beyond Scope	
143. Undertake further study to determine feasible sources of funds to meet the increased requirements of the Education System. This will include but not limited to the following:  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◇ Retain the cost sharing scheme and consider the efficacy of increasing School Fees</li> <li>◇ Education Debenture</li> <li>◇ Private Investment in Education</li> <li>◇ Multi-lateral loan and grant funds</li> </ul>	Yes	One of NET's directives is to explore different funding sources for physical facilities. This includes support from Diaspora and public private partnerships.

# TRANSFORMING JAMAICA'S EDUCATION SYSTEM

## 1.0 Transforming Education

**Introduction & Background:** The Education System Transformation Programme (ESTP) is the response to the assessment of the education sector's performance as outlined in the Task Force on Education's (TFE) Report of 2004. The ESTP is an all-embracing set of actions designed to result in the desired standard of performance of the sector and to put in place systems to ensure greater accountability at all levels of the sector for the quality of delivery of education. The World Bank financed project was originally designed to support the implementation of the ESTP by focusing on capacity building within key sector agencies emerging out of the implementation of the recommendations of the TFE report of 2004. The key sector agencies which emerged from the mandate to transform Jamaica's education system for which Bank financing was to be applied were the National Education Inspectorate (NEI), Jamaica Teaching Council (JTC), National Education Trust (NET) and Regional Education Agencies (REAs). The Bank was to provide co-financing dedicated to specific activities of these agencies. A link with specific eligible expenditures was seen as necessary due to the tight budgetary position in Jamaica in 2009/2010 which saw competing priorities among various programmes. It was deemed that unless Bank financing was explicitly linked to specific inputs, there would be a high risk that funding would not be available to finance the programme even if it was recognised as a high priority for Jamaica's development objectives. Programme funding was therefore established using a result based funding arrangement tied to set disbursement linked targets.

**Programme Concept & Rationale:** The Government of Jamaica (GOJ) in 2005 made a significant investment in the design of its transformation and modernisation programme which had strong bi-partisan and national support for the reform of the education sector. Funding originally provided by GOJ was used to significantly increase access to school spaces and to develop plans and programmes which were intended to transform the education landscape through the efforts of the Education Transformation Team whose efforts was organised through various work streams which addressed issues related to (i) increasing space access (ii) improvements in governance & leadership (iii) curriculum teaching & learning (iv) modernisation of the sector for improved accountability (v) behaviour management. In 2009 the ETT was replaced by the ESTP with the function to implement the reform initiatives being vested in a Change Management Unit of the ESTP. The significant change saw the initiatives being brought within the Ministry to implement the change from within. A cornerstone of the ESTP is the establishment of independent agencies which would be accountable and give dedicated focus to important functions of the Ministry of Education. These entities, the NEI, JTC, NCEL, NET, Curriculum and Assessment Agency (CAA) and REAs (now the Central Ministry (CM) & Department of School Services (DSS) would be vested with specific functional responsibilities that would allow for increased accountability, performance and regulation and delivery of quality education services. In addition to those entities which were to be established with funding from the World Bank, the GOJ also funded the establishment of two other agencies that had responsibility for the regulation of the tertiary sector in Jamaica (J-TEC) and the coordination of parenting initiatives and programmes in line with policy and legislation enacted in 2012 (NPSC).

The rationale for the Bank's involvement in the ESTP was informed by its extensive experience working in the education sector in Jamaica and the solid relationships with key stakeholders. Though the ESTP had strong local support, the reform needed both financial and technical support to ensure implementation and the positive impact on education outcomes desired. Given the Bank's expertise and flexible lending instruments the Bank signed the

<sup>1</sup>The ETT was established as a body reporting directly to the Minister of Education to design and develop the change initiatives that would lead to the transformation of the education system.

<sup>2</sup>NCEL evolved from an aspect of the JTC that was to treat with developing and empowering Principals to lead their schools. However as the reform evolved it was determined that a dedicated entity was needed giving the critical role of leadership in enabling improved school performance.

<sup>3</sup>The CAA – Curriculum & Assessment Agency will not be established as it was determined that given other changes to the transformation and modernisation plan the functions were best vested in the core Ministry which ultimately has direct responsibility for national standards which are core to a Ministry of education.

loan for the Education Capacity Building Program with the GOJ in March 2010.

**Goals & Objectives:** The ESTP aims at more effective and efficient education service delivery by expanding access, improving teaching and learning, and transforming the governance structure of the education system. This is a sector-wide programme to be implemented over a ten-year period and commenced in 2005. The transformation of the governance structure comprised a core element of the programme. It sought to bring greater levels of accountability and improved quality to the system by: (a) decentralizing decision-making and service delivery (b) institutionalizing effective systems of accountability at all levels (c) increasing the quality and capacity of teachers and administrators; (d) strengthening monitoring and evaluation to provide more targeted support to schools; and (e) creating mechanisms to mobilize more and consistent resources to meet educational needs. NET was designed to be the vehicle through which the MOE would secure a consistent and reliable source of funds to support capital programmes in education with a particular focus on, but not limited to infrastructure. The mechanisms were to be established to attract funding from the Diaspora, the private sector, and other sources.

## 2.0 World Bank Loan: 7815-JM Education Transformation Capacity Building Programme

**The Education Capacity Building Programme:** The project was designed under three (3) components and though, as the programme evolved, there were modifications to some elements within the components, the three components remained as the basic elements of the *Education Transformation Capacity Building Programme*.

### Component 1 – Enhanced Performance & Accountability

**National Education Inspectorate (NEI):** The loan funds provided support to assist in the establishment of a systematic inspection process and a baseline (including a management information system) on school and student performance through contracting of inspectors, training, and resources to carry out inspections in approximately 954 (100%) public primary and secondary schools over the period between September 2009 and March 2015. This is intended to enable greater accountability as well as, to improve the quality of education.

**Jamaica Teaching Council (JTC):** Loan funds also assisted in establishing and implementing a registration and licensing system for teachers (including a management information system), and in developing and carrying out an in-service teacher training programme to support the licensing system and professional development of teachers.

**The National College for Education Leadership (NCEL):** This entity was initially conceived to be an operational arm of the JTC, however it was realised early in the execution of the programme that the mandate and scope of what NCEL was designed to undertake required focus and a governance arrangement that would enable its growth as a premier leadership development body. The NCEL is that body that ensures school leaders are informed and equipped to execute the policies and programmes of the Ministry of Education. It is intended to improve the standards and qualifications for school principals and education leaders, including training of current staff and preparation of future leaders and managers to move into positions of leadership. NCEL also provided training in collaboration with the National Council on Education (NCE) for school boards and school inspectors as required by the NEI as well as, other key staff that support school management such as Bursars.

**Central Policy Ministry (CPM) & Department of School Services (DSS):** Resources of the loan were used to provide, technical assistance and training to build capacities of the CPM and DSS staff in order to effectively carry out the functions identified for the policy Ministry and to be able to give more direct support to schools (through the DSS) based on areas identified in the School Improvement Plans (SIPs). Training of School Boards was also to take place to assist them in improving and providing better leadership to schools and carrying out the mandates of the Education Act and Regulations, as well as, new legislation enacted to support the transformation of the sector. This will allow for Boards to participate more effectively in school leadership. The training is to be provided through NCEL in collaboration with the

<sup>4</sup>REAs were initially piloted in two Regions however it became very evident that this delegation of operational responsibility for service delivery would not work for the education sector and would not result in the ability for equitable allocation of resources to improve system performance. It was decided that the concept of REAs would be replaced with the establishment of a Department of School Services (DSS) as the operational arm of the Central Ministry (CM) which would focus on setting policy, standards and quality assuring and monitoring the delivery of education services. The DSS does not have delegated authority but operates under devolution of responsibility as agreed with the Ministry's Permanent Secretary.

132. Develop and disseminate handbook for schools/PTAs re: best practices to encourage parental involvement.	Yes	This has not been done through the PTA's exclusively. The Parenting Support Commission has created "parenting places" and provided materials to guide parents and schools about parental roles in education.
133. Implement voluntary Homework/ Extended Learning Time Programmes in partnership with the school community. The programme is to be supervised by a rotating team of teachers.	Beyond Scope	
134. Establish school-parent-child contracts to foster parents' participation and in which parents work with teachers in charting the progress of the children.	Beyond Scope	
135. Establish Parent Teacher Associations where non-existent, provide parents with opportunities to handle responsibilities in the school as necessary, and provide training in literacy and parenting skills for parents as needed.	Yes	The NEI looks for active parental involvement as part of the inspection process. If it is not evidence, recommendations are made for improvement
136. Revitalize and promote November as Parent month. Publicize theme, awards, competitions et cetera.	Yes	National Parenting Support Commission promotes Parent Month
137. Establish a clearing-house for private sector companies to facilitate their support of the education sector	Yes	NET provides this function
138. Collaborate with Ministry of Information on existing Values and Attitudes program	Beyond Scope	
<b>Finance</b>		
139. Government should re-evaluate the level of resources that it will commit to the education system, since it is clear that previous notions of what is required (as articulated in the 2003 Parliamentary Resolution), will not achieve the objectives outlined herein. This should be done after a fine-tuning of the quantum of the resources required to transform the Education System.	Yes	Government of Jamaica has contributed significantly to the transformation programme.
140. Government should examine ways of increasing private and institutional participation in providing education services	Yes	NET has been established specifically for this purpose



120. Improve on provision for special sitting of examinations for special needs students.	Beyond Scope	
121. Foster and facilitate acceleration and enrichment for the gifted and talented at all levels, and implement a small number of well resourced magnet schools coupled with on-day-per-week "pull out" regime for the exceptionally gifted	Beyond Scope	
<b>Stakeholder Participation</b>		
122. Enforce system-wide implementation of student councils at the secondary and tertiary levels.	Beyond Scope	
123. Develop a Student Council Manual	Beyond Scope	
124. Recognise national student bodies deemed to be representative of students at the Secondary and Tertiary levels.	Beyond Scope	
125. Provide institutional support for approved student bodies at the secondary and tertiary levels	Beyond Scope	
126. Students to be part of teacher and principal evaluation process.	Yes	Students are surveyed as part of NEI inspections. This is a school assessment and reflects the evaluation of principals and teachers.
127. Performance criteria for principals to include existence and functioning of a student council	Beyond Scope	
128. Implement community outreach programme to encourage volunteerism, similar to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◇ Jamaica All Age Schools Project</li> <li>◇ School Community Outreach Programme (SCOPE)</li> <li>◇ "Change from Within" Project</li> <li>◇ "Basic School Enhancement" Project</li> </ul>	Beyond Scope	
129. Develop standardized scorecard (measurement of school's performance in academic and non-academic areas against objectives), including criteria and methodology for school to disseminate information the school community. Include school performance against national and regional averages.	Yes	Standardised NEI reports with recommendations are prepared, drafts returned to the schools and all outstanding issues resolved. When finalised, the reports are posted on the Ministry's website.
130. Disseminate scorecard and other performance information to the school community each year.	Yes	See above
131. Design system to send examination reports to each parent to include: child's score vis-à-vis national, regional and school's average score.	Beyond Scope	

NCE. The loan also provided resources to support the build-out of an Enterprise School Management System (ESMS).

### **Component 2: Mechanisms to Mobilize Resources to the NET**

**The National Education Trust (NET):** The National Education Trust was established as the vehicle through which the Ministry of Education will secure a consistent and reliable source of funds to support capital programmes in education with a particular focus on, but not limited to, infrastructure. The NET, under its Articles of Incorporation, is empowered to receive endowments, bequests, borrow and lend and participate in the bond market for the purpose of raising funds to support investment in activities that are education priorities. The loan supported the provision of mechanisms to mobilize resources to the National Education Trust (NET) by funding the cost to implement a marketing and public awareness strategy to mobilize resources for the NET, as well as, development of NET's financial capability to manage investments and the NET's "education trust fund" and a firm specialising in organization development was engaged to ensure the organization is structured to meet its obligations and commitments in an optimal way. Training for NET and other relevant GOJ staff in the use of public-private partnership arrangements was also funded.

### **Component 3 – Communications, Project Management and Monitoring & Evaluation**

This component covered the required management and administrative support for effective implementation of the loan programme. The loan supported:

The implementation of a **strategic communications** strategy to ensure ownership of the transformation and modernization process across all levels and allay anxiety and fears among staff and key stakeholders resulting from the organizational changes.

The Project management function guided and quality assured the execution of the project activities with strong support of a robust monitoring & evaluation framework as well as, coordinated the provision of **staffing, training, purchase** of necessary equipment, technical assistance and materials for programme management, and to meet other operating costs.

Support from the Ministry's Programme Monitoring and Evaluation Unit (PM&EU) and technical assistance allowed for the conduct of **process and summative evaluations** of the ESTP, as well as some formative evaluations and associated annual external audits of programme financing and compliance constituted a strong monitoring and evaluation framework.

### **3.0 Implementation Status and Factors Affecting Implementation**

**Status of implementation:** By the end of the loan period (March 31, 2015) the project would have met and in some instances exceeded the targets set. The modernization activities which the loan supported saw to the establishment of the following agencies – the NEI, JTC & NCEL, as well as, the design of a CM & DSS and provided support for organisational development activities, a marketing campaign and the establishment of a financial and investment system for NET. All agencies are operational and support systems are at an advanced stage of completion.

**NET** obtained its legal status having been incorporated as a government company in December 2010. NET has provided oversight for construction activities in about 12 schools exceeding the 10 school construction activities established as a target under the World Bank project. Though it has not been able to implement any Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) activities, it has worked in close collaboration with the Development Bank of Jamaica and the Ministry of Finance to try to overcome the obstacles to this posed by Jamaica's current economic circumstances. NET has launched its marketing campaign and has engaged with donors who have provided support through donations, satisfying the target which was set. Its online portal has been positioned to provide for crowd funding, reaching out to Jamaicans in the diaspora, as well as others wishing to donate funds to support education. It has under the direction of its Board defined its purpose and developed its three year business plan.

The **NEI** has developed a rigorous inspection system and inspection handbook and completed inspection of all public institutions in Jamaica at the primary and secondary levels (954), thus providing for the first time in Jamaica's history, a baseline of school performance from which to inform empirically the Ministry of Education's support and initiatives aimed

at improved performance and school improvement. This will have exceeded the target of 80% of school's inspected by the end of the loan. The NEI has provided policy recommendation and valuable information to support school improvement; in excess of 90% of schools inspected have used the inspection reports to inform the development of their School Improvement Plans (SIPs), exceeding the 60% target set originally. By the end of the loan programme the NEI will have in place an inspection system enable through the use of technology that will be efficient and cost effective. The NEI is currently negotiating with the Ministry of Education in the Turks & Caicos Islands (TCI) to develop an inspection system for that country.

The **JTC** currently has registered on its electronic portal 95% of the approximately 25,000 teaches in the system, meeting target. The original target of 50% of teachers licenced had to be removed and was replaced by 95% of teachers registered on the JTC's electronic system. The change was necessary as licencing requires legislative authority and though the requisite legislation was drafted and extensive consultation done, its passage has been affected by persistent resistance from the body representing teachers (the Jamaica Teachers Association [JTA]) and has not yet been approved. It is expected that the bill will be tabled in Parliament by June 2015. The JTC has however been providing support for the professional development of teachers through Quality Education Circles (QECs) meeting the target of 95% of teachers being trained within their (QECs); the JTC has also implemented a "Beginning Teacher" mentorship programme. It has been promoting efforts to raise the standing of the profession and recognising excellence in the profession through annual awards to teachers during international teachers' week in October each year. The JTC is a leading member of the international association of Teaching Councils.

The **NCEL** began training of sitting Principals in 2012 and to date has trained 595 Principals and Education Officers under its Effective Principals Training Programme (EPTP), exceeding the target of 500 which was set. The College under contract with the University of the West Indies (UWI) has also trained 40 aspiring Principals under the Aspiring Principals Training Programme, certified by the UWI at the level of a diploma. The College has developed a peer coaching programme and programmes to improve performance of school bursars, leadership of mathematics instruction by Principals and is currently developing leadership programmes for other levels of leadership in the education sector including the tertiary level. NCEL was awarded for its innovative programmes by the Canadian Development Office in its "Bright Star" awards programme in 2014. The College has extended its reach and has commenced training of Principals in the British Virgin Island and has received requests from other Caribbean territories to extend its Principals training programmes to them.

Approval for the establishment of a re-engineered MOE through a **Central Ministry** focused on policy, setting of standards and quality assuring delivery of education services along with its operational arm the **Department of School Services (DSS)** was obtained from the Honourable Minister of Education and Public Sector; a functional profile and operations manuals and process maps have been developed, documenting the work processes that will obtain in the modernised ministry. Job descriptions for the changed functions are 60 per cent completed and a Performance Monitoring & Accountability System (PMAS) was rolled out in April 2014 to ensure improved system accountability. Transitioning to new jobs in the Ministry and emerging agencies has commenced and about 20 per cent of staff from the Central Ministry has transitioned into new jobs, above the target of 10 per cent. Critical to the efficiency of the system is the way the modernised MOE will employ technology to improve service delivery. The Bank has funded work leading to the establishment of an **Enterprise School Management System, a Human Resource Management System and a Document Management System** as well as portals linked via the MOE's website for all the new agencies. These initiatives will vastly improve service performance and will assist in realising one of principal objectives of the TFR.

**Stakeholder Communications:** The project has exceeded targets set for stakeholder communications. Twenty-seven (27) staff meetings will have been conducted by March 31, 2015, in line with the target set, to inform on the modernisation; since 2010 monthly newsletters (The Educator) have been published, as well as a semi-annual

<sup>5</sup>QEC – Mechanism through which schools are grouped for service delivery and support of the Regions and to promote the operation of schools in a community of practice.

107. Revitalize the Jamaica Combined Cadet Force under the aegis of the Jamaica Defence Force	Beyond Scope	
108. Encourage secondary school students to help other students by way of mentoring and peer counselling, as part of their service learning activities	Beyond Scope	
109. Hire Social Workers and personnel from allied professions to provide services throughout the system as needed.	Yes	There are social workers in the Regional Offices.
110. Counselling in teachers colleges that should also form part of continual professional development and be a requirement for licensing of teachers.	Beyond Scope	
111. Promote public education through commercials on consequences of violence in schools	Beyond Scope	
112. Encourage summer camps for boys, in particular, that are geared toward esteem building, values, attitudes and sports.	Beyond Scope	
<b>Special Needs</b>		
113. Embark on a "child find" to ensure that special needs children are identified and referred for testing and appropriate services.	Yes	The Special Education initiative supported by the ESTP has completed the "child find" initiative. Children with special needs have been identified. Appropriate service has not yet been provided for all those identified through "child find".
114. Implement system for the early detection of children with special needs, to begin at the early childhood level	No	Not yet in place.
115. Transfer the Special Education Unit functions to each REA	Yes	While a Special Education Unit exists within the Ministry, special education resource personnel are also available in the regional centres.
116. Introduce mandatory training (course work) in the nature and needs of the special child, and diagnostic and prescriptive teaching, for all pre-service and in-service teachers	In Process	Special Education Policy is currently being developed
117. Embark on public education programme for awareness and understanding of special needs.	In Process	Special Needs Coordinator has worked with numerous stakeholders to raise the awareness and understanding of special needs
118. Provide focused education to parents of special needs students.	Yes	Through the National Parenting Support Commission
119. Include special needs students in the regular classroom setting with the appropriate support services and instructional materials for the different groups of learners including resource rooms where necessary	In Process	Special Education Policy is currently being developed

100. Establish a system that identifies the actual children in need of nutritional support, and ensure that they receive the support; building on other existing programmes such as the social Safety Net Program. For example, school grants could be disbursed to families rather than institutions, through a voucher system.	Yes	The School Feeding Programme identifies children in need of nutritional support and provides meals.
101. Widen stakeholder base to include school gate vendors in order to monitor the type and nutritional quality of commodities sold, and prevent the peddling of drugs to children.	No	While some schools have teachers serving as greeters, their primary purpose is to monitor students as they enter school and to prevent the peddling of drugs to children.
102. Form strategic alliances with the Ministry of Health to provide: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◇ Health screening of students upon entry to primary and secondary levels.</li> <li>◇ Dental, optical and other preventive health services.</li> <li>◇ Parenting education information at health centres and hospitals on nutrition and healthy lifestyles.</li> </ul>	Yes	Strategic alliances have been established with Health in the delivery of PATH and through the Parenting Support Commission.
<b>Anti-Social and Violent Behaviour</b>		
103. Implement a citizenship education program in schools, including values and attitudes, character education, patriotism, service learning, and the importance of co-curricular activities. Build on existing programmes and initiatives such as Values and Attitudes, PALS, Change From Within, et cetera.	Yes	Included in new HFLE curriculum which was developed in 2013. Also included in parent forums
104. Promote greater involvement of parents in order to strengthen the link between home and school.	Yes	The Parenting Support Commission and PTAs are promoted to encourage greater links between home and school.
105. Improve the aesthetics, including adequate green areas and implement first-level maintenance of the physical plant	Beyond Scope	
106. Strengthen co-curricular activities including sports and cultural arts and others such as Scouts, Girl Guides, 4-H clubs et cetera.	Yes	SIPs emphasise and NEI inspectors look for active co-curricular programmes in schools.

publications (Transformation News) with wide circulation across the sector to inform on the modernisation and transformation of the education system. In excess of 24 public consultations were conducted to garner public buy-in for legislative and policy changes as well as, changes in teaching and learning consequent on the transformation of the sector. In addition, outreach to engage the wider public with respect to promoting the brand of new and emerging agencies was done using various media such as radio, television and the press. A supplement was produced and circulated in one of the daily newspapers giving national exposure to the transformation initiative and agenda.

#### 4.0 Government of Jamaica Financing

The **Jamaica Tertiary Education Commission (J-TEC)** has received support from the World Bank through consultation, reports on the tertiary sector and significant connections being facilitated by the Bank, its operations and establishment was however primarily funded by the GOJ which to date has committed approximately US\$12 million to support the ESTP's agenda. The modernisation programme under the ESTP also saw to the legal establishment of a **National Parenting Support Commission (NPSC)** funded by the GOJ that has enhanced the activities of the modernised ministry by strengthening the home/school relationship, through coordination of various parenting initiatives, advocacy and support to parents. In just over two (2) years, the NPSC has established its brand across Jamaica.

The **legislative agenda** is significantly advanced with all the required legislation and consequential amendments to the Education Act, a School Improvement – Special Measures Policy to empower the Ministry's intervention in chronically underperforming schools and Special Education and Security and Safety policies drafted and awaiting approval. The JTC and J-TEC bills have been drafted with consultation on the former completed and only preparation of the draft legislation by the Chief Parliamentary Council (CPC) and tabling now remaining. The J-TEC bill is currently with the CPC for review while consultations are to be concluded. It is expected that this bill will be tabled during this legislative period.

The GOJ jointly with the IDB has provided funding for the **curriculum and assessment** as well as Special Education initiatives, critical to the improved performance expected of the system.

The GOJ along with the World Bank will **fund the development of technology based solutions** to improve efficiency of the MOE's operations.

#### 5.0 IDB Loan: 2301/OC-JA Education Sector Reform II

With just one year remaining, activities funded under the IDB Programme have also shown progress. The **Special Education Project** has completed the evaluation of students who were identified under the **Child Find initiative**. All reports are being prepared for the seven thousand students assessed and the findings are being shared with their parents or guardians. The seminal report that will provide an indication of the level of special needs in the school system is to be delivered to the Permanent Secretary and the Minister by the end of the first quarter of 2015. During 2014 the Special Education component rolled out training in the Proficiency Pathway a guide to the management of instruction at the primary level, finalised work on the Alternative Programme for Secondary Education, a new and inclusive approach through which secondary education will be offered, and provided significant inputs to the Ministry's School-Wide Positive Behavioural and Intervention Support (SWPBIS) behaviour management programme through its Team Teach and Autism PRO endeavours. The Special Education Project made significant contributions to capacity building and provided tremendous support to Regions through the introduction of Special Needs Coordinators in all Regions.

In the area of **curriculum and assessment development** significant work has been done. It is of note that there is also funding support from the GOJ in these areas.

**Piloting of the National Standards Curriculum (NSC)** has begun in 48 schools island wide, the profile for the **Grades 2 & 9 diagnostic exams** has been completed, and work now continues to develop the Primary Exit Profile (PEP) to replace the GSAT. The curriculum and assessment developmental activities are quite significant and are expected to guide the transformation of Jamaica's Education output. It is expected that this will change the approach

from the traditional transactional approach to teaching and learning, to that of a child-centred and caring transformational approach, focusing on the development of skills and competencies of the whole child.

Our support continued for the **Literacy and Numeracy** teams who have continued their efforts towards achieving or nearing the 2015 millennium development goals for literacy and numeracy.

The IDB stands out as one of the few development partners still willing to lend for social infrastructure. The loan provided for the **construction of the 1200 capacity Cedar Grove High School** in St. Catherine and during 2015 will see to the **extension of BB Coke and Balaclava High Schools** in St. Elizabeth, by adding 320 student places in each school.

The IDB over the loan period has also supported the ESTP with Technical Corporation grant funds to support the education initiatives and ensure the quality of the outcomes.

## 6.0 Project Management, Operations Plan & Governance Arrangements

Project management was part of the overall responsibility of the Director of the ESTP in guiding, managing and coordinating project activities related to procurement, financial management, project planning, scheduling and monitoring of the implementation of the project activities. The activities of the various funding sources complemented each other in supporting and enabling the activities of the transformation and modernisation programme, managed through the **Change Management Unit (CMU)** of the ESTP. Operations plans were set annually and monitored monthly through a **comprehensive review committee** involving all areas of the programme. Weekly performance monitoring meetings were conducted with CMU staff to motivate and nurture and to ensure the programme remained on target as well as, to resolve issues that arose. Critical process owners in the MOE were identified to lead in the development of programme activities, guiding the development and implementation of activities. The governance arrangements for oversight included a **Steering Committee Chaired by the Permanent Secretary** of the Ministry which initially met quarterly and eventually (from 2012) met every six months. For the oversight of the modernisation of the Ministry which saw to the establishment of new entities as well as the re-engineering of the core Ministry, a **Modernisation Management Team (MMT)** was established with wide representation from a representative cross section of Ministry staff, this working group was Chaired by the Director, ESTP providing a forum for discussions and strategic input to the modernisation effort. The MMT reported to a **Modernisation Steering Committee (MSC) Chaired by the Minister of Education and Co-Chaired by the PS**. The MSC is comprised of union representatives and members from the MOF, Cabinet Office and the PIOJ and was the body that approved and or sanctioned change initiatives and plans, prior to seeking national approval from The Cabinet.

## 7.0 Factors Affecting Implementation & Impact

Two factors had an adverse impact on implementation; (i) procurement and (ii) the changing economic environment in Jamaica. Procurement was delayed due to the very bureaucratic processes for large (value) services, specifically the procurement of the NEI inspection system which experienced delays both due to the local process as well as, delays at the Bank. This in part affected the project's time line which influenced the extension of the loan programme. The significant devaluation of the Jamaican dollar vis-a-vie the US dollar over the life of the loan also affected implementation along with the restrictions placed on government expenditure consequent on the GOJ entering into an agreement with the IMF. This affected the approved budgetary limits granted to the project from 2012 to the current period. There is also some positive impact which came about from the mode of implementation which allowed for additional project outputs over what was initially envisaged. One output which is expected to have a significant impact is a **study of the institutional analysis of schools** to determine the appropriateness of the institutional arrangements

<sup>6</sup>The Child Find is an initiative designed to identify children with special needs who are in our general education settings. The initiative was conducted across all grades at the primary level.

89. Rationalize the available primary school capacity, determine additional space required and build schools to meet this space demand.	In Process	A school rationalization study is currently being conducted
90. Rationalize the available secondary school capacity; determine additional requirements including those from the converted Junior High and All Age schools, as well as those retained in the high school system for the additional grade 12 year; then build the required schools to meet the projected consequent demand	In Process	A school rationalization study is currently being conducted
91. Eliminate the shift system and include the number of students in the shift school in the above rationalization processes for primary and secondary	In Process	Between the period 2009 to 2014 a total of 18 schools were removed from the shift system, representing a 15% reduction over the period. Currently, there is a gap of 98 schools or 85% of public schools that remains on the shift system.
92. Incorporate the needs of learners into the design of schools, including accessibility for the physically challenged and support for co-curricular activities	In Process	One of the strategies contained in the Education Sector Strategic Plan 2011 – 2020 is the provision for students with exceptionalities. The plan is to have 75% of secondary institutions delivering equitable service by 2020.
93. Locate new schools as integral components of communities	In Process	Rationalisation of schools consultancy currently underway.
94. Implement National Action Plan for Environmental Education in each school.	Beyond Scope	
95. Provide adequate resources for the proper preventive and corrective maintenance of the school plant.	In Process	This will be assisted through the efforts of NET
96. Involve the private sector and community in school maintenance	In Process	NET has begun to inventory school maintenance needs and to communicate them to the Diaspora. School Boards and PTAs are aware of school needs through the NEI reports. This
97. Include maintenance (and condition) of school in each principal's performance criteria.	Yes	Included in NEI reports which are tied to SIPs
98. Design and implement solid waste management and landscaping programs for each school.	Beyond Scope	
<b>Health and Nutrition</b>		
99. Develop and implement nutritional policy for schools.	Yes	The Programme of Advancement Through and Health and Education benefits all needy students and provides an opportunity for improved nutrition. The school feeding programmes help ensure improved nutrition. The HFLE curriculum provides instruction in good nutrition.

78. Introduce a discrete student ID e.g. birth certificate number	In process	The DSS has introduced a discrete student identification that will be part of the integrated School Management System.
79. Develop GSAT reporting format to include profile of the performance on the test in order to obviate any school based testing for assessment/placement in Grade 7	In process	GSAT assessment will comprise three components viz. (i) Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS), in Mathematics, English, Social Studies, Science, (ii) Performance tasks, administered at school by the teacher, using aesthetic education to provide the context for assessment in the same four subject areas. Initially the performance tasks will not be heavily weighted, but introduced gradually so as to build teacher and public confidence in this new aspect. SAU will supply the assessment tasks, scoring rubrics and monitor the implementation of the performance tasks. (iii) Tests of verbal and quantitative reasoning, which will not be curriculum based.
80. Retain non-academic components of the ESP and incorporate in the school curriculum	Yes	New Standards curriculum incorporates non-academic performance. Procedures for assessment of the non-academic component are not yet developed.
81. Incorporate the location of secondary schools relative to population distribution in the capacity rationalization of schools.	In Process	A rationalization study of schools is currently underway
82. Determine demand for Grades 12-13 spaces with emphasis on the geographic distribution and implement additional spaces.	Beyond Scope	
83. Take into consideration the distance from home to school when allocating GSAT places.	Beyond Scope	
84. Examine feasibility of implementing a national school bus service throughout the island.	Beyond Scope	
85. Provide fiscal incentives for private investment in educational facilities (including boarding) throughout the island.	Beyond Scope	
<b>Facilities</b>		
86. Embark on a program to rehabilitate and upgrade schools to international standards	Yes	Through NET, 12 school construction activities have been undertaken. It should be noted that IMF restrictions have reduced GoJ's opportunity to incur debt or enter into public private partnerships that would accelerate the rehabilitation of education facilities
87. Rationalize existing school spaces at the primary and secondary levels to produce 2 school types, K-6 and 7-12	In Process	Currently undergoing a consultancy to assist with the rationalisation of schools
88. Convert all primary, primary and junior high and all age schools to primary or secondary	In Process	Some schools have been converted

to meet the ever expanding demand placed on schools. This study brought schools, the final point of education service delivery, into focus and stands as a significant unintended output of the Education Transformation Capacity Building Programme.

## 8.0 Project Finance

Of the US\$16 million World Bank loan fund it is estimated that US\$15.500 million will be drawn down, this includes US\$500,000 in retroactive financing and US\$40,000 handling fees. Approximately US\$500,000 will be left undisbursed (to be written back). For the IDB financing of US\$15 million, expenditure at the end of programme is estimated at US\$12.2 million, approximately US\$1.8 million will be undisbursed (it is yet to be determined if this will be written back). The project will record significant foreign exchange loss of approximately US\$70,000.

## 9.0 Actions for Sustainability – Post Completion Operations

**Transition arrangements:** Transition of project activities to emerging agencies and the core Ministry are in place and was enabled due to the way activities were executed. These were executed by identifying process owners from the Ministry who lead in the development of the various activities supported by the loan. The same is true for those who head the agencies that have been established and are operational – they lead as the process owner. Activities are therefore institutionalised and transitioning arrangements are expected to go smoothly.

**Technical, financial & institutional arrangements:** The new and emerging agencies are staffed with the technical expertise required for their sustainability and from inception staff cost was being funded by the Ministry of Education. The financial arrangements for the sustainability of operations are already reflected in the GOJ's budget allocation for the Ministry of Education for the financial year beginning April 2015. The institutional arrangements for the sustainability of the new functional arrangements are substantially in place. NET is incorporated as a government company under the direction of a Board of Directors. The framework document for the NEI was completed and Cabinet submission prepared to commence the legal establishment for the NEI as an Executive Agency; the JTC will be established legally as a statutory body as soon as its support legislation is made into law. This is expected to be tabled in Parliament by June 2015; the NCEL's functional profile was completed and Cabinet submission drafted for approval to have that body legally established as a support agency of the MOE. Other agencies though not funded by the World Bank (J-TEC, NPSC) are also advanced, with the NPSC already legally established as a Commission; J-TEC's legislation is being drafted and is also expected to be tabled during the current legislative period. The Central Ministry and DSS functional profile are completed and approved and the modernised organisational structure completed; 15% of staff has transitioned into the new agencies and the core ministry.

**Staffing & Management:** The agencies though not yet operating at full staff complement have between 40 – 70% of their staff complement. For the core Ministry, the full staff complement will be subject to the approval of the MOF, where it is hoped that the opportunity to right-size the Ministry will be provided.

**Policies & legislative arrangements:** Review for Special Education Policy is 100% completed and consultations as required, scheduled. NEI Framework and Cabinet Note for the operations of the CM & DSS structure has also been completed. Cabinet submission for NEI framework has been submitted for approval; School Improvement/Special Measures Policy is completed, regional consultations have also been completed and the policy document circulated for Ministries, Departments and Agencies consultations; the Safety & Security Policy is 95% completed; review and recommendations for change of the Education Act and Regulations is completed and drafting instructions are being

<sup>7</sup>At the inception of the loan the exchange rate was US\$1=J\$85.5, current exchange rate is US\$1=J\$115.7; additionally the World Bank's exchange rate on average had a difference of approximately J\$2 dollars lower than the official exchange rate in Jamaica which had an impact on the amount of the overall fluctuation due to the variations.

prepared, final review of the JTC Bill has been completed and final drafting instructions are being prepared for submission to the CPC for preparation of draft Bill for tabling in Parliament by June 2015.

**Performance Indicators for Impact Evaluation:** In 2012 a study was commissioned to develop performance indicators to be used for impact evaluation. The study notes that “*These current reform efforts acknowledge that while the main thrust behind the national urgency for education transformation is poor student performance, the operational efforts must also, of necessity, address institutional as well as instructional issues facing the system. The ESTP aims at ensuring more effective and efficient education service delivery by expanding access, improving teaching and learning, and transforming the governance structure of the education system.*” The study along with the performance indications of the TFR and those detailed in the National Education Strategic Plan (NESP) (a deliverable of the ESTP) are comprehensive indicators for impact evaluation.

### 10.0 Lessons Learned

Issues related to the nature (a complex and significant change process) of the project affected execution within the timeframe originally planned, this may not have been sufficiently factored during project preparation. The project was designed to support a change process which was complex as it would be implemented while the recurrent obligations of the MOE would have to be met. This resulted in competing demands on the time of staff to work through the change process while attending to the current demands for delivery of education services. For projects of this nature greater flexibility needs to be factored in establishing timelines.

Another significant factor that had an impact was the changing economic circumstances, particularly the effect of the agreement entered into by Jamaica with the IMF. This had the effect of changing the GOJ’s priorities; most noticeably the priority that had to be given to legislative reform to support the agreement with the IMF. Given that only the CPC can draft legislation those areas of the MOE legislative reform were not given the immediate attention that may have been expected at loan signing. The sensitivity and awareness of the Bank to the impact of this was not given immediately recognition. So too was the resulting impact on the targets and conditions which affected fiscal space and hence budgetary allocation and the pace of execution. It was these which eventually resulted in the restructuring of the project, allowing for changes to targets in the results matrix and disbursement link targets (DLTs). The support provided by the Bank’s supervisory officer facilitated the reformulation and the understanding of the impact of the changed circumstances. This enabled the project to respond creditably to these significant macro-economic changes.

On the part of the executing agency, the changes in administrative and political leadership meant that for such a significant change process time had to be spent to brief, convince and gain approval of new leadership on the path taken in the change process. This had an impact on the pace of execution, an issue unforeseen at the start of the project.

The success of the modernisation ultimately rests on the ability and willingness of the internal and related stakeholders to embrace change. This was recognised early and efforts were made to support the required culture and mind-set change critical to success. This proved to be one of the most challenging of the tasks embodied in the programme and came about almost as a by-product of the change process. The economic climate also made for a less than ideal environment within which to modernise and re-engineer the business of education service delivery. It is recommended that future change initiative that are as complex should as a pre-cursor seek to condition the minds of stakeholders to make them more receptive to the idea of change before the hard-core initiatives are implemented. The public and policy makers need to become involved in such a critical area of economic development. While the expectation of the system has not yet been realised, the MOE has not been standing still, there have been successes and while we should all pause to celebrate we will continue to work on the recommendations of the Task Force Report (*see Appendices 1 and 2 with progress on targets as at the end of March 2015*) not yet realised as a Ministry of Education as well as, a government.

All Age, and the Primary and Junior High Schools through the utilization of existing spaces in these schools occasioned by GSAT placement machinery.		
• Introducing the 2-year/3-year track to CSEC examinations based on the Grade 9 results.		
<b>Assessment</b>		
70. Rationalise the national assessments by ceasing the administration of the SSC and JSC	In Process	Work is on going on the finalization of the structure of the National School Leaving Certificate.
71. Standardize the grading system throughout the education system for improved tracking of student progress	No	
72. Administer and score Grade 1 Readiness Inventory at the kindergarten level prior to entry (May/June). Inventory to be administered at the receiving primary school after registration in May.	Yes	The Inventory is administered from the 3rd week in August to the 2 <sup>nd</sup> week in September as part of the orientation process for the new entrants to primary school. At this time students have registered but not yet started the Grade 1 programme.
73. Implement a monitoring and verification system for Grades 1 and 3 tests to ensure the integrity of test results.	Yes	The “Grade 3” Diagnostic Test will in future be administered at the end of Grade 2. Thus, there will be one year remaining for the students to continue experiencing the integrated curriculum in Grade 3 if enrichment or intervention is needed before moving on to the discrete curriculum in Grades 4 – 9. The assessment instruments are developed by SAU, and teachers are trained to administer, score and report the results. Regional Officers and SAU monitor the administration of Grade 1 and Grade 3 tests to ensure integrity.
74. Administer the Grade 4 test externally.	Yes	This test of literacy and numeracy is administered externally by SAU. Students must be certified literate to proceed to prepare for GSAT.
75. Results of Grade 9 assessment to be used to place students either on: ◇ 2-year track to CSEC up to Grade 11 OR ◇ 3-year track to CSEC up to Grade 11-2 (Sit Basic Proficiency at Grade 11 and General Proficiency at Grade 11-2)	In Process	Grade 9 assessment results will be used for diagnosis and placement in CSEC or TVET programmes in Grades 10 – 12.
76. Submit each child’s detailed test results to his/her parents/guardian	In Process	Detailed student profile reports are included in the work of the consultants currently working with SAU
77. Introduce a profile card for each student for recording academic, co-curricular and community activities. This should be a transferable record with internal and external test results, health status and other student information that moves with the student throughout his/her school career. This information should be recorded in a central database as part of the integrated Management Information System (MIS).	In Process	Profile reporting will be included among the deliverables of the consultants currently working with SAU.

		An assessment library to be set up with a bank of assessment tasks that teachers can use for classroom assessment to support implementing the new curriculum.
57. 'Curricularise' the CSEC syllabus (convert the CSEC syllabus to standard, outcomes based curriculum format) and ensure that smooth progression exists between Grade 9 and CSEC.	In Process	Mathematics and some Science subjects were identified as areas where this has started. E-learning Jamaica has also worked with teachers to expand and elaborate the CSEC syllabuses in a number of subject areas.
58. Undertake a comprehensive evaluation of the grades 7 – 9 common curriculum	Yes	This has been done through the new Standards Curriculum for grades 1 – 9
59. Incorporate non-academic components of ESP in the curriculum	Yes	New Standards curriculum that is being piloted incorporates non-academic performance.
60. Develop and deploy specialist curriculum teams to monitor and support curriculum implementation.	Yes	This has been done in support of the new Standards Curriculum. The curriculum implementation includes Monitoring and Evaluation. In addition, the Monitoring and Evaluation Unit of the Ministry has conducted a review of the monitoring process and provided suggestions for enhancement.
61. Train principals and other school leaders in curriculum implementation including timetabling skills and management of teaching and learning using distance modalities as appropriate.	Yes	NCEL has provided professional development for 42 school leaders whose institutions are piloting the New Standards Curriculum.
62. Expedite the implementation of the I.C.T. Policy currently in draft form.	Beyond Scope	
63. Train all teachers in the use of information and communications technology.	No	This is not yet possible as the Ministry cannot provide access to computers in a manner that would ensure all teachers have regular access. However, NCEL has provided an ICT Leadership programme to 70 leaders who are involved with the Tablets in Schools Project
64. Provide Internet access to all schools using wireless technology if necessary.	No	Reliable internet is not yet available at all schools.
65. Promote and encourage the use of public and school libraries, and transform public libraries	Beyond Scope	
66. Establish classroom libraries in each school, especially at the primary level.	Beyond Scope	
67. Establish maximum class size for Grades K-3 as 20 and Grades 4-6 as 30 and secondary as 25.	Beyond Scope	
68. Expedite the implementation of the Early Childhood Development curriculum in all Early Childhood facilities including the training of Early Childhood practitioners.	In Process	Is an emphasis of the NESP and a priority for the Minister
69. Implement a seamless K to 12 system to include children ages 5 at the lower end of the system and an additional year at the upper end. This will result in an expansion of the number of years of schooling from 11 years to 13 years by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increasing the number of infant departments attached to government</li> </ul>	In Process	The new Grade 9 assessment that will be written by all Grade 9 students will be diagnostic in intent and used to provide a profile report on students' strengths and weaknesses. This will identify whether students need additional time or intervention before proceeding to sit for the CSEC examinations or whether alternative programmes (e.g. TVET) are more aligned with their strengths and abilities.

## 11.0 Assessment of Outcomes

Areas of Assessment	Assessment of Outcomes	Ratings
<b>6.1.</b> Relevance of objectives, design & implementation	The objectives as outline in the result matrix proved relevant and the design of the project was also effective and valid meeting the needs of the MOE's transformation agenda. The design for implementation with a CMU integrated into the operations of the MOE created an integrated matrix operation that proved effective for sustainability and institutionalisation of the project goals and objectives.	<b>Highly satisfactory</b>
<b>6.2.</b> Quality Assurance Monitoring Report	The QA monitoring reports/ results matrix were effective for monitoring outputs which was useful to ensuring project performance and achievement remained on target.	<b>Highly satisfactory</b>
<b>6.3.</b> Implementation & Utilization Report	Implementation of any change process can be difficult and complex, the project therefore faced those typical challenges of time, culture and competing demands but was able nonetheless to achieve substantially the targets and objectives set. The M&E strategy was critical in meeting expectations.	<b>Highly satisfactory</b>
<b>6.4.</b> Achievement of development objectives	The development objectives were appropriately defined and substantially achieved.	<b>Highly satisfactory</b>
<b>6.5.</b> Assessment of achievements	The targets set were substantially achieved. Those that presented a challenge were related to legislative change and or reform which was outside the control of the project. These were change when the project was reformulated.	<b>Satisfactory</b>
<b>6.6.</b> Institutional Strengthening	Significant contribution was made in this area both through the process of execution and the fellowships awarded for capacity building.	<b>Satisfactory</b>
<b>6.7.</b> Unintended outcomes & impact	There were some unintended outcomes due to required added project activities which were not in the initial design. These were largely positive in their effect.	<b>Satisfactory</b>

## 12.0 Risk Assessment

Risk Elements	Risk Assessment	Risk Mitigation
7.1. Political	Over the period of execution there was a change in political administrations as well as administrative head of the MOE, which saw two Ministers of Education and three (3) Permanent secretaries. The risk level was <b>negligible to low</b> as the project objectives were seen as priorities.	The fact of the programme having bi-partisan support proved an effective mitigating factor.
7.2. Economic/Financial	The Jamaican economy saw declining fortunes over the 4 year period of execution with the exchange rate moving from US\$1=J\$85.5 to US\$1= J\$115.7 which impacted the project and cost. The macro-economic changes impacted the budgetary allocation due to shrinking fiscal space which affected the pace of execution and ability to achieve full drawdown of the loan. The risk level is assessed as <b>significant</b> .	Over the life of the project effective contract negotiations and significant input to execute project activities assisted in minimising the effect of the tight fiscal space and declining economic fortunes.
7.3. Sustainability	As at closing there was high expectation that the gains from the project would be sustained and supported as a priority of the MOE. The economic condition and tight fiscal monitoring imposed due to Jamaica's relationship with the IMF is cause for caution, hence risk level is assessed as <b>moderate</b>	All objectives have been substantially implemented and the effective stakeholder communication which gained significant buy-in for the objectives of the programme augurs well for the gains being sustained even if build-out is slowed due to financial constraints.
7.4. Organisation Culture	Changing behaviour is challenging and will take effort and consistent implementation of the new accountability framework to ensure the results based performance culture demanded by the transformation of the sector. For this reason the risk level is rated as <b>moderate</b> .	Training was provided for "mind-set change", leadership and support for improved competence and performance which it is hoped will change the performance culture within the MOE.

Curriculum		
50. Develop and implement a clear and transparent policy to guide curriculum review and development, cross-curricula themes and issues across subject areas, resource allocation, training, articulation and sustainability issues, and integrate the visual and performing arts in the design and delivery of curriculum	In Process	Webb's (1997) Depth of Knowledge approach has been adopted as the underlying theoretical framework for curriculum review and revision for Grades 1 – 9 to guide alignment between curriculum standards and assessment. A focus on STEM and ICT has been infused into pedagogy in all subject areas. At the same time, the performing arts are used to "drive the curriculum" at all grade levels, and also included as a discrete subject at Grades 4 – 9. TVET is also integrated into the Grades 1 – 3 curricula and is taught as a discrete subject in Grades 4 – 9.  Assessment, with an emphasis on formative assessment of thinking skills, is also integrated across subject areas. CSS is working with JTEC to ensure that the changes to the National Curriculum are reflected in changes to courses at the teachers' colleges.
51. Review the curricula at early childhood, primary and secondary levels and ensure articulation at the various transition points.	Yes	Particularly at the Grade 6 to 7 transition point in the National Standards curriculum, attention has been paid to ensuring that articulation between the two levels, which was not there previously, is now in place. In addition, the emphasis on an integrated approach and assessment of skills such as critical and strategic thinking in the New Standards Curriculum should provide a solid foundation for achievement at Grades 10 – 12
52. Conclude and expedite the curriculum development process for ECD.	Beyond Scope	
53. Conclude and distribute the standards document for the administration of ECD facilities	Beyond Scope	
54. Develop and implement curriculum standards and outcomes for all subjects at every primary grade level	Yes	This has been done through the new Standards Curriculum for grades 1 – 9
55. Expedite the development and delivery of the programmes and material for Windows for Literacy	No	Substituted with other materials
56. Expedite the delivery of material to support the integrated primary curriculum	In Process	An online space has been created for teachers in the Pilot to share concerns and seek assistance from CSS as they implement the New Curriculum. CSS monitors this space to provide prompt responses. Curriculum Implementation teams set up in the schools as part of the pilot (Principal, members of the community, PTA, Grade Coordinators, Heads of Departments, School Based Coordinator, Culture Agents, persons with ICT knowledge)  The "Tablets for Schools" programme will be a part of this effort as access to curriculum content including the approved textbooks and supplementary texts is to be provided via this means.  Material to support school principals and members of the schools' curriculum implementation teams in implementing 'formative assessment walk-throughs' to monitor implementation in the pilot classrooms.



37. Ensure all teacher's hold Bachelor Degrees in Education or, for those with degrees in other disciplines, Diplomas in Teacher Education	No	Not possible without the approval of the legislation.
<b>Curriculum, Teaching and Learning Support – Learn to Read</b>		
38. Assess students and determine need for remediation, specifically in reading	Yes	Students are assessed at Grade 4.
39. Train and provide remediation specialists (approx. 400) on medium term contract throughout the REAs	Yes	The national literacy programme has resulted in the hiring of literacy specialists who reside in regional offices and support the work of literacy coaches in each school. The coaches are working to build capacity for the teaching of reading within the schools.
40. Train approximately 5,000 teachers' aides to support primary school teachers with remediation	Yes	While the magnitude is not 5,000, a significant number of literacy coaches support the work of teachers in Jamaica's schools.
41. Appoint literacy coordinators at each school	Yes	This has been achieved through the national literacy programme.
42. Develop and implement a public awareness campaign around the value of early literacy	Yes	Materials have been developed by the National Literacy Team
43. Reinstigate the national "Drop Everything and Read" remediation programme	No	Have substituted with other initiatives
<b>Curriculum, Teaching and Learning Support – Read to Learn</b>		
44. Implement a menu of remediation options including: I. Taking students out of grade, providing parallel remediation and subsequent reintegration II. Leaving students in grades and providing a mixed grade delivery III. Support with information technology IV. Use of reading specialists and reading resource rooms/reading laboratories V. Emphasise language arts and mathematics for three academic years	Yes	While resources for item iii. are limited, all of these options have been introduced a varying levels throughout the education system.
45. Determine and procure resources required for remediation including specialists, teachers' aides, curriculum, IT	Yes	This has been achieved through the National Literacy Programme
46. Expand the Master Teacher's corps and use competent English language and mathematics specialists to train teachers in classroom and workshop settings	Yes	While not achieved exactly as envisioned, teachers are receiving direct and effective professional development through the involvement of specialists who sit in their classes and work with them on the development and delivery of teaching plans.
47. Use ICT to teach difficult concepts via distance	No	This has not yet been achieved system wide but is envisioned by JTC and NCEL
48. Encourage teacher exchange programme and the sharing of facilities and resources	Yes	This has been achieved through the establishment of 63 Quality Education Circles where teaching professionals meet to discuss challenges and solutions. This has resulted in the sharing of resources and exchanges (including student exchanges).
49. Incorporate knowledge of the physiological and psychosocial differences between boys and girls into the entire teaching	Yes	Incorporated into HFLE which is integrated across the core curriculum

# APPENDICES

## 1. STATUS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE TASK FORCE ON EDUCATION REFORM

RECOMMENDATION	STATUS	COMMENT
<b>Governance and Management - Establish a new model of governance with students at the centre and</b>		
1. Strengthen governance and management at the school level	Yes	Professional development of school board members
2. Establish Regional Education Authorities to support schools	Yes	Not established as recommended by the Task Force as the structure would result in it being impossible for the Minister to execute his/her responsibility to the people. Department of School Services and the Regional Office organisation result in the devolution of the responsibilities as envisioned by the Task Force while maintaining the Minister's authority to manage education on behalf of the people.
3. Restructure the Ministry of Education to be a policy Ministry	In Process	Approval has been obtained and a functional profile and operational manual developed. Job descriptions are 60% complete.
4. Restructure the support institutional framework	Yes	This has been achieved through the creation of the NEI, NCEL, NET, J-TEC, NPSC. Student assessment remains within the DSS. J-TEC has the responsibility for articulation of tertiary education and is developing an accreditation strategy that includes the UCJ.
5. Make school boards accountable to Regional Education Authorities for the operation of schools	Yes	This has been done in a more collaborative way than had been envisioned. The school boards and the Regional Offices work together to enhance learning through the development and implementation of School Improvement Plans. Principals are responsible to both the Boards the Ministry for the delivery of the plans
6. NCE cease the practice of inviting Members of Parliament to recommend School Board Chairmen	Yes	The school visits and interviews did not reveal any indication that Chairs were selected by Members of Parliament. However, it is possible that this is the case and also possible that some of the original appointees remain. Principals spoke of supportive Board Chairs who were committed to good school governance and positive student outcomes.
7. Train and certify board chairmen and board members in board governance	Yes	Board chairs and members have received training through the World Bank supported element of ESTP
8. Board holds Principal accountable for objectives and performance targets of Strategic Plan	Yes	The Strategic Plan is the School Improvement Plan. The Principal is responsible to both the Board and the Ministry for the implementation of the SIP.
9. Train Principals in school management and leadership	Yes	A total of 547 Principals and Education Officers have participated in the Effective Principals' Training Programme. Thirty individuals have completed the System and School Leaders' Coaching Programme, thirty principals have completed Leadership of Place and 911 Principals and Department Heads have participated in the Leadership of Math programme.
10. Make Principals responsible for school management, including teaching	Yes	The NEI reports, which are tied to the SIPs evaluate schools on effective teaching. The principal, supported by the Board and DSS, is the person responsible for implementing the recommendations of the NEI reports.

11. Establish REAs as semi-autonomous agencies under the Ministry's portfolio to monitor school performance and provide specialist support	No	The regional offices are not semi-autonomous but rather part of the DSS. However, their function reflects the spirit of this recommendation: the education officers (housed in the regional offices) monitor school performance and specialist support exists within each regional office.
12. Support to schools will be provided by REA curriculum implementation teams	Yes	School support is provided through the Regional Office. NEI inspection reports reveal that curriculum implementation teams exist in schools.
13. Employ specialists such as guidance counsellors, reading specialists, etc. regionally and teachers at the school board level	Yes	The Regional Offices provide specialist support and teachers are employed by schools. It should be noted that the MOE has introduced a voluntary relocation programme to assist with staffing schools at optimum levels.
14. Restructure the Ministry of Education so that its functional areas are policy development, projects, information and communication, research, finance, human resource management and financial audit. Agencies and other public bodies will concentrate on delivering policy	In Process	The structure is approved and the jobs are in the process of being described.
15. Outsource certain functions to a network of private and public support institutions. This might include student assessment, professional development, curriculum development, teacher registration and licensing, institution registration and accreditation and quality assurance.	Yes	See 4 above.
<b>Accountability - Design and implement Performance-Based Management System, to include rewards and sanctions, for all staff in MOE</b>		
16. Reward teachers based on improved student achievement	No	However, the new PMAS involves the setting of annual objectives that should lead to improved student achievement. The teacher and the principal or department head work together to develop and monitor achievement on an annual work plan.
17. Reward teams/departments within schools based on increased student performance in specific subject areas	No	However, the new PMAS involves the setting of objectives that should lead to increased student performance. See 16 above.
18. Reward school management teams based on overall school performance	No	School management teams can only be rewarded on their inputs to overall school performance. Quite rightly, members of management teams are rewarded for their efforts (agreed upon with the principal and Board) to increase school performance.
19. Reward Ministry and other support Institutional staff based on national performance	No	Again, Ministry and other support staff are recognized for performance that leads to positive student outcomes nationally.
20. Develop strategic plans at all levels within the education system. Plans would include clearly defined objectives, measures and targets, as well as strategies and actions required to achieve the targets.	Yes	School Improvement Plans are prepared for all schools. Annual plans are developed from the SIPs
21. Implement monitoring and reporting systems within the MOE, support institutions and schools to focus on achievement of targets	Yes	Schools report to the regional offices and to the DSS on their progress which is monitored at both levels of the system. Boards also hold principals accountable for performance on the annual plan. In addition the reports and recommendations from school inspections are shared with the school, the Board and the DSS for inclusion in

22. Implement monitoring and reporting systems within the MOE, support institutions and schools to focus on achievement of targets	Yes	Schools report to the regional offices and to the DSS on their progress which is monitored at both levels of the system. Boards also hold principals accountable for performance on the annual plan. In addition the reports and recommendations from school inspections are shared with the school, the Board and the DSS for inclusion in annual action plans.
23. Implement monitoring and reporting systems to support institutions and schools to focus on achievement of targets	Yes	See 22 above
24. Implement a comprehensive Management Information System to collect, collate and analyze information	Yes	The system exists but is not yet computerized.
25. Publish information on a timely basis at the school, community and national levels	In Process	Over 200 of the NEI reports are published on the MOE's website. The NEI is in the process of putting up its own portal and has ceased populating the MOE's site knowing that the new portal will be operational within the next month.
26. Conduct an annual National Taxpayer Satisfaction Survey to get stakeholder feedback	No	There is significant consultation through the broad membership of School Boards and PTAs
27. Conduct annual parent and community satisfaction surveys to get feedback on performance of schools	Yes	The NEI surveys parents as part of the inspection process.
28. Redefine the role of school bursars to permit a greater focus on accounting	In Process	This is part of the development of the DSS. NCEL plans to launch a programme in School Financial Management and Administration for Bursars, Assistant Bursars, Clerical Assistants and others with financial responsibilities during the second quarter of 2015.
29. Employ a uniform electronic accounting and reporting system	Beyond Scope	
30. Develop procedures to ensure accounting is current within 2 weeks of the end of each month. Implement and support effective sanctions to ensure compliance	Beyond Scope	
<b>Management and Organisation of Teaching</b>		
31. Renegotiate the leave entitlement of teachers and principals	Beyond Scope	
32. Establish a clear position on the length of instructional time and number of working days for which teachers are employed	Beyond Scope	
33. Provide training programmes in leadership and management for all principals	Yes	Completed through NCEL. See 9 above
34. Retain retired teachers of excellence on fixed contract after retirement	Yes	Retired teachers have been engaged to support many functions within the ESTP. For example, they have served as inspectors for NEI and have served as literacy and numeracy coaches.
35. Develop and implement a licensing and certification system with relicensing occurring every 5 years	No	While legislation has been prepared, it has yet to be considered by members of Parliament.
36. Develop and implement a comprehensive distance education programme for pre-and in-service teachers. This should be offered to in-service teachers outside of school hours	No	While not yet a reality, both JTC and NCEL are seeking to move some of the professional development to an e-learning platform.