



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization



UNESCO  
INSTITUTE  
FOR  
STATISTICS



TECHNICAL  
COOPERATION  
GROUP



## TCG4:

# Report of the UIS about the status of development of the indicators

TCG4/8

16-18 January 2018

Dusit Thani Dubai

133, Sheikh Zayed Road, Trade Centre,

Dubai, United Arab Emirates



## TCG Indicator Development

Indicator	Theme	Issues
4.2.3	Stimulating parenting and homes	Work plan addressing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Definition and measurement of “positive and stimulating home learning environment”</li> <li>- Global comparability of currently available data from different sources</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Data collection in countries at different income levels</li> <li>- Possible modification of indicator</li> <li>- Identification of custodian for indicator</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> Inputs: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Report by Abbie Raikes</li> </ul>
4.3.1	Formal and non-formal education and training	Work plan addressing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Definition and measurement of participation in formal and non-formal education and training (target population, scope, reference period, etc.)</li> <li>- Global comparability of currently available data from different sources</li> <li>- Strategy for harmonized data collection on formal and non-formal education and training</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> Inputs: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Report and work plan by Daniel Capistrano</li> </ul>
4.5.2	Language of instruction	Work plan addressing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Definition of “language of instruction” and “first or home language”</li> <li>- Global comparability of currently available data from different sources</li> <li>- Strategy for harmonized data collection</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> Inputs: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Report by Michael Bruneforth</li> </ul>
4.5.3	Funding formulas	Work plan addressing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conceptual definition of indicator</li> <li>- Measurement of reallocation to disadvantaged populations</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> Inputs: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Report by Michael Bruneforth</li> </ul>

4.6.3	Participation rate in literacy programmes	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Definition and measurement of participation in literacy programmes (target population, scope, reference period, etc.)</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Data collection</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Report and work plan by Daniel Capistrano</li> </ul>
4.7.1	Global Citizenship Education/Education for Sustainable Development	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conceptual definition and measurement of indicator</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Report plus data by Hoda Jaberian (Education Sector)</li> </ul>
4.7.2	HIV and sexuality education	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Definition of “life skills-based HIV and sexuality education”</li> <li>- Measurement and global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Report by Christophe Cornu and Yongfeng Liu (Education Sector)</li> </ul>
4.7.3	Human Rights education	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conceptual definition and measurement of indicator</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Not yet commissioned</li> </ul>
4.a.1	Adapted infrastructure for disabled students	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conceptual definition of indicator</li> <li>- Measurement and data collection</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Not yet commissioned</li> </ul>
4.a.2	Bullying	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conceptual definition of indicator</li> <li>- Measurement and data collection</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul>

		<p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Christophe Cornu (Education Sector) jointly with WHO</li> </ul>
4.a.3	Attacks on schools	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conceptual definition of indicator</li> <li>- Data collection strategy</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Report from the Global Coalition to Protect Education from Attack</li> </ul>
4.b.2	Scholarships	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Data collection and global comparability</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Paper from GEM Report</li> </ul>
4.c.5	Teachers' salaries	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Measurement of "average teacher salary"</li> <li>- Definition of "professions requiring a comparable level of qualification"</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Not yet commissioned</li> </ul>
4.c.7	In-service teacher training	<p>Work plan addressing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Definition of "in-service teacher training"</li> <li>- Disaggregation by type of training</li> <li>- Global comparability of data</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> </ul> <p>Inputs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Not yet commissioned</li> </ul>

## GAML – Indicator Development

Indicator	Theme	Issues
4.1.1.b/c	Reading and Mathematics at the end of primary and end of lower secondary	Work plan addressing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Global comparability with Global Framework for Reference</li> <li>- Definition of proficiency levels and description of levels</li> <li>- Benchmarks, one on each measurement point</li> <li>- Long and interim reporting strategy</li> <li>- Possibility of stand-alone module</li> </ul>
4.1.1. a	Reading and Mathematics in the early grades of primary	Work plan addressing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Global comparability with Global Framework for Reference</li> <li>- Specificities of the indicator</li> <li>- Definition of proficiency levels and description of levels</li> <li>- Benchmark</li> <li>- Long and interim reporting strategy</li> <li>- Possibility of stand-alone module</li> </ul>
4.2.1	ECD developmentally-on-track	Support to UNICEF <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Definition on three domains (learning, health, psychosocial)</li> <li>- Definition of developmentally-on-track on the composite of three domains</li> <li>- Development of reporting scale</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Long and interim reporting strategy</li> <li>- Possibility of stand-alone module</li> </ul>
4.4.2	Digital literacy skills	Work plan addressing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Global comparability with Global Framework for Reference</li> <li>- Definition of proficiency levels</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Long and Interim Reporting strategy</li> <li>- Possibility of stand-alone module</li> </ul>
4.6.1	Literacy and numeracy skills	Work plan addressing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Comparability with expanded Framework for Reference</li> <li>- Definition of proficiency levels</li> <li>- Benchmarks</li> <li>- Implementation options to encourage country participation</li> <li>- Long and interim reporting strategy</li> <li>- Possibility of stand-alone module</li> </ul>
4.7.4	GCED	Work plan addressing more fundamental issues



		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Relevance of global comparability in GCED</li> <li>- Possibility of common definitions and proficiency levels</li> <li>- Target group – age/grade and in/out of school youth</li> <li>- Defining benchmarks</li> <li>- Reporting strategy, use existing ICCS or ‘link’ across existing national assessments</li> <li>- Commission studies to examine the fundamental issues</li> </ul>
4.7.5	ESD	<p>Work plan addressing more fundamental issues</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Relevance of global comparability in ESD</li> <li>- Possibility of common definitions and proficiency levels</li> <li>- Target group – age/grade and in/out of school youth</li> <li>- Defining benchmarks</li> <li>- No existing cross-national assessment except PISA but the assessment might not be repeated</li> <li>- Reporting strategy</li> <li>- Commission studies to examine the fundamental issues</li> </ul>



## Annex. Report to the Education 2030 Steering Committee, June 2017

### Introduction

The current set of 11 global and 32 thematic indicators (see **Annex 1**) for the follow-up and review of the SDG4 – Education 2030 Agenda were developed in the period 2014 to 2015 and agreed in 2016 by the United Nations Statistical Commission (UNSC) and the Technical Cooperation Group on SDG 4 – Education 2030 Indicators (TCG) respectively. Both sets of indicators were subjected to several rounds of open consultations before being finalised and agreed by countries. **Annex 1** shows which indicators are ready for reporting in 2017 and those which will require further development.

The 11 global indicators were developed by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Sustainable Development Goal Indicators (IAEG-SDGs) based on advice from a wide range of sources including countries, international and regional organizations, civil society, academia and the business community. They were agreed by the UNSC in March 2016 and further endorsed by the UNSC in March 2017. They will be formally adopted by the UN's Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) in June 2017 and thereafter by the UN General Assembly.

The 32 thematic indicators were developed originally by the Technical Advisory Group on Post-2015 Education Indicators (TAG) and included in the Education 2030 Framework for Action adopted by UNESCO Member States in November 2015. The indicator framework has been further reviewed and revised by the [TCG](#) formed in 2016. The TCG is responsible for leading the development of the indicators through close cooperation with Member States, civil society representatives and experts from international and regional organizations.

In October 2016, at its second meeting in Madrid, Spain, the TCG approved a set of 29 indicators including the 11 global indicators for reporting in 2017 as well as indicators requiring further methodological development. A number of additional areas were identified for further development, typically on topics not yet well-covered by the agreed sets of indicators. In total, there are 22 indicators including some global indicators, which require further development. To take this work forward the TCG has established a Working Group on Indicator Development (WG-ID) currently consisting of 8-10 participants in the TCG meetings. The WG-ID is responsible for finalising the methodologies for 15 of the 22 indicators. The remaining 7 indicators all concern learning outcomes and will be developed by Task Forces of the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning (GAML) also established by the UNESCO Institute for Statistics in 2016.

The WG-ID and GAML Task Forces are reviewing existing methodologies and data sources for each indicator consulting external experts as appropriate and will make recommendations to the full TCG on the appropriate methodology to use. Once approved by the TCG, the indicators will be added to the list for reporting. The WG-ID is starting work on 7 of the 15 indicators in which members of the group have expertise and for which some methodologies already exist. It is expected to take 12-18



months to complete the development work for all of the indicators identified. The WG-ID presented its draft work plan and set of deliverables for 2017-2018 to the full TCG at its last meeting in Montreal, Canada on 1-2 June 2017.

### Indicators requiring further development

For indicators with existing methodologies, the WG-ID will first need to determine if these are applicable in all parts of the world or whether further development or extension of these methodologies will be required. Where a methodology is agreed, the issue will be to widen the coverage of countries by extending existing surveys to more countries, where possible, including relevant questions in other surveys and/or developing new surveys. The WG-ID will be asked to advise on the most appropriate approach(es) in each case. The WG-ID has begun work on the 7 indicators listed in **Table 1**.

**Table 1: Indicators already in the process of being developed**

No.	Indicator	Action being taken
4.3.1	Participation rate of youth and adults in formal and non-formal education and training in the previous 12 months, by sex	<p>Review of methodologies in existing data sources:</p> <p>Eurostat's Adult Education Survey and Continuing Vocational Training Survey</p> <p>OECD's Programme for the International Assessment of Adult Competencies</p> <p>Review of other potential data sources including national surveys and labour force surveys.</p>
4.4.3	Youth/adult educational attainment rates by age group, economic activity status, levels of education and programme orientation	Simplification taking into account the aim of the target
4.7.1	Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in: (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment	UNESCO's Section for Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship has developed a draft methodology for review by the WG-ID



4.7.2	Percentage of schools that provide life skills-based HIV and sexuality education	UNESCO's Section for Health and Education has developed a draft methodology for review by the WG-ID
4.a.2	Percentage of students experiencing bullying, corporal punishment, harassment, violence, sexual discrimination and abuse	World Health Organization is modifying the Global School-based Health Survey with inputs from UNESCO and the School-Related Gender-Based Violence Working Group
4.c.5	Average teacher salary relative to other professions requiring a comparable level of qualification	Review of existing methodology used by OECD and the identification of suitable comparator professions and data sources on salaries (actual or statutory)
4.c.7	Percentage of teachers who received in-service training in the last 12 months by type of training	Review of existing methodology used by OECD and conceptual and definitional development. A cross-national data collection methodology and instrument need to be developed.

The remaining indicators fall into several different categories. Some indicators have established methodologies and are being collected by other organizations. These methodologies will still need to be reviewed to ensure their applicability across the world and are likely to be addressed by the WG-ID in its next phase of work (see **Table 2**)

**Table 2: Indicators with established methodologies**

No.	Indicator	Survey instrument(s)
4.2.3	Percentage of children under 5 years experiencing positive and stimulating home learning environments	UNICEF's Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey
4.6.3	Participation rate of illiterate youth/adults in literacy programmes	UIS's Regional Module for Latin America and the Caribbean
4.a.3	Number of attacks on students, personnel and institutions	Global Coalition to Protect Education from Attack

The remaining five indicators will require more extensive work and may need to involve external experts and possibly substantial revisions to the originally proposed indicator (see **Table 3**).

**Table 3: Indicators requiring extensive further methodological development**

No.	Indicator	Work required
4.5.2	Percentage of students in primary education whose first or home language is the language of instruction	Conceptual and definitional development.
4.5.3	Extent to which explicit formula-based policies reallocate education resources to disadvantaged populations	Conceptual and definitional development.  Establishment of an assessment tool and method.
4.7.3	Extent to which the framework on the World Programme on Human Rights Education is implemented nationally (as per the UNGA Resolution 59/113)	Identification of experts able to develop a qualitative assessment tool (perhaps similar to that for 4.7.1).  OHCHR has already been approached but has not so far identified the resources necessary to undertake this work.
4.a.1 (d)	Proportion of schools with access to: (d) adapted infrastructure and materials for students with disabilities	Development of definitions
4.b.2	Number of higher education scholarships awarded by beneficiary country	Development of a data collection methodology to cover the many disparate sources of scholarships for study abroad

The TCG also identified additional areas for further development which are presented in **Table 4**. It is expected that this work would not begin until most of the existing indicators have been addressed by the group.

**Table 4: Additional areas for further methodological development**

No.	Target	Additional areas for development
4.3	By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university	Affordability, quality
4.4	By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship	Measures of a broader range of work-related skills than ICTs, other employment-related indicators
4.7	By 2030, ensure all learners acquire knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including among others through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship, and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development	Attitudes and values, life-long learning/non-formal, qualitative indicators
4.a	Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all	Expenditure, national quality standards
4.b	By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training, information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes in developed countries and other developing countries	Support for marginalised students

The Education 2030 Steering Committee is invited to take note of the work of the TCG.

## Annex 1. Global and thematic indicators for the follow-up and review of the Education 2030

### Agenda

Pale blue shading = global indicators

**Red font** = modifications by TCG to original list of 43 thematic indicators presented in the Education 2030 Framework for Action

Target 4.1 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.1.1	Proportion of children and young people (a) in Grade 2 or 3; (b) at the end of primary education; and (c) at the end of lower secondary education achieving at least a minimum proficiency level in (i) reading and (ii) mathematics, by sex	YES	YES
4.1.2	Administration of a nationally-representative learning assessment (a) in Grade 2 or 3; (b) at the end of primary education; and (c) at the end of lower secondary education	YES	
4.1.3	Gross intake ratio to the last grade (primary education, lower secondary education)	YES	
4.1.4	Completion rate (primary education, lower secondary education, upper secondary education)	YES	
4.1.5	Out-of-school rate (primary education, lower secondary education, upper secondary education)	YES	
4.1.6	Percentage of children over-age for grade (primary education, lower secondary education)	YES	
4.1.7	Number of years of (a) free and (b) compulsory primary and secondary education guaranteed in legal frameworks	YES	



Target 4.2 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.2.1	Proportion of children under 5 years of age who are developmentally on track in health, learning and psychosocial well-being, by sex	YES	YES
4.2.2	Participation rate in organized learning (one year before the official primary entry age), by sex	YES	
4.2.3	Percentage of children under 5 years experiencing positive and stimulating home learning environments	NO	YES
4.2.4	Gross <b>early childhood education enrolment ratio in (a) pre-primary education and (b) and early childhood educational development</b>	YES	
4.2.5	Number of years of (a) free and (b) compulsory pre-primary education guaranteed in legal frameworks	YES	
Target 4.3 By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.3.1	Participation rate of youth and adults in formal and non-formal education and training in the previous 12 months, by sex	YES	YES
4.3.2	Gross enrolment ratio for tertiary education <b>by sex</b>	YES	
4.3.3	Participation rate in technical-vocational programmes (15- to 24-year-olds) <b>by sex</b>	YES	
<b>Additional areas for development: affordability, quality</b>		Not applicable	YES



Target 4.4 By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.4.1	Proportion of youth and adults with information and communications technology (ICT) skills, by type of skill	YES	YES
4.4.2	Percentage of youth/adults who have achieved at least a minimum level of proficiency in digital literacy skills	NO	YES
4.4.3	Youth/adult educational attainment rates by age group, economic activity status, levels of education and programme orientation	YES	YES to simplify
Additional areas for development: measures of a broader range of work-related skills than ICTs, other employment-related indicators		Not applicable	YES
Target 4.5 By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.5.1	Parity indices (female/male, rural/urban, bottom/top wealth quintile and others such as disability status, indigenous peoples and conflict-affected, as data become available) for all education indicators on this list that can be disaggregated	YES	
4.5.2	Percentage of students in primary education whose first or home language is the language of instruction	NO	YES
4.5.3	Extent to which explicit formula-based policies reallocate education resources to disadvantaged populations	NO	YES
4.5.4	Education expenditure per student by level of education and source of funding	YES	
4.5.5	Percentage of total aid to education allocated to least developed countries	YES	



Target 4.6 By 2030, ensure that all youth and a substantial proportion of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.6.1	Proportion of population in a given age group achieving at least a fixed level of proficiency in functional (a) literacy and (b) numeracy skills, by sex	YES	YES
4.6.2	Youth/adult literacy rate	YES	
4.6.3	Participation rate of illiterate youth/adults in literacy programmes	NO	YES
Target 4.7 By 2030, ensure all learners acquire knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including among others through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship, and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.7.1	Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in: (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment	YES	YES
4.7.2	Percentage of schools that provide life skills-based HIV and sexuality education	NO	YES
4.7.3	Extent to which the framework on the World Programme on Human Rights Education is implemented nationally (as per the UNGA Resolution 59/113)	NO	YES
4.7.4	Percentage of students by age group (or education level) showing adequate understanding of issues relating to global citizenship and sustainability	NO	YES
4.7.5	Percentage of 15-year-old students showing proficiency in knowledge of environmental science and geoscience	NO	YES
Additional areas for development: attitudes and values, life-long learning/non-formal, qualitative indicators		Not applicable	YES

Target 4.a Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
--	--	-----------------------	------------------------------





4.a.1	Proportion of schools with access to: (a) electricity; (b) Internet for pedagogical purposes; and (c) computers for pedagogical purposes	YES	
	(d) adapted infrastructure and materials for students with disabilities		YES
	(e) basic drinking water; (f) single-sex basic sanitation facilities; and (g) basic handwashing facilities (as per the WASH indicator definitions)		
4.a.2	Percentage of students experiencing bullying, corporal punishment, harassment, violence, sexual discrimination and abuse	NO	YES
4.a.3	Number of attacks on students, personnel and institutions	NO	YES
<b>Additional areas for development: expenditure, national quality standards</b>		Not applicable	YES
Target 4.b By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training, information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes in developed countries and other developing countries		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.b.1	Volume of official development assistance flows for scholarships by sector and type of study	YES	
4.b.2	Number of higher education scholarships awarded, by beneficiary country	NO	YES
<b>Additional areas for development: support for marginalised students</b>		Not applicable	YES



Target 4.c By 2030, substantially increase the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing States		For reporting in 2017	Requires further development
4.c.1	Proportion of teachers in: (a) pre-primary education; (b) primary education; (c) lower secondary education; and (d) upper secondary education who have received at least the minimum organized teacher training (e.g., pedagogical training) pre-service or in-service required for teaching at the relevant level in a given country, by sex	YES	
4.c.2	Pupil-trained teacher ratio by education level	YES	
4.c.3	Proportion of teachers qualified according to national standards by education level and type of institution	YES	
4.c.4	Pupil-qualified teacher ratio by education level	YES	
4.c.5	Average teacher salary relative to other professions requiring a comparable level of qualification	NO	YES
4.c.6	Teacher attrition rate by education level	YES	
4.c.7	Percentage of teachers who received in-service training in the last 12 months by type of training	NO	YES