End-Term Evaluation of the Project "Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing their Learning Outcomes in Gambella and Somali Regional States, Ethiopia"

FOUNTAIN MANAGEMENT CONSULTANCY

May 2017

ADDIS ABABA

ETHIOPIA

End-Term Evaluation of the Project "Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing their Learning Outcomes in Gambella and Somali Regional States, Ethiopia"

Draft Report

Submitted to

UNESCO-IICBA

By

FOUNTAIN MANAGEMENT CONSULTANCY

Consultants
Befekadu Zeleke, PhD
Seleshi Zeleke, PhD

May 2017

Table of Contents

List of Tables

Acronyms

CTE	College of Teacher Education
ETB	Ethiopian Birr
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GRP	Gender Responsive Pedagogy
GSECE	General Secondary Education Certificate Examination
HTPs	Harmful Traditional Practices
KAP	Knowledge, Attitude and Practice
MOE	Ministry of Education
PTA	Parent -Teacher Association
REB	Region Education Bureau
UNESCO-IICBA	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization – International Institute for Capacity Building in Africa
WEO	Woreda Education Office

Executive Summary

The objectives of this study was to conduct an end-term evaluation of the project "Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing their Learning Outcomes in Ethiopia" which was implemented in six schools of the Gambella and Somali regions, three schools in each region.

To achieve the objectives of the project, UNESCO-IICBA in partnership with the Regional Education Bureaus and the schools

(1) Sensitized teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process through training in gender-sensitive pedagogy.

(2) Built the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools.

(3) Strengthened School-Community Partnerships to assist the retention of girls in schools.

(4) Increase the retention of girls in lower secondary grades and improve their learning outcomes through a multi-faceted intervention.

(5) Established income generating schemes to support female students from economically weak families.

The main objective of this end term evaluation was to examine relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and sustainability of the project. To achieve this, both primary and secondary qualitative and quantitative data were gathered using questionnaire, interviews and FGDs from 125 respondents as well as from documents.

Analyses of both the quantitative and qualitative data provided the following results.

(1) In addition to its consistency with the government's policies and strategies, the project was launched after a baseline survey was conducted. The baseline survey reported analysis of the situation in the project schools in general and the needs of female students in particular. It was based on the evidence reported in the baseline survey that the project was launched. Hence it was relevant.

(2) The project's effectiveness was evaluated by examining the objectives and the achievements and the gap between the two. The project was found to be very effective particularly in conducting the training workshops. Through the training, the project has built the capacity of principals, teachers, and PTA members on gender responsive pedagogy, gender sensitive classroom management, and gender sensitive lesson planning which helped the school community particularly those who received the training directly. One problem observed in relation to the capacity building training was the fact that no formal training was conducted at the school level. Even though the trained teachers exerted effort to pass on to their colleagues and students the themes of the training informally they could have been much more productive with a formal training which could have invited a relatively large number of students and teachers.

(3) The efficiency of the project was mainly evaluated based on time and financial efficiency.

The financial efficiency of the project was positively evaluated because the budget has been utilized well for the planned activities. The activities for which the budget was utilized however differ across the project schools. With the same amount of money, in one school a five-room residential block was built along with fence and toilet whereas in another school, only six containers were bought. In the view of the consultants, regardless of their future income generating capacity, the residential block appears to be cost effective than the containers. In fact, currently, the containers are generating income whereas the residential block is not.

With respect to time efficiency, the capacity building training sessions were completed according to schedule. The sessions included training to sensitize teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process with focus on gender-sensitive pedagogy and training to build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools. Thus, the capacity building component has been completed as planned as far as UNESCO-IICBA is concerned.

Regarding the efficiency of the IGAs, one can say that the schools are at different levels of income generation. In Gambella regional state only one of the three schools has started generating income. In Somali regional state, two of the three schools have begun generating

income. According to the stakeholders interviewed, the budget for the IGAs was released late and that created the delay in setting up the IGAs. Thus,

(4) Both institutional and financial sustainability of the project was judged favorably by the different groups of stakeholders. Because the project has built the capacity of teachers, school principals and PTA members, the institutional sustainability of the changes is ensured. In addition, the financial sustainability of the project is promising because of the IGAs already launched in some of the schools and IGAs yet to be launched in other schools. Unlike other projects that merely focus on financial support to needy female students without any income generation scheme, the present project focuses on IGAs that will generate income for years to come to support female students beyond the project's life time.

In conclusion, because the project's objectives were consistent with the government's policies and strategies and the fact that the project was launched based on results of a baseline survey that identified the needs of female students in Grades 9 and 10, the project was very relevant. One can also conclude that the project was effective particularly with respect to the training because the training has changed teachers' views and actions positively. In contrast, the effectiveness of the training was limited because the training was not formally conducted at the school level. On the other hand, the IGAs were effective in some schools, less effective in others and not effective still in other schools.

In a similar way, efficiency of the project was partly good and partly not. Even though UNESCO-IICBA had completed the planned tasks within the time frame, there are activities that have not been completed at the school level. On the one hand, all planned training workshops were fully completed. Besides, the budget for each school has been utilized efficiently for the planned activities. On the other hand, in addition to the delay in implementation of the project, the IGAs have not yet begun generating income at least in one-half of the schools.

Finally, sustainability of the project was judged positively. Unlike other projects that provide financial support to needy female students from the beginning up until the completion of the

project, the present project focused on IGAs that will continue generating income to support female students beyond the project's life time.

Despite its achievements, the project has faced several challenges. These include delay in implementation of the project in general and release of the project fund in particular, turnover of school principals and distance of the project schools from the regional capitals and from each other. These challenges appeared to have impacted the project implementation negatively.

Finally, the end term evaluation presents recommendations that help similar future interventions produce better impacts and outcomes. The first recommendation is concerned with follow up of the project in the schools. Because the project is still in progress in the schools, there is a need to follow up and monitor the schools. Second, although the impacts of the GRP training are encouraging, the schools have not formally offered the training to teachers and students at the school level. One can imagine that strengthening the training in the project schools could produce more desirable outcomes. Third, if UNESCO-IICBA decides to scale up the project outcomes in other schools of the two regions, it is important to hire a livelihood expert at least on part-time basis to help guide and advise the schools to identify a feasible IGA that takes into account the local contexts.

CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background

Evidence indicates that the education of girls has a lot of positive social returns. One of these is delaying the age of marriage for girls, thereby minimizing the social and physical costs of early marriage. The other benefit of keeping girls in school as long as possible is that they will be empowered, as a result of the education they receive, to take better care of themselves. This in turn shall help reduce eventual maternal mortality, and will result in better child rearing practices that will bring about reduced child mortality.

The education of girls also affects the eventual success of their children. It is believed that children born to more educated mothers perform better at school as they get the necessary help from their mothers at home. This in turn leads to better efficiency of the education system of a country; and creates a more egalitarian society with as many women represented in the workplace and in decision making roles as men, creating a more just and peaceful world in the process.

While the returns from the education of girls are numerous as discussed above, it has not been possible to achieve these due to entrenched attitudes and values that discourage the equal participation of girls in the education system of most countries in the world. Girls remain marginalized and the unequal opportunities accorded to boys and girls are hurting not only individuals, but also the society as a whole. The main objective of this project was to address the issues of retention of girls in lower secondary schools (Grades 9 and 10) and the factors that inhibit their performance. The project planned to do these through capacity building interventions targeting teacher education institutions, teacher trainees, community leaders, school management staff and girls in six selected schools in Gambella and Somali regions in Ethiopia.

The major goal of the project was improving the retention of girls in lower secondary schools in Gambella and Somali regions of Ethiopia, both of which have higher than the national average dropout rate for girls, and improve their learning outcomes as measured by the Ethiopian General Secondary Education Certificate Examination (GSECE).

1.2. Objectives of the Project

"Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and increasing their Learning Outcomes in Ethiopia" project aims to tackle the issues of high dropout rate of girls and lower achievement level through the capacity building of teachers and school management staff in gender sensitive pedagogy and girls friendly school management, community-school partnership and setting up income generating schemes.

Specific Objectives

The project had the following specific objectives.

- Sensitize teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process through training in gender-sensitive pedagogy.

- Build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools.

- Strengthen School-Community Partnerships to assist the retention of girls in schools.

- Increase the retention of girls in lower secondary and improve their learning outcomes through a multi-faceted intervention.

- Share the best practices observed in the project schools during the life of the project and assist in the replication of good practices in other districts of the two regions.

The project had three major components designed to achieve these objectives. These are

i) Capacity building of school teachers, school management staff in the pilot schools, and teacher educators in the teacher training colleges in the two regions, in gender responsive pedagogy (GRP),

ii) Establishing a community based Girls Education Support Structure (GESS) in order to advocate for the promotion of girls' education in the locality where the schools are located,

iii) Setting up viable and sustainable income generation schemes for needy girls in the pilot schools so that their school related needs will be met and they stay on in school.

1.3. Purposes of the Evaluation

The main purpose of this end term evaluation is to assess the overall effectiveness of the Girls' Education Project that has been implemented in Gambella and Somali Regional States. Because this evaluation is to be conducted at the end of the project period, it will examine all aspects of the project during the entire implementation period.

The evaluation is intended to be forward looking which will capture effectively and provide information on the nature, extent and where possible the effect of the project for the MoE and REBs. The lessons that will be drawn from the end term evaluation will focus on the examination of the implementation process with a view to understanding what has worked and what has not worked, which may in turn help in designing and implementing similar other projects in the future.

1.4. Scope and Focus of the Evaluation

The survey was be conducted in Gambella (Goderei, Pugnido and Metar districts) and Somali (Degehabur, Kebridehar and Gode districts) regional states. The final evaluation will look at (1) management of the project, (2) project activities, and (3) partnership with stakeholders. In general, it will address the results achieved and the partnerships established.

Targets of the study are mainly female students, the schools' administrative staff and teachers. The evaluation will also target Girls Education Support Structures and PTAs, district (or woreda) Education Officers, heads of Regional Education bureaux and gender focal persons and MoE directorate of General Education, Gender and Special Needs and Inclusive Education including experts in the latter two directorates.

The scope of the final evaluation is delimited by the following four key criteria of evaluation: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability. Each of these is briefly described below.

i. Relevance

As a criterion of assessment, relevance deals with the validity and necessity of a project or its expected effects (or project purpose and overall goal) against the needs of target beneficiaries. Relevance should therefore focus on examining (i) whether the project intervention is appropriate as a solution for problems of the beneficiaries, (ii) whether the contents of the project is consistent with national and local policies, and (iii) whether the project is justified to be implemented given the identified needs.

ii. Effectiveness

Effectiveness of a project is concerned with management processes and their appropriateness in supporting delivery. It involves examining the extent to which the project objectives were achieved, taking into account their relative importance. The types of services provided will be examined against the planned ones, and all the outputs of the program will be scrutinized.

iii. Efficiency of project implementation

Efficiency deals with how economic resources/inputs are converted to results. The main focus is on the relationship between project cost and effects – the way in which resources and inputs (funds, time, human resources, etc.) were applied towards the achievement of results.

iv. Sustainability

Ssustainability focuses on whether produced effects continue after the termination of the assistance. As a terminal evaluation, the effort is to sort out whether there were in-built mechanisms for ensuring sustainability and whether those mechanisms were at play during the implementation of the project.

1.5. Key Questions of the Final Evaluation

Based on the above criteria of evaluation the following basic questions are formulated under each criterion to guide this survey:

Relevance of the Project

- Was the project relevant for the identified needs?
- Was the project consistent with the federal and regional governments' policies?

Effectiveness of the Project

- To what extent did the project achieve its overall objectives?
- To what extent did the project's monitoring and evaluation mechanism contribute in meeting project results?
- How effective were the strategies and tools used in the implementation of the project?

- How effective has the project been in responding to the needs of the beneficiaries, and what results were achieved?

Efficiency of the Project

- Was the process of achieving results efficient? Did the actual or expected results (outputs and outcomes) justify the costs incurred?
- How was the project's collaboration with the MoE, Regional Education Bureaux and schools?
- How did the project financial management processes and procedures affect the project implementation process?

Project Sustainability

- To what extent are the benefits of the project likely to be sustained after a completion of the project?
- What is the likelihood of continuation and sustainability of project outcomes and benefits after completion of the project?
- What are the key aspects that require attention in order to improve prospects of sustainability of project outcomes and the potential for the replication of the approach?
- How was capacity strengthened at the school and regional level?
- What are the main lessons that have emerged from the project implementation?
- What recommendations can be made for similar support in the future based on the project results?

CHAPTER TWO

EVALUATION METHOD

The methods which were employed in this evaluation are presented below under different sections. These include evaluation design, study sites, study participants and sampling techniques, instruments for data collection, data analysis methods and ethical considerations.

2.1. Evaluation Design

This evaluation was undertaken using mixed method design. Thus, using both quantitative and qualitative methods, comprehensive data were gathered and analyzed.

2.2. Study Sites

The evaluation was conducted in three woredas (Goderei, Pugnido and Metar) in Gambella and three woredas (Degehabur, Kebridehar and Gode) in Somali regional states. The consultants, together with their assistants, visited and collected data from each of the six woredas (mainly from the six lower secondary schools) in which the Girls' Education Project has been implemented.

2.3. Data Sources

This evaluative study used both secondary and primary data sources to obtain relevant and comprehensive information about the Girls' Education Project. The secondary data sources were project documents, annual reports, and statistics obtained from the school records or from the Woreda Education Office (WEO) as well as those from the project office.

The primary data were gathered mainly from female students, teachers, and the schools' administrative staff. In-depth information was also gathered from different stakeholders including PTAs, WEO and REB experts and gender focal persons and experts from the Ministry of Education's Directorate of General Education and the Directorate of Gender and Special Needs and Inclusive Education.

All sample respondents included in this end term evaluation to provide data through in-depth interview and focus group discussion (FGD) were selected using purposive sampling technique.

This sampling technique was used so as to focus on those stakeholders who could provide pertinent and rich information about the project. The main criteria for selecting the respondents were the position they held and how well the respondents know the project. The selection was done with the help of teachers and the school principal in each school. Teachers in each school who received training provided data through questionnaire. These were also selected using purposive sampling technique.

Table 1. Composition of the Sample Respondents

Respondent Type (Tool)		Sample Size
Teachers (Questionnaire)	From 6 schools	43
Principals (Interview)	6 schools x 1 Principal	6
PTA members (Interview)	6 Schools x 2 Members	12
Education Experts (Interview) (from MOE, REBs and WEOs)	MOE Experts + REB Experts + WEO Experts	10
Female Students (FGD)	Grade 9 (from 6 Schools)	27
	Grade 10 (from 6 Schools)	27
	Total Sample Size = 125	

2.4. Data Gathering Tools

The tools we used to gather data are described below.

Questionnaire

We employed questionnaire to collect relevant data for the evaluation from teachers. The questionnaire included items that revolve around the main criteria of evaluation: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of the project.

Key Informant Interview

Key informant interview was conducted with experts drawn from different stakeholders. More specifically, participants included school principals, PTA members, WEO and REB experts and experts from the two directorates of the MoE. The items in the interview addressed the key

questions of the evaluation.

Focus Group Discussion

Focus Group Discussion was conducted with two groups of female students from each project school: one group comprising Grade nine students and a second group comprising Grade ten students. This yielded 12 FGDs in the six project schools. In each FGD, an average of eight female students participated. Each FGD was moderated by the lead researcher. Here also, the items for the FGDs were related to the key questions of the evaluation.

Document Review

In addition, data pertaining to enrolment, dropout, and pass rate (on Grade 10 National Examination) were gathered from school records and WEOs. The data were used to examine the extent to which female students' (in Grades 9 and 10) dropout rate has decreased and pass rate has increased in the project schools.

2.5. Procedures of Data Collection

This evaluation was conducted by four researchers: two for each region with a lead researcher and an assistant. Each lead researcher was supported by his assistant (with a very good linguistic ability in relation to the specific language of the region) during data collection for translation purposes so as to overcome language barriers. The fieldwork (or data collection) in the two regions was conducted simultaneously for five days in the first week of April 2017.

2.6. Methods of Data Analysis

Data analysis was conducted using both quantitative and qualitative methods. After analyzing the quantitative data, the results are presented using descriptive statistics such as percentage and frequency. Other quantitative data which were obtained mainly from school records including enrolment, dropout and pass rates are also presented in terms of frequency and percentage in tables.

The qualitative data obtained through interviews and FGDs were read and re-read by the researchers before identifying the emerging themes. The data were then organized under the identified themes and presented in a way that represents the views and/or opinions of the

respondents, sometimes verbatim (e.g., using direct quotes from the interview and FGD sessions) and other times paraphrased.

2.7. Ethical Considerations

Effort was made to conduct the evaluation in a way that meets ethical standards. First, the researchers clearly communicated the purpose of the study to all respondents. Second, the researchers also informed the respondents that (1) participation is based on their full consent, (2) the data would be used only for the purpose of the final evaluation, and (3) information would be used without the name of the respondents attached to it (that is, under anonymity). Overall, therefore, the respondents were informed about their rights not to participate in the study or to withdraw at any point in the data collection process if they wish to do so.

CHAPTER THREE
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter presents the end-term evaluation of the project that aimed to retain girls in lower secondary schools and to increase their learning outcomes in Gambella and Somali regional states in Ethiopia. In particular, the evaluation focuses on the project's relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability. The findings and discussion are therefore presented accordingly.

3.1. Relevance of the Project

Both Gambella and Somali regions are two of the four emerging/developing regions in Ethiopia. There are underlying problems that negatively impact the education of girls in these developing regions. The main problems are gender inequality and the low status of women and girls in society. Societal inequalities between males and females, inequities within the family, harmful traditional practices (HTP) against young girls (e.g., early marriage) and gender-based violence (GBV) had been common in Ethiopia. These are powerful forces that impede efforts to increase female students' educational participation and attainment.

The federal and regional governments are doing their level best to bring about a significant reduction in gender inequality and inequity particularly in education. Consequently, these problems have shown decreasing trend in the country partly due to laws (e.g., family law, 2000) enacted in the country. Nonetheless, the problems do exist at present in different parts of the country though not as visible as in the past.

To make matters worse, families in these regions have limited financial income and supporting female students' education throughout high school has remained a major problem for parents. For this reason, many female students in Grades 9 and 10 are often forced to dropout from school or fail in examinations. It was to address these problems that UNESCO-IICBA launched the project in six schools of the Gambella and Somali regions.

The relevance of the project could be evaluated from two perspectives: (1) Do the project's objectives go hand in hand with those of the government of Ethiopia? (2) Does the project address the problems of the local community? Given the government's policies and strategies to narrow the gender gap in educational participation and attainment in the country, UNESCO-IICBA's project could be seen as a vehicle to achieve this particular goal. It is clear therefore that the objectives of UNESCO-IICBA's project which was implemented in both regions (Gambella and Somali) are consistent with those of the government of Ethiopia in general and MOE's objectives in particular. Hence, viewed from this perspective, the project was relevant.

Regarding the needs of the local communities and whether the project has addressed those needs, it is important to note that before launching the project, UNESCO-IICBA had commissioned a baseline study that assessed the needs of the schools in the form of situation analysis. Among other things, the baseline study reported several findings that confirmed female students' disadvantages particularly when compared with their male counterparts. For example, examination of the academic performance of female students as measured by promotion rate indicated a smaller promotion rate for female students than for male students. The study also revealed a larger dropout and repetition rates for female students in Grades 9-10 than their male counterparts. According to the baseline study findings, the major factors that negatively impacted female students' education were the community's attitude toward female students' education, early marriage, the workload of female students at home, financial problem, and distance of school from home. The project was initiated based on these identified problems and the need to address them.

The data we gathered from the two regions further suggest that there is consensus among stakeholders about the relevance of the project. The evaluation team found no one who questioned the relevance of the project. In stark contrast, most of the interviewees asked the consultants to thank UNESCO-IICBA for initiating and implementing the project because the project has left something visible in the project areas which might serve female students in lower secondary grades for years to come. It is therefore clear from the interviewees' responses that the project had a contribution in the fight to retain female students in lower secondary grades.

Participants also raised a point regarding the huge problem surrounding the education of female students and felt that even though the project has contributed its share in that fight, given female

students' problems, including those in lower grades, terminating the project within only one term may not bring long lasting changes. They therefore asked UNESCO-IICBA to think seriously about continuing the project at lease for one term so that the schools and the surrounding communities' capacities be built and strengthened enough to fight against any undesirable beliefs and actions against the education of female students not only in the lower secondary grades but also in the lower primary grades.

In sum, three points are worth reiterating regarding relevance. First, based on the results of the baseline study which was conducted in 2014 before launching the project, there was a need to address problems surrounding the education of girls. One can say therefore that the project was launched based on evidence and was thus relevant. Second, the project was not only consistent with the government's policies and strategies but it was also implemented in partnership with one of the government's ministry (MOE), another evidence for its relevance. Third, interviews and FGDs with different stakeholders from both Gambella and Somali regional states further supported that the project was relevant. On the whole, viewed from the three angles just described, one can conclude that the project was highly relevant.

3.2. Effectiveness of the Project

Effectiveness refers to the extent to which the project's objectives have been achieved. In this end term evaluation, project effectiveness has been examined in four areas: to what extent the project was effective in delivering planned results; to what extent the project's monitoring and evaluation mechanism contributed in meeting project results; how effective were the strategies and tools used in the implementation of the project; and finally how effective has the project been in responding to the needs of the beneficiaries, and what results were achieved. This section is devoted to presentation and discussion of the results along these lines.

As stated at the beginning of this report, the main goal of this project was to improve the retention of girls in lower secondary schools in Gambella and Somali regions of Ethiopia and improve their learning outcome as measured by the Ethiopian General Secondary Education Certificate Examination. The project further had the following specific objectives to be achieved at the end of the project period. These were:

- Sensitize teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process through training in gender-sensitive pedagogy

- Build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools

- Strengthen School-Community Partnerships to assist the retention of girls in schools

- Increase the retention of girls in lower secondary and improve their learning outcomes through a multi-faceted intervention

- Share the best practice experience during the life of the project and assist in the replication of good practices in other districts of the two regions.

(A) Effectiveness of the capacity building training provided to the different groups of stakeholders

Evidence gathered from documents and interviews conducted with stakeholders regarding the contents of the training provided by the UNESCO-IICBA project showed that the following areas, among others, were covered in the training sessions.

- Training on life skills
- Training on gender responsive pedagogy
- Training on gender responsive school management
- Training on gender responsive lesson planning
- Training on gender responsive classroom setup
- Training on gender responsive language use
- Training on developing school level action plan
- Training on gender in education etc.

Regarding capacity building of the different groups of stakeholders, UNESCO-IICBA has conducted all the training sessions as planned. As indicated in the above list of the training contents, the training sessions aimed at sensitizing teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process with focus on gender-sensitive pedagogy and training to build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the

learning of female students in the six project schools. Thus, the capacity building component has been completed as planned as far as UNESCO-IICBA is concerned.

To examine the effectiveness of the training, we gathered both quantitative and qualitative data from teachers who received the training through a questionnaire and interview. The questionnaire asked the teachers to evaluate, among other things, the relevance, appropriateness of the contents, the methods and timing of the training. The teachers' evaluations of the different aspects of the training are summarized for each region in the table below.

The data generally show that almost all the teachers evaluated the training and its different aspects favourably. More specifically, the data generally confirm that the training was (i) relevant for the teachers' daily activities, (ii) appropriate in terms of its contents, (iii) appropriate in terms of the methods employed by the trainers, and (iv) appropriate in terms of the time it was conducted. Besides, the majority also rated competence of the trainers "above average." In a similar manner, all the teachers indicated that the training has changed their views on treating girls in and outside the classroom. Finally, they rated their overall satisfaction with the training "average" or "above average," the latter rating pertaining to the majority of teachers.

In short, the ratings generally support the point that the training was very much effective in the eyes of the teachers who received the training. Thus, the quantitative data clearly showed that the training in general and its specific aspects in particular were positively evaluated by those teachers who received the training. One can thus conclude that the training was conducted in a way that satisfies the participants from both Gambella and Somali regional states in almost all of its aspects.

Table 2. Teachers' Evaluation of the Different Aspects of the Training (in Percent)

Specific Point	Gambella Region (n = 13)			Somali Region (n = 14)		
	Below Average	Average	Above Average	Below Average	Average	Above Average

Relevance of the training to teachers' daily activities	0.0	8.3	91.7	0.0	0.0	100.0
Appropriateness of training contents to teachers' daily activities	0.0	7.7	92.3	0.0	0.00	100.0
Appropriateness of the training methods to the teachers	0.0	16.7	83.3	0.0	7.1	92.9
Competence of the trainers who offered the training	0.0	30.8	69.3	0.0	0.0	100.0
Appropriateness of the training time	7.7	15.4	77.0	0.0	7.1	92.9
The training changed your views on treating girls in and outside the classroom	0.0	23.1	77.0	0.0	14.3	85.7
The level of your overall satisfaction with the training	0.0	30.8	69.3	0.0	7.1	92.9

Source: Data obtained from teachers (April, 2017)

We obtained the qualitative data through group interviews conducted with teachers who received the training. The discussions clearly showed that the training had positively changed their outlooks or views on women and girls for good. For example, one of the teachers who participated in the training explained the change as follows.

> I had accepted for a long time the misconception that women or girls are naturally weak and thus could not perform academically well regardless of the support they receive. However, after the training, I have learned that women/girls can excel academically if they get the chance to learn and if there is some sort of support provided to them. And if they do so, they can easily change their communities.

The above view clearly shows how important the training sessions were in changing long held and deep-rooted misconceptions among teachers about female students' abilities and education. This suggests that the capacity building efforts particularly those conducted centrally by UNESCO-IICBA to teachers and other stakeholders were effective because they have brought about desirable changes in teachers' beliefs and outlooks concerning female students' education and their potential to excel in their studies. In addition, the teachers who participated in the training provided by UNESCO-IICBA have reported that the way they treat female students in and outside classrooms has changed significantly for the better.

It is important to note, however, that UNESCO-IICBA conducted the training to build the capacity of those trained stakeholders so that the latter can offer the training to their colleagues and students at the school level in collaboration with the school management. However, the trained stakeholders did not offer the training to others (e.g. teachers and students) as initially expected to scale up the impact of the training.

Given the changes in teachers' beliefs and actions which resulted from the training, one can also imagine how big the changes could have been had the training sessions been conducted as planned to teachers and students at the school level. In this connection, one may raise several questions. Why didn't the schools' management take the initiative to conduct the training as planned? Was there any problem on the teachers' side who received the training to conduct the training? Further probing the interviewees produced several answers to the questions raised.

Among the teachers who received the training, one teacher from Pugnido Secondary School, for example, indicated that even though the training was not conducted formally in the school, they have transferred the knowledge they got from the training to their colleagues and students informally. Asked to examine as to whether their work could have been more productive had they conducted the training to students and teachers formally, the teacher admitted that it should have been a better option for them.

Recognizing the fact that the training could have been more productive had it been conducted formally, the teacher further said that "We, teaches who received the training as well as the school are to blame for not conducting the training formally. The school management should have created a forum for us to offer the training to both teachers and students formally."

Another teacher from a different school who received the training also admitted that they did not formally train teachers and students at the school level. Asked why, she stated that one of the teachers who received the training has already left the school. She further pointed out that there were other problems. She stated,

> If we ask teachers and students to attend the training, we need to have budget with which we can provide some refreshment. We need also to have budget for payment to the participants because this has become customary whenever there is training. We cannot do this as the school does not have any budget for such training. Besides, I had a fear and was not sure whether teachers would accept me as a trainer had I offered the training.

Like those whose responses are quoted above, others also admitted that the outcome could have been far better had the school management arranged a forum for formal training. For one thing, many more students and teachers could have received the training as compared to those who got the knowledge from the trained persons informally. In other words, the training could have reached many more students and teachers. Second, the formal training could have been a better option in sensitizing the school community as a whole because every participant could take the training and the ideas discussed seriously. Third, such formal training could have engendered better changes and outcomes pertaining to beliefs associated with female students' education in the project schools.

In short, all things considered, the training programs which were aimed at building the capacity of stakeholders were carried out as planned at the central level and they were fully effective at that level. However, the training has not been cascaded at the school level and was not offered to students and teachers by those who received the training as training of trainers (TOTs). This was the main weakness of the planned training at the school level and because the training did not reach students and teachers as expected, its effectiveness was limited.

(B) Effectiveness of Project Monitoring and Evaluation Mechanisms

The project monitoring and evaluation for this particular project has been carried out in several ways. One of this was conducting joint review meetings where the stakeholders judged the progress of the project implementation in each project school. Besides, experts from the MOE and UNESCO-IICBA have conducted joint review meetings.

Besides, the project schools had to submit periodic progress reports to their respective REBs. The two REBs, in turn, had to compile the progress reports from project schools and report this to

UNESCO-IICBA and MOE quarterly. In brief, the monitoring and evaluation mechanism utilized (joint and independent monitoring and evaluation) for the project was effective.

The stakeholders at the school level, however, have complained that the monitoring and evaluation that need to be conducted by the MOE and UNESCO-IICBA in the form of school visits did not materialize. According to the stakeholders, such a visit could have helped the schools in implementing the project according to schedule because the visits would generally encourage the stakeholders who are directly responsible for implementing the project.

(C) Effectiveness of the Project Strategies and Tools

UNESCO-IICBA has used the government's formal structure in the implementation of project activities. Both UNESCO-IICBA and MOE were at the top followed by REBs of the two regions playing the intermediary role between the project schools and top level bodies. The roles, duties and responsibilities of each partner were clearly defined during project implementation. This has enabled all partners to own the project and include in their annual plans of activities. This was the reason for successful implementation of the major activities of the project in the two regions. Thus, the strategies and tools followed by UNESCO-IICBA were effective to implement the project.

(D) Effectiveness of the Project in Improving Female Students' Achievement and Reducing Dropout Rate

The pass rate of tenth grade female students on the examination that is annually administered nationwide is shown in Table 3 below. The data generally indicate an increase in pass rate of female students from 2013/14 to 2015/16. One can also observe from the data that some schools have shown a significant improvement in female students' pass rate from 2013/14 academic year to 2015/16 academic year. Tinishu Meti Secondary School is a very good example in this regard. This particular school improved the pass rate of its tenth grade female students from 17.9 percent in 2013/14 to 66.1 percent in 2015/16.

It should be noted that the data we obtained from Sayid Mohammed/Hassen Secondary School was inflated (that is larger than the real data) because the school records included both groups of students who were promoted to preparatory school and those who were able to join TVET colleges. Actually, the data on the pass rate should have considered only the former group. For that reason,

the pass rate does not reflect the reality. Despite this issue, one can observe that among the schools in the two regions, those in Somali region have recorded far better pass rates for their tenth grade female students than their counterparts in Gambella region.

Table 3. Pass Rate (in Percent) of Female Students on the Tenth Grade National Examination

Region	Project School	2006 E.C. (2013/14)	2007 E.C. (2014/15)	2008 (2015/16)
Gambella	Metar	37.5	49.2	41.6
	Pugnido	18.3	37.9	53.1
	Tinishu Meti	17.9	29.2	66.1
Somali	Kabri Dahar	76.9	74.2	82.9
	Sayid Mohammed/Hassen	100.0	96.9	100.0
	Dagahabur	48.9	58.7	65.5

Source: School records (April 2017)

In a similar manner, the data in Table 4 show the dropout rate of ninth and tenth grade female students in the six project schools. Among the schools in Gambella region, both Matar and Tinishu Meti Secondary Schools had very low dropout rates, the largest recorded dropout rate being 3.6 percent. Unlike the two schools, dropout rate in Pugnido Secondary School was very large, the largest recorded dropout rate being 40.0 percent for ninth grade female students.

The data also show differences in the dropout rates of ninth grade and tenth grade female students. With the exception of Kabri Dahar Secondary School, the dropout rates among ninth grade female students in the other five secondary schools are generally higher than those of tenth grade female students. One possible explanation for this difference could be the fact that tenth grade is the grade at which college bound and those who are not would be determined and thus marks completion of secondary education in the country. The students would therefore be more serious with their education and interested to complete their secondary education; it is thus less likely for them to dropout of school at grade ten than they do at grade nine.

Table 4. Dropout Rate (in Percent) of Female Students in Grades 9 and 10

Region	Project School	Grade Level	2006 E.C. (2013/14)	2007 E.C. (2014/15)	2008 E.C. (2015/16)	2009 E.C. (2016/17)
Gambella	Metar	9	3.1	2.2	1.9	1.0
		10	NA	0.5	1.5	NA
	Pugnido	9	20.1	17.7	40.0	17.7
		10	10.9	9.8	26.5	18.9
	Tinishu Meti	9	3.2	3.6	0.5	0.8
		10	2.9	3.3	2.8	1.3
Somali	Kabri Dahar	9	8.0	13.5	10.0	19.4
		10	13.3	17.4	18.4	6.7
	Sayid Mohammed/Hassen	9	1.7	0.0	0.0	NA
		10	0.0	0.0	0.0	NA
	Dagahabur	9	4.0	2.1	2.3	NA
		10	1.2	2.0	0.9	NA

Source: School records (April 2017)   NA = Not all data were available to compute the dropout rate

The data presented above pertaining to both the pass and dropout rates of ninth and tenth grade female students generally showed an increasing trend for pass rates and a decreasing trend for dropout rates. Thus, both dropout and pass rates have shown a desirable trends from year to year with some few exceptions. Thus, the question we should finally ask is this. Are the desirable changes recorded in both the pass and dropout rates due to the project?

Right from the start, one should admit that this is a difficult question to answer. First, different projects work on female students on overlapping areas and one cannot be sure which specific project is responsible for the impact. The consultants have experienced such issues when interviewing some stakeholders. When asked for example about what the project has accomplished in their schools, some of the stakeholders (e.g., students, PTA members) often mix up the activities of the different projects.

Second, although two of the schools (that is, Dagahabur and Kebri Dahar) have started supporting needy female students financially, the others have not. Third, even though UNESCO-IICBA offered capacity building training in several areas, the training was not offered at the school level in some of the schools. Fourth, even though the schools were expected to provide tutorial and

supplementary classes to female students with low academic achievement, in some of the schools this is yet at the planning stage. The schools plan to provide academic support to female students in the near future although we don't know whether this would materialize.

In brief, on the one hand, even though the schools were expected to provide academic support, at least some of them have not done this. On the other hand, as discussed earlier the pass and dropout rates of ninth and tenth grade female students in the schools have improved. This is the puzzle we could not explain. It could be that the trained teachers in the schools have exerted effort not only to improve their treatment of female students but also to support them academically and that may be one explanation why there was improvement.

(E) Effectiveness of the IGAs

The IGA is one component of the project. Through setting up viable and sustainable income generation schemes, the project aimed at supporting needy female students in the pilot schools by fulfilling their school related needs so that they can stay on in school. As shown in the two tables (one for the three schools in each region) below, the statuses of the IGAs differ from one school to the other. In general, the schools in Somali region appear to be in a better standing than the schools in Gambella region. In Gambella region, the schools have not identified the needy female students let alone support them financially.

In one of the schools (that is, Sayid Mohammed Secondary School), for example, beneficiary female students have not been identified for fear that the income from the cafeteria may not be enough to provide the financial support. It should also be noted that the cafeteria was able to generate an income of only 1500 ETB during the first month of its commencement out of which 1000 Birr was paid out to one employee who serves in the cafeteria. One can observe that within a month the balance was only 500 ETB.

To see the effectiveness of the different IGAs, one can easily compare the income generated using the two bajajs in Dagahabur and the cafeteria in Sayid Mohammed Secondary School. The former generated approximately 500 ETB per day whereas the latter generated only 500 ETB within a month. Thus, clearly the bajajs are more effective in generating income than the cafeteria. This

suggests that Dagahabur Secondary School had a well thought out IGA as opposed to the others. As indicated in an earlier section, the absence of a professional in the area of livelihood in the woredas who could have helped and/or advised the schools to identify more effective IGAs is partly responsible for the issues associated with the IGAs.

In sum, the six schools are at different stages when it comes to IGAs. In general, the IGAs identified for the schools in Gambella regional state are less effective than the schools in Somali regional state. Another important point regarding the IGAs, according to different stakeholders, is the fact that the stakeholders are hopeful that the IGAs will be effective in the near future even if they have not started generating income currently. For some stakeholders, the rooms or the containers will be permanent sources of income in the future and even female students themselves are happy to see the buildings even if they did not start generating income because the schools have informed them that the IGA are aimed at supporting ninth and tenth grade female students. In conclusion, we shall wait and see how effective the IGAs will be in the future but for now, Dagahabur Secondary School has identified a more effective IGA than any of the other schools.

Table 5. Type and Status of the Income Generating Activities in the Three Schools, Gambella Regional State

Item	Matar Secondary School	Pugnido Secondary School	Tinishu Meti Secondary School
The specific IGA initially planned	???	Six-room residential block for rent	Ten containers for rent which could be used for small tea rooms, shops, etc.
Initial plan changed to	Two-room house for rent	Five-room residential block with fence and common toilet	Six containers for rent
Reason for changing the initial plan		Initial plan changed because fence and toilet was considered an essential part of the block and that resulted in a five-room block	Initial plan changed because of the delay of release of the budget and the rising price of building materials
Construction Status	Under construction	Construction completed	Construction completed
Currently rented as planned?	Not yet ready for rent	Ready for rent but not rented out	Four of the six containers are already rented out for four months.
Stakeholders' hope	They are hopeful that it will be useful.	Hopeful but at the same time they fear that individuals may not afford the monthly rent	Very hopeful because the four containers have already been rented out
Income generation status	The rooms are yet under construction.	The rooms are ready for rent but did not start generating income	Began generating income for about four months but only four of the six containers are rented out
Beneficiary female students	Not selected	Not selected	The process of selection began but not completed.
Overall rank within the region for being closer to income generation	3	2	1

Table 6. Type and Status of the Income Generating Activities in the Three Schools, Somali
Regional State

Item	Dagahabur Secondary School	Kebri Dahar Secondary School	Sayid Mohammed Secondary School
The specific IGA initially planned	Transportation service with two bajajs.	Stationery shop	Cafeteria
Status of the IGA	The two Bajajs are providing transportation services each earning approximately 250 Birr per day. .	The project is not functional although the school has already rented shop in the town and all the necessary equipment are bought and stored, including a computer, photocopy machine, etc. through the project fund.	The cafeteria has very recently (a month ago) started to provide limited cafeteria service to students. All the necessary equipment to run the project such as TV, satellite receiver, refrigerator, etc. are bought and installed. .
Income generation status	Started generating income	Not functional; a generator bought by the project to fully launch the IGA was provided to the TVET college by the REB and that hindered the project to run its activities.	Recently started; partly functional; Some of the equipment did not match the original specifications; some of the equipment are not fully functional
Beneficiary female students	10 female students receive 700 ETB per month	10 female students have been identified	The school did not identify beneficiary female students for fear that the income from the cafeteria may not be enough to provide the financial support.
Overall rank within the region for income generation and supporting female students	1 (Effective)	3 (Not effective)	2 (Less effective)

3.3. Efficiency of the Project

As described below, efficiency of the project was judged in terms of time and financial efficiency.

(A) The Project's Efficiency in terms of Time

To evaluate the project's efficiency in terms of time, one can examine the pace of implementation of the main components of the project, namely

a) Capacity building of school teachers, school management staff in the pilot schools, and teacher educators in the teacher training colleges in the two regions, in gender responsive pedagogy (GRP),

b) Establishing a community based Girls Education Support Structure (GESS) in order to advocate for the promotion of girls' education in the locality where the schools are located,

c) Setting up viable and sustainable income generation schemes for needy girls in the pilot schools so that their school related needs will be met and they stay on in school.

Regarding capacity building of the different groups of stakeholders, UNESCO-IICBA has conducted all training sessions as planned. The sessions included training to sensitize teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process with focus on gender-sensitive pedagogy and training to build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools. Thus, the capacity building component has been completed as planned as far as UNESCO-IICBA is concerned.

Regarding the efficiency of the IGAs, one can say that the schools are at different levels of income generation at the end of the project implementation period. In Gambella regional state, for example, only one of the three schools (that is, Tinishu Meti Secondary School) has started generating income. Asked why this was the case, many of the interviewees confirmed that they received the budget for IGA (that is, 300,000 ETB per school) only in late May or early June 2016. Thus, according to the stakeholders interviewed, the budget for the IGA was released late and that created the delay in building/constructing the residential block and that was the main reason why they could not generate income thus far.

In Somali regional state, on the other hand, two of the three schools (that is, Dagahabur and Kabri Dahar Secondary Schools) have begun generating income and supporting female students. In this regard, therefore, the schools in Somali region are generally better than the schools in Gambella region. Overall, we can observe that whereas three of the six schools have started generating income, the other three have not yet begun generating income. Thus, at the school level, whereas three of the schools were efficient in relation to IGA, the other three were not.

Apart from the late release of the budget for the IGAs, it appears clear that the level of commitment of the schools' management or the concerned committee members varies from one school to another. Even within the same regional state, the management of the three schools or the committees established to oversee the IGAs appeared to differ in exerting maximum effort to see the IGAs completed and become functional.

Another important factor that may explain why the statuses of the IGAs are different or why the IGAs are at different levels or stages of completion or functioning is the absence of professionals in the woredas who could have helped the schools in planning a better or more useful IGA considering the local situation. Even if the school management or committee members had the willingness and commitment to contribute their best to see the completion of the IGAs, the planned income generation might not materialize or might not produce the anticipated income unless the IGAs were identified based on some evidence that people in the locality are in need of the services. The support of professionals is therefore as important as the commitment of the school management and the committee members.

(B) The Project's Financial Efficiency

In general, the budget which was allocated for the project was utilized to implement the project activities, namely conducting the capacity building training sessions and setting up the IGAs in each school. The trainings were conducted centrally for the stakeholders from all six project schools and the budget allocated for that was fully utilized. The budget for the IGAs, on the other hand, was distributed to each school to set up the IGAs. According to the stakeholders from the schools, the budget for the IGAs was also fully utilized. Given the activities carried out by the

project and the amount of budget utilized, one can safely conclude that the project's financial efficiency was very good.

3.4. Sustainability of the Project

In this end term evaluation sustainability of the project is examined in terms of institutional and financial sustainability.

(A)   Institutional Sustainability

As discussed in this report, the project has carried out different capacity building trainings and awareness raising workshops for school principals, teachers, and PTA members. In particular, training programs related to gender responsive pedagogy, gender responsive lesson planning, and gender responsive teaching and learning materials, gender responsive language use and interaction in the classroom and gender responsive classroom setting for teachers in the project schools have developed their skills and competencies in classroom management and improve girls' performance.

In addition, trainings provided for school principals on gender responsive school management, and developing school level action plan helped the school managers to pay attention to girls' education in their respective schools. Hence, the capacities developed through these different training programs indicate that the schools have developed their (managerial) capacities to manage the results achieved through the project in their schools. This is also clearly stated by some of the respondents who participated in interviews and FGDs. For instance, an expert from Somali REB states that "The results obtained via the project will sustain due to the capacity building trainings given for the teachers and principals."

(B) Financial Sustainability

Financial sustainability is ensured when the schools can generate income after the termination of the project to continue supporting needy female students. The IGAs are at different stages at the time of the evaluation. The IGAs are put in place for the project schools so that they can increase their potential to support needy girls financially through the income generated from the activities. Some study participants have similar opinions on the financial sustainability of the project. For

example, one of the PTA members interviewed in one of the project schools in Gambella stated that:

> Sustainability of the project can be seen from what the project accomplished particularly the residential block that was built. This is something visible and long lasting. The residential block is now ready for rent and the income generated will support female students from poor families for a long time in the future.

In general, several respondents were sure about the financial sustainability of the project because the stakeholders are hopeful that the IGAs will generate income for the years to come and this could help support female students from poor family backgrounds. However, the continuity of the activities largely depends on the wise use and management of the income generated from the activities for the purposes of the project. That is, as the schools continue to provide financial assistance for girls from destitute families, they also need to put in place saving mechanism through which they save a portion of the money from the income generated which may be used for running costs, maintenance of equipment and further expansion of similar IGAs. In so doing, the schools can improve their financial capacity to support a large number of needy girls.

3.5. Challenges

Like other projects, this project has faced several challenges during the implementation period. The major ones are discussed below.

(1) Turnover of school principals

In most of the project schools, the school principals who are now overseeing the implementation of the project were not there at the beginning. They assumed the current position after they got transfer to the respective schools and that was well after the launch of the project. Consequently the school principals do not appear to be well aware of the main project objective which is supporting needy female students (financially and academically) so that they perform better in school. Besides, the turnover appeared to have contributed to the implementation of the project negatively because it would obviously delay the implementation of the project as the school principal is the key person in implementation of the project at the school level.

(2) Distance of the project schools from the regional capitals and from each other

The project schools are very far apart and in remote areas. Despite the fact that the schools have so many needy female students, the distance of the schools from the regional capital and from each other made frequent monitoring and evaluation very difficult.

(3) Intervention from REB officials

In Kebri Dahar Secondary School, for example, the generator which was bought for the project school was transferred to Kebri Dahar CTE with the order of the REB head who promised the school to replace it with another generator. However, the REB head was replaced by a new one and the return of the generator did not materialize up until now. This has contributed to the delay of the full functioning of the IGA in the school.

3.6. Lessons Learned

(1) The training on gender responsive pedagogy needs to be strengthened.

So many positive impacts have been reported from each school even when all stakeholders did not participate in the training. Some of the trainings were offered to a limited number of participants from the schools. The trainees were then expected to train others in their respective schools. Although no uniformity was reported in the trainings which were conducted across the project schools, the teachers who received the training evaluated the training favorably. They also indicated that the training sessions have impacted their attitudes toward the education of female students as well as how they should treat them. One can imagine how more productive the trainings could have been had they been offered in the schools where students and teachers from each project school could have participated.

(2) IGA and the need for guidance from a livelihood expert

All stakeholders without exception have judged the IGA as an essential component of the project. Especially of importance is the fact that one way of ensuring sustainability of the project is through IGA. But there was no expert on livelihood that could have helped or advised the REBs and project schools on identifying appropriate, feasible and profitable IGA for each school.

CHAPTER FOUR

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1. Conclusion

From the results presented in the previous chapter, one may draw the following conclusions.

Because the project's objectives were consistent with the government's policies and strategies and the fact that the project was launched based on results of a baseline survey that identified the needs of female students in Grades 9 and 10, the project was very relevant. One can also conclude that the project was effective particularly with respect to the training because the training has changed teachers' views and actions in relation to female students' potential and that they can excel in their studies if they get support that helps them overcome the challenges they face at home, in school and in their communities at large. That is, the training workshops were very effective in bringing about positive changes among teachers and school principals. However, the effectiveness of the training was limited because the training was not formally conducted at the school level although those who were trained have passed on the knowledge they gained to students and teachers informally. On the other hand, the IGAs were effective not in all project schools.

In a similar way, efficiency of the project was partly good and partly not. Whereas UNESCO-IICBA had completed the planned tasks within the time frame, there are activities that have not been completed at the school level. From the positive side, all planned training workshops were fully completed. Besides, the budget for each school has been utilized efficiently for the planned activities. On the negative side, apart from the delay in implementation of the project, the IGAs have not yet begun generating income at least in one-half of the schools.

Finally, sustainability of the project was judged positively. Unlike other projects that provide financial support to needy female students from the beginning up until the completion of the project, the present project focused on IGAs that will continue generating income to support female students beyond the project's life time.

4.2. Recommendations

Based on the evaluation results, the following recommendation are put forth.

Recommendation 1: GRP training

Among the components of the project, the training on GRP was found to be very effective. However, the training that was given by UNESCO-IICBA was not offered at the school level by those teachers who received the training. Using a cascade model, the trainings provided by UNESCO-IICBA could have been offered to a large number of students and teachers and this could have brought more desirable changes in the schools. UNESCO-IICBA needs to require all project schools in the future to conduct the training so as to reach more students and teachers.

Recommendation 2: IGA

Given the problems that have been reported in identifying feasible and profitable IGA that considers the specific context, one can argue that project schools in which similar other projects will be conducted need proper advice from livelihood experts. This would help them identify appropriate IGA for their schools. Such an expert needs to be employed by respective REBs so that he/she can provide advisory support to schools from the beginning of the project till the end.

Recommendation 3: Turnover of principals

As stated by several interviewees, turnover of school principals had been a challenge in several of the project schools. Although UNESCO-IICBA or other parties could not stop the turnover of principals, whenever new principals are transferred or assigned to the project schools, either the REB or UNESCO-IICBA should provide orientation on the main objectives and targets of the project. This way, the project's objectives could be achieved without any misdirected efforts by the new principals.

Recommendation 4: The need for follow up

Given what has been implemented and achieved so far, one can easily observe that some of the components of the project have yet to be realized. In most of the project schools, for example, the IGAs have yet to begin generating income. More importantly, most of the schools have not started supporting needy female students financially. In short, most of the schools need to do more to realize their plans and to make all proposed IGAs functional so as to make possible the support of female students from poor family backgrounds.

Appendix A

Teachers' Questionnaire

Part I: Background Characteristics of Respondents

1.1. Name of School _____

1.2. Sex of Respondent: Male _____ Female _____

1.3. Age of the Respondent _____

1.4. Educational Qualification _____

1.5. Work Experience in Years _____

Part II: Questions Related to the Project

2.1. What were the different supports provided to your school by the project since its launching in 2013?

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

2.2. In your opinion, how satisfactory are the impacts of the project in changing conditions that existed before the commencement of the project?

	Very High	High	Average	Low	Very Low
Improved pass rate of grade nine female students					
Improved pass rate of girls on the tenth grade national examination					
Reduced female students' absenteeism (from school)					
Reduced female students' dropouts (Grade 9)					
Reduced female students' repetition (Grade 9)					
Improved girls' academic achievement					
Reduced gender based violence in school					
Improved the attitudes of teachers toward the education of girls					
Improved parents' attitudes toward girls' education					

2.3. Did you receive any training from the project? Yes _____ No _____

2.4. If your response to the above question is "yes," in what areas did you receive the training?

_____
_____
_____
_____

2.5. If your response to the above question (2.4.) is yes, please indicate your overall evaluation of the training with respect to the specific points indicated in the table below.

Specific Point	Very High	High	Average	Low	Very Low
Relevance of the training to your daily activities					
Appropriateness of training contents to your daily activities					
Appropriateness of the training methods to you					
Competence of the trainers who offered the training					
Appropriateness of the training time offered to you					
The training changed your views on treating girls in and outside the classroom.					
The level of your overall satisfaction with the training					

2.6. Which of the following input related activity has been carried out by the project in your school?

Input-related activity	Yes	No
Provided financial support to girls		
Provided seed money for income generation activities.		
Conducted awareness raising programs to girls		
Construction of latrine		
Separate toilet for girls constructed		
Organized tutorial or supplementary classes for girls		
Reading rooms are now available		
Introduced inclusive education		
Conducted community sensitization programs on the importance of girls' education		
Mobilize the community to change the community's perception and attitudes toward girls' education		
Created gender sensitive (friendly) school environment for girls		
Provided reading materials for students		
Textbooks for teachers		
Teacher's Guide		
Textbooks for students		
Awareness creation on HIV and AIDS		
Awareness creation on harmful traditional practices		

2.7. In your opinion, are there changes or improvements registered in your locality due to the inputs provided to the school?

Area of Improvement	Yes	No
Improved the attitudes of female students toward their education		
Improved girls' enrolment in the school.		
Reduced Grades 9 and 10 female students' dropout		
Improved Grades 9 and 10 female students' academic performance		
Reduced female students' repetition rate (in Grade 9)		
Improved girls' awareness of harmful traditional practices		
Improved the community's awareness on the issues related to HIV and AIDS		
Improved the community's awareness on harmful traditional practices		
Improved the community's awareness on the importance of girls' education		
Improved teachers' attitudes toward female students' education		
Improved teachers' treatment of female students		
Improved the academic support teachers provided to female students		

2.8. In your opinion, have the project's activities addressed the main needs of female students in Grades 9-10? Yes _____ No _____

2.9. If your answer to the above question (2.8) is no, list those educational needs of female students which you think were not addressed.

_____
_____
_____
_____

2.10. What is your overall evaluation of the sustainability of project activities? Do you think the community can own and sustain the activities in the absence of the donor?

_____
_____
_____

- How do you evaluate the community's Attitude towards project activities?

_____
_____
_____

- How do you evaluate the financial capacity of the community?

_____
_____
_____

- How do you evaluate the managerial capacity of the community?

  _____
  _____
  _____

2.11. Are there any sustainability measures that are being undertaken by the community, local administration, etc. to own the activities upon termination of the project?

   Yes _____ No _____

- If yes, please list the measures that are being undertaken.

  _____
  _____
  _____
  _____
  _____

2.12. Please describe your overall assessment of the project's contributions to female students, teachers and the community at large.

  _____
  _____
  _____
  _____

2.13. In your opinion, what were the strengths of the project?

  _____
  _____
  _____
  _____

2.14. In your opinion, what were the major weaknesses of the project, if any?

  _____
  _____
  _____
  _____

Appendix B

Interview Guide for School Principals

Woreda _____ **Name of School** _____

Capture: Sex, age, qualification, years of services and position of respondents

1. How well do you know the project "retaining girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Ethiopia"?

2. What are the different activities/supports offered by the project in your school?

3. What are the different benefits gained from the project, in terms of improving girls' achievement, reducing the drop out of girls, reducing repetition of girls in your school?

4. What were the different capacity building programs provided by the project to principals, teachers and community representatives?

   - How do you evaluate the relevance of these training programs in promoting girls education in the area?

5. Do you think the project has addressed the educational demands/needs of the surrounding communities? How?

6. Have you participated in the implementation of the project? Can you tell me what your specific role was?

7. How do you evaluate your work relationship with the project managers?

8. How did the project financial management processes and procedures affect the project implementation process?

9. Do you think the project will continue in the future in case the sponsoring NGO terminates its supports? How?

10. Do you think there are other educational demands that the project did not address? Please list the specific needs that you think need to be addressed in future interventions?

11. What do you think are the lessons learned from the project?

    - What are the strengths of the project?
    - What are major weaknesses of the project?
    - What were the major challenges faced while implementing the project?

12. What is your overall evaluation of the project?

Thank you.

Appendix C

Interview Guide for PTA Members

Name of Project School _____ **woreda** _____

Capture: Sex, age, qualification, years of services and position of respondents

1. Do you know the project "retaining girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Ethiopia"?
2. What are the different activities/supports offered by the project in your school? Who were the beneficiaries/targets of the project?
3. What were your contributions to achieve the objectives of the project?
4. Have you received/participated in any training program to build your capacity by the project? How do you see the relevance of the training programs in promoting girls education in the area?
5. Have you participated in the implementation of the project? What was your specific role?
6. Do you think the project will continue in the future if the sponsoring NGO terminates its supports? How?
7. Do you think there are other educational demands that the project did not address? Please specify them.
8. What do you think are the lessons learned from the project?
   - What are the strengths of the project?
   - What are major weaknesses of the project?

Thank you

Appendix D

Interview Guide for MoE, REB and WEO Experts

Capture: Sex, age, qualification, years of services and position of respondents

1. Do you know the project "retaining girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Ethiopia"?
2. How relevant was the project in promoting girls education in terms of reducing girls drop out, improving their retention, attendance, reducing repetition rates, and improving their academic performance in project schools?
3. How relevant was the project in increasing awareness on the relevance of girls' education among children, community members, teachers and school administrators?
4. Do you think all the activities of the project have been implemented as planned? Were there issues that may have affected implementation of planned activities?
5. Are you satisfied with the pace of implementation of the project? Were there any delays in the course of implementation of the project? What were the causes of delay, if any, according to you?
6. Do you think the project management has used project resources such as the budget economically? If not, suggestions on more economical ways to use the resources?
   What comments or suggestions do you have on the way the Project has been managed?
7. What monitoring and evaluation mechanisms were in place during the implementation period?
8. Do you think the project has produced the results that were envisaged in its objectives?
9. To what extent have the following envisaged results been achieved?
   - Improve the retention of girls in lower secondary schools by reducing dropout rate for girls, and improve their learning outcome as measured by the Ethiopian General Secondary Education Certificate Examination.
   - Sensitise teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process through training in gender-sensitive pedagogy
   - Build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools
   - Strengthen School-Community Partnerships to assist the retention of girls in schools
   - Share the best practice experience during the life of the project and assist in the replication of good practices in other districts of the two regions.
10. What do you think are the impacts of the project on beneficiary girls, community members, teachers and school principals?
11. Have PTAs and education boards received any capacity building/awareness raising training? What were the major components of training provided to the PTAs and education boards?
12. What were the challenges that have been encountered in the course of implementing this project?
13. What lessons have been learnt in the course of implementation of the project?
14. Do you think the project will continue in the future in case the sponsoring NGO terminates its supports? How?

Thank you

Appendix E

FGD Guide for Grade Nine and Ten Female Students

Woreda _____ **Name of School** _____

Capture: Grade and age of the FGD participants

1. How well do you know the project "retaining girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Ethiopia"?
2. What are the different activities/supports offered by the project in your school? Who were the beneficiaries/targets of the project?
3. What were the different supports you obtained from the project?
4. What are the different benefits gained from the project, in terms of improving girls' achievement, reducing the drop out of girls, reducing repetition of girls in your school?
5. Do you think there are other educational demands or needs that the project did not address? If yes, please list or describe them.
6. Do you think the project will continue in the future if the sponsoring NGO terminates its supports? If yes, how?
7. What do you think are the lessons drawn from the project?
8. What are the strengths of the project? What about its major limitations? What were the major challenges faced while implementing the project?
9. What is your overall evaluation of the project? What do you suggest for future actions?

Thank you

.

Appendix F

FORMS FOR RECORDING SECONDARY DATA

(1) Statistics on Enrollment of Male and Female Students (2006 – 2009 E.C.)

Project School	Grade	2006 E.C. (2013/14)			2007 E.C. (2014/15)			2008 E.C. (2015/16)			2009 E.C. (2016/17)		
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												

(2) Statistics on Dropout Rates (2006 – 2009 E.C.)

Project School	Grade	2006 E.C. (2013/14)			2007 E.C. (2014/15)			2008 E.C. (2015/16)			2009 E.C. (2016/17)		
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												

(3) Statistics on Repeaters (2006 – 2009 E.C.)

Project School	Grade	2006 E.C. (2013/14)			2007 E.C. (2014/15)			2008 E.C. (2015/16)		
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
	9									
	10									
	9									
	10									
	9									
	10									

(4) Pass Rate of Female and Male Students on TENTH GRADE National Examination (2006 – 2008 E.C.)

Project School	Number of Students who	2006 E.C. (2013/14)			2007 E.C. (2014/15)			2008 E.C. (2015/16)		
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
	Sat for the exam									
	Passed the exam									
	Sat for the exam									
	Passed the exam									
	Sat for the exam									
	Passed the exam									