

UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA



EDUCATION SECTOR DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME

JOINT EDUCATION SECTOR REVIEW 2012

AIDE MEMOIRE

NOVEMBER, 2012

Contents

Contents	ii
List of Abbreviations	iv
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
1.0 INTRODUCTION	8
1.1 RATIONALE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE JESR 2012	8
1.1.1 EDUCATION SECTOR DIALOGUE	8
1.1.2 RATIONALE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE JESR 2012.....	9
1.2 METHODOLOGY AND SCOPE OF THE JESR 2012.....	10
1.2.1 Joint Monitoring Visits	10
1.2.2 Technical Working Session	10
1.2.3 Joint Assessment of Education Sector Performance	12
1.2.4 JESR Aide Memoire.....	12
1.2.5 High Level Meeting.....	12
2.0 OPENING STATEMENTS AT THE JESR 2012 TECHNICAL WORKING SESSION ...	13
2.1 WELCOMING NOTE.....	13
2.2 STATEMENT FROM THE DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS.....	13
2.3 STATEMENT FROM CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANISATION	15
2.4 STATEMENT FROM THE GOVERNMENT.....	16
2.5 OPENING REMARKS.....	18
3.0 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS FROM KEY INPUTS TO THE JESR 2012	21
3.1 THE EDUCATION SECTOR PERFORMANCE REPORT 2011/2012	21
3.1.1 Basic Education	31
3.1.2 Higher Education.....	36
3.1.3 Technical and Vocational Education and Training.....	37
3.1.4 Folk Education.....	39
3.1.5 Cross-Cutting Issues.....	40
3.1.6 Financial Performance 2011/12.....	42
3.1.7 Human Resources.....	49
3.1.8 Challenges.....	53
3.1.9 Priorities for 2012/13.....	55
3.2 THE JOINT FIELD VISITS REPORT 2012.....	55
3.3 SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION ISSUES FROM PLENARY AND GROUP DISCUSSIONS:.....	59
3.4 CSO PERFORMANCE IN EDUCATION DELIVERY 2010-11.....	60
3.5 DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS CONTRIBUTION IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR 2012	62
3.6 EDUCATION SECTOR MILESTONES.....	66
3.6.1 Status of Implementation of 2011/12 Milestones.....	66
3.6.2 Milestones and Specific Actions for 2012/13.....	67
3.6.3 Proposed Milestones for 2013/2014.....	67
4.0 CLOSING REMARKS FROM THE JESR 2012 TECHNICAL WORKING SESSION	68
4.1 Joint Statement from the JESR Working Sessions.....	68
4.2 CONCLUDING REMARKS BY THE GOVERNMENT	70
5.0 CONCLUSION	72
Annex 6.1: OPENING STATEMENTS FROM THE JESR 2011 TECHNICAL WORKING SESSION	74
Annex 6.1.1. Opening Statement by Government Chair.....	74
Annex 6.1.2. Opening Statement by Education Development Partners' Group	78

Annex 6.1.3 Opening Statement by the Civil Society Organisations (CSOS).....	81
Annex 6.1.4 Opening Statement by the Guest of Honour.....	83
Annex 6. 2: EDUCATION SECTOR MILESTONES:	87
Annex 6.2.1 STATUS OF 2011/12 MILESTONES AND SPECIFIC ACTIONS AS OF AUGUST 31, 2012.....	87
Annex 6.2.2 MILESTONES AND SPECIFIC ACTIONS FOR 2012/2013	108
Annex 6.2.3 PROPOSED MILESTONES 2013/2014	109
Annex 6.3: JOINT ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATION SECTOR PERFORMANCE FOR 2011/12	110
Annex 6.4: CLOSING REMARKS FROM THE JESR 2012 TECHNICAL WORKING SESSION	118
Annex 6.4.1 Joint Statement from the JESR Working Sessions	118
Annex 6.4.2 Concluding Remarks by Government	121
Annex 6.5 PROCEEDINGS FROM THE HIGH LEVEL MEETING	124
Annex 6.5. 1 Opening Remarks	124
Annex 6.5.2 STATEMENT ON EDUCATION SECTOR REVIEW PROCESS 2011	129
Annex 6.5.3 BRIEF ON EDUCATION SECTOR AIDE MEMOIRE 2011	132
Annex 6.5.4 DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS' COMMENTS ON AIDE MEMOIRE 2011	135
Annex 6.5.5 CIVIL SOCIETY COMMENTS ON AIDE MEMOIRE 2011	138
Annex 6.5.6 GOVERNMENT COMMENTS ON THE AIDE MEMOIRE 2011	142
A: Issues Raised by Participants	145
B: Responses by Government to Issues Raised	146
Annex 7.0 THE WAY FORWARD	149
Annex 8.0 CLOSING REMARKS	150

List of Abbreviations

AIDS	Acquired immune deficiency syndrome
CBET	Competency-Based Education and Training
COBET	Complementary Basic Education in Tanzania
CSOs	Civil Society Organisations
DPs	Development Partners
ED-DPG	Education Development Partners' Group
EFA	Education for All
EFE	Education for Employment
ESDC	Education Sector Development Committee
ESDP	Education Sector Development Programme
ESMIS	Education Sector Management Information System
ETP	Education and Training Policy
FDCs	Folk Development Colleges
FE	Folk Education
FY	Financial Year
GER	Gross Enrolment Rate
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
JESR	Joint Education Sector Review
JMV	Joint Monitoring Visits
LGAs	Local Government Authorities
MCDGC	Ministry of Community Development Gender and Children
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MIS	Management Information System
MKUKUTA	Mkakati wa Kukuza Uchumi na Kupunguza Umaskini Tanzania
MOEVT	Ministry of Education and Vocational Training
NECTA	National Examination Council
NER	Net Enrolment Rate
NGOs	Non Governmental Organisations
NSAs	Non State Actors
PE	Personnel Emoluments
PEDP	Primary Education Development Programme
PMO-RALG	Prime Minister's Office Regional Administration and Local Government
PS	Permanent Secretary
PSLE	Primary School Leaving Examination
SEDP	Secondary Education Development Programme
TAMONGSCO	Tanzania Association of Managers and Owners of Non-Government Schools and Colleges
TCs	Teacher Colleges
TEN/MET	Tanzania Education Network/Mtandao wa Elimu Tanzania
TRCs	Teachers' Resource Centres
TSH	Tanzanian Shillings
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
TWG	Technical Working Group
TWSS	Technical Working Sessions
VET	Vocational Education and Training
VETA	Vocational Education and Training Authority
VETCs	Vocational Education and Training Centre

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. The 2012 Education Sector Review Aide Memoire (AM) summarizes the key findings, deliberations and recommendations of the Joint Education Sector Annual review (JESR). The JESR is the culmination of the on-going sector dialogue process that allows key stakeholders in the sector, the Government (GoT), Development Partners (DPs) and Non-State Actors (NSAs) including Civil Society Organisations (CSOs), Faith-Based Organizations (FBOs) and the Community to have an open space for discussions, challenges and agreements on technical and policy issues in order to improve the quality of education services delivery throughout the year. The sector dialogue also includes meetings with the High government officials - Minister and Permanent Secretary , and other officials and representatives of the community at school, district and regional levels during the field monitoring visits and the JESR technical working sessions.
2. Sector reviews are relevant to the Government of Tanzania in its implementation of the MKUKUTA II, the Tanzania Development Vision 2025, the Five Year Development Plan (5YDP), the Election Manifesto 2010, the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), as well as Education for All (EFA) goals and other international commitments. In the context of the Poverty Reduction Budget Support (PRBS) review process an annual Performance Assessment Framework (PAF) is used that includes indicators on Satisfactory Sector Reviews. The agreed key areas for a sector review include discussions on financing and budgeting as integral components of the national planning and budgeting system; accountability and sector dialogue and; overall progress on agreed targets and results monitoring.
3. The JESR process comprises five main components: Joint Monitoring Visits to Councils; a Technical Working Session; a Joint Assessment of Education Sector Performance; Preparation of the JESR Aide Memoire 2012; and, a High Level Meeting (HLM) to review and approve the JESR Aide Memoire 2012.

4. This AM summarizes the key deliberations from the JESR technical working session discussions. The 2012 Technical Working Session was different from previous years in that the review of the Annual Education Sector Performance Report 2011/2012 (ESPR) formed the main basis of discussions and reported on overall progress highlighting the achievements of the agreed priorities, outputs, outcomes and milestones, including data from Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MOEVT), Prime Minister's Office, Regional Administration and Local Government (PMO-RALG) and Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children (MCDGC). Specific presentations were also done on key components including: Financial performance based on the budget, where financing has been targeted (areas of focus, education levels and trends); Human resources review; Review of sub sector performance in relation to the priority activities identified in the sub-sector's development programmes; implementation of the agreed milestones and specific actions for 2011/12; confirmation of the Government's priorities and milestones for 2012/2013; and proposal of new milestones for 2013/2014.

Other presentations and discussions were on DPs Contribution to the education sector; CSOs Performance in the education sector and discussion of the findings of the Joint Monitoring Visits to Councils. The AM also records the agreed assessment of sector performance in 2011/12 based on the agreed rating framework.

5. Joint Assessment of Education Sector Performance:

The Education Sector has established a jointly agreed rating framework which incorporates three key areas of assessment: 1) finance and budgeting; 2) results and performance; and, 3) accountability and sector dialogue. Following the completion of the Technical Working Session, Government and DPs representatives assess the education sector performance using the indicators and rating scale in the jointly agreed rating framework. This year's rating exercise was preceded by reviewing the rating framework in March 2012 and approved at the normal dialogue structure. The process of assessment was concluded on 5th November 2012. The final agreed

score for the sector is 62% implying a Satisfactory Performance. It should be noted that the score for 2011/12 cannot be compared with previous years because the indicators are not all the same.

However, during the assessment it was felt that the revised framework is good but there are few indicators that need further revision to make it more robust.

6. Education Sector Milestones:

- a) The stakeholders of the education sector sought ways of getting a common and better understanding of the milestones process and was agreed to hold a specific session on Milestones in 18 September, 2012. The main purpose was to discuss and develop a common understanding of the concept of Milestones in the context of the Education Sector and prepare participants for discussions during the JESR 2012 on upcoming Milestones.
- b) For the year 2011/12, a total of 13 milestones were developed and included 57 specific actions. Review of implementation of milestones and specific actions conducted at mid-year (13th March, 2012) showed that most of the specific actions in the 2011/12 milestones had not yet been achieved due to various reasons. It was then jointly agreed that the timeframe for completion of the milestones be extended to 31st August, 2012. The purpose of developing these milestones nearly one year in advance is to ensure that relevant departments have sufficient time to determine the necessary specific actions and include these in the work plans, budget requests and other planning processes, including procurement plans, for the following year. However, there were major constraints in implementation of agreed milestones that included: inadequate budget allocations and late receipt of funds; large number of specific actions, which lead into partial implementation of milestones; agreed milestones are not necessarily the same as the Government's priorities; and, some milestones or specific actions are not clearly worded or well understood by all parties.
- c) Milestones and Specific Actions for 2012/13: JESR 2011 also developed a list of eight milestones for 2012/13. Due to the questions raised on the purpose and context of milestones, the process of developing specific actions for these milestones has not been fully completed and work is still in progress. In this

context stakeholders agreed that the proposed milestones will be further prioritized so as to come-up with few focused and implementable milestones agreed in respective education sector fora.

- d) Unlike previous years when a list of proposed milestones were agreed upon at the technical review session, this year (2012) the stakeholders jointly agreed to propose broad areas for further deliberation at the education sector dialogue process in order to come up with specific milestones that will be implemented in 2013/14. The proposed broad areas that will be targeted are: **Quality:** Strengthening the teaching and learning environment at all levels; **Human Resource:** Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector; **Financing:** Expanding base for financing the education sector; and **Governance:** Improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.
7. Summary of findings from key inputs to the JESR 2012 included the following:
- a) The education Sector has made some improvement over the last year towards the achievement of its overall priorities and expected outcomes across all sub-sectors including:
- i. increased access for both boys and girls especially at pre-primary and primary levels, secondary and Higher education although the proportion of girls decrease as they move up the education ladder;
 - ii. increased numbers of teachers trained and employed across the sector as well as improved deployment of quality teachers to underserved rural areas and an improved national primary Pupil Teacher Ratio from 51 (2010) to 46 (2012);
 - iii. improved infrastructures, teaching and learning materials including assistive devices and provision of Higher learning students loans and sponsorship;
 - iv. verification of teachers' claims amounting and payment of salary and non-salary arrears; and provision of continuous professional development to the teaching staff in order to retain teachers in difficult and hard to reach areas and raise their morale and professionalism for

effective teaching.

- v. On financing the sector, the 2012/13 budget show positive trends of an additional 1.27% of total govt. budget (now 19.13%) and the release and expenditure of 2011/12 budget appears satisfactory with a major increase in share to primary sub-sector (now 55.8%).
- b) However, despite these achievements, the sector still faced challenges including shortage of teachers especially to the rural and underserved areas, inadequate teaching and learning materials and, insufficient financial resources to implement the planned priorities. Specifically it was noted that there are still inequities between districts in terms of TPR that still ranges between (30-60); the capitation grants especially for primary school level are still far too low and there is still no ring-fenced budget for pre-primary which represents a major constraint to a planned expansion; a percentage decrease in secondary sub-sector that raises concern over the very low pass rates and existing constraints and the increasing loans provision to Higher Education is still on the rise despite the efforts by the Government which included alternative financing on HESLB to tackle the effects it had on other sub sectors budgets.

The status of key indicators for the sector in 2011/12 is summarized in Table 1.

8. JESR plenary discussions: participants had an opportunity to discuss some key issues and challenges in the education sector both during plenary sessions and in group discussions. Some of the key issues raised and discussed included: :
- a) *Teachers and linkages with quality improvement in school/colleges and universities:* Government to show serious commitment to quality improvement and focus on issues such as teacher's capabilities, efficiency and effectiveness ; teacher's retention; and improving staffing in universities
 - b) *Conducive teaching and learning environment:* improved /increased Infrastructure at all levels of education including classrooms /lecture rooms, laboratories, workshops, libraries and related SWASH aspects.
 - c) *Financing and Alternative funding in education:* GoT to invest more on areas with great returns; Not enough public financing resources to deliver objectives and outcomes in the sector- thus need to look into financing alternatives: Prioritize disbursement of Capitation Grants to school level, mix funding and

partnerships between public and private, and encourage community to support their own schools/institutions. There is need for the Govt. to present and track data on loans repayment to ensure sustainability / quality of Higher education.

- d) *Private public partnership:* There is need for the Government to develop a strategy to enhance mutual understanding between education providers and beneficiaries
- e) *Skills development:* expand funding sources through increased and better utilization of Skills Development Levy and use of Private, Public partnerships, improve curriculum to match the required skills to meet the labor market demands.
- f) *Improved school management, leadership:* provide school management and leadership skills to school managers and improve selection process for heads of schools, and improve systems to control and manage teachers
- g) *Participation of parents and communities:* encourage improved effective participation at all levels of education in the design, planning and implementation of education services; communities/parents to be encouraged to initiate, develop and manage education funds at community levels.
- h) *Literacy skills:* critical need to look at how best to improve the 3Rs particularly at the pre and primary levels as the foundation for improved learning skills, establish -specialization in teacher colleges for early grade teaching and in the 3Rs.
- i) *Quality assurance and inspectorate:* Government to follow up and establish the proposed quality assurance autonomous body, inspectorate to cover the whole Sector, roles and responsibilities of other quality assurance bodies to be clarified and linkages to be improved.

9. Conclusion:

- a) Stakeholders expressed satisfaction that this year's working session was a significant improvement on previous ones and that the changes introduced in

the presentations and discussions by sub-sectors will improve efficiency in reviewing performance in the future.

- b) The stakeholders further agreed on major recommendations of this Review including: aligning the milestones to the budget cycle so that they can be incorporated in the Ministries 2013/14 MTEFs.
- c) As a sign of joint agreement, the education stakeholders who participated at the 2012 JESR, declared their commitment to work together in implementing the Milestones in their various capacities including harnessing of resources to ensure High level achievements of targets set for the Education Sector.

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The Government of Tanzania gives high priority to the provision of quality education to all Tanzanians given its fundamental role in bringing about the nation's social, culture and economic development. This priority is emphasized in the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP/MKUKUTA II), the Tanzania Development Vision 2025, the Five Year Development Plan (5YDP), the Election Manifesto 2010, the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), as well as Education for All (EFA) goals and other international commitments.

Provision of equitable quality education and training at all levels is one of the main tasks of the Government of Tanzania. To realize this objective, it has also to collaborate with educational stakeholders so that they participate actively in the provision of education.

The Government of Tanzania, in collaboration with Development Partners (DPs) and Non-State Actors (NSAs) including Civil Society Organisations (CSOs), Faith-Based Organizations (FBOs) and the Community have been conducting Joint Education Sector Reviews (JESRs) since 2006, to assess the overall performance, impact/progress of the sector in attaining the aforementioned strategies. The JESR 2012 is the seventh such review and built on the successes of previous JESRs.

1.1 RATIONALE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE JESR 2012

1.1.1 EDUCATION SECTOR DIALOGUE

The Joint Education Sector Review (JESR) is the culmination of the on-going sector dialogue that takes place throughout the year. Sector dialogue is an on-going process that allows key stakeholders in the sector (GoT, DPs, and CSOs) to have an open space for discussions, challenges and agreements to improve the quality of education throughout the year.

The key elements of the sector dialogue include engagement in regular dialogue on specific technical issues through active participation in: Technical Working Groups (TWGs); the Education Sector Development Committee (ESDC) and the Folk Education Development Committee (FEDC) Task Forces; and, the ESDC and FEDC. Technical advice and recommendations from the TWGs have played an important role in the sector dialogue process, whereby issues are discussed and debated by experts to arrive at informed decisions regarding delivery of education services.

In addition, the sector dialogue also includes: some ad hoc meetings with the Minister and Permanent Secretary; discussions with officials at school and district level during the field monitoring visits, as well as during the JESR technical working sessions; and, assessment of sector performance by utilizing the jointly agreed rating framework.

1.1.2 RATIONALE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE JESR 2012

Sector reviews are relevant to the Government of Tanzania in its implementation of the MKUKUTA II. In the context of the Poverty Reduction Budget Support (PRBS) review process an annual Performance Assessment Framework (PAF) is used. This PAF includes indicators on Satisfactory Sector Reviews. The Government of Tanzania and Development Partners have jointly identified three key areas for a sector review. They are:

1. Financing and budgeting as integral components of the national planning and budgeting system: sector reviews provide feedback on sector performance and a forum for discussing sector policy and expenditure plans.
2. Accountability and sector dialogue: sector reviews evaluate the quality of the sector dialogue and stakeholders' consultation processes throughout the year, information sharing and the quality of the review processes.
3. Progress on Agreed Targets and Results Monitoring: sector reviews provide the basis for performance monitoring. For General Budget Support, the sector review processes provide information on performance, based on

agreed indicators and milestones, as well as looking at how well the mechanisms that address sector constraints are functioning.

The overall objective for the JESR 2012 was to assess the performance of the education sector for the period 2011/2012 against the agreed milestones and sector wide performance indicators and generate priorities and milestones for the year 2013/2014.

1.2 METHODOLOGY AND SCOPE OF THE JESR 2012

The JESR comprises five main components:

- a) Joint Monitoring Visits to Councils;
- b) a Technical Working Session;
- c) a Joint Assessment of Education Sector Performance;
- d) Preparation of the JESR Aide Memoire 2012; and,
- e) a High Level Meeting (HLM) to review and approve the JESR Aide Memoire 2012.

1.2.1 Joint Monitoring Visits

The JESR 2012 joint monitoring visits were conducted in July 2012. Monitoring teams, including GoT officials, DPs and CSO representatives, visited all 11 education zones to collect and compile the views of education stakeholders on potentials and challenges influencing the teaching and learning as well as the application of science, mathematics, and English subjects in primary and secondary schools, Teacher' Colleges, Vocational training colleges and Folk development colleges.

1.2.2 Technical Working Session

The Technical Working Session for JESR 2012 was held in September 25-27, 2012. It was conducted under the leadership of the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT), on behalf of the Government, and involved representatives of all education sector stakeholders, including DPs and NSAs. Prior to the official opening of the technical working session the DPs, NSAs

and Government of Tanzania gave statements that were then followed by the opening remarks by the Permanent Secretary Ministry of Finance.

The 2012 Technical Working Session was different from previous years in that the review of the Annual Education Sector Performance Report 2011/2012 formed the main basis of discussions. There was a presentation of the overall sector performance followed by specific presentations on the financial performance and Human Resource issues in the sector. There were discussants from DPs and NSAs for the overall sector performance. The sub sector presentations by different government officials also formed the key component of the technical discussions and were discussed separately. This year there was also presentation of DPs Contribution to the Education Sector and CSO performance in the Education sector with discussants from the Government.

The following activities were performed during the Technical Working Session:

- Presentation and review of the Education Sector Performance Report (ESPR), which reported on overall progress highlighting the achievements of the agreed priorities, outputs, outcomes and milestones, including data from MOEVT, PMO-RALG and MCDGC;
- Financial performance based on the budget, where financing has been targeted (areas of focus, education levels and trends);
- Human resources review;
- Review of sub sector performance in relation to the priority activities identified in the sub-sector's development programmes;
- implementation of the agreed milestones and specifications for 2011/12
- DPs Contribution to the education sector;
- CSOs Performance in the education sector;
- Discussion of the findings of the Joint Monitoring Visits to Councils;
- Confirmation of the Government's priorities and milestones for 2012/2013;
- Proposal of new milestones for 2013/2014.

1.2.3 *Joint Assessment of Education Sector Performance*

The Education Sector has established a jointly agreed rating framework which incorporates three key areas of assessment: 1) finance and budgeting; 2) results and performance; and, 3) accountability and sector dialogue. Following the completion of the Technical Working Session, Government and DPs representatives assess the education sector performance using the indicators and rating scale in the jointly agreed rating framework.

1.2.4 *JESR Aide Memoire*

This Aide Memoire (AM) summarizes the key findings, deliberations and recommendations from the JESR technical working sessions, including prioritized milestones and specific actions for 2012/13 and proposed milestones for 2013/14. The AM also records the agreed assessment of sector performance in 2011/12 based on the agreed rating framework.

The Aide Memoire should be read together with:

- i. the Annual Education Sector Performance Report 2011/12;
- ii. the Joint Field Visits Report 2012;
- iii. the JESR 2012 Technical Working Session Report;
- iv. the Development Partner's Contribution to the Education Sector Report, and
- v. the CSOs' Report on Performance in Education Delivery.

1.2.5 *High Level Meeting*

The JESR is finalized by conducting the High Level Meeting (HLM), which is chaired by the Honorable Minister for Education and Vocational Training. The purpose of the HLM is to ratify the Aide Memoire.

2.0 OPENING STATEMENTS AT THE JESR 2012 TECHNICAL WORKING SESSION

2.1 WELCOMING NOTE

The Acting Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT), Celestine Gesimba, welcomed everyone to the review technical working session expressing his expectation that the outputs of the working session would contribute to effective educational planning, as the Review is a forum where priority actions are identified. He thanked Ramadhan Khijja, the Permanent Secretary Ministry of Finance, for coming to officiate the opening of the Education Sector Review working session. He further thanked John Moore, the Acting High Commissioner for Canada for his participation in the working session. The DPs and CSOs representatives were then invited to give statements.

2.2 STATEMENT FROM THE DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS

The Education Development Partners' Group [ED-DPG] statement was presented by the Acting High Commissioner for Canada, John Moore as CIDA is the current chair of the ED – DPG. The High Commissioner expressed thanks for being invited to participate and to address technical working session participants on behalf of the ED-DPG. He noted that the education partners' group consists of bilateral and multilateral agencies that are providing support to the education sector, and that at the moment it consists of ten members who come together as a group to promote coordination among themselves in dealing with the various education ministries in the Government of Tanzania.

The High Commissioner appreciated the fact that this year, for the first time, the technical working session program has a specific timeslot for DPs to share a more detailed report on the contributions of the group to the education sector.

The High Commissioner reiterated that the annual review allows the opportunity to reflect back on what has been achieved during the previous year. He noted areas of sector concern for further attention and action indicating that at last year's education sector High

Level meeting that followed the 2011 review, the key challenges emerging from the review were the need to improve the quality of education at all levels. Also he emphasised the need to address financial constraints facing the sector. He revealed that there has been some positive developments on the quality side, where there is a renewed emphasis on improving learning outcomes in Tanzania. This followed evidence from a variety of studies on the challenges facing the education sector. On the financing side, the allocation of the national budget to the education sector increased last year from 17% to 19% for 2012-13, which is a step in the right direction. Furthermore, he appreciated significant advances that have been made to follow-up on one of last year's key recommendations, to pursue additional financing to the sector from the Global Partnership for Education (GPE). He emphasised that DPs are actively supporting the government in preparing its application and support this process.

However, he noted that many pressing needs such as the need to provide teaching and learning materials and ensure students, particularly girls, are able to continue through to Higher levels of education still remain. He emphasized the need to increase teacher effectiveness through better recruitment, training and motivation. Furthermore he pointed out there is a need to ensure improved access to better quality, relevant secondary education for children from low income households and marginalized groups., He insisted that DPs would prefer to see enhanced involvement of Civil Society and the private sector in education with the view to promoting transparency and accountability to Tanzanian citizens. The High Commissioner indicated that recent data presents a picture of rapid sector expansion, but with declines in the performance and dissatisfaction amongst teachers. He further advised that it is time to become more concerned with what is going on at the local level and that there is a need to continue with implementation of policy and programme reforms within the education sector in Tanzania which they are ready to support.

In concluding the High Commissioner emphasized the importance of critically assessing the sector strengths and weaknesses, achievements and challenges in order to develop new

ideas based on past achievements and moving the sector towards a new vision, which will ultimately benefit all Tanzanians.

2.3 STATEMENT FROM CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANISATION

The CSO opening statement was presented by Mary Soko, the Chair of TEN/MET Board. She pointed that the Joint Education Sector Review (JESR) process is the most significant annual pre-occupation for education stakeholders and is a great opportunity to influence education policy in both the short and long term objectives. It is also a learning experience for education Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), other education stakeholders and an avenue to ensure explicit partnership among the three levels of the school and community, districts or local authorities and the Government.

She explained that the CSOs are operating in 8 zones all over Tanzania, with a total of 157 active members of TEN/MET. The members are engaged in Pre-primary, Primary, Secondary Education and Teacher Education and that they are committed in service delivery complementing the Government efforts and advocating for the poor.

She emphasized that the annual Joint Education Sector Reviews provide an opportunity for all key stakeholders to contribute to the development of education and is an assessment tool for Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Development Partners Group (DPG) and the Government. The Joint Education Sector Review process is also a proof that CSOs have an important role to play in the implementation of policies and programmes.. In addition, the reviews serve as reliable monitoring (and evaluative) tools for assessing the short and long term objectives for the Education Sector Development Programme, 2011-2017.

She noted that CSOs in Tanzania acknowledge the initiatives the Government is making and the DPs support in improving the quality of education at all levels as well as the financial support to the CSOs.

She narrated how during the year, CSOs have actively and constructively participated in education policy processes and advocating for quality education for all children, youths, in pursuing Science, English and Mathematics in Tanzania.

2.4 STATEMENT FROM THE GOVERNMENT

The official Government Statement was presented by The Acting Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training Mr Selestine Gesimba. He pointed out that JESR is the session where the annual overall performance report of the education sector in respect to achievement of priorities, targets and outcomes; joint monitoring visit report and status of implementation of milestones for 2011/12 are shared and discussed. Likewise, priority action areas and milestones for 2013/2014 are identified and proposed for consideration at High Level Meetings.

He reminded participants that last year a similar review was conducted that culminated in a joint assessment of education sector whereby the education sector was rated satisfactory after scoring 70%. The parties also agreed to a revised rating framework through the dialogue fora that will be used this year (2012) and expressed his expectations that participants would work hard as a team to ensure that the output of the session contributes towards attaining a satisfactory sector review which would feed into MKUKUTA/ Public Expenditure Review (PER) and General Budget Support (GBS) reviews.

The Acting Permanent Secretary noted that the 2011/12 Education Sector Performance Report (ESPR) shows remarkable achievements in the areas of improved access, number of teachers, adequate infrastructures, teaching and learning materials including assistive devices and provision of Higher learning students loans and sponsorship. Also he mentioned that, there were 13 identified milestones for the year 2011/2012 as indicated in four priority areas namely improve efficiency and effectiveness, human resources management, increase access to education services and improve quality of education services. He reiterated that the Government expected that, the status of implementation would be shared accordingly in the working sessions.

In addition, he noted that there were a number of documents and initiatives that were supposed to be finalized including: Reviewed Education and Training Policy (ETP); Human Rights Strategy; Adult and Non Formal Education Development Plan. Others were Tanzania Beyond Tomorrow (TBT) e – Education Programme; Unit Cost Study for Secondary and Higher Education; Environmental Strategic Plan; School Wash and Hygiene Strategy; HIV and AIDS guidelines; and the Technical and Vocational Education and Training Development Programme (TVETDP). He indicated that, out of these, the Human Rights Strategy; Adult and Non Formal Education Development Plan; Environmental Strategic Plan; School Wash and Hygiene Strategy; HIV and AIDS guidelines have been finalized and approved. He assured participants that the Government is committed to ensure that the finalized documents are implemented and the pending ones are finalized for approval.

On Teacher's welfare, the Acting Permanent Secretary informed participants that during the year under review, MoEVT in collaboration with PMO-RALG verified teachers' claims amounting to Tsh. 52 billion by 30th June 2012. Furthermore he explained that Tsh 24 billion was paid to 24,654 teachers as salary arrears and Tshs. 18 billion was paid to 19,922 teachers as non-salary arrears . It was also informed that, the non-salary arrears claims for 5,894 teachers were not paid because the claimers failed to present authentic evidence. He noted that the Government is committed to continue paying teachers claims once they are verified.

The Acting PS further pointed out that in 2011/12, a total of 407 primary schools teachers' houses and 270 for secondary schools were constructed and that continuous professional development of personnel was also provided to the teaching staff in order to retain teachers in difficult and hard to reach areas and raise their morale and professionalism for effective teaching.

The Acting PS also noted that, during 2011/12 a number of challenges were observed on effective provision of quality education at all levels such as decrease in enrolment in pre and primary levels, addressing the 3Rs in lower primary education and increased number

of out of school children and youth. Other challenges include: increased demand for Higher education student loans and improving the retention of teachers.

In addition, he pointed out that, the participants would use the opportunity to identify achievable milestones for 2013/2014 and challenges so as to come up with quick win milestones taking into consideration the sector priorities as prescribed in the Five Year Development Plan 2011/12 – 2015/16, the backlog of the milestones 2011/12 as well as those which are not likely to be achieved in 2012/13.

In conclusion, he extended the Government appreciation to Development Partners for their continued support to the education development through budget support, technical advice, consultative dialogue and monitoring and evaluation. He also commended the contributions of Non State Organizations in complementing the Government efforts through service delivery and advocacy. He also reminded all education stakeholders that, what has been achieved were the efforts and responsibilities of all education stakeholders.

2.5 OPENING REMARKS

The Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Finance, Mr Ramadhani Khijja, officiated the opening of the 2012 Annual Joint Education Sector Review. He thanked organizers and all the participants for making the session a reality. On behalf of the Government of the United Republic of Tanzania, he thanked all stakeholders for sparing their time to attend the working session.

He noted that the education sector has been conducting annual reviews since 2006, with the aim of assessing the performance of the sector in the context of the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty, Millennium Development Goals and Education for all targets. He highlighted that the sector performance was reviewed through the annual performance report data from the relevant education sector Ministries in terms of the

extent to which the sector has implemented agreed priority actions identified in the previous year.

The Permanent Secretary further asserted that education sector reviews are relevant to the Government of Tanzania as they provide inputs to the Annual General Budget Support Review process as well as the Poverty Reduction Budget Support process. He mentioned that the JESR was one of the underlying processes of the General Budget Support and Performance Assessment Framework (PAF). In the context of MKUKUTA, he insisted that the PAF is used to assess the performance against agreed targets and focuses on key areas that include: Financing and Budgeting; Accountability and Sector Dialogue; and Progress on Agreed Targets that have also been incorporated in the Education Sector Rating Framework.

He also emphasized that the objective of Joint Education Sector Review 2012 was to assess performance of the education sector against the agreed milestones and sector wide performance indicators including assessment of different reports related to outcome and outputs; key priorities identified in sub sector programmes, sector dialogue and financing including trends on budgetary allocations as well as budget executions. He also hoped that discussions on the Education Sector performance report, Civil Society organizations (CSOs), Development Partners Contribution in the education sector, field visit report and the status of implementation of milestones would lead to identification of the key strategies that will facilitate finalization of 2012/13 milestones and identification of milestones for 2013/2014.

Furthermore, he underlined the Government's high priority commitment to the provision of quality education to all Tanzanians at all levels, and reiterated the importance of education sector in the attainment of medium and long term plans and strategies. He emphasized that reviews should be continuous and regular processes in the sector so as to provide avenue for discussing and assessing education issues and challenges with a view to finding solutions.

In addition, he pointed out that despite the current achievements in the education sector there are a number of challenges particularly securing adequate budget to meet the provision of quality education. He urged participants to come up with 'quick win milestones' in line with the Tanzania Five Year Development Plan 2011/12 – 2015/16, that will provide solutions for taking the education reform agenda forward.

In conclusion he thanked all education stakeholders for their support to facilitate provision of equitable quality education in Tanzania.

3.0 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS FROM KEY INPUTS TO THE JESR 2012

3.1 *THE EDUCATION SECTOR PERFORMANCE REPORT 2011/2012*

The Education Sector has made some improvement over the last year towards the achievement of its overall priorities and expected outcomes. A number of achievements and challenges were recorded during implementation across all sub-sectors.

Key achievements in the sector include increased access for both boys and girls especially at pre-primary and primary levels, secondary and Higher education although the proportion of girls decrease as they move up the education ladder. There were also increased numbers of teachers trained and employed across the sector.

Despite these achievements, the sector still faced challenges including shortage of teachers especially to the rural and underserved areas, inadequate teaching and learning materials and, insufficient financial resources to implement the planned priorities.

The status of key indicators for the sector in 2011/12 is summarized in Table 1.

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	S	MDG	M	P	R		
Pre-Primary Education													
Net Pre-Primary school enrolment	2004	24.6 %	37.2%	37.5% (m=37.4 %, f=37.7)	42.4% (m=42.7 %, f=42.1%)	39.9% (m=41.0, f=38.8)	A	√	√	√	√	BEST	
Total number of teachers pre-primary	2004	10,365	17,338 (m=10,554, f=6,784)	16,349 (m=7,657, f=8,692)	10,830 (m=5,856, f=4,974)	9,352 (m=4410, f=4942)						BEST	
Primary Education													
Net Primary school enrolment	2000	59%	95.9% (m=95.84, f=95.96)	95.4% (m=95.2, f=95.6)	94% (m=93.7, f=94.2)	92% (m=91.4, f=92.5)	A	√	99 %	√	√	BEST	
Survival rate to Standard VII	2000	70%	62.4% (m=61.2, f=63.6)	69.3% (m=66.6, f=72.1)	66.4% (m=64.0, f=68.8)	72.3% (m=68.1, f=76.5)		√	√	√	√	BEST	
% of cohort completing Standard VII	2000	70%	53% (m=51.7, f=54.3)	62.6% (m=60.0, f=65.2)	62.6% (m=60.0, f=65.2)	54.8% (m=52.2, f=57.4)		√	90 %	√	√	BEST	
Standard VII examination pass rate	2000	22%			53.5% (m=59.0, f=48.3)	58.3% (m=62.5, f=54.5)		√	60 %	√	√	BEST	

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	S	MDG	M	P	R		
Transition rate from standard VII to Form I (m/f not available)	2000	21.0 %	51.6%	43.9%	52.2%	53.6%		√	50 %	√	√	BEST	
Primary dropout rate (m/f not available)	2003	3.8%	3.7%	2.6%	3.4%	0.83%						BEST	
Proportion of children with disability attending primary school (Based on GER)	2006	0.24 %	0.32% (m=0.38, f=0.27)	0.35% (m=0.40, f=0.29)	0.36% (m=0.40, f=0.33)	0.34% (m=0.19, f=0.14)		√	20 %	√	√	BEST	
Percentage of Orphanage and Vulnerable Children(OVC) enrolled in primary school	2006	8.6%	10.34% (m=10.34, f=10.35)	10.33% (m=10.27, f=10.39)	10.26% (m=10.33, f=10.19)	2.5% (m=1.26, f=1.27)			20 %			BEST	
Primary teacher/pupil ratio	2000	1:46	1:54	1:51	1:48	1:70		√	1,45	√	y	BEST	
Primary pupil/classroom ratio	2006	1:92	1:109	1:72	1:66	1:70							
Primary pupil/textbook ratio	2001	1:2	1:3	1:5	1:5	1:5			1:01				
Primary repetition rate (m/f not available)	2003	5.3%	2.5%	2.8%	2.6% (m=1.36, f=1.24)	2.6% (m=1.37, f=1.27)						BEST	
Total number of Primary School teachers	2003	113,980	157,185 (m=80,06)	165,856 (m=8217)	175,449 (m=8609)	180987 (m)						BEST	

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	S	MDG	M	P	R		
Primary qualified teacher (gradeA+above)/pupil ratio	2003	1:106	6, f=77,119)	0, f=83686)	8, f=89351)	=87601, f=93386)			0.0847			BEST	
Percentage of Primary school teacher with relevant qualification (Grade A + above)	2003	53.89 %	91.2%	94.5%(m=93.3, f=95.7)	96.5%(m=95.6, f=97.3)	96.6 (m=96.3, f=96.9)							
Pupil/ toilet(pit latrine) ratio for primary schools	2005	0.08	1:89(m=1:92, f=1:86)	1:56 (m=1:57, f=1:56)	1:53 (m=1:54, f=1:51)	1:56 (m=1:56, f=1:55)							
Secondary Education													
Net Secondary Enrolment % form 1-4	2002	6.0%	29.1% (m=29.7, f=28.5)	30.8% (m=31.8, f=29.9)	34.5% (m=35.4, f=33.7)	36.6% (m= 36.5, f=36.6)		√	50 %	√	√	BEST	
Net Secondary enrolment % form 5+6	2002	0.4%	1.5% (m=1.4, f=1.5)	1.9% (m=2.1, f=1.8)	2.0% (m=2.5, f=1.6)	2.7% (m=3.2, f=2.2)			25 %			BEST	
% of female enrolment in form I	2003	48.2 %	44.60%	45.30%	47.24%	49.40%			50 %			BEST	
% of cohort completing secondary form 1-4	2003	91.0 %	84.95% (m=93.3,	72.9% (m=75.2,	78.1% (m=77.6,	77.1% (m=77.2%, f						BEST	

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09 f=76.5)	2009/10 f=70.3)	2010/11 f=78.4)	2011/12 =77.0%)	S	MDG	M	P	R		
% of cohort completing secondary form 5+6	2004	90.1%	103.4% (m=111.2, f=92.6)	78.2% (m=80.9, f=74.4)	96.7% (m=103.7, f=86.3)	94.2% (m =101.7%, f =91.3%)						BEST	
Division 1-III in Form 4 examinations pass rate (f/m not available)	2000	25.8%	17.9%	11.4%	10.00%	NA			70%			BEST	
Secondary dropout rate	2003	6.6%	3.29%	3.24%	2.6%	4.00%						BEST	
Secondary repetition rate form 1-4	2003	3.4%	1.7%	1.5%	1.7%	1.10%						BEST	
Total number of secondary school teachers	2003	16,399	33954(m =22972,f =10982)	40517(m =27821,f =12696)	52146(m =36357,f =15789)	65,086 (m = 44524 ,f = 20562)						BEST	
Secondary qualified teacher (Diploma + above) /pupil ratio	2003	1:33	1:57	1:51	1:40	1:34							
percentage of secondary students provided with scholarship	2003	6,019	11895(0.81%)	NA	NA	NA						BEST	
Teacher Education													

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	S	MDG	M	P	R		
Percentage of primary school teaches with relevant qualifications (grade A+ above)	2003	53.89 %	91.2%	94.5% (m=93.3, f=95.7)	96.5% (m=95.6, f=97.3)	99.3% (m=99.3, f=99.3)		√	90 %			BEST	
Percentage of secondary school teaches with relevant qualifications (diploma + above)	2003	86.57 %	76.2% (m=73.5, f=81.8)	79.2% (m=76.7, f=84.9)	84.7% (m=82.9, f=88.9)	30.2% (m=30.8, f=29.3)			90 %			BEST	
Total intake per year (college capacity)	2005	26,224	35,371 (m=18218, f=17139)	36,648 (m=20051, f=16597)	37,698 (m=20385, f=17313)	43,258 (m=24,360, f=18,898)						BEST	
Percentage of tutor in teachers' colleges with relevant qualifications (degree + above)	2004	36.4 %	63.6%	95.4%	97%	98.10%						BEST	
Adult and Non-Formal Education													
COBET enrolment	2005	221,479	47,091	72,799 (m=39,503, f=33,296)	82,459 (m=44,626, f=37,833)	76867 (m=41241, f=35626)						BEST	
Enrolment in ICBAE Centres	2005	1,668,503	57,289	924,893 (m=473,78)	1,050,517 (m=499,899)	907,771 (m=434,466)						BEST	

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	S	MDG	M	P	R		
Vocational Education													
Vocational Education enrolment	2005	35,797	120,644	82,962,	104,840	121,348		√				VETA	
% of female in Vocational Education Training	2005	45%	47%	39.3%	49.7%	47.3%						VETA	
Completion rate	2005	85.7%	86.3%	65.3%	76.6%	90.3%						VETA	
VET Examination pass rate	2005	63.20%	80.20%	76%	77%							VETA	
Technical Education													
Total Enrolment Technical Education	2006	40,059	49,185	50,173	85,040	112,447						NACTE/BEST	
% of female enrolment in Technical Education institutions	2006		43.2%	40.8%	45.5%	47.9%						NACTE/BEST	
Number of students in Evening programs	2011	487			487	7250							
% of Students enrolled in Evening programmes	2011	0.6			0.6	6.4							
Number of students accessing programs	2012	406				406							

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	S	MDG	M	P	R		
through ODL													
% Of Students in ODL	2012	0.4				0.4							
Number of Government sponsored students	2011/12	16112				16112						BEST	
% of Government sponsored students	2011/12	14.3%				14.3%						BEST	
Number of students receiving Loans	2011/12	9726				9726						BEST	
% of students receiving Loans	2011/2012	8.60%				8.60%						BEST	
Higher Education													
Gross Enrolment Ratio Higher Education (in Percentage)	2005/06	0.27%	2.5%	5.3%	8.0%	9.5%		Y	2%	y	y	TCU/BEST	
Total Higher Education student Enrolment	2005/06	40,993	95,525	118,951	139,638	166,484						TCU/BEST	
Percentage of females in Higher Education	2005/06	32.5%	33.3%	35.5%	35.8%	36.40%						TCU/BEST	

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	S	MDG	M	P	R		
Number of Higher education students provided with loan (f/m not available)	2006	42,792	58,798	72,035	91,568	94533						HSLB	
Folk Education													
Total FDC enrolment	2005	25,246	31,462 (f=43%)	29,557 (f=48.7%)	31,877 (f=48.3%)	32,133 (f=48.64%)						MCDGC	
% of female in folk Education	2007/08	43%	48.7%	48.3%	48.3%	48.64%						MCDGC	
number of staff receiving in service training	2005/06	43	25 (f=9)	23	93	45						MCDGC	
Number of people trained in entrepreneurship	2005/06	18,116	31,462	31,039	31,877	32,133						MCDGC	
Macro-Economic Resources													
GDP Growth rate	2003	6.9%	7.4%	6.0%	7.0%	6.40%						NBS	
Share of expenditure allocated to education as % of total budget	2003	18.7%	19.8%	18.3%	17.9%	16.90%						BEST	
Share of GDP allocated to Education	2003	4.0%	5.8%	6.2%	6.3%	5.80%						BEST	
share of GDP allocated to Technical Education	2010/11	0.4%			0.4%	0.28%						BEST	

Table 1: Key Indicators of Education Sector Performance form 2007/08 to 2011/12

Indicator Name and Description	BASELINE		INDICATOR TARGET VALUES (as per Strategic Plan)				Indicator Type					DATA SOURCE /MEANS OF VARIFICATION	COMMENT
	Baseline Date	Indicator Value	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	S	MDG	M	P	R		
Share of GDP allocated to VET	2008/09	0.2%	0.2%	0.2%	0.3%	0.19%						BEST	
Support to Other Providers as % of SDL received	2009		3%		2%	1%						VETA	

Note: MDG – Millennium Development Goals; M11=MKUKUTA; P=PAF; R=Ruling Party Manifesto; S=Sector Monitoring Tool (a=active, f= future use

3.1.1 Basic Education

The Basic Education Sub-Sector is comprised of Pre-primary, Primary, Secondary, Teacher Education, and Adult and Non-formal Education. The major achievements and challenges highlighted in the JESR Performance Report for the FY 2011/2012 by sub-sectors include:

Pre-Primary Education

In Pre-primary Education, orientation seminars on the use of ECD guidelines continued to be provided to teachers in 36 LGAs. However, the enrolment at Pre-primary level for the year 2012 decreased by 3.2% when compared with enrolment of 2011. The decreasing trend in enrolment of Pre-primary had also affected the GER and NER. The GER and NER for the year 2012 was 41.8% and 39.9%, while for the 2011 the GER was 44.5% and NER 42.4%.

Primary Education

In Primary Education, the achievements recorded in the year 2011/12 include: an increase of 1.2% in enrolment at Standard One, an increase in enrolment of standard one to Seven with official age (7-13 years) from 91.5% in 2011 to 93.5% in 2012, pupils' dropout rate improved from 3.3% in 2011 to 3% in 2012 and Gender Parity Index (GPI) improved at the ratio of 1:1 in Primary Education. Also the enrolment of COBET learners Cohort I (age 11-13) has improved and reached 49,293 (22,811 female and 26,482 males). This is a decrease of 11.8% when compared to the enrolment of 55,889 in 2011. A total of 5,758 learners sat for Grade 4 Examination and 4,851 equivalent to 84.2% passed and were mainstreamed into formal Education system.

As regards to learning environment, there was improvement through construction of school facilities including construction of 870 classrooms, 407 teachers' houses, and 11,908 pit latrines and fabrication of 607 desks. This was done by the Government in collaboration with other education stakeholders. The provision of textbooks continued to improve to an

average Book Pupil ration (BPR) of 1:5 but these averages mask geographical inequities as observed during the field monitoring visits.

Furthermore, in the year 2011 a total of 973,812 pupils (462,798 boys and 571,014 girls) sat for PSLE in 2011. Out of these 58.3% (62.5% boys and 54.5% girls) passed. This is an improvement when compared with the achievement of 53.5% attained in year 2010. Similarly, transition rate from primary to Secondary increased from 52.2% in 2010 to 53.6% in 2011.

In addition, a number of activities to improve the quality of teaching and learning were carried out including: designing and typesetting charts for science subjects for Grades I – VII; review of curriculum and syllabi for primary schools; printing and distribution of syllabus to primary schools and conducting 17 subject panel meetings for schools and colleges to solicit views on the implementation of the curriculum.

In relation to Good Governance, the activities done to improve the management of schools included: training of School Committees, Ward Education Coordinators (WECs) on their roles and responsibilities; and ensuring that supervision, monitoring, policy and technical guidance is done from regional and national levels.

However, the overall enrolment at Standard I – VII decreased by 1.4%. The decreasing trend was also realized in GER and NER in 2012 which was 98.4% and 92.0% compared to 2011 where GER was 102.7% and NER was 94.0% respectively.

The children with disabilities enrolled in 2012 were 28,195 (11,979 girls) equivalent to 42.5%. This was a decrease by 7.4% when compared to the enrolment of 30,433 in 2011.

The Pupils Classroom Ratio (CPR) has declined by 4%. In 2011 the CPR was 1:66 compared to 1:70 in 2012 while the national CPR standard is 1:40. Also the pupils toilet ratio for primary schools decreased from 1:53, (1:54 Male and 1:51 Female) in 2011, to 1:56 (1:56 Male and 1:55 female) in 2012.

Secondary Education

Achievements in Secondary Education include: an increased enrolment of Form 1- 4 by 5.4%; transition rate from primary to secondary education from 52.2% in 2011 to 53.6% in 2012; enrolment at Form 5-6 by 3.9% and enrolment of students in Secondary Education through ODL Programme from 49,533 in 2011 to 51,993 2012. The total enrolment (Form 1-6) also rose by 54.0% in 2012 while the students of Form 1 – 6 by gender increased by 5.3 % for boys and 8.9% for girls. The GER for Form 1-6 improved from 36.1% in 2011 to 36.9% in 2012, while the NER increased from 32.1% in 2011to 34.3% in 2012. The NER for Ordinary and Advanced level Secondary Education has also improved from 34.5% and 2.0% in 2011 to 36.6% and 2.7% in 2012 respectively.

In order to ensure equitable enrolment, monitoring and supervision of Form 1 selection in 21 regions and Form 5 selection were successfully done. A total of 457,321 students (223,007 girls and 234,314 boys) were selected to join form one in Government Secondary Schools in 2012. Similarly, a total number of 31,206 students (8,655 girls and 22,551 boys) were selected to join Form 5 in Government secondary schools and technical education.

In addition, the pass rates in the Certificate for Secondary Education Examination (CSEE) showed a slight improvement to 53.6% in 2012 compared to 50.4% in 2011. A number of activities were carried out to improve quality of education. These included: posting a total of 13,192 (7,189 degree and 6,003 diploma holders) new teachers in all LGAs increasing the teaching force from 52,146 (12,212 in Non-Government Secondary Schools) in 2011 to 65,025 (13,567 in Non-Government secondary Schools) in 2012. This is an increase of 12,879 teachers (24.7%).

Other quality improvement initiatives included: the preparation of a draft “Strategy for Management of Teachers Attendance” and conducting in-service Training (INSET) for Science, Mathematics, Languages and ICT programme. Other initiatives were designing and development of training materials; selection of 400 licensed teachers to join Teachers Colleges; training 61 non education graduates on pedagogical skills, training of curriculum

coordinators on design and development of competency based curriculum and development of e-learning curriculum.

Other efforts were put on improving provision of textbooks especially Literature books for English language, reviewing syllabuses and teacher's guides, preparation and distribution of modules and syllabi to schools. Also improved examination processes and Establishment of mini Data Centre for Storage Area Network (SAN) were carried out through NECTA. A new sel-form affixed with student's photo was also developed and linked with NECTA's Examination results database. These interventions strengthened the capacity of NECTA towards enhanced students' assessment system.

On the teaching and learning environment, there are initiatives to upgrading infrastructure in 264 secondary schools in order to make them functional. In addition, a total of 1,316 classrooms, 127 laboratories, 95 hostels, 12 libraries, 270 teacher's houses and 1,029 pit latrines were constructed; and 125,855 desks were fabricated using local funds and community contributions.

Teacher Education

During the Financial year 2011/12, a total of 43,258 (18,898 females; 24,360 males) which is an increase of 14.7% teacher trainees compared to 2011 were enrolled in both Government and non-Government Teachers Colleges. A total of 12,360 were enrolled in pre-service Diploma, 1,056 in Diploma in -service training, 25,626 grade A and 51 in certificate in special needs education. A total of 11,014 grade A Teachers and 7,771 Diploma teachers graduated from different Teachers' Colleges in Tanzania Mainland.

A number of activities aimed at improving the quality of education were carried out including: INSET for 2,052 primary school teachers, 60 licensed teachers and 120 tutors in teaching English, Mathematics, ICT and teaching skills and bridging course to 1,415 form six leavers in science, mathematics and English subjects. Other activities were: introduction to pedagogical leadership course in all 34 Government College Principals, monitoring exercise

aiming at observing the implementation of the training and Block teaching practice to Grade A and Diploma students and editing of teachers' modules for certificate and diploma levels.

Adult and Non-Formal Education

In year 2012, the total enrolment of adult learners in the ICBAE programme for both functional and post-literacy was 907,771 (male 434,466 and female 473,305). The enrolment of out-of-school in the COBET programme for Cohorts II was 27,574 of which 14,759 (53%) were boys and 12,815 (47%) were girls. In 2011, COBET Cohort II learners who sat for Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE) were 2,173 (boys 1,253 and girls 920) and 1,576(72%) passed and joined secondary education. A number of initiatives were carried out to improve the facilitation processes including: preparation of the curriculum framework that caters for the local level needs and linkage with their socio-economic development; retraining of facilitators, and fundraising in collaboration with other education MDAs and key education stakeholders for the effective implementation of the AE/NFE programme. In addition, Monitoring and Evaluation of implementation of AE/NFE programmes was conducted.

School Inspection

During 2011/12, a total number of 6,228 (31%) of the targeted 20,045 educational institutions were inspected and provided with academic and professional support on how best to prepare lessons to enhance teaching and learning. In addition, in-house training was given to newly appointed school inspectors and a workshop to develop Inspectorate Management Information System (IMIS) for School Inspectors at District and National levels, Ward Education Coordinators and Information and Communication Technology Experts was conducted. Similarly, a total of 98 teachers were recruited to be School Inspectors and attended an induction course. The National Form Two Examination for 2011 was conducted in 4,187 centres and a total of 418,974 Candidates sat for the examination where 190,259 candidates passed the examinations (45.40%), out of which 77,388 were girls and 112,871 boys.

3.1.2 Higher Education

The key priorities for Higher education subsector in 2011/12 included provision of grants, sponsorship and scholarships to students studying at various universities in and outside the country; undertaking a cost analysis, PETS and alternative sources of funding. Other priorities were: coordinating implementation of the Higher Education Development Programme (HEDP) and Science and Technology Higher Education Project (STHEP) programmes; improving the students' loan application, means testing for loans eligibility and improving the central application and admission system for Higher education and overall staff support and development.

Key achievements in improving access to Higher education included: enrolment of a total of 166,484 students in 43 universities and university colleges (11 Government and 32 Non Government) with a total of 60,592 female students (equivalent to 36.4 of total enrolment). This was an increase of 0.6% from 2010/2011 enrolment. The Government continued to offer special assistance to students with disabilities in some universities and university colleges namely; UDSM, MZUMBE, SUA, MUCCOBS and DUCE. There was an increase of medical, dental and veterinary students from 1,750 in 2010/2011 to 1,900 in 2011/2012. The private sector continued support the Government in establishing and running Higher education institutions particularly in education, medical, business and engineering degree programs. Three universities were established to offer education programs. These are; Eckenford Tanga University, University of Bagamoyo and Jordan University Collegewhile Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture runs business programs, and Saint Francis University College of Health and Allied runs medical courses and engineering programs by St. Joseph College of Engineering and Technology.

In 2011/2012 the Ministry also coordinated 200 scholarship offered to Tanzania under Bilateral Cultural Agreements for both undergraduate and postgraduate studies, and 292 postgraduate scholarships from Government universities under the Science Technology and Higher Education Project financed by the World Bank. The Ministry also, participated in Higher education exhibitions which had opportunity to conduct awareness on

opportunities for studies in Higher education and critical policy issues. The same opportunity happened during the celebration of 50 years anniversary of political independence in December 2011.

On aspects of quality improvement, the Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU) coordinated admission of 45,598 applicants for university education under the reviewed version of Central Admission System and studies of 31 PhD staff in German under DAAD/Tanzania Agreement on cost sharing and accredited 81 programmes and courses to be offered in universities. Other aspects included finalization of the University Qualification Framework; conducted 7 seminars on leadership and management; finalized the Draft of National Qualification Framework and the Regulations of the Framework which was submitted to stake holders and conducted technical evaluation to 16 institutions and prepared guidelines for awards, employment, staff performance review and career development; norms for governance units; postgraduate training; and credit accumulation and transfer.

In addressing the aspect of capacity building, the MOEVT under the STHEP covered costs for the long courses training of 162 and 195 academic staff at the level of PhD and Masters respectively and 379 administrative and academic staff in the implementing institutions and at the Ministry's Headquarters. The Higher Education Students Loans Board has supported 235 academic staff in public and Private Universities and 41 academic staff are attending long courses under DAAD – Tanzania programme, while 80 academic staff are undergoing training under the sponsorship of the Ministry.

3.1.3 Technical and Vocational Education and Training

The TVET recorded a number of achievements in 2011/12 including: the completion of construction of new VTCs in Lindi, Pwani, Manyara, and Dar es Salaam. The number of VTCs offering vocational education and training increases to 750 centers in 2011 as compared to 672 in the year 2010. The number of private VTCs increased from 523 in 2010 to 586 in 2011. The number of registered technical institutions increased from 240 in

2010/11 to 287 in 2011/12. The number of technical institutions allowed to enroll students (with full and provisional registration) increased from 232 in 2011 to 276 in 2012.

On access, student enrolment in VET increased from 104,840 in 2010 to 121,348 in 2011 out of whom 56,849 were female (47%) of the total enrollment. The enrolment in short courses increased from 12,088 in 2010 to 46,732 in 2011. In technical education student enrolment increased by 32.2% from 85,040 in 2010/11 to 112,447 in 2011/12 of which 90,641 students were enrolled in public institutions. The enrolment of female students increased from 38,698 (46.3%) in 2010/11 to 53,889 (47.9%) in 2011/12. Bridging programmes for electrical engineering and mechanical engineering were piloted whereby 48 students attended the programmes to completion at Arusha Technical College.

The retention of students in VET substantially improved. A total of 110,014 students attended and completed long and short courses in various skills representing a drop out of 9.3% as compared to 25.5% in 2010. The dropout rate for VET female students decreased substantially from 24.9% in 2010 to 9.8% in 2011.

A total of 36 technical Institutions were inspected for accreditation in 2011/12. The number of technical institutions with full and provisional accreditation status which are allowed to offer competence-based programmes increased from 98 in 2010/11 to 107(37.2%) in 2011/12.

In addition, a total of 545 vocational teachers attended vocational instructor certificate courses while 67 attended vocational instructor diploma courses in 2011 at Morogoro Vocational Teachers Training College. Furthermore, a total of 3630 vocational teachers/instructors received short term training in areas of ICT, CBET programme. Also 452 instructors from 16 technical institutions received training on modern delivery techniques of curriculum using a CBET approach. 127 TVET teaching staff received training on CBET curriculum development and CBET programme delivery. Delivery through EFE Project

A study to establish the situation of TVET in Tanzania was also conducted. The study revealed that an average of 402,305 Standard VII, 156,309 Form 4 and 8,332 Form 6 leavers could not be selected for further general education per annum over the last five years. Further,

the Five Years Development Plan observes the need for an annual throughput of at least 125,000 technicians and 635,000 workers with vocational qualifications and by 2015. This entails the need for expansion to the tune of trebling the current TVET capacity.

The main challenges are mobilizing adequate resources to facilitate the expansion of physical facilities including: establishment of 28 district vocational centers, new technical colleges; acquiring adequate and modern equipment, tools and teaching materials that match with modern technologies so as to equip graduates with required skills; and increasing the allocation of SDL funds to cater for an increase of students at newly constructed VTCs.

3.1.4 Folk Education

A number of achievements made by Folk education in 2011/012 included: enrolment of 32,133 students out of which, 15,632 (48.64 %) were female learners, 348 adults with disabilities (53% female), and 83 young mothers (equivalent to 60%) increase compared to 2010/2011 were equipped with knowledge and skills to enable them acquire self employment. The students received training on skills like Tailoring, Masonry, Mechanics, Electrical installation, Computers etc. All students also attended compulsory modules such as HIV and AIDS prevention and control, environmental management and gender. FDCs also provided training to 52 staff in various professional skills and training of trainers to 65 teachers on application of appropriate technology namely power tillers, fuel conserving stoves, push carts, oxen and plough, incubators, bricks pressing machines and fruits and vegetables preserving machines. The main achievement in 2011/2012 was prior preparations made to ensure 25 FDCs enrol vocational education and training students by January 2013.

The sub sector also conducted a study in collaboration with TVET on the required skills and emerging skills in the market. The findings indicate that skills provided through folk education promote self employment. Also there are a number of emerging skills related to the skills currently being provided such as Computer, ICT, and Electronics. The main

challenge is that FDCs are seriously underfunded to an extent that most of the activities are not fully implemented including the Folk Education Development programme activities.

3.1.5 Cross-Cutting Issues

In the context of this Aide memoire, the Cross Cutting Issues report covers areas of Gender , HIV and AIDS, Environmental Education; Guidance and Counseling , Human Rights Education, Education Sector Management Information System (ESMIS), Information Education and Communication (IEC), ICT and Special Needs Education.

Gender:

In 2011/12, there were finalization of Gender Strategic Plan and Gender Mainstreaming Guidelines, training modules on gender for capacity building of MoEVT management, staff, institutions, agencies and developing *Gender Sensitization Materials*.

HIV and AIDS:

In 2011/12, there were improvements of Sexual Reproductive Health Education, Peer Education and Life skills targeting sexual behaviour change for learners at all levels. 150 peer educators in 6 selected Higher Learning and TVET institutions and 30 Health service providers in the same institutions were trained. Research was conducted on *Behaviour Change for Learners* for policy interventions and decision making as well as training of all participants enrolled in FDCs on HIV and AIDS prevention and control.

Minimum package on SRH, HIV and Life Skills for learners that will be used in primary schools teachers were developed and comprehensive SRH/HIV/Life Skills training was conducted to 300 teachers from selected schools in Muheza and Handeni Districts in Tanga as well as Mtwara and Iringa regions.

Guidance and Counselling:

The major activities in 2011/12 were building capacity of the primary education teachers to provide quality guidance and counseling services to learners in all primary schools and establishing clear mechanisms for coordinating research to support primary education responses to guidance and counselling programme and services. Other activities

implemented were Establishing monitoring, evaluation and reporting mechanism for guidance and counseling programme in primary education and Strengthening programme management and coordination in primary education. .

Human Rights Education:

In 2011/12, there was finalization of Human Rights Education Strategic Plan and budget for its implementation.

Information Communication and Technologies (ICTs):

The main issues were Promoting ICTs for teaching and learning at all levels of education through implementation of Tanzania Beyond Tomorrow (TBT), e-education Programme; and Preparing and broadcasting 632 radio programmes for primary schools.

Education Sector Management Information System (ESMIS):

In 2011/12 forty (40) computer sets were purchased and installed to the 40 Councils under pilot in Basic Education Management Information System (BE- MIS). The process is continuing to other 68 Councils. Build capacity was provided to 204 Council technical staff on basic IT skills (Window, Excel and AV).

Information Education and Communication (IEC):

In financial year 2011/12 there were efforts of improving education and training policies, programmes, plans, circulars, strategies and developing MoEVT Communication Strategy.

Special Needs and Inclusive Education:

To widen and increase quality of inclusive education, training was conducted to various groups including: five MoEVT officers on Inclusive Education and Sign Language, 300 teachers at certificate level and 150 teachers at diploma level. Also Education officers and Special Needs Education officers from seven Councils on Special Needs and Inclusive Education; and 5 FDCs namely Arnatouglu, Bigwa, Kisarawe, Ilula and Sengerema provided inclusive education in their programs. Generally enrolment for learners with disabilities increased in all level.

Environmental Education:

In 2011/12, Climate change topics were integrated in History, Science, Civics and Geography subjects syllabi, for certificate teacher training. In addition, National SWASH Strategy and guidelines were developed and SWASH mapping report was launched in Sumbawanga. SWASH sensitization campaign was also conducted to tutors, MoEVT officials, community and School committees. Similarly, the School Inspectorate Checklist was reviewed to incorporate SWASH indicators.

3.1.6 Financial Performance 2011/12

During the financial year 2011/12, the share of the education sector was 17.86% of the total national budget of TSh. 13,525,895 mill. This represented a decrease of 1.04% budget share for the sector, as compared to 18.90% of FY 2010/11. In FY 2012/13 the share of the sector to the total national budget increased by 1.24%. The budget trends analysis in this report focuses only on three Ministries although the education sector cuts across different ministries. The focused ministries are; Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MOEVT), Ministry of Community Development Gender and Children (MCDGC) and Prime Ministers' Office-Regional Administration and Local Government (PMO-RALG). Funds allocated to these three ministries accounted for more than 85% of the total education sector budget.

During the financial year 2011/12, the three ministries had the budget of TSh. 2,204,587mill equivalent to 93.8% of the education sector budget. The remaining share of 6.8% went to other Ministries which are not included in this analysis for instance Ministry of Science and Technology, Ministry of Lands Housing and Human Settlement Development, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism.

In 2012/13, the budget for the three ministries amounts to sh. 2,525,674 mill equivalent to 87% of the education sector budget. The allocation of funds between the three Ministries is as follows: Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MOEVT - Vote 46) Sh. 720,310.00 Mill (equivalent to 25% of total budget of the education sector); Prime Minister Office – Regional Administration and Local Government Authority (PMO-RALG – Vote 56, 79 -89 &95) Sh. 1,795,050 mill (equivalent to 62.1% of total budget of the education sector). Budgets under PMO – RALG Vote 56 is 4,429mill and LGAs budgets is Sh. 1,790,621mill and Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children (MCDGC - Vote 53) Sh. 10,314 Mill (equivalent to 0.4% of total budget of the education sector).

Table 2 The Education Sector budget Trend by Level 2008/09 – 2012/2013 (in

Million)

Sub sector	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13
Primary Education	666,419	830,702	968,729	961,462	1,613,346
Secondary Education	140,196	197,483	414,704	494,250	509,783
Vocational Training	8,007	8,370	8,692	*45,879	*52,649
Other Basic Education	69,630	829	983	816	2,761
Teacher Education - MoEVT	25,250	47,053	28,895	35,892	47,172
Inspectorate - MoEVT	5,900	12,096	11,969	17,806	17,748
Commissioner For Education -- MoEVT	5,702	7,235	8,785	9,316	8,551
Administration - MoEVT	26,867	38,752	40,177	36,224	27,299
UNESCO Commission -- MoEVT	381	968	931	732	1,484
Public Serv. Comm.(Teachers Service)	3,700	4,281	4,405	4,761	4,595
MCDGC	5,386	5,133	10,043	7,348	10,314
Total Basic and Folk Education	957,438	1,152,902	1,498,313	1,614,486	2,295,702
University Education	335,746	413,771	525,464	602,780	584,196
Technical Education	14,796	16,888	17,309	9,726	12,251
Other Higher Education	69,342	N/A	N/A	0	
<i>Other Tertiary(Other Training Institutions)</i>	53,050	62,803	154,872	129,123	
Total Higher Education	472,934	493,462	697,645	741,629	596,447
Development Fund to Local Government		97,516	0	0	
Salary Adjustment				59,096	0
Total Education	1,430,372	1,743,880	2,195,958	2,415,211	2,892,149
Total Govt. Budget	7,215,631	9,513,685	11,609,557	13,525,895	15,119,644
Education to Total Govt. Budget	19.80%	18.30%	18.90%	17.86%	19.13%

*Note: *These figures are estimates for VETA budget from Skills Development Levy.*

The distribution of the education sector budget can also be disaggregated into main sub-sector components

Table 3: Trends of Budget Allocation by Sub-Component 2008/09 – 2012/2013

Sub-Sector	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13
Primary Education	46.60%	47.6%	44.1%	40.0%	55.8%
Secondary Education	9.80%	11.3%	18.9%	20.5%	17.6%
Vocational Training	0.60%	0.5%	0.4%	1.9%	1.8%
Teacher Education - MoEVT	1.80%	2.7%	1.3%	1.5%	1.6%
Administration	1.90%	2.2%	1.8%	1.5%	0.9%
MCDGC	0.40%	0.3%	0.5%	0.3%	0.3%
University Education	23.50%	23.7%	23.9%	25.0%	20.2%
Technical Education	1.00%	1.0%	0.8%	0.4%	0.4%
Other Tertiary	3.70%	3.6%	7.1%	5.4%	-
UNESCO Commission – MOEVT	0.03%	0.1%	0.0%	0.0%	0.1%-
Percent of Total Govt. Budget	19.80%	18.3%	18.9%	17.86%	19.13%

Source: MoF Budget Speech, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training budget speech, Sectors budgets books and LGAs.

Analysis of the budgetary allocations indicated that the budget for primary education increased from 40% in 2011/12 to 55.8% in 2012/13. The allocation for Teachers education increased by 0.1% the same as the allocation for UNESCO. The rest of the education sub-sectors recorded a downward trend in terms of percentage. For instance, the budget for secondary education has decreased from 20.5% in 2011/12 to 17.6% in 2012/13, and Higher education sub-sector has decreased from 25.0% in 2011/12 to 20.2% in 2012/13 a decrease of 4.8%.

Both the field monitoring visits and the technical review revealed a financial gap in financing education activities across the sector. During the field visits lack of adequate or non-existent infrastructure associated with non-conducive working environments for both teachers/lecturers and students was noted. Increased enrolment in all levels and the demand for Higher education student loan in Higher education institutions demands a new approach in financing education and need to explore other financing sources including the use of Public private Partnerships in the provision and financing education. The Government may also wish to accelerate the process of applying for new resources like the Global Partnership for Education (GPE).

Expenditure

During the financial year 2011/12, a total of Sh. 2,042,289 million was released to the three ministries to finance education activities. This is equivalent to 93% of its total approved budget and 71% of the approved sector budget. The expenditure was Sh. 2,042,289mill which was 100% of the total funds released.

Recurrent expenditure for thee ministries was Sh. 1,752,326mill which was 100% of the released funds. The release was 96% of the approved budget to the three ministries. Development expenditure was Sh. 206,607mill which was 100% of the funds released. The release was 71% of the approved budget while expenditure was 100% of the budget released. The release of foreign development funds to the three Ministries was 88,945mil which was 86% of the approved budget and was 100% spent. The expenditure for local development funds was 100% of the funds released and the release was 64% of budget approved to these three Ministries.

Approved budget estimates to PMO-RALG were Sh. 41,444mill for education activities while the release amounted to Sh. 32,100 equal to 77% of its approved budget. The expenditure was Sh. 32,100 mill which is 100% of the total funds released.

In 2011/12, Funds allocated to LGAs was Sh. 1,407,255 million while funds released was Sh. 1,291,629 mill which was equivalent to 92% of the approved budget and the expenditure amounted to Sh. 1,291,629mill of the funds released equivalent to 100% of the released funds.

The Ministry of Community Development Gender and Children had a budget of Sh. 5,461mill in 2011/12. The released funds amounted to Sh. 4,633mill equivalents to 85% of the approved budget. The released fund was 100% spent.

In 2011/12, the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training had a budget of Sh.750,427mill while funds released was Sh. 713,927mill which is equivalent to 95% of the approved budget and the expenditure amounted to Sh. 713,927mill which was 100% of the released funds.

Table 4: Funds Released and Actual Expenditure by Three Ministries, 2011/12(Sh. millions)

VOTES		BUDGET	% of total budget	RELEASE	% released/ budget	% of total release	EXPENDITURE	expenditure /released
46	MOEVTC	750,427		713,927	95		713,927	
	PE	36,692	5	36,692	100	5	36,692	100
	OC	578,217	77	557,055	96	78	557,055	100
	foreign dev	94,668	13	88,945	94	12	88,945	100
	Local dev	40,850	5	31,235	76	4	31,235	100
56	PMO-RALG	41,444		32,100	77	-	32,100	
	PEDP - Local Dev	32,100	77	32,100	100		32,100	100
	PEDP-Foreign Dev	4,706	11	-	-			
	SEDP- Local Dev		-	-				
	SEDP-Foreign Dev	4,638	11		-			
70 - 89 & 95	LGAs	1,407,255		1,291,629	92		1,291,629	
	PE	1,073,886	76	1,073,886	100	83	1,073,886	100
	OC	225,579	16	167,766	74	13	167,766	100
	Dev. Funds	107,790	8	49,977	46	4	49,977	100
53	MCDGC-Folk Education	5,461		4,633	85		4,633	
	PE	-	-	-				
	OC	961	18	283	29		283	100
	Foreign dev	-	-					
	Local dev	4,500	82	4,350	97		4,350	100
TOTAL SECTOR BUDGET PER COMPONENT	PE	1,110,578	50	1,110,578	100	54	1,110,578	100
	OC	804,757	37	725,104	90	36	725,104	100
	Foreign dev	104,012	5	88,945	86	4	88,945	100
	Local dev	185,240	8	117,662	64	6	117,662	100
	TOTAL	2,204,587		2,042,289	93		2,042,289	100

Note: These figures include budget reallocation that occurred during budget execution.

Discussant:

Ian Attfield, from DFID – UK on behalf of Education Development Partners commented on the Financing of Education. He acknowledged Government of Tanzania sources for provision of good quality and timely data: (*BEST, MoEVT 2008 – 2012 Education Statistics (Aug. 2012)*, *PMO-RALG Local Government finance website data (2010/11)*) and Education Sector Performance Report (2011/12).

He noted that release and expenditure of 2011/12 budget appears satisfactory but capitation grants are far too low (2,172/= per pupil). Further, the 2012/13 budget trends are positive – additional 1.27% of total govt. budget (now 19.13%). Also there is major increase in share to primary sub-sector (now 55.8%). However, there is still no ring-fenced budget for pre-primary which represents a major constraint to a planned expansion and a 2.9% reduction in secondary sub-sector is a concern - given very low pass rates and existing constraints.

He further noted that the decline in budget share of Higher Education of 4.8% to 20.2% in 2012/13 as well as findings on financial diversification of sub-sector as welcome ideas but noted Loans provision is still on the rise and that the Govt. needs to present and track data on *loans repayment* to ensure *sustainability / quality* of Higher education.

On National trends he noted that they still suggest that a major drive is needed on quality and low pass rates, especially at Form 4, and trends represent a huge inefficiency and mask two issues: Little early learning is a major constraint to raising pass rates and Major financial disparities in local budget / resource allocations. He used the findings of the UWEZO Study on Learning Outcomes – Early Grade Literacy to illustrate the risks associated with variances in financial allocations across districts, urban/rural.

On Equitable Resource Allocation he noted excellent online district data on 2010/11 primary budgets on PMO-RALG website but that there is need for timely update for 2011/12 to enable trend analysis; analysis 2010/11 showed large per capita budget spread – some up to three times as much as others, driven by staff personnel emolument (PE) allocation He note that many councils over spend and many under spend posing difficult in

identifying reasons for such a situation. The situation was a constraint on transparency and accountability to Tanzanian parents and children and since Tanzania has joined the Open Government Partnership, there was a commitment to publicise such information.

On Teacher Allocation, he noted good progress and that analysis of 2010 - 2012 showed that govt. efforts to deploy more qualified teachers to underserved rural areas was working, the national primary PTR improved from 51 (2010) to 46 (2012) and inequity between districts also improved considerably although PTR range is still too wide (30-60). He recommended that regular inclusion and use of more detailed NECTA examination and quality related data should be considered.

He proposed on:

(1) Budget & Openness including:

- *Pre-school and Higher Education sub-sectors:* Ring fence a pre-school budget, increase access to pre-school for primary school readiness and correct age enrolment. And monitor and increase Higher Education student loan repayments, seek cost recovery.
- *Predictability and Control in Budget Execution:* Improve the timeliness of fund transfers to LGAs and onwards to school, set and actually deliver, faster, a Higher rate of capitation grants and simplify guidelines for Primary Education grants and transfers.
- *Comprehensiveness & Transparency (Open Govt. Partnership__commitment):* systematically include on a website and in newspapers all grant transfers to LGAs including the amount and date of transfer, close to real time and re-introduce the notification of transfers (including capitation grants) to schools and display information on school and local notice board.

(2) Resources Inequity including:

- Continue to drive down the primary Pupil Teacher Ratio nationally, with a focus on equity in allocation and a results focus;
- Build upon success in reducing PTR and inequity in under-served districts;

- Getting more qualified teachers in remote /rural areas – ‘ring fence’ more PE funds for districts with PTR > 50;
- Implement salary and other related reform measures to motivate teachers to upgrade their skills, attend and teach.
- Tackle Inequity in Financing School Quality Improvements
- Measure and reduce disparities and changes in Capitation Grant budget allocation and spend to districts and schools
- Get finance and examination / learning outcome data into the public domain to hold District and School leaders to account for their performance, and
- Reward success and help poor performing areas to improve.

3.1.7 Human Resources

The priorities for the education sector on human resources in FY 2011/12 were: provision of in-service training of personnel in order to improve their competences and increase productivity; application of computerized system known as “Human Resource Capital Information System” for keeping/storing records of human resources and implementation of approved new organizational structures of the Ministries of MOEVT and PMO-RALG. Other priorities were to operationalize the Open Performance Review and Appraisal System (OPRAS), recruit 833 employees, promote 917 workers, confirm 351 workers and issue work permits to 800 foreign experts in the education sector.

The achievements during the period under review included: recruitment of 224 Teachers’ College Tutors; approval of 362 foreign experts to teach in government and non-government schools; increased teaching force at all levels (teachers for pre-primary and primary schools increased from 186,279 to 190,339; teachers for secondary schools increased from 52,146 to 65,026; number of teaching staff for Technical Education increased from 3,754 to 4,590; number of teaching staff for Universities increased from 3,083 to 3,755; and 46 FDC staff were recruited), Other achievements were: improved qualified Teacher Pupils Ratio (Primary schools from 1:64 in 2008 to 1:47 in 2012; Secondary schools from 1:37 in 2008 to 1:29 in 2012 Teachers’ Colleges from 1:21 in 2008

to 1:22 in 2012), promotion of 441 MoEVT personnel at respective levels and confirmation of 41 staff at public service

Also achievements were realised in the following: computerized Human Capital Management Information System (HCMIS), revision of the Government circular No.11 of 2002 in order to accommodate the new scheme of service for Teachers' College tutors, provision of in-service training/professional development to 1,056 Diploma teachers, 25,626 Grade A teachers, and 51 Special Needs Education Teachers, professional development for 45 FDC staff, sponsoring a total of 162 staff for PhD and 195 for Masters for Higher Learning Institutions. The management and administrative levels were strengthened with the implementation of new organizational structures and vacant and acting positions were filled in.

The challenges in Human Resources are such as retention of teaching staff in difficult and hard to reach areas and provision of continuous professional development of personnel as well as availability of adequate teaching and non teaching staff in FDCs. There plans to address the challenges in 2012/2013 is finalizing the study on HR-SITAN and implementing some key recommendations, identification of the hard to reach/marginalized places and provision of amenities in order to motivate workers, preparation of comprehensive HR Training Programme and recruitment of 440 Teachers' College tutors and 983 school inspectors in order to increase efficiency.

Discussant

In response, and on behalf of the Education Development Partner Group, Tom Blanc, looked at the development of human resources in Tanzania since independence and pointed out that the Education Sector Human Resources Situation Analysis report indicated that Tanzania was given the globalization and technological aspects currently needs to examine the ways of working and redefine aims stressing the need to change the attitude of "Business as Usual" but rather be willing to embrace an overhaul of the Human Resource Development system in the education sector.

He noted that human resource development is the most important factor of production in the Tanzanian economy and must be one of the leading objective on the Government of Tanzania's development agenda because it is capable of transforming all the other factors for the betterment of human life and human welfare in Tanzania hence the need to develop it effectively in order to increase its productivity and capital value.

He provided a summary of key elements on Human resource aspects since independence, citing the 1967 Arusha Declaration as the basic inspiration behind fundamental national goals and strategies that were reflected in successive national development plans, which focused on economic growth; equity and self reliance, rural development and mass literacy as well as the provision of basic needs for the entire population. Examples of these included: social mobilization of the rural population through the villagization program, ensuring an adequate and equitable provision of basic services, universal primary education, mass literacy programs, promotion of Kiswahili as the national language and the 1974 Musoma Resolution, whose aim was to interface work with education.

He also pointed out that the 2012 Education Sector Human Resources Situation Analysis proposes and recommends a Human resource approach that is in line with the socio-economic realities of Tanzania and that of the contemporary market oriented economy where citizens compete for jobs in employment on the basis of their skills and work experience or their own ingenuity. The increasing significance of the private sector, which requires giving greater attention to manpower requirements at the sectoral and organizational levels and allowing market forces to play a bigger role in order to link manpower planning efforts to social demand for manpower were also cited as critical issues.

On the supply and demand of the education sector's human resources, the 2012 he indicated that the Education Sector Human Resources Situation Analysis pointed out that Tanzania had been experiencing an explosive demand for more and better human resources, especially teachers, due to expanding enrollments and diversification in the types of education being offered. He observed that the Situation Analysis reports that, "The

system is not broken yet.” The structures, systems, infrastructure and human resources are in place but the human resources within it are not working optimally. Pass rates are low at both Standard 7 at around 50 percent and at O-Levels at approximately 20 percent and that there are not enough students passing He added that the universities and technical colleges graduates do not to meet the demands of the economy. He emphasised that the shortages are particularly acute in the Sciences, Mathematics and English which undermine the goal of the country to create a technology-driven economy that is competitive globally. He insisted that this requires urgent and bold actions to reverse a marked downward spiral.

Further he noted that the 2012 Education Sector Human Resources Situation Analysis presented a picture of rapid expansion of enrolments but sharp declines in the quality of service delivery and low morale among teachers and that urgent reforms to tackle service delivery failures with a clear focus on increasing accountability and improving results were needed in order to ultimately improve learning outcomes. He argued that ad hoc, small, incremental reforms in human resource development would not be sufficient in steering the education sector effectively or rapidly towards meeting its outcome goals.

To address the various challenges, he asserted that the Situation Analysis emphasizes need for clear linkages between central and local government and school communities, clarity on functions, authority and relationships of accountability in the context and vision of the Education and Training Policy (ETP) and the Education Sector Development Programme (ESDP). Also there was a need for ensuring the availability and retention of the human resources needed to arrest and reverse the current decline or stagnation in the quality of education in Tanzania, improved policies of ensuring that education and vocational training at all levels is relevant to the basic needs of the labor market and developing a National Development Strategy that embraces the participation of the entire civil society. Also extensive collaboration with private sector institutions, local non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and local community-based organizations (CBOs) and other education stakeholders were important.

The discussant also emphasized other issues raised in the Human Resource Situational Analysis report such as the need to improve the quality of primary, secondary and tertiary education, reducing the skills mismatch between what the education system is producing and the labor market needs so as to remain competitive in an increasingly challenging business investment environment. In conclusion, he noted that all education stakeholders – (Development Partners, CSOs, NGOs and members of the Private Sector) – were keen and ready to assist the Government in its reform of the human resource development system through existing budget support and ongoing programs.

3.1.8 Challenges

The Education Sector is still experiencing a number of challenges towards provision of equitable quality education. The challenges include:

Equity and Access

- a) Shortage of key school/institution infrastructures and facilities (teachers' houses, classrooms, laboratories, workshops, libraries, sanitary facilities (SWASH), at all levels to accommodate the increasing number of students;
- b) Low enrolment of pupils in pre-primary classes;
- c) Declining trend in primary education GER and NER;
- d) Regional disparities in terms of enrolment, retention, completion and transition to Higher level as well as in overall provision of teaching and learning facilities and human resource;
- e) Improving enrolment, retention, completion and transition at all levels;
- f) Acquiring adequate and modern equipment, tools as well as teaching and learning materials and assistive devices that match with modern technologies so as to equip graduates with skills and capability to compete in the job market; and
- g) Improving the participation rate of female students at all levels

Quality Education:

- a) Improving skills in Mathematics, Sciences and English language at all levels;
- b) Provision of adequate capitation grants;

- c) Availability of adequate teaching and learning materials and assistive devices;
- d) Availability of adequate numbers of qualified teachers, including teachers for special education, pre-primary and primary; Higher education, technical colleges and FDCs;
- h) Improving teacher attendance in classrooms;
- i) Improve students' performance in CSEE to cope with A-Level expansion;
- j) Improve number of school inspectors as per establishment and school inspectorate working environment (furniture, computers, photocopiers and stationeries) and reliable transport to access hard to reach areas throughout the year; and
- k) Ensuring conducive learning environment for the COBET learners.

Capacity Building:

- a) Enhancing the use of ICT in teaching and learning;
- b) Building management capacities at all levels for school management and management of funds and other resources disbursed to schools.

Human Resources

- a) Retention of teaching staff in difficult and hard to reach areas;
- b) Continuous professional development of personnel which is a very important aspect in human resource planning and development;
- c) Availability of adequate teaching and non teaching staff in FDCs;
- d) Payment of the outstanding arrears and allowances to existing Personnel; and
- e) Raising the morale of teachers for effective working.

Financial

- a) Mobilizing resources to facilitate increased allocations to the subsectors;
- b) Improving the allocation of SDL funds to cater for an increase of students at newly constructed VTCs and FDCs,
- c) Availability of adequate and timely disbursement of recurrent and development funds;
- d) Improving budgetary allocation for implementation of Education Development Programmes;
- e) Institutionalizing of alternative modes/means of financing education sector

- f) Increase in education demands compared the available resources; and
- g) Increase in requirement of teaching and learning of science and technology to develop human capital for sound economic development.

3.1.9 *Priorities for 2012/13*

The sector Priority Actions for 2012/13 are:

- 1) Improving the quality of education at all levels with emphasis on creating a conducive environment for teaching and learning and training adequate number of teachers/tutors and instructors;
- 2) Increasing enrolment and retention at every education level whilst facilitating its access to the people and especially the disadvantaged families;
- 3) Increasing student enrolment in science and engineering, education, agriculture and health profession and targeted skills in the areas of natural gas, uranium, iron and steel and petroleum; and
- 4) Rehabilitation and retooling the existing Folk Development Colleges (FDCs) and Community Development Training Institutes (CDTIs) as well as the Vocational Education Training Institutions

3.2 *THE JOINT FIELD VISITS REPORT 2012*

In 2012, the Joint Field Monitoring Visits took place in 11 Local Government Authorities (LGAs) namely Arusha, Ilala, Hai, Nyamagana, Songea, Ruangwa, Bukoba Rural, Rungwe, Singida Urban, Mvomero and Tabora Rural. The objective of the JESR field monitoring visits was to reveal the key education issues and challenges facing teaching, learning and application of Science, Mathematics and English in the education institutions with the view to identifying root causes to be addressed.

The primary method of data collection was focus group discussions with education stakeholders, observation and individual interviews. Focus group discussions (FGDs) captured the views and opinions of learners, teachers, facilitators, parents, school committee/board members, school/institution management teams and LGAs officials.

The main findings from the field regarding teaching, learning and application of Mathematics, Science (Physics, Biology and Chemistry) and English at all Levels indicated that: pupils, teachers and parents acknowledge that it is important to learn Mathematics, sciences and English for the benefit of their own future lives. Also the findings revealed that it was important to use participatory methods in teaching and learning processes. In addition, the findings revealed that availability of Mathematics, Science and English clubs and Internet facilities in schools/institutions promotes teaching and learning of the subjects and proper utilization of Teachers Resource Centres promotes on job training hence teaching and learning of the students.

Furthermore, the findings indicated that there are inadequate competent Mathematics, Science and English teachers and T&L materials and assistive devices to students with disabilities and that few students opt to study Mathematics, Science and English because of conceiving them as difficult subjects. It was also noted that there were inadequate laboratories, chemicals, workshops, libraries and library facilities, classrooms and equipment that limited practices by students and teachers and that there was inadequate in-service training and orientation to teachers/facilitators on curriculum changes (competence based). Also lack of lab technicians burdens teachers to prepare for practical and use of certain science equipment which contributed to limited application of science and languages, Furthermore it was pointed out that there was lack of qualified teachers and it was difficult to retain competent Science, Mathematics and English teachers/tutors at Government schools/institutions due to poor motivation. In addition it was reported that there was an overload of the few available Mathematics, Science and English teachers limiting teachers/facilitators to prepare adequately for the subjects.

The main conclusions regarding teaching Science, Mathematics and English in schools/institutions visited indicated that : Science, Mathematics and English are seen as extremely relevant subjects to social and economic life in general; The Competency Based curriculum is well appreciated by teachers despite low understanding of the CBET methodology due to inadequate orientation training. Also inadequate INSET opportunities

limits confidence, competence and motivation of teachers/tutors, shortage of competent teachers/tutors of Science Mathematics and English at different levels causes poor performance of pupils/students and the fact that some entrants to teacher education courses have low qualifications results into incompetent student teachers.

The key recommendations provided for different levels regarding learning and application of Science, Mathematics and English were that:

i) Pupils, students and participants should: be encouraged to join Science, Math and debate clubs/projects in schools; practise speaking English in and outside classroom setting and be encouraged to search for knowledge in libraries, Internet and other sources.

ii) Teachers and facilitators (except for teacher students) should: take their professional responsibilities seriously and abide by their own professional ethics and codes of conduct; introduce interactive methodologies to enhance teaching and learning Science, Mathematics and English, eg clubs, interclass competition, site visits and field trips, exchange programs, project works, parents days and ensure learning is integrated with practical activities to increase learners' competencies in scientific knowledge.

iii) Parents and care-givers should actively follow up support their children's development in the subjects; encourage their children, both boys and girls, to study Science, Mathematics and English for their betterment of their lives. Also, parents should participate in different ways to facilitate the learning of Science, Mathematics and English in the school of their children.

Members of School Committees and School Boards at primary and secondary schools and Board Members of VTCs and FDCs should work closely with school/college administration to create a conducive environment for the teaching, learning and application of these subjects participate in the development and implementation of school and institution development plans to strengthen t/l of Science, Maths and English and participate in the development and provision of incentives packages for excelling teachers in science, maths and English.

Head Teachers, School Heads, Principals and Academic teachers (except for teacher students) should establish good links with the local community in trying to make conducive the environment for new teachers especially in hard-to-reach areas; encourage teachers on the use of locally available teaching and learning resources; conduct school internal inspection and provide feedback to staff and pupils and parents.

Student Teachers, Tutors, Principals and Board Members of Teachers' Colleges should establish strong links with local primary and secondary schools to strengthen quality of education in those institutions and to provide a conducive environment for their students to do teacher practice ,focus on improving the English skills of the student teachers and encourage their own students' capacity for self-directed learning.

District officials should ensure that teachers/tutors are distributed to schools/institutions accordingly, utilize TRCs for teacher development, ensure adequate supply of books and other teaching materials to facilitate learning in schools and improve school inspection for quality assurance.

Other stakeholders (e.g. Politicians, Ministries, Development Partners, Private Sector, Civil Society Organisations) should improve minimum qualification of student teachers joining teacher education courses, develop and implement a comprehensive INSET programme for all teachers tutors, and facilitators in schools and institutions and develop incentive package for teachers and facilitators according to their different circumstances; initiate the National campaign to build and facilitate Laboratories, Workshops and Libraries for schools/institutions.

For the future Field Visits it was recommended that the questionnaire should be pre-tested., information to the Councils should be sent in advance with a well elaborative note telling the purpose for carrying such activity and who will be consulted and improve the report format to avoid repetitions of same ideas/issues.

3.3 SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION ISSUES FROM PLENARY AND GROUP DISCUSSIONS:

JESR participants had an opportunity to discuss some key issues and challenges in the education sector both during plenary sessions and in group discussions. The following were some of the key issues raised and discussed:

1. *Teachers and linkages with quality improvement in school/colleges and universities:*
Government to show serious commitment to quality improvement.
 - *Teacher's capabilities, efficiency and effectiveness* - the need to look at the selection process and mechanism for entry requirement to Teacher colleges; formalize INSET programs and recognize school based INSET; reinforce efficiency and effectiveness of teachers.
 - *Teacher's retention:* improve teaching and learning environment – teaching learning materials, teacher's housing, incentive packages; provide induction courses at district/school levels for improved teacher professionalism.
 - *Improve Staffing in universities:* develop comprehensive succession plan to address the challenge of aging staff; invest in staff development; encourage staff /undergraduates in undertaking required subjects particularly in sciences and engineering to meet the required skills development and linking college/universities with the world of work and improve incentive packages
2. *Conducive teaching and learning environment:* improved /increased Infrastructure-limited at all levels of education including classrooms /lecture rooms, laboratories, workshops, libraries and related SWASH aspects.
3. *Financing and Alternative funding in education:* GoT to invest more on areas with great returns; Not enough public financing resources to deliver objectives and outcomes in the sector- thus need to look into financing alternatives: Prioritize disbursement of Capitation Grants to school level, mix funding and partnerships between public and private, and encourage community to support their own schools/institutions.
4. *Private public partnership:* There is need for the Government to develop a strategy to enhance mutual understanding between education providers and beneficiaries

5. *Skills development*: expand funding sources through increased and better utilization of Skills Development Levy and use of Private, Public partnerships, improve curriculum to match the required skills to meet the labor market demands.
6. *Improved school management, leadership*: provide school management and leadership skills to school managers and improve selection process for heads of schools, and improve systems to control and manage teachers
7. *Participation of parents and communities*: encourage improved effective participation at all levels of education in the design, planning and implementation of education services; communities/parents to be encouraged to initiate, develop and manage education funds at community levels.
8. *Literacy skills*: critical need to look at how best to improve the 3Rs particularly at the pre and primary levels as the foundation for improved learning skills, establish - specialization in teacher colleges for early grade teaching and in the 3Rs.
9. *Quality assurance and inspectorate*: Government to follow up and establish the proposed quality assurance autonomous body, inspectorate to cover the whole Sector, roles and responsibilities of other quality assurance bodies to be clarified and linkages to be improved.

3.4 CSO PERFORMANCE IN EDUCATION DELIVERY 2010-11

The paper on CSO performance in education delivery during the 2011/12 year was presented by Mrs. Mary Soko, the TEN/MET Board Chair. She explored activities carried out by TEN/MET and its members, linking the report with the overall contributions of stakeholders.

She mentioned that the CSOs acknowledge and realized that: JESR was significant in improving the quality of education and it was a great opportunity to influence education policy and practice in both the short and long-term objectives. Also that CSOs noticed progress that has been made in education in Tanzania. She observed that , much more remain to be done to meet Education for All (EFA) goals and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and Tanzania Development Vision 2025 and MKUKUTA goals and targets.

It was pointed out that CSOs also noted key areas in the education sector including: *ECCD and Pre-primary* as an important foundation for success in improving access and participation in Higher levels of education and that statistics show low gross enrolment ratio of only 44.5%. This indicates that the majority of children are still not enrolled in schools accordingly;

Primary Education, was identified as the area that has succeeded in increasing pupil enrolment and attendance especially where CSOs have intervened, though with challenges like inadequate textbooks and low capacity of teachers in English, Mathematics and Science:

In-service training was an area identified as important for attaining quality teaching and learning English, Mathematics and Science as well as improving pupils' understanding and the quality of education;

Secondary education was mentioned as one of the sub sectors that has inadequate resources like textbooks, laboratories and libraries which causes students joining Higher levels of education with inadequate ability in English, Mathematics and Science subjects.

She noted that poor National Form Four Examination results of 2010 and 2011, indicates that there are inadequate teachers and poor teaching and learning environment in most of secondary schools and *Teachers Resource Centres* established for improving quality-teaching methodology of teachers in subjects like English, Mathematics and Science and promoting reading culture.

She also pointed some key recommendations that: MOEVT, MCDGC and PMORALG should allocate enough resources for schools inspection and use monitoring & evaluation as a yardstick for ensuring quality education/ Also, Education funding at all levels should clearly show implementation of inclusive education and there should be close collaboration and consultation between TIE and stakeholders in developing the competence-based

curriculum regarding its concept, philosophy and in particular, how its objectives and intended learning outcomes should be assessed.

In conclusion she emphasized that the quest for quality of education and teaching profession should start with strengthening the quality of teachers, through careful selection of candidates, followed by appropriate pre-service and good quality training and regular in-service training.

Discussant:

Mr M. S. Katemba from the MCDGC responded to the CSO presentation on behalf of the Government. He noted key areas that needed to be considered with respect to CSOs contribution in the sector including: the issue of quality teaching, learning and application of English, Mathematics and Science in schools; CSOs complementing Government efforts to bridge the gap in providing effective and sound educational quality services. He insisted that stakeholders need to join efforts to come up with strategic and deliberate move to improve skills of teachers, learning environment and replication of successful programs carried out by CSOS in the development of the education sector.

3.5 DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS CONTRIBUTION IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR 2012

The contribution of the (ED DPG) in the education sector was presented by Mr. Warren Kidd, Chair of the ED DPG. He mentioned that the Education Development Partners Group is one of the sub-groups of the overall Development Partners Group (DPG) in Tanzania consisting of Bilateral and Multilateral agencies, (5 bilateral donor agencies (CIDA (Chair), SIDA (Deputy Chair), DFID, USAID, France) and 5 multilateral agencies (World Bank, UNESCO, UNICEF, the World Food Programme and the African Development Bank) signatory to the JAST that are providing support to the education sector. He pointed out that the ED-DPG promotes coordination of Development Partners to ensure the most efficient use of resources that are provided to the Government of Tanzania to achieve the education objectives of the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty

(MKUKUTA), the education Millennium Development Goals (MDG), the Education for All (EFA) goals and the Education Sector Development Programme (ESDP) and its subsector programmes.

He explained that the overall objective of the Education Development Partners' Group (ED-DPG) is to support the Tanzania education system in achieving a more efficient, effective and equitable delivery of quality education services at all levels, through: effective coordination of external assistance and DP interventions and quality policy dialogue with Government and other stakeholders (civil society, local government, private sector, and Parliament). Specifically, added that the ED-DPG works towards coordinating DP harmonization and alignment efforts to improve the effectiveness of education sector policy dialogue.

Further he noted that the work of the ED-DPG is guided following key principles, which have been established by the DP Main as a basis for cooperation among DPs and with Government and Non-State Actors in Tanzania including: National ownership and Government leadership, Accountability by having a "collective responsibility" to make coordinated efforts to improve effectiveness and quality of development assistance in the Education Sector, as well as to represent a common ED-DPG position once agreed; Consistency: through endeavoring to ensure that its decisions and actions are consistent with the JAST, Paris Declaration and other national and international agreements/commitments to which ED-DPG members are party.

Inclusiveness: by being open to any bilateral or multilateral agency that provides development assistance to the United Republic of Tanzania. He highlighted that the DPG cooperation is premised on voluntary engagement and peer support and takes decision on the basis of consensus and is respectful of differences regarding policy and modalities and transparency in their engagement in policy dialogue as well as efforts for improving aid effectiveness.

Also he elaborated how the ED DPG participates and the role and contribution to the Education Sector in 2011-12 noting that the DPG provided detailed input towards improving the dialogue structure in the sector, recommending, for example, a re-conceptualization of the milestones and TWGs; provided specific input to strategies, policy and programme documents; supported key initiatives, such as the application process for funding from the Global Partnership for Education; provided significant technical assistance to the sector through the Technical Working Groups, workshops and other initiatives and assignments. This support was provided directly by DP staff and where necessary, through the provision of specialized consultants for specific issues.

On funding the sector, he explained that in 2011-12, DPs provided approximately US\$ 210 million to the Tanzanian education sector, in addition to allocations to the sector from DPs significant GBS support.¹

Furthermore he noted the challenges that the group has identified including: the need for a more efficient and revitalized dialogue structure to address: clarity in the education sector dialogue structure, such as the roles of Technical Working Groups and how they relate to the MDAs, consistency of technical meetings, and the proper mandate of each group; overlapping between mandates of different technical working groups; role and value of the milestones and their alignment with sector priorities as stipulated in the budget and action plans; appropriate level/rank of participants at various levels of the structure; complexity and capacity of the education system, including clarity of roles of education sector MDAs, particularly in the context of decentralization; and, inadequate Sector-wide human and financial resources, and in some instances inequitable and inefficient usages of the limited resources.

In conclusion he highlighted some key DP priority issues noting that the situation of the education sector calls for reforms of education systems with a clear focus on increasing

¹ These figures are provided here only to indicate the order of magnitude of DP contributions. They are unofficial estimates.

accountability and results, to be able to improve learning outcomes for all boys and girls, men and women across the country who seek education and training.. Also to become more concerned with what is going on at the local level, the need to clearly and boldly emphasize the implementation of policy and programme reforms within the education sector in Tanzania, particularly those relating to: recruitment, training, deployment, motivation and role of teachers; capacity development in planning, management, monitoring and evaluation at all levels; improved functional literacy and numeracy for children, youth and adults; increased access to better quality, relevant education for children from low income households, marginalized groups and for girls; role of Inspectorate in quality assurance; and, strengthening public engagement in the sector.

Discussant

The response to the ED DPG was presented by Mr M. Chacha on behalf of the Government. He noted that the provision of quality education is a collaborative effort from the stakeholders and that the DP presentation has clearly indicated their overall significant contributions in the process of developing educational plans, strategies and programme documents. He also pointed out that the Government appreciates and recognizes the contribution of technical assistance through various specialized consultancies and financing contribution to the education sector.

However, he noted that the presentation did not synchronize itself to the thrust and proceeding of this education sector review, in the sense that one would have expected the presentation to suggest to the Government on how to address the challenges not merely mentioning them. On the issue of education sector dialogue structure, he refuted the idea that there is lack of clarity because all Technical Working Groups were formulated jointly within ESDP dialogue structure through agreed Terms of Reference, functions and membership, as well as on the issue of mandate.

He further pointed out that as partners there is expectation for assistance, for example on the challenge of the role and value of the milestones that they are not clearly aligned with the sector priorities. He noted that the expectation was that DPs would make the thrust of

the presentation with practical experiences in other countries. He proposed also that the last part of *DPS priority issues*, lacks explicit elaboration, because currently there are reforms in every subsector of education with, a clear focus, hence, did not see the value for the call by DPs for the urgent policy and programme reform within education sector except perhaps the review of the current reforms relating to recruitment, training, capacity development, increased access, strengthening public engagement in the sector.

In conclusion he reiterated that, *members were in the working session to find out the solutions of the current challenges in the Education Sector* and not to deal with the well known challenges.

3.6 EDUCATION SECTOR MILESTONES

3.6.1 Status of Implementation of 2011/12 Milestones

For the year 2011/12, a total of 13 milestones were developed. The detailed road map for these milestones included 57 specific actions. Reviews of implementation of milestones and specific actions were conducted at mid-year (13th March, 2012). During the mid-year review it was noted that most of the specific actions in the 2011/12 milestones had not yet been achieved due to various reasons and it was jointly agreed that the timeframe for completion of the milestones be extended to 31st August, 2012. The status of implementation of the 2011/12 milestones, as of August 31st 2012 is shown in Annex 2.1

Major constraints faced in implementation of agreed milestones included:

- 1) Inadequate budget allocations and late receipt of funds, which led to delays in implementation;
- 2) Large number of specific actions, which lead into partial implementation of milestones;
- 3) Agreed milestones are not necessarily the same as the Government's priorities; and,
- 4) Some milestones or specific actions are not clearly worded or well understood by all parties.

3.6.2 *Milestones and Specific Actions for 2012/13*

JESR 2011 also developed a list of eight milestones for 2012/13, which are included in the Annex 2.2. The purpose of developing these milestones nearly one year in advance is to ensure that relevant departments have sufficient time to determine the necessary specific actions and include these in the work plans, budget requests and other planning processes, including procurement plans, for the following year.

3.6.3 *Proposed Milestones for 2013/2014*

Unlike previous years when a list of proposed milestones were agreed upon at the technical session, this year the stakeholders agreed to propose broad areas for further deliberation at the education sector dialogue process in order to come up with milestones that will be implemented in 2013/14. The following are the broad areas that will be targeted :

- **Quality:** Strengthening the teaching and learning environment at all levels;
- **Human Resource:** Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector;
- **Financing:** Expanding base for financing the education sector; and
- **Governance:** Improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.

4.0 CLOSING REMARKS FROM THE JESR 2012 TECHNICAL WORKING SESSION

4.1 Joint Statement from the JESR Working Sessions

The key education stakeholders (Government, Development Partners and CSOs) agreed to issue a Joint Statement for the closing session as a reflection of the spirit of cooperation, which aims at strengthening consultative dialogues to jointly assess the education sector performance towards provision of quality education.

They noted that the agreed JESR methodology was a result of consultations and dialogue among stakeholders, involving a number of key steps. Namely:

- 1) The compilation of the Education Sector Performance Report for the year July 2011 to June 2012. This report provided a summary of sector priorities, achievement of targets, challenges and way forward for each sub-sector;
- 2) Preparation of CSOs, Performance Report in Education Sector;
- 3) Preparation of Development Partners Contribution in the Education Sector Report;
- 4) Conducting site visits to schools, Teachers' Colleges, Adult Education and Folk Education centres, Vocational and Technical education institutions, district council offices which focused on revealing the key education issues and challenges facing teaching, learning and application of Science, Mathematics, English subjects and compilation of the report;
- 5) Holding the Stakeholders' Working sessions where the reports were presented and discussed.

They pointed out that the review sessions have enabled participants to work systematically to:

- Reflect on the achievements and challenges in the education sector during the financial year, ending 30th June, 2012, and

- Prioritizing issues for 2013/14 by considering backlog of 2011/2012 and milestones which will not be implemented in 2012/13.

The partners agreed that the proposed milestones will be further prioritized so as to come-up with few focused and implementable milestones agreed in respective education sector fora. They expressed satisfaction that this year's working session was a significant improvement on previous ones and that the changes introduced in the presentations and discussions by sub-sectors will improve efficiency in reviewing performance in the future.

The stakeholders agreed on major recommendations of this Review including: aligning the milestones to the budget cycle so that they can be incorporated in the Ministries 2013/14 MTEFs. They noted that for FY 2012/13 they have provisionally proposed 8 milestones some of which have started to be implemented and some need to be agreed and approved in the ESDC fora.

They also agreed to propose 2013/14 milestones which were derived from the 2012 JESR working session targeting the following areas:

- **Quality:** Strengthening the teaching and learning environment at all levels;
- **Human Resource:** Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector;
- **Financing:** Expanding base for financing the education sector; and
- **Governance:** Improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.

They agreed on the Way forward that:

- The incorporation of ideas, views and corrections generated during the review session into the final versions of the Education Sector Performance Report 2011/12 to be presented to the next ESDC meeting.

- There is a need for broad identified areas to be refined into milestones in order to address key priorities of the sector that will be incorporated in the Ministries' 2013/14 MTEFs.
- Presentation of the Milestones through the various dialogue structures; that is the Education Sector Development Committees, Joint Education Sector Committee, Inter Ministerial Steering Committee and the High Level Meeting for the final approval of the JESR Aide-Memoire 2012.

As a sign of joint agreement, the education stakeholders who participated at the 2012 JESR, declared their commitment to work together in implementing the Milestones in their various capacities including harnessing of resources to ensure High level achievements of targets set for the Education Sector. The Statement was then jointly signed by the ED-DPG Chairperson, Civil Society Organization Chairperson and the Education Sector Chairperson as true record of the JESR 2012 deliberations.

4.2 CONCLUDING REMARKS BY THE GOVERNMENT

Dr. Florens M. Turuka, Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Communication, Science and Technology, delivered the concluding remarks on behalf of the Government and officially closed the JESR 2012 Technical Session.

He thanked the organizers of the Annual Joint Education Sector Review working session and acknowledged the presence and effective participation of key education stakeholders whom he believed had deliberated well on the success and challenges facing the education sector which was key to the development of our country. He also noted that the opening remarks from the Guest of Honor, Mr. Ramadhan Khijjah, the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance, and Statements from the Government, Development Partners (DPs), and Civil Society Organization (CSOs) offered clear guidelines which enabled participants to accomplish the objectives of this review.

He noted that the presentations and discussions focused on education sector performance reports and joint monitoring visits and that stakeholder had identified and agreed on the broad areas including.

- Quality: Strengthening the teaching and learning environment at all levels;
- Human Resource: Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector;
- .Financing: Expanding base for financing the education sector; and
- Governance: Improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.

He noted that the broad areas were to be refined into key priorities and milestones that would be incorporated in the Ministries' 2013/2014 MTEFs.

5.0 CONCLUSION

Following the Technical Working Session, Government and DPs representatives met on the 25-27/9/2012 to assess the overall sector performance for the year 2011/12. To determine the performance assessment, a rating framework was commonly agreed to be used to rate implementation results, financing and budgeting, progress of targets set and accountability which feeds into the GBS Annual Review. This year's rating exercise was preceded by reviewing the rating framework in March 2012 and approved at the normal dialogue structure. The process of assessment was concluded on 5th November 2012. The final agreed score for the sector is 62% implying a Satisfactory Performance. It should be noted that this score for 2011/12 cannot be compared with that of previous years in that some of the indicators have changed. During the assessment it was felt that the revised framework is good but there are few indicators that need further revision to make it more robust. The agreed Performance Assessment is included in Annex 6.3.

The Joint Education Sector Review is finalized by conducting a High Level Meeting (HLM), which is chaired by the Minister for Education and Vocational Training. The purpose of this meeting is to approve the Aide Memoire, which outlines the outcomes of the Joint Education Sector Review including findings, recommendations, milestones and the performance assessment.

The HLM for JESR 2012 took place on 16th November, 2012 and was chaired by the Honorable Minister for Education and Vocational Training, Dr. Shukuru Jumanne Kawambwa (MP). The HLM provided an opportunity for participants to discuss the Aide Memoire, which was then approved by the members.

The approved Aide Memoire serves as the official record of the Joint Education Sector Review process for 2012. It records the proceeding of the HLM as indicated in Annex 6.5.

The approved Aide Memoire provides a basis from which to report the sector's performance to the General Budget Support Annual Review, November 2012. It also

provides direction and guidance for activities of the sector for 2012/13 and 2013/14, including the milestones which will be assessed in the next JESR in 2013.

In addition to the regular agenda items for the HLM, this year there was an added agenda to discuss and sign the Education Reform Compact (ERC). Although this is not a direct task emerging out of the JESR process it was noted that it has linkages in that it sets out the broad framework for discussing future milestones to be agreed upon in the sector as the initiatives in the ERC were broad enough to accommodate more specific actions during planning, including issues around teachers, curriculum and emphasis on science and Mathematics.

The Decision reached:

The ERC was endorsed and signed by Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training, Civil Society Organizations, CIDA, WB, USAID, DFID, SIDA, WFP, UNICEF and UNESCO.

6.0 ANNEXES

Annex 6.1: OPENING STATEMENTS FROM THE JESR 2011 TECHNICAL WORKING SESSION

Annex 6.1.1. Opening Statement by Government Chair

STATEMENT BY THE CHAIR OF THE EDUCATION SECTOR PERMANENT SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING MR SELESTINE GESIMBA AT THE OPENING OF THE 2012 ANNUAL EDUCATION SECTOR REVIEW WORKING SESSION HELD AT WATER FRONT NSSF ON 25TH SEPTEMBER 2012

**Permanent Secretaries,
Deputy Permanent Secretaries,
Regional Administrative Secretaries,
Directors and Heads of Institutions,
Councilors',
Development Partners,
Civil Society Organizations,
Distinguished Guests,
Participants,
Members of the Media,
Ladies and Gentlemen.**

Allow me to take this opportunity to welcome you all to the 2012 Joint Education Sector Review (JESR) working sessions. Let me thank the organizers who made this event happen. We are pleased to inform you that, we have a wide range of stakeholders coming from different parts of the country. Indeed, I expect quality output to be delivered by the end of this Joint Education Sector Review. Thus, again, thank you for coming.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I understand you are all aware that, it is in this session whereby the annual overall performance report of the education sector in respect to achievement of priorities, targets and outcomes; joint monitoring visit report and status of implementation of milestones for

2011/12 are will be shared and discussed. Likewise, priority action areas and milestone for 2013/2014 will be identified and proposed for consideration at High Level Meetings.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

As you may recall, last year we had a similar review. After the working sessions, assessment of education sector was done jointly and the education sector was rated satisfactory after scoring 70%. The parties also agreed to revise the rating framework. This has also been accomplished through the dialogue fora where the new rating framework for 2012 was approved in the ESDC meeting. It is therefore my expectation that you will all work hard as a team so as to ensure that the output of this session contributes to towards attaining a satisfactory sector review which will feed into MKUKUTA/ PER and GBS reviews.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

The 2011/12 Education Sector Performance report shows remarkable achievements in the areas of improved access, number of teachers, adequate infrastructures, teaching and learning materials including assistive devices and provision of Higher learning students loans and sponsorship. I am also acquainted that, there were 13 identified milestones for the year 2011/2012 as indicated in four priority areas namely improve efficiency and effectiveness, human resources management, increase access to education services and improve quality of education services. It is the Government expectation that, the status of implementation will be shared accordingly in the working sessions.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

In the year under review, a number of documents and initiatives were supposed to be finalized. These include: Reviewed Education and Training Policy (ETP); Human Rights Strategy; Adult and Non Formal Education Development Plan; Tanzania Beyond Tomorrow (TBT) e – Education programme; Unit Cost Study for Secondary and Higher Education; Environmental Strategic Plan; School Wash and Hygiene Strategy; HIV and AIDS guidelines; and the Technical and Vocational Education and Training Development Programme (TVETDP). The Human Rights Strategy; Adult and Non Formal Education Development Plan; Environmental Strategic Plan; School Wash and Hygiene Strategy; HIV and AIDS guidelines have been finalized, shared in the dialogue for a and approved. The Government

is committed to ensure that the finalized documents are implemented, and the pending ones are finalized for approval.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

During the year under review, MoEVT in collaboration with PMO-RALG verified teachers' claims amounting to 52 bil. by 30th June 2012. Out of the verified claims the amount related to salary arrears amounted to Tshs. 24 bil. was paid to 24,654 teachers and non-salary arrears amounted to Tshs. 18 bil. was paid to 19,922 teachers. The non-salary arrears claims for 5,894 teachers were not paid because the claimers failed to present authentic evidence of their claims. The Government is committed to continue to pay teachers claims once they are verified.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

In 2011/12, a total of 407 primary schools teachers' houses and 270 for secondary schools were constructed. Continuous professional development of personnel, which is a very important aspect in human resource planning and development at different levels of education, was also provided to the teaching staff. The Government will continue taking such measures in order to retain teachers in difficult and hard to reach areas in order to raise their morale and professionalism for effective working.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

It is well known that, with the expansion of education service delivery well underway in several sub-sectors, it has become clear that certain constraints within the education sector may be inhibiting the pace and scope of expansion and/or compromising the quality of education services that are being delivered. During 2011/12 a number of challenges were observed on effective provision of quality education at all levels. To mention a few it include decrease in enrolment in pre and primary levels, how to address the 3Rs in lower primary education and increased number of out of school children and youth; increased demand for Higher education student loans and how to improve the retention of teachers.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Having seen some of the major challenges facing the education sector, it is in this technical working session where participants will use this opportunity to identify achievable milestones. I therefore urge you to explore fully the challenges, discuss them thoroughly so as to come up with quick win milestones taking into consideration the sector priorities as

prescribed in the Five Year Development Plan 2011/12 – 2015/16, and actual challenges experienced during the implementation of the previous milestones. This means that, when identifying milestones for 2013/14 you should take into consideration the backlog of the milestones 2011/12 and those which are not likely to be achieved in 2012/13.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I wish to extend the Government gratitude to Development Partners both Active (CIDA, Sweden, DfID, UNICEF, UNESCO, and World Bank) and Delegating (AfDB, France, WFP, EU, Japan, and USAID) members for their continued support to the education development through budget support, technical advice, consultative dialogue and monitoring and evaluation. Moreover, the Government recognizes the contributions of Non State Organisations in complementing efforts through service delivery and advocacy. I'm proud of the cordial relationship maintained throughout the period of the current Chair (CIDA) particularly Corey Huntington and outgoing Deputy Chair (DfID) to be specific Madam Tanya Zebroff. I look forward to continued relationship be sustained by the current Education Development Partners Group lead and Deputy. The Government values and will continue to value the close and honest relationship among the education stakeholders.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Finally, allow me to use this opportunity to remind all education stakeholders that, what we have achieved and the ongoing plans and strategies in the provision of quality education are the efforts and responsibility of all of us. **Let's work together.**

THANKS FOR LISTENING.

Annex 6.1.2. Opening Statement by Education Development Partners' Group

**STATEMENT BY EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS TO THE JOINT EDUCATION SECTOR
REVIEW 2012, SEPTEMBER 25, 2012**

BY:

JOHN MOORE, ACTING HEAD OF MISSION, CANADIAN HIGH COMMISSION

Honourable Permanent Secretaries,
Distinguished representatives of central, regional and local government,
Distinguished representatives of Civil Society Organizations,
Development Partner colleagues,
Representatives of public and private educational institutions and agencies,
Teachers and parents,
Ladies and gentlemen:

Good morning.

I am pleased to be here this morning to share a few words on behalf of the Education Sector Development Partners Group at the opening of this technical working session for the 2012 joint education sector review.

The Education Development Partners Group consists of bilateral and multilateral agencies that are providing support to the education sector, and at the moment it consists of ten members. We come together as a group to promote coordination among ourselves in our dealings with the various education ministries in the government of Tanzania.

This year, for the first time, the program of this technical working session includes a timeslot for a report on the contributions of the development partners group to the education sector, so i won't go further into the details of what we do now, since you will hear about that tomorrow.

The annual review allows us the opportunity to reflect back on what has been achieved during the previous year, and to note areas of sector concern for further attention and action.

At last year's education sector high level meeting that followed the 2011 review, we noted that the key challenges emerging from the review were the need to improve the quality of education at all levels, and the need to address financial constraints facing the sector.

On the quality side, we are pleased to see a renewed emphasis on improving learning outcomes in Tanzania, following evidence from a variety of studies on the challenges facing the education sector.

On the financing side, we have noted that the allocation of the national budget to the education sector increased last year from 17% to 19% for 2012-13, which i think all of us, or at least all of us in this room anyway, can agree is a step in the right direction!

Significant advances have been made to follow-up on one of last year's key recommendations, to pursue additional financing to the sector from the global partnership for education. As DPs we are actively supporting the government in preparing its application and we stand ready to support this process through to its effective implementation of any funding that may be acquired.

These are all good steps forward.

Unfortunately, as we all know, many pressing needs remain, such as the need to provide more textbooks and learning materials, or to ensure students, particularly girls, are able to continue through to higher levels of education. We know we need to increase teacher effectiveness through better recruiting, training and motivation to ensure smaller class sizes with qualified teachers teaching the required number of hours per day. And we still need to ensure improved access to better quality, relevant secondary education for children from low income households, marginalized groups, and for girls. Throughout all of this we would like to see enhanced involvement of civil society and the private sector in education to enhance transparency, accountability to Tanzanian citizens and to provide more choice.

Many of these and other needs are well understood, but how to obtain them is not always very clear. Improving the education sector step-by-step with small incremental reforms may not be enough: recent data presents a picture of rapid sector expansion, but with clear declines in the quality of service and low morale amongst teachers. The situation now calls for reforms of education systems with a clear focus on increasing accountability and results, if the system will be able to improve learning outcomes for all boys and girls, men and women across the country who seek education and training. It is also time to become more concerned with what is going on at the local level. There is a need to clearly and boldly emphasize the implementation of urgent policy and programme reforms within the education sector in Tanzania.

The education sector development partners are keen and ready to support a reform initiative through their existing budget support and programmes. In addition, several donors have new investments that are currently under design, and as noted already we are collectively supporting the preparations for an application for 100 million dollars in new financing from the global partnership for education. There is a significant opportunity here and now to rethink the usual approaches to these problems, to learn from past successes and mistakes made here and in other countries, and to embark on some new paths.

It is, as always, up to the government of Tanzania how to embrace this opportunity, and how to shape the path ahead. The education development partners look forward to working with the government and the other education stakeholders in this process, including over the next few days at this technical working session, and in the follow-up to the joint education sector review.

In this spirit, I hope that we can be open and honest with each other throughout these discussions, to critically assess the sector strengths and weaknesses, achievements and shortcomings, as we focus collectively on developing ideas for continuing to build on past achievements and moving the sector towards a new vision, which will ultimately benefit all Tanzanians.

Ahsante sana

Annex 6.1.3 Opening Statement by the Civil Society Organisations (CSOS)

Mrs. Mary Soko, TEN/MET Board Chair

Honourable Permanent Secretary,
Deputy Permanent Secretaries,
Regional Administrative Secretary,
Directors and Heads of Institutions,
Councillors,
Distinguished DPS,
Distinguished Private sectors,
Distinguished parents, Teachers,
Member of Media,
Distinguished participants, Ladies and Gentlemen,

Good Morning,
I am here to present the CSOs' Statement.

The education sector review (ESR) process is the most significant annual pre-occupation for education stakeholders. The review is a great opportunity to influence education policy in both the short and long term objectives. It is also a learning experience for education civil society organizations (CSOs), Development Partners Group (DPG) and the government to ensure, explicit partnership among the three levels of the school and community, districts or local authorities, and the State.

We CSO we are operating in 8 zones all over Tanzania, making a total of 157 active members of TEN/MET, engaging in Pre-primary, Primary, Secondary education and teacher education. We are committed in service delivery complementing the Government efforts and advocating for the poor.

This annual Education Sector Reviews provide an opportunity for all key stakeholders to assess and contribute to the development of education. It is an assessment tool for education civil society organizations (CSOs), Development Partners Group (DPG) and the government to assess what have been done in the education sector, what are the achievements, opportunities and the challenges facing education sector in Tanzania and find ways to overcome the identified challenges.

The Joint Education Sector Review process is also a proof that CSOs have an important role to play in the implementation of policies and programmes, especially in critiquing the

effectiveness of their implementation. In addition, the reviews serve as reliable monitoring (and evaluative) tools for assessing the short and long term objectives for the Education Sector Development Programme, 2011-2017.

CSOs in Tanzania realise the initiatives the government is making in improving the quality of education at all levels. We also realise and acknowledge the DPG efforts in supporting the Government and improving the quality of education in the country and also supporting the CSOs financially.

During the year, CSOs have actively and constructively participated in education policy processes and advocating for quality education for all children, youths, in pursuing science, English, and mathematics in Tanzania.

Our commitment as CSOs is to continuously supporting the Government efforts as we perform our duties on service delivery.

We also commit ourselves to continuously advocating for the poor so that their voices are heard. That is influencing policies and practice. As well as, assessing and tracking funds allocated to the local government to ensure accountability and proper use for the intended aims.

THANK YOU for listening
Presented by Mary Soko
TEN/MET Chairperson

Annex 6.1.4 Opening Statement by the Guest of Honour

**STATEMENT BY PERMANENT SECRETARY MINISTRY OF FINANCE DURING THE
OFFICIAL OPENING OF THE ANNUAL JOINT EDUCATION SECTOR REVIEW
WORKING SESSIONS ON 25TH SEPTEMBER, 2012 AT NSSF WATER FRONT, DAR ES
SALAAM**

**Permanent Secretaries,
Deputy Permanent Secretaries,
Regional Administrative Secretaries,
Directors and Heads of Institutions,
Councilors,
Development Partners,
Civil Society Organizations,
Distinguished Guests,
Participants,
Members of the Media,**

Ladies and Gentlemen.

I feel greatly honored to be invited to officiate this vital and important working session of the Joint Education Sector Review 2012. This is an Annual event and it is the sixth event since we started this process.

On behalf of the Government of the United Republic of Tanzania, allow me to take this opportunity to welcome you all in this year Joint Education Sector Review working session. I wish to thank the organizers who have made this review a reality. Going through a list of participants, I have noted a wide range of stakeholders coming from the Government Ministries and Departments, Development Partners, and Non State Actors. Indeed, I thank you all for sparing your valuable time to attend this session.

Ladies and Gentlemen

The education sector has been conducting annual reviews since 2006, with the aim of assessing the performance of the sector in the context of the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty, Millennium Development Goals and Education for all targets. In the exercise, the sector performance is reviewed through the annual performance report data from the relevant education sector ministries and in terms of the extent to which the sector has implemented agreed priority actions identified in the previous year. The review has continued to take place yearly so as to provide opportunity for all education stakeholders to discuss the key issues that may have risen in the sector in the previous year and identify and agree on priority actions for the coming year.

Ladies and Gentlemen

Sector reviews are relevant to the Government of Tanzania as they provide inputs to the Annual General Budget Support Review process as well as the Poverty Reduction Budget Support process. The JESR is one of the underlying processes of the General Budget Support a Performance Assessment Framework (PAF) as such it provides inputs into the GBS Annual Review. In the context of MKUKUTA, the PAF is used to assess the performance against agreed targets. The framework has three areas which the Government and Development Partners have agreed to assess the performance of each sub sector and hence the entire sector as whole. These areas include: Financing and Budgeting; Accountability and Sector Dialogue; and Progress on Agreed Targets. These areas have been incorporated in the Education Sector Rating Framework where as assessment is carried out in accordance with the jointly agreed criteria.

Ladies and Gentlemen

The objective of Joint Education Sector Review 2012 is to assess performance of the education sector against the agreed milestones and sector wide performance indicators. The specific objectives include: assessment of different reports related to outcome and outputs; key priorities identified in sub sector programmes and sector

dialogue; to provide a clear view of financing including trends on budgetary allocations as well as budget executions and what the performance has been.

I am aware that over the three days you will discuss the Education Sector performance report, Civil Society organizations (CSOs), Development Partners Contribution in the education sector, field visit report and the status of implementation of milestones. It is the Government expectation that, you will share your treasured experience and expertise to assess the performance and ultimately ensure that the key strategies are identified to facilitate finalization of 2012/13 milestones and identification of priority sector actions which will lead to development, and hence recommendation of milestones for 2013/2014.

Ladies and Gentlemen

We all know that, despite the current achievements particularly in enrolment expansion at all levels; the education sector is still facing a number of challenges. The biggest challenge is on securing adequate budget to cater for the conducive and enabling teaching and learning environment, adequate teaching and learning materials and equipment, adequate and qualified human resources at all levels and on the overall, is to improve the quality of education. As you are probably aware, Higher education students' loans take a lion's share of the education sector budget, particularly Ministry of Education and Vocational Training budget. The Government is working hard to address this challenge accordingly. The challenge before you in this technical working session is to come up with achievable milestones with focused feasible strategies to ensure provision of quality education to all. Thus you should strive to identify quick win milestones, taking into account the Tanzania Five Year Development Plan 2011/12 – 2015/16, and actual challenges witnessed in the previous Joint Education Sector Review. Hence, I wish you a successful and worth full discussion during this review.

Ladies and Gentlemen

Before declaring this ESR working session open, am using this opportunity on behalf of the government to extend our sincere gratitude to all education partners including Development Partners, Civil Society and Faith Based Organizations for their materials, financial, technical and moral support rendered to facilitate improved provision of quality education in Tanzania.

Ladies and Gentlemen

With these few remarks, it is now my great pleasure and honor to declare the 2012 Annual Joint Education Sector Review Working Sessions officially opened.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION

Annex 6. 2: EDUCATION SECTOR MILESTONES:

Annex 6.2.1 STATUS OF 2011/12 MILESTONES AND SPECIFIC ACTIONS AS OF AUGUST 31, 2012

General Observations:

Out of the 57 specific actions, 30 have been completed; and a total of 27 need to be completed to finalize all Milestones.

S/No.	SPECIFIC ACTION	EXPECTED OUTPUT	RESPONSIBLE ACTOR	TWG	DEADLINE	STATUS AS OF 31 ST AUGUST 2012	COMMENTS
ISSUE 1	IMPROVE EFFICIENCY AND EFFECTIVENESS ON PUBLIC						
MILEST ONE 1	Develop a 5-year, education sector-wide, costed, operational plan						
1.1	Develop ToR, including a template, for developing a 5-year, sector-wide, costed, operational plan Oct 2011.	TOR and template for developing a 5-year costed operational plan in place	DPP	RACEF	2011-10-31	COMPLETED TOR template were approved at ESDC of 20th October, 2011.	

1.2	Hold working sessions with task team to draft the 5-year costed framework by March 2012 in conjunction with MTEF 2012/13.	5-year costed operational plan in place	DPP	RACEF	2012-03-31	<u>NOT DONE</u> Rescheduled for completion by end of September, 2012 after Budget Session	A combined status report to be provided on this issue including all Strategic Plans from the three Ministries. <u>SUGGESTION:</u> Ministries to continue using current strategic plans until new ones are in place.
1.3	Discuss and approve operational plan in ESDC by June 2012.	Approved 5- year costed operational plan	DPP	RACEF	2012-06-30	<u>NOT DONE</u> Subject to completion of 1.2	
MILEST ONE 2	Simplify and rationalise education funding mechanisms for LGAs						
2.1	Finalize report from October 2010 working session on grants formula system for allocating funds to Councils by	Report on Grants Formula in place	DPP	RACEF	2012-02-28	<u>COMPLETED</u> The report is in place and circulated to RACEF members.	

	February, 2012.						
2.2	Identify at least two priority recommendations for implementation in 2012/13 by March, 2012.	Identified priority recommendations on grants formula system for allocating funds in place.	DPP	RACEF	2012-03-31	NOT DONE Subject to completion of 2.1	
MILEST ONE 3	Conduct analysis of unit cost, including community contributions, for Secondary Education.						
3.1	Prepare ToR for Unit Cost Study for Secondary Education by November 2011.	ToR for Unit Cost Study in place.	DSE & DPP	RACEF	2011-11-30	COMPLETED ToR for Unit Cost Study in place	
3.2	Procurement of consultants by March, 2012.	Consultants procured	DSE & DPP	RACEF	2012-06-30	ON TRACK Advert process in progress	Procurement of consultants to start in July, 2012 and will follow GoT procedures as outlined in the SEDP II procurement guideline.

							Finalization date changed from July to September, 2012
3.3	Initiate Unit Cost Study by April, 2012.	Status of implementation of the Schedule of activities	DSE & DPP	RAC EF	2012-07-31	<u>NOT DONE</u> Subject to completion of above	Finalization date changed from August to October, 2012
3.4	Complete first draft of Study by May, 2012.	First draft of Unit Cost Study in place.	DSE & DPP	RAC EF	2012-08-31	<u>NOT DONE</u> Subject to completion of above	Finalization date changed from September to November, 2012
3.5	Finalise Unit Cost Study Report and share recommendations by June 2012.	Finalized and shared Report on the Unit Cost Study in place.	DSE & DPP	RAC EF	2012-09-30	<u>NOT DONE</u> Subject to completion of above	Finalization date changed from October to December, 2012

MILEST ONE 4		Conduct analysis of unit cost, including community contributions, for Higher Education					
4.1	Complete procurement of consultants by end of November 2011.	Consultants procured	DHE & DPP	RAC EF	2011-11-30	<u>COMPLETED</u> An international consultant engaged in January 2012	
4.2	Initiate the Unit Cost Analysis for Higher Education as per TOR by the end of December 2011.	Status of implementation of the Schedule of activities	DHE & DPP	RAC EF	2011-12-31	<u>COMPLETED</u> Draft Unit cost study in place and reviewed by the Higher Education Quality Assurance Forum	
4.3	Complete draft report for review by management by February 2012.	The reviewed draft report for Unit Cost Study in place.	DHE & DPP	RAC EF	2012-02-28	<u>COMPLETED</u> The reviewed draft report for Unit Cost Study in place.	
4.4	Finalise the Unit Cost Analysis for Higher Education	Finalized and disseminated Report	DHE & DPP	RAC EF	2012-06-2012	<u>RESCHEDULED</u> Final report to be submitted by August, 2012 and dates for dissemination to stakeholders to be determined later.	

	and disseminate the findings by June 2012.	on the Unit Cost Study in place.					
ISSUE 2							
MILEST ONE 5 Implement key recommendations from Education Sector Human Resources Situation Analysis							
5.1	Collect and analyse data for HR SITAN Report by September 2011.	Analyse d data for HR SITAN in place.	DAH R, DPP	IA	2011-09-30	COMPLETED The report for data collection and analysis was submitted to the MOEVT on 16th September 2011	
5.2	Finalize draft HR SITAN report by October 2011.	Finalize d HR SITAN draft Report in place.	DAH R, DPP	IA	2011-10-31	COMPLETED Draft report submitted by consultants on February2012.	
5.3	Share HR SITAN report with education stakeholders by January, 2012.	Shared HR SITAN report .	DAH R, DPP	IA	2012-01-31	COMPLETED Stakeholders workshop was conducted on 29th March, 2012. The report is in place.	

5.4	Finalize HR SITAN report by February, 2012.	Finalized HR SITAN report	DAH R, DPP	IA	2012-04-30	<u>COMPLETED</u> The final HR SITAN report was submitted on 22nd May, 2012	
5.5	Disseminate HR SITAN report by February 2012.	Disseminated HR SITAN final report	DAH R, DPP	IA	2012-07-31	<u>COMPLETED</u> Dissemination of the HR SITAN report was done	
5.6	Identify at least two priority recommendations for implementation in 2012/13 by March 2012.	Identified priority recommendations in place.	DAH R, DPP	IA	2012-04-30	<u>ON TRACK</u> Priority recommendations to be identified by the GoT Task Team.	
ISSUE 3	INCREASE ACCESS TO EDUCATION SERVICES						
MILEST ONE 6	Increase enrolment in Pre-Primary Education						

6.1	Disseminate ECD operational guidelines and minimum standards to key ECD stakeholders in 9 Councils by January 2012.	Disseminated ECD operational guidelines and minimum standards in place.	DPE	QI	2012-01-31	<u>COMPLETED</u> Dissemination completed in Bagamoyo, Kibaha and Temeke Councils in Jan 2012 Makete, Mtwara®, Magu have been covered in Feb. 2012. Monduli, Siha and Hai have been covered on February, 2012	
6.2	Disseminate pre-primary teachers guide in 9 Councils by end of January 2012.	Disseminated pre-primary teachers guide in place.	DPE	QI	2012-01-31	<u>COMPLETED</u> Dissemination completed in all 9 Councils.	
6.3	Conduct in-service training for 180 pre-primary teachers in 9 Districts by January, 2012.	180 pre-primary teachers trained.	DPE	QI	2012-01-31	<u>COMPLETED</u> 120 pre-primary teachers have been trained. The remaining 60 teachers were trained by end of March, 2012.	
MILEST ONE 7	Improve access to education for girls						

7.1	Construct 120 girls' hostels for secondary schools in disadvantaged areas by June 2012.	120 girls' hostels constructed.	CE, DPE, DSE, HE, T VET + PMO-RALG	EE	2012-06-30	COMPLETED. Communities in collaboration with Education stakeholders have started to construct 24 hostels in different schools are completed.	
7.2	Conduct Technical education pre-entry programmes for 150 girls by June 2012	150 girls received Technical education pre-entry programmes.	CE, DPE, DSE, HE, T VET + PMO-RALG	EE	2012-06-30	COMPLETED: -69 girls joined the pre-entry programme at DIT in July 2011. -177 girls attended in Pre entry programmes at MIST in June-August 2011. 105 girls attended pre-entry programme at ATC in May- July, 2012	
7.3	Produce and disseminate 2,000 copies of publications to sensitize girls to join Technical education by June, 2012.	2,000 copies of publications produced and disseminated.	CE, DPE, DSE, HE, T VET + PMO-RALG	EE	2012-06-30	COMPLETED: 3,000 brochures of programmes offered by ATC, DIT and MIST were distributed at tradefairs and exhibitions including TCU and at the 50 years Independence Anniversary. Brochures ensured that girls were targeted since they would be given sponsorship.	Copies of brochures to was shared at the ESDC meeting of 20th March 2012.

7.4	Provide 50 Higher Education scholarships to girls through MoEVT by June, 2012	50 girls received Higher Education scholarships.	CE, DPE, DSE, HE, T VET	EE	2012-06-30	COMPLETED: So far 67 girls were provided with Higher Education Scholarships by June, 2012. Female students were provided scholarship as follows: Mozambique (06); China (39); Algeria (20); Russia (02).	
MILEST ONE 8	Improve water, sanitation and hygiene at primary and secondary schools						
8.1	Conduct National SWASH Campaign by promoting hygiene and behavioral change in 6,000 primary schools by June 2012.	National SWASH Campaign conducted to 6,000 primary schools.	CE +PM O-RALG +CE	CCI	2012-06-30	IN PROGRESS: SWASH sensitization orientation campaign conducted to 1,097 primary schools, 10 REOs, 46 DEOs, 198 Headteachers and 123 primary School teachers.	

8.2	Construction and rehabilitation of latrines and hand washing facilities in 2 primary schools in each of 44 LGAs by June, 2012.	Latrines and hand washing facilities in 2 primary schools in each of 44 LGAs constructed and rehabilitated.	CE + PMO-RALG + CE	EE	2012-06-30	<p><u>IN PROGRESS:</u> Identification of 88 primary schools had been done. ADB has released funds for construction of latrines in Primary schools. Construction of latrines has been done in Makete (17 schools); Kibondo (7); Temeke (5) and Siha (7). 1). Constructions of latrines in 42 LGAs started in April 2012 Funds for construction had been distributed to respective LGAs.</p>	
8.3	Construction and rehabilitation of latrines at 184 secondary schools by June 2012.	Latrines in 184 secondary schools constructed and rehabilitated.	PMO-RALG +	EE	2012-06-30	<p><u>RESCHEDULED</u> Conditional survey has been conducted in 264 schools by MOEVT which include 2,487 toilet stances. Besides the survey been conducted, a total of 117 toilets were constructed by Councils in collaboration with Communities and other education stakeholders in secondary schools. Construction of toilets will be done in FY 2012/13.</p>	

8.4	Monitor implementation of School Wash Activities at primary and secondary schools and share quarterly reports through TWG.	Quarterly Monitoring reports for SWASH Activities shared through TWG.	CE	CCI	2012-06-30	Monitoring of SWASH activities was done in four Councils, Kibondo, Temeke, Makete and Siha. The monitoring report was shared in the SWASH Technical Working Group Meeting held on 24 february, 2012. The report was shared in the CCI Technical Working Group on 21st June, 2012.	
MILESTONE 9	Finalise Technical and Vocational Education and Training Development Programme						
9.1	Complete procurement of consultant by July 2011.	Consultant procurement.	DTVE T	TVE T	2011-07-31	COMPLETED Consultant was procured in accordance with PPA in July, 2011.	
9.2	Review and approve consultant's inception report by September 2011.	Reviewed and approved consultant's inception report.	DTVE T	TVE T	2011-09-30	COMPLETED: Draft Inception report was shared in the TVET TWG and endorsed for approval on 25th August 2011.	
9.3	Conduct session to discuss zero	Discussed zero draft of	DTVE T	TVE T	2012-06-30	NOT DONE To be conducted.	

	draft of TVETDP by January, 2012.	TVETDP Report.					
9.4	Conduct stakeholders meeting to inform TVETDP zero draft by February, 2012.	TVETDP zero draft report disseminated to stakeholders.	DTVE T	TVE T	2012-05-31	<u>NOT DONE</u> To be conducted.	
9.5	Conduct stakeholders meeting to inform 1st draft TVETDP by April, 2012.	TVETDP 1st draft report disseminated to stakeholders.	DTVE T	TVE T	2012-07-31	<u>RESCHEDULED</u> To be conducted in September, 2012.	-
9.6	Conduct sessions to finalize TVETDP by June, 2012.	Finalised TVETDP document.	DTVE T	TVE T	2012-08-31	<u>ON TRACK:</u> Expected to be completed by September, 2012.	
MILEST ONE 10	Complete development of Adult Education Development Plan						

10.1	Share the plan in the ESDC dialogue structure for approval by November, 2011.	Approved Adult Education Development Plan	AE/N FE	EE	2011-11-30	<p><u>COMPLETED</u> The plan was shared and endorsed in the EE TWG of 24th February 2012.</p> <p>The document was presented and approved by ESDC meeting of 20th March 2012.</p>	
10.2	Coordinate the incorporation of AEDP activities in MoEVT, PMO-RALG and LGAs MTEF by May, 2012	AEDP activities incorporated in MoEVT, PMO-RALG and LGAs MTEFs.	AE/N FE	EE	2012-05-31	<p><u>COMPLETED</u> Activities incorporated in Ministries MTEF.</p>	
ISSUE 4	IMPROVE QUALITY OF EDUCATION SERVICES						
MILEST ONE 11	Implement key strategic actions for improving the effectiveness of teaching English, Science and Math in primary schools						

11.1	Monitor and support implementation of School Based In-service Training for Primary School Teachers (MWAKEM) in 7 pilot Councils by December 2011.	Monitoring Report on School Based In-service Training for Primary School Teachers in place.	CE, DTE, DPE, DSE + PMO RALG	QI	2011-12-31	COMPLETED Monitoring and support provided to 2, 052 in 7 Councils between October and November, 2011. The Monitored Councils were Magu, Mtwara (R), Hai, Siha, Bagamoyo, Makete and Temeke	
11.2	Evaluation of School Based INSET for Primary School Teachers (MWAKEM) pilot materials, structure and its delivery system by March 2012.	Evaluation report on School Based INSET for Primary School Teachers in place.	CE, DTE, DPE, DSE + PMO RALG	QI	2012-03-31	NOT DONE To be conducted.	

11.3	Revise MWAKEM structure and materials for scaling up by April 2012.	Revised MWAKEM structure and materials for scaling up in place.	CE, DTE, DPE, DSE + PMO RALG	QI	2012-04-30	<u>NOT TO BE COMPLETED IN 2011/12</u> Carried forward to 2012/13 due to financial constraint.	
11.4	Print and distribute 3,000 copies of Science INSET module by April 2012.	3,000 copies of Science INSET module printed and distributed.	CE, DTE, DPE, DSE + PMO RALG	QI	2012-04-30	<u>NOT DONE</u> To be completed.	
11.5	Incorporate MWAKEM activities in MOEVT, PMO-RALG and LGAs MTEFs by May, 2012.	MWAKEM activities incorporated in MOEVT, PMO-RALG and LGAs MTEFs.	CE, DTE, DPE, DSE + PMO RALG	QI	2012-05-31	<u>COMPLETED</u> Directives was sent to all LGAs by PMORALG to incorporate INSET in their MTEFs and they incorporated..	

MILEST ONE 12 Implement key strategic actions for improving the effectiveness of teaching English, Science and Math in secondary schools							
12.1	Develop teachers' guide in Science using local materials by August 2011.	Teachers' guide in Science using local materials in place.	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO-RALG	QI	2011-08-31	COMPLETED Guides for Physics and Chemistry were developed as planned.	
12.2	Develop Training Manuals for English Teachers by August, 2011.	Training Manuals for English Teachers in place.	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO-RALG	QI	2011-08-31	COMPLETED Training Manuals for English Teachers are already developed and are in use.	
12.3	Publish and distribute 15,000 copies of teachers' guide in Science using local materials by December, 2011.	15,000 copies of teachers' guide in Science using local materials in place.	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO-RALG	QI	2011-04-15	COMPLETED 15,000 copies of Teachers Guides have been printed and distributed to all schools.	Copies were distributed as per schedule

12.4	Publish and distribute 4,000 copies of Training Manuals for English Teachers by March, 2012.	4,000 copies of Training Manuals for English Teachers printed and distributed.	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO- RALG	QI	2012-06-30	<u>RESCHEDULED</u> To be completed by October, 2012.	Date changed from 30th June 2012 to October, 2012.
12.5	Conduct Impact Assessment of IN-SET programme for Secondary School Teachers by April, 2012	Report on Impact Assessment of IN-SET programme for Secondary School Teachers in place.	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO- RALG	QI	2012-04-30	<u>COMPLETED</u> Internal assessment was Conducted in February 2012.	

12.6	Provide ICT facilities to 21 secondary schools by April 2012	21 secondary schools provided with ICT facilities	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO-RALG	QI	2012-04-15	<p><u>COMPLETED</u> Procurement of 210 computers was done in May, 2012 and distributed to schools on June, 2012.</p>	
12.7	Develop digital content for Science, Mathematics and English subjects by May, 2012	Digital content for Science, Mathematics and English subjects in place.	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO-RALG	QI	2012-05-31	<p><u>COMPLETED</u> Science Teachers Practical Guides had been developed in textual and Video/digital forms.</p> <p>Digital content for teaching English language is completed in mid- June, 2012.</p> <p>Mathematics model lessons had been put into digital form in mid- June, 2012.</p>	
12.8	Train 210 Science, Mathematics and English teachers in use of ICT for teaching by May,2012	210 Science, Mathematics and English teachers trained in use of ICT for teaching	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO-RALG	QI	2012-05-31	<p><u>COMPLETED</u> 70 teachers from 7 schools trained in use of ICT for teaching</p> <p>140 teachers to be trained by end March, 2012.</p>	

12.9	Conduct training of 3,010 Science and Mathematics teachers using the existing training manuals by June, 2012.	3,010 Science and Mathematics teachers trained using the existing training manuals .	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO-RALG	QI	2012-06-30	COMPLETED 3,000 teachers trained in December, 2011 using existing Manual.	The remaining 10 didn't turn up because were attending the long course.
12.10	Conduct training of 484 English teachers by June, 2012.	484 English teachers trained.	CE, DSE, DTE + PMO-RALG	QI	2012-06-30	IN PROGRESS 276 teachers trained by March, 2012. Training of 208 teachers to be conducted by June, 2013 due to financial constraint.	
MILEST ONE 13	Finalise sector-wide strategic framework for use of ICT to deliver quality education TBT Programme)						
13.1	Conduct consultation with stakeholders by November 2011.	Report on the Consultation with stakeholders in place.	DPP	QI	2011-11-30	NOT DONE: Document to be shared in QI TWG by end of November, 2012. Request for funds to finalize the TBT programme Document was sent to SIDA. Procurement processes for consultant in progress	Consultation with stakeholders not done. ACTIONS: Financial support of this activity awaited from SIDA. To share document at the coming QI TWG meeting.

13.2	Share the strategic framework in the ESDC fora for approval by March, 2012.	Shared strategic framework.	DPP	QI	2012-06-30	<u>RESCHEDULED</u> Share the strategy in ESDC TF and ESDC for approval subject to completion of 13.1.	
13.3	Incorporate TBT activities in MoEVT, PMO-RALG and LGAs MTEFs by May, 2012	TBT activities incorporated in MoEVT, PMO-RALG and LGAs MTEFs	DPP	QI	2012-05-31	<u>NOT DONE</u> Subject to 13.2.	

Annex 6.2.2 MILESTONES AND SPECIFIC ACTIONS FOR 2012/2013

S/NO	PROPOSED MILESTONES
ISSUE 1: FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT	
1.	Secure additional funding for the Education Sector Budget through the Global Partnership for Education
2.	Improve accountability and effective management of funds at Council and school level
ISSUE 2: HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT	
3.	Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified Human Resources within the Education Sector
ISSUE 3: ACCESS TO EDUCATION	
4.	25 FDCs to provide both Folk and Vocational Education
ISSUE 4: QUALITY EDUCATION	
5.	Strengthen the teaching and learning of the 3Rs in lower primary
6.	Implement Key Strategies for Quality Assurance Improvement at All Levels
7.	Improve quality of Higher Education through accelerated implementation of HEDP
ISSUE 5: MONITORING AND EVALUATION	
8.	Develop a sector-wide monitoring and evaluation framework for the ESDP (linked to the 5 year costed plan)

Annex 6.2.3 PROPOSED MILESTONES 2013/2014

Key Recommendations

The major recommendations of this Review are to align the milestones to the budget cycle so that they can be incorporated in the Ministries 2013/14 MTEFs. For FY 2012/13 we have provisionally proposed 8 milestones, some of them have started to be implemented and some need to be agreed and approved in the ESDC fora.

We have also agreed to propose 2013/14 milestones which were derived from the 2012 JESR working session targeting the following areas:

- **Quality:** Strengthening the teaching and learning environment at all levels;
- **Human Resource:** Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector;
- **Financing:** Expanding base for financing the education sector; and
- **Governance:** Improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.

We have also agreed on the way forward as follows:

- The incorporation of ideas, views and corrections generated during the review session into the final versions of the Education Sector Performance Report 2011/12 to be presented to the next ESDC meeting.
- The need for broad identified areas to be refined into milestones in order to address key priorities of the sector that will be incorporated in the Ministries' 2013/14 MTEFs.
- Presentation of the Milestones through the various dialogue structures; that is the Education Sector Development Committees, Joint Education Sector Committee, Inter Ministerial Steering Committee and the High Level Meeting for the final approval of
- the JESR Aide-Memoire 2012.

Annex 6.3: JOINT ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATION SECTOR PERFORMANCE FOR 2011/12

Subject	Type of information needed	Source of information	Indicator(s)	Rating Scale for 2011/12	Points allocation:			Score	EVIDENCE
					A= 100%				
					B= 50%				
					C = 0%				
					A	B	C		
A Budget and Financing – Weighting = 22%									
A1. Are FY 12/13 budget estimates consistent with the sector strategy, plan and priorities?	· Planned budget (MTEF), ESBAS, Strategy documents for Higher Education, ICT, PEDP, SEDP, TDMS, Capacity building, etc.	· Budget guidelines · MTEF · Strategic documents and plans for MOEVT, PMO-RALG, and MCDGC	1. % of overall GoT budget planned for education in FY 12/13.	A= More than previous year (17.90% or above).	4.0	2.0	0.0	4.0	% of overall GoT budget for 2011/12= 16.9 % of overall GoT budget for 2012/13= 19.13
				B= equal to previous year (17.80 -17.89%)					
				C= Less than previous year (17.79% or below)					
Subtotal for A1			2. Sufficient funds are budgeted in MTEF for implementation of agreed annual milestones for 2012/13	A= 75% or more of required funds budgeted	3.0	1.5	0.0	1.5	Out of the 8 milestones only the following Milestones are under implementation: GPE FEDC HE To check with Government on funds Budgeted for the 3 milestones.
				B = 25-74% of required funds budgeted					
				C= 24% or less of required funds budgeted					
					7.0	3.5	0.0	5.5	
A2. Is FY 11/12 budget allocation (funds released) in	· Approved budget	· MTEF	3. % deviation between budget	A= less than previous year	3.0	1.5	0.0	3.0	VOTE 2010/11 2011/12

line with approved budget?	· Budget allocations by votes and sub-votes	· Quarterly financial reports	approved by Parliament and funds released for Vote 46 (MOEVT), Vote 56 (PMO-RALG: Education) and Vote 53 (MCDGC: Folk Education) decreased in FY 11/12 as compared to FY 10/11	B = same as previous year					46 86.5(13.5) 95(5)
				C= more than previous year					53 30.3(69.7) 87(13)
								56 86.6(13.4) 77(23)	
								Total 67.8(32.2) 86.3(13.7) Rating based on Total	
4. % of funds released for capitation grants to primary schools in FY 2011/12	A= more than previous year	3.0	1.5	0.0	3.0	2010/11 <u>Primary:</u> Budget:80,029,990,000 Release: 23,161,111,184 % released= 28.94			
	B = same as previous year					2011/12 Budget: 80,029,990,000 (30billion for central purchase of textbooks) Release: 49,410,768,698 Released: 61.74%			
	C= less than previous year								
Subtotal A2					6.0	3.0	0.0	6.0	
A3. FY 11/12 Budget execution is in line with approved budget?	· Budget execution information	· Quarterly financial reports of relevant MDAs (MOEVT, PMO-RALG, etc)	5. % deviation between funds released and expenditure for OC and Development Funds under Vote 46 (MOEVT), Vote 56	A= less than previous year	7.0	3.1	0.0	7.0	VOTE 2010/11 2011/12 46 100 100
		· Audit reports		B = same as previous year					53 100 100 56 100 100

		· Education sector PETS	(PMO-RALG: Education), Vote 53 (MCDGC Folk Education) decreased in FY 11/12 as compared to FY 10/11	C= more than previous year						Total
			6. Primary and secondary capitation grants are released to LGAs on a quarterly basis	A= Both primary and secondary CG released quarterly	2.0	1.0	0.0	2.0		Availed Data shows that Capitation Grants are released monthly but does not show which councils/schools received the funding.
				B = Only primary or secondary released quarterly						
				C= Neither primary nor secondary released quarterly						
Subtotal A3					9.0	4.5	0.0	9.0		
Total for A					22.0	11.0	0.0	20.5		
B. Progress on agreed targets and results - Weighting = 60%										
B1. Progress on agreed performance indicators, targets and outcomes as identified in ESDP, sector monitoring tool, MKUKUTA and the PAF for the previous year.	· Outputs and outcomes of activities for FY 2010/11	· Annual Performance Report	7. Progress on outcome indicators in the GBS PAF 2012	A = 3 or 4 OIs show positive trend since 2011	15.0	7.5	0.0	7.5		<u>1. Form Four Pass Rates 2011:</u> Target 2011= 55% Actual: Average = 58.3%, M= 62.5%), F= 54.5%; TARGET MET <u>2. Proportion of councils in which less than 40 % of Standard VII pupils passed the PSLE in the previous year-</u> Target 2011= 9%
		· Education sector monitoring tool indicators		B = 2 OIs show positive trend since 2011						

		· GBS PAF 2011		C = 1 or no OIs show positive trend since 2011					Actual= 11.4%. TARGET NOT MET 3. <u>Form 4 examination pass rates (Division I-III) national average for the previous year, disaggregated by gender: Target 2011= 14%</u> TARGET NOT MET Actual: Average = 10.0%, M= 12.13%; F= 7.13%) 4. <u>Total enrolment in Degree Programmes (% females)</u> Target 2011/12: Total 124,500 Actual= 166,484: Female= 66,592 (36%) TARGET MET
			8. Progress on sector-wide performance indicators reported on in ESPR 2011/12	A= 70% or more show a positive trend	20.0	10.0	0.0	10.0	25 (48%) Negative 27(52%) Positive
				B = 50-69% show a positive trend					
				C= 49% or less show a positive trend					
Subtotal B1					35.0	17.5	0.0	17.5	
B2. Progress in achieving the milestones agreed in the JESR process for 2010/11	· Milestones agreed in the 2009 JESR review	· Updated roadmap with status column completed	9. % of specific actions for agreed annual milestones completed by 30 June 2012	A= 66% or more show a positive trend	20.0	10.0	0.0	10.0	30 (52.6%) SA completed 27 (47.4%) Not completed
	· Status of roadmap activities	· JESR Aide Memoire 2010		B= 50-65% show a positive trend					
				C= 49% or less show a positive trend					

B3. Response mechanism to constraints is functioning			10. % of risk mitigation measures identified in ESPR 2010/11 implemented and reported on in ESPR 2011/12	A= 66% or more implemented & reported B = 50-65% implemented & reported C= 49% or less implemented & reported	5.0	2.5	0.0	5.0	All targets at risk identified for implementation in 2010/11 have been reported in 2011/12. Further targets have been identified for actions to be taken in 2012/13 25 out of 34.
Subtotal for B2 & B3					25.0	12.5	0.0	15.0	
Total for B					60.0	30.0	0.0	32.5	
C. ACCOUNTABILITY - Weighting = 18%									
C1. Quality of education sector working group dialogue and stakeholder consultations throughout the year	· Minutes of meetings held in accordance with the roadmap schedule for each working group and committee	· Updated roadmap with status column filled in	11. Frequency/regularity of ESDC meeting	A= 4 quarterly meetings are held	4.0	2.0	0.0	2.0	3 ESDC TF and ESDC meetings held in Q 2, 3, 4 RACEF= 2 M&E= 3 QI= 3 EE= 4 IA-0 TVET HE-0 CCI= 3
	· Monitoring of the functioning of TWGs and sub-committees and ESDC meetings	· Minutes of TWG, ESDC Task Force and ESDC meetings		B = 2 to 3 quarterly meetings are held					
				C= 1 or no quarterly meetings are held					

			12. Sector Dialogue includes discussion of issues related to Financial Management, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · Priorities for Budget Guidelines; · Preparation of draft MTEFs; and · Response to CAG audits. 	A= Discussion on all three issues occurred. B= Discussion of one or two of these issues. C= No discussion on any of these issues	1.0	0.5	0.0	0.5	Discussions on Budget Guidelines and CAG reports discussed at RACEF meetings.
Subtotal C1					5.0	2.5	0.0	2.5	
C2. Information sharing (through ESDC fora and JESR)	· Quality and timeliness of the documents delivered	· DPG Education and MOEVT secretariats	13. All documents for review are circulated at least one week before ESDC TF meetings	A= All received on time	2.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	Received but not before meeting
				B= All received before the meeting					
		C= Not all received							
		14. All documents approved by ESDC in 2012 are published on MOEVT website within one month	A= All published on time	2.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	Not done	
B= All published, but with delays									
C= Not all published									
Subtotal C2					4.0	2.0	0.0	1.0	
C3. Quality of the JESR review	· agenda and supporting documents	Report on Technical Working Session	15. Dates for 2012 Joint Education Sector Review (JESR) Technical Working	A= JESR TWS conducted on agreed dates	3.0	1.5	0.0	1.5	In recognition that the dates for the JESR were not finalized until August (but were then maintained)

	for Technical Working Sessions		Sessions (TWS) are agreed by June 30, 2012, and maintained	B= JESR TWS conducted, but not on agreed dates C= JESR TWS not conducted						
			16. Programme and content for JESR TWS jointly agreed four weeks in advance	A= TWS Programme agreed 4 weeks in advance B = TWS Programme agreed 3 weeks in advance C= TWS Programme agreed 2 weeks in advance or less	2.0	1.0	0.0	2.0	Tentative programme and content agreed on 22nd August 2012- one month in advance.	
Outputs of JESR	· Roadmap	· ESPR Report 2011/12	17. Aide Memoire 2012, including agreed annual milestones and specific actions for 2012/13 and proposed milestones for 2013/14, approved at HLM prior to GBS Annual Review	A= AM, including 2012/13 and 2013/14 milestones, approved on time	4.0	2.0	0.0	2.0	Scored in anticipation that it will be done before GBS Annual Review 2012/13:5 milestones have specific actions that were agreed upon. Three do not. 2013/14- Milestones not proposed at the 2012 JESR.	
· Clarity on the agreed decisions and milestones?	· list of agreed milestones and specific actions implemented and suggested new milestones	· Aide Memoire 2011		B= AM approved on time, but without 2012/13 and 2013/14 milestones						
· Gantt chart and minutes agreed?		· Agreed milestones and specific actions		C= AM not approved on time						
		· Responsible GOT person for each milestone								
Subtotal C3					9.0	4.5	0.	5.5		

						0			
Total for C						18.0	9.0	0.0	9.0
GRAND TOTAL		Total (A) + Total (B) + Total (C)		Satisfactory = 50-100%; Unsatisfactory = 0-49%		100.0	50.0	0.0	62
		(22) + (60) + (18)							

Annex 6.4: CLOSING REMARKS FROM THE JESR 2012 TECHNICAL WORKING SESSION

Annex 6.4.1 Joint Statement from the JESR Working Sessions

The 2012 Joint Education Sector Review was held from 25th to 27th September, 2012. This was a result of preparatory work done by the Education Sector Ministries, Development Partners and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs). Participation in the JESR include key stakeholders; education functionaries from Education MDAs, DPs, CSOs, Education Officers from Regions and Local Government Authorities. The objective was to review the education sector performance for the period of 2011/2012, and generate priorities and milestones for the year 2013/14. This statement is a reflection of the spirit of cooperation, which aims at strengthening consultative dialogues to jointly assess the education sector performance towards provision of quality education.

The agreed JESR methodology was a result of consultations and dialogue among us, involving the following:

- 6) The compilation of the Education Sector Performance Report for the year July 2011 to June 2012. This report provided a summary of sector priorities, achievement of targets, challenges and way forward for each sub-sector;
- 7) Preparation of CSOs, Performance Report in Education Sector;
- 8) Preparation of Development Partners Contribution in the Education Sector Report;
- 9) Conducting site visits to schools, Teachers' Colleges, Adult Education and Folk Education centres, Vocational and Technical education institutions, district council offices which focused on revealing the key education issues and challenges facing teaching, learning and application of Science, Mathematics, English subjects and compilation of the report;
- 10) Holding the Stakeholders' Working sessions where the reports were presented and discussed.

We thank all those involved in the preparations and participation in this review, for their hard work and constructive discussions.

This year the review sessions have enabled us to work systematically to:

- Reflect on the achievements and challenges in the education sector during the financial year, ending 30th June, 2012.
- Prioritising issues for 2013/14 by considering backlog of 2011/2012 and milestones which will not be implemented in 2012/13. The proposed milestones will be further prioritized so as to come-up with few focused and implementable milestones agreed in respective education sector fora. In this respect, we want to express our satisfaction that this year's working session is a significant improvement on previous ones and the changes introduced in the presentations and discussions by sub-sectors will improve efficiency in reviewing performance in the future.

Key Recommendations

The major recommendations of this Review are to align the milestones to the budget cycle so that they can be incorporated in the Ministries 2013/14 MTEFs. For FY 2012/13 we have provisionally proposed 8 milestones, some of them have started to be implemented and some need to be agreed and approved in the ESDC fora.

We have also agreed to propose 2013/14 milestones which were derived from the 2012 JESR working session targeting the following areas:

- **Quality:** Strengthening the teaching and learning environment at all levels;
- **Human Resource:** Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector;
- **Financing:** Expanding base for financing the education sector; and
- **Governance:** Improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.

We have also agreed on the way forward as follows:

- The incorporation of ideas, views and corrections generated during the review session into the final versions of the Education Sector Performance Report 2011/12 to be presented to the next ESDC meeting.
- The need for broad identified areas to be refined into milestones in order to address key priorities of the sector that will be incorporated in the Ministries' 2013/14 MTEFs.
- Presentation of the Milestones through the various dialogue structures; that is the Education Sector Development Committees, Joint Education Sector Committee, Inter Ministerial Steering Committee and the High Level Meeting for the final approval of the JESR Aide-Memoire 2012.

We, the education stakeholders who participated at the 2012 JESR, declare our commitment to work together in implementing the Milestones in our various capacities including harnessing of resources to ensure High level achievements of targets we have set for the Education Sector.

.....
Education DPG	Education Sector	Civil Society Organization
Chairperson	Chairperson	Chairperson

Dar es Salaam
27th September, 2012

Annex 6.4.2 Concluding Remarks by Government

***Dr. Florens Turuka,
Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Communication, Science and Technology***

**Permanent Secretaries,
Deputy Permanent Secretaries,
Regional Administrative Secretaries,
Heads of Development Cooperation,
Directors and Heads of Institutions,
Directors of Local Government Authorities,
Development Partners,
Civil Societies Organizations,
Distinguished Guests,
Invited Participants,
Members of the Media,**

Ladies and Gentlemen.

Allow me to use this opportunity to thank the organizers of this occasion for inviting me to officiate the closing of this important Annual Joint Education Sector Review working session. I feel grateful, to be given the opportunity to participate in this event. I believe your presence and effective participation have enlightened on the success and challenges facing the education sector which is key to the development of our country.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

During this working session you had an opportunity to hear opening remarks from the Guest of Honor, Mr. Ramadhan Khijjah, the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance, and also Statements from the Government, Development Partners (DPs), and Civil Society Organization (CSOs). I believe from their remarks you developed guidelines which enabled you to accomplish the objectives of this review.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I am aware that this session was also preceded by presentations of education sector performance reports and joint monitoring visits. The visits aimed at verifying the reports with actual implementation of education activities and collect views from the education stakeholders.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I have been informed that the presentations and discussions focused on sub sectors priorities, outcomes and challenges encountered in the year 2011/2012 in the provision of quality education which is fundamental to social and economic development of our country.

The sub sectors involved are: Pre-primary, Primary, Secondary and Teacher Education; School Inspectorate, Adult and Non-Formal, Folk Education, Technical and Vocational Training and Higher Education.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I commend the work well done, as your participation and contribution to this joint technical working session have made it possible to identify and agree on the broad areas to be refined into milestones in order to address key priorities of the sector that will be incorporated in the Ministries' 2013/2014 MTEFs. The broad areas are:

- **Quality:** Strengthening the teaching and learning environment at all levels;
- **Human Resource:** Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector;

- **.Financing:** Expanding base for financing the education sector; and
- **Governance:** Improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

It is my hope that, other recommendations raised during the presentations and discussions on different issues are also concrete suggestions for improving education and are going to be vital inputs; and guide the preparation of the Aide Memoire which in turn will inform the General Budget Support Review. I use this opportunity to remind the drafting team of the Aide Memoire to work hard and ensure the document is ready in time.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Lastly, I congratulate you all for your active participation and commitment in this working session. I wish a safe journey to all of you back to your working stations.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

With these few remarks, I now have pleasure to declare the 2012 Joint Education Sector Review Working Sessions officially closed.

Thank you for your attention

Annex 6.5 PROCEEDINGS FROM THE HIGH LEVEL MEETING

Annex 6.5.1 Opening Remarks

***Honorable Dr. Shukuru J. Kawambwa (MP),
Minister For Education And Vocational Training***

Honorable Ministers;

Your Excellencies Ambassadors and High Commissioners;

Permanent Secretaries,

Deputy Permanent Secretaries,

Country Directors of International Organizations;

Heads of Development Co operations;

Representatives from:

The Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social Services;

Baraza Kuu la Waislam Tanzania (BAKWATA);

Christian Social Services Commission (CSSC);

**Tanzania Association of Managers and Owners of Non Government Schools
and Colleges (TAMONGOSCO)**

Distinguished Guests;

Ladies and Gentlemen.

Let me take this opportunity to welcome you all to the Joint Education Sector Review, 2012 High Level Meeting. On behalf of the Government of the United Republic of Tanzania, I thank you all for devoting your time to participate in this meeting besides your busy schedules of work. I would also, like to thank the organizers who devoted their time and efforts to make this High Level Meeting a reality. It is my expectation that, the output of this meeting will inform the planning, budgeting and will also help to improve the implementation of the education sector programmes for the coming years.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

As we all know, the Government of United Republic of Tanzania in collaboration with education stakeholders has been conducting Joint Annual Education Sector Review since 2006. The main objective of these reviews has been to assess the overall performance of the sector in the light of the Tanzania Development Vision 2025, Five Year Development Plan, National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP/MKUKUTA), Education for All (EFA) targets and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The results of the joint reviews have been documented in the Joint Education Sector Review Aide Memoire, which serve as the official record document of the Joint Education Sector Review processes for each year and forwarded to the High Level Meetings.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

The High Level meeting aims at discussing and approving the Joint Education Sector Aide Memoire for implementation. This meeting is normally preceded by the Education Sector Development Committees, Joint Education Sector Thematic Working Group and the Inter-Ministerial steering Committee.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

It can be recalled that, in the JESR 2011 High Level Meeting, we agreed on the following issues as the Way Forward:

- i. Fine tuning the approved Aide Memoire by incorporating of comments and corrections raised by participants and circulate the corrected version electronically to all stakeholders in PDF format by 30th November, 2011 and publish the document by 31st January, 2012;
- ii. Representatives of Education Sector from the Government, Development Partners and Civil Society Organizations to meet between November, 2011 and January, 2012 so as to discuss and jointly agree on few, strategic, focused, quick win and implementable milestones and specific actions for 2012/13 for inclusion in the Ministries' Medium Term Expenditure Frameworks;
- iii. The Education Sector Rating Framework to be reviewed and agreed by January, 2012;

- iv. The roadmap which guide implementation of the agreed milestones be developed and shared in the ESDP fora by January, 2012;
- v. The Government and Education Partners to be committed on implementation of the agreed milestones with specific actions in 2011/12; and
- vi. The Government of Tanzania, Development Partners and Civil Society Organizations to continue conducting Joint Annual Education Sector Reviews which are relevant to the Government of Tanzania so as to feed into the General Budget Support Review Performance Assessment.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I am glad to inform you that, all the actions agreed as the way forward, have been addressed as a result of the commitment of education stakeholders, in the planning, financing and monitoring of the performance of the Education Sector.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

In September, 2012 we conducted the seventh Annual Joint Education Sector Review. The overall objective of the review was to assess the performance of the education sector for the year 2011/2012 against the agreed milestones and sector wide performance indicators; and generate priorities and milestones for the year 2013/2014.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I am informed that, this year's performance reports as presented by the Government, Development Partners and Civil Society Organizations' explained the achievements by sub-sectors. Major achievements of the sector in FY 2011/12 include the increased enrolment for both boys and girls at all levels although the proportion of girls decreased as they move up the education ladder. At secondary level, for instance enrolment increased from 1,789,547 in 2011 to 1,884,272 in 2012.

At Vocational level enrolment increased from 85040 in 2011 to 112447 in 2012. For higher education enrolment increased from 139,638 in 2011 to 166,484 in 2012. There was also an increased number of teachers trained and employed across the sector.

Meanwhile the number of teaching staff for Primary Education increased from 175, 449 in 2011 to 180,987 in 2012.

Despite these achievements, the sector still faced challenges including shortage of teachers especially to the rural and underserved areas, inadequate teaching and learning materials and, insufficient financial resources to implement the planned priorities. The Government in collaboration with other stakeholders will continue to address these challenges and areas of deteriorating performance by applying the mitigation actions to be shared in the dialogue fora.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I am aware that, the Education Sector Review was jointly conducted by all education sector stakeholders, likewise, joint rating of the sector performance as well as the preparation of the JESR 2012 Aide Memoire were also jointly done. May I take this opportunity to convey my gratitude to the Civil Society Organizations, Development Partners and the Government for submitting the final JESR, 2012 Aide Memoire for our consideration and approval today.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I wish to inform you that, the review process has been successfully conducted. From the joint rating of the education sector performance conducted on 5th November, 2012 the sector scored 62% in the overall performance rating which is a Satisfactory Grade. Let us congratulate each other for the good joint work.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

I wish to acknowledge the Development Partners' contribution to the education sector through General Budget Support, Basket Funds and Direct Project funding modalities. I also take this opportunity to thank the Development Partners for spearheading the Global Partnership for Education and Cash on Delivery Funding Modalities, which by and large will narrow the existing financing gap in the education sector. The Government will continue to collaborate with Development Partners to ensure that the additional funding is available to improve the provision of quality education in Tanzania.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Sincerely, I also recognize the valuable technical and financial support to the Education Sector by Civil Society and Faith Based Organizations and through bilateral co-operations. Indeed the ESDP structured consultative dialogues; joint working sessions and joint monitoring visits have contributed immensely to the education sector achievements.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

May I now take this opportunity to declare the HLM 2012 is officially opened and call upon all members to deliberate on the Joint Education Sector Aide Memoire in detail and ultimately approve it.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION

Annex 6.5.2 STATEMENT ON EDUCATION SECTOR REVIEW PROCESS 2011

***Mr. Jumanne A. Sagini, Acting Permanent Secretary
Prime Minister's Office Regional Administration and Local Government***

Chairperson,

The Education Sector Review Process is the culmination of the on-going sector dialogue that takes place throughout the year. Sector dialogue is an on-going process that allows key stakeholders in the sector (GoT, DPs, and CSOs) to have open fora for discussions, challenges and agreements to improve the quality of education.

The Joint Education Sector Review (JESR) Aide Memoire document is approved by the High Level Meeting under the chairmanship of the Honourable Minister for Education and Vocational Training. The JESR, 2011 Aide Memoire was approved by the High Level meeting of 22nd November, 2011. After the 2011 High Level Meeting, eight milestones for 2012/13 were agreed upon for inclusion in the Ministries' Medium Term Expenditure Frameworks; The Education Sector Rating Framework was reviewed and approved on 20th March, 2012

Chairperson,

The status of implementation of the agreed milestones for 2011/12 was jointly updated through the ESDP dialogue fora between February and April, 2012. The Mid year review of implementation of milestones and specific actions for 2011/12 was finalised at the ESDC meeting of 12th July, 2012. The intention of the mid-year review was to keep track of the implementation of the specific activities, so as to identify strengths and weaknesses, finalize activities before the end of the fiscal year, and hence establish the way forward. However, during the mid year review it was realized that some of the specific actions in the 2011/12 milestones had not yet been achieved due to various reasons. The respective departments and Technical Working Groups were directed to fast track the implementation of milestones.

Chairperson,

In 2012, the Terms of Reference (ToR) for Joint Education Sector Review was developed and shared in Monitoring and Evaluation Technical Working Group (M&E TWG) meetings which forwarded the document to the ESDP Task Team meetings. The ToR was presented and approved at the ESDC Task Force and ESDC meetings held on 10th and 12th July, 2012 respectively.

Chairperson,

The 2012 Joint Education Sector Review was meant to assess the education sector performance in terms of the extent to which each sub-sector had implemented the recommendations of the previous review, to assess performance of the education targets, and provide a clear view of Human Resource situation and financial performance.

The review had the following processes:-

- (a) The sub-sector performance reports were prepared, and consolidated into the Education Sector Performance Report, which was shared in the ESDP dialogue fora.
- (b) The Joint Monitoring visits were conducted in 11 sampled Councils from 22nd to 28th July, 2012. The 2012 joint monitoring visits focused on the teaching and application of Science, Mathematics and English language in Primary, Secondary and Teacher Education, Vocational Education and Training; and Folk Development Colleges. The visiting teams comprised of Government officials, Development Partners and Civil Society Organizations' representatives. The teams carried out the exercise using the agreed TOR for the Joint monitoring visits 2012 and monitoring tools. The exercise involved physical observation of institutions and held interviews and discussions with focused groups. A Joint monitoring report was prepared and shared at the JESR 2012 Working Sessions.
- (c) The 2012 Joint Education Sector Technical Working sessions were held from 25th to 27th September, 2012 and the report for proceedings was shared. During the Joint Education Sector Technical working sessions, each sub-sector had an opportunity to present their annual performance.

Chairperson,

The Education Sector Performance report was complimented with the Joint Monitoring Visits report and Civil Society Organisations Performance in Education Delivery. Status of implementation of Specific actions for the 2011/12 milestones was also presented and discussed. Development Partners had an opportunity to present status of their contribution in the delivery of education.

Each of the above presentation was followed by discussants presentation, plenary sessions and Group discussions. This arrangement instilled to positive engagement and participation by stakeholders. Issues that emerged from the JESR 2012 stakeholders' discussions were to be considered as an input to the development of 2013/14 milestones. At the end of joint review working session, concluding statements were made by representatives of the Civil Service organizations and Development Partners. The session ended by having the Government statement and closing remarks.

Chairperson,

As the way forward, the draft 2012 Joint Education Sector Aide Memoire was prepared based on the Joint ESR technical working sessions proceedings and deliberations which are documented in the sessions report. The proposed Aide Memoire was discussed and endorsed by the Education Sector Development Committee held on 8th November 2012, the Government and Joint Education Sector Thematic Working Groups meetings on 13th November 2012 as well as Inter Ministerial Steering Committee of 15th November 2012.

With these remarks I beg to submit.

Annex 6.5.3 BRIEF ON EDUCATION SECTOR AIDE MEMOIRE 2011

***Ms. Kijakazi Mtengwa, Permanent Secretary,
Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children***

Chairperson,

The JESR, 2012 Aide Memoire highlights the review processes in summary form and findings of key inputs to the review including: statements from the government, Development Partners and civil Society Organizations, Education Sector Performance Report 2011/12 by sub-sectors, Joint Monitoring Visits Report 2012, and papers on the contribution of Development Partners and Performance of Civil Society Organizations in the delivery of quality Education. Issues that emerged from the Technical Working Session are also included in the Aide Memoire.

Chairperson,

The Aide Memoire (AM) also summarizes the key findings, deliberations and recommendations from the JESR technical working sessions, including prioritized milestones for 2012/13 and proposed broad areas for 2013/14 milestones. The AM also records the agreed assessment of sector performance in 2011/12 based on the agreed rating framework.

Chairperson,

The 2012 Aide Memoire is comprised of five chapters, whereby. **Chapter one** gives the introduction of the document which comprise of the background of the education sector dialogue. The chapter indicates that the Education Sector has been conducting successful annual reviews since 2006. The aim of the reviews has been to assess the overall performance of the sector focusing on the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP/MKUKUTA), Education for All (EFA) targets and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The reviews have been jointly conducted by education stakeholders

including the Government, Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Faith Based Organizations, Development Partners (DPs) and the Community.

The first chapter also gives the rationale and objectives of the Joint Education Sector Review for 2012 which is to provide the basis for monitoring the performance and dialogue, provide inputs to the General Budget Support review process which assesses Government performance against the Performance Assessment Framework (PAF) matrix, MKUKUTA, Election Manifesto and the milestones agreed during the previous year's education sector review.

Chairperson,

Chapter two gives summary of the opening statements whereby welcome note, official opening and key note address are summarized. In addition, statements from the DPs and the Civil Society Organizations feature in this same chapter.

Chairperson,

The third chapter of the Aide memoire summarizes key findings of inputs to the JESR 2012 including performance of each sub sector, Joint Field Visit Report, 2012, CSOs and Development Partners' contribution towards delivery of quality education for FY 2011/2012. It includes summary of discussion issues from plenary and group discussions. The chapter also covers the status of milestones for 2011/2012 and milestones for 2012/2013. Based on the agreement in the JESR 2012 working sessions, 8 Milestones will remain as they are without having fully specific actions subject to discussion and agreement within subsectors depending on their budget.

Chairperson,

The proposed broad areas for 2013/14 milestones also feature in the chapter. The broad areas that will be targeted are: **quality** intending to strengthen the teaching and learning environment at all levels; **human resource** with the view to improving equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector;

financing hoping to expand the base for financing the education sector; and **governance** intending to improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.

Chairperson,

Chapter four highlights the concluding remarks including the joint statement from the JESR working sessions, the agreed way forward, closing statements from the CSOs, DPs and the Government. **Chapter five** highlights the score achieved by the sector and makes the conclusion.

With these remarks, Mr Chairman, I beg to submit the JESR, 2012 Aide – Memoire in brief.

Annex 6.5.4 DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS' COMMENTS ON AIDE MEMOIRE 2011

***Ms Patricia McCullagh, Head of Cooperation, High Commission of Canada
Chair of the Education Development Partners' Group***

**Honorable Minister of Education and Vocational Training
Permanent Secretaries,
Deputy Permanent Secretaries, Participants, Ladies and Gentlemen:**

It is a pleasure for me to join you today for my first Education Sector High Level Meeting, and I welcome this opportunity to speak on behalf of the education sector Development Partners.

Honourable Chairperson:

We feel that the Aide Memoire reflects the presentations and discussions that took place during this year's Technical Working Session, as well as related aspects of the Annual Review, such as the field visits and the rating exercise. I understand that the technical working session itself was especially vibrant this year, and we applaud the decisions to concentrate this year on the sector performance report as the key basis for discussions, and to emphasize small group discussions so strongly in the format. We felt that there was more interaction among participants this year than in the past, and the discussions were more enriching because of this.

In our DP statement at the Review we noted the importance of improved financing for education, and the importance of improving the quality of education being delivered in the country. On the financing side, perhaps the most significant development over recent months is the decisive actions taken to apply for one hundred million dollars in funding from the Global Partnership for Education, or GPE. As DPs we commend the Government for doing what it can, as quickly as it can, to seize this opportunity and press ahead with the development of quality sub-sector plans in order to try to obtain additional resources to support the sector. We remain committed partners in this process, and we have been happy to provide technical and coordination support to it when asked.

On the quality side, in our statement at the review we also called for reforms in the education system, with a clear focus on increasing accountability and results, in order to improve learning outcomes for all the boys and girls, men and women across the country who seek education and training. We note that steps are being taken to address this issue, including the development of the new Education Reform Compact, which prioritizes these issues for greater attention over the next few years. We look forward to looking at the Compact in more detail later today.

Clearly there is a lot of work being done to try to address many of the common issues that we have jointly identified in the education sector. But we would instead like to highlight some concerns we have about the ways in which we are working with each other towards these and other objectives.

I'm told that Tanzania has one of the most advanced dialogue structures globally, and that the education sector is one of the most advanced sectors in this regard. So we are already working with something solid.

However, we do feel that it is time for a serious review of the dialogue structure in order to make adjustments and improvements. As DPs, we are concerned that the dialogue structure is not functioning adequately to fully serve its purpose. We are concerned that the mechanisms which were put in place to support the structure are no longer effective. And we want to ensure that we have an effective partnership that enables us to support you as you set the national education development agenda and lead all of our efforts. So we would like to move forward with a "dialogue on the dialogue", if you will.

We feel it is time to rethink things like how the milestones are prepared and used, and whether the various working groups and committees in the structure help us to work together better, or do they simply confuse matters and take our time away from other more critical matters to improve the education system in Tanzania.

We know that the government also has concerns related to the structure, and we are pleased to have been invited in the past to make suggestions on this front. We are partners in this process, and we share responsibility for the current situation, and for working towards improving it.

As the Joint Assistance Strategy itself is under review, we feel that now is the appropriate time for us to take a step back and look at how we work together, in order to collaborate more effectively and efficiently, and ultimately to improve what the education sector can provide to the people of Tanzania.

Asanteni sana.

Annex 6.5.5 CIVIL SOCIETY COMMENTS ON AIDE MEMOIRE 2011

***Justin Morgan, Associate Country Director, Oxfam – Chair of TENMET
Board of Directors***

**Honorable Minister for Education and Vocational Training,
Practitioners and Partners in Tanzania’s Development,
Ladies and Gentlemen:**

It is indeed with great honor and pleasure that I deliver this statement on behalf of the Civil Society Organization’s who are engaged in improving the quality and access to Education for the children in Tanzania.

I would like acknowledge the Government of Tanzania’s statements in placing education at the centre of eradicating poverty and seeing all Tanzanian citizens’ live a life of dignity, freedom and prosperity. The recognition of having both girls and boys enjoying equal access to quality education continues to be a positive step by the Tanzanian government, and the commitment to access has been backed by a 20% or near, allocation of budget to education.

Our review of the Aide Memoire is that it is a fair reflection of the assessments completed and the views presented in prior meetings.

The Civil Society Organizations that make up the membership of the Tanzania Education Network (TEN/MET) maintain our commitment to finding solutions to Tanzania’s education challenges with the Government and other development partners. Our members are supporting the government in providing school infrastructure, such as classrooms, water and sanitation facilities, desks, books and chairs and possibly the most important of all – teachers with the right skills and motivation to lead our children’s learning. We also have members that are working with the students, parents and teachers of Tanzania to better engage with the education system, by monitoring and informing leadership on the

performance and delivery of services, engaging in debates around the curriculum, and evaluating the performance of the education system.

As we approach 2015, all of us in this room are no doubt questioning the probability of achieving the Education for All goals. As we reflect on the statistics, we must not lose sight of the consequences. A country with only 58% of students passing and progressing into secondary school is not providing the foundation for sustained economic and social prosperity. It is creating a culture of haves and have nots.

We, as civil society organizations acknowledge the Government's self-critique on the implementation of last year's education sector milestones. The government's own assessment identified constraints in implementation including "inadequate budget allocations and late receipt of funds; large numbers of specific actions, which lead to partial implementation of milestones; agreed milestones are not the same as the Government's priorities."

We therefore are calling on the government to use these shortcomings in setting the priorities for the coming year.

We should see the 3rd issue raised in the 2012 Joint Education Sector Review as the first priority. Seeing financing and alternative funding in education is a quick win with the right political will. From 2010/11 to 2011/12 the review has seen the percentage of funds released for capitation grants increase. This is commendable. However, with so much resources still not getting to the school, much more needs to be done. Without resourced schools, not the education sector but schools, our children are going without. Our future doctors and farmers, civil servants and engineers, have to beat the odds to get ahead in this world. Their education, their access to quality education is a right, not a privilege. We in this room have the opportunity to ensure the right is a reality for all Tanzanian children. Let's only be satisfied when the percentage of capitation released, and utilized, reaches 100%.

Recognizing the large number of specific actions raised in the prior year as a constraint, we as civil society would like to share with the Honorable Minister where we believe priority must sit. I have already mentioned one area, disbursements of resources to the schools – a potential quick win. I would also like to share our thinking on two other areas of priority. Firstly, showing a serious commitment to quality improvement and focus on teacher’s capabilities, efficiency and effectiveness, as well as their retention, especially in primary schools. Secondly, supporting school management and to improve the selection process for head students in schools. The members of TEN/MET have seen, through evidence, that when these are invested in and prioritized, there is a clear return on investment with improved learning within the school environment.

A soon to be released piece of research from Haki Elimu, shares with us the plight of teachers in Tanzania, and with clear evidence linking improvement of teacher quality with student examination results. The report identifies that “Less than 40 percent of the teachers used other items beyond books and the syllabus in teaching.” “Only 17 percent of the responding teachers reported having always/often used ICT resources in teaching”. There also remains a strong culture of lecturing within the schooling system. And when we look at the investment in teachers it is clear to see why such trends exist. “About a third (33.5%) of the teachers reported to have attended some professional development training opportunity in the past five years.” Just one third in the last 5 years. The research also seen that “Though the competence based curriculum was introduced .. in 2005, .. (only) a third of the teachers reported to have received any training in this area.” The skills and commitment of teachers is clearly paramount to our children’s education. Honourable Minister, we as members of TEN/MET call on your leadership to ensure that the teachers in the system today are valued and honoured. We look to see that priority is given to enhancing their skills and capacities.

The work of Oxfam, a member and chair to the board of TEN/MET, and also the organisation for which I work, has seen that changes in the selection of student bodies at the school bring immediate returns in terms of accountability, and also see’s girls take a much more prominent role. While the guidelines for head student and student

representatives are clear, its implementation is less so. Election between students is the mode in which head students are to be selected. Experience shows that head students are often appointed by the head teacher. The result is too often is that the head students are used to get students to conform to the teacher's demands, rather than hold the school and its management to account. When elections happen, there is a clear difference. Oxfam has seen that firstly, more girls are elected – our first sample of schools seen 80% of schools elect a girl as their head student. We also see that students are more accountable to their fellow students. We have reports back of cleaner schools, particularly toilets, and in several cases teacher absenteeism was questioned, and in each case addressed, either by improved attendance or removal from post. As we look to see that our education system helps our children learn, helps our children question and reason, helps our children mature academically and socially, we here today in positions of influence over the education system must provide the space for student empowerment. As we approach 2013, civil society organisations call for priority to be given in improving school systems, to control and manage resources.

Honorable Minister, we thank you for your, and your ministry's continued commitment to reflect, assess and improve the education system for future of Tanzanian's. Our commitment as civil society remains as strong as ever to find solutions to the challenges faced in the education system of Tanzania. I hope that through this statement, we have been clear on our areas which we believe require priority: ensuring financial resources get to schools, investing in the current teachers in the system, and seeing school student bodies properly recognized and empowered.

As we work on the coming year's plans, and start to shape the post 2015 education development agenda, the members of TEN/MET are ready to help.

Thank you

Annex 6.5.6 GOVERNMENT COMMENTS ON THE AIDE MEMOIRE 2011

Hawa Abdulrahaman Ghasia (MP), Minister of State Prime Minister's Office – Regional Administration and Local Government

Honorable Ministers;

Your Excellencies Ambassadors and High Commissioners;

Permanent Secretaries,

Deputy Permanent Secretaries,

Country Directors of International Organizations;

Heads of Development Co operations;

Representatives from:

The Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social Services;

Baraza Kuu la Waislam Tanzania (BAKWATA);

Christian Social Services Commission (CSSC);

Tanzania Association of Managers and Owners of Non Government Schools and Colleges (TAMONGOSCO)

Distinguished Guests;

Ladies and Gentlemen.

I have noted with pleasure that the 2012 review process which has been jointly carried out by the Government, Development Partners and the Civil Society Organisations representatives has led to a timely production of the Joint Education Sector Review 2012, Aide Memoire. This is a success and I commend all the Education Sector stakeholders. Nevertheless with regard to the Aide Memoire I have few comments to make:

1. Both Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) and Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) at pre-primary and primary education are showing a decreasing trend. The decrease in NER is contrary to the expectation of attaining MKUKUTA target of NER of 99% by 2015. In

this regard, there is a need to sensitize the community to send children to schools in order to attain universal primary education and hence achieve MKUKUTA as well as EFA targets and MDGs.

2. The joint visit monitoring report indicates that there are inadequate competent Mathematics, Science and English teachers and Teaching and Learning materials and assistive devices. Few students opt to study Mathematics, Science and English as most of the students conceive them as difficult subjects. There are inadequate laboratories, chemicals, workshops, libraries and library facilities, classrooms and equipment that limit practices by students and teachers. It has also been noted that there is inadequate in-service training and orientation to teachers/facilitators on the review of curriculum (competence based),. Also lack of laboratory technicians burdens teachers to prepare for practical and use of certain science equipment which contribute to limited application of science and languages. There is an urgent need to improve the teaching learning environment with a view to promoting teaching, learning and application of Mathematics, Science and English subjects.
3. The secondary education is still facing shortage of qualified teachers to cope with expanded enrolment. The situation is further aggravated by lack of adequate supportive infrastructure and social services like housing for teachers, utilities, library, laboratories, administration blocks, classrooms, hostels, toilets, desks in both urban and rural areas Lecture rooms at higher learning institutions are also limited. In this regard, I am of the opinion that we should look into the possibility of enhancing the development budget for the education sector. The sector should also explore alternative ways of increasing the supply of teachers for secondary schools and tutors in colleges based on the Government regulations.
4. There are initiatives aiming at utilizing Folk Development Colleges in the provision of both Vocational Training and Folk Education so as to enhance the provision of knowledge and skills to the increasing number of primary and secondary school leavers. The main challenge is availability of adequate resources to facilitate scaling up and sustaining the initiative. There is a need to explore the financing sources.

5. The share of education sector budget increased from 17.8% in 2011/12 to 19.13% in 2012/13. However the large amount of funds about 85% is for Higher Education Students' Loan Board. This situation hampers the provision of quality education services at all levels. The Government has come up with some initiatives which explore alternative financing of Higher Education including involvement of financial institutions and Social Security Funds.
6. The Five Years Development Plan (FYDP) observes the need for an annual throughput of at least 125,000 technicians and 635,000 workers with vocational qualifications by 2015. In order to respond to FYDP; there is a need to expand TVET institution capacity threefold. The main challenges ahead include mobilization of adequate resources to facilitate the expansion of physical facilities including establishment of 28 district vocational centers, new technical colleges; acquiring adequate and modern equipment, tools and teaching materials that match with modern technologies so as to equip graduates required; and increasing the allocation of Skills Development Levy (SDL) funds to cater for an increased students' enrolment.
7. Generally the education sector faces a number of challenges as elaborated and discussed during the 2012 JESR Technical Working Sessions. It will take time to overcome them, but I assure our partners that the Government is committed in addressing these challenges so as to ensure there is provision of quality education at all levels. I would like to emphasize that **quality of education** cannot be compromised. Being partners in education, I welcome you all to join hands with the Government in the provision of quality education in country as one of the pillars for development.

Thank you

Annex 6.5.7 SUMMARY OF GENERAL DISCUSSION

A: Issues Raised by Participants

Participants had the opportunity to raise a number of issues and questions that were later responded to by the Government as follows:

1. Given the main issues raised at the review and during the dialogue processes, and the fact that the assessment of the sector shows a rating of 62% what issues will be taken on board for the future of the education sector so that the sector would start doing things differently. or would it be business as usual. What is the level of ambition in the sector and how do we want to raise the bar, and set priorities and ensure that they are implemented taking into account the required resources both financial and human? There is need to think of the development of Human capital as it played a major role in implementation of identified strategies and plans.
2. Reference was made to the Education Reform Compact (ERC) noting that within it there were various strategies but also noted that there is need to have a clear way forward on their implementation. The ERC was also an indication of new and strong commitments on moving the sector forward.
3. The review emphasized the need to look for alternative funding mechanisms and scale up access to new funding and better utilization and equitable distribution of resources to ensure better results.
4. Noted that additional funding from GPE was an opportunity of more resources in the Sector and also commended the Government for exploring Cash on Delivery-Results based financing as another opportunity for leveraging better results
5. Issue of ICT was raised asking to what extent the Government planned on considering the use of ICT in learning.
6. Safety of schools environments was noted as an areas of concern.
7. The linkage of Vocational Training and skills development needs to be further explored
8. Noted the importance of discussing the issues to get clarity on how broad stakeholders' ambitions should be.

9. On issues of access and population growth, it was noted that there will be increased enrolment that could be at the expense of quality. The need to learn from other countries on how they are addressing the issue was noted.
10. It is not sufficient to continue thinking that the available resources are enough instead there should be a window where resources could be placed for Government and Non-Government institutions to borrow. The Government urged to think critically about Public Private Partnerships noting that the Government could utilize Non-Government Institutions infrastructure including laboratories and libraries .
11. Noted a large gap of science teachers and asked whether there was any strategy in place to bridge it such as the sourcing of teachers from other East African countries by elimination of working permits which cost 1500 dollars from teachers who are otherwise paid minimal salaries.
12. Noted the increased number of Form Four student failures and encouraged the Government to increase NACTE's capacity in coordinating and assisting mushrooming VET to be accredited so as to address the gap of those who do not proceed to higher levels of formal education.

B: Responses by Government to Issues Raised

1. The Government was not going to continue business as usual and was ready to make positive changes in the system to ensure delivery of quality education.
The Education Reform Compact was a 3 year initiative by Government to ensure fast tracking of strategies for quicker and better results. Understood that development partners were behind the ERC hence appreciated their support. Noted that DPs are also ready to change their way of engaging and appreciating the support by DFID on the issue of Fast Tracking results and that the model being tested (Model from Malaysia) would help to align education systems.
2. The Government was ready to sit down and establish what could be done to get better outcomes at Pre Primary, Primary and secondary education levels and is prepared to put in a lot of finance to ensure achievement of those results with the assistance of Development Partners.

3. The government appreciates the achievements and support from private institutions in the education sector at all levels and will continue to make the environment more conducive for private institutions to operate. One such achievement is the provision of student loans which does not distinguish Private from Public Institutions.
4. The Government understands the concerns on financing. It is true that the Government has set up a window at the Tanzania Investment Bank for farmers to borrow. This could also be a possibility for Education and the Government is ready to look at possible financing mechanisms. The MOEVT will take it up with the Ministry of Finance and Government at large, on how this could be pursued. Government to consider serious interventions in moving forward the education Agenda including considerations for results based financing.
5. Regarding utilization of private schools infrastructure- Government would like to utilize them, taking into consideration the costs and quality issues. Noted that currently the Government also has empty spaces at A Level and higher Education levels, because there were not enough students who passed at Form Four to fill all available A-Level spaces. This was also the case at Higher Education Institutions.
6. Regarding use of available infrastructure in Private Institutions- The Government was very positive to respond to that and that MCDGC was already undertaking an activity on utilization of Folk Development Colleges to deliver VET. Some funding had been availed for transforming 25 FDCs to provide VET. The Government was open for further discussion on use of available facilities to provide training including on analyzing issues around quality and costs.
7. The Government has also put up a new Public Private Partnership Act in the country that will ensure quick wins.
8. Regarding Human Resources- Tanzania agreed to open a window for secondary school teachers-science and math from East African countries however it was found out that there were also shortages of science and Math teachers available within the East African countries. The government promised to look into the permit issue.
9. The Government is expanding on Vocational Training Colleges and has also decide to make use of existing FDCs to offer Vocational education and building new VET

colleges. A qualification Framework is also in place for learners to be able to cross from one type of institution to another.

10. Informed that the Government in collaboration with USAID was piloting ICT in Mtwara and Zanzibar. Commended the efforts that USAID has already shown indicating that the long term plan would be on the use ICT in teaching.
11. MOF noted that the amount of Government funding allocated to education has been increasing overtime both in public and private institutions. Noted that Private sector was strong investor in education so far.
12. Government lauded the idea of Performance Based Financing however noted that once one decides to reward performance, one will also be obliged to sanction nonperformance.
13. Noted that the ERC is an important tool in improving the learning outcomes hence the Government will need to abide to the reforms which were being proposed, critically considering measures to ensure a functioning education system. This will require commitment to radical changes and increased resources in the sector.

Annex 7.0 THE WAY FORWARD

Mr. Selestine Gesimba, Acting Permanent Secretary,

Ministry of Education and Vocational Training

According to the presentations and discussions held in 2012 High Level Meeting the Aide Memoire has been approved subject to incorporation of raised inputs and corrections from participants. The agreed way forward is as follows:

1. Fine tuning the document and circulate electronically the corrected version to all education stakeholders in PDF format by 30th December, 2012 and publish it by 31st January, 2013;
2. Representatives from the Government Education sector, Development Partners and Civil Society Organizations will meet between November, 2012 and January, 2013 to discuss and jointly agree on backlog, and few, strategic, focused, quick win and implementable milestones and specific actions for 2013/14 for inclusion in the respective Ministries' Medium Term Expenditure Frameworks;
3. For smooth implementation of agreed milestones and joint performance assessment, the roadmap which guide implementation of the same will be developed and shared in the ESDP fora by March, 2013;
4. The Government and Education Sector stakeholders are all committed to implementing all agreed milestones with specific actions which will be identified for implementation in FY 2013/14; and
5. The Government of Tanzania, Development Partners and Civil Society Organizations will jointly conduct Mid Term Review of the Education Sector Development Programme 2008 – 2017 to assess status of its implementation by June 2014.

Annex 8.0 CLOSING REMARKS

Hon. Dr. William Augustao Mgimwa (MP.), Minister for Finance

Honorable Ministers;

Your Excellencies Ambassadors and High Commissioners;

Permanent Secretaries,

Deputy Permanent Secretaries,

Country Directors of International Organizations;

Heads of Development Co operations;

Representatives from:

The Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social Services;

Baraza Kuu la Waislam Tanzania (BAKWATA);

Christian Social Services Commission (CSSC);

**Tanzania Association of Managers and Owners of Non Government Schools and
Colleges (TAMONGOSCO)**

Distinguished Guests;

Ladies and Gentlemen.

I feel honoured to be given this privilege to officially close this High Level Meeting for the Education Sector. Let me take this opportunity to thank you all for active participation in this important meeting which approves Aide Memoire as a document that summarizes the review process and sets milestones to be implemented in the education sector for the coming year. The comments made participants together with the general discussions held during this meeting have made me feel confident that we have committed ourselves to working together in the endeavour to enhance the delivery of quality education services at all levels hence attain improved performance.

Honourable Chairperson

Since we are all committed to implement the Joint Assistance Strategy for Tanzania (JAST) and agreed to both sector and macro level dialogues, let me assure you that your

contributions at this session will be taken into account in fine-tuning of the Joint Education Sector, 2012 Aide Memoire. Your constructive comments will be paramount inputs into preparation of plan of action based on the Aide Memoire.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

In the Aide memoire 2012, there are status of implementation for 2011/12 milestones, 2012/13 milestones and broad areas for developing milestones for 2013/14. We have been informed that, for the year 2011/12, a total of 13 milestones which included 57 specific actions were developed and it was noted that most of the specific actions in the 2011/12 milestones were not achieved due to various reasons.

The JESR 2012 approved eight milestones for 2012/13 which were developed in 2011/12. Some of those milestones are currently being implemented, hoping that all milestones will be fully implemented by 30th June, 2013.

This year in the technical session, the education stakeholders agreed to propose broad areas for further deliberation at the education sector dialogue process in order to come up with milestones that will be implemented in 2013/14. The broad areas which have been approved by the High Level Meeting and that will be used to develop new milestones are:

1. **Quality:** Strengthening the teaching and learning environment at all levels;
2. **Human Resource:** Improve equitable distribution and retention of qualified human resource within the education sector;
3. **Financing:** Expanding base for financing the education sector; and
4. **Governance:** Improve accountability and effective management for service delivery.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Having said that, may I suggest the following:

- (i) Milestones for 2011/12 which were crucial but underfunded or not budgeted hence not implemented in that specific year should either be reprioritized and incorporated in sub-sectors' MTEFs for 2013/14 or look for alternative source of

funding. In this case, we request the Development Partners and other stakeholders to join hands with the Government in order to implement them;

- (ii) All 2012/13 milestones and specific actions should be implemented and completed by 30th June, 2013;
- (iii) The milestones and specific actions that are urgent in FY 2012/13 but they do not appear in the existing MTEFs such as the implementation of 3Rs for primary schools, an alternative source of funding should be sought, in order to be implemented;
- (iv) In case of any backlog in 2012/13, the milestones and specific actions should be carried forward into FY 2013/14;
- (v) Ensure that, few 2013/14 milestones and specific actions are identified based on the broad agreed areas and should be incorporated within the Government priorities; and
- (vi) In the course of identifying the 2013/14 milestones and specific actions within the broad identified areas, only those which are not implemented as routine activities should be identified.
- (vii) Few 2013/14 milestones and specific actions should be identified and incorporated in the FY 2013/14 MTEF for implementation within the specified financial year.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

It is my expectation that, if these measures are adopted and implemented by the education sector, issues of backlog, piled milestones and underfunded or not budgeted activities will be tackled. This means for each financial year you will be having few implementable milestones and specific actions based on Government priorities. .

Ladies and Gentlemen,

The Government through the Ministry of Finance considers education as a top priority in the allocation of resources. This is because education is a key element for both social and economic development and is critical in attaining national development agenda as spelt out in the MKUKUTA and Tanzania Vision 2025 and MKUKUTA II. The Ministry of Finance is

ready to provide expertise on modalities to access additional funding from Global Partnership for Education and Cash on Delivery.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Let me take this opportunity to recognize the technical and financial support from the Development Partners, Civil Society Organisations and Faith Based Organisations for their contribution which have led to the success of the education sector. Since the education sector needs more financial and technical support, we therefore urge all education stakeholders to continue mobilizing of required resources so as to ensure the provision of quality education in Tanzania.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

With those few remarks, I now take this opportunity to declare the Joint Education Sector Review, 2012 High Level Meeting is officially closed.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION