The Technical Cooperation Group

Second meeting Summary

Montreal, Canada
4 November, 2016

**Draft Summary Record: Second Meeting of the
Technical Cooperation Group on the Indicators for SDG4-Education 2030 (TCG)**

Introduction

The second meeting of the Technical Cooperation Group on the Indicators for SDG4-Education 2030 (TCG) took place on 26-28 October 2016, at the Consejo Escolar del Estado (the State School Council) in Madrid, Spain. There were 74 experts and representatives from a wide range of countries, civil society organizations and multilateral organizations participating in the meeting (Annex 1).

The objectives of the meeting were to advance the development of indicators for monitoring SDG 4 by (a) discussing and agreeing the list of thematic indicators (including necessary placeholders) to be recommended by the TCG for reporting in 2017 and for adoption by the Education 2030 SC; (b) updating participants on the implementation process regarding the SDG global indicators led by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on SDG Indicators (IAEG-SDGs); (c) clarifying the data governance structure for SDG 4; (d) identifying the steps needed to operationalize the thematic indicators and establish working groups for this purpose; and (e) agreeing on the terms of reference and the main elements of the TCG's work plan in 2016-2017.

Results

The TCG Secretariat (UIS):

- THANKED the host of the Ministry of Education, Culture and Sports of Spain, the National Institute for Educational Evaluation in Spain, and the Organization of Ibero-American States for Education, Science and Culture.

- WELCOMED the participation and inputs from the TCG Members, Observers, UNESCO, CCNGO, Educational International, GPE, OECD, UNICEF, and the World Bank Group in the second TCG meeting.

The Technical Cooperation Group:

- ADOPTED the draft agenda.

- APPRECIATED the update from the Co-Chair of the Education 2030 Steering Committee, Mr. Dankert Vedeler, on the Committee´s work, its objectives, main lines of action and NOTED that the set of thematic indicators base for reporting in 2017 will be endorsed at the next meeting of the Committee to be held on 8-9 December 2016.

  WELCOMED the update from the Co-Chair of the Education 2030 Steering Committee on the discussion about a lead indicator and the update of the Secretariat on the technical activities carried forward to inform the Education 2030 SC in meeting of December.

- NOTED the latest developments in the implementation of the SDG global indicators led by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on SDG Indicators (IAEG-SDGs).

- NOTED the Data Governance Structure for SDG 4.

- NOTED the technical implementation process for learning outcome indicators (associated with Targets 4.1, 4.2, 4.4, 4.6, and 4.7) and the results of the second meeting of the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning.

- WELCOMED the update on interlinkages between SDG 4 education indicators and other SDG Goals and Targets.

- NOTED the conclusions and recommendations of the UIS and OECD based on their assessments on countries' data availability to monitor the progress on SDG 4.

- NOTED the national initiatives on the implementation of monitoring SDG 4 in Jamaica, Saudi Arabia and Spain.

- DISCUSSED the results of the Open Consultation of TCG Thematic Education Indicators and the Open Consultation of the TCG on Placeholder Indicators.

- Discussed and AGREED on the list of 29 thematic education indicators to be reported in 2017 (see Table 1) which will be presented for endorsement by the Education 2030 Steering Committee, noting the need for further review and development of the remaining 14 thematic indicators (Table 1) included in the annex of the Education 2030 Framework for Action.

- DISCUSSED and AGREED on the need to explore the relevance and feasibility of new additional indicators and data sources to better inform some of the targets (Table 1).

- DISCUSSED the criteria to use placeholders at both the global and thematic levels. The use of placeholders for selected indicators will be DECIDED through a further TCG consultation to be launched shortly after the meeting.

- NOTED the request made by the representative from France to have a list of the different products which are being produced related to indicators and monitoring of SDG4-Education 2030 and COMMITED to provide that list to the TCG members and observers.

- DISCUSSED the TCG's terms of reference and the main elements of the TCG's work plan in 2016-2017. Members and observers will provide feedback on the draft TCG's terms of reference which will be circulated by the UIS shortly after the meeting.

- DISCUSSED the steps needed to operationalise the thematic indicators and AGREED on the creation of 3 TCG Working Groups for the purposes of improving the methodological work of the SDG 4 indicators, identifying capacity building needs and producing recommendations to improve SDG 4 country reporting mechanisms. Members and observers will provide feedback on the draft terms of reference of the Working Groups which will be circulated by the UIS after the meeting.

- DISCUSSED the development work which is being carried out by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning (GAML) in relation to indicators on learning outcomes and skills and INVITED countries to join GAML. This initiative would be the fourth area of work (in addition to the three working groups) where TCG members and observers can directly contribute to the development work on indicators which is in progress.

- DISCUSSED and NOTED that the IAEG is considering additional global indicators for some SDG targets, including 4.1. The UIS was asked for advice. The TCG will be consulted on this matter shortly after the meeting and seek reaching a common position that can be communicated to the IAEG and the Education 2030 Steering Committee.

- DISCUSSED the importance of having at the global level an indicator that reflects learning outcomes and also another one that indicates children in/out of school at the end of primary and lower secondary, and therefore AGREED on submitting the concern to the IAEG-SDGs meeting in Geneva in November 17-18 clarifying the position of the group in that regard.

Summary of individual sessions

Session 1: Opening session

Ms Silvia Montoya (UNESCO Institute for Statistics, Director), Mr Jorge Sáinz González (Spain, Secretary-General of Universities in the Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport) and Mr Abicalil (Organization of Ibero-American States for Education, Science and Culture, Director-General of Education and Cultural Programmes) welcomed the participants to meeting. Ms Montoya presented the objectives of the meeting and proposed the meeting agenda. Each meeting participant introduced him/herself.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- ADOPTED the meeting agenda.

Session 2: The SDG global monitoring framework

Ms Silvia Montoya updated the meeting participants on the status of the implementation of the SDG 4 Global and Thematic Indicator Frameworks. She highlighted the first SDG Digest published by the UIS in August 2016 which set out the key challenges for SDG 4 data collection as well as the role of countries in the 2030 agenda.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- DISCUSSED the current state of SDG 4 implementation.

Session 3: The SDG Education 2030 Steering Committee

Mr Dankert Vedeler (the co-chair of SDG Education 2030 Steering Committee) updated the TCG on the Committee's work, its objectives, and main lines of action. Mr Vedeler also addressed the process of shaping the monitoring framework.

The global indicators will be further discussed and decided by the IAEG-SDGs which will next meet in November in Geneva. Mr Vedeler recommended that the inputs and results of the TCG should be conveyed to the IAEG meeting. Regarding Target 4.5 on equity, disaggregated data (e.g. by wealth, location, disability) need to be collected in a sensible way. The SDG agenda should lead to accountability of the state government, civil society, international organizations, and others. Finally, he mentioned the cost implications of data collection which need to be balanced with the need for data.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- NOTED the SDG 4- Education 2030 Steering Committee's work, its objectives, and the Co-Chair's reflections on the process of shaping the monitoring framework.

Session 4: UIS SDG 4 related data initiatives

Chaired by Mr Alexander Leicht (UNESCO, Chief of Section of Education for Sustainable Development), this session started with a presentation by Mr Said Ould Voffal (UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS), Programme Specialist in Education Indicators and Data Analysis Section) with an update on the development of the metadata for the SDG 4 global and thematic indicators, the UIS' data production and harmonization processes, their issues and challenges, and the UIS' strategies. Then, Mr Juan Cruz Perusia (UIS, Regional Advisor, Latin America and the Caribbean) presented the UIS' SDG 4-related data initiatives, including the Sustainable Development Data Digest, data repository for SDG4-E2030 indicators (e.g., the eAtlas for Education 2030), and webinars and blogs on data development.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- NOTED the UIS' latest SDG 4 related data initiatives.

Sessions 5-8: Progress towards defining the set of thematic indicators for 2017

Chaired by Mr. Dankert Vedeler, this session was organized into three parts, which started with a presentation by Ms Alison Kennedy (UNESCO Institute for Statistics, Programme Specialist in Education Indicators and Data Analysis Section) on the results of the Open Consultation on the Thematic Education Indicators (launched on August 23).

Indicators for Targets 4.1, 4.6 and 4.c were well supported by the 58 respondents to the survey, including 28 TCG-affiliated (Members, Observers, and organizations) and 30 others (countries, civil society, academia and non-TCG affiliated organizations). By contrast, indicators for Targets 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 4.5, 4.7, 4.a and 4.b required further consideration either because as a group they did not represent well the ambitions of the targets; or individually, they require further conceptualization and/or methodological development. For each target, the main concerns raised by the respondents, proposed changes, and areas for future development were presented. More details for each target can be found in Ms Kennedy's presentation slides.

Following Ms Kennedy's presentation, four groups were formed and elected their respective chairpersons and rapporteurs.

Each grouped was assisted by a facilitator from the original Technical Advisory Group on post-2015 education indicators (TAG) which developed the proposal for the thematic indicator framework.

Report from Group 1 on Targets 4.1, 4.2 and 4.6
- The indicators that have broad agreement for monitoring in 2017 are 4.1.1, 4.1.2, 4.1.3, 4.1.4, 4.1.5, 4.1.6, 4.1.7, 4.2.1, 4.2.2, 4.2.4, 4.2.5, 4.6.1, and 4.6.2.
- The indicators that the Group suggested should not be used for monitoring in 2017 include 4.2.3 and 4.6.3.
- The indicators that need further conceptual or methodological development include 4.1.1, 4.2.1, 4.2.3, 4.6.1 and 4.6.3.
- Additional areas suggested by the Group for further development include the hidden costs of education (eg school uniforms, meals and transport).

Report from Group 2 on Targets 4.3, 4.4 and 4.7
- The indicators that received broad agreement for monitoring in 2017 include 4.3.1, 4.3.2, 4.3.3, 4.4.1, 4.4.3, and 4.7.1.
- The indicators that the Group suggested should not be used for monitoring in 2017 include 4.4.2, 4.7.2, 4.7.3, 4.7.4, and 4.7.5.
- The indicators that need further conceptual or methodological development include 4.3.1, 4.4.1, 4.4.2, 4.4.3, 4.7.1, 4.7.2, 4.7.3, 4.7.4, and 4.7.5
- Additional areas suggested by the Group for exploration and development include (a) the measures of affordability and quality for Target 4.3; (b) employment-related indicators and measures of a broader range of work-related skills than ICTs for Target 4.4; (c) attitudes and values, lifelong learning, non-formal education, and qualitative indicators for Target 4.7.

Report from Group 3 on Targets 4.5 and 4.b
- The indicators that received broad agreement for monitoring in 2017 include 4.5.1, 4.5.4, 4.5.5, 4.b.1.
- The indicators that the Group suggested should not be used for monitoring in 2017 include 4.5.2, 4.5.3, and 4.b.2.
- The indicators that need further conceptual or methodological development include 4.5.2, 4.5.3, and 4.b.2.
- Additional areas suggested by the Group for exploration and development include the measurement of support for marginalized students for Target 4.b.
- It was also suggested that the disaggregation of 4.5.1 by migratory status should be explored.

Report from Group 4 on Targets 4.a and 4.c
- The indicators that received broad agreement for monitoring in 2017 include 4.a.1, 4.c.1, 4.c.2, 4.c.3, 4.c.4, and 4.c.6.
- The indicators that the Group suggested should not be used for monitoring in 2017 include 4.a.2, 4.a.3, 4.c.5, and 4.c.7.
- The indicators that need further conceptual or methodological development include 4.a.1 (d), 4.a.2, 4.a.3, 4.c.5, and 4.c.7.
- Additional areas suggested by the Group for exploration and development include expenditure and national quality standards for Target 4.a.

Following the reports from each group the TCG discussed and finalized the list of indicators for reporting in 2017 and those indicators and areas requiring further development. Twenty-nine indicators,

including the 11 global indicators, were selected for reporting in 2017. The results from the break-out and plenary discussions are summarized in Table 1.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- NOTED the results of the TCG Open Consultation on the Thematic Education Indicators.
- PARTICIPATED in small group discussions and REPORTED the summary of the group discussion.
- DISCUSSED the indicators by target, ENDORSED the indicators to be used for monitoring and reporting in 2017 and AGREED on the indicators and additional areas that need further development.
- SUGGESTED the periodicity of each indicator and the levels of disaggregation should be included in the metadata and definitions of each indicator.
- RECOMMENDED that the work on indicators requiring further development should be completed before 2019 so that the report to the High Level Political Forum on progress towards SDG 4 could cover all indicators.

Session 9: Indicators for SDG4 targets focused on learning outcomes

Ms Silvia Montoya updated the meeting participants on the focus, status and progress of the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning (GAML), a UIS initiative to address the learning outcome agenda.

The demand for globally-comparable data on learning necessitates new ways of working with countries, regional bodies and global organizations to produce the required data for monitoring. With many measures already in use, substantial progress has been made in defining and measuring learning in similar ways in many parts of the world. The task now is to build on the work done to date to develop globally-comparable approaches for data collection and analyses.

For each education target, the issues and options for measurement are slightly different, with a set of working principles that apply to all targets. The UIS has identified two areas of work: helping countries to ensure data quality and harmonizing different methods and metrics.

With respect to the quality of data, UIS has two initiatives. The first is the Catalogue of Learning Assessment, which maps the availability of assessments and their characteristics by country. The second is the Data Quality Assessment Framework that includes three modules.

Ms Montoya described three technical issues that should be addressed to report data for SDG4:
   1) Comparability: What are the issues that arise in assessing comparability?
   2) Defining the minimum proficiency level: What is the present state of thinking on how best to define 'minimum proficiency 'or basic competencies?
   3) Periodicity: What is the consensus on how frequently data should be collected, especially in light of how quickly it is anticipated that changes in learning outcomes can be identified?

- Participants WERE INVITED to join the task forces of the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning.

Session 10: Interlinkages between Indicators

Mr Jordan Naidoo (UNESCO, Director of Division for Education 2030 Support and Coordination) presented the interlinkages between indicators across SDG Goals and Targets with a focus on education (Goal 4) and other SDGs, such as Target 3.7 (health and well-being), Target 8.6 (decent work and economic growth), Target 12.8 (responsible consumption & production), and Target 13.3 (climate action).

The TCG Meeting participants:

- NOTED the links between the indicators under education (Goal 4) and those under other SDGs.

Session 11: Assessing countries' readiness to monitor the progress on SDG 4 - a regional perspective

Chaired by Mr Husein Abdul-Hamid (World Bank, Senior Education Specialist and Edstats Coordinator), this session started with a presentation made Ms Corinne Heckmann on OECD & the Education SDG architecture and associated projects contributed by the INES Programme (an authoritative source for accurate and relevant information on education for OECD's 35 member and partner countries). Additionally, she presented the results of OECD's mapping of SDG 4 Global and Thematic Indicators and relevant data sources.

Similarly, Mr Juan Cruz Perusia presented the results of the UIS' survey on assessing the readiness (or data availability) of countries in the Arab States, Asia and the Pacific, Latin America and the Caribbean, and sub-Saharan Africa to produce the indicators for SDG4-Education 2030. He further discussed the challenges for specific data sources.

Comments from the participants: (a) the importance of setting standards and definitions in collecting cross-national data; (b) the need to have coordination mechanism between entities within countries in order to integrate pieces of information; (c) a suggestion to use reports produced by NGO, in addition to administrative data.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- NOTED UIS' and OECD's recent assessments on countries' data availability for monitoring SDG4.

Session 12: Progress towards defining placeholder indicators for reporting in 2017

Chaired by Mr Jordan Naidoo, in this session Ms Alison Kennedy presented the results of the TCG Open Consultation on Placeholders (launched by the UIS on September 26) with 34 respondents.

Questions and comments from the participants: (a) some concern about using placeholders that have low relevance to the SDG 4 Targets; (b) for 4.6.1, a suggestion to use proxy data/indicators (e.g. education attainment of lower secondary education) than the proposed placeholder indicator (assessment of functional literacy and numeracy skills) in order to have a higher country coverage; (c)

request for clarification on the uses and purposes of global, thematic and national monitoring and the distinctions between them; (d) a suggestion to reduce the use of placeholders and instead, to prioritise the development of the original indicators.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- PROPOSED another TCG consultation on the placeholders to clarify their purpose and decide in which cases they should be used.
- REQUESTED the Secretariat to compile a list of the different products related to indicators and the monitoring of SDG 4 – Education 2030 which are available.

Session 13: Implementation of SDG 4 monitoring frameworks in countries

Chaired by Mr Hiroyuki Hattori (UNICEF, Statistics Specialist – Education), this session included three panelists presenting the implementation of monitoring SDG 4 in their countries.

Dr Mansour Alosaimi (Permanent Delegation of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia to UNESCO) addressed his government's implementation and initiatives for monitoring SDGs. Ms Philippa Livingston (Jamaica, Director of Policy, Analysis, Research & Statistics) presented Jamaica's implementation strategy for the SDGs. Mr Vicente Alcañiz (Spain, Director of National Institute of Educational Assessment) presented the national/international learning assessments and evaluation in Spain, and Spain's participation in data collection projects conducted by OECD and EU.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- NOTED the implementation of SDG 4 monitoring frameworks in Saudi Arabia, Jamaica and Spain.

Session 14: Indicator development in Finance

Mr Saïd Ould Voffal provided an overview on SDG education finance indicators and presented the key issues regarding the coverage of finance in the UIS data collection. Mr Ould Voffal presented the UIS strategy to improve the coverage of expenditure data and which will combine the two following approaches:

- Simplifying the questionnaires to collect only essential data for countries with the least statistical capacity
- Exploring the possibility of using existing external data sources to fill in data gaps and get the collected data reviewed and validated by national statisticians before their publication

Mr Ould Voffal presented preliminary results of ongoing UIS study on the feasibility of expanding the coverage of current UIS statistics on household expenditure on education by using existing household surveys databases. This work is done in collaboration with The World Bank and the International Household Surveys Network (IHSN) and is expected to significantly improve the coverage of household educational expenditure data in the UIS Data Centre by May 2017.

There was finally a discussion about whether indicators like 4.5.4 on expenditure per student should be based on initial or final financing. As a result of the discussions it was agreed that initial financing would be more appropriate in this case as the indicator is an equity measure of who is financing education.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- NOTED the issues about collecting education finance data from countries and the UIS' strategies of addressing these challenges and the changes of the methodology of calculating some indicators using initial financing.

Session 15: Setting up Working Groups

Ms Alison Kennedy and Ms Silvia Montoya presented the TCG's terms of reference, including the TCG membership, governance, operation, decision process, and the creation of four working groups. The working groups are designated to support the implementation of the TCG work plan and work on the four areas including indicator development (Working Group 1, or WG1), statistical capacity-building (WG2), country reporting (WG3), and learning outcomes (WG4). All TCG participants are encouraged to join the working groups. It is expected each group will have 6-8 members and will be chaired by a TCG Member. Ideally, the composition of each group should have a good regional representation.

After the TCG meeting, the UIS will send out the working groups' terms of reference and an invitation to participants to express interest in taking part in one or more groups.

Questions and comments from the meeting participants: There should be communication mechanism across the four working groups as their tasks are correlated. This will be provided by the UIS in its role as secretariat. The division of tasks between the Working Group on Indicator Development and the Working Group on Learning Outcomes should be clear. Generally, WG4 will work on learning outcome related indicators. The remaining indicators will fall under WG1.

In the last session of the meeting, a proposal was made to agree on a joint statement from the TCG to the IAEG-SDGs and the Education 2030 Steering Committee. The proposal was in two parts:

(i) to recommend dropping "grades 2/3" from the global indicator 4.1.1 because of practical reasons (i.e. the lack of data in most of the countries); and
(ii) to support the selection of an additional global indicator for Target 4.1.

The TCG was divided on the first part of the proposal. The UIS Director noted there were several other indicators where data coverage was relatively low but that the TCG had agreed on their further development. None of the indicators had been dropped. Additionally, UIS's mapping exercise of national learning assessment systems revealed that more than 40 countries are currently assessing children's learning at early grades. The TCG therefore decided not to accept that part of the proposal or to make any other changes to the existing global indicators.

On the second part of the proposal there appeared to be broad agreement on recommending the selection of an additional global indicator. It was AGREED that the Secretariat would write to Members following the meeting to propose such a statement and to seek their agreement.

The TCG Meeting participants:

- NOTED TCG's terms of reference and immediate work plan, which include the plan of setting up Working Groups.
- WERE INVITED to join the Working Groups in the areas of indicator development, country statistical capacity-building, data reporting, and learning outcomes. The invitations will be formally sent together with the draft ToR for the Working Groups.

Table 1. Summary of the indicators agreed by the TCG for monitoring in 2017 and the indicators that need further development

In the table, dark grey shading indicates global indicators, whereas **red font** indicates modifications to original list of 43 thematic indicators

Primary and secondary education	Target 4.1 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Learning	4.1.1	Proportion of children and young people (a) in Grade 2 or 3; (b) at the end of primary education; and (c) at the end of lower secondary education achieving at least a minimum proficiency level in (i) reading and (ii) mathematics, by sex	YES	YES
	4.1.2	Administration of a nationally-representative learning assessment (a) in Grade 2 or 3; (b) at the end of primary education; and (c) at the end of lower secondary education	YES	
Completion	4.1.3	Gross intake ratio to the last grade (primary education, lower secondary education)	YES	
	4.1.4	Completion rate (primary education, lower secondary education, upper secondary education)	YES	
Participation	4.1.5	Out-of-school rate (primary education, lower secondary education, upper secondary education)	YES	
	4.1.6	Percentage of children over-age for grade (primary education, lower secondary education)	YES	
Provision	4.1.7	Number of years of (a) free and (b) compulsory primary and secondary education guaranteed in legal frameworks	YES	
Early Childhood	Target 4.2 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Readiness for primary school	4.2.1	Proportion of children under 5 years of age who are developmentally on track in health, learning and psychosocial well-being, by sex	YES	YES
Participation	4.2.2	Participation rate in organized learning (one year before the official primary entry age), by sex	YES	
Readiness for primary school	4.2.3	Percentage of children under 5 years experiencing positive and stimulating home learning environments	NO	YES
Participation	4.2.4	Gross **early childhood education enrolment ratio in (a) pre-primary education and (b) and early childhood educational development**	YES	
Provision	4.2.5	Number of years of (a) free and (b) compulsory pre-primary education guaranteed in legal frameworks	YES	

TVET and Higher Education	Target 4.3 By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Participation	4.3.1	Participation rate of youth and adults in formal and non-formal education and training in the previous 12 months, by sex	YES	YES
	4.3.2	Gross enrolment ratio for tertiary education **by sex**	YES	
	4.3.3	Participation rate in technical-vocational programmes (15- to 24-year-olds) **by sex**	YES	
	Additional areas for development	**Affordability, quality**	not applicable	YES
Skills for work	Target 4.4 By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Skills	4.4.1	Proportion of youth and adults with information and communications technology (ICT) skills, by type of skill	YES	YES
	4.4.2	Percentage of youth/adults who have achieved at least a minimum level of proficiency in digital literacy skills	NO	YES
	4.4.3	Youth/adult educational attainment rates by age group, economic activity status, levels of education and programme orientation	YES	YES to simplify
	Additional areas for development	**Measures of a broader range of work-related skills than ICTs, other employment-related indicators**	not applicable	YES

Equity	Target 4.5 By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Policy	4.5.1	Parity indices (female/male, rural/urban, bottom/top wealth quintile and others such as disability status, indigenous peoples and conflict-affected, as data become available) for all education indicators on this list that can be disaggregated	YES	
	4.5.2	Percentage of students in primary education whose first or home language is the language of instruction	NO	YES
	4.5.3	Extent to which explicit formula-based policies reallocate education resources to disadvantaged populations	NO	YES
	4.5.4	Education expenditure per student by level of education and source of funding	YES	
	4.5.5	Percentage of total aid to education allocated to ~~low income~~ **least developed** countries	YES	
Literacy and Numeracy	Target 4.6 By 2030, ensure that all youth and aa substantial proportion of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Skills	4.6.1	Percentage of population in a given age group achieving at least a fixed level of proficiency in functional (a) literacy and (b) numeracy skills, by sex	YES	YES
	4.6.2	Youth/adult literacy rate	YES	
Participation	4.6.3	Participation rate of illiterate youth/adults in literacy programmes	NO	YES

Global Citizenship	Target 4.7 By 2030, ensure all learners acquire knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including among others through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship, and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Provision	4.7.1	Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in: (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment	YES	YES
	4.7.2	Percentage of schools that provide life skills-based HIV and sexuality education	NO	YES
	4.7.3	Extent to which the framework on the World Programme on Human Rights Education is implemented nationally (as per the UNGA Resolution 59/113)	NO	YES
Knowledge	4.7.4	Percentage of students by age group (or education level) showing adequate understanding of issues relating to global citizenship and sustainability	NO	YES
	4.7.5	Percentage of 15-year-old students showing proficiency in knowledge of environmental science and geoscience	NO	YES
	Additional areas for development	**Attitudes and values, life-long learning/non-formal, qualitative indicators**	not applicable	YES

School Environment	Target 4.a Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Resources	4.a.1	Proportion of schools with access to: (a) electricity; (b) Internet for pedagogical purposes; and (c) computers for pedagogical purposes	YES	
		Proportion of schools with access to: (d) adapted infrastructure and materials for students with disabilities		YES
		Proportion of schools with access to: (e) basic drinking water; (f) single-sex basic sanitation facilities; and (g) basic handwashing facilities (as per the WASH indicator definitions)		
Environment	4.a.2	Percentage of students experiencing bullying, corporal punishment, harassment, violence, sexual discrimination and abuse	NO	YES
	4.a.3	Number of attacks on students, personnel and institutions	NO	YES
	Additional areas for development	**Expenditure, national quality standards**	not applicable	YES
Scholarships	Target 4.b By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training, information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes in developed countries and other developing countries		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Numbers	4.b.1	Volume of official development assistance flows for scholarships by sector and type of study	YES	
	4.b.2	Number of higher education scholarships awarded by beneficiary country	NO	YES
	Additional areas for development	**Support for marginalized students**	not applicable	YES

Teachers	Target 4.c By 2030, substantially increase the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing States		For monitoring in 2017	Requires further development
Trained	4.c.1	Proportion of teachers in: (a) pre-primary education; (b) primary education; (c) lower secondary education; and (d) upper secondary education who have received at least the minimum organized teacher training (e.g., pedagogical training) pre-service or in-service required for teaching at the relevant level in a given country, by sex	YES	
	4.c.2	Pupil-trained teacher ratio by education level	YES	
Qualified	4.c.3	Proportion of teachers qualified according to national standards by education level and type of institution	YES	
	4.c.4	Pupil-qualified teacher ratio by education level	YES	
Motivated	4.c.5	Average teacher salary relative to other professions requiring a comparable level of qualification	NO	YES
	4.c.6	Teacher attrition rate by education level	YES	
Supported	4.c.7	Percentage of teachers who received in-service training in the last 12 months by type of training	NO	YES

Annex 2: Meeting participants

Member countries

Armenia

1. Mr Robert Stepanyan
   Head of the Department of Development Programs and Monitoring
   Ministry of Education and Science

Botswana

2. Mr Sir Wonder Masebola
   Director, Department of Education, Planning Research and Statistics
   Ministry of Education and Skills Development

Brazil

3. Ms Juliana Marques da Silva
   Instituto Nacional de Estudos e Pesquisas Educacionais Anísio Teixeira

4. Ms Betina Fresneda
   Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística - IBGE

Cabo Verde

5. Mrs. Ana Santos
   Director of Studies, Planning and Cooperation
   Ministry of Education

6. Mr Emmanuel Borges
   Technical Lead, Statistics Matters
   Ministerio de Ensino Superior, Ciencia e Inovaçao

Cameroon

7. Mr Ambroise Owotsogo Onguene
   Directeur de la Panification, des Projets et de la Coopération
   Ministère de l'éducation nationale

Canada

8. Ms Klarka Zeman
   Senior Analyst
   Statistics Canada

9. Ms Jolie Lemmon
Analyst
Education Data and Research Division Council of Ministers of Education

Colombia
10. Ms Mara Brigitte Bravo Osorio
Coordinadora de la Dirección General del DANE
Departamento Administrativo Nacional de Estadística

Cuba
11. Mr Miguel Angel Ferrer Lopez
Director of Organization, Planning and Information
Ministerio de Educación

France
12. Mr Robert Rakocevic
Direction de l'évaluation, de la prospective et de la performance
Ministère de l'Education nationale, de l'enseignement supérieur et de la recherche

Germany
13. Ms Bettina Link
Ministry for Education, Youth and Sports of Brandenburg

India
14. Ms Swapna Bhattacharya
Director
Department of School Education and Literacy
Ministry of Human Resource Development

15. Professor Jandhyala B G Tilak
Vice-Chancellor (I/c)
National University of Education Planning and Administration
Ministry of Human Resource Development

Jamaica
16. Ms Philippa Livingston
Senior Statistician
Ministry of Education, Youth and Information

Mexico

17. Ms Mónica Gladis Pérez Miranda
Director de área
Instituto Nacional para la Evaluación de la Educación

18. Ms Isaura Flores Portillo
Primer Secretario
Embajada de México en España

Philippines

19. Dr Napoleon K. Juanillo, Jr
Director
Commission on Higher Education

Russian Federation

20. Mr Marc Agranovich
Head of the Center for Education Monitoring and Statistics
Federal Institute for Education Development
Ministry of Education and Science

Senegal

21. Mr Cheikh El Bouh DIAGNE
Agent de la Direction de la Planification et de la Réforme
Ministère de l'Éducation nationale

Sweden

22. Ms Lotta Larsson
Senior Advisor - Statistics Sweden
Unit for Education and Labour market statistics
Department for Population and Welfare Statistics

Uganda

23. Mr Cathbert Mulyalya
Principal Planner for Education
Ministry of Education and Sports

24. Mr Elly Kafeero Kamahungye
Minister Counsellor
Ministry of Education and Sports

United Kingdom

25. Ms Sarah Hennell
Department for International Development

United Republic of Tanzania

26. Mr Makuru S. Pedro
Assistant Director, Monitoring and Evaluation
Ministry of Education Science and Technology

Observer countries

Argentina

27. Ms Elena Duro
Secretaria de Evaluación Educativa
Ministerio de Educación y Deportes

Belgium

28. Ms Nathalie Jauniaux
Directrice de l'Académie de recherche et d'enseignement
Ministère de la Fédération Wallonie-Bruxelles

Bolivia

29. Ms. Susana Postigo
Director of Planning
Ministry of Education

30. Mr Luis Fernando Carrasco Taboada
Chief of the Team for Sectorial Research
Indicators and Educational Analysis
Ministry of Education

31. Ms Pamela Mamani
Permanent Delegation of Bolivia to UNESCO
Second Secretary
Maison de l'UNESCO

Kenya

32. Mr Michael M. Kahiti
Chief Economist, Central Planning and Project Monitoring Unit
Ministry of Education, Science and Technology

Latvia

33. Ms Anita Švarckopfa
Head of Culture, Education, Science and Health Statistics Section
Central Statistical Bureau of Latvia

Morocco

34. Mr Abdelhaq El Hayani
Directeur de la stratégie, des statistiques et de la planification
Ministère de l'éducation nationale et de la formation professionnelle

Oman

35. Mr Faris Bin Said Alfarsi
Head of Analysis and Indicators Section
Ministry of Education

Pakistan

36. Mr. Haseeb Athar, New Secretary,
Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training
Block "D" Pak. Secretariat

Republic of Korea

37. Dr. Kim, Chang Hwan
Director-General, Senior Research Fellow
Educational Survey & Statistics Research Division
Korean Educational Development Institute

38. Dr. Park, Sung Ho
Director, Research Fellow
Center for School Violence Prevention Research
Korean Educational Development Institute

39. Dr. Moon, Sung Bin
Associate Research Fellow
Center for Educational Statistics
Korean Educational Development Institute

40. Ms. Hong, Bogang
Korean National Commission for UNESCO

41. Ms Bo, Young Choi
Ministry of Education of Korea
Government Complex-Sejong, 408 Galmae-ro

Saudi Arabia

42. Dr Mansour Alosaimi
Counselor for Education
Permanent Delegation of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia to UNESCO

Spain

43. Mr. Jesús Ibañez
Sub-Director General of Statistics and Studies
Spanish Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport

44. Mr. Vicente Alcañiz
Director of National Institute of Educational Assessment
Spanish Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport

45. Mr. Miguel Ángel Álvarez
Sub-Director General Deputy of Statistics and Studies.
Spanish Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport

46. Mr. Joaquín Martín
Head of Indicators of Education Area. National Institute of Educational Assessment
Spanish Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport

47. Mr. José María Gallego
Technical Advisor of Indicators of Education Area. National Institute of Educational Assessment
Spanish Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport

48. Mr. Pedro Revilla Novella
Vocal advisor to the President of the National Statistics Institute. National Statistics Institute.
Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness

49. Mr. Raúl San Segundo Arribas
Head of Social Statistics Area. National Statistics Institute.
Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness

50. Charo Gutiérrez Felipe
SG of Promotion of Foreign Educative
Spanish Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport

51. Laura Rumed Chust
SG of Educative Foreign Promotion
Spanish Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport

Zambia

52. Mr Lancelot Mutale
Chief Planning Officer
Ministry of Education

Organizations

Collective Consultation on NGOs Coordination Group

53. Ms Rasheda Choudhury

Education International

54. Ms Antonia Wulff

55. Clara Fontdevila

GPE

56. Mr Moritz Bilagher

OECD

57. Ms Corinne Heckmann

58. Ms Marta Encinas Martin

Organization of Ibero-American States for Education, Science and Culture

59. Mr. Carlos Abicalil, Director-General of Education, Science and Culture

60. Mr. Hugo Camacho, Coordinator of Center of Higher Education

61. Mrs. Tamara Díaz, Coordinator of Institute of Evaluation

62. Mrs. Camila Diógenes, Chief of Staff

UNESCO

63. Mr Jordan Naidoo
64. Mr Alexander Leicht
65. Mr Manos Antoninis

UNESCO Institute for Statistics

66. Ms Silvia Montoya
67. Ms Alison Kennedy
68. Mr Said Ould A Voffal
69. Mr Juan Cruz Perusia
70. Ms Chiao-Ling Chien
71. Mr Alejandro Vera Mohorade

UNICEF

72. Mr Hiroyuki Hattori

World Bank

73. Mr Husein Abdul-Hamid

Education 2030 Steering Committee Co-Chair

74. Mr Dankert Vedeler
    Norwegian Ministry of Education and Research