



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization



UNESCO  
INSTITUTE  
FOR  
STATISTICS



TECHNICAL  
COOPERATION  
GROUP



# SDG indicator 4.7.1: Proposal for a Measurement Strategy

TCG6/REF/4



## CONTENTS

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>1. INTRODUCTION</b>   | <b>3</b>  |
| <b>2. GLOBAL CONTENT FRAMEWORK FOR SDG THEMATIC INDICATOR 4.7.1</b>            | <b>3</b>  |
| 2.1. Definition of GCED and ESD  | 3         |
| 2.2. Operationalization  | 4         |
| 2.3. Operationalization national policies, curriculum                          | 5         |
| <b>3. PROPOSED DEFINITION FOR SDG GLOBAL INDICATOR 4.7.1</b>                   | <b>7</b>  |
| 3.1. The SDG 4.7.1 indicator dashboard   | 8         |
| <b>4. MAPPING EXISTING TOOLS FROM ILSAS INTO SDG THEMATIC INDICATORS 4.7.1</b> | <b>9</b>  |
| 4.1. Definition of scores for SDG global indicator 4.7.1                       | 12        |
| <b>5. PROPOSED STEPS FOR DATA COLLECTION</b>                                   | <b>13</b> |
| <b>6. PROPOSED QUESTIONNAIRE</b>   | <b>14</b> |
| A. Guidelines for completion   | 14        |
| B. Questionnaire   | 14        |
| <b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>  | <b>21</b> |



## 1. Introduction

---

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are the blueprint to achieve a better and more sustainable future for all. They address the most important global challenges we face, including those related to poverty, inequality, climate, environmental degradation, prosperity, and peace and justice. Within these goals, SDG 4 establishes that by 2030 we have to “Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all”. SDG 4 contains 10 specific targets. One of these targets, 4.7, refers to the knowledge and skills that are necessary for a sustainable future. Specifically, it states that by 2030, we have to “ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture’s contribution to sustainable development”.

The current global indicator for target 4.7 is: “4.7.1 Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in: (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment”.

The remainder of this document is divided into the following sections. Section 2 summarizes the global content framework based on existing mapping exercises.<sup>1</sup> Section 3 proposes a measurement framework for SDG indicator 4.7.1. Section 4 describes how data from international large-scale assessments can be mapped to indicator 4.7.1. Section 5 outlines the steps for data collection and Section 6 proposes a questionnaire.

## 2. Global content framework for SDG thematic indicator 4.7.1

---

### 2.1. Definition of GCED and ESD

The global indicator 4.7.1 measures the extent to which countries mainstream Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD); and the thematic indicators 4.7.4 and 4.7.5 refer to learning outcomes that should be achieved as a result of the educational inputs described in the global indicator. In this section, we first establish a definition of GCED and ESD that will constitute the base of a global content framework for the construction of specific indicators. GCED and ESD represent the higher order competences within Target 4.7, which outlines the knowledge, skills, attitudes and values of all learners to promote a sustainable future. Within target 4.7, these competences are associated with the values of sustainability, human rights, gender equality, peace and non-violence and appreciation of cultural diversity (Hoskins, 2016). Reaching consensus on a definition of these concepts is particularly difficult since they have distinct

---



histories within UNESCO and beyond; and because they both are considered as umbrella concepts that encompass a broad range of knowledge, skills, attitudes, values, identities and behaviours.

UNESCO has conducted extensive work directed at defining and operationalizing GCED and ESD. A review of the literature on the topic suggests the following conclusions: a) there is currently neither a clear definition nor universal agreement in defining and operationalizing these concepts; b) however, a set of guiding principles and themes within GCED and ESD can be identified.

For the purpose of the current exercise, we build on previous work conducted by UNESCO and partially adopt the definitions and operationalization advanced in recent documents (e.g. Hoskins, 2016; IBE, 2016; Sandoval-Hernández & Miranda, 2018; UIS, 2017; UNESCO, 2012a, 2012b, 2013, 2014, 2015). So, drawing on this body of literature we propose the following working definitions of GCED and ESD:

**Global Citizenship Education (GCED):** nurtures respect for all, building a sense of belonging to a common humanity and helping learners become responsible and active global citizens. GCED aims to empower learners to assume active roles to face and resolve global challenges and to become proactive contributors to a more peaceful, tolerant, and inclusive and secure world.

**Education for Sustainable Development (ESD):** empowers learners to take informed decisions and responsible actions for environmental integrity, economic viability and a just society, for present and future generations, while respecting cultural diversity. It is about lifelong learning, and is an integral part of quality education.

## 2.2. Operationalization

Our operationalization of these concepts is based on the work of a research team from the International Bureau of Education (IBE) and the Global Education Monitoring Report (GEMR) team that developed a coding scheme (IBE, 2016) to evaluate 78 national curricula for evidence of GCED and ESD content.

Table 1 presents the global content framework that will be used in this exercise. As mentioned above, it is based on the coding scheme developed by the IBE and GEMR team but has the following adaptations. This coding scheme was specially designed to measure the global indicator 4.7.1 (i.e. the extent to which countries mainstream GCED and ESD).

One adaptation was the elimination of some of the sub-categories originally included in the coding scheme. Some concepts (e.g. Human Rights or Peace) had two sub-categories each. One referring to the concept itself and another referring to the educational contents (e.g. Human Rights and Human Rights Education). These double entries were eliminated (cf. IBE, 2016 pp 38-39).

**Table 1. Global Content Framework for SDG indicators 4.7. 1, 4.7.4 and 4.7.5**

|   | Category   | Sub-category   |
|---|--|--|
| Global Citizenship Education (GCED)         | Interconnectedness and Global Citizenship  | Globalization  |
|   |  | Global/international citizen(ship), global culture/identity/community                                      |
|   |  | Global-local thinking, local-global, think global act local, glocal  |
|   |  | Multicultural(ism)/intercultural(ism)  |
|   |  | Migration, immigration, mobility, movement of people   |
|   |  | Global Competition/competitiveness/globally competitive/international competitiveness                      |
|   | Gender Equality  | Global Inequalities/disparities  |
|   |  | Gender equality / equality / parity  |
|   | Peace, Non-violence and Human Security   | Empower(ment of) women/girls (female empowerment, encouraging female participation)                        |
|   |  | Peace, peace-building  |
| Human Rights                                | Awareness of forms of abuse/harassment/violence (school-based violence/bullying, household-based violence, gender-based violence, child abuse/harassment, sexual abuse/harassment) |  |
|   | Human rights, rights and responsibilities (children's rights, cultural rights, indigenous rights, women's rights, disability rights)   |  |
| Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) | Health and Well-being  | Freedom (of expression, of speech, of press, of association/organisation), civil liberties                 |
|   |  | Social justice   |
|   |  | Democracy/democratic rule, democratic values/principles  |
|   |  | Physical health/activity/fitness   |
|   | Sustainable Development  | Mental, emotional health, psychological health   |
|   |  | Healthy lifestyle (nutrition, diet, cleanliness, hygiene, sanitation, *clean water, being/staying healthy) |
|   |  | Awareness of addictions (smoking, drugs, alcohol)  |
|   |  | Sexual and/or reproductive health  |
|   |  | Economic sustainability, sustainable growth, sustainable production/consumption, green economy             |
|   |  | Social sustainability, (social cohesion re sustainability)   |
|   | Environmental Science (geoscience)   | Environmental sustainability/environmentally sustainable   |
|   |  | Climate change (global warming, carbon emissions/footprint)  |
|   |  | Renewable energy, alternative energy (sources) (solar, tidal, wind, wave, geothermal, biomass...)          |
| Environmental Science (geoscience)          | Ecology, ecological sustainability (ecosystems, biodiversity, biosphere, ecology, loss of diversity)   |  |
|   | Waste management, recycling  |  |
|   | Physical systems   |  |
| Environmental Science (geoscience)          | Living systems   |  |
|   | Earth and space systems  |  |

### 2.3. Operationalization national policies, curriculum

In order to make it possible to build global indicator 4.7.1, it was necessary to define not only GCED and ESD but also what is going to be understood by national education policies, curricula, teacher education and student assessment. The definitions and their operationalization were guided by UNESCO's recommendations (UNESCO, 2012a, 2012b, 2013, 2014, 2015) and supplemented by the glossary of curriculum terminology (IBE, 2013) and the UIS Glossary<sup>2</sup>. Table 2 contains the resulting definitions.

<sup>2</sup> Available from: <http://uis.unesco.org/en/glossary>



**Table 2. Definition and operationalization of national education policies, curricula, teacher education and student assessments**

| Definition   | Operationalization  |
|--|---|
| <b>Education policies</b>  |   |
| Formal decisions made by government or education authorities that have a direct or significant effect on the curriculum, its development and implementation. These decisions are normally recorded in a range of official documents. | The mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in legal frameworks (e.g., the constitution, domestic legislation, specific laws or regulations, etc.) at national and sub-national levels at each level of education (e.g. pre-primary, primary, secondary, tertiary, non-formal education). |
| <b>Curriculum</b>  |   |
| Design, planning and sequencing of teaching and learning processes. It includes a statement of purpose, contents, activities and learning practices, as well as the modalities for assessing learners' achievements.                 | The mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in curricula at each level of education including: coverage of the topics in mandatory subjects and extracurricular activities; time for learning (e.g. number of teaching hours for these topics); and teaching and resource material.       |
| <b>Teacher education</b>   |   |
| Formal teacher training (pre-service or in-service) designed to equip teachers with the knowledge, attitude, behavior and skills required for teaching at the relevant level.  | The mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in initial and continuing professional development of teachers at each level of education.  |
| <b>Student Assessment</b>  |   |
| The process through which the progress and achievements of a learner or learners is measured or judged in compliance with specific quality criteria.   | The mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in student assessments and examinations addressing student knowledge and skills, values, attitudes and behaviors, at each level of education.   |

### 2.3.1. What curriculum?

Regarding the concept of “curriculum” we make two observations:

- Curriculum definitions vary (see IBE, 2013). In a broad sense, the term curriculum may include all the other aspects mentioned above (i.e. policy, teacher education, student assessment). In the current (more limited) operationalization, curriculum refers mainly to learning objectives/competencies, content/topics covered, planned learning experiences/methods and time for learning.
- A potentially relevant distinction that could become informative for the current framework and exercise is that between intended curriculum, implemented curriculum and attained curriculum.

*Intended curriculum.* A set of formal documents which specify what the relevant national education authorities and society expect that students will learn at school in terms of knowledge, understanding, skills, values, and attitudes to be acquired and developed, and how the outcomes of the teaching and learning process will be assessed. It is usually embodied in the curriculum



framework(s) and guides, syllabi, textbooks, teacher's guides, the content of tests and examinations, regulations, policies and other official documents.

*Implemented curriculum.* The actual teaching and learning activities taking place in schools through interaction between learners and teachers as well as among learners, e.g. how the intended curriculum is translated into practice and actually delivered.

*Attained curriculum.* The curriculum which indicates the knowledge, understanding, skills and attitudes that learners actually acquire as a result of teaching and learning, assessed through different means and/or demonstrated in practice. In the current UNESCO frameworks and measurement, SDG indicator 4.7.1 is particularly focused on *intended* curriculum.

### 3. **Proposed definition for SDG global indicator 4.7.1**

---

The core of Indicator 4.7.1 is measuring the extent to which GCED and ESD are mainstreamed in (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education, and (d) student assessment. As such, this global indicator does not require the definition of a minimal level of mainstreaming. In this case, the optimal level would be the systematic inclusion of GCED and ESD in all the areas described in the indicator.

Therefore, what we propose here is to measure the prevalence of GCED and ESD in national education policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment, based on a series of dichotomous items and based on the ICCS 2016 questionnaire adapted to the needs of global indicator 4.7.1 as described in Section 6.

The curriculum is the main driver of teacher's training and assessment and it is the body and practices that define the operationalization of the high-level aggregates. As mentioned before, the term curriculum may include all the other aspects mentioned above (i.e. policy, teacher education, student assessment).

It is reasonable to think that the main challenges will be to measure curriculum and the curriculum will be the main tool that will express in depth the adoption of different sub-constructs. So for national policies, teachers and assessment the expected reference should be more general level and will be reflected in one score that reports whether GCED and ESD are present in the four areas considered by the indicator (maximum score of 4). A second score would report the presence/absence of each of the categories of GCED and ESD in the curricula (maximum score of 5). As important point to note is that there is no reference to the need for students to have a minimum level of competences in global citizenship.

**Table 3. Approach for each level of education**

|   | Policies | Curricula                | Teacher Education | Assess. | <b>Indicator 1</b>         |
|---|----------|--------------------------|-------------------|---------|----------------------------|
| General reference                         | X        | X                        | X                 | X       | <b>Score 1 from 0 to 4</b> |
| Interconnectedness and Global Citizenship |          | X                        |                   |         |                            |
| Gender Equality                           |          | X                        |                   |         |                            |
| Peace, Non-violence and Human Security    |          | X                        |                   |         |                            |
| Human Rights                              |          | X                        |                   |         |                            |
| Health and Well-being                     |          | X                        |                   |         |                            |
| Sustainable Development                   |          | X                        |                   |         |                            |
| <b>Indicator 2</b>                        |          | <b>Score from 0 to 6</b> |                   |         |                            |

### 3.1. The SDG 4.7.1 indicator dashboard

With the data available in the ICCS NCS, it is possible to compute two scores. One score at the general level that reports whether GCED and ESD are present in the four areas considered by the indicator (maximum score of 4). The second score would report the presence/absence of each of the categories of GCED and ESD in the curricula (maximum score of 6).

Based on the questionnaire in Section 6 the indicator will result from a combined measurement of the presence of each of these categories in education policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment.

- a. One indicator that measures how general concepts are embedded in the curriculum and that could go from 0 to 4**

|           | NEP | C | TE | SA |  |
|-----------|-----|---|----|----|--|
| Primary   |     |   |    |    | Indicator <b>could range from 0 to 4</b> |
| Secondary |     |   |    |    |  |

- b. A second that measures the extent to which all relevant categories appear in the curriculum**

|   | Primary                        | Secondary |
|---|--------------------------------|-----------|
| Interconnectedness and Global Citizenship |                                |           |
| Gender Equality                           |                                |           |
| Peace, Non-violence and Human Security    |                                |           |
| Human Rights                              |                                |           |
| Health and Well-being                     |                                |           |
| Sustainable Development                   |                                |           |
| Indicator                                 | <b>Could range from 0 to 6</b> |           |





### c. Indicator 4.7.1 Dashboard

The indicator dashboard will look like the one below.

|           | General (from 0 to 4) |           | Curriculum (from 0 to 6) |           |
|-----------|-----------------------|-----------|--------------------------|-----------|
|           | Primary               | Secondary | Primary                  | Secondary |
| Country A |                       |           |                          |           |
| Country B |                       |           |                          |           |
| Country C |                       |           |                          |           |

The interpretation of the indicator is rather simple, especially if expressed as percentages of the theoretical maximum value. In either case the higher the value the largest the extent of implementation. In the case of assessment is intending to measure.

## 4. Mapping existing tools from ILSAs into SDG thematic indicators 4.7.1

A last exercise done is to see the possibilities of reporting using current information following analytic strategy.

First, informed by the operationalizations identified above, we consulted the latest version of the frameworks and the instruments/questionnaires applied in several international large-scale assessments (ILSAs) of student and teacher outcomes. We particularly focused on studies and instruments that could potentially provide information about the intended curriculum (e.g. by means of national context questionnaires or country encyclopaedias). These were the OECD Teaching and Learning International Survey (TALIS)<sup>3</sup>, the IEA Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS)<sup>4</sup>, the OECD Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)<sup>5</sup> and the IEA International Civic and Citizenship Study (ICCS)<sup>6</sup>. We assessed these sources of information with the following criteria in mind: the assessment framework should (at least partially) refer to the concepts relevant to SDG 4.7.1, the instruments should provide sufficient information on many of the aspects/concepts involved, and they should potentially allow long-term monitoring.

As a result of this exercise, we identified the ICCS 2016 study as the most comprehensive source of information for the global indicator SDG 4.7.1. We must, however, mention that other surveys could also be informative. For example, TALIS could provide some information about some of the aspects of GCED and ESD in teacher education.

Specifically, the ICCS 2016 study was singled out for the following reasons:

- The 2016 ICCS assessment framework explicitly considered both GCED and ESD. Most themes/aspects of GCED and ESD are considered to overlap and are conceptualized under the umbrella term “civic and citizenship education” (CCE) (Schulz, Ainley, Fraillon, Losito, &

<sup>3</sup> See: <http://www.oecd.org/education/talis/>

<sup>4</sup> See: <https://www.iea.nl/timss>

<sup>5</sup> See: <http://www.oecd.org/pisa/>

<sup>6</sup> See: <https://iccs.iea.nl/home.html>



Agrusti, 2016, pp 4-5; Schulz et al., 2018) and an effort was made to cover these topics with all the instruments;

- Various sources of information are captured by several instruments (e.g. National context survey, School questionnaire, Teacher questionnaire, Student Questionnaire);
- The focus on GCED and ESD is part of the main survey (i.e. they are not optional). They are a core part of the ICCS assessment framework, and they are highly likely to be retained in subsequent waves of the study, allowing monitoring over time;
- Some of the indicators relevant for SDG 4.7.1 are already used by IEA and other international organizations (e.g. EC/Eurydice) to inform civic and citizenship education policies.

Second, we reviewed the ICCS 2016 instruments and items that could be relevant for SDG 4.7.1 (see Köhler, Weber, Brese, Schulz, & Carstens, 2018). Table 3 provides an overview of our mapping exercise assuming an intended curriculum perspective. The first column lists the countries that participated in ICCS 2016. The other columns correspond to the GCED and ESD categories defined in our content framework (see Table 2), and the black dots indicate that the category is present in the corresponding documentation.

This overview is in line with the current focus of indicator SDG 4.7.1 on *intended* curriculum and it is based on the items included in the National Context Survey (NCS) completed by the ICCS National Research Coordinators (NRCs)<sup>7</sup>. The NCS was completed by the ICCS 2016 National Research Coordinators that had the task to review official curricular documents prior to answering the questionnaire.

A few observations can be made based on the information included in Table 3:

- The National Context Survey is a relevant instrument to measure the aspects of SDG indicator 4.7.1 on GCED and ESD. It provides information to evaluate whether GCED and ESD are present in national education policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessments.
- For the curricula, it provides information for six out of the seven categories included in our content framework (at least one sub-category for each category). Only the category of Health and Well-being is not covered.
- For the other aspects, the coverage is more limited but allows identifying whether GCED and ESD, as a general concept, are present in national education policies, teacher education, and student assessments.
- With few exceptions, the information is mainly relevant for secondary education and in particular for the ICCS target grade 8.

---

<sup>7</sup> The full instrument and the procedure followed to complete it are available in Köhler, et al. (2018).



**Table 4. Data availability for GCED and ESD in policy, curriculum, teacher education and student assessment; ICCS 2016 NCS data**

|     | Policy  | Curriculum  |  |  |                 |  | Teacher education                          |  |  | Student assessment                        |  |  |  |
|-----|---|---|--|--|-----------------|--|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|
|     |   | CCE Topics included in the curriculum at the target grade |  |  |                 |  | CCE mandatory in initial teacher education |  | In-service, cont. education or prof. development for CCE offered |   |  |  |  |
|     | GCED and SDG (CCE) included as part of formal curriculum at lower-secondary education | Human rights (Citizens' rights and responsibilities)      | Sustainable Development and Environmental Science (Environment and environmental sustainability) | Interconnectedness and Global Citizenship (Emigration and immigration) | Gender equality | Peace, Non-violence and Human Security (Conflict resolution) | Specialist teachers of GCED and ESD (CCE)  | Teachers of subjects related to GCED and ESD (CCE) | Teachers of subjects not related to GCED and ESD (CCE)           | Specialist teachers of GCED and ESD (CCE) | Teachers of subjects related to GCED and ESD (CCE) | Teachers of subjects not related to GCED and ESD (CCE) | Students expected to be formally assessed with regard to learning outcomes of GCED and ESD (CCE) |
| BFL |   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  |  | ☐  | ☐  |   | ☐  | ☐  |  |
| BGR | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐               | ☐  |  | ☐  |  |   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| CHL | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐               | ☐  |  | ☐  |  |   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| COL |   | ☐   |  |  | ☐               | ☐  |  |  |  | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| DNK | ☐   | ☐   |  |  |                 |  |  | ☐  | ☐  |   |  |  | ☐  |
| DNW | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  | ☐  |  |  | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| DOM | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  |  |  |  |   | ☐  |  | ☐  |
| EST | ☐   | ☐   |  |  |                 | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| FIN | ☐   | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A             | N/A  |  | ☐  |  |   | ☐  |  |  |
| HKG | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐               | ☐  |  |  |  | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| HRV | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐               | ☐  |  |  |  |   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| ITA | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  |  | ☐  |  | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| KOR |   | ☐   | ☐  |  |                 | ☐  |  | ☐  |  |   |  |  | ☐  |
| LTU | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  |  | ☐  |  | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  |  |
| LVA | ☐   |   |  |  |                 |  | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  |  |
| MEX | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| MLT | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               |  |  | ☐  |  |   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |
| NLD | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  |  | ☐  |  |   |  |  |  |
| NOR | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |   |  |  |  |
| PER | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐               | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |  | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐  |
| RUS | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  |                 | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |  | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐  |
| SVN | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐               | ☐  |  |  |  |   | ☐  |  | ☐  |
| SWE | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  |  | ☐  | ☐  |   | ☐  | ☐  |  |
| TWN | ☐   | ☐   | ☐  | ☐  | ☐               | ☐  | ☐  | ☐  |  | ☐   | ☐  |  | ☐  |



#### 4.1. Definition of scores for SDG global indicator 4.7.1

The computation of the score is rather simple and is based on the intersection between the data collected through the ICCS National Contexts Survey (NSC) and the content framework presented in section 1, Table 3. A summary of the categories and sub-categories covered by the NCS is in Table 4.

**Table 4. ICCS coverage of GCED and ESD categories**

|      |   | National education policy | Curricula | Teacher education | Student assessment |
|------|---|---------------------------|-----------|-------------------|--------------------|
| GCED | <b>GCED and ESD as a general concept</b>  | X                         | X         | X                 | X                  |
|      | Interconnectedness and Global Citizenship |                           | X         |                   |                    |
|      | Gender Equality                           |                           | X         |                   |                    |
|      | Peace, Non-violence and Human Security    |                           | X         |                   |                    |
|      | Human Rights                              |                           | X         |                   |                    |
| ESD  | Health and Well-being                     |                           |           |                   |                    |
|      | Sustainable Development                   |                           | X         |                   |                    |

#### SDG 4.7.1 Dashboard – Secondary education based on ICCS 2016

|                                  | General (from 0 to 4) |           | Curriculum (from 0 to 6) |           |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------|--------------------------|-----------|
|                                  | Primary               | Secondary | Primary                  | Secondary |
| Belgium (Flemish)                |                       | 0         |                          | 0         |
| Bulgaria                         |                       | 3         |                          | 1         |
| Chile                            |                       | 3         |                          | 1         |
| Colombia                         |                       | 2         |                          | 2         |
| Croatia                          |                       | 3         |                          | 1         |
| Denmark                          |                       | 3         |                          | 4         |
| Germany (North Rhine-Westphalia) |                       | 3         |                          | 0         |
| Dominican Republic               |                       | 2         |                          | 0         |
| Estonia                          |                       | 4         |                          | 3         |
| Finland                          |                       | 1         |                          | 0         |
| Hong Kong SAR                    |                       | 3         |                          | 1         |
| Italy                            |                       | 2         |                          | 0         |
| Korea, Republic of               |                       | 2         |                          | 2         |
| Latvia                           |                       | 3         |                          | 5         |
| Lithuania                        |                       | 1         |                          | 0         |
| Malta                            |                       | 3         |                          | 1         |
| Mexico                           |                       | 3         |                          | 0         |
| Netherlands                      |                       | 1         |                          | 0         |
| Norway                           |                       | 2         |                          | 0         |
| Peru                             |                       | 3         |                          | 1         |
| Russian Federation               |                       | 4         |                          | 2         |
| Slovenia                         |                       | 3         |                          | 1         |
| Sweden                           |                       | 1         |                          | 0         |
| Taiwan, China                    |                       | 3         |                          | 0         |



## 5. Proposed steps for data collection

---

1. Approval of conceptual framework
2. Finalize questionnaire
3. Adopt and adapt the ICCS instructions for
  - a. Who should fill questionnaire and
  - b. Quality control.
4. Data collection consist of the following steps:
  - a. Countries provide the main pieces of national legislation, curricula, guidelines for teacher education and student assessment relevant to GCED and ESD.
  - b. The UIS assesses these materials based on quality control guidelines to be defined and based on international assessment. A potential quality control body or TAG could be considered to that end.
5. Pilot in a few countries with an online questionnaire for primary education.
6. Prepare report of the TCG and request upgrade based on current information from ICCS.
7. Publish the data for indicator 4.7.1 as mapped in the table above with the clarification that health and well-being is not covered.
8. Progress with the mapping of other potential sources such as PISA and TALIS.



## 6. Proposed questionnaire: GCED and ESD in policy, curriculum, teacher education and student assessment

### A. Guidelines for completion

Based on ICCS experience it is necessary to designate a person from each country who is asked to consult a wider array of reference documents (particularly education policy documents) before answering the questions.

Response formats are mainly structured (“Yes” and “No” options) but NRCs had opportunities to provide open-ended responses for clarification and could participate in defining the content of the survey by providing feedback on the appropriateness, completeness and relevance of questions.

### B. Questionnaire

Question 1 - TAGS: GCED and ESD in POLICY, mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in educational policies?

**Policies are:**

\_\_\_\_\_

The mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in legal frameworks (e.g., the constitution, domestic legislation, specific laws or regulations, etc.)

**Q1a** - *Is there a definition of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development in the education policies for **primary education**?*

See Table in Appendix for information on global citizenship and education for sustainable development in the context of this survey.

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|                             | YES | NO |
|-----------------------------|-----|----|
| Primary Education (ISCED 1) |     |    |

**If you answered ‘yes’, please describe, in brief, the definition and provide references to relevant documents.**

**SPACE TO FILL** \_\_\_\_\_

**Q1b** - *Is there a definition of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development in the education policies for **secondary education**?*

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|                                     | YES | NO |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|
| Secondary Education (ISCED 2 and 3) |     |    |



If you answered 'yes', please describe, in brief, the definition and provide references to relevant documents.

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_

Question 2 - TAGS: GCED and ESD in POLICY, mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in legal frameworks (official curricula)

**Q2a** - Is there a definition of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development in the national curricula or official guidelines for school education in **primary education**?

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|                             | YES | NO |
|-----------------------------|-----|----|
| Primary Education (ISCED 1) |     |    |

If you answered 'yes', please describe, in brief, the definition and provide references to relevant documents.

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_

**Q2b** - Is there a definition of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development in the national curricula or official guidelines for school education **in secondary education (ISCED 2 and 3)**?

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|                                     | YES | NO |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|
| Secondary Education (ISCED 2 and 3) |     |    |

If you answered 'yes', please describe, in brief, the definition and provide references to relevant documents.

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_



Question 3 - TAGS: GCED and ESD in POLICY, mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in legal frameworks (official curricula/school subjects), primary education, secondary education, upper-secondary education

**Q3a** - Please describe how global citizenship education and education for sustainable development is formally implemented in **primary education (ISCED 1)**.

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|  | Yes | No |
|--|-----|----|
| Is global citizenship education and education for sustainable development included as part of the formal curriculum?   |     |    |
| Are there differences between different study programs at this education level?<br>Is there a specific curriculum subject for civic and citizenship education? |     |    |

If 'yes', please provide the original name of this subject with its translation into English and in which grades it is taught:

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_

**Q3b** - Please describe how GCED and ESD is formally implemented in secondary education (ISCED 2 and 3).

*(Please write original name of education level and its English translation below)*

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|  | Yes | No |
|--|-----|----|
| Is global citizenship education and education for sustainable development included as part of the formal curriculum?   |     |    |
| Are there differences between different study programs at this education level?<br>Is there a specific curriculum subject for civic and citizenship education? |     |    |

If 'yes', please provide the original name of this subject with its translation into English and in which grades it is taught:

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_





Question 4 - TAGS: GCED and ESD in POLICY, mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in legal frameworks (official curricula/school subjects), primary education, secondary education, upper-secondary education

**Q4a - Are the following topics included in the curriculum for primary education (ISCED 1)?**

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|  | Yes | No |
|--|-----|----|
| Human rights   |     |    |
| The global community and international organizations |     |    |
| The environment and environmental sustainability     |     |    |
| Emigration and immigration                           |     |    |
| Equal opportunities for men and women                |     |    |
| Citizens' rights and responsibilities                |     |    |
| Critical and independent thinking                    |     |    |
| Conflict resolution                                  |     |    |

**Q4b - Are the following topics included in the curriculum for secondary education (ISCED 2 and/or ISCED 3)?**

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|  | Yes | No |
|--|-----|----|
| Human rights   |     |    |
| The global community and international organizations |     |    |
| The environment and environmental sustainability     |     |    |
| Emigration and immigration                           |     |    |
| Equal opportunities for men and women                |     |    |
| Citizens' rights and responsibilities                |     |    |
| Critical and independent thinking                    |     |    |
| Conflict resolution                                  |     |    |



Questions 5 - GCED and ESD in TEACHER EDUCATION, mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in initial and continuing professional development in primary and secondary education.

**Q5a** - *Is global citizenship education and education for sustainable development covered as mandatory part of pre-service/initial teacher education for teachers in **primary education**?*

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|  | Yes | No |
|--|-----|----|
| Specialist teachers of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development  |     |    |
| Teachers of subjects related to global citizenship education and education for sustainable development (e.g. history, geography, social studies) |     |    |
| Teachers of subjects not related to global citizenship education and education for sustainable development (e.g. mathematics, science)           |     |    |

**Please provide references to relevant documents.**

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_

**Q5b** - *Is global citizenship education and education for sustainable development covered as mandatory part of pre-service/initial teacher education for **teachers in secondary education**?*

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|  | Yes | No |
|--|-----|----|
| Specialist teachers of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development  |     |    |
| Teachers of subjects related to global citizenship education and education for sustainable development (e.g. history, geography, social studies) |     |    |
| Teachers of subjects not related to global citizenship education and education for sustainable development (e.g. mathematics, science)           |     |    |

**Please provide references to relevant documents.**

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_



Questions 6 - GCED and ESD in TEACHER EDUCATION, mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in in-service professional development in primary and secondary education.

**Q5a** - *Is global citizenship education and education for sustainable development offered as part of professional development for teachers in primary education?*

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|  | Yes | No |
|--|-----|----|
| Specialist teachers of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development  | 1   |    |
| Teachers of subjects related to global citizenship education and education for sustainable development (e.g. history, geography, social studies) |     |    |
| Teachers of subjects not related to global citizenship education and education for sustainable development (e.g. mathematics, science)           |     |    |

**Please provide references to relevant documents.**

**SPACE TO FILL** \_\_\_\_\_

**Q5b** - *Is global citizenship education and education for sustainable development offered as professional development for teachers in secondary education?*

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|  | Yes | No |
|--|-----|----|
| Specialist teachers of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development  | 1   |    |
| Teachers of subjects related to global citizenship education and education for sustainable development (e.g. history, geography, social studies) |     |    |
| Teachers of subjects not related to global citizenship education and education for sustainable development (e.g. mathematics, science)           |     |    |

**Please provide references to relevant documents.**

**SPACE TO FILL** \_\_\_\_\_



Question 7 - GCED and ESD in STUDENT ASSESMENT, mainstreaming of GCED and ESD in student assessment, primary, secondary and upper secondary level

**Q7a** - Are students expected to be formally assessed with regard to learning outcomes of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development in **primary education**?

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|                             | YES | NO |
|-----------------------------|-----|----|
| Primary Education (ISCED 1) |     |    |

If 'yes', please provide the original name of this subject with its translation into English and in which grades it is taught:

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_

**Q7b** - Are students expected to be formally assessed with regard to learning outcomes of global citizenship education and education for sustainable development in **secondary education**?

**(Please tick one box only.)**

|                                     | YES | NO |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|
| Secondary Education (ISCED 2 and 3) |     |    |

If 'yes', please provide the original name of this subject with its translation into English and in which grades it is taught:

SPACE TO FILL \_\_\_\_\_



## Bibliography

---

- Hoskins, B. (2016). *Towards the development of an international module for assessing learning in Global Citizenship Education (GCE) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD): A critical review of current measurement strategies*. Retrieved from <https://www.gcedclearinghouse.org/sites/default/files/resources/245620e.pdf>
- IBE. (2013). *Glossary of Curriculum Terminology*. Paris: UNESCO International Bureau of Education.
- IBE. (2016). *Global Monitoring of Target 4.7: Themes in National Curriculum Frameworks*. Paris: International Bureau of Education - UNESCO.
- Köhler, H., Weber, S., Brese, F., Schulz, W., & Carstens, R. (2018). *ICCS 2016 User Guide for the International Database*. Amsterdam: IEA.
- Sandoval-Hernández, A., & Miranda, D. (2018). *Exploring ICCS 2016 to measure progress toward target 4.7*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Schulz, W., Ainley, J., Fraillon, J., Losito, B., & Agrusti, G. (2016). *IEA International Civic and Citizenship Education Study 2016. Assessment Framework*. Amsterdam: Springer Open.
- Schulz, W., Ainley, J., Fraillon, J., Losito, B., Agrusti, G., & Friedman, T. (2018). *Becoming citizens in a changing world: IEA International Civic and Citizenship Education Study 2016 international report*. Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- UIS. (2017). *Measurement strategy for SDG Target 4.7*. Madrid: UNESCO Institute for Statistics.
- UNESCO. (2012a). *Education for Sustainable Development Sourcebook*. Paris: UNESCO.
- UNESCO. (2012b). *Exploring Sustainable Development: a Multiple-Perspective Approach*. Paris: UNESCO.
- UNESCO. (2013). *Global Citizenship Education: An Emerging Perspective, Outcome document of the Technical Consultation on Global Citizenship Education*. Paris: UNESCO.
- UNESCO. (2014). *Global Citizenship Education, Preparing Learners for the 21st Century*. Paris: UNESCO.
- UNESCO. (2015). *Global Citizenship Education, Topics and Learning Objectives*. Paris: UNESCO.