

# FINAL NARRATIVE REPORT AND EVALUATION OF THE UNESCO PROJECT: "STRENGTHENING NATIONAL CAPACITIES FOR IMPLEMENTING THE 2003 CONVENTION FOR SAFEGUARDING INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE IN ERITREA"



Project Location: Eritrea (Eastern Africa Region)

Implementation Period: 2014-2018

Budget codes: 199GLO4000.8 (2014-2017)

199GLO4338 (2018)

Donor: Kingdom of Norway earmarked contribution to the

Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund of the 2003

Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible

Cultural Heritage

Total budget (USD): US\$278,164

Prepared by: Karalyn Monteil, Regional Advisor for Culture,

**UNESCO** Regional Office for Eastern Africa

Timeframe of evaluation: October 2018 to January 2019

Submission Date: 5 Nov 2019

# Table of Contents

l.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:	3
II.	EVALUATION REPORT STRUCTURE	4
III.	FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION	9
IV.	CONCLUSIONS	16
V.	RECOMMENDATIONS	17
VI.	LIST OF ANNEXES	20

# I. Executive Summary:

The project "Strengthening National Capacities for Implementing the 2003 Convention for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage in Eritrea", funded by an earmarked contribution from the Kingdom of Norway to the Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund of the UNESCO 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage, was successfully carried out from 2014 to 2018 and resulted in concrete outcomes such as the development of a national legislation for the protection of Eritrea's tangible and intangible cultural heritage, the establishment of an Intangible Cultural Heritage Section within the Department for Culture in the Commission for Culture and Sports and a national ICH focal point for UNESCO, the elaboration of a first national inventory of intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in Eritrea, national awareness-raising of the concept of safeguarding intangible cultural heritage, capacity building in identifying and safeguarding ICH as well as in developing an International Assistance request and in preparing a nomination file, and lastly, in the establishment of a National ICH Committee.

It should be noted that the political context of the country radically changed at the end of the project with a peace agreement signed between Eritrea and Ethiopia in July 2018. This change has motivated the Government of Eritrea to place more attention on the safeguarding of their intangible cultural heritage, which has always been a focus of the government (i.e. research and documentation of the nine ethnolinguistic groups), but which they are now more capable of carrying out thanks to the capacity building aspects of this project (community-based inventories and safeguarding practices); and it has also motivated the State Party to consider nominating an element shared by all nine ethno-linguistic groups in the country in order to foster solidarity and avoid any possible misgivings about nominating an element from only one of the nine ethno-linguistic groups.

Throughout the project, the State Party ensured wide media coverage of all activities, which helped to further raise awareness on a national level.

The project can confidently claim to have reached its development objectives by:

- Enabling Eritrea to safeguard its intangible cultural heritage through the effective implementation of the 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage, thereby contributing to sustainable development at local and national levels; and
- Promoting better visibility of intangible cultural heritage, awareness of its significance and function
  in society, and mutual respect for the heritage of others, thereby fostering cultural diversity,
  intercultural dialogue and a culture of peace.

Furthermore, the project obtained its immediate objectives, by:

- Assisting Eritrea to meet national obligations under the 2003 Convention, in particular with regards to inventory-making and other safeguarding measures;
- Building a critical level of national capacity, (policy, legal, and institutional framework and human resource expertise) for safeguarding intangible heritage and implementing the Convention; and
- Increasing the possibilities of Eritrea to benefit from the Convention's mechanisms of international cooperation, including International Assistance from the Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund.

Lastly, the project succeeded in reaching its expected results, by:

- Increasing national awareness about the 2003 Convention and better understanding of its international mechanisms and national obligations;
- Building national capacity for the implementation of the Convention in particular in areas of policy and legislation; community based inventorying, preparing international requests to the ICH Fund and elaborating nominations to the Lists under the Convention;
- Revising policies and legislation in favour of intangible cultural heritage and proposals made towards establishing an institutional framework for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage; and
- Increasing knowledge about community-based inventorying.

Lessons learned from the project include the need for formal and informal training of the national expert to accompany the international expert in the project and the need for an information meeting with local communities to raise awareness of the UNESCO 2003 Convention and the concept of safeguarding ICH prior to undertaking community-based inventory work. The inclusion of the Eritrean Research and Documentation Centre (equivalent to the National Archives) in the inventory training and as a repository for the inventories is also an activity to be recommended for future project beneficiaries. The need to publish the inventory was highly recommended by the international expert but not included as a project activity, which could have motivated and/or obliged the State Party to undertake this necessary step prior to preparation of a nomination file.

Despite the significant progress made through this project, as of the finalization of this report, the State Party has not yet published its final inventory of ICH, submitted a request for International Assistance to the Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund, however, regular meetings of its National ICH Committee have been scheduled.

It will be up to the leadership of the National Intangible Cultural Heritage Committee, with support from the Eritrean Commission for Culture and Sports, to ensure that the benefits gleaned from this project are sustainable through the continued awareness raising, inventorying and safeguarding of Eritrea's intangible cultural heritage.

# II. Evaluation report structure

The aim of the evaluation process was to review the Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact and Sustainability of the activities undertaken as part of the project "Strengthening National Capacities for Implementing the 2003 Convention for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage in Eritrea" in order to inform future capacity building activities for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage (ICH), notably in the Africa region. The purpose of the evaluation process was to ensure a wide consultation of project stakeholders in a transparent and participatory manner in order to provide informed feedback to UNESCO, the implementation partner and the donor. The scope of the evaluation process included consultations with: the implementation partner, national and international experts, community representatives, and the national authority responsible for culture. The data collection tools included face to face interviews with Eritrean stakeholders undertaken during the week of 22 to 26 October 2018 in Asmara and Massawa, Eritrea and e-mail consultations with the international experts. The responses to the questionnaires filled out after each training workshop were also used as a data source together with the final reports prepared by the international and national experts as well as the implementation

partner. A desk review of media coverage of the project was also undertaken. The evaluation process was limited by the language barriers, which were partially overcome through translation and interpretation services. The evaluation was undertaken by the project manager for Components II and III, which may have influenced objectivity.

#### 1. Overview of the project

The evaluation reviewed the project "Strengthening National Capacities for Implementing the 2003 Convention for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage in Eritrea", which had the following objectives and expected results:

#### **Development objectives**

- To enable Eritrea to safeguard its intangible cultural heritage through the effective implementation
  of the 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage, thereby
  contributing to sustainable development at local and national levels.
- To promote better visibility of intangible cultural heritage, awareness of its significance and function in society, and mutual respect for the heritage of others, thereby fostering cultural diversity, intercultural dialogue and a culture of peace.

#### **Immediate objectives**

- To assist Eritrea to meet national obligations under the 2003 Convention, in particular with regards to inventory-making and other safeguarding measures.
- To build a critical level of national capacity, (policy, legal, and institutional framework and human resource expertise) for safeguarding intangible heritage and implementing the Convention.
- To increase the possibilities of Eritrea to benefit from the Convention's mechanisms of international cooperation, including International Assistance from the Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund.

#### **Expected results**

- Increased national awareness about the 2003 Convention and better understanding of its international mechanisms and national obligations.
- National capacity built for the implementation of the Convention in particular in areas of policy and legislation; community based inventorying, preparing international requests to the ICH Fund and elaborating nominations to the Lists under the Convention.
- Policies and legislation revised in favour of intangible cultural heritage and proposals made towards establishing an institutional framework for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage.
- Increased knowledge about community-based inventorying.

#### 2. Evaluation purpose, objective and scope

The <u>purpose</u> of the evaluation process was to ensure a wide consultation of project stakeholders in a transparent and participatory manner in order to provide informed feedback to UNESCO, the implementation partner and the donor. The <u>objective</u> of the evaluation process was to review the Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact and Sustainability of the activities undertaken as part of the project "Strengthening National Capacities for Implementing the 2003 Convention for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage in Eritrea" in order to inform future capacity building activities for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage, notably in the Africa region. The <u>scope</u> of the evaluation process

included consultations with: the implementation partner in Eritrea, national and international experts, community representatives, and the national authority responsible for culture: the Eritrean Commission for Culture and Sports regarding each project activity foreseen in the project document, according to its Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact and Sustainability.

#### 3. Evaluation methodology

The <u>methodology</u> of the evaluation process included desk reviews of all project documents and reports, email consultations with international experts, and a week-long (22 to 26 October 2018) mission to Asmara and Massawa in Eritrea to meet with the national implementation partner, community representatives, the national authority responsible for culture and other key stakeholders of the project. This was combined with personal experience and observations of the project implementation as the project manager since January 2016.

On 24 and 25 October 2018, the UNESCO programme specialist of the Regional office for Eastern Africa visited Massawa on the Red Sea coast together with the ICH focal point, Mohad Suleman, the national expert, Dr Senait Bahta, Mr. Mohammed Said, a researcher, photographer and videographer Mr. Weldeghi Kelete and Mr. Marhawi Meaze, all from the Commission of Culture and Sports, in order to interview four community members from the Tigre ethnic group about their experiences participating in the community based inventory. Each of them were interviewed with interpretation provided by Mr. Said. The interview was recorded by the Cultural Affairs Bureau. It was very helpful in learning the direct impact the training and fieldwork parts of the project had on local communities.

#### 4. Findings / Conclusions

a) Component I: Strengthening Policy, Legal and Institutional Frameworks

#### **Outputs for Component I**

- Awareness about the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage and the 2003 Convention raised;
- Existing policies and legal frameworks reviewed in a way that facilitates coordination between all stakeholders that have a role to play in the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage;
- Appropriate Institutional framework proposed to facilitate inter-sectoral mechanism for the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage.

Component I was successfully achieved in so far as all of the outputs were accomplished. The project implementation team identified one national expert, Mr. Senai Woldeab, who was tasked to collect information related to existing legal, policy and institutional frameworks. His research found that there were not any existing policies or legislation related to ICH in Eritrea prior to the commencement of the project. On the basis of his desk study, the expert elaborated a draft legislation on cultural heritage for Eritrea. Awareness was raised about both the concept of intangible cultural heritage and the 2003 UNESCO Convention. Moreover, the identification of ICH in Eritrea raised direct awareness among the community groups and individuals who practiced the elements. The national media was a key partner in achieving this goal as well as the participants in the various workshops, who continued to raise awareness about ICH back in their families and communities after the trainings.

A stakeholder's workshop on Eritrean Cultural and Natural Heritage Legislation took place on 26 and 27 May 2015 in Asmara, organized jointly by the Cultural Affairs Bureau, Ministry of Education and the

Asmara Heritage Project in coordination with UNESCO Nairobi. Participants of the workshop were Eritrean experts who represented stakeholder institutions such as the National Museum of Eritrea, National Commission of Eritrea for UNESCO, Research and Documentation Centre, Ministry of Tourism, Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Energy and Mines, Department of Religious Affairs, Eritrean Institute of Technology, College of Arts and Social Sciences, Eritrean Police and School of Law. The workshop benefitted from the presence of a UNESCO international expert, Hon. Mr. Silverse Anami, a UNESCO ICH facilitator from Kenya, who shared his perspectives on cultural policy reform in favour of safeguarding intangible cultural heritage.

The workshop reviewed and validated a legislation encompassing protection of tangible heritage including natural heritage, as well as safeguarding intangible cultural heritage. It addresses issues pertaining to the definition of various forms of culture, ownership and use of heritage, institutional set up in the field of heritage conservation and safeguarding (including the establishment of the Board under the Ministry of Education) and the establishment of the Eritrean Cultural and Natural Heritage Fund. Following the workshop, the Cultural and Natural Heritage Proclamation was proclaimed and gazetted on 30 September 2015 (proclamation number 177/2015).

The Cultural Affairs Bureau organized a public ceremony to present the new law in January 2016, which was presided by the Director of the UNESCO Regional Office for Eastern Africa and the Ministry of Education. Eritrea's national legislation, which covers the guidance of both the 1972 UNESCO World Heritage Convention and the 2003 Intangible Cultural Heritage Convention, is now included on the UNESCO Database of National Cultural Heritage Laws so that it can serve as a model for other countries in the Africa region and inform various actors of Eritrea's national heritage legislation.

Aside from the law, no policies were created or adopted as part of this project. An Intangible Cultural Heritage section was created within the Commission of Culture and Sports and a National Committee was established to oversee safeguarding of ICH in Eritrea. Both of these new bodies provide the appropriate institutional framework for facilitating inter-sectoral collaboration for safeguarding ICH. These achievements were accomplished over a four-year period rather than six months as originally foreseen in the project document. The awareness raising was continuous throughout the project from 2014 to 2018. The legislation evolved over a one-year period between 2014 and 2015. The institutional framework was created and strengthened periodically throughout the project and through the development of the Intangible Heritage Section in 2015-2016 and the launching of the National ICH Committee in 2018, which developed an Action Plan for 2018-2019.

The following equipment was purchased to support project implementation in Phase I:

Purchased	Organization responsible	To be used by
1 desktop computer	Commission for Culture and	Project Coordination Team
2 laptop computers	Sports- Intangible Heritage Office	Project Coordination Team
1 digital camera		Community
2 digital audio recorders		Community
6 printer cartridges		Project Coordination Team
2 printers		Project Coordination Team

## b) Component II: Community-based Inventorying: Training & Fieldwork

#### **Outputs for Component II**

- 25 people (officials, experts, civil society and community members) trained in inventory making;
- Field work on community inventorying undertaken;
- 1 draft inventory elaborated.

Component II was carried out through the successful implementation of its two main activities: Activity 1: Community based Inventorying workshop; and Activity 2: Fieldwork for Community-based Inventorying. The outputs were achieved in so far as at least 25 people were trained in inventory making from 3 to 18 April 2017. This workshop also included specialized training in photography and participatory video production. In addition, the Director of the National Research and Documentation Centre (equivalent to the National Archives) led a session on the data requirements for the inventory forms to become part of the National Archives. Participants received a certificate of participation signed by the national and international experts. The fieldwork to develop Eritrea's first community based inventory was carried out from August to October 2017, and a draft inventory of ICH was elaborated, which includes 18 elements representing two elements from each of the nine ethno-linguistic groups in Eritrea. The Intangible Heritage Section of the Cultural Affairs Bureau is currently preparing the final version of the inventory, which they plan to publish as Volume I of Eritrea's national inventory of intangible cultural heritage. Component II was foreseen to be carried out over a six-month period, which was accomplished despite the delays faced in procuring the equipment required for the fieldwork. Activity 1 for the Community- based Inventorying workshop was carried out in April 2017; and Activity 2 for the Fieldwork for Community based Inventorying was carried out from August to October 2017. The draft inventory was submitted by the national expert in November 2017; however, it required significant revisions after review by the international expert and the 2003 Convention Secretariat. Some of the delays faced in finalization of the inventory have been linked with the need to translate the various inventories from nine different national languages into English. Prior to starting the fieldwork, the national expert also needed to work with the community teams to translate the inventory form and consent form into the nine ethnic languages of Eritrea, which proved to be quite arduous and time consuming. It should also be noted that the national experts identified to accompany such a UNESCO project also require preparatory training from UNESCO, which could be offered through the international expert and the Secretariat of the 2003

Convention. In addition, the community involved in the inventory fieldwork could also benefit from a one-day training course or awareness-raising course on the 2003 Convention, ICH and the inventory process, which ideally should be led in their local language.

A national Intangible Cultural Heritage Committee was established in October 2018, and is responsible for validating the final inventory. At its first meeting, the National Committee of Eritrea adopted an Action Plan for 2018 to 2020, which outlines the main actions to be undertaken for safeguarding Eritrea's intangible cultural heritage, namely the implementation of safeguarding measures, elaboration of inventories and international cooperation. The Committee is working in four task teams, responsible for research, documentation and archives, communication and general management. With the founding members from the Ministry of Education, the Research and Documentation Centre, the National Union of Eritrean Women, the National Museum, and academia, it aims to work with a wide range of national stakeholders ranging from various ministries to community leaders.

# c) Component III: Workshop: Preparing Nomination Files and International Assistance Requests (Months 12 to 13)

#### **Outputs for Component III**

• 20 people (government officials, cultural experts, academia and civil society) trained in the elaboration of requests for International Assistance and preparation of nomination files;

Component III was successfully accomplished in terms of outputs, as more than 20 people (32 participants) were trained in the elaboration of International Assistance (IA) requests and the preparation of nomination files from 19 to 28 February 2018; however, despite the training, the beneficiaries still do not feel autonomous to fill out an IA request or to begin preparations for a nomination file. It should be noted that the International Expert has offered distance mentoring to continue to guide the State Party in the elaboration of an IA request, which could offer them support in the elaboration of their first nomination file. The State Party also requested the Regional Advisor for Culture to provide an additional presentation on the "Register of Good Safeguarding Practices" of the 2003 Convention during a December 2018 mission to Eritrea, as they were unclear on what this type of nomination entailed. If the National Expert had been formally trained by the International Expert and through UNESCO regional trainings prior to the commencement of the workshops, then she could have been counted on to provide guidance to the national team in filling out the IA request or preparing a nomination file.

Component III was foreseen to be carried out over a two-month period, and the workshop was indeed carried out over 2 weeks; but the planning and follow-up period required more time, and therefore, future projects should foresee more time for this activity.

# III. Findings of the Evaluation

#### 1. Relevance of the project

This project directly addressed the safeguarding needs and priorities of the country, as defined through a series of meetings and exchanges between UNESCO and the State of Eritrea from the time leading up to Eritrea's ratification of the Intangible Cultural Heritage Convention in 2010. At its seventh session in December 2012, the UNESCO Intergovernmental Committee of the 2003 Convention accepted the voluntary contribution from Norway to the Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund to support a specific project for strengthening national capacities for implementing the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage in Eritrea (Decision 7.COM 19).

The UNESCO project "Strengthening National Capacities for Implementing the 2003 Convention for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage in Eritrea" was launched in Asmara in 2014, and aimed to build a critical level of experience and knowledge, both in government institutions and among the nine ethnolinguistic communities of Eritrea, so that the country is equipped with an appropriate sustainable framework for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage (ICH) and implementing the 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage on a long term basis.

As Eritrea lacked a national legal framework for safeguarding ICH as well as capacities for carrying out inventories of ICH and preparing nomination files and International Assistance requests, the project activities successfully filled those gaps and were thus relevant for Eritrea. Even though Eritrea has a longstanding Cultural Affairs Bureau (CAB), which carried out research and documentation of indigenous cultures and traditions prior to the project, the term 'Intangible Cultural Heritage' or 'ICH' was unfamiliar and communities were not directly involved in any of the Bureau's activities aside from being interviewed

for information. The project built on the existing research activities carried out by the CAB and expanded them to include comprehensive inventories of ICH.

The project was extremely relevant in bringing in the involvement of the local communities into Eritrea's safeguarding efforts, and in raising a national awareness of Eritrea's ratification of the 2003 Convention and its resources for safeguarding ICH.

Prior to the project launch, Eritrea was a relatively isolated country due to its previous border conflict with Ethiopia. This project was relevant not only in raising Eritrea's capacities to safeguard its ICH but also in increasing the government's trust in UNESCO and in development partners such as the Kingdom of Norway to collaborate in a respectful and transparent manner. As Eritrea is a very independent country, which prefers to lead all activities undertaken on its territory, the fact that this project evolved from bilateral discussions between UNESCO and the State Party significantly contributed to the project's relevance and the Government's 'buy-in' and 'ownership'. It should be duly noted that, to the evaluator's knowledge, this project was the first extra-budgetary project undertaken by UNESCO in Eritrea, and therefore plays a significant role in demonstrating to Eritrea, to UNESCO, to the Government of Norway and to the wider donor community, the possibility of successfully implementing an extra-budgetary project with the State of Eritrea.

"This project was relevant because community-based inventories had not been carried out before; but capacity-building was critical for this. It was the right time to carry out this project because the country was depending on its ongoing mechanisms. What was new through this project was the community-based involvement in the inventory process; before this was only done by experts." - Dr Senait Bahta, October 2018

#### 2. Efficiency of project implementation

Despite the delays faced in this project, which originally foresaw 24 months for its implementation, this project succeeded in obtaining tangible results in a relatively short period of time, especially giving consideration to the country's context in the global arena.

The project can legitimately boast to having directly contributed to the following improvements in the country's safeguarding of its ICH:

- Creation of an Intangible Cultural Heritage Section within the Cultural Affairs Bureau;
- Designation of a National Focal Point for ICH in Eritrea;
- Development and enactment of a National Legislation for the protection of tangible and intangible cultural heritage in Eritrea;
- Increased national awareness of the term ICH and the necessity of its safeguarding;
- A first inventory of ICH in Eritrea;
- Awareness raised of the process for nominations to the Representative List of ICH, the List of ICH in Need of Urgent Safeguarding and the Register of Good Safeguarding Practices;
- Increase community awareness and involvement in research and documentation of ICH in Eritrea;
- A National Committee established to oversee safeguarding of ICH in Eritrea;
- An Action Plan adopted for the National ICH Committee;
- Increased international awareness of ICH in Eritrea.

Despite these achievements, the main reasons for delay in implementation can be attributed to the changeover in the National ICH Focal Point, the changeover in the Culture Programme Specialist in the

UNESCO Regional Office for Eastern Africa, and the extremely limited internet access and telephone service, which decreased the overall efficiency in project coordination and implementation.

Lastly, the ongoing government support and community support, including from the Director Generals responsible for culture from the six regions or Zorbas, as well as from the community leaders in each Zorba helped to ensure the efficiency of the project implementation. The national media was instrumental in ensuring the awareness raising results were achieved through wide media coverage in four languages: Tigrinya, Tigre, Arabic, and English.

"The existing human resources within the Cultural Affairs Bureau were utilized in an efficient manner throughout the project implementation."

- Dr. Senait Bahta, October 2018

#### 3. Effectiveness of the project

The effectiveness of the project is demonstrated by the tangible project results already cited above under 'efficiency'. We can unequivocally state that awareness of ICH was raised, ICH trainings were carried out, legislation was developed and adopted, and a National ICH Committee was established and is active today. In addition, following ratification of the 2003 Convention by Eritrea, and the launching of this first extrabudgetary project for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage, a number of programmes and projects were carried out by Eritrea, including creation of an Intangible Cultural Heritage Section within the Eritrean Commission for Culture and Sports, designation of a National Focal Point for the 2003 Convention, and establishment of a National ICH Committee, which has already adopted an Action Plan for Safeguarding ICH in Eritrea.

The most obvious contribution of this project to the achievements of its specific safeguarding objectives is the adoption in September 2015 of Eritrea's National Proclamation No. 177/2015 for Cultural and Natural Heritage as well as elaboration of its first National Inventory of ICH and its National Action Plan for Safeguarding ICH.

The project document foresaw challenges in project implementation linked with political will as well as involvement/commitment of other project stakeholders such as government officials, cultural experts and researchers, civil society, and communities of practice. However, the project enjoyed the full support of the government, cultural experts, civil society and local communities.

The project document also foresaw potential risks linked to:

- In-adequate preparation for the implementation of the various activities;
- Security of the community selected for community-based ICH inventorying;
- Appropriateness (representation), availability and commitment of the community selected for community-based ICH inventorying;
- Availability and commitment of the experts selected for implementing the various activities for prolonged period of time;
- Commitment of the beneficiaries to put the knowledge gained to good use;
- Political will and support;
- Prioritization of the project;
- Commitment and participation by high-level government officials;
- Lack of interest by high-level officials to participate in the project;
- Lack of support by other stakeholders not directly linked to culture;
- Active participation by all types and levels of stakeholders;
- Commitment and preparation of experts;
- Willingness and interest in undertaking follow-up activities;

- Interest in translating basic information on the 2003 Convention into local languages to conduct activities with communities;
- Availability of community members;
- Proper storage of documentation resulting from inventory-making;
- Experts not well selected nor prepared or not available;
- Communities wanting to keep practices secret;
- Documents from inventorying not properly stored;
- No system for follow-up;
- No proper follow-up on requests and nominations files;
- Political and institutional stability in Eritrea;
- Timely and smooth cooperation between UNESCO and Eritrean government;
- All stakeholders properly consulted;
- Timely availability of resources;
- Timely organization of workshops and activities;
- Honest and constructive evaluation of the projects by participants, including experts;
- Timely submission of reports;
- Political instability;
- Government not cooperating;
- Inventorying equipment is faulty.

However, none of the above risks were experienced during the project implementation period aside from political instability prior to the signing of the peace agreement with Ethiopia in July 2018. The risk of no proper follow up on IA requests and Nomination Files is less relevant since they have not yet been submitted to UNESCO. Lastly, the timely organization of workshops and activities was not maintained mostly due to the lack of effective communications means through telephone and Internet connectivity in Eritrea.

#### 4. Impact of the project

This project produced a wide range of positive impacts to benefit national safeguarding efforts that can be categorized in the short and long term, and include the following:

<u>Short term</u> – Various short term results were achieved in the initial phase of the project as well as at the start of each project activity. They include: the establishment of the Intangible Cultural Heritage Section within the Cultural Affairs Bureau; the designation of a national focal point for ICH; national awareness-raising of ICH and of the government's commitment to safeguarding Eritrea's intangible cultural heritage traditions; development of a national legislation to safeguard ICH; production of a first inventory of ICH in Eritrea; and establishment of a National ICH Committee.

These impacts are categorized as short term since they were attained over a short period of time and some could be considered as 'quick wins', which demonstrate the government's engagement; however, their impact should by no means be considered as short term, as every one of these actions will influence the sustainable safeguarding of ICH in Eritrea over the long term.

#### Long term-

All of the above-mentioned achievements cited above can also be considered as having long-term impacts since they have established the solid foundation for safeguarding ICH in Eritrea. The Government's commitment to making safeguarding of ICH a priority is demonstrated through their establishment of the Intangible Cultural Heritage Section within the Cultural Affairs Bureau; designation of a national focal point for ICH; adoption of a national legislation to safeguard ICH; validation of a first inventory of ICH in

Eritrea; and establishment of a National ICH Committee, which has already elaborated a National Action Plan for Safeguarding ICH in Eritrea.

In addition to these short and long term impacts, the project activities for fieldwork, which involved local communities in carrying out community based inventories in the places where the communities live increased their awareness that they are the custodians of their ICH and therefore responsible for passing it on to future generations. This awareness and ownership of ICH and its safeguarding will have the longest-term impact on Eritrea's ICH.

"During the inventory work, the community members wanted to inventory more than two elements in order to demonstrate the richness and vastness of their ICH."

- Idriss Ali Saleh, youth participant from the Tigre community, October 2018

Another long-term impact of the project was provided by the extensive media coverage, which raised national and international awareness of the project and of the diverse ICH in Eritrea. Prior to the project, the term 'ICH' was unknown in Eritrea and the direct involvement of local communities was unheard of in research and documentation work undertaken by university experts or staff of the Cultural Affairs Bureau. Moreover, the Government named a regional ICH focal point and the Director of the Regional Museum created a new ICH Unit as one of the four units in the museum. The Regional Museum Director stated that the digital archive training offered during the project also impacted his museum work, and he asked that more training be offered in this area.

"Following my participation in the inventory workshop in Asmara, I was motivated to create a new ICH Unit at the Regional Museum, and the Culture Commissioner nominated a regional focal point for intangible cultural heritage who is now working out of our museum."

- Mr. Yohannes G/nugus, Director of the Regional Museum of Northern Red Sea in Massawa, October 2018

During my interview with the Tigre community, I learned that their perception of their own ICH was broadened through participation in the workshop and inventory fieldwork, and as a result, their community presented more elements at the annual cultural festival than they normally do, which further encouraged safeguarding and transmission to other community members, especially youth.

The short and long-term impact of Eritrea's first Cultural and Natural Heritage Legislation should not be underestimated. In less than one year, Eritrea's National Proclamation No. 177/2015 for Cultural and Natural Heritage was successfully developed and adopted (in September 2015) with support from this extra-budgetary project.

The new legislation, developed through this project, provides Eritrea with a framework to protect Eritrea's intangible cultural heritage for future generations, and also provides the solid foundation on which Eritrea will be able to build a strong, sustainable and resilient heritage sector. This first Eritrean Cultural and Natural Heritage Legislation, aimed at protecting national cultural and natural heritage with particular focus on both tangible and intangible cultural heritage, also contributed to the successful nomination of 'Asmara: A Modernist City in Africa' as a UNESCO World Heritage site. Nevertheless, a culture policy is still needed to reinforce the protection of ICH in Eritrea.

The high level of media attention focused on this project ensured not only wide national media coverage but also international coverage, including through the Eritrean Delegation to the African Union newsletter.

Following the April 2017 training workshop in Asmara on 'Community-based inventorying of Intangible Cultural Heritage' led by Mr. Lovemore Mazibuko, an ICH facilitator from Malawi, Eritrea designated a national team to carry out fieldwork among the nine ethno-linguistic groups of Eritrea. The fieldwork was led by Dr. Senait Bahta, a national ICH facilitator engaged by UNESCO, and resulted in the successful inventorying of 18 ICH elements: two from each of the nine ethno-linguistic groups of Eritrea. Although only one community was targeted as part of the original project activities, it was decided that carrying out the inventory among all nine groups would enable the participants in the training to test their skills in community based inventorying and would also spread information on safeguarding ICH to more local communities within these groups.

The following inventory of 18 elements was successfully completed through the project:

No.	Ethnic Groups	Regions	Elements	Domain		
1	Tigrigna	Maekel (Central Zone)	Process of Enjera making-, Melekhet- & Sfe making	Local knowledge & Craftsmanship		
2	Saho	South	Sibole making & Hakale rite	Crafts & Ritual		
3	Blin	Anseba	Kala & Jembil making	Social practice & Craftsmanship		
4	Kunama	Gash-Barka	Asuma & Ayfa (Traditional Rope making & Local Drink preparing)	Craft & Culinary Tradition		
5	Nara	Gash-Barka	Tafati & Tekosham (Local drink & Porridge preparing )	Both Culinary Tradition		
6	Bdaweit	Gash-Barka	Besokoy Abk & Quas Traditional Dance	Traditional Game & Performing Art		
7	Tigre	Northern Red Sea	Ali KuKuy Traditional Puppetry & Abre	Performing arts & Social practice		
8	Rashayda	Southern Red Sea	Abudi- bread making & Traditional Tent use	Culinary tradition & local Knowledge		
9	Afar	Southern Red Sea	Tobno –Unique way of food preservation & Radoyta	Culinary tradition & Traditional ball game		

The February 2018 workshop in Asmara on 'Preparation of Nomination Files and elaboration of International Assistance Requests' introduced the process of nominating elements on UNESCO 2003 Convention's two Lists (Representative List and Urgent Safeguarding List) as well as the Register of Good Safeguarding Practices. It also presented the process for elaborating requests for International Assistance from the Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund. This raised capacities of participants in the short term, who through practicing filling out a first nomination file and an IA request, will successfully gain the skills, experience and knowledge required to support national efforts for nominations and IA proposals in the future.

One of the most long-term impacts of the project was the establishment, in July 2018 by the Commission for Culture and Sports, of a National Committee to oversee the safeguarding of Eritrea's ICH. The National Committee adopted a two-year Action Plan for safeguarding the country's intangible cultural heritage, which includes the submission of an International Assistance Request for the preparation of Eritrea's first nomination file of an ICH element.

The evaluation of this project, which consulted a wide range of stakeholders involved in the project over the years ranging from staff of the Department of Culture, team leaders for the inventory fieldwork, participants in the workshops and community representatives as well as the national and international experts engaged by UNESCO to support implementation of the project, and visited Asmara and Massawa, has formulated recommendations to increase the long-term impacts of this project in Eritrea.

The project made swift and effective strides in raising capacities on a national level, and equipping a wide range of government and community stakeholders with the skills necessary to safeguard Eritrea's ICH over the long term.

#### 5. Sustainability of project results

Throughout the project, the UNESCO Office in Nairobi worked in close collaboration with the Cultural Affairs Bureau within the Ministry of Education, the Eritrean National Commission for UNESCO, the National Museum of Eritrea, the Eritrean Research and Documentation Centre, and the College of Arts for the successful implementation of the project activities and results. Their active engagement has continued since the project activities were completed, and will ensure that the safeguarding of ICH in Eritrea remains a priority.

Eritrea's National Proclamation No. 177/2015 for Cultural and Natural Heritage, adopted in September 2015, will also ensure the project results as it offers a first national legislation to ensure the sustainable protection of ICH In Eritrea.

The involvement of all nine ethno-linguistic groups in the inventory fieldwork will also contribute to the sustainability of the project as every group from all regions of Eritrea were involved in the project and feel ownership over not only the inventories but also the safeguarding measures to ensure their continued transmission.

Prior to the start of this project, the Cultural Affairs Bureau had begun researching and documenting the ICH practices of the nine ethno-linguistic groups of Eritrea; however, the training and awareness raising of this project broadened their understanding of ICH as a term and more importantly of the urgency and importance of ensuring the safeguarding of ICH. This heightened awareness will also contribute to the sustainable results of this project.

The national expert, Dr Senait, is considering publishing the national inventory as part of the University of Asmara's *College of Social Sciences Journal*, to further ensure its sustainable outreach. She also suggested it could be published as part of the Youth Magazine or Women's Magazine, as part of both of these national associations. These options could further ensure the sustainable impact of the national inventory and raise awareness of the necessary safeguarding measures required.

The lack of national budget to continue the inventory work beyond the first pilot inventory could negatively impact the sustainability of the project; however, the International Assistance request to the ICH Fund, which is currently being finalized, could offer the financial support necessary to continue the inventories until a sustainable source of financing can be identified by the national authorities.

The results of the project were expanded through UNESCO Regular Programme funding from the Communications and Information Sector to include preparation of digital archives of the inventoried ICH elements, which are now included in the Eritrean Research and Documentation Centre (equivalent to the National Archives). This further contributed to the project's sustainable outreach.

A Certificate of participation was given after each training workshop, which recognized the individual participants, and established a national network of trained and qualified stakeholders to participate in future ICH activities in Eritrea.

Lastly, the creation of the National Task Team and the launching of their Action Plan improves chances of sustainability of the ICH safeguarding actions in Eritrea.

#### IV. Conclusions

#### 1. Relevance

This project and its activities were relevant in raising national awareness and capacities in Eritrea for the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage, as they directly responded to the needs identified in the country in terms of awareness raising, legislation and capacity building.

#### 2. Efficiency

The risk of lack of government engagement was foreseen in the project document as well as the difficulty of transferring funds to Eritrea; neither of these were experienced and on the contrary, the government was fully engaged in the project from start to finish. However, the project document did not foresee the ongoing communication challenges throughout the project due to lack of a reliable internet and telephone service/access in Eritrea. This led to inefficiency in project implementation due to communication challenges between UNESCO and the implementation partners in Eritrea.

At the same time as this project was being implemented, Eritrea was also expanding national efforts to implement the UNESCO 1972 World Heritage Convention. As a result, the two national entities implementing both 1972 and 2003 Conventions worked in harmony and their synergies resulted in the first national legislation, which covers both tangible and intangible cultural heritage.

#### 3. Effectiveness

The project activities were effectively reached in that awareness was raised, legislation was adopted, government structures were created (Intangible Cultural Heritage Section within the Cultural Affairs Bureau, a National Committee for ICH and a National Action Plan for Safeguarding ICH), and capacities were raised in understanding ICH, undertaking inventories and preparing International Assistance requests and nomination files.

It should be noted that the national team feel less autonomous in finalizing the IA request and preparing a nomination file; however, they have the skills and knowledge necessary to begin the process, which in doing so, will further reinforce their capacities through direct experience. If the National Expert had been formally trained by the International Expert and through UNESCO regional trainings prior to the commencement of the workshops, then she could have been counted on to provide guidance to the national team in filling out the IA request or preparing a nomination file.

#### 4. Impact

The project resulted in the following impacts:

- Awareness of ICH has increased on local, regional and national levels in Eritrea.
- An Intangible Cultural Heritage Section was established within the Cultural Affairs Bureau.
- Eritrea's National Proclamation No. 177/2015 for Cultural and Natural Heritage was adopted in September 2015.
- The first Inventory of ICH in Eritrea was successfully completed in 2018.
- 32 Eritreans have been formally trained in carrying out inventories and preparing IA requests. and nomination files.

- A National Committee for ICH has been established.
- An Action Plan for Safeguarding ICH was adopted by the National Committee.
- An International Assistance request for the Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund was drafted.
- A first extra-budgetary project in the field of culture was successfully carried out in Eritrea, which can serve as a positive example for other donors and partners interested in supporting the sustainable development of Eritrea through culture.

#### 5. Sustainability

Many of the impacts listed above will directly contribute to the sustainability of this project. In addition to Eritrea's National Proclamation No. 177/2015 for Cultural and Natural Heritage, adopted in September 2015, this project has also maximized its sustainability and created a multiplier effect through building a critical level of national capacity, both in government institutions and among key players from communities and civil society in the identification and safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage.

The National Task Team has been designated and through their Action Plan they will oversee the implementation of safeguarding activities ranging from inventorying to preparing Eritrea's first nomination file. They will also advise on policy, legal and institutional frameworks. The National Task Team's efforts combined with the increased national awareness raising of the importance of safeguarding Eritrea's ICH will ensure the sustainability of the project's results.

#### V. Recommendations

#### 1. General comments

The overall timeframe for the project was overly ambitious for the project country context, and notably for organizing the activities given the low access to Internet and phone communications. What was foreseen as a two-year project took four years to be carried out. Almost one year was lost due to transitions in staffing in both the State Party and the UNESCO Nairobi Office, thus poor communications and delayed implementation. Financial management of the project was weak at times, partly due to turnover in both the UNESCO Nairobi Office and the Commission for Culture and Sports- Intangible Cultural Heritage Office, which led to gaps in financial reporting information. Nevertheless, remarkable accomplishments were achieved over a relatively short period of time, especially given the political context of the country and its limited engagement with outside partners during the project implementation period.

#### Gender and human rights

Although their participation was low, the presence of <u>women</u> in this project was encouraged throughout implementation and women were involved in all activities, especially in the community-based inventory work. For the training workshops, on average 7 out of 32 participants were female. The Commission for Culture and Sports has no female directors or leaders of research so the principle counterparts among the national implementation partner were male. Nevertheless, a female national expert was engaged to advise the country on the project implementation and played a leading role in the workshops and fieldwork, and is also a member of the National ICH Committee. <u>Human rights</u> were considered when carrying out the inventory work and the utmost respect was given to community members from all nine ethno-linguistic groups of Eritrea, who participated in the project activities.

#### 2. Overall Recommendations

#### Experts

- Train the national expert--as is done with international experts, and have the training reinforced by training by the international expert before and after each activity;
- Encourage the international expert to use more didactic training methods—more dialogue, less lectures—while maintaining the content of the training modules.

#### **Workshops**

- Shorten the session each day but prolong the overall duration of workshops;
- Increase the number of breaks and discussions in each session;
- Increase the number of youth participants;
- Increase the number of workshops in future projects (including follow-up workshops to ensure knowledge and capacities were acquired);
- Provide workshop hand-outs in advance, including the Basic Text of the 2003 Convention and its Operational Directives—in local language when possible;
- Allocate more time in the workshop to the safeguarding measures (consider a separate workshop on this topic);
- Increase group work in the workshops.

"Participants felt group works provide them with the opportunity to discuss issues and reach consensus," Dr Senait Bahta, National Expert, November 2017.

#### <u>Fieldwork</u>

- The communities involved in the inventory fieldwork could benefit from a one or two-day training course/awareness-raising session on the 2003 Convention, ICH, the inventorying process and safeguarding measures, which ideally should be led in their local language;
- To ensure sustainability of the project activities, further information and awareness-raising meetings are needed in each *zobas* (sub region);
- All consent and inventory forms should be translated into local languages spoken by the communities carrying out the inventories;
- Increase the participation of women in fieldwork.

#### Inventory(-ies)

- Ensure the final printed inventory is one of the deliverables in future project designs to increase project results and motivate State Parties to finalize their national inventory(-ies);
- Consider the budget and time required to translate inventories from local languages into English (or French) for future inventories or for future projects with inventory activities;
- Involve the national archives or equivalent in inventory activities and ensure the final inventories are accessed into the national archives;
- Explore links with museums and exhibitions, which could benefit from the images, films and documentation obtained during fieldwork, to expand and deepen the interpretation of museum

collections;

 More support is needed to continue inventory exercises, awareness-raising activities among communities (i.e. 6 of the 9 ethnic groups in Eritrea are located in the Massawa region), and procure equipment to continue the documentation and archive work for Eritrea's ICH.

#### Preparing International Assistance Requests and Nomination files

- Further training in developing IA requests and preparing nomination files is needed;
- Consider breaking up this workshop into two separate workshops.

#### National Committee

- Increase the participation of women in the national committee;
- Need to foresee funding and time for translations before and after community based inventories.

#### 3. Specific Recommendations

#### **To UNESCO**

- 1) Future similar projects should aim to include training for the national expert by UNESCO and by the international expert(s) in advance of each workshop;
- 2) An external evaluation could have been considered, rather than a self-evaluation by the project manager in the field, in order to ensure a more objective evaluation of the project activities;
- 3) Highlight the complementarity among different UNESCO Conventions and use projects such as this one to assist Member States who wish to develop legislation based on more than one Convention;
- 4) Continue to foresee a high number of monitoring missions by UNESCO in similar project documents, especially when the project is covered by a non-resident agency in the country, to ensure close communications and involvement in project activities and implementation;
- 5) Raise awareness of the success of this project among UNESCO Member States to demonstrate the success of extra-budgetary projects in Eritrea.

#### **To the State Party**

- 1) Ensure implementation of the National Proclamation No. 177/2015 for Cultural and Natural Heritage;
- 2) Ensure support for the National Intangible Cultural Heritage Committee and implementation of its National Action Plan for Safeguarding ICH in Eritrea;
- 3) Continue community outreach and awareness-raising activities of ICH and safeguarding measures—including among ministries and in each zobas (sub-region)
- 4) Publish the inventories of ICH carried out and validated by the National Committee;
- 5) Consider submitting an International Assistance request to begin preparations of a nomination file for Eritrea;
- 6) Following the Peace Agreement signed in 2018, consider preparing a joint nomination file with Ethiopia to safeguard shared ICH elements;
- 7) Continue close collaboration with national media to further raise awareness of ICH in Eritrea and safeguarding measures;
- 8) Consider adopting a national culture policy to further direct and ensure the safeguarding of ICH in Eritrea;

- 9) Consider creating UNESCO Clubs in Eritrea to engage youth in identifying and safeguarding ICH.
- 10) Participate in Intergovernmental Committee meetings for the UNESCO 2003 Convention.

#### To partners

- 1) Continue engaging with Eritrea, which has proven to be a reliable partner and high standard setter for project implementation;
- 2) Offer Eritrea the flexibility it needs in terms of timing or budget lines in order to ensure they take ownership of the project, which is critical to its success;
- 3) Build on the high level of expertise in the country through further capacity building activities, including international exchanges.

## VI. LIST OF ANNEXES

- i. List of persons interviewed
- ii. List of sites visited
- iii. List of documents consulted
- iv. Evaluation matrix
- v. Results framework

#### **ANNEX I: LIST OF PEOPLE INTERVIEWED FOR THE EVALUATION**

	Gender	First name	Last Name	Title	Organization
1.	Mr.			2003 Focal Point &	
				Secretary of National	Cultural Affairs
		Mohad	Suleman	ICH Committee	Bureau- Intangible
2.	Dr. Ms.			National Expert; task	
				team head from	Professor of
				National ICH	Anthropology,
		Senait	Bahta	Committee	College of Arts &
3.	Mr.	Mohamed	Said	Director of Research	Cultural Affairs
4.	Mr.	Zerisenai	Anebrhan	Researcher	Cultural Affairs
5.	Mr.	Weldeghi	Kelete	Video/photography	Cultural Affairs
6.	Mr.	Marhawi	Meaze	Video/photography	Cultural Affairs
7.	Ms.			Film writer and	
				director; task team	
				head from National ICH	Cultural Affairs
		Rahel	Towelde	Committee	Bureau- PFDJ
8.	Mr.			Education Ministry	
				Officer- educational	Chairperson of
		Baslios	Zemo	media	Communication Task
9.	Mr.			Former Head of	
		Soloman	Tsehay	Cultural Affairs Bureau	Cultural Affairs
10.	Ms.				Research and
		Azeb	Tewolde	Director of Research	Documentation
11.	Mr.			puppetry practitioner	
		Omar	Hamid Haway	Tigre community	Alikukuy element
12.	Ms.			Abre practitioner	
		Sadia	Idris Adem	(ritual practice)	Abre element

13.	Mr.			Musician (drummer	Alikukuy (youth
		Idriss	Ali Saleh	and singer)	trying to learn
14.	Ms.	Asha	Ali Mohammed	Dancer, singer	Abre and Alikukuy
15.	Mr.				Regional Museum of
		Yohannes	G/nugus	Museum Director	Northern Red Sea
16.	Mr.	Silverse	Anami	International Expert	Kenya
17.	Mr.	Lovemore	Mazibuko	International Expert	Malawi
18.	Amb.				Commission for
		Zemede	Tecle	Commissioner	Culture and

#### **ANNEX II: LIST OF SITES VISITED**

22-23 October 2018- Asmara, Eritrea

24-25 October 2018- Massawa, Eritrea

26 October 2018- Asmara, Eritrea

#### **ANNEX III: LIST OF DOCUMENTS CONSULTED**

- i. UNESCO Project document
- ii. UNESCO Progress Reports to the donor (2015-2018)
- iii. Legislation workshop report by Silverse Anami (30 October 2015)
- iv. Inventory workshop report by Lovemore Mazibuko (April 2017)
- v. International Assistance and Nominations Workshop Report by Lovemore Mazibuko (February 2018)
- vi. Inventory Fieldwork report by Dr Senait Bahta (October 2017)
- vii. Evaluation feedback (2017 and 2018)
- viii. Final project report by Commission of Culture and Sports -Intangible Cultural Heritage Section
- ix. UNESCO Monitoring mission reports (2015-2018)
- x. Evaluation assessment by international expert Silverse Anami—email consultation
- xi. Evaluation assessment by international expert Lovemore Mazibuko --email consultation
- xii. Notes from interviews undertaken 22 to 26 October 2018 in Eritrea
- xiii. Media coverage (2014-2018)
- xiv. Contracts issued (2014-2018)

## **ANNEX IV: EVALUATION MATRIX**

Expected Result	Activity	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Impact	Sustainability	Conclusions	Recommen- dations	Comments
Expected Result N°1: Eritrea establishes the institutional infrastructure required for the effective safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage (Phase 1)	Revision of legislative and policy frameworks (2014-2015)	First national legislation for heritage protection; there was no legislation before regarding heritage. Once awareness raising and ratification of 2003, then no heritage legislation in Eritrea. Also signed 1972 Convention earlier, these two instruments motivated the State Party to enact legislation to cover both. This Project was developed through dialogue with UNESCO based on needs.	Completed in less than one year; however, budget for equipment was not sufficient, so not enough procured.	Legislation addresses needs of both ICH and WH in Eritrea. The State Party was satisfied with Anami as the international expert. Anami reviewed the draft legislation prior to workshop, then gave the context and overview of the legislation during the workshop.	ICH more closely monitored and protected on a national level; greater awareness of need to protect ICH through law. Limited implementation to date.	Legislation is based on guidance of both 1972 and 2003 Conventions. Mohad Suleman nominated as focal point. in mid-2016. Active collaboration between Asmara Heritage Project (World Heritage dossier) and Cultural Affairs Bureau financially and technically for legislation development. However, little awareness raising about the law aside from a few news items.	Adoption of Eritrea's National Proclamation No. 177/2015 for Cultural and Natural Heritage in September 2015. National authorities feel secure because now it's a law and it's easier to speak with stakeholders and refer to a law. This new legislation was also published on the UNESCO Database of National Cultural Heritage Laws	Prior to this project, this was the only national legislation in Eastern Africa to cover both ICH and WH and can serve as an example in the region for combining guidance of all or numerous UNESCO Conventions into one legislation. Recommend full implementation to ministers, notably establishment of national bodies.	Senai Woldeb, a lawyer in Eritrea drafted the legislation. He looked at 1972, 2003 and other countries' legislation. All preparation for the draft was done nationally prior to the workshop with the international expert. He had regular consultations with physical heritage and intangible heritage professionals from various ministries. A Steering Committee was formed for WH that took over consultations for the legislation. The Commission for Culture and Sports wanted to complete legislation before the public launch of project in Feb 2016.

Expected Result	Activity	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Impact	Sustainability	Conclusions	Recommen- dations	Comments
Expected Result N°2: Eritrea establishes a framework and methodology for inventorying intangible cultural heritage with the participation of communities, groups and relevant NGOs (Phase 2)	Awareness-raising (2014-2018)	Most participants considered the first workshop on awareness raising "the most important workshop" of the project. Prior to the workshop there was a general lack of familiarity with the 2003 Convention text and terminology, even though Eritrea was safeguarding its ICH before. This workshop was needed to raise awareness of the Convention ratified by Eritrea.	Could have been done more efficiently by broadening focus to include more awareness raising among 9 ethnic groups (each zorba), and offering specialized media training in ICH for the Ministry of information	Participants were not at the same level of awareness prior to the workshop; however, after the workshop, everyone had the same level of understanding. Before inventory work, the national team went to each zorba to explain the Convention and the inventory methodology. Participants interviewed felt they now have the tools and knowledge to safeguard ICH.	Greater familiarity with the Convention and terminology; gave a new framework to work through the Convention, also Eritrea had already been safeguarding ICH through research and documentation. Learned how to work with UNESCO guidelines	Following the project, participants and other stakeholders can refer to ICH and communities in Eritrea know what they are talking about. The workshop raised their motivation to safeguard ICH.	National TV coverage in 3 languages; Articles in national and international newspapers; Radio coverage in Eritrea; Interviews on national TV with international and national experts; UNESCO web site news; Banners; Information brochure. Awareness- raising workshop organized in February 2017 for 40 participants. plus practice 2 days in field. The national expert also published articles and papers on ICH following her involvement in the project.	Eritrea has 9 ethnic groups in 6 regional zorbas and sub zones. So in order to reach all society members, need to do awareness raising workshops in each region or sub region in their language in order to broaden awareness raising beyond Asmara. Need more awareness raising workshop in each zone prior to inventory field work— especially for community leaders and Administrators from each region. Could use dramas on TV/radio for awareness raising, and could also consider preparing an exhibition of photos and descriptions of ICH to exhibit at the airports.	More awareness raising needed in each zone and among ministries. Need brochures and info materials on ICH. Airport, train and museums offer opportunities for awareness raising if a budget is identified. Could also pursue articles in Ethiopian Airlines and Air Eritrea inflight magazines. A one-day awareness raising session could be organized for each ethnic group after the workshop in the capital. This could be attended by ethnic groups from the sub-regions and other regional experts (i.e. working in the museum); More training needed for the national expert; need to work more with media for awareness raising. Plans for Eritrean greetings video and brochures on greetings from 9 ethnic groups; education on ICH - not in schools yet, youth or university, but plans to put this in national curriculum. Opportunity to create UNESCO clubs to focus on ICH. There are currently heritage chapters in social studies courses; art education also has history and heritage, including oral traditions. But only topics or chapters, not full curriculum so there is no mention of safeguarding ICH in schools. Participants are grateful for Norway's support; the concepts of ICH and

								safeguarding ICH was new to Eritrea prior to this project, the workshops helped clarify the ideas about ICH. Eritrea was already doing safeguarding but was not calling it ICH. The terminology was not used before, and the Culture Commission team of researchers was not using the 2003 Convention approach of community involvement.
Capacity building in carrying out community based inventories of ICH (April 2017)	The capacity-building workshop was relevant for increasing understanding of the 2003 Convention and inventorying. Prior to the training, the Commission carried out documentation and research. Now they are following the 2003 guidelines for inventories and safeguarding.	Participants felt there was not enough time in the workshop to cover all the topics. Some participants' felt that the international expert's answers were too long and that made the agenda rushed.	There was not enough time for each group to present their practice work. Only 2 out of 5 groups presented. The experts feedback was helpful, and enabled participants to to see the mistakes they made. Some participants regretted that more time was spent on theory than practice.	Overall the participants felt that the workshop prepared them to do the field work for inventories.	Participants acquired the skills necessary to fill out the inventory forms	Eight day workshop carried out in April 2017 with 39 national participants, including 10 women.  The staff of the Commission learned the importance of involving communities even if they consider themselves experts in the field.	Participants felt the training workshop should be 3 weeks or one month. The Commission indicated that that the payment for the workshop was inadequate and the State had to add 4000 USD to cover the costs of the workshop.  The staff of the Culture Commission need more practice filling out the forms and reviewing the guidelines for inventories in order to be autonomous.  PPT presentations should include	See questionnaire for specific feedback regarding the time the international expert took to answer questions during the workshop, which they felt delayed the course so they did not cover all topics adequately. As a solution, the participants proposed that the workshop needed to be longer.

Capacity building in Digitizing and Archiving Documents	This workshop was relevant as these skills were not developed in participants.	The participants felt there was not enough time for the workshop and the time	Participants felt the time was too short to learn all archiving rules, formats, etc.	The community members were more capable to use cameras after the basic lessons shared.	Training continues to be organized by CLT Commission to increase	Two day workshop carried out in April 2018 with 25 national participants,	notes and be handed out in advance to all participants prior to the workshop. More time required for practice and review of group work. Increase participation of women (notably from associations).  Participants need to keep practicing to ensure the knowledge and techniques	There were some comments from participants suggesting improving training modules who were not fully satisfied with the performance of international and national
(17-18 April 2017)		management. was poor. The Director of National Research and Documentation Centre –RDC (Dr Azeb Tewolde) trained participants in Tigrinya with an English PPT. There were not enough cameras and video cameras to do the exercises, only limited supplies so not all participants could practice.		Greater awareness of importance of digitization and archiving. Theory understood.	knowledge and skills in archiving; Strengthened links between Culture Commission and the Ministry of Information and RDC.	including representatives of the Eritrean Research and Documentation Centre (national archives). In addition to ICH inventory work, the documentation and archive training raised capacities of Massawa museum staff in documenting and archiving their collections.	become institutionalized.  Consider increasing length of training to one full week.	experts.

co co b ir o	Field work carrying but community pased nventories of ICH (July to Sept 2017)	Participants felt this activity was the most important as they met communities in the field, used UNESCO guidelines, filled forms, obtained consent, and did research according to guidelines. The fieldwork helped participants to know how to get information from communities and how to utilize the methodology from the workshop. Participants found it was a learning experience to check their skills and understanding of the training	The participants and organizers did not find the fieldwork efficiently organized. There were transport problems, budget deficit, not enough time, remote areas, harsh climate (some researchers got sick). Moreover, the transcriptions, videos and subtitles, took a very long time. The equipment was adequate, but was delivered late. The programme was not extended so the participants undertook one month of field work instead of two months. It took them two	The model inventory forms were adequate, but consent form should be signed by 4 people (regional administration, sub zone, village leader and the practitioner). Two elements from each of 9 groups, were inventoried, so resulted in 18 elements (met target), but there is much more to do.	Everyone got to practice because all 9 ethnic groups targeted instead of one or two as originally foreseen in the project document. The DG from each zorba (region) participated in the workshops as the Team Leaders (they also participated in Asmara workshop). According to participants, they were passive in the workshop but very active in the fieldwork. The work was more effective after translation into their mother tongues. In their language, the	This activity will continue after the project ends. However, funding is limited. The inventories, photos and videos from the fieldwork could be displayed during annual culture festival in August.	3 months of fieldwork carried out among all nine ethno-linguistic groups of the country. The fieldwork highlighted the need for an ICH focal point in the Massawa National Museum to coordinate ICH activities in the region. The Museum Director also included an ICH UNIT within the museum and its collections and displays have been influenced by the fieldwork. The fieldwork also resulted in a wider variety of traditional practices from each ethnic group being	When designing similar project for other countries, consider inventorying fewer elements but covering more ethnic groups so more people can be included in the inventory exercise. National expert required training in 2003 Convention and inventory formats, etc. Limitations include: transportation, financial resources, remote areas covered-there are very elderly people who contain ICH knowledge, so urgent to speak with them.	Three weeks per ethnic group (for 2 elements); consent form should be signed by at least four people, as stated in effectiveness.
		workshop. Participants found it was a learning	was not extended so the participants undertook one		the fieldwork. The work was more effective after translation		fieldwork. The fieldwork also resulted in a wider variety of	covered- there are very elderly people who contain ICH	
		check their skills and understanding of the training.	work instead of two months. It took them two months to		mother tongues. In their language, the communities		practices from each ethnic group being presented at	urgent to speak	
		The field work enabled them to test the UNESCO methodology	transcribe the inventories into English. They found it was hard putting		understood and provided information needed. The leaders did not		the annual cultural festival in the capital in August since the		
		used and guidelines.	field work into the required format. Only 2 skilled camera		like signing the consent forms- they shared the information		communities were more aware of the different types		

	<del></del>			funcilio finitin	<del></del> 1	CLOULT		1
		men were		freely for the		of ICH they		
		engaged, so		documentation		could present		
		photos were		and it made		from their		
		lacking for		them think they		ethnic groups.		
		some		were not being		Need		
		inventories.		trusted.		equipment for		
		Most				communities so		
		participants				they can		
		agreed there				continue		
		was insufficient				documenting.		
		time to do the				The equipment		
		inventories				went back to		
		correctly.				the Culture		
		,				Commission		
						after the field		
						work. Field		
						work inventory		
						leaders should		
						be invited to		
						participate in		
						future		
						conferences. An		
						exhibition on		
						ICH could be		
						organized in the		
						Asmara and		
						Massawa		
						airports.		
Finalization	This is relevant	More time was	All 18 elements	The inventory is	Once	Draft inventory	Need skillful	
of first	and its	needed to	forms are	not published	published,	submitted,	people in local	
national	importance is	finalize 9	completed and	yet, but the	this will be	requires further	languages to	
inventory	understood by	videos. This	transcribed	National	first volume,	details to	help with	
of ICH in	the National	task of	into English	Committee	and	finalize. Not yet	finalizing	
Eritrea	Committee but	finalization was	, and the second	recognize that it	capacities	published. Part	inventory sheets.	
(Nov 2017	it has not yet	left to team		is important to	exist to	of National	RDC agreed to	
to June	been	leaders in		publish, and to	continue	Committee	store	
2018)	completed and	Asmara,		edit videos (9)	publishing	action plan.	inventories, and	
2020)	is therefore	community		22.2 114203 (3)	future	action plans	only give with	
	considered	members			volumes of		special access	
	urgent.	stayed back at			inventories.		permission, and	
	uigeiit.	home and did			Some of the		to digitize for	
		not participate.					national	
		not participate.			inventory was			
			]		published in		archives.	ı l

			the newspaper.		İ
					i)
					ı

Expected Result	Activity	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Impact	Sustainability	Conclusions	Recommen- dations	Comments
Expected Result N°3: Eritrea utilizes the strengthened institutional and human resources, both female and male, from government, civil society and communities, for the effective safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage	Capacity building in preparing International Assistance Requests to the 2003 Convention Fund (Nov 2017)	Stakeholders considered this workshop and skills relevant and important to move to the next step in nominating and safeguarding ICH elements in Eritrea.	Participants felt there was not enough time in the workshop for them to understand the form (Most felt they could not fill it out alone)	No, because participants cannot fill out the form alone.	Awareness raised of the IA mechanism	No, training still needed. The sample used was not effective-need success stories of submitted files rather than a collection of mistakes. Form not filled out, need more time for practical work. Skills still needed to fill out IA and nomination files alone.	Ten day workshop carried out in Nov 2017.	Time constraint so did not finish filling out the forms. The workshop should result in a finished IA request. More time needed for such workshops.  Participants suggested that they should finish one form of each (IA and nomination) during the workshop with the international expert.	Participants regretted that the international expert spent more time on theory than practical exercises so they do not feel autonomous in filling out these forms; moreover, participants felt that the national expert was not helpful in these trainings, and that her own training is required before she can lead the national team in this task.
(Phase 3)	Capacity building in preparing Nomination Files for ICH (Nov 2017)	This was considered relevant because Eritrea wants to prepare a nomination file of ICH elements for safeguarding.	Participants felt that the time management was lacking and not all topics were covered in detail	Representative elements and elements in need of urgent safeguarding were effectively covered but Good Safeguarding Practices were not covered during the workshop, maybe due to time limitation	Members of the National Committee feel capable of filling out the nomination file, therefore the workshop was effective in this task.	The national expert participated in this workshop and is a member of the National committee, which will oversee nomination dossiers; therefore, they will ensure the sustainability of this workshop.	Ten day workshop carried out in Nov 2017	Enjera was used as a practice exercise but the participants did not finish filling out the form due to lack of time, more time is needed to ensure draft nomination file completed during training. And more relevant examples are required from Good Safeguarding practices. The majority of participants were	See responses to questionnaire; concern that nomination on urgent safeguarding could cause dissonance among communities wondering why their endangered element was not nominated (The National Committee could consider an interview on TV explaining the selection procedure)

							to lack of time. Theory had more time than practice, this should be modified for future trainings.	
Finalization of International Assistance Request (2018)	Necessary as national funds lacking	Despite training the request has not yet been submitted; however, this is not due to lack of efficiency but need for agreement from national authorities on the element to be nominated.	The National Committee has not ensured the finalization of the IA request; however, they are relying on approval from higher authorities before submission.	This action has not yet been completed.	Once submitted, Eritrea would be a priority country to receive assistance so the outcome would be sustainable.	Draft elaborated by national team with support from international expert. Not yet submitted to UNESCO.	Focus on implementation of action plan of National Committee so that the IA request can cover awareness raising meetings in the zones, preparation of nomination file and continued inventory work. National Committee included in Action Plan.	Not yet submitted
Creation of a National ICH Committee and Action Plan for Safeguarding ICH in Eritrea (2018)	This has been created and is very relevant	An action plan was developed for two years and Task teams were designated.	The four task teams make it effective, but more people needed from different ethnic groups to make it more effective. There are 13 members now, need to ensure replacement when turnover; need other	Safeguarding measures are critical because of 30 years of war. Following peace with Ethiopia, now Eritrea can shift focus from defense to safeguarding. Many ICH are in danger	Lack of funding could impact outcomes; broad mix of representatives. Each member is translating ICH terms into 9 languages and preparing guidelines on documentation. RDC on the committee and cultural affairs	Created in May 2018. Two year Action Plan adopted in June 2018, formally named by Commissioner. 4 task teams each with an action plan elaborated. They need budget. Meeting once a month. Terms	Consider preparing a joint nomination with Ethiopia to highlight shared experiences. Study trip to Uganda and Ethiopia have been requested. Need regional training to use ICH for peace building in the region.	The ICH Committee is meeting once a month now, but could meet less often once they advance on base actions; The national expert felt that more research is needed on heritage not yet studied in Eritrea.

	ministry stakeholders like ministry o tourism, information.	'	bureau (doc task team) preparing guidelines.	of reference not yet adopted, but prepared. for sustainability, more people to be trained and more in depth training	
				needed.	

# **ANNEX V: RESULTS FRAMEWORK**

Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement/benchmarks	Sources and means of verification	RESULTS ACHIEVED
--------------------	---	-----------------------------------	---------------------

Development Objective(s)	А.	A. To assist Eritrea to safeguard its intangible cultural heritage through effective implementation of the 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage thereby contributing to sustainable development at local and national levels.	A.2.	Number of safeguarding initiatives undertaken by Eritrea over the next 4 years that reflect the principles and objectives of the Convention and the broades participation of communities.  Number of files submitted from Eritrea over the next 4 years for the Urgent Safeguarding List, Representative List and Register of Good Safeguarding Practices and International Assistance.	A.2.1. Files received by UNESCO from Eritrea over the next 4	A.1.1. No national periodic report submitted yet since the Committee decided in 2017 to undertake a reform of the Periodic Reporting of the Convention. The decision of the Committee was to follow a regional cycle for the submission of periodic reports. States will continue to submit their periodic reports, however they are no longer asked to submit their reports based on the year of their ratification (and every 6 years after). The regional cycle of submission for Africa is in 2023. Nonetheless, Eritrea prepared a draft report in 2017, which was to be reviewed by stakeholders after the International Assistance and Nominations workshop in Feb 2018; however, the new Committee Decision ended up in this meeting being cancelled.
	В.	To promote better visibility of intangible cultural heritage, awareness of its significance and function in society, and mutual respect for the heritage of others, thereby fostering cultural diversity, intercultural dialogue and a culture of peace	B.1.	Number of visibility initiatives that create awareness about safeguarding intangible heritage and the 2003	B.1.1. Project reports; press releases and articles in the media including websites; information from the statutory periodic reports of Eritrea.  B.2.1. Inventories received from Eritrea.	A.2.1. Eritrea is currently trying to decide on which element to propose first for listing. They are considering Alikukuy puppetry practice for the Urgent Safeguarding List; however, they fear a nomination from the Tigre community could cause dissonance among the eight other ethnic-linguistic groups of Eritrea; therefore, they are also considering nominating their Annual August Cultural Festival on the Register of Good Safeguarding Practices as well as the practice of making the bread Njera, which is practiced by all nine ethno-lingustic groups and may have a more unifying effect through listing. A request for international assistance to help with the preparation of a first nomination file as well as continued awareness-raising and inventory work in each zorba (sub region) is currently under preparation.  B.1.1 Three project progress reports were submitted to the donor. Media coverage of the project was widespread in Eritrea and also featured on UNESCO web sites  B.2.1. Eritrea has prepared its first inventory of ICH, which contains 18 elements (or two from each of the nine ethno-linguistic groups in Eritrea), which was shared with UNESCO. This inventory is currently being published by the Cultural Affairs Bureau.

	Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement/benchmarks	Sources and means of verification	RESULTS ACHIEVED
A.	To assist Eritrea to meet their national obligations under the Convention, in particular with regards to inventory-making and other safeguarding measures.	<ul> <li>A.1. Number of ICH safeguarding programmes, projects or activities initiated including inventories.</li> <li>A.2. Number of visibility activities initiated and supported.</li> </ul>	A.1.1. Reports of safeguarding activities.  A.1.2. Inventories elaborated and shared.  A.2.1. Press releases and articles	A.1 A first inventory carried out featuring 18 elements of ICH.  A.2 More ICH elements featured in the National Culture Festival in August 2018 and 2019 following awareness raising of ICH in this project. Numerous media interviews and feature articles on TV and in newspapers.
Immediate Objectives	To build a critical level of national capacity, (policy, legal, and institutional framework and human resource expertise) for safeguarding intangible heritage and implementing the Convention in Eritrea.  To increase the possibilities of Eritrea to benefit from the Convention's mechanisms of international cooperation.	<ul> <li>B.1. Number and variety of stakeholders (government officials, cultural experts, civil society representatives, community representatives) trained in the mechanisms of the Convention.</li> <li>B.2. Existence of adequate institutional framework for safeguarding ICH.</li> <li>B.3. Number of policies and legislation revised and containing the principles of the Convention.</li> <li>C.1. Number of files elaborated and submitted to the Urgent Safeguarding List and Representative List.</li> <li>C.2. Number of safeguarding projects submitted to the Register of Good Safeguarding Practices,</li> <li>C.3. Number of International Assistance requests to the Intangible Cultural Heritage Fund</li> </ul>	A.2. 2.Statutory periodic report  B.1. 1.Workshop/meeting and activity reports  B.1.2. Training evaluation sheets filled by the participants.  B.2.1. Reports and work plans of Institutions working on the Convention  B.3.1. Laws and policies.  C.1.1. Files submitted to the Urgent Safeguarding List,  C.1.2. Files submitted to the Representative List.  C.2.1. Submissions to the Register of Good Safeguarding Practices  C.3.1. International Assistance requests submitted and	<ul> <li>B.1 Each workshop invited a wide range of stakeholders including 30-40 participants in each workshop.</li> <li>B.1.1 The commission for culture and sports and the international expert prepared a workshop activity report after each workshop.</li> <li>B.1.2. Evaluation sheets were completed by all participants in each workshop and most were satisfied with results; however, a few requested longer workshops.</li> <li>B.2.1 A National ICH Committee was formed and an action plan was adopted.</li> <li>B.3.1 A national law was adopted. A draft policy exists.</li> <li>C. No files have been submitted to date and no international assistance request has been submitted yet.</li> </ul>

	Α.	Increased national awareness about the 2003 Convention and better understanding of the international mechanisms and national obligations.	A.1. Number and profile of people participating in the 3 main activities of the project.  A.2. Number of high-level government officials participating in the project activities.	A.1.1. Minutes of meetings and reports of workshops A.1.2. Participants lists A.2.1. Minutes of meetings and reports of workshops	A. B.	Over 100 stakeholders directly participated in project activities (average 30-40 participants per workshop); the opening ceremony of each workshop entailed high level ministerial presence as well as full media coverage in 3 languages.  The Department of Culture and regional authorities as well as community members have
Expected results	В.	National capacity built for the implementation of the Convention in particular in areas of policy and legislation, community based inventorying, preparing international requests to ICH Fund and elaborating nominations to the 2 Lists under the Convention.	B.1. Number and profile of participants showing an understanding of the different areas of the implementation mechanisms of the Convention.  B.2. Training and quality of the materials used in the training workshops.	A.2.2. Participants lists  B.1.1. Participants lists  B.1.2. Evaluation sheets of the training workshops  B.2.1. Training materials  B.2.2. Training report	C.	authorities as well as community members have all increased their understanding and capacity to identify and safeguard Eritrea's ICH. Although the IA request has not yet been submitted, this could still be received in 2019.  Eritrea successfully elaborated it's first national legislation on the protection of natural and cultural heritage and ICH practices. The national culture policy was not addressed during this project; however, the Culture Commissioner is reviewing it internally. The National Committee has elaborated an Action Plan for safeguarding of Eritrea's ICH.
	C.	Policies and legislation revised in favour of intangible heritage and proposals made towards establishing an institutional framework for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage.	C.1. Number of policies and legislations revised in favour of the safeguarding of ICH. C.2. Type of Institutional Framework proposed for the safeguarding of ICH.	C.1.1 Laws and policies  C.2.1. Proposed Framework for safeguarding Intangible Heritage	D.	The field work carried out in each of 9 sub regions increased national capacity to undertake and manage community based inventories of ICH.  A final inventory has been prepared and is awaiting publication.
	D.	Increased national capacity to undertake and manage community based inventorying.	D.1. Number of people especially community members and custodians participating in the workshop and fieldwork.  D.2. Number of free, prior and informed consents received when inventorying ICH.	D.1.1. Participants list  D.2.1. Free prior and informed consents received  D.3.1. Field data on field research received		

Interver	Objectively verifiable i achievement/bene		s of RESULTS ACHIEVED
	D.3. Number of docume from inventory-making sappropriately.  D.4. Comprehensiveness Inventory elaborated.	stored	

		Intervention logic	Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement/benchmarks	Sources and means of verification	RESULTS ACHIEVED
	A.	Initiating the Project and developing an Implementation and Monitoring Plan	A.1. Implementation and Monitoring Plan accepted	A.1.1. Implementation and monitoring Plan	A. The project implementation plan was updated yearly in accordance with the implementation rate. The UNESCO monitoring missions proved very useful in adjusting the plan and adapting to national context and needs.
	В.	Review of existing policies, legal and institutional frameworks	B.1. Recommendations made regarding the revision of various policies	B.1. Report of the review	B. The national team and international expert worked closely to review the existing legal framework and the recommendations were followed by the Department for Culture and national focal point, who led the elaboration
	C.	Training on community	C.1. 25 people including community members trained in community based	C.1.1. Training report	of the new legislation.  C. The field work was extended to all 9 sub regions and
		based inventorying and field work on inventorying		C.1.2 Participants Evaluation sheets	therefore the outreach was broader and over 100 people were involved and trained in the workshop and field work.
	D.	Training on preparing nomination files and	D.1. 20 experts trained on preparing	C.1.3. Draft inventory	D. 30 experts were trained on preparing nomination files and IA requests, which exceeded targeted benchmarks.
		international assistance	nomination files and international assistance requests	D.1.1.Training Report	E. The project enjoyed high visibility both on UNESCO web
		requests		D.1.2. Participants Evaluation Sheets	sites, in national media and internationally including
Activities	E.	Undertaking visibility of		D.1.3. Draft Nomination	coverage in an Eritrea Delegation report to the African Union.
	Ē.	the project	E.1. Press Coverage in local and international media including UNESCO website	File	F. A National ICH Committee has been formed and they
				D.1.4. Draft International Assistance request	met monthly the first year following creation and quarterly afterwards. They have adopted a two year action plan.
	F.	Exit strategy: establishing National Task Team	F.1. Action Plan and workplan of National Task team	E.1.1. Press releases and articles in the media including websites	G. The Commission for Culture and Sports submitted a final report for the project. UNESCO prepared regular progress reports for the donor and also reported outcomes in SISTER,
				F.1.1. Exit Strategy	UNESCO's reporting tool.
	G.	Reporting	G.1 Recommendations made in the	document	H. An evaluation mission was carried out in end October 2018 and interviews were held with main stakeholders.
			reports of various activities and workshops	G.1.1 Reports	Recommendations are included in the final evaluation
	l.,	Evelvation		H.1.1. Evaluation Report	report.
	H.	Evaluation	H.1. Recommendations made in the		
			Evaluation for safeguarding Intangible cultural heritage		

#### **ANNEX VI: MEDIA COVERAGE**

The project activites were widely covered by all forms of media (National Television, Radio and Newspapers). Extensive media coverage both as a news item and in the form of other media programmes was given to the workshop. See the table below.

News reportage in Tigrigna, Tigre, Arabic and English languages for 2:46 minutes.		
1.5.1.5.1.6.1.6.1.6.1.6.1.6.1.6.1.6.1.6.	3 April 2017	Opening ceremony
News reportage in Tigrigna, Tigre, Arabic and English languages	13 April 2017	Closing ceremony
Ms. Karalyn Monteil was interviewed about Intangible Cultural Heritage for 30 minutes.	14 April 2017	Interview on "Open Mic" programme
Mr. Mohammedsaid Osman researcher of Tigre oral tradition in Cultural Affairs Bureau	23 April 2017	"Geleb Dehan" – Tigre programme
Mr. Lovemore Mazibuko International ICH facilitator was interviewed about the Training workshop for 30 minutes.	27 April 2017	Interview on "Open Mic" programme
Mr. Mohad Suleman Project Coordinator was interviewed about Training workshop for 30 minutes.	29 April 2017	Interview on "News Highlights" programme
Ms. Karalyn Monteil interviewed on a documentary on Eritrea Intangible Cultural Heritage (English Documentary), link: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0A81MJUcYto	24 July 2017	ERI TV Documentary
News reportage in Tigrigna, Tigre, Arabic and English Languages for 2 minutes each	19 and 20 February 2018	Opening ceremony
ICH National Expert Dr. Senait Bahta interviewed about Training Workshop and inventorying activities	27 February 2018	Interview on "News Highlights" programme
Mr. Zerisenai Andebrhan (Culture researcher) and Awet tesfamariam () interviewed about ICH and role of youth in safeguarding ICH	4 March 2018	Interview on "Maeger" youth Programme
"Mmzgab Rekiq Bahlawi WriSha" means Inventorying of Intangible Cultural Heritage	4 April 2017	Article on "Hadas Erita" inTigrigna Language by Zersenay A/brhan
"Community Based Inventorying in Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage."	15 April 2017	Articles on "ERITREA PROFILE" by Semhar Mebrahtu
Checking on Intangible Cultural Heritage	19 April 2017	Articles on "ERITREA PROFILE" by Asmait F/brhan
News On Hadas Eritrea (Tigrigna), Eritrean profile, Eritrea Al Hadissa (Arabic) and Eritrya Hadas (Tigre) newspapers.	20 and 21 February 2018	Opening Ceremony
"How to Prepare Nomination file and Request International Assistance" by Semhar Mebrahtu (Eritrea Profile)	21 February 2018	Reportage on "Development" column
Sltena bzaeba reqiq bahlawi wrsha (Training workshop on ICH) in Tigrigna by Zerisenai Andebrhan (Hadas Eritrea)	22 February 2018	Reportage On "Bahlin sine tibebn" Column (Culture and Arts)
News reportage on Preservation of Cultural Heritage in Eritrea, link: <a href="http://allafrica.com/stories/201704050206.html">http://allafrica.com/stories/201704050206.html</a>	4 April 2017	News article on <a href="http://www.shabait.com">http://www.shabait.com</a>
News reportage on Checking on Eritrea's Intangible Cultural Heritages, link: http://www.shabait.com/articles/q-a-a/23828-checking-on-eritreas-intangible-cultural-	19 April 2017	News article on <a href="http://www.shabait.com">http://www.shabait.com</a>
	Mr. Mohammedsaid Osman researcher of Tigre oral tradition in Cultural Affairs Bureau Mr. Lovemore Mazibuko International ICH facilitator was interviewed about the Training workshop for 30 minutes. Mr. Mohad Suleman Project Coordinator was interviewed about Training workshop for 30 minutes. Ms. Karalyn Monteil interviewed on a documentary on Eritrea Intangible Cultural Heritage (English Documentary), link: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0A81MJUcYto News reportage in Tigrigna, Tigre, Arabic and English Languages for 2 minutes each  ICH National Expert Dr. Senait Bahta interviewed about Training Workshop and inventorying activities Mr. Zerisenai Andebrhan (Culture researcher) and Awet tesfamariam () interviewed about ICH and role of youth in safeguarding ICH "Mmzgab Rekiq Bahlawi WriSha" means Inventorying of Intangible Cultural Heritage  "Community Based Inventorying in Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage."  Checking on Intangible Cultural Heritage  News On Hadas Eritrea (Tigrigna), Eritrean profile, Eritrea Al Hadissa (Arabic) and Eritrya Hadas (Tigre) newspapers.  "How to Prepare Nomination file and Request International Assistance" by Semhar Mebrahtu (Eritrea Profile)  SItena bzaeba reqiq bahlawi wrsha (Training workshop on ICH) in Tigrigna by Zerisenai Andebrhan (Hadas Eritrea)  News reportage on Preservation of Cultural Heritage in Eritrea, link: http://allafrica.com/stories/201704050206.html  News reportage on Checking on Eritrea's Intangible Cultural Heritages, link:	Mr. Mohammedsaid Osman researcher of Tigre oral tradition in Cultural Affairs Bureau  Mr. Lovemore Mazibuko International ICH facilitator was interviewed about the Training workshop for 30 minutes.  Mr. Mohad Suleman Project Coordinator was interviewed about Training workshop for 30  29 April 2017  minutes.  Ms. Karalyn Monteil interviewed on a documentary on Eritrea Intangible Cultural Heritage (English Documentary), link: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OA81MJUcyto  News reportage in Tigrigna, Tigre, Arabic and English Languages for 2 minutes each  ICH National Expert Dr. Senait Bahta interviewed about Training Workshop and inventorying activities  Mr. Zerisenai Andebrhan (Culture researcher) and Awet tesfamariam () interviewed about 1 March 2018  ICH and role of youth in safeguarding ICH  "Mmzgab Rekiq Bahlawi WriSha" means Inventorying of Intangible Cultural Heritage  "Community Based Inventorying in Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage."  15 April 2017  Checking on Intangible Cultural Heritage  News On Hadas Eritrea (Tigrigna), Eritrean profile, Eritrea Al Hadissa (Arabic) and Eritrya 19 April 2017  News On Hadas Eritrea (Tigrigna), Eritrean profile, Eritrea Al Hadissa (Arabic) and Eritrya 20 and 21 February 2018  "How to Prepare Nomination file and Request International Assistance" by Semhar Mebrahtu (Eritrea Profile)  SItena bzaeba reqiq bahlawi wrsha (Training workshop on ICH) in Tigrigna by Zerisenai Andebrhan (Hadas Eritrea)  News reportage on Preservation of Cultural Heritage in Eritrea, link:  http://allafrica.com/stories/201704050206.html  News reportage on Checking on Eritrea's Intangible Cultural Heritages, link: http://www.shabait.com/articles/q-a-a/23828-checking-on-eritreas-intangible-cultural-

Online News Websites	News reportage on Community Based Inventorying in Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage, link: <a href="http://www.shabait.com/articles/nation-building/23804-community-based-inventorying-in-safeguarding-of-intangible-cultural-heritage-">http://www.shabait.com/articles/nation-building/23804-community-based-inventorying-in-safeguarding-of-intangible-cultural-heritage-</a>	15 April 2017	News article on <a href="http://www.shabait.com">http://www.shabait.com</a>
	Eritrea Launches Inventorying of Intangible Cultural Heritage, link <a href="https://www.tesfanews.net/eritrea-launches-inventorying-of-intangible-cultural-heritage/">https://www.tesfanews.net/eritrea-launches-inventorying-of-intangible-cultural-heritage/</a>	20 April 2017	News Article on https://www.tesfanews.net
	UNESCO web news — A four-year UNESCO project in Eritrea succeeded in raising national capacities for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage, 26 October 2018	Various dates	UNESCO Regional Office for Eastern Africa <u>web site</u>
	Eritrea establishes a National Committee for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage, 19 September 2018		2003 Convention web page on Eritrea
	UNESCO workshop on safeguarding intangible cultural heritage opens in Eritrea, 22 February 2018		
	Eritrea launches inventory of intangible cultural heritage, 6 April 2017  UNESCO Intangible Cultural Heritage project leads to the first heritage legislation in		
	Eritrea, 28 Jan 2016		
National Radio	Broadcasted in all (9) local languages as News Item  Mr. Zerisenai Andebrhan interviewed about the workshop and ICH inventorying Activities for 45 minutes in Tigrigna (National Radio)	On various dates 17 February 2018	News on National Radio  "Zete ms Dmtsi Hafash" (Discussion with Dmtsi Hafash (National radio) programme
	News about the opening ceremony of the workshop in all nine languages	20 and 21 February 2018	National News
	Mdlaw sened nahgurawi tefelatnet (Preparation of nomination file and international Assistance request) reportage + Interview with the National Expert Dr. Senait Bahta in Tigrigna programme for 30 minutes.  (This programme was translated and aired in various languages)	28 February 2018	"Qrsitatna" Heritage Programme
	News about the closing ceremony of the workshop in all nine languages	01 March 2018	National News
	News report on UNESCO workshop on safeguarding intangible cultural heritage opens in Eritrea, link: <a href="http://www.unesco.org/new/en/nairobi/about-this-office/single-view/news/unesco">http://www.unesco.org/new/en/nairobi/about-this-office/single-view/news/unesco</a> workshop on safeguarding intangible cultural heritage/	22 February 2018	News Article on http://www.unesco.org/new/en/nairobi/
	News reportage on workshop held on Documentation of Cultural Heritage, http://allafrica.com/stories/201802200441.html	19 February 2018	News article on <a href="http://allafrica.com">http://allafrica.com</a>
	News report on training workshop on cultural heritage concludes, Link: <a href="http://www.shabait.com/news/local-news/25865-training-workshop-on-cultural-heritage-concludes">http://www.shabait.com/news/local-news/25865-training-workshop-on-cultural-heritage-concludes</a>	1 March 2018	News article on <a href="http://www.shabait.com">http://www.shabait.com</a>