UNESCO's Memory of the World Programme

Register Sub-Committee (RSC)

Minutes of the 4th and 5thMeeting

Fourth Meeting
UNESCO Headquarters, Paris, 4-5 December 2006;
Archives Nationales, Paris, 6 December 2006.

Members of the Sub-Committee: Roslyn Russell (Chair), Lourdes Blanco (Latin America and the Caribbean region, Rapporteur), Rujaya Abhakorn (Asia and Pacific region), Jan Bos (IFLA), Ray Edmondson (CCAAA), Nada Itani (Arab region), Joan van Albada, substituting for Ken Hall (ICA).

UNESCO Programme Officer:
Joie Springer (Information Society Division)

1. Opening of the meeting

After a welcome to Register Sub-Committee members by Joie Springer, the meeting was opened by the incoming Chair, Roslyn Russell, and those attending introduced themselves. Lourdes Blanco was appointed as Rapporteur *in absentia*. Ray Edmondson agreed to take notes until Lourdes's arrival from the airport.

2. The Agenda

The agenda was adopted as set out (**Appendix 1**). Joan van Albada advised that he would be absent in the morning of Tuesday 5 December as he had a commitment at another meeting.

3. Nominations to the Memory of the World Register

Discussion of the assessments of the nominations to the International Register occupied the first two days of the meeting. Fifty-four nominations were evaluated, based on assessments completed by each member of the RSC according to the assignment set by the Chair and circulated by the Secretariat prior to the meeting. Joie Springer provided visual and textual updates or additional information submitted by the nominators. The Chair of RSC went through the list by number and each member presented the case for the nomination assigned to them.

Decisions were arrived at through consensus after discussion. In accordance with previous practice, members of the Register Sub-Committee agreed that they would not vote on nominations from their own countries, although they would answer questions put to them by other members on issues that arose.

Thirty-two (32) nominations were recommended for inscription on the International Register. Twenty-two (22) were assessed as not meeting the criteria for inscription on the *Memory of the World* International Register, although several were recommended as eligible for inscription on regional or national *Memory of the World* registers. In most cases, members of the RSC put forward suggestions for action to be taken to revise the nominations. Joie Springer undertook to advise the nominators of the status of their nominations, and invite comments and extra information as requested by the RSC. The full list of nominations is to be found in **Appendix 2**.

4. Examination and discussion of selection criteria for the Memory of the World Register.

Discussion was based in the first instance on position papers prepared by IFLA and ICA; implementation guidelines for audiovisual materials, documentary films, provisional inscriptions; and a paper prepared by Ray Edmondson at the request of the 3rd RSC meeting. The authors – Jan Bos (IFLA), Ray Edmondson (CCAAA) and Joan van Albada (ICA) – spoke to their papers. (These papers are among those on the UNESCO Memory of the World website provided for the IAC meeting in Lijiang, China, in 2005.)

The Chair also raised the need to resolve a problem that had been identified during discussion of the nominations: a selection criterion that would encapsulate the regard in which specific items of documentary heritage are held by particular national, ethnic or faith communities. Members discussed many of the proposals implicit in the position papers, in order to define a possible way forward in preparing more appropriate selection criteria.

While IFLA and CCAAA are in broad agreement with the principles and procedures of the *Memory of the World* Programme, as set out in the *General Guidelines to Safeguard Documentary Heritage*, ICA's position has been that the principle of selectivity governing the criteria, which allows the inscription of individual documents and archival fonds, is 'incompatible with archival practices and ethics'. The ICA paper calls for a 'Hall of Fame' or similar distinguishing title, to include all national archives[1]. Up to now, the position of ICA has been that this large nomination of all national archives should be placed on the Memory of the World Register. In discussion in this meeting, Joan van Albada proposed that a 'Hall or Register of Fame' of the most important 'memory' institutions, including national archives, should be set up as a high priority[2]. National archives should explicitly be recognised in the Memory of the World Programme as a whole. The 'Register of Fame' would co-exist with and complement the Memory of the World International Register. As a corollary, Mr van Albada said that ICA had would continue to support individual archives nominating single documents or archival fonds for inscription on the Memory of the World Registers. Indeed, ICA would be pleased to encourage this process once the proposed amendment had been implemented.

The Chair thanked Mr van Albada for this clarification of ICA's views on the position of archives in the *Memory of the World* Programme.

5. *Discussion of new methods to improve evaluation procedures, including revising nomination form.*

Consideration was given to different aspects and interpretations of the nomination form and how nominators can formulate proposals that satisfy the selection criteria. There were a number of suggestions, including that the RSC consider the adoption of the 'community and spiritual significance' criterion used by the Australian *Memory of the World* Committee (this can be viewed in the Manual on the Australian MoW Committee's website – www.amw.org.au).This addresses the problem referred to in 4. *Examination and discussion of*

---

[1] 'national archives' is used as a shorthand expression to describe the entire holdings or total fonds of national archive services. In this context, it does not refer to national archive services as institutions, but rather to all the archival documents held by these institutions. These archives are constantly increasing as a result of continuing transfers of historically significant archives from record-creating agencies to national archive services. Nearly all national archive services are category A members of the International Council on Archives. The addresses of ICA's category A members could act as reference points for national fonds to be included in the proposed 'Register of Fame'.

[2] This list or register might include also institutions like the British Library, the Library of Congress, the Bibliothèque national de France, etc.

selection criteria for the Memory of the World Register, i.e, reflecting the regard in which specific items of documentary heritage are held by particular national, ethnic or faith communities.

There was also a suggestion that one or two examples could be added to the Guidelines to demonstrate how the criterion can be applied. The descriptions should be user friendly, providing successful nominations as exemplars.

Nominators are to be asked to provide names of outside references of specialists or referees.

There was also discussion of ways of making the nomination process easier to undertake, particularly for those who are not first-language speakers of English or French. These included the inclusion of step-by-step procedures, taking the nominee on a 'walk-through' of the procedure of filling out the form (or an update of the one that is already there at Appendix A).

The meeting agreed that Roslyn Russell and Ray Edmondson will revise the form and then turn it over to Lourdes for further review and/or development.

6. Procedures for updating existing inscriptions

A document was circulated in which several aspects of the issue were discussed. The development of a methodology for revisiting the register was suggested, to determine if items still meet the criteria. It was agreed that a monitoring process must be developed and implemented; there will be further discussion of this issue at the March meeting of the RSC

7. Establishment of a Lost Heritage and Missing Register

In order to determine the extent of lost or missing heritage, a format should be established as for the international register: It was suggested that the search for this heritage should be limited to the previous decade, so that the task is not overwhelming. This subject will be dealt with more extensively during the next RSC meeting in March.

8. Other Items

(a)   format of next meeting: it will take the form of a *combined face-to-face meeting and teleconference*, due to the budgetary limitations of the Programme. Joie Springer, along with the Chair, Roslyn Russell, Jan Bos (IFLA), and Ken Hall (ICA) will be present in person at the UNESCO Bonvin building in Paris; other RSC members will be joining by teleconference.

(b)   Items for agenda of June IAC meeting have to be established. These must be agreed to prior to the Bureau meeting 19-20 March.

9. Close of meeting

The Chair thanked the host of the meeting and participants. A guided visit of the French National Archives organised by Joan van Albada was a major highlight of the closing session. Thanks are extended to Mr van Albada and the Archives Nationales de France for making this possible.

rr/re/lb/js

Fifth Meeting:
21 March 2007, UNESCO Headquarters, Paris, and teleconference

Attendees: Joie Springer, Roslyn Russell (Chair), Ray Edmondson, Jan Bos, Ken Hall, Rujaya Abhakorn, Lourdes Blanco (Rapporteur)

1. Opening of the meeting

Welcome to delegates by the Chair, who explained the experimental nature of the combined face-to-face and teleconference. She also extended a special welcome to Ken Hall on joining the Sub-Committee for his first meeting.

There were two major items for discussion by the Sub-Committee:

- The list of 25 nominations (one was withdrawn) which had been discussed at the 4th Register Sub-Committee meeting in Paris in December 2006, and which were returned to their nominators with recommendations or requests for clarification or further information.

- A preliminary draft of revised Selection Criteria sent out the previous day by the Secretariat, amalgamating key ideas from position papers prepared by IFLA, ICA and CCAAA to augment and elucidate the selection criteria.

2. Discussion of the nominations

The members of the RSC discussed each nomination which had not, in the opinion of those attending the December RSC meeting, met the selection criteria and for which additional information and clarification had been requested.

The comments and deliberations of the RSC members as a result of further information supplied resulted in ten additional nominations being recommended for isncription on the Register. The remaining nominations were either recommended for regional or national registers, or their nominators were advised to resubmit their nominations in future rounds.

Comments and contributions by RSC members are reflected in the final recommendations that will go forward to the IAC meeting in Pretoria in June 2007.

3. Comments on report of December meeting

Ray Edmondson sent his comments by email. Lourdes Blanco asked a question about Peru becoming a joint nominator for the Danish nomination (No 28) of Guaman Poma de Ayala's Manuscript had been discussed. Joie Springer confirmed that this had been followed up.

4. Discussion of draft revised Selection Criteria

The draft revised Selection Criteria document was circulated before the meeting. RSC members discussed the desirability of separating the selection criteria from the operational guidelines and working towards the development of a manual that would amplify the methodologies to be applied to nominations, and to make the assessment process clearer for those compiling nominations.

Several RSC members raised issues pertaining to the wording of some sections of the circulated Selection Criteria document, in particular the claim that the Register in its current form is well balanced geographically and culturally. Other members expressed concerns about the definition of 'impact' to determine global significance. It was decided that the RSC would continue to work on the revision of the Selection Criteria and Operational Guidelines.

5. Procedure for updating inscriptions on Register

As the example from Korea relating to the Choson Dynasty documents shows, a procedure is needed to update records listed on the Register when more cognate material is located. World significance does not have to be established, but everything else has to be substantiated in the same way as for a nomination.

Teleconference concluded at 12.30 pm. Face to face meeting (Joie Springer, Jan Bos, Ken Hall, Roslyn Russell) resumed 2.30 pm.

The RSC members in attendance in Paris continued to discuss the revised Selection Criteria, and made a number of decisions relating to the wording of the document (now contained in a draft version). This was subsequently offered to RSC members for comment and approval, along with a version developed by Ray Edmondson. RSC members decided to approve the latter version.

6. Provisional inscriptions

The RSC members discussed the status of provisional inscriptions. Unless more information is produced to establish their global significance or integrity more securely, they are not added to the Register. If this material is located and described, the nomination goes to the RSC to see if the criteria have been met (as in adding additional material to a Register entry)

7. Lost and Missing Heritage Register

The December 2006 RSC meeting decided to limit the time frame for Lost and Missing Heritage to the 20th century, and beyond. Any items to be considered have to have met the criteria for the International Register

The RSC will revisit the Lost and Missing Heritage issue in a couple of years' time when the results of an Australian Memory of the World survey and its lessons are apparent. For the present, we have the publication, *Lost Memory: Libraries and Archives Destroyed in the Twentieth Century*, as an extensive reference to lost documentary heritage. Since this was published there have been other significant losses in Iraq, Timor Leste, many African countries and impacts from tsunamis and hurricanes.

Meeting concluded at 4.30 p.m.

APPENDIX 1

**4ᵗʰ Meeting of the Register Subcommittee (RSC)
of the Memory of the World Programme
UNESCO Headquarters (Bonvin Building, Room B-8.38)
4-6 December 2006
9:30 – 17:30**

Provisional Agenda

1. Opening of the meeting and Introductions

2. Appointment of rapporteur

3. Adoption of agenda

4. Assessment of nominations received and RSC recommendations

5. Examination and discussion of selection criteria for the Memory of the World Register

6. Discussion of new methods to improve evaluation procedures including revising assessment form

7. Procedures for updating existing inscriptions

8. Establishment of a Lost Heritage and Missing Register

9. Other Items
    (a) format of next meeting
    (b) items for agenda of June IAC meeting

10. Closure of meeting

APPENDIX 2

LIST OF NOMINATIONS 2006-2007

EGYPT
Number: 2006-01
Arabic Papyrus Collection

PHILIPPINES
Number: 2006-02
Jose Maceda's Philippine Music Tape Collection

* ~~Number: 2006-03~~

SLOVAKIA
Number: 2006-04
Mining maps and plans of the Main Chamber - Count Office in Banská Stiavnica

* ~~Number: 2006-05~~

PAKISTAN
Number: 2006-06
Political Agencies Press Lists from 1804-1849

UKRAINE
Number: 2006-07
Heirmos: repertoire of Ukranian and Belarusan Church monody from 16th-18th centuries

SOUTH AFRICA
Number: 2006-08
Liberation Struggle Living Archive

EGYPT
Number: 2006-09
Unique Collection of Persian illustrated and illuminated manuscripts

USA
Number: 2006-10
The Wizard of Oz (Victor Fleming 1939), produced by Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer

HUNGARY (in cooperation with Austria, Croatia)
Number: 2006-11
Tabula Hungariae

AUSTRIA
Number: 2006-12
Tabula Peutingeriana

IRAN
Number: 2006-13
Bayasanghori Shâhnâmeh (Prince Bayasanghor's Book of the Kings)

IRAN
Number: 2006-14
Rab' I-rashidi (Rab I-rashidi Endowment) 13th Century Manuscript

IRAN
Number: 2006-15
Deer hide Qurans

INTERNATIONAL COMMITTEE OF THE RED CROSS
Number: 2006-16
Archives of the International Prisoners of War Agency, 1914-1923

PORTUGAL
Number: 2006-17
Corpo Cronológico - Collection of Discovery Manuscripts

CANADA
Number: 2006-18
Fonds du Séminaire de Québec (1623-1800)

CANADA
Number: 2006-19
Hudson's Bay Company fonds

OMAN
Number: 2006-20
Manuscript of Al-Ansab

Number: 2006-21

OMAN
Number: 2006-22
Manuscript of the Holy Quraan

AUSTRALIA
Number: 2006-23
The Story of the Kelly Gang

AUSTRALIA
Number: 2006-24
The convict records of Australia

SOUTH AFRICA
Number: 2006-25
Criminal Court Case No. 253/1963 (State Versus N Mandela and Others)

CHINA
Number: 2006-26
Qing Dynasty Yangshi Lei Archives

SLOVAKIA
Number: 2006-27
Slovak Folk Songs and Bartók Béla

DENMARK
Number: 2006-28
El primer nueva coronica y buen gobierno

SWEDEN
Number: 2006-29
Ingmar Bergman Archives

SWEDEN
Number: 2006-30
Alfred Nobel Family Archives

VENEZUELA
Number: 2006-31
Colombeia: Generalissimo Francisco de Miranda's archives

UNITED KINGDOM
Number: 2006-32
Hereford Mappa Mundi

GERMANY
Number: 2006-33
Collection of manuscript papers of Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz

GERMANY
Number: 2006-34
Construction and Fall of the Berlin Wall and The Two-plus-Four-Treaty of 1990

LATIN AMERICA (Bolivia, Colombia, Mexico and Peru)
Number: 2006-35
American Colonial Music

MEXICO
Number: 2006-36
Colección de Lenguas Indígenas

EUROPE (Poland, Russian Federation and Slovenia)
Number: 2006-37
Codex Suprasliensis - Mineia četia, Mart (The Supraśl Codex - Menology, March)

POLAND
Number: 2006-38
National Education Commission Archives

BELGIUM
Number: 2006-39
Collection of Musical Fragments from the 10th to the 16th Century

ARGENTINA
Number: 2006-40
Human Rights Documentary Heritage 1976 - 1983

* *Number: 2006-41*

SPAIN
Number: 2006-42
Santa Fe Capitulations

SPAIN
Number: 2006-43
Treaty of Tordesillas of 7 June 1494

FRANCE
Number: 2006-44
Tapisserie de Bayeux

THAILAND
Number: 2006-45
Thai Laws and Proclamations on the Abolition of Slavery published in the Royal Gazette (1874-1911)

GREECE
Number: 2006-46
Olympic Anthem

KOREA
Number: 2006-47
Printing woodblocks of the Tripitaka Koreana and miscellaneous Buddhist scriptures

KOREA
Number: 2006-48
Uigwe: Records of Royal Protocols in the Court of Joseon Dynasty

HUNGARY (in association with Croatia, Serbia Slovakia and Slovenia)
Number: 2006-49
Classical Multi-ethnic Collection of Traditional Music by Béla Bartók, Zoltán Kodály and their followers (1896-1945)

AFRICA
Number: 2006-50
Unpublished Papers of Christopher Okigbo

CZECH REPUBLIC
Number: 2006-51

Medieval manuscripts of the Czech Reformation

CZECH REPUBLIC
Number: 2006-52
Collection of Russian, Ukrainian and Belorussian émigré periodicals 1918-1945

NICARAGUA
Number: 2006-53
National Literacy Campaign Archives

PACIFIC
Number: 2006-54
Original unpublished drawings and paintings of scientific phenomena from French Pacific Ocean exploration voyages (1768-1846)

* *Number: 2006-55*

DENMARK
Number: 2006-56
Sound Toll Registers

INDIA
Number: 2006-57
Gilgit manuscripts

INDIA
Number: 2006-58
Rigvedasamhita, Rigvedasamhita-Padapatha and Rigvedasamhitabhashya

* Nos 3, 5, 21 withdrawn; Nos 41 and 55 technically incomplete.