AFRICAN UNION

Development of A Teacher Support and Motivation Framework (TSMF) for African countries

Report of the workshop of the literature review and research tools, 23-24 Jan 2017, Addis Ababa.

Table of content

I. Background

In Sub-Saharan Africa, where teacher attrition rates are reportedly as high as 30% and there are high levels of teacher absenteeism, the need for motivated teaching staff is crucial.

A 2007 synthesis report (Akyeampong & Bennell, 2007) of 12 studies undertaken in Ghana*, Kenya, Lesotho, Malawi, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Tanzania, and Zambia found that "*very sizeable proportions of primary school teachers have low levels of job satisfaction and are poorly motivated. Tens of millions of children are, therefore, not being taught properly and are not receiving even a minimally acceptable education. The unavoidable conclusion is that most schooling systems are faced with what amounts to a teacher motivation crisis…*"[1]

The findings of this report require a call to action, not only to develop tools to address this crisis, but to establish reliable reporting and monitoring mechanisms for trends in teacher motivation (TM).

At the global level, UNESCO-IICBA participated in the 9th International Policy Dialogue Forum organized by the International Teachers' Task Force (ITTF) in Siem Reap, Cambodia. The Forum's theme centered on : "Motivating teachers: what do we know? And what do we need to achieve the Education 2030 Agenda?" highlighting teacher motivation as a key concept in in the Incheon Declaration: "*We will ensure that teachers and educators are empowered, adequately recruited, well-trained, professionally qualified, motivated and supported within well-resourced, efficient and effectively governed systems.*"

During the deliberations, UNESCO-IICBA intention to develop a teacher support and motivation framework for Africa was discussed. The framework sets out to support a joined-up, comprehensive approach to teacher motivation at institutional and school levels that is not there yet and goes beyond the usual dialogue around teacher salaries and professionalization. It will provide countries with policy and strategy options to address the issue at regional, country and school levels and seek to demonstrate the impacts of such strategies on teaching quality and practice at school level.

Understanding the triggers for teacher motivation is key to attracting and retaining teachers in the profession and an important component for building conducive teaching and learning environments at school level. A teacher support and motivation framework is subsequently a critical tool within a broader education strategy designed to improve the quality of instruction and learning outcomes, to improve access for vulnerable populations, to increase literacy rates.

UNESCO–IICBA is capitalizing on a number of initial outputs as inputs to the development of a Teacher Support and Motivation Framework for Africa. Along with its partners, the Institute has already begun working at the intersection of advocacy, technical support, research and regional peer learning to advance the evidence base on what works best in the area of teacher motivation and support strategies in the African region.

---

[1]Akyeampong and Bennell (2007) "Over one-third of all the teachers at the survey primary schools in five of the six extended case study countries indicated that teachers at their school are 'poorly' or 'very poorly' motivated. Motivation levels appear to be chronically low in Ghana and Zambia"

This includes the completion of abroad conceptual framework for the whole exercise, an extensive literature review, the conceptualization of a research approach, and the design of tools and their testing.

II. Objectives of Workshop

The objectives of the January workshop were to meet among technical partners in order to:

1. review progress and different outputs to date and harmonize approaches;
2. look into the main findings of the literature review;
3. agree on the methodological approach and the design of the tools,
4. formulate a way forward;
5. discuss the African perspective which will feed into the global study conducted by the Teachers' Task Force on teacher support and motivation.

III. Format of the Meeting and Participants

The meeting took place at the UNESCO-IICBA office, Congo Building, UNECA Compound, Addis Ababa Ethiopia from 23 to 24 January 2017. There were 12 participants representing UNESCO-IICBA, consultants, FAWE, the African Union and ADEA.

The first day of the meeting focused on discussing the overall process of developing the TSMF for Africa. Presentations and discussions included:

(i) the conceptual framework for the exercise, summary of the literature review and findings;
(ii) the methodological approach and the designed tools created by consultants;
(iii) and feedback sessions.

The second day of the meeting included discussions on the outline for the way forward and a presentation of scenarios for cooperation with education stakeholders and partners.

IV. First Day: 23 January 2017

IV.1 Opening Remarks

Dr. **Yumiko Yokozeki, Director of UNESCO-IICBA,** welcomed the meeting participants and invited them to introduce themselves as well as briefly share stories about inspiring teachers in their lives. She also shared IICBA's vision and mission around teacher development and support, and in particular teacher motivation. She emphasized that motivation is key for teacher professional development as part of achieving SDG 4 and highlighted that teacher motivation is currently the focus of much attention at the global level, thus necessitating for UNESCO-IICBA to provide support and a framework for implementation in Africa.

IV.2 TSMF: Process and Phases of Development

Mr. Omar Diop, Senior Programme Specialist at UNESCO IICBA explained the background of IICBA's initiatives regarding teacher motivation. One of the Institute's main programs focuses on 'Teacher policy development and capacity building' in which teacher motivation is a component. After developing a practical guide for countries to develop national teacher policies and address learning outcomes in the context of SDG4 and CESA, IICBA launched its policy tool during the celebration of World Teachers' Day (WTD) in September 2016.

With WTD 2016 also marking the 50th anniversary of UNESCO/ILO recommendations on conditions of service of teachers IICBA profited from the occasion to convene a seminar with African stakeholders, partners, ILO and Education International in Addis Ababa. One of the key recommendations emerging from the seminar was the need to elaborate a Concept Note for the development of the TSMF for Africa.

The purpose of the concept note was two-fold: (1) to present a methodological framework for the development of TSMF, and (2) to propose actionable dimensions of the TMSF that could be engaged at the sub-regional and country levels to improve teacher motivation and hence student learning outcomes in Africa. IICBA then engaged two consultants to:

1. develop the literature review;
2. map the best practices in Africa and similar contexts;
3. develop the research tools.

Mr. Diop then invited **Ms. Carmela Salzano** to discuss the literature review, findings, dimensions and references, and **Dr. John Oliphant** to present the design of the research exercise.

IV.3 Presentation 1: The literature review, findings, dimensions and references

Ms. Carmela Salzano presented the literature review. She explained that the aims of the review were to:

- seek conceptual clarification on what we mean by teacher motivation;
- identify the nature and scope of factors affecting teacher motivation in different contexts;
- identify the extent to which teacher motivation strategies are adequately addressed within existing national education/teacher policies and legislation in African countries;
- identify intervention frameworks developed by international development partners, civil society, the private sector, community organizations, local action networks, social entrepreneurs, and philanthropic and development foundations;
- identify best practice examples and articulate lessons learned;
- identify approaches for measuring the effectiveness of TSMFs at national and school levels, focusing on the impact on education quality, teachers' conditions of service and learning outcomes.

She mentioned that the literature review was principally internet-based - looking across literature sources on teacher motivation written by NGOs, university doctoral students, research institutions, and UN agencies to capture insights and seek out practice in the African context as well as more generally in low-middle income and crisis-affected countries. The review uncovered over 100 studies and practice-related documents. Each document was briefly examined and categorized under the following headings:

- Country;
- Thematic area;
- TM analytic frameworks and tools;
- Type of evidence: conceptual; practice-based; evidence-based.

Some key points in her presentation on the first part of the literature review were:

- **Quick overview of key issues**

There has been a marked increase in academic and NGO research on teacher motivation in low-middle income countries over the past 16 years. Education institutes and NGOs such as Voluntary Service Overseas (VSO), ActionAid, Save the Children and the Aga Khan Foundation have produced seminal studies on teacher motivation as far back as 2001/2002 focusing on:

1) understanding what influences teachers in their career choice,
2) how various factors positively or negatively impact a teacher's sense of job satisfaction,
3) the impact of TM over time on different dimensions of education policy and the extent of a teacher crisis, if any

These studies have been extremely useful in increasing knowledge on how teacher motivation is influenced by different policy, management, and qualitative dimensions of education systems, school contexts and professional issues that matter a lot to teachers themselves.

- **The teacher motivation crisis in Africa**

There is a noted decline in teacher motivation and morale across Africa. Teaching is not generally perceived as a good career choice and sometimes even a choice of last resort. This has resulted in thousands of teachers dropping out of the profession and others teaching unenthusiastically in ways that do not advance learning. The manifestations of this TM crisis include:

1) Low professional commitment to classroom preparation and instruction;
2) High rates of daily teacher's absence;
3) Opposition or lack of enthusiasm for education reforms;
4) Industrial action or the threat of industrial action.

- **Understanding the causes**

As underlined by Save the Children US in 2011, some of the contributing factors to the low morale of teachers include:

1) Low and irregular salary payments;
2) Societal respect for teachers has fallen;
3) Teachers face weak accountability with little support;
4) Teaching is often a second-choice job with few opportunities for professional development;
5) Teachers face unclear and constantly changing policies as well as poor management;
6) Teachers rarely have an opportunity for input into school management and ministry policy;
7) Teachers have few or poor learning materials and poor physical facilities.

The influencing factors for teacher motivation can be broadly classified into:

1) Context;
2) level;
3) School level;
4) Teacher

Teacher motivation patterns emerging from the research

1) Rural versus urban – There is a general assumption that it is more demotivating to work in rural areas than urban. Based on findings, this is not entirely true as urban areas also have their own challenges that demotivate teachers.
2) Qualified versus non-qualified teachers – There were no sizeable differences between the motivation levels of qualified and unqualified teachers. Additionally, that qualification and motivation was strongly influenced by age.
3) Primary versus secondary – Motivation among secondary school teachers was observed to be higher than among primary school teachers.
4) Private versus government schools – Based on a number of findings, private school teachers were reported to be more motivated than their public counterparts.
5) Male versus female – There were contrasting findings about who between the two genders were more motivated.

- **Why is TM important to policy and practice?**

From a policy and practice perspective, greater understanding and investments are needed in teacher motivation strategies for several reasons:

1) Attracting and retaining teachers, and protecting the benefits of major investments in the teaching corps
2) Effectiveness of education reform efforts
3) Equitable and efficient deployment of teachers across countries
4) The impacts on learning outcomes

IV.4 Discussion on the Literature Review

Some important points from the literature review were brought up during the discussion. The participants actively provided their feedback:

- **Mr. Virgilio Juvane** pointed out the potential, as well as value, of the TSMF specifically for supporting professional development of African teachers and the literature review should subsequently address specific issues in Africa such as the demographic dividend and anticipating the challenges it may bring for teachers.

- **Dr. Temechegn Engida** and **Dr. Binyam Sisay** mentioned the importance of raising the issue of gender preference within the teaching profession and career development path. This included how gender issues influence the choice of becoming teachers in primary and secondary schools.

- **Ms. Martha Muhwezi** reminded the participants that in countries with extremely high rates of youth unemployment, teaching may be the only profession that qualified graduates can

obtain. Therefore, in some contexts, the high qualification levels of those teachers may be ignored.

- **Dr. John Oliphant** stated that teacher motivation is a complex issue. We need to look at teachers as agents of change at the classroom level, especially concerning how they cope with daily challenges to teaching and learning. Teachers should be solicited to contribute their own understanding of what types of interventions are needed to support them for both professional growth and raising their own motivation levels.

In response to the forum's feedback, **Ms**. **Carmela Salzano** agreed on the need to underline the influence of deployment policies and strategies in considering gender issues in teacher motivation. It is understandable that we need more research about gender issues in the teaching profession and how they impact teacher motivation.

IV.5 Presentation 2: The Design of the Research Exercise

Dr. John Oliphant presented the research instruments that he developed as well as piloted. They have mostly been drawn from the literature review and largely adapted from questionnaire and interview tools used by Save the Children (2011) and Bennell and Akyeampong (2007). The questionnaire represents the following dimensions in teacher motivation:

- salary/pay and remuneration
- career structure and professional development
- teacher professional status
- availability of teaching/learning materials/facilities
- working and living conditions
- teachers' voice
- school leadership and management
- teacher autonomy and accountability

The instruments have been developed in two categories. Category A consists of a questionnaire, interviews and observations for teachers and school principals, while Category B focuses on strategic and purposive interviews with Save the Children, STIR Education, VSO, the World Bank and Education International on related work that has already been carried out.

Dr. Oliphant reported that the instruments of Category A had undergone a pilot testing in Lesotho to see the clarity, validity as well as how much tie the respondents may need to answer the questions. The pilot testing involved teachers in five public schools and one private school. Those schools were chosen based on convenience for representing a range of schools from very low to average, good, and high performance based on national exams and any other related factors on both teachers and students. All the respondents returned all the questionnaires within four days.

IV.6 Discussion on Design of the Research Exercise

- **Dr. Temechegn Engida** suggested that the scope of the Teacher Motivation Framework should not only focus on sub-Saharan Africa (SSA), but include all African countries. It is understandable that both the literature review and the research design mostly referred to the research conducted by NGOs so far in SSA. However, considering that UNESCO IICBA's

commitment to supporting teacher policy in Africa, the framework should include the conditions of teacher motivation in all African countries.

- **Ms. Martha Muhwezi** pointed out the importance of involving gender issues in the instruments. She agreed to review the instruments and provide links to the gender aspects.
- **Dr. Binyam Mendisu** suggested interviewing the best teachers in Africa to see what motivates them. This will also provide the best teachers with an opportunity to contribute ideas for the quality development of their profession.
- **Dr. Beatrice Njenga** mentioned the need for the framework to refer to the teacher study conducted by the African Union. This is to clarify the fact that due to societal prejudice, sometimes teachers attend college without the motivation to become an educator. Additionally, she suggested observing and improving upon teacher motivation by making comparisons to other professions. The framework should clearly define teachers in the research.
- **Mr. Virgilio Juvane** emphasized the need to involve a number of diverse groups of teachers. He stressed that clear reasons must be provided for categorization as well.

V. Second Day: 24 January 2017

V.1 Summary of Day 1

Mr. Omar Diop briefly summarized the discussions from the first day and stressed the following points for developing both the literature review as well as the instruments:

- Focusing on the target of specific teachers (basic education);
- Involving the gender aspects in the instruments;
- Focusing on all African countries rather than only sub-Saharan Africa;
- Incorporating the work of the African Union reports on teachers;
- Identifying the gaps by referring to any previous research;
- Considering the diversity of Africa (demographics are important);
- Using all UNESCO networks in collecting data from countries and schools (example: Aspnet or the UNESCO National Commissions);
- Considering student involvement in collecting data to reflect better on the learning perspective;
- The need for providing a publication related to the project and summarizing the literature review undergone;
- Providing all documents in English and French.

In line with the summary, **Dr. Yumiko Yokozeki** suggested the need to contact all the regional offices of UNESCO in Africa to see if they have any existing resources or related studies to support the framework. In addition, **Mr. Virgilio Juvane** also emphasized an aspect of the methodology that includes the scope of all Africa.

Mr. Omar Diop recognized the need for adding examples from North Africa in the literature review, as well as capturing all upcoming issues on teacher motivation and support. **Dr**. **Binyam Mendisu** then also suggested making reference to countries that excel in teacher motivation.

V.2 Scenarios of the Way Forward and Brainstorming for the Operationalization

Ms. Carmela Salzano's presentation started the session on the second part of the literature review. Some key points in her presentation were:

- **Traditional and emerging responses**

She briefly presented that on the part of governments and development partners; there is a need to focus on systemic, extrinsic solutions for the teaching (and teacher motivation) crisis through:

1) Recruitment and incentive strategies to attract, reward, and retain teachers in the profession (mainly pecuniary measures);
2) Deployment policies to ensure that adequate numbers of teachers are deployed to rural and hard-to-reach areas;
3) Redressing low salaries;
4) Addressing the professionalization and status of teachers;
5) Training-based interventions.

Some shortcomings that we need to anticipate in TM:

1) Failure to enforce teachers' rights to better working conditions as outlined by national legislation, professional standards and the ILO/UNESCO recommendations;
2) Piecemeal and unsustainable salary and monetary solutions;
3) Extrinsic solutions based on a weak understanding of how contextual, political, and school-based factors and personal variables interact to lower TM;
4) Ignorance of complexities involved in TM, which makes the design of standardized TM strategies very difficult;
5) Overlooking the importance of self-actualization, autonomy, and responsibility on teacher morale;
6) Ignoring the complex nature of the teaching-learning process in which intrinsic teacher motivation is affected by, and is a major ingredient in, the 'production' of education quality.

Some emerging approaches that we can take into account:

1) Approaches based on voice and social dialogue
2) Approaches based on school leadership and improvement
3) Approaches based on teachers as change makers and problem solvers
4) Approaches focusing on school/cluster level professional development
5) Approaches based on communities of teaching professionals working together at local levels
6) Appraisal/evaluation as part of professional development

Finally, there some best practices that we can learn from researching TM:

1) Recognizing teachers' agency
2) Developing the individual and collective capacity of teachers
3) Acknowledging the importance of working with and across school communities and local stakeholders

- **Monitoring and evaluation:**

Ms. Salzano revealed that even though it would be practically impossible to make a uniform monitoring and evaluation framework that produces simplistic conclusions about whether a teacher motivation program is effective or not, monitoring activities on teacher motivation are still needed in order to: i) mobilize knowledge; ii) ensure that relevant stakeholders have access to that knowledge to inform debates and decisions about how to improve teacher motivation locally and nationally, and; iii) contribute to a growing evidence base for greater financial investments in teacher motivation initiatives.

While explaining the implementation process of Impact Evaluation and Randomized Control Trials (RCTs), she mentioned two important reasons for them. The first reason is that the participation of teachers in Impact Evaluations in itself can strengthen 'Voice' and teacher motivation, and the second one is that more innovative, collaborative program evaluation designs are needed that promote the reception and use of such information by local education officials in real time, rather than after a program is completed

- **Tools and resources**

Ms. Salzano explained that the literature review revealed a number of analytic frameworks, surveys, questionnaires, and diagnostic tools that have emerged through partners such as VSO, Save the Children US, and the Teacher Motivation Working Group, which can be built up in the development of a Teacher Support and Motivation Framework for Africa.

To incorporate the research from the literature review as well as the feedback from the first day discussion, Dr. John Oliphant has planned to develop the instruments using the following aspects:

1) Comparing teaching with any other profession
2) Addressing the general conditions of Africa, not only SSA
3) Addressing gender issues
4) Addressing pre- and in-service training separately
5) Involving the results of a teacher study conducted by the African Union
6) Considering any issues on the use of observation and interview for various NGOs (FAWE, Natcom, Education International, ADEA, ANCEFA, STIR, Aga Khan and Save the Children)
7) Considering the examples from Nordic and Singapore
8) Providing the tools in two languages (English and French)

Mr. Virgilio Juvane suggested designing a timeline for all activities in developing the framework as well as conducting the project. To follow up his suggestion, Mr. Omar Diop proposed the following plan:

1) Ms. Carmela Salzano and Dr. John Oliphant will prepare 2 – 3 pages for discussing the budget with partners;
2) Final documents before the ADEA meeting on 15 - 17 March
3) Organize a meeting for partners in June 2017.

VI. Closing Remarks

Mr. Lawalley Cole from ADEA thanked IICBA for starting this important work. He suggested establishing a steering committee as soon as the project is implemented in the African region.

Dr. Beatrice Njenga from the African Union Commission also expressed her appreciation for being involved in the meeting as a representative of the African Union. She re-emphasized the importance of reviving the PACTED through the cluster meetings. In addition, as part of her support to the project, she will send the data and instruments from the teacher study conducted by the African Union to enrich the data in the literature review.

On behalf of the Director of UNESCO-IICBA, **Mr. Virgilio Juvane** thanked all participants in the workshop. He appreciates all feedback from the two-day discussion and conveyed his gratitude for the work of the consultants for both the literature review and the design of the instruments. He highlighted the commitment of UNESCO-IICBA to providing more support for the professional development of teachers in Africa.

Contacts for the study:

- Mr. Mame Omar DIOP, Senior Program Specialist, UNESCO IICBA, o.diop@unesco.org

- Mr. Virgilio Juvane, Program Coordinator, UNESCO-IICBA, v.juvane@unesco.org

Annex 1: List of Participants

No	Name	Organization	Email address
1.	Yumiko Yokozeki	UNESCO IICBA	y.yokozeki@unesco.org
2.	Virgillio Juvane	UNESCO IICBA	v.juvane@unesco.org
3.	Omar Diop	UNESCO IICBA	o.diop@unesco.org
4.	Binyam Sisay Mendisu	UNESCO IICBA	bs.mendisu@unesco.org
5.	Temechegn Engida	UNESCO IICBA	t.engida@unesco.org
6	Indriyati Rodjan	UNESCO IICBA	i.rodjan@unesco.org
7.	Peter Kiteyi	UNESCO IICBA	p.lilande@unesco.org
8.	John Oliphant	Consultant (Lesotho)	jn.oliphant@gmail.com
9.	Carmela Salzano	Consultant	mella_s@hotmail.com
10.	Martha Muhwezi	FAWE	MMuhwezi@fawe.org
11.	Beatrice Njenga	African Union	NjengaB@africa-union.org
12.	Lawalley Cole	ADEA	coleL@africa.union.org

Annex 2: Way Forward, Output and Timeline

Way Forward

1. Incorporating 2-3 examples from North Africa, Francophone, Lusophone into the literature review;
2. Using the African Union's Teacher Study and data;
3. Widening the piloting by using existing networks (Fawe, Natcoms, EI, ADEA, ANCEFA, etc.);
4. Providing some examples that may be drawn from Nordic countries and others;
5. Using the results of observations conducted by STIR, Aga Khan Foundation, Save the children, etc.;
6. Conducting interviews with the African Union, Education International, NGOs, etc.;
7. Translating tools into English and French
8. Providing more specific background on the long term Agenda 2063 and the CESA with recommendations from WTD 2016
9. Preparing a 3-4 page document on the exercise and what is left to be done, including the key steps, timeline, and its cost

Output:

1. The final tools with feedback
2. The final literature review with feedback

Timeline

No	Activities	Deliverables	Expected time
1.	Integrating teacher study conducted by the African Union into parts of the literature review	• Ms. Beatrice Njenga will send the files of the study to Mr. Omar Diop to share with all participants in this meeting. • Ms. Carmela Salzano will integrate the study into the literature review	Week 4 January 2017
2.	Integrating gender aspects in the instruments	• Ms. Martha Muhwezi will review the instruments and integrate the gender aspects. • Dr. John Oliphant will finalize the instruments • All instruments will be shared to all partners during ADEA meeting	Week 1 March 2017
3.	Meeting among partners	UNESCO IICBA will organize a meeting with partners to discuss	June 2017
4.	Writing 2-3 pages on budget discussion	Ms. Carmela Salzano and Dr. John Oliphant will prepare the document before theADEA meeting	March 2017