

END TERM EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT
“RETAINING GIRLS IN LOWER SECONDARY SCHOOLS AND
INCREASING THEIR LEARNING OUTCOMES IN AFAR AND
BENISHANGUL GUMUZ REGIONAL STATES, ETHIOPIA”

Final Report

FOUNTAIN MANAGEMENT CONSULTANCY

March 2016

ADDIS ABABA

ETHIOPIA

END TERM EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT
“RETAINING GIRLS IN LOWER SECONDARY SCHOOLS AND
INCREASING THEIR LEARNING OUTCOMES IN AFAR AND
BENISHANGUL GUMUZ REGIONAL STATES, ETHIOPIA”

Submitted to
UNESCO-IICBA

By
FOUNTAIN MANAGEMENT CONSULTANCY

Consultants
Befekadu Zeleke, PhD
Seleshi Zeleke, PhD

March, 2016

Table of Contents

Content	Page
Table of Contents	3
List of Tables	4
Acronyms	5
Executive Summary	6
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	10
1.1. Background	10
1.2. Objectives of the Evaluation	11
1.3. Purposes of the Evaluation	12
1.4. Scope and Focus of the Evaluation	13
1.5. Key Questions of the Final Evaluation	14
CHAPTER TWO: EVALUATION METHODS	16
2.1. The Study Sites	16
2.2. Data Sources	16
2.3. Data Collection Tools/Methods	18
2.4. Methods of Data Analysis	19
2.5. Ethical Considerations	20
2.6. Procedure	20
CHAPTER THREE: RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	21
3.1. Relevance of the Project	21
3.2. Efficiency of the Project	24
3.3. Effectiveness of the Project	32
3.4. Impact of the Project	44
3.5. Sustainability of the Project	47
3.6. Challenges Encountered	49
3.7. Lessons Learned	51
CHAPTER FOUR: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	53
5.1. Conclusion	53
5.2. Recommendations	54
References	58
ANNEXES	59

List of Tables

Table No.	Table Title	Page
Table 1	Size of the Sample Respondents by Region, Respondent Type and Sex	17
Table 2	Number of Direct Beneficiaries by Region and School	28
Table 3	Preliminary Planning	33
Table 4	Conducting Baseline Survey Study and Validating Findings	34
Table 5	Capacity Building Training Workshops for Teacher Educators and School Management Staff	35
Table 6	Supportive Supervision Provided	36
Table 7	Strengthening Community–School Partnership and Advocacy on Girls’ Education	37
Table 8	Exploring Income Generating Possibilities to Support Girls’ Education	38
Table 9	Type of IGAs by Region and School and their Status and Overall Effectiveness	38
Table 10	Conduct mid-term and end-of-project evaluation	39
Table 11	Pass Rate (in Percent) of Female Students on the Tenth Grade National Examination	42
Table 12	Dropout Rate (in Percent) of Female Students in Grades 9 and 10	44

Acronyms

CTE	College of Teacher Education
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GESS	Girls' Education Support Structure
GRP	Gender Responsive Pedagogy
GSECE	General Secondary Education Certificate Examination
HTPs	Harmful Traditional Practices
KAP	Knowledge, Attitude and Practice
MOE	Ministry of Education
PTA	Parent -Teacher Association
REB	Regional Education Bureau
TOR	Terms of Reference
UNESCO-IICBA	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization – International Institute for Capacity Building in Africa

Executive Summary

The objectives of this study was to conduct an end-term evaluation of the project “Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing their Learning Outcomes in Ethiopia” which was implemented in six schools of the Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regions, three schools in each region.

To achieve the objectives of the project, UNESCO-IICBA in partnership with the Regional Education Bureaus and the schools

- (1) Sensitize teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process through training in gender-sensitive pedagogy.
- (2) Build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools.
- (3) Strengthen School-Community Partnerships to assist the retention of girls in schools.
- (4) Increase the retention of girls in lower secondary grades and improve their learning outcomes through a multi-faceted intervention.
- (5) Establishing income generating schemes to support economically weak female students

The main objective of this end term evaluation was to examine relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the project. To achieve this, both primary and secondary qualitative and quantitative data were gathered using questionnaire, interviews and FGDs from 309 respondents.

Analyses of both the quantitative and qualitative data provided the following results.

- (1) In addition to its consistency with the government’s policies and strategies, the project was launched after a baseline survey was conducted. The baseline survey reported analysis of the situation in the project schools in general and the needs of female students in particular. It was based on the evidence reported in the baseline survey that the project was launched. Hence it was relevant.
- (2) The efficiency of the project was mainly evaluated based on time and financial efficiency. There is some consensus that there was a delay at the initial phase of the project and that

affected the implementation process up until the end. The IGA in each school is a case in point. Some schools have started the IGAs whereas others have planned to launch the IGA in the near future. In contrast, the project was successful in conducting the planned training workshops and creating support structure at the community level.

In a similar manner, financial efficiency of the project was not impressive. Because of the delay in implementation, the project schools have yet to utilize more than 40 percent of the fund allocated for IGAs. Whereas the total budget allocated for IGAs for the two regions was 164,000, about 60 percent of this fund has been utilized so far. However, the project was found to be efficient because the money spent particularly in conducting the training workshops is meaningful when one observes the changes that occur in attitudes, beliefs and practices of the different stakeholders in relation to female students' education.

- (3) The project's effectiveness was evaluated by examining the objectives and the achievements and the gap between the two. The project was found to be very effective particularly in conducting the training workshops. Through the training, the project has built the capacity of principals, teachers, and PTA members on gender responsive pedagogy, gender sensitive classroom management, and gender sensitive lesson planning which helped the school community to treat female students better. Male students also treat their female counterparts far better now than before. On the other hand, not all IGAs were effective. In some schools such as Werer, Asayita, Wombera the IGA appeared to be effective. In other schools (e.g., Aba'ala and Belo Jiganfoy), the IGAs were not effective. In Aba'ala Secondary School, for example, the first IGA (cattle fattening) has failed due to the drought which affected the area and the school have proposed another after selling the cattle. Thus, depending on the activities and the project schools, the project was effective in some regards. **but not in others.**
- (4) Evaluating the impact of the IGA component of the project was found to be difficult because the status of the IGA component is not only different from one project school to another but in some schools the IGA has yet to start functioning fully. Focusing on the impact of the completed components of the training, one can say that the project had an impact particularly in changing students and teachers' attitudes toward girls' education, male students and teachers' treatment of girls, gender based violence, and parents' attitudes toward girls' education. There appears to be positive changes in relation to female students' treatment and

support and the changes, according to the respondents, are attributable to the training provided to the different groups of stakeholders.

- (5) Both institutional and financial sustainability of the project was judged favorably by the different groups of stakeholders. Because the project has built the capacity of teachers, school principals and PTA members, the institutional sustainability of the changes is ensured. In addition, the financial sustainability of the project is promising because of the IGAs already launched in five schools and IGAs yet to be launched in one of the schools. Unlike other projects that merely focus on financial support to needy female students without any income generation scheme, the present project focuses on IGAs that will generate income for years to come to support female students beyond the project's life time.

In conclusion, the project has contributed considerably to the education of girls in the six project schools. The capacity building trainings provided to different groups of stakeholders were very effective in bringing about positive changes in teachers, PTA members, school principals and students. First, because of the training they received on GRP, teachers have become more gender sensitive in the teaching learning process including lesson planning. Second, the capacity of principals and other school management staff has been built through training and they have become more sensitive on gender issues (e.g., GBV) that impact female students' education. Third, the school-community partnership has been strengthened and as a result there is more awareness among community members about the importance of girls' education. Fourth, even though the results are not yet satisfactory or consistent across the project schools, there were small positive changes observed in relation to pass rate and dropout rate of female students.

Regarding the IGAs, one cannot say much at present although many of the stakeholders have very positive expectations. Many consider the IGA as the main component of the project which will make the desired changes and project outcomes sustainable.

Despite its achievements, the project has faced several challenges. These include the absence of a focal person exclusively for the project at region level, delay in implementation of the project in general and release of the project fund in particular, turnover of school principals and distance of the project schools from the regional capitals and from each other. These challenges appeared to have impacted the project implementation negatively.

Finally, the end term evaluation presents recommendations that help similar future interventions produce better impacts and outcomes. The first recommendation is concerned with follow up of the project in the schools. Because the project is still in progress in the schools, there is a need to follow up and monitor the schools. Second, because the impacts of the GRP training are encouraging, strengthening the training in the project schools could produce more desirable outcomes. Third, given the prevalent poverty in the communities of the two regions, there is a need to scale up the project results in other schools of the two regions.

Fourth, if UNESCO-IICBA decides to scale up the project outcomes in other schools of the two regions, it is important to hire a livelihood expert at least on part-time basis to help guide and advise the schools to identify and conduct frequent supervision. Finally, there is a need to conduct a workshop that brings as many stakeholders as possible from the six project schools to discuss their achievements, the challenges they faced, and the way forward. Such a workshop is especially important because the six project schools are at different stages of implementation of the project. Besides, the stakeholders can also share their experiences pertaining to IGAs and because the project schools have launched different IGAs, such a discussion and experience sharing will be valuable.

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background

The need to educate girls just like boys cannot only be justified on equity grounds. Both anecdotal evidence and results of research have shown that the education of girls has a lot of positive social returns. One of these is delaying the age of marriage for girls, thereby minimizing the social and physical costs of early marriage. According to the International Center for Research on Women (ICRW), "Higher levels of education - particularly attending secondary school - can protect girls from early marriage. Research shows that schooling helps girls develop aspirations and gives them skills to negotiate who and when they will marry" (2007, p.4).

The other benefit of keeping girls in school as long as possible is that they will be empowered, as a result of the education they receive, to take better care of themselves. This in turn shall help reduce eventual maternal mortality, and will result in better child rearing practices that will bring about reduced child mortality.

The education of girls also affects the eventual success of their children. It is believed that children born to more educated mothers perform better at school as they get the necessary help from their mothers at home. This in turn leads to better efficiency of the education system of a country; and creates a more egalitarian society with as many women represented in the workplace and in decision making roles as men, creating a more just and peaceful world in the process.

While the returns from the education of girls are numerous as discussed above, it has not been possible to achieve these due to entrenched attitudes and values that discourage the equal participation of girls in the education system of most countries in the world. Girls remain marginalized and the unequal opportunities accorded to boys and girls are hurting not only individuals, but also the society as a whole. The main objective of this project was to address the issues of retention of girls in lower secondary schools (Grades 9 and 10) and the factors that inhibit their performance. The project planned to do these through capacity building interventions targeting teacher education institutions, teacher trainees, community leaders, school management

staff and girls as well as boys in six selected schools in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regions in Ethiopia.

It is strongly believed that this project could contribute in creating a favorable environment for girls to stay in school at least to the end of the lower secondary level and to improve their learning achievement through interventions that focused on making teaching gender-sensitive and responsive, creating awareness in the community about the benefits of educating girls, making the school management supportive by making the school environment more conducive for girls, and engaging boys in this endeavor as much as girls.

The major goal of the project was improving the retention of girls in lower secondary schools in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regions of Ethiopia, both of which have higher than the national average dropout rate for girls, and improve their learning outcomes as measured by the Ethiopian General Secondary Education Certificate Examination (GSECE).

1.2. Objectives of the Project

The project entitled “Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and increasing their Learning Outcomes in Ethiopia” aimed to reduce the dropout rate of girls in the six project schools, three per region, by 20% at the end of the project period. It is also expected that the girls in the six schools would show an improvement in their learning achievement of 15 percentage points as measured by the Ethiopian General Secondary Education Certificate Examination (EGSECE).

Specific Objectives

The project has the following specific objectives.

- Sensitize teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process through training in gender-sensitive pedagogy.
- Build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender issues that impact the learning of girls in the project schools.
- Strengthen school-community partnerships to assist the retention of girls in schools.

- Increase the retention of girls in lower secondary schools and improve their learning outcomes through a multi-faceted intervention.
- Share the best practices observed in the project schools during the life of the project and assist in the replication of good practices in other districts of the two regions.

The project had three major components designed to achieve these objectives. These were:

- i) Capacity building of school teachers, school management staff in the pilot schools, and teacher educators in the teacher training colleges in the two regions, in gender responsive pedagogy (GRP),
- ii) Establishing a community based Girls Education Support Structure (GESS) in order to advocate for the promotion of girls' education in the locality where the schools are located,
- iii) Setting up viable and sustainable income generation schemes for needy girls in the project schools so that their school related needs will be met and they stay on in school.

1.3. Purposes of the Evaluation

The main purpose of this end term evaluation is to assess the overall effectiveness of the Girls' Education Project that has been implemented in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regional states. Because this evaluation is conducted at the end of the project period, it examined all aspects of the project during the entire implementation period.

The overall purpose of the evaluation is to assess the processes and achievements made to draw lessons for future similar projects as well as for other schools in the regional states which did not participate in the project. The evaluation is intended to be forward looking which will capture effectively and provide information on the nature, extent and where possible the effect of the project. The lessons that will be drawn from the end term evaluation will focus on the examination of the implementation process with a view to understanding what has worked and what has not worked, which may in turn help in designing and implementing similar other projects in the future.

1.4. Scope and Focus of the Evaluation

The survey was conducted in Afar (Aba'ala, Asayita and Werer Secondary Schools) and Benishangul Gumuz (Assosa, Belo Jiganfoy and Wombera Secondary Schools) regional states. Targets of the study were mainly female students, the schools' administrative staff and teachers. The evaluation also targeted Girls Education Support Structures and PTAs, heads of Regional Education Bureaus and gender focal persons and MOE Directorate of General Education, Gender and Special Needs and Inclusive Education including experts in the latter two directorates.

The scope of the final evaluation was delimited by the following four key criteria of evaluation: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability. Each of these is briefly described below.

i. Relevance

As a criterion of assessment, relevance deals with the validity and necessity of a project or its expected effects (or project purpose and overall goal) against the needs of target beneficiaries. Relevance should therefore focus on examining (i) whether the project intervention is appropriate as a solution for problems of the beneficiaries, (ii) whether the content of the project is consistent with national and local policies, and (iii) whether the project is justified to be implemented given the identified needs.

ii. Effectiveness

Effectiveness of a project is concerned with management processes and their appropriateness in supporting delivery. It involves examining the extent to which the project objectives were achieved, taking into account their relative importance. The types of services provided will be examined against the planned ones and all the outputs of the program will be scrutinized.

iii. Efficiency of project implementation

Efficiency deals with how economic resources/inputs are converted to results. The main focus is on the relationship between project cost and effects – the way in which resources and inputs (funds, time, human resources, etc.) were applied towards the achievement of results.

iv. Sustainability

Sustainability focuses on whether produced effects continue after the termination of the assistance. As a terminal evaluation, the effort is to sort out whether there were in-built mechanisms for ensuring sustainability and whether those mechanisms were at play during the implementation of the project.

1.5. Key Questions of the Final Evaluation

Based on the above criteria of evaluation the following basic questions were formulated under each criterion to guide this survey.

Relevance of the Project

- Was the project relevant for the identified needs?

Effectiveness of the Project

- Was the project effective in delivering designed or planned results?
- To what extent did the project's monitoring and evaluation mechanism contribute in meeting project results?
- How effective were the strategies and tools used in the implementation of the project?
- How effective has the project been in responding to the needs of the beneficiaries, and what results were achieved?

Efficiency of the Project

- Was the process of achieving results efficient? Did the actual or expected results (outputs and outcomes) justify the costs incurred?
- How was the project's collaboration with the MOE, Regional Education Bureaux and schools?
- How did the project financial management processes and procedures affect the project implementation process?

Project Sustainability

- To what extent are the benefits of the project likely to be sustained after a completion of the project?
- What is the likelihood of continuation and sustainability of project outcomes and benefits after completion of the project?
- What are the key aspects that require attention in order to improve prospects of sustainability of project outcomes and the potential for the replication of the approach?
- How was capacity strengthened at the school and regional level?
- What are the main lessons that have emerged from the project implementation?
- What recommendations can be made for similar support in the future based on the project results?

CHAPTER TWO

EVALUATION METHODS

This evaluation was conducted using a combination of qualitative and quantitative methods. Given the large geographical area over which the schools were dispersed both in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regions and the relatively short period of time (that is, 10 days) allotted for data collection, it was necessary to employ a method that is flexible enough to permit several but simple data collection tools (that is, semi-structured interview, questionnaire, FGD and observation) and a combination of qualitative and quantitative methods of data analysis. More importantly, all possible effort was made to obtain the views of key stakeholders (that is, students, teachers, PTA members). The use of quantitative and qualitative methods made it possible to gather not only in-depth information but also dependable data for they were collected from different groups of stakeholders using different tools that make triangulation possible.

The study sites, study participants and sampling techniques, instruments that were used to collect data, procedure, data analysis methods and ethical considerations are described below.

2.1. The Study Sites

UNESCO-IICBA, in collaboration with the Afar and Benishangul Gumuz Regional Education Bureaus (REB), implemented the project in three schools in Afar region (Aba'ala, Mohammed Hanferey, and Werer Secondary Schools) and other three schools in Benishangul Gumuz region (Assosa, Belo Jiganfoy and Wombera Secondary Schools). Data for the evaluation were gathered from all the six project schools in the two regions. The consultants and their assistants visited and collected data from each of the six project schools.

2.2. Data Sources

This evaluative study used both secondary and primary data sources to obtain relevant information. The secondary data sources were project documents, reports, and statistics obtained from the schools and the REBs.

The primary data were gathered from female students in Grades 9 and 10, teachers, principals, project focal persons at the school level, PTA members, project focal persons in the two REBs,

and MOE officials. Table 1 shows composition of the respondents who were selected from the different groups of stakeholders.

Table 1. Size of the Sample Respondents by Region, Respondent Type and Sex

Respondent Type (Method)	Afar Region			Benishangul Gumuz Region			Total (Both Regions)		
	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
Students (Questionnaire)	-	94	94	-	96	96	-	190	190
Students (FGD)	-	27	27	-	19	19	-	46	46
Teachers (Questionnaire)	28	1	29	20	5	25	48	6	54
Directors, PTA members and focal persons (Interview)	7	2	9	4	1	5	11	3	14
REB Focal Person (Interview)	1	-	1	1	-	1	2	-	2
Total	36	124	160	25	121	146	61	245	306

In addition to the participants from the two regions, three officials from the MOE (the director for Special Support and Inclusive Education, a Senior Project, Research and Information Expert and a Gender Expert, all male) and the project coordinator from UNESCO-IICBA (female) were interviewed. Overall, quantitative and qualitative data were gathered from 310 (64 male and 246 female) participants.

The respondents were selected with the help of the directors of the schools. In each school, the female students were selected from Grade 9 and Grade 10 students because they were the targets of the project. First, two categories of female students were identified: Group 1 and Group 2. Those in Group 1 were female students who received financial and material support as well as academic support as per the project's objectives. Unlike those in Group 1, female students in Group 2 did not receive any financial or material support but they received training and academic support in the form of tutorial classes like those in Group 1.

Among the female students in Group 1, we selected all those who were willing and who were also present in school on the date of data collection. But we asked the school directors to randomly select female students from those in Group 2 in particular from Grades 9 and 10.

In selecting all the other groups of respondents who participated in the FGDs and in the interviews, purposive sampling technique was used. This technique was used so as to focus on those stakeholders who would provide us with pertinent and in-depth information about the project. How well the respondents knew the project was the main criterion used for selecting the respondents. The selection was done with the help of directors in each school.

2.3. Data Collection Tools/Methods

The consultants employed questionnaire, semi-structured interview guide, focus-group discussion guide, and observation checklist to collect primary data for the evaluation. Besides, review of documents provided secondary data. Each data gathering tool is described below.

Questionnaire

Two questionnaires were administered, one to be filled in by female students and another by teachers. Each questionnaire included both open- and close-ended items. The questionnaires also contained rating scales comprising items that require respondents to rate the multifaceted contributions of the project. The items generally pertain to the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the project that aimed to retain girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regional states in Ethiopia.

The scale was developed by the consultants for the purpose of this evaluation. Furthermore, the questionnaire contained items that aimed to explore the opinions of teachers regarding the training they received, relevance and appropriateness of the training contents to their work, as well as opinions on areas of improvement or impact of the project.

Semi-Structured Interview

Semi-structured interview guide was developed and used to obtain data from different interviewees: directors of the project schools, PTA members, project focal persons at the REBs, MOE officials and UNESCO-IICBA staff. The interview guide dealt with several issues including relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the project. Other issues addressed by the interview guide included lessons learnt from the project and challenges encountered during the implementation period.

Focus Group Discussion (FGD)

The FGD guide was used to facilitate the discussion held with female students. In each school, female students who benefited from the project directly and some who did not were selected to participate in the FGD. The FGD guide was developed to gather information on issues pertaining, among other things, to the financial and material support provided to female students, the benefits gained from the project, impact of the project on female students, lessons learnt from the project, strengths and weaknesses of the project, if any, and challenges faced in the implementation period.

Observation

The observation was basically used to see the different equipment UNESCO-IICBA provided to each school. The equipment included computers, photocopy machines, refrigerators, and other kitchen utensils.

Document Review

In addition to primary data, secondary data were gathered from each school. In particular, statistics pertaining to student enrollment, dropout, repetition and pass rate were gathered from school records. Besides, reports that the schools wrote and submitted to UNESCO-IICBA at different stages, documents regarding the capacity building training, and minutes of different meetings held at the school level concerning the implementation of the project were obtained whenever available.

2.4. Methods of Data Analysis

The data collected for the evaluation through the tools described above were quantitative and qualitative. More specifically, the qualitative data were obtained through interview, FGD and review of documents. On the other hand, the secondary data pertaining student statistics and the data collected through the questionnaires were chiefly quantitative.

After reading the responses obtained through the tools, the qualitative data were coded and categorized into classes of pertinent themes. The data were then analyzed by examining the expressions of the respondents and by determining emerging similarities and differences among the responses of the participants for each category. The results were then written using descriptions that reflect the mix of different responses.

On the other hand, the data which were gathered through the questionnaires were entered into the SPSS software for quantitative data analysis. The data were then analyzed using appropriate

statistical techniques including descriptive and inferential statistics: frequencies, percentages, means, standard deviations, and inferential statistical tests.

2.5. Ethical Considerations

The evaluation was conducted in a way that meets ethical standards. First, the researchers clearly communicated the purpose of the study to the respondents. The consultants then informed the respondents that (1) participation is fully based on their willingness, (2) the data would be used only for the purpose of the evaluative study, and (3) information would be used without the name of the respondents attached to it (that is, under anonymity). Overall, therefore, the respondents were informed about their rights not to participate in the study and they participated only because they agreed to do so.

2.6. Procedure

After signing an agreement with the client, relevant documents for the evaluation were collected and reviewed. Then, the consultants developed data gathering tools and submitted them to the client for comments and further refinement. After the final data collection tools were approved by the client organization (that is, UNESCO-IICBA), the consultants and their assistants conducted the fieldwork.

The two assistants are university instructors and experienced researchers who have broad experience in data collection. Regardless, they were asked to read the questionnaire and interview and FGD guides and be familiar with them. In particular, they were asked to read the items of each tool of data collection and to raise any doubts they might have about the items. The consultants urged the assistants to record (in writing) any information provided by the participants verbatim whenever possible regardless of its perceived values for the evaluation.

CHAPTER THREE

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter presents the end-term evaluation of the project that aimed to retain girls in lower secondary schools and to increase their learning outcomes in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regional states in Ethiopia. In particular, the evaluation focuses on the project's relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. The findings and discussion are therefore presented accordingly.

3.1. Relevance of the Project

Both Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regions are two of the four emerging/developing regions in Ethiopia. There are underlying problems that negatively impact the education of girls in these developing regions. The main problem is gender inequality and the low status of women and girls in society. Societal inequalities between males and females, inequities within the family, harmful traditional practices (HTP) against young girls (e.g., early marriage) and gender-based violence (GBV) had been common in Ethiopia. These are powerful forces that impede efforts to increase female students' educational participation and attainment.

The federal and regional governments are doing their level best to bring about a significant reduction in gender inequality and inequity particularly in education. Consequently, these problems have shown decreasing trend in the country partly due to laws (e.g., family law, 2000) enacted in the country. Nonetheless, the problems do exist at present in different parts of the country though not as visible as in the past.

To make matters worse, families in these regions have limited financial income and problems supporting female students' education throughout high school have remained parents' problems. For this reason, many female students in Grades 9 and 10 are often forced to dropout from school or fail in their exams. It was to address these problems that UNESCO-IICBA launched the project in six schools of the Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regions.

The relevance of the project could be seen from two perspectives: (1) Do the project's objectives go hand in hand with those of the government of Ethiopia? (2) Does the project address the problems of the local community? In short, given the government's policies and strategies to narrow the gender gap in educational participation and attainment in the country, UNESCO-IICBA's project could be seen as a vehicle to achieve this particular goal. By supporting students financially and academically, the project attempted to improve female students' school attendance, decrease female students' dropout and improve their academic achievement. Thus, because it contributes towards the achievement of the MOE's objectives, there is every reason to believe that the project was relevant.

But what about the societal needs? Did this project address real needs in the intervention areas? How do the stakeholders (including female students, teachers, school principals, and PTA members) judge relevance of the project? First, it should be noted that before launching the project, UNESCO-IICBA had commissioned a baseline study that assessed the needs of the schools in the form of situation analysis. Among other things, the baseline study reported several factors, both inside and outside the school, that hamper the education of female students particularly in lower secondary grades (Grades 9 and 10): lack of gender friendly and gender sensitive environment both inside and outside school, early marriage, GBV, poverty, and demand for child work/labour. The project was initiated based on these identified problems and the need to address them.

The data we gathered from the two regions further suggest that there is consensus among stakeholders about the relevance of the project. The evaluation team found no one who questioned the relevance of the project. While the consensus among stakeholders provides evidence for relevance of the project, the participants also explained why they thought so.

A school principal in one of the project schools in Afar region had the following to say regarding relevance of the project.

The relevance of the project is obvious in this area where most households are poor. The problems of the communities are broad. The project has helped us to focus on female students from destitute families who, at times, would be forced to drop out of school because their parents could not buy them school uniforms and/or stationery. At present, thanks to the project, there are no female students who drop out of school for these reasons.

What about the beneficiary girls? What did they say about the relevance of the project? When asked about the relevance of the project, beneficiary students in one of the schools in Afar region have stated that “Because our parents are weak and poor, we would not be in school had it not been for the financial and educational support we received. We could have dropped out of school.”

In a similar manner, in FGD conducted in one of the schools in Benishangul Gumuz region, female students agreed that the project was relevant. They had the following to say.

The project paid attention to promote girls’ education through training and financial support. Girls’ education was ignored in the past. But after this intervention, the importance of educating girls equally with boys is well recognized and has received much more attention than before. Our parents are now interested to send girls to schools in our vicinity after the project intervention.

An interviewee from the MOE, on his part, noted that the project provides financial support to girls whose families couldn’t support or send their daughters to secondary schools due to financial problems. Continuing his explanation, he said,

The project tries to reach these needy girls to solve their financial problems and to help them pursue or complete their secondary education. ... In this regard, the project is highly relevant in the communities or pastoralists where economic problems are the main causes for girls to discontinue their education.

Another important point that should be raised here in relation to relevance of the project is the training on Gender Responsive Pedagogy (GRP) provided to teachers. The training on GRP was one of the objectives of the project. The main goal of the GRP training was to make teachers gender responsive and sensitive as they plan and teach their lessons and participate in extracurricular activities along with students in general and female students in particular. Many of the participants in this evaluation strongly believed that there was a gap in GRP in the project schools and that was why teachers in the past could not treat female students as fairly as they treat male students. After the training, according to many participants, teachers not only treat female students fairly but they also support them in different ways so that they can obtain better results in school. Based on the data we gathered, one can conclude that the training on GRP has addressed an important need of teachers, another evidence for relevance of the project.

In summary, three points are worth noting regarding relevance. First, based on the results of the baseline study (Garuma & Tolessa, 2013) which was conducted before launching the project, there was a need to address problems surrounding the education of girls. One can say therefore that the project was launched based on evidence and was thus relevant. Second, the project was not only consistent with the government's policies and strategies but it was also implemented in partnership with one of the government's ministry (MOE), another evidence for its relevance. Third, interviews and FGDs with different stakeholders further supported relevance of the project. On the whole, viewed from the three angles just described, one could argue that the project was highly relevant.

3.2. Efficiency of the Project

As described below, efficiency of the project was judged in terms of time and financial efficiency.

(A) The Project's Efficiency in terms of Time

Many of the stakeholders who provided information for this evaluation agreed that the main limitation of the project was delay in implementation. There is general consensus among the stakeholders that the project was not efficient in terms of time. When asked about the pace of implementation of the project, an official from the MOE told us his view as follows.

To be honest with you, I am not satisfied with the pace of the implementation. Initially there was a delay to launch the project and to start the income generating activities in the project schools. Some of the reasons for the delay were failure to identify appropriate IGAs in the local areas or project schools. In some schools there were disagreements among committee members on specific project activities identified for the project. Initially there was also a delay in releasing the fund at central level (from UNESCO-IICBA) due to some technical difficulties pertaining to the project code. These and other related factors have contributed to the delay in project implementation.

The project coordinator from UNESCO-IICBA's side confirmed that there was a delay of about eight months initially because of shortage of officers at UNESCO-IICBA. She also confirmed that there was a delay in implementation of the project because of the technical difficulties encountered in relation to budget coding. Besides, the nature of the project especially the purchasing process of the IGA items including the bidding process took quite longer time. But it was not only

UNESCO-IICBA that was responsible for the delay of implementation of the project. In relation to this, one of the school principals from Afar region stated that the school, REB and UNESCO-IICBA have contributed to the delay of the implementation in different ways. Explaining his opinion, the school principal stated,

The school contributed to the delay in its own way. We were required to submit proposal and action plan before the project fund was released. But due to our workload and limited experience to write proposal and action plan, we could not meet deadlines. The REB, on its part, has to follow government financial management procedure to release the project budget and that in itself requires much time. Further, UNESCO-IICBA had its own issues in releasing the fund initially.

Respondents from the six schools, more or less, have expressed their views about the pace of implementation of the project the same way. According to most respondents, the REBs and the government's financial management regulations and procedure should take much of the blame for the delay of the project implementation.

Overall, there was no disagreement among the respondents regarding the delay. A strong evidence for this is the fact that even though it was a three-year project, most of the activities of the project were undertaken in the last two years. The fact that 40 percent of the IGA fund was released nearly at the end of the project period to the schools is an additional evidence for inefficiency of the project. It is further worrying to note that the second installment of the project fund (40 percent) did not reach some of the project schools at the time of data collection for this end term evaluation. This is particularly true of the three schools in Benishangul Gumuz region.

Despite the inefficiency of the project particularly in terms of time, it is encouraging to note that the delay did not affect the capacity building component of the project. The training offered to different groups of stakeholders (principals, teachers, PTA members and through them to students) on different topics (e.g., GRP, life skills) has been completed as planned. Besides, it is further encouraging to find out that the training was very productive in changing perceptions, attitudes and practices of teachers, principals, PTA members, male students and female students in relation to the treatment of girls and the value of the education of girls. The training has further improved the teaching-learning process in several ways including the positive changes observed in the

preparation of lesson plans as well as in mainstreaming the issues of girls in every aspect of the school activities.

(B) The Project's Financial Efficiency

In general, of the total budget (that is, 500,000 USD) that was allocated to implement the project activities, 95 percent (that is, 474, 890.71 USD) was distributed to and partly utilized by the project schools for the planned activities. The remaining 5 percent (that is, 25,109.29 USD) of the total budget is still available. Given the activities carried out by the project and the amount of budget utilized, one can safely conclude that the project's financial efficiency was very good.

But because the project was inefficient in terms completing planned activities according to schedule/plan, this undoubtedly has affected the project's financial efficiency negatively. Accordingly, on average 40 percent of the IGA fund in each school has not been utilized at the end of the project period. This is true about the financial efficiency of the project schools.

Despite the delay in the utilization of the fund, there appears to be agreement among the respondents that the budget was utilized according to the initial plan. The two interviewees we had from the MOE were confident when they stated that the budget utilized so far has been spent according to the initial plan. In this regard, it is important to note that decisions about how to utilize the budget in each school are made by a committee (consisting of the school principal, the focal person, teachers and PTA members) rather than an individual (or individuals). According to the respondents at the school level, no one individual could decide on how to utilize the money without the consent of committee members.

Another question that should be raised in relation to the financial efficiency of the project relates to the value added in relation to the project's objectives because of the implementation of the project and to what extent the budget allocated for each school has enabled the project to achieve results. This can be examined from two perspectives. First, one can examine the value added because of the capacity building trainings provided to the different groups of stakeholders. Second, the value added can also be examined in terms of the number of beneficiary girls in each school who received financial and material support.

With regard to the first perspective, there is no question about the value added because of the capacity building trainings provided to the school management, teachers, and PTA members as well as the life skills training and tutorial classes provided to students. That is, the value added due to the capacity building trainings was clearly very significant when one examines the positive changes produced after the trainings. As discussed earlier, the trainings conducted at different levels were fruitful in changing perceptions, attitudes and practices of teachers, principals, PTA members, male students and female students concerning female students' education and their treatment in and outside the school. In addition, the training has improved the teaching-learning process in several ways including lesson plan preparation and the positive changes seen in the willingness of teachers to provide academic support to female students through tutorial classes without any remuneration. Grade 11 and 12 students also benefited indirectly.

With regard to the second perspective, the number of female students who received both financial and material support in each project school was examined. Unlike the three schools in Benishangul Gumuz region, the project fund was distributed equally to each of the three schools in Afar region. In other words, the three schools in Afar region have received equal funding for implementing the project. However, the number of beneficiaries who directly received financial and material support varies noticeably (from a low of only 5 to a high of 32). Given that one of the objectives of the project is supporting female students in Grades 9 and 10, the evaluation team did not find the big variation among the project school fair or reasonable. In particular, the team found it unfair to limit the financial support only to five female students in one of the schools when there are so many needy female students. In other words, the support is of value to the students but the number of beneficiaries is limited particularly in one school. The financial support, as one component of the project, could have been more efficient had it served more direct beneficiaries particularly in Werer secondary school. UNESCO-IICBA, MOE or the REBs could have avoided such big variation in the number of beneficiaries had they fixed the minimum number of beneficiaries that a school should serve. Based on the data in Table 2 below, one can say that Aba'ala secondary school was more efficient than the other two schools in Afar region.

Table 2. Number of Direct Beneficiaries by Region and School

Region	School	Number of Direct Beneficiaries
Afar	Aba'ala	32
	Mohammed Hanferey	16
	Werer	5
Benishangul Gumuz	Assosa	150 (planned)
	Belo Jiganfoy	70 (planned)
	Wombera	25 (planned)

The three schools in Benishangul Gumuz region, on the other hand, did not provide any financial or material support to female students. But they have planned to support female students (see the number of female students for each school in the table above) financially and materially in the near future. However, few female students who received life skills and beauty salon training have received 4,500 ETB each during the three-month training period.

Another question that needs to be answered in relation to financial efficiency is “Was it worth spending money on some of the project activities?” The IGA which was proposed initially in Aba’ala secondary school is a case in point. A house was constructed to serve as a center for cattle fattening but it was not giving any service at the time of data collection for this evaluation. The IGA initially proposed was later found to be not feasible due to the cost associated with fattening of the cattle which was relatively high due to the drought. As a result of this and the drought, the committee formed to oversee the project decided to sell the cattle to avoid the risk of loss of the cattle or selling them for a smaller price. The school has now ordered a three-wheel automobile (called Bajaj) to provide transportation service in the town. As for the house built for the initial IGA, the committee was looking for other options such as renting the house for others who can utilize it as a shelter for cattle fattening after the drought season. One of the consultants has visited the center and has seen that the house as well as the area around it is convenient particularly for cattle fattening.

The same is true about the IGA proposed in Belo Jiganfoy secondary school (grinding mill). The grinding service requires a house in which the machine should be installed. However, even though

the house is built, the machine has not been set up because the town does not get electricity service at present. In relation to this, it should be noted that there was a promise from the government's side that the town would get electricity service in 2015 and that the REB was sure this would happen. Unfortunately, this was not realized but it was based on this promise that the school committee proposed this particular IGA. To solve this problem, the school committee has recently decided to buy a generator to make the IGA functional and this appears to be a good decision. Furthermore, in the other two project schools (in Assosa and Wombera Secondary Schools) of the Benishangul Gumuz region, the sets of equipment bought for a beauty salon have not given any service so far. Instead of generating income the sets have been put in a store due to lack of working space, renting houses. However, the photo copy and writing center is functional.

(C) What Measures were taken to Ensure Efficiency of the Project?

Among several potentially useful measures that need to be put in place, partnership between the different stakeholders and monitoring and evaluation are probably the main ones. Each is examined in brief below.

How close and strong were the partnerships between the different stakeholders? Were the partnerships useful in making the project efficient? In an effort to secure answers to these questions, we posed the questions to two of the MOE experts we interviewed.

Both experts indicated their satisfaction in their own ways. One of them, a senior expert, told us the following.

Beginning from the project proposal stage, the MOE's Gender Directorate and UNESCO-IICBA worked together to make the project successful. We were aware of the baseline study conducted to assess the situation in the project schools in general and the needs of female students in particular. UNESCO-IICBA has used resource persons from the MOE for the capacity building training workshops. Continuing his response, the expert indicated that there was a close relationship particularly between the Gender Directorate of MOE and UNESCO-IICBA not only at the initial stage of the project but also throughout the project lifetime. According to the senior expert,

UNESCO-IICBA, in partnership with the MOE's Gender Directorate, has accomplished several tasks during the lifetime of the project. We worked together in monitoring and evaluation. We have also participated in review meetings with the concerned staff of the REBs. In fact, in one meeting, we could review the

progress of several projects at the same time. Even when we could not be there physically, we make telephone calls for discussions with the REB staff about the project implementation or its progress.

The second, a gender expert, started by judging the relevance of the project but emphasized one limitation of the project in relation to partnership. He had the following to say.

This project is highly relevant addressing the issue of girls' education. Such project requires continuous monitoring and evaluation. This further requires a person or an expert responsible for the follow-up activities at the level of the MOE. Hence, I suggest that a project focal person be assigned at the MOE so that the day to day follow up on the activities could be carried out for successful implementation of the project.

The fact that there was no project focal person at regional level and its negative impact on timely implementation of the project activities have been raised as a limitation of the project by other interviewees as well including those from the REBs and UNESCO-IICBA and school principals. A further examination of the working relationship (or partnership) between the different stakeholders provided mixed messages. The working relationship between UNESCO-IICBA and the REBS was judged good. The one between UNESCO-IICBA and the project schools was judged to be indirect; that is, the two communicated indirectly through the REBs.

The working relationship between the REBs and project schools was judged to be poor in both Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regions but it was more so particularly in Benishangul Gumuz region. The poor working relationship observed between the REBs and the project schools could be related to the absence of a permanent focal person at the level of the REBs. Some dedicated "focal persons" were already overloaded but they had to do the project activities in addition. Many of the respondents in the project schools have raised to the evaluation team several complaints including the fact that the project schools had little or no participation in decision making (e.g., identifying a feasible IGA). The REBs, on their part, had doubts about the accountability of the project schools and wanted to ensure that the project fund is spent according to the initial plan.

A final point that should be examined is monitoring and evaluation. How frequently was monitoring and evaluation conducted? Was there monitoring and evaluation conducted in

collaboration with the different stakeholders? Monitoring and evaluation is important in such a project because it helps to determine the progress made in the implementation of the project and to take appropriate measures, when necessary, to rectify any delays in project implementation or divergence from the project's initial plans.

The evaluation team asked the experts from the MOE about the project's monitoring and evaluation and how they judge the conduct of monitoring and evaluation. As indicated above, they stated that the MOE, UNESCO-IICBA and the REBs conduct monitoring and evaluation together. They also indicated that they themselves participated in review meetings. The interviews we had with the experts from the MOE clearly indicated that (1) there were two review meetings conducted in Adama town in the presence of staff from the Emerging Regions Directorate as well as from the Gender Directorate of the MOE, and (2) there was joint school visit by the experts from the MOE and UNESCO-IICBA.

One can generally observe from the forgoing discussion that monitoring and evaluation was jointly conducted by UNESCO-IICBA, the Gender and Emerging Regions Directorate of the MOE and the REBs. Although frequent monitoring and evaluation could have benefited the project schools and the beneficiaries even more, one should also remember that the distance of the project schools from Addis Ababa, the regional capitals and from each other was a major challenge that limited the number of school visits and monitoring and evaluation that could be conducted.

3.3. Effectiveness of the Project

Effectiveness refers to the extent to which the project's objectives have been achieved. In this end term evaluation, project effectiveness has been examined in four areas: to what extent the project was effective in delivering designed or planned results; to what extent the project's monitoring and evaluation mechanism contributed in meeting project results; how effective were the strategies and tools used in the implementation of the project; and finally how effective has the project been in responding to the needs of the beneficiaries, and what results were achieved. This section is devoted to presentation and discussion of the results along these lines.

As stated at the beginning of this report, the main goal of this project was to improve the retention of girls in lower secondary schools in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz regions of Ethiopia and improve their learning outcome as measured by the Ethiopian General Secondary Education Certificate Examination. The project further had the following specific objectives to be achieved at the end of project period. These were:

- Sensitise teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process through training in gender-sensitive pedagogy
- Build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools
- Strengthen School-Community Partnerships to assist the retention of girls in schools
- Increase the retention of girls in lower secondary and improve their learning outcomes through a multi-faceted intervention
- Share the best practice experience during the life of the project and assist in the replication of good practices in other districts of the two regions.

(A) Project Effectiveness in terms of Delivering Designed or Planned Results

In order to examine the project’s effectiveness in terms of delivering designed or planned results the team has examined to what extent the planned activities have been accomplished during the project life time and tried to identify if there were some discrepancies between what was planned and what was achieved and reasons for discrepancies if any for each specific activity. Accordingly, the project has planned seven major activities and thirteen sub activities that lead to the achievement of the goal of the project and its specific objectives. The following tables present major activities with their sub-activities.

Table 3: Preliminary Planning

<i>No</i>	<i>Activity 1 :Preliminary Planning Sub Activities:</i>	<i>Achievement in %</i>	<i>Reason for Discrepancy, if any</i>
1	Face-to-face discussion with colleagues at the MOE, Regional Education Bureau and UNESCO Addis Ababa Office on the modalities of launching the project	100	

2	Select three pilot schools from each region to include in the study	100	
3	Develop a ToR for a consultant who will do a baseline survey study on the situation of girls education in Afar region	100	

As indicated in the table above, all the activities planned as preliminary planning for the project were successfully carried out and completed. Specifically, the face-to-face discussion with colleagues at the MOE, the two REBs and UNESCO-IICBA office has been carried out on the modalities of launching the project. In a similar vein, three pilot schools from each region, a total of six project schools were identified and included in the project.

Finally, a TOR for a base line study on the situation of girls' education in Afar region was prepared on time and used to guide the baseline study in the region. A baseline study for Benishangul Gumuz region was not planned since another baseline study has been already conducted in the region through a similar project supported by the Packard Foundation and executed by the UNESCO Addis Ababa Liaison Office.

Table 4: Conducting Baseline Survey Study and Validating Findings

No	<i>Activity 2: Conducting Baseline Survey Study and Validating Findings</i> <i>Sub Activities:</i>	<i>Achievement in %</i>	<i>Reason for Discrepancy, if any</i>
1	Conducting a survey study to identify the salient features of girls' education in the Afar region.	100	
2	Undertake missions to project sites	100	
3	Validating the baseline survey results	--	the baseline study was completed much later than originally thought

Conducting a baseline survey study with its validation workshop on the findings was planned with three specific activities as indicated in table above. A baseline survey study was carried out for Afar region but the validation workshop on the findings was not carried out during the project life time. However, the consulting team has understood that this was due to the longer period that the

preliminary work has taken to launch the project and caused delays in the selection of consultants who would conduct the baseline survey. Yet, as clearly indicated in one of the project progress reports, the findings from the baseline survey was shared with Afar Regional Education Bureau colleagues that enabled UNESCO-IICBA receive significant feedback on important issues and challenges of girls’ education highlighted in the report in the region. Besides, the baseline study has also been shared with the teachers, school management staff and GESS members during the capacity building workshops organised for Afar Region. In general, it is safe to say that the baseline study was validated with the help of these mechanisms.

On top of this, UNESCO-IICBA staff has conducted field visits to the two regions as planned. The purposes of the visits were assessing the situation in the pilot schools, conduct follow up and supervision on the progress of project implementation, assess the situation of Girls’ Hostel in Afar, and discuss the feasibility of the proposed income generating activities in the project schools with stakeholders. The mission has also carried out a follow up and supervision visits on the implementation of the schools’ Gender Responsive Pedagogy (GRP) and Gender Responsive School Administration plans.

Table 5: Capacity Building Training Workshops for Teacher Educators and School Management Staff

Activity 3: Capacity Building Training Workshops for Teacher Educators and School Management Staff <i>Sub Activities:</i>	<i>Achievement in %</i>	<i>Reason for Discrepancy, if any</i>
Organize training workshops for the REB and CTE staff on Gender responsive Pedagogy and school management as well as teacher educators and school management staff in the TEIs found in the two regions The following areas were the focus of the training program conducted at Hawassa Town for five days. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gender responsive pedagogy • Gender responsive lesson planning • Gender responsive teaching and learning materials • Gender responsive language use and interaction in the classroom • Gender responsive classroom setting • Gender responsive school management • Monitoring and evaluation • Developing school level action plan 	100	

Life skill training was the main topic of the training conducted at Adama town.		
---	--	--

Regarding capacity building training workshops for teacher educators and school management staff, three teachers and the college dean from Gilgel Gibe Teachers Training College in Benishangul Gumuz region were trained as TOT on GRP organized by IICBA. Following this training different activities have been implemented with the support and collaboration of different NGOs. Among these include: the trained teachers and school management staff in the six schools have cascaded the training for all the teachers in their respective schools. As a result, a total of 150 teachers have become aware of Gender Responsive Pedagogy and Gender Responsive School Administration. On top of this, awareness raising program was organized for students on the importance of girls' education, gender based violence, and reproductive health. UNESCO-IICBA had also organized GRP Training of Trainers (ToT) training for school teachers and school management staff. Thus, the evaluating team understood that the capacity training programs were carried out as planned to achieve the objectives of the project.

Interviews conducted with different individuals on the training programmes provided by the project also proved that the training areas listed above in the table were carried out by the project. According to these responses the following areas were highly mentioned by different respondents:

- Training on life skills
- Training on gender responsive pedagogy
- Training on gender responsive school management
- Training on gender responsive lesson planning
- Training on gender responsive classroom setup
- Training on gender responsive language use
- Training on developing school level action plan
- Training on gender in education etc.

A two-day training was also conducted on IGA proposal writing and management as well as financial management.

From the above discussions one can easily see that the capacity training programs were highly relevant in promoting girls' education in the two regions.

Table 6: Supportive Supervision Provided

Activity 4: Provide Supportive Supervision <i>Sub Activities:</i>	<i>Achievement in %</i>	<i>Reason for Discrepancy, if any</i>
Gender experts from the Gender Directorate of the Ministry of Education provide supportive training and supervision	100	

As indicated in the table supportive provision was provided by UNESCO-IICBA where it has made financial contribution to the Gender Directorate of the Ministry of Education to develop training modules on Gender Responsive Pedagogy to be incorporated in the training curriculum for pre-service primary and secondary school teachers. The workshop provided by the Ministry of Education, Gender Directorate with the support of IICBA's girls' education project on Gender Responsive Pedagogy for 80 module writers from many universities. Furthermore, IICBA has participated in the advocacy and mobilization workshop organized by the Ministry of Education, Gender Directorate, and the Directorate for Special Support for Emerging Regions (Afar, Benishangul Gumuz, Gambella and Somali). The workshop focused on planning for community mobilization and advocacy, with the aim of mobilizing the community to send girls to schools. It also included annual meeting with the emerging regions.

Table 7: Strengthening Community–School Partnership and Advocacy on Girls' Education

No	Activity 5 Strengthening Community – School Partnership and Advocacy on Girls' Education <i>Sub Activities:</i>	<i>Achievement in %</i>	<i>Reason for Discrepancy, if any</i>
1	Setup a Girls' Education Support Structure	100	
2	Support GESS units with training and consultation meetings	100	
3	Support Girls' Hostels built in the two project regions	100	

One of the activities planned in the project was strengthening community-school partnership and advocacy on girls' education. Based on this plan, the project has set up girls' education support structure in all the six project schools. In addition, the project has supported GESS units with training and consultation meetings. Particularly the project has organized training for members of the GESS in all the project schools on gender and gender responsive education with the objective of building their capacity on girls' education issues that impact girls' learning outcomes. The trainings or workshops were conducted in Assosa, Benishangul Gumuz, for the three project schools with a total of 32 (11 female and 21 Male) participants and another conducted in Semera, Afar Regional State, for the project schools in the region with a total of 30 (10 female and 20 male) participants. Furthermore, the project has supported the two girls' hostels with material resources ranging from computers to kitchen utensils. Overall, the project was fully effective in achieving all the three goals shown in Table 7 above,

Table 8: Exploring Income Generating Possibilities to Support Girls' Education

No	Activity 6 Exploring Income Generating Possibilities to Support Girls' Education <i>Sub Activity:</i>	Achievement in %	Reason for Discrepancy, if any
1	Explore possibilities for income generation to support girls' education	100	

As presented in Table 8, the exploration for feasible income generating activities for needy female students at each project school was carried out as originally planned by UNESCO-IICBA. List of IGAs at each project school are shown in Table 9 below.

Table 9. Type of IGAs by Region and School and their Status and Overall Effectiveness

Region	School	IGA	Status	Overall Effectiveness
Afar	Aba'ala	Cattle fattening	Established but ; planned another IGA	Because of the drought, the oxen are sold. Instead, the school has ordered a three-wheel automobile (called Bajaj) to provide transportation service to the public in the town.

	Mohammed Hanfrey	Cafeteria	Functional	Many of the participants are satisfied with the IGA and have judged it effective. The school has planned to continue the IGA.
	Werer	Printing and Photocopy Service	Functional	There is consensus among the school community that the IGA is effective. The school has also planned to begin an additional IGA (cafeteria) with the remaining 40 percent of the project fund.
Benishangul Gumuz	Assosa	Photocopy and beauty salon services	Partly functional	The photocopy service is functional whereas the equipment for the beauty salon is not. Working space has yet to be secured from the city administration.
	Belo Jiganfoy	Grinding mill (electric)	Partly	The machine is purchased and stored because there is no electricity service in the town.
	Wombera	Photocopy and beauty salon services	Partly functional	The school provides photocopy service. However, due to lack of working space, the equipment for the beauty salon has not been utilized as planned.

Table 10: Conduct Mid-term and End-of-project evaluation

Activity 7 Conduct mid-term and end-of-project evaluation	<i>Achievement in %</i>	<i>Reason for Discrepancy, if any</i>
Conduct mid-term and end-term project evaluation	50	Mid-term evaluation was not conducted due to delays in launching of the IGAs.

The final activity of the project was related to conducting mid-term and end-term evaluations of the project. As it is clearly put in the table, the mid-term evaluation was not conducted due to the fact that the IGAs at each project school were delayed for various reasons. The main purpose of mid-term evaluation in such type of projects is to generate information on the progress achieved so far and provide correct measures to improve project performance in the remaining time. In the situations where no project activities were launched, it was reasonable for UNESCO-IICBA to delay the mid-term evaluation. This end term evaluation was also carried out as planned and hence it could be stated that the project has carried out all the activities planned to achieve its specific objectives.

(B) Effectiveness of Project Monitoring and Evaluation Mechanisms

As shown earlier, the project monitoring and evaluation for this particular project has been carried out in several ways. One of this was conducting joint review meetings where the stakeholders judge the progress of the project implementation in each project school. Besides, experts from the MOE and UNESCO-IICBA have conducted joint monitoring and evaluation. Furthermore, the experts from the MOE and UNESCO-IICBA have even conducted school visits to observe firsthand the progress of the project in each school.

Moreover, the project schools had to submit periodic progress reports to their respective REBs. The two REBs, in turn, had to compile the progress reports from project schools and had to report this to UNESCO-IICBA and MOE quarterly. In brief, the monitoring and evaluation mechanism utilized (joint and independent monitoring and evaluation) for the project was effective.

(C) Effectiveness of Project Strategies and Tools

UNESCO-IICBA has used the government's formal structure in the implementation of project activities. Both UNESCO-IICBA and MOE were at the top followed by REBs of the two regions playing the intermediary role between the project schools and top level bodies. The roles, duties and responsibilities of each partner were clearly defined during project implementation. This has enabled all partners to own the project and include in their annual plans of activities. This was the reason for successful implementation of the major activities of the project in the two regions. Thus, the strategies and tools followed by UNESCO-IICBA were very effective to implement the project.

(D) Effectiveness of the Project in Responding to the Needs of the Beneficiaries

As vividly discussed earlier, the project had addressed one of the major challenges encountered in the provision of education to citizens; that is, narrowing the gender gap in secondary school participation by increasing access. Accordingly, the project has focused on the two developing regions that were deprived of social services such as education, health, etc. in the past. Increasing girls' access to secondary education by reducing their dropout rates and improving their academic performances was the main purpose of the project. In order to achieve this goal the project has supported girls with poor economic backgrounds and unable to afford educational costs like stationeries in the project schools through IGAs although this was not as functional as it was planned particularly in Benishangul Gumuz region during project life time. This was also

supported by some of the PTA members participated in the interview. For instance, in an interview conducted in one project school in Afar the following was stated:

- The financial assistance provided to female students from poor families has helped them to fulfill some of their school needs such as uniform, transport, meals, clothes, additional reading materials, etc. which encouraged them to continue their education.
- The provision of sanitary pad for girls during their menstruation has contributed to minimize girls' absenteeism
- The tutorial programs for the female students has promoted their academic achievement
- The gender awareness trainings and discussions and the accompanied disciplinary majors has encouraged females not to drop out.

Secondly, the project has carried out different awareness raising activities on the importance of educating girls for different community groups including school principals, teachers, male and female students, parents and community members. This has further helped to minimize traditional barriers and out looks to promote girls education in the two regions. The response from one of the PTA members in Afar clearly indicated that the project has addressed the educational demands of the community as related to girls' schooling. The following are some of the issues addressed because of the effect of the project according to the respondent.

- saving few girls from dropping out due to lack of school uniform and stationary materials
- As per the culture of the community, many girls from the school were given to early marriage. Because of the awareness training through the project few were saved from this through the collaborative effort of the principal, the teachers and the girls themselves.
- Some males sexually harassing females were found in the school. These males were identified and reported to the police and measures were taken thereby saving the girls from dropping school as the result.

In general, the project has addressed two fold challenges: economic and traditional outlooks toward girls' education and thereby improve the situation of girls' education in the two regions. As a result of the project's intervention and other similar activities carried out simultaneously in the project schools, the dropout rate among girls has decreased, and their retention and academic performance particularly in grade ten national examinations has shown some improvement.

Therefore, one may conclude that the project was effective in responding to the needs of the beneficiaries during its life time.

(E) Effectiveness of the Project in Improving Female Students’ Achievement and Reducing Dropout Rate

The data in Table 11 show pass rate of female students in the six project schools on the tenth grade national examination before the beginning of the project (as reported in the baseline study conducted in the three project schools in Afar region) in 2011/12 academic year and around the end of the project in 2014/15 academic year. Comparison of the pass rates in the two academic years provides a rough estimate about the pass rates of tenth grade female students before and after implementation of the project. Because no data were available for two of the project schools in Benishangul Gumuz region (for the 2011/12 academic year), the difference is estimated here only for the four schools (three schools from Afar region and one from Benishangul Gumuz region for four years and the two schools for two and three years).

Table 11: Pass Rate (in Percent) of Female Students on the Tenth Grade National Examination

Region	Project School	2004 E.C. (2011/12)	2005 E.C. (2012/13)	2006 E.C. (2013/14)	2007 E.C. (2014/15)	Improvement in Pass Rate
Afar	Aba’ala	53.0	19.8	17.1	59.0	6
	Mohammed Hanferey	52.0	NA	NA	71.0	19
	Werer	72.0	63.3	59.6	84.0	12
Benishangul Gumuz	Assosa	NA	51.0	46.0	57.5	6.5%
	Belo Jiganfoy	62.0	62.	9.4	69.0	7%
	Wombera	NA	44.7	53.7	55	10.3%

Source: Baseline study and school records Note: NA = data not available

As shown in the last column of the table, the level of improvement in female students’ pass rate differs among the three schools. In specific terms, the improvement in the pass rate ranges from

6.5 % of Assosa to 19 percent (in Mohammed Hanferey Senior Secondary School). Given the project's objective of achieving a 15 percent average improvement in the pass rate of tenth grade female students, the improvement in Mohammed Hanferey Secondary School is above the target whereas the other two schools (Aba'ala and Werer Secondary Schools) have performed below the target. . In general, though it is not uniform the trend in tenth grade female students' pass rate exhibited good improvement.

Looking at the data from a different perspective, one can calculate the average pass rate for the three project schools in Afar region combined. This computation yields an average improvement of 12.3 percent in the pass rate of tenth grade female students, which is a little lower than the target (an average improvement of 15 percent). Even though this average improvement is lower than the target, one can argue that the improvement is a significant and encouraging achievement given that the region is emerging/developing and changes in these regions usually require much hard work and relatively long time.

Unlike the data for the pass rate, the baseline study did not report clearly the dropout rate for girls separately. The study did not report the dropout rate for Grades 9 and 10 separately either. Furthermore, the dropout rate reported in the baseline study was based on a survey rather than data obtained from the school records. It would not therefore be right to make comparisons based on the data reported in the baseline study.

Instead, the evaluation team obtained data on dropout rate for three consecutive years. The data are presented in Table 12 below. In short, no clear pattern in dropout rate could be observed over the three-year period, but there is reduction in dropout rate. That is, the data showed no uniform decrease in the dropout rate of female students in Grades 9 and 10. However, a decreasing trend in dropout rate was observed in Mohammed Hanferey (Grade 10), Assosa (both Grades 9 and 10) and Belo Jiganfoy (Grade 9) secondary schools. Thus, in view of decreasing the dropout rate of female students, Assosa, Mohammed Hanferey and Belo Jiganfoy Secondary Schools were better than the other three schools.

Table 12: Dropout Rate (in Percent) of Female Students in Grades 9 and 10

Region	Project School	Grade Level	2005 E.C. (2012/13)	2006 E.C. (2013/14)	2007 E.C. (2014/15)
Afar	Aba'ala	9	0.7	1.9	7.0
		10	0.0	14.0	9.2
	Mohammed Hanferey	9	37.5	2.3	2.6
		10	3.3	1.2	1.2
	Werer	9	25.0	12.3	15.6
		10	0.0	10.5	2.8
Benishangul Gumuz	Assosa	9	17.7	17.6	8.6
		10	9.9	3.2	0.9
	Belo Jiganfoy	9	35.4	28.8	21.5
		10	5.9	0.0	16.7
	Wombera	9	10.1	8.6	10.6
		10	3.7	1.0	1.9

Source: School records

3.4. Impact of the Project

Before examining the impact of the project, it should be reiterated that the project's efficiency in terms of time is not satisfactory. As a result of the delay in implementation, some components of the project have yet to start (e.g., IGAs in Aba'ala and Belo Jiganfoy Secondary Schools) while other components have been completed (e.g., capacity building component or training workshops). Besides, one can easily observe that the six project schools are at different stages of implementation of the IGAs. In other words, while some schools have planned to launch a second IGA (Mohammed Hanferey and Werer Secondary Schools) in addition to the first, other schools are still in the first phase.

Furthermore, because other projects were in progress in some of the schools (e.g., Werer Secondary School) simultaneously with UNESCO-IICBA's project, it would be difficult to determine the impact of UNESCO-IICBA's project especially when the projects have some common areas of focus or interest. Even in the absence of other projects in the schools, one could

not ascertain why the impacts or changes occurred. That is, one cannot certainly tell that changes that occurred are due to the project's activities. This observation points to the need for coordinating the different projects that are being implemented in one school.

Focusing on the impact of the completed components of the project, the evaluation team attempted to secure data or evidence about the project's impact from the respondents through rating scales, interviews and FGDs. Accordingly, the respondents were asked to rate whether change (or impact) has occurred in several areas (e.g., in teachers and male students' treatment of female students, gender based violence, parents' attitude toward girls' education) and if so to what extent. Similar questions were posed to interviewees and FGD participants. The results are presented next.

Female students in each school were asked to rate the level of change (response options range from no change to above moderate change) in their attitude toward their education, school results, absenteeism, late coming, and study habits due to UNESCO-IICBA's project (in particular due to the life skills training, tutorial classes, and the financial support provided to them). In response, a large majority of students in both Afar (ranging from 78 to 95 percent of participants) and Benishangul Gumuz (ranging from 88 to 96 percent of participants) regions indicated that there was a moderate or above moderate change in each of the five areas described above.

In a similar manner, a large majority of the female students in both Afar (ranging from 63 to 95 percent) and Benishangul Gumuz (ranging from 69 to 89 percent) regions showed that there was at least a moderate change in GBV, parents' attitudes toward girls' education, girls' workload at home, and family support for girls' education. In other words, the participants were of the opinion that (1) there was reduction in the incidence of GBV and in girls' workload at home and (2) there was improvement in family support for and parents' attitudes toward girls' education due to the project.

Unlike the above encouraging results, female students' ratings were mixed in relation to teachers' treatment, teachers' support, male students' treatment of female students and teachers' attitudes toward girls' education. That is, whereas in Benishangul Gumuz region, a great majority (ranging from 88 to 98 percent) of the female students affirmed that there was a moderate or above moderate

positive change in the above four areas, this was not the case for Afar region. As a follow up to this, it was necessary to examine students' ratings for each of the three schools in Afar region separately. The latter analysis indicated that whereas the changes were rated to be moderate or better in Werer Secondary School, a majority of female students in Aba'ala Secondary School confirmed that there was little or no change in teachers' treatment of female students, teachers' support, male students' treatment and teachers' attitudes toward girls' education due to the project's activities. In Mohammed Hanferey Secondary School, on the other hand, female students were almost equally divided; that is, whereas some say there is very little or no change in teachers and fellow male students, others believed otherwise and judged the change to be moderate or better. The ratings thus indicate that Aba'ala and Mohammed Hanferey Secondary Schools have to do more to improve teachers' support, male students' treatment of girls and teachers' attitudes toward girls' education.

The data gathered through interviews and FGDs show clearly the stakeholders' belief that the project had impacts and that it improved conditions in the schools. The main impacts of the project that were identified by the respondents include the following.

- The schools have saved several female students from dropping out because now, unlike in the past, they can support needy female students financially thanks to the project.
- As per the culture of the community in Afar, many girls from Werer Secondary School were married early while they are very young (early marriage). Because of the awareness raising programs organized by the project, however, few girls were saved from early marriage through the collaborative efforts of the principal, teachers and the girls themselves.
- Changes have also been observed among girls. In the past, most of the girls were very shy to ask permission to use toilets during their menstrual cycle. Because of the life skills training they received and the resulting awareness, they no longer fear to ask permission or to talk about the sanitary pad they need during the period.
- Although the project's main objective is supporting female students, the photocopy, writing and printing services that are functional in the school (that is, Werer Secondary School) for income generation has helped the school to make the teaching learning process more convenient for the students. During examination time, teachers used to write the examination questions on the blackboard and that was time consuming especially if teachers develop a large

number of questions. Now that the services mentioned above are available, tests and exams are prepared on paper and the school has become more efficient.

- In the project schools, teachers want to support female students at present. They are supporting female students academically by organizing tutorial classes and so far the school has not paid them any incentives. Besides, they prepare handouts and put them in the copy center where students can get copies of the handout paying for the photocopy service. This way, the students have the handouts for their study but at the same time they contribute to the IGA that support them by photocopying handout and other assignments.

3.5. Sustainability of the Project

In this end term evaluation sustainability of the project is examined in terms of institutional and financial sustainability.

(A) Institutional Sustainability

As discussed in this report, the project has carried out different capacity building trainings and awareness raising workshops for school principals, teachers, students, parents and community members. In particular, training programs related to gender responsive pedagogy, gender responsive lesson planning, and gender responsive teaching and learning materials, gender responsive language use and interaction in the classroom and gender responsive classroom setting for teachers in the project schools have developed their skills and competencies in classroom management and improve girls' performance.

In addition, trainings provided for school principals on gender responsive school management, and developing school level action plan helped the school managers to pay attention to girls' education in their respective schools. Hence, the capacities developed through these different training programs indicate that the schools have developed their (managerial) capacities to manage the results achieved through the project in their schools. This is also clearly stated by some of the respondents who participated in interviews and FGDs. For instance, an expert from Benishangul Gumuz REB states that "The results obtained via the project will sustain due to the capacity building trainings given for the teachers and principals."

On top of this, the skills developed through training (e.g., beauty salon) are useful for the female students who took the training not only because they have the skills now but also they can open a beauty salon themselves in the town and serve the people utilizing the skills they developed through the training. This way, the impacts of the project can be long lasting. These different trainings and workshops conducted were useful in changing the views of key stakeholders including female students. The changes reported seem generally to be real and long lasting.

(B) Financial Sustainability

Financial sustainability is ensured when the schools can generate income even after the termination of the project to continue supporting needy female students. The IGAs appear to be in good condition at the time of the evaluation. Relatively long lasting income generating activities (equipment) are put in place for the project schools so that they can increase their potential to support needy girls financially through the income generated from the activities. Some study participants have similar opinions on the financial sustainability of the project. For example, one of the PTA members interviewed in one of the project schools in Afar stated that:

Yes, the project will continue in the future even if the currently supporting partner terminates its assistance. The reason is that the school has already established one income generating center and is on its way with the second one (the planned school café). With these two centers and others to be created in the future, the project will survive in the absence of the supporting agency.

In a similar vein, a PTA member interviewed in another project school in Afar had the following to say about the financial sustainability of the project in his school.

Yes, I strongly believe that the project will continue in the absence of the supporting NGO because the seed money is not being used up. Rather it is invested on income generating projects and these projects will be there to provide the required finance for running the project objectives on continuous basis. Furthermore, the school had discussion with community representatives (religious and clan leaders) on how to continue the project and they all promised that they will do everything they can to get it going.

According to different respondents, there is no doubt about the financial sustainability of the project due to the IGAs planted. However, the continuity of the activities largely depends on the wise use and management of the income generated from the activities for the purposes of the

project. That is, as the schools continue to provide financial assistance for girls from destitute families, they also need to put in place saving mechanism through which they save a portion of the money from the income generated which may be used for running costs, maintenance of equipment and further expansion of similar IGAs. In so doing, the schools can improve their financial capacity to support a large number of needy girls.

3.6. Challenges

Like other projects, this project has faced several challenges during the implementation period. The major ones are discussed below.

(1) No project-specific focal person was assigned.

The fact that there was no project-specific focal person (or focal person exclusively for the project) to oversee the implementation of the project at the regional level was judged to be a real challenge both by school directors, MOE and UNESCO-IICBA. The focal persons at the REB level assume the position of “focal person” to oversee the implementation of the project in addition to the tasks for which they are primarily responsible. The focal persons have already much workload with their regular job and the additional responsibility as a focal person overburdened them. Besides, the schools are far away from the regional capital as well as from each other and that also appeared to hinder the smooth and timely implementation of the project.

Apart from the above responsibilities, the focal persons serve as task force members whenever there are emergencies (e.g., draught in Afar region) or celebrations (e.g., celebrations of Nations and Nationalities’ Day in Benishangul Gumuz region in 2014) at the regional level. During those times, the focal persons would be fully engaged in their new roles compromising the smooth and timely implementation of the project.

(2) Delay in implementation and release of the project fund

Implementation of the project was very slow. Why? Delay in the initial stage, disagreement between REB and the schools, the slow process of securing working space suitable for business, feasibility of the proposed IGA particularly at Belo Jiganfoy (i.e., electric grinding mill where there is no electric power) were the main problems encountered. The grinding mill should have been a machine that works with diesel. These problems could be due to the fact that the schools

and the REBs did not have any experience pertaining to IGAs or livelihood expertise. What is more, the microfinance office or bureaus in the two regions are not strong enough to provide expert advice or support to the schools.

Timely release of funds was another challenge that created several problems in the implementation of the project. The problem started at the school level but it appeared to have gone as far as the REB and UNESCO-IICBA.

(3) Turnover of school principals

In most of the project schools, the school principals who are now overseeing the implementation of the project were not there at the beginning.

(4) Partnership

One of the challenges encountered in this project was the working relationship (or partnership) between the REBs and project schools. In some of the schools, particularly in Benishangul Gumuz region, the participants complained that “the project was under the complete control of the REB and the school had no say whatsoever” It was also reported that the implementation of the project in the school was delayed for prolonged time due to disagreement between the REB and the committee formed to identify and propose IGA. The committee first proposed constructing a guest house where income is mainly generated by renting bed rooms. But the REB rejected the proposal and another committee was formed in 2014 to work on a different proposal. With pressure from the REB, the committee proposed photocopy service and a beauty salon that gives service to the public. It should be noted at this juncture that MOE, UNESCO-IICBA and the Italian Cooperation had intervened to resolve the problem.

(5) Distance of the project schools from the regional capitals and from each other

The project schools are very far apart and in remote areas. Despite the fact that the schools have so many needy female students, the distance of the schools from the regional capital and from each other made frequent monitoring and evaluation very difficult.

3.7. Lessons Learned

The following lessons were drawn from the project by different respondents.

1. The training on gender responsive pedagogy needs to be strengthened.

So many positive impacts have been reported from each school about the trainings. Some of the trainings were offered to a limited number of participants from the REBs and schools, in a cascading form. The trainees were then expected to train others in their respective schools. Although no uniformity was reported in the trainings which were conducted across the project schools, many of the study participants, however, reported that the impact was surprising.

2. IGA and the need for guidance from a livelihood expert

All stakeholders without exception have judged the IGA as an essential component of the project. Especially of importance is the fact that one way of ensuring sustainability of the project is through IGA. But there was no expert on livelihood that could have helped or advised the REBs and project schools on identifying appropriate, feasible and profitable IGA for each school. Admittedly, UNESCO-IICBA had provided training on IGA for the stakeholders. However, that was not sufficient and there was a pressing need for livelihood experts. The need for such experts and their guidance or advice would become even more important when the originally identified IGA in some. Whereas one possibility was utilizing the expertise of those in the Regional Microfinance Bureaus, the Bureaus were not strong enough to provide their expert advice on IGAs to the project schools. Besides, IGA is out of their expertise for the REBs and the project schools.

CHAPTER FOUR

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1. Conclusion

From the results presented in the previous chapter, one may draw the following conclusions.

Because the project's objectives were consistent with the government's policies and strategies and the fact that the project was launched based on results of a baseline survey that identified the needs of female students in Grades 9 and 10, the project was very relevant. Whereas UNESCO-IICBA had completed the planned tasks within the time frame, there are activities that have not been completed at the school level.

Except for the IGAs, the other components of the project were completed as planned and thus were effective. For example, the training workshops were very effective in bringing about positive changes among teachers, PTA members, school principals and students. Teachers have received training on GRP which has helped them to be gender sensitive in the teaching learning process including lesson planning. Besides, because of the training, the capacity of principals and other school management staff has been built and this has helped them to be more sensitive now than before on gender issues (e.g., GBV) that impact the learning of girls. Furthermore, due to the project, the school-community partnership has been strengthened. This was successful because community leaders were involved as members of the Girls' Education Support Structure (GESS) within a PTA arrangement. Moreover, though not consistent across the project schools, the efforts exerted to improve the pass rate and decrease the dropout rate of female students have yielded some results in most of the schools. In fact, these efforts should continue unabated because particularly achieving objectives pertaining to female students' retention and their academic achievement (pass rate) requires persistent effort and relatively long time as well as efforts from REB and MoE. Thus, one can safely conclude that the project was effective in achieving its objectives with some gaps only on the IGA component. Even the IGAs were effective in some of the project schools although for two of the schools it requires time.

Focusing on the impact of the completed components of the training, however, one can conclude that the project had a significant impact particularly in changing students and teachers' attitudes toward girls' education, male students and teachers' treatment of girls, gender based violence, and even parents' attitudes toward girls' education. These changes are believed to be attributable to the training provided to the different groups of stakeholders. Regarding the impact of the project, once again the IGA component of the project is unfinished hence evaluating its impact at this point of time is challenging except the outcome. In these case a number of 56 students are economically supported.

Finally, sustainability of the project was judged positively. Unlike other projects that provide financial support to needy female students from the beginning up until the completion of the project, the present project focuses on capacity building and IGAs that will continue generating income to support female students beyond the project's life time.

4.2. Recommendations

Based on the evaluation results, the following recommendation are put forth.

Recommendation 1: GRP training

Among the components of the project, the training on GRP was found to be very effective. Despite the positive changes observed in the schools, many interviewees were of the opinion that the GRP training could have been even more effective had it been conducted in the regions where many more teachers could have participated. Thus, whenever UNESCO-IICBA organizes such useful training in the future, it will be important to select a venue in the regional capitals so that there would be more participants.

In addition, because the GRP training was judged to be very effective in bringing about desirable changes in the school communities, it would be useful if provided to all new teachers as well as to those who have been teaching so far. That is to say, such changes can be scaled up substantially if the MOE can mainstream GRP in its Teacher Education Curricula. One way of doing this could be mainstreaming GRP in the pedagogical courses that teachers are required to take while on preservice or in-service training. This is even more relevant to Colleges of Teacher Education (CTE) and Faculties/Colleges in Universities that train teachers as they are the key stakeholders in

teacher training. It is necessary that CTEs, Faculties/Colleges in Universities and the MOE work together to mainstream GRP in the teacher education curricula. In similar other projects, there is also a need on the part of UNESCO-IICBA and MOE to strengthen the partnership between CTEs and Colleges/Faculties in Universities and the schools.

Recommendation 2: IGA

Given the problems that have been reported in identifying feasible and profitable IGA that considers the specific context, one can argue that project schools in which similar other projects will be conducted need proper advice from livelihood experts. This would help them identify appropriate IGA for their schools. Such an expert needs to be employed by respective REBs so that he/she can provide advisory support to schools from the beginning of the project till the end.

Recommendation 3: Turnover of principals

As indicated earlier, turnover of school principals has been a challenge in several of the project schools. Frequent orientation and follow up needed.

Recommendation 4: The need for follow up

Given what has been implemented and achieved so far, one can easily observe that some of the components of the project have yet to be realized. In some of the schools, the scheme proposed for income generation has not yet been functional partly. Aba'ala secondary school in Afar region and Belo Jiganfoy secondary school in Benishangul Gumuz region are good examples. Besides, two of the schools in Afar region (Mohammed Hanferey and Werer secondary schools) have planned to begin a second IGA (in addition to the already existing IGA) with the remaining 40 percent of the project fund. Further, the two project schools in Benishangul Gumuz region (Assosa and Wombera secondary schools). In short, most of the schools need to do more to realize their plans and to make all proposed IGAs functional.

This, in turn, requires serious follow-up and guidance perhaps from the UNESCO-IICBA, MOE and/or REBs. The follow up can be conducted in the form of monitoring and evaluation with a view to ensuring the smooth and appropriate implementation of the proposed IGAs in each school. It should be noted that the monitoring and evaluation could be conducted only if budget is allocated for the purpose. But because the project has already phased out, there may not be readily available

budget to finance the cost of conducting monitoring and evaluation. It is therefore important that the stakeholders (UNESCO-IICBA, MOE and REBs) meet, discuss and explore means of securing the budget needed for monitoring and evaluation. Besides, they also need to discuss and decide as to which entity (MOE or REB) should be primarily responsible to conduct periodic monitoring and evaluation.

Recommendation 5: The need for scaling up

Given the limited funding of the project and the large number of needy female students in the project areas, the project has supported a limited number of female students. But the six project schools constitute only a small part of the schools in the two regions. There are other schools in the same regions that need similar support, financial or otherwise. Thus, the impacts observed in the six project schools need to be scaled up in the other schools in the two regions through new but similar projects. It is, therefore, important that the project continues supporting female students, particularly in providing training to female students and teachers and raising the awareness of parents and the community at large in the same schools. This will help sustain the impacts of the project and the changes so far observed in the schools.

Recommendation 6: The need to focus on the primary objective of the project

The evaluation team would like to emphasize that one of the primary objective of the project is supporting needy female students financially so that they can achieve better in school and continue to attend school at least up until they complete secondary education. The team has observed that the project schools have given more attention to income generation through the IGAs. There should be clear communication and understanding among the stakeholders that the IGAs are primarily meant for supporting needy female students and as long as the school generates income, it should continue supporting female students from poor family backgrounds financially. Further, as long as the school generates income, it can use the money to improve quality of education and to make the school environment more convenient for girls. But such things should be done along with the financial and material support that should be provided to female students from destitute families.

Recommendation 7: Experience sharing among the stakeholders

As shown in the results of the evaluation, the six project schools have proposed and implemented almost different IGAs with few exceptions. Besides, the evaluation has found out that the project schools are at different stages of implementation. Furthermore, the challenges encountered by each school were different. All these call for a joint discussion among the project schools, partners and stakeholders about the experiences they went through, the challenges faced and the way forward. The evaluation team strongly believes that such a formal experience sharing meeting will be essential to motivate the project schools to complete the remaining unfinished components of the project. We therefore recommend an experience sharing workshop to be organized by UNESCO-IICBA where the different stakeholders including those from the project schools participate and share experiences with each other. Such a workshop requires budget and we suggest that the remaining 25,109.29 USD which was not utilized by the project be used for the purpose of organizing the workshop.

References

Gari Duguma & Tolessa Dadi (2013). Baseline Study on Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing Their Learning Outcomes in Afar, Ethiopia.

UNESCO-IICBA (2012). Project document: Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing their Learning Outcomes in Ethiopia.

List of Appendices

Appendix A. Teachers' Questionnaire

Appendix B. Female Students' Questionnaire

Appendix C. Interview Guide (for School Principals)

Appendix D. Interview Guide (for PTA Members)

Appendix E. Interview Guide (for Experts from MOE and REB)

Appendix F. FGD Items For Girls In Project Schools

Appendix G. Forms for Recording Secondary Data

Appendix H. Pass Rate of Female Students on Tenth Grade National Examination

Appendix- A

UNESCO IICBA and Fountain Management Consultancy

Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing their Learning Outcomes in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz Regions, Ethiopia

Questionnaire to be Completed by Teachers

Part I: Background Characteristics of Respondents

- 1.1. Name of school _____
- 1.2. Sex of respondent: Male _____ Female _____ 1.3. Age of the Respondent _____
- 1.4. Educational Qualification _____
- 1.5. Work experience in years _____

Part II: Questions Related to the Project

- 2.1. What were the different supports provided to your school by the project in the last three academic years?

- 2.2. In your opinion, how satisfactory are the impacts of the project in changing conditions that existed before the commencement of the project?

	Very High	High	Average	Low	Very Low
Improved pass rate of grade nine female students					
Improved pass rate of girls on the tenth grade national examination					
Reduced female students' absenteeism (from school)					
Reduced female students' dropouts (Grade 9)					
Reduced female students' repetition (Grade 9)					
Improved girls' academic achievement					
Reduced gender based violence in school					
Improved the attitudes of teachers toward the education of girls					
Improved parents' attitudes toward girls' education					

- 2.3. Did you receive any training from the project? Yes _____ No _____

2.4. If your response to the above question is “yes,” in what areas did you receive the training?

2.5. If your response to the above question (2.4.), please indicate your overall evaluation of the training with respect to the specific points indicated in the table below.

Specific Point	Very High	High	Average	Low	Very Low
Relevance of the training to your daily activities					
Appropriateness of training contents to your daily activities					
Appropriateness of the training methods to you					
Competence of the trainers who offered the training					
Appropriateness of the training time offered to you					
The training changed your views on treating girls in and outside the classroom.					
The level of your overall satisfaction with the training					

2.6. Do you need additional training? Yes _____ No _____

2.7. If your response to the above question (2.6) is “Yes,” list the areas in which you want to receive training.

2.8. Which of the following input related activity has been carried out by the project in your school?

<i>Input-related activity</i>	<i>Yes</i>	<i>No</i>
Provided financial support to girls		
Provided seed money for income generating activity		
Conducted awareness raising programs to girls		
Construction of latrine		
Separate toilet for girls		
Organized tutorial or supplementary classes for girls		
Reading rooms		
Introduced inclusive education		
Conducted community sensitization programs on the importance of girls' education		
Mobilize the community to change the community's perception and attitudes toward girls' education		
Created gender sensitive (friendly) school environment for girls		
Provided reading materials for children		
Textbooks for teachers		
Teacher's Guide		
Textbooks for students		
Awareness creation on HIV and AIDS		
Awareness creation on harmful traditional practices		

2.9. In your opinion, are there changes or improvements registered in your locality due to the inputs provided to the school?

Area of Improvement	Yes	No
Improved the attitudes of female students toward their education		
Improved quality of education provided		
Improved girls' participation in school		
Reduced Grades 9 and 10 female students' dropout		
Improved Grades 9 and 10 female students' academic performance		
Reduced female students' repetition rate (in Grade 9)		
Improved girls' awareness of harmful traditional practices		
Improved community's/parents' awareness on the issues related to HIV and AIDS		
Improved community's/parents' awareness on harmful traditional practices		
Improved community's/parents' awareness on the importance of girls' education		
Improved teachers' attitudes toward female students' education		
Improved teachers' treatment of female students		
Improved the academic support teachers provided to female students		

2.10. In your opinion, have the project's activities addressed the needs of female students in Grades 9-10? Yes _____ No _____

2.11. In your opinion, are there other unmet educational needs of female students in your school? Yes _____ No _____

2.12. If yes for the above question (2.11), list those unmet educational needs that should be addressed in the future in the woreda?

2.13. What is your overall evaluation of the sustainability of project activities? Do you think the community can own and sustain the activities in the absence of the donor?

- How do you evaluate the community's Attitude towards project activities?

- How do you evaluate the financial capacity of the community?

- How do you evaluate the managerial capacity of the community?

2.14. Are there any sustainability measures that are being undertaken by the community, local administration, etc, to own the activities after donor withdrawal? Yes _____ No _____

- If yes, please list the measures that are being undertaken.

2.15. Please describe your overall assessment of the project's contributions to female students, teachers and the community at large.

2.16. What is your overall assessment of the project's relevance to female students, teachers and the community at large?

2.17. In your opinion, what were the strengths of the project?

2.18. In your opinion, what were the major weaknesses of the project, if any?

2.19. How would you judge the project's overall accomplishments? Please describe the project's strengths and weaknesses. .

Overall Judgment of the Project's Accomplishment

The Project's Strengths

The Project's Weaknesses

Appendix-B

UNESCO IICBA and Fountain Management Consultancy

Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing their Learning Outcomes in Afar and Benishangul Gumuz Regions, Ethiopia

(Questionnaire to be completed by Female Students)

Part I: Background Characteristics of Respondents

1.1. Name of school _____

1.2. Age of the Respondent _____

Part II: Questions Related to the Project

2.1. Did you receive any kind of support from the project? Yes _____ No _____

2.2. If your response to the above question is “yes,” please list all kinds of supports that you have received from the project.

2.3. In your opinion, did the project bring about positive changes in the attitudes, perceptions and treatment of teachers, male students and the school community at large in relation to female students’ education? Check one of the response options.

	High	Average	Low	No Change
Positive changes in teachers’ treatment of female students.				
Teachers now support female students academically.				
Male students treat female students better now than in the past.				
Teachers’ attitudes toward female students’ education have improved.				
Gender based violence is reduced.				
Parents’ attitudes toward girls’ education have improved.				
Reduced female students’ workload at home				
Improved family support for female students’ education				

2.4. Did the project bring about positive changes in your attitudes toward your education, academic performance, absenteeism, etc.? Check one of the response options.

	High	Average	Low	No Change
Change in attitudes toward your own education				
Changes in your school results				
Changes in your absenteeism (from school)				
Changes in late coming (to school)				
Changes in your study habits				

2.5. In your opinion, are there changes or improvements registered in your locality due to the inputs provided to the school by the project?

Area of Improvement	Yes	No
Improved the attitudes of female students toward their education		
Improved quality of education provided		
Improved girls' participation in school		
Reduced Grades 9 and 10 female students' dropout		
Improved Grades 9 and 10 female students' academic performance		
Reduced female students' repetition rate (in Grade 9)		
Improved girls' awareness of harmful traditional practices		
Improved community's/parents' awareness on harmful traditional practices		
Improved community's/parents' awareness on the importance of girls' education		
Improved teachers' attitudes toward female students' education		
Improved teachers' treatment of female students		
Improved the academic support teachers provided to female students		

2.6. In your opinion, have the project's activities addressed the needs of female students in Grades 9-10? Yes _____ No _____

2.7. In your opinion, are there other unmet educational needs of female students in your school? Yes _____ No _____

2.8. If yes for the above question (2.11), list those unmet educational needs that should be addressed in the future in the woreda?

2.9. What is your overall evaluation of the sustainability of project activities? Do you think the community can own and sustain the activities in the absence of the donor?

- How do you evaluate the community's attitude towards project activities?

- How do you evaluate the financial capacity of the community?

- How do you evaluate the managerial capacity of the community?

2.10. In your opinion, what were the strengths of the project?

2.11. In your opinion, what were the major weaknesses of the project, if any?

2.12. If you have any other comments or suggestions, please describe them here.

Appendix - C

Prepared by UNESCO-IICBA and Fountain Management Consultancy

Structured Interview for School Principals in Project Schools

Woreda _____ Name of School _____

Capture: Sex, age, qualification, years of services and position of respondents

1. Do you know “retaining girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Ethiopia” project?
2. What are the different activities/supports offered by the project in your school?
3. What are the different benefits gained from the project, in terms of improving girls’ achievement, reducing the drop out of girls, reducing repetition of girls in your school?
4. What were the different capacity building programmes provided by the project to principals, teachers and community representatives? How do you evaluate the relevance of these training programmes in promoting girls education in the area?
5. Do you think the project has addressed the educational demands of the surrounding communities? How?
6. Have you been participated in the implementation of the project? Would you mention some of your roles?
7. How do you evaluate your work relationship with project managers?
8. How did the project financial management processes and procedures affect the project implementation process?
9. Do you think the project will continue in the future in case the sponsoring NGO terminates its supports? How?
10. Do you think there are other educational demands that are not addressed by the project? Mention specific needs that need to be addressed in future interventions?
11. What do you think are good lessons gained from the project? What are the good qualities of the project? What are major weaknesses of the project? What were the major challenges faced while implementing the project?
12. Your overall evaluation of the project? Your overall suggestions for future actions?

Thank you.

Appendix- D

Prepared by UNESCO-IICBA and Fountain Management Consultancy

Interview for PTA Members

Name of Project School _____ woreda _____

Capture: Sex, age, qualification, years of services and position of respondents

1. Do you know “retaining girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Ethiopia” project?
2. What are the different activities/supports offered by the project in your school? Who were the beneficiaries/targets of the project?
3. What were your contributions to achieve the objectives of the project?
4. Have you received/participated in any training programme to build your capacity by the project? How do you see the relevance of the training programmes in promoting girls education in the area?
5. Have you been participated in the implementation of the project? Would you mention some of your roles?
6. Do you think the project will continue in the future in case the sponsoring NGO terminates its supports? How?
7. Do you think there are other educational demands that are not addressed by the project? Mention specific needs that need to be addressed in future interventions?
8. What do you think are good lessons gained from the project? What are the good qualities of the project? What are major weaknesses of the project?

Thank you

Appendix - E

Prepared by UNESCO-IICBA and Fountain Management Consultancy

Interview Items for Experts at Different Levels (MoE, REB and WEOs)

Capture: Sex, age, qualification, years of services and position of respondents

1. Do you know “retaining girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Ethiopia” project?
2. How relevant was the project in promoting girls education in terms of reducing girls drop out, improving their retention, attendance, reducing repetition rates, and improving their academic performances in project schools?
3. How relevant was the project in increasing awareness on the relevance of girls’ education for children, community, teachers and school administrators in the area?
4. Do you think all the activities of the project have been implemented as planned? Issues that may have affected implementation of planned activities. If any?
5. Are you satisfied with pace of implementation of the project? Were there any delays in the course of implementation of the project? What were the causes of delay, if any, according to you?
6. Do you think the project management has used project resources such as finance economically? If not, suggestions on more economical ways to use the resources?
7. What monitoring and evaluation mechanisms were in place during the implementation period of the project?
8. What comments or suggestions do you have on the way the Project has been managed?
9. Do you think the project has produced the results that were envisaged in its objectives?
10. To what extent have the following envisaged results been achieved?
 - Improve the retention of girls in lower secondary schools by reducing dropout rate for girls, and improve their learning outcome as measured by the Ethiopian General Secondary Education Certificate Examination in the two regions of Afar and Benishangul Gumuz of Ethiopia?
 - Sensitise teachers on gender-related issues in the teaching learning process through training in gender-sensitive pedagogy
 - Build the capacity of principals, head teachers and other school management staff on gender-issues that impact the learning of girls in the pilot schools
 - Strengthen School-Community Partnerships to assist the retention of girls in schools
 - Increase the retention of girls in lower secondary and improve their learning outcomes through a multi-faceted intervention
 - Share the best practice experience during the life of the project and assist in the replication of good practices in other districts of the two regions.
11. To what extent were the following projects activities have been implemented in the two regions of Afar and Benishangul Gumuz of Ethiopia?
 - 11.1. To what extent capacity Building Training Workshops for Teacher Educators and School Management Staff have been offered?
 - a. Organised training workshops for the REB and CTE staff on Gender mainstreaming as well as teacher educators and school management staff in the TEIs found in the two regions?

b. Offered (Six) one-week training workshops (three in each region) organized in the three areas of training - Gender Responsive Pedagogy, Gender Sensitive School Management and Leadership, and Gender Relevant Curriculum?

11.2. To what extent was the project provided Supportive Supervision?

a. Gender experts from the Gender Directorate of the Ministry of Education provided supportive training and supervision?

11.3. To what extent the project has strengthened Community – School Partnership and Advocacy on Girls' Education?

a. Setup a Girls' Education Support Structure units in the six schools selected from the two regions?

b. To what extent Periodic consultative visits and/or trainings provided to GESS members to build capacity and advocacy roles?

c. To what extent equipment and/or supplies provided to the girls' hostels from project funds in the two regions? What were the items?

11.4. To what extent the project explored income generating possibilities to support girls' education in the two regions?

a. To what extent a set of income generating schemes identified to support girls with school materials, uniforms and other related expenses have been provided with the seed money from the project fund? List of these school materials, uniforms and other related materials provided in project schools?

12. What do you think are the impacts of the project on beneficiary girls, community members, teachers and school principals?

13. Have PTAs and education boards received any capacity building/awareness raising training? What were the major components of training provided to the PTAs and education boards?

14. What were the challenges that have been experienced in the course of implementing this project?

15. What lessons have been learnt in the course of implementation of the project?

16. Do you think the project will continue in the future in case the sponsoring NGO terminates its supports? How?

17. Do you think there are other educational demands that are not addressed by the project? Mention specific needs that need to be addressed in future interventions?

Thank you

Appendix - F

Prepared by UNESCO-IICBA and Fountain Management Consultancy

FGD Items for Girls in Project Schools

Woreda _____ Name of School _____

Capture: Grade and age of respondents

1. Do you know “retaining girls in lower secondary schools and increasing their learning outcomes in Ethiopia” project?
2. What are the different activities/supports offered by the project in your school? Who were the beneficiaries/targets of the project?

3. What were the different supports you obtained from the project?
4. What are the different benefits gained from the project, in terms of improving girls' achievement, reducing the drop out of girls, reducing repetition of girls in your school?
5. Do you think there are other educational demands that are not addressed by the project? Mention specific needs that need to be addressed in future interventions?
6. Do you think the project will continue in the future in case the sponsoring NGO terminates its supports? How?
7. What do you think are good lessons gained from the project? What are the good qualities of the project? What are major weaknesses of the project? What were the major challenges faced while implementing the project?
8. Your overall evaluation of the project? Your overall suggestions for future actions?

Thank you

Appendix- G

UNESCO IICBA and Fountain Management Consultancy

Retaining Girls in Lower Secondary Schools and Increasing their Learning Outcomes in Ethiopia

FORMS FOR RECORDING SECONDARY DATA

(1) Statistics on Enrollment of Male and Female Students (2004 – 2007 E.C.)

Project School	Grade	2004 E.C. (2011/12)			2005 E.C. (2012/13)			2006 E.C. (2013/14)			2007 E.C. (2014/15)		
		M	F	T	M	M	F	T	M	M	F	T	M
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												

(2) Statistics on Dropouts (2004 – 2007 E.C.)

Project School	Grade	2004 E.C. (2011/12)			2005 E.C. (2012/13)			2006 E.C. (2013/14)			2007 E.C. (2014/15)		
		M	F	T	M	M	F	T	M	M	F	T	M
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												

(3) Statistics on Repeaters (2004 – 2007 E.C.)

Project School	Grade	2004 E.C. (2011/12)			2005 E.C. (2012/13)			2006 E.C. (2013/14)			2007 E.C. (2014/15)		
		M	F	T	M	M	F	T	M	M	F	T	M
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												
	9												
	10												

(1) Pass Rate of Female and Male Students on TENTH GRADE National Examination (2011 – 2015)

Project School	Number of Students who	2004 E.C. (2011/12)			2005 E.C. (2012/13)			2006 E.C. (2013/14)			2007 E.C. (2014/15)		
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
	SAT FOR THE EXAM												
	PASSED THE EXAM												
	SAT FOR THE EXAM												
	PASSED THE EXAM												
	SAT FOR THE EXAM												
	PASSED THE EXAM												
	SAT FOR THE EXAM												
	PASSED THE EXAM												

Appendix H: Pass Rate of Female Students

Table 11: Pass Rate (in Percent) of Female Students on the Tenth Grade National Examination

Region	Project School	2005 E.C. (2012/13)	2006 E.C. (2013/14)	2007 E.C. (2014/15)
Afar	Aba'ala	NA	35	59
	Mohammed Hanferey	31	48	71
	Werer	65	65	84
Benishangul Gumuz	Assosa	58	52	51
	Belo Jiganfoy	3	23	62
	Wombera	45	54	NA

Source: School records

The percentage is obtained by dividing the number of 10th grade students who passed the national exam by the total number of female students who sat for the exam and multiplying the quotient by 100. Overall, the pass rate in the six schools ranged from 3 percent to 84 percent.

Examining the pass rate and its trend for each school, one can observe that with the exception of Assosa Secondary School, there was what one may call an increasing trend in the pass rate in the other five schools.