TCG-8/W/3

TCG PROGRESS REPORT

2020 - 2021

Introduction

The Technical Cooperation Group on the Indicators for SDG 4 – Education 2030 (TCG) held its seventh meeting ([TCG 7](#)) virtually. In mid-2021, one working group and one plenary were also held.

Consultation June 2021

The Secretariat of the TCG convened its members to a [meeting on 21 June 2021](#) to present the most recent activities and developments on the implementation of the SDG 4 Indicator Framework, and briefed the participants on the following topics:

1. **TCG progress and update on benchmarks** Member States, regional organizations and partners in all regions have been actively collaborating to implement the regional benchmarking process and discuss indicators for regional benchmarking, which will take into consideration the disparities across regions and guide countries in setting benchmarks at the national level.

2. **Equity benchmarks** In October 2020, the TCG approved a technical and political process for setting benchmarks. However, the seventh benchmark indicator on equity remained to be discussed in greater detail. Since then, options have been explored and were presented to the TCG Members.

3. **Regional/global aggregates** So far, such aggregates have been reported for 5 of the 12 SDG 4 Global Indicators. This year at the 2021 UNSG SDG Report, regional and global aggregates will be reported for almost all SDG 4 indicators for the first time. Yet, an agreement must be reached on the definitions and methodologies for regional averages for most SDG 4 indicators.

Following the meeting, a consultation of the TCG Members was opened on the options proposed for the benchmark indicator on equity and regional and global aggregates for SDG indicators 4.1.1, 4.1.2, parity indices and finance indicators. Votes were counted as stipulated in the [TCG Rules for Voting](#).

In total, 17 Members casted their votes and the results of the consultation are presented in this report.

Consultation results summary

ISSUE	DECISION
Benchmark: Indicator on Equity	The indicator/measure of **gender gap of the secondary completion rate** should be used as benchmark indicator for equity
Regional and global aggregates	
4.1.1 – Learning assessment data-based indicators	**Enrolment** should be used as population weight - When data is missing, **imputing missing values based on other information** should be chosen. The statistical model and the variables used for imputation will be clearly document and reported to the TCG. **50% of countries** is the minimum representation to report on regional or global aggregates - The **past 5 years** is the reference period to use to report to regional or global aggregate
4.1.2 – Survey-based indicator	- The **cohort size** (10-14 year old for primary, 15-19 year old for lower secondary, 20-24 year old for upper secondary) should be used as population weight - When data is missing the **imputation of missing values based on other information** should be use. The statistical model and the variables used for imputation will be clearly documented. **50% of countries** is the minimum representation to report the regional or global aggregates - The **past 5 years** is the reference period to report the regional or global aggregate.
Parity Indices	- The **median of countries**, i.e. average over individual countries' parity index, should be used as population weight. **50% of countries** is the minimum representation to report the regional or global aggregates
1.a.2 – Finance indicator	- The **median of countries**, i.e. average over individual countries, should be used as population weight - When data is missing, **imputation of missing values based on other information** should be used. The statistical model and the variables used for imputation will be clearly documented. - The minimum representation to report the regional/global aggregate should be **50% of countries in the region**.
Confidence Intervals and Disaggregation	The indicators 4.1.1, 4.1.2 and 4.2.2 **should be disaggregated for urban/rural region and bottom/top quintile**.

Indicator dissemination

Following the 7th meeting of the Technical Cooperation Group (TCG) in October 2020, the members were consulted on various issues, namely on the revised title and addition of the following indicators that all were released in 2021.

INDICATOR	RELEASED IN FEBRUARY
4.1.0	New indicator merging indicator 4.1.1 and 4.1.2 called "Proportion of children/young people prepared for the future, by sex"
4.5.2	Percentage of students **in a) early grades, b) at the end of primary, and c) at the end of lower secondary education** who have their first or home language as language of instruction.
4.5.3	*New name* Existence of funding mechanisms to reallocate education resources to disadvantage populations
	Development of a qualitative indicator with a three-point scale
4.a.2	Percentage of students experiencing bullying in the last 12 months in **a) primary, and b) lower secondary education**
4.c.5	Use statutory teacher salaries as interim reporting strategy until further methodological work is done. OECD countries reported using Education at a Glance data. - Initiate a collaboration between the UIS and ILO in order to advance in the definition of indicator guidelines for a long-term approach to report
4.c.7	The use of TALIS for OECD countries in TCG6 and had been extended. Approval of the use of TALIS and Learning Assessments for all countries.
4.a.1	Use learning assessments to fill data gaps for the sub-indicators of SDG 4.a.1: a) electricity, b) the Internet, c) computers for educational purposes, and e) basic drinking water *Approval of new metadata by IAEG-SDG January 2021*

National benchmarks

The UIS and the Global Education Meeting (GEM) Report have been working closely with regional partners and Member States towards two deadlines:

- Endorsement of the minimum regional benchmarks by regional entities and their Member States who participated in various consultation rounds by July 2021. Table 1 summarizes the processes that took place in each region.
- Submission by Member States of national benchmarks by 15 October 2021 in view of the next UNESCO General Conference in November 2021.

AFRICA	ASIA AND THE PACIFIC	ARAB STATES	LATIN AMERICA	EUROPE
October 2020: consultations UIS & the **African Union Commission** **February 2021:** consultations experts from the AU member states, the **Regional Economic Communities (RECs)** and key **stakeholders** **May-June 2021**: UIS and **IPED** set up 5 regional meetings on regional benchmarking process in each region	UIS partnered with **UNESCO Bangkok** and **Learning and Education2030+ Networking Group** in establishing regional benchmarks for the region. Regional partners: **ASEAN, SEAMEO, SAARC, SPC Pacific Community** **Oct-Nov 2020**: regional consultation and technical team meetings **Mar-April 2021**: sub-regional consultations and country feedback	UIS partnered with **UNESCO Beirut** in establishing regional benchmarks for the region, together with regional partners such as **ABEGS**, RCEP **End of 2020**: High-level meetings **Early 2021**: Consultation with regional stakeholders and one-to-one meetings with Ministries of Education	UIS partnered with **UNESCO Santiago** in establishing regional benchmarks for the region, together with regional partners such as ECLAC, OEI, CARICOM, CECC-SICA	
•Agreement on all proposed indicators for regional benchmarks •Additional indicators proposed	• Agreement on all proposed indicators for regional benchmarks • Additional indicators proposed	• Commitment to the benchmarking process • Proposed benchmarks shared with Member States		• Commitment to the benchmarking process • Set their own 7 indicators, 3 of which align with the SDG indicators
Regional benchmarking consultations on SDG4 and CESA 16-25 with Members States	Summary Report of Asia and Pacific Regional Technical Consultation on Regional benchmarks for SDG4	Education Monitoring in Arab countries and SDG 4 (in progress)	Continental Overview: Bridging Latin America and the Caribbean Monitoring Frameworks and the SDG 4	Continental Overview: Monitoring the SDG 4 in Europe, North America and Caucasus and Central Asia (in progress)

All benchmark-related information is found on the [TCG](#) website, including the [country](#), [regional](#) and [global](#) dashboards with minimum and feasible benchmarks for countries' consideration. More information on the process of establishing national benchmarks is available in the paper 'Update on the process of defining national SDG 4 benchmarks' prepared by UIS/GEMR (WG/W/5).

Survey design and implementation on *Tracking Policy Commitments*

The UIS managed and coordinated the production and implementation of the following projects:

- Survey of National Education Responses to COVID-19 School Closures (also referred as the Joint Survey), third iteration with the World Bank, the OECD, and UNICEF. The questionnaire and a glossary were translated in five languages (English, French, Spanish, Russian, and Arabic).
- Tracking on October 2020 Global Education Meeting and Mission Recovery commitments

Meetings and webinars

Several meetings were held by the TCG Secretariat since the last TCG annual meeting.

- **TCG meeting** ([concept note](#)) on 21 June 2021: the meeting had for objective to update the TCG Members and observing participants on the progress of the benchmarks and other indicator developments, to propose options pertaining to the equity benchmark indicator, and to present definitions for regional averages for most SDG 4 indicators to reach an agreement.
- **TCG working group on education expenditure** ([concept note](#)) on 18 June 2021: the working group members were brought together (virtually) by the TCG Secretariat and the chair of the working group to review the proposal of the UIS to fill the data gaps in expenditure using all sources of information.
- **TCG webinar**: launch of [Guidelines for Data Collection to Measure SDG 4.7.4 and 4.7.5](#) (on 30 June 2021), during which the different phases of nationally representative educational assessments were presented.

Communication and outreach

The TCG Secretariat has published the following papers and blogs.

Information/Research Papers

SDG 4 Data Digest 2020 ([English](#), [French](#), [Spanish](#))

Continental Overview: Bridging CESA and SDG 4 in Africa ([English](#), [French](#))

Using ISCED to Compare Education Systems ([English](#), [French](#), [Spanish](#)) and online diagrams available on the new [ISCED website](#)

Pandemic-Related Disruptions to Schooling and Impacts on Learning Proficiency Indicators ([English](#), French, Spanish)

Guidelines for Data Collection to Measure SDG 4.7.4 and 4.7.5 ([English](#))

School Closures and Regional Policies to Mitigate Learning Loss due to COVID-19: A Focus on the Asia-Pacific (Co-branded paper with UNESCO Bangkok) ([English](#))

Blogs (UIS website only)

Disruptions to Schooling and the Need for Recovery ([English](#))

Bridging CESA 16-25 and SDG 4: Using Regional Benchmarks to Meet Education Objectives ([English](#))

Using Household Surveys to Achieve the SDG 4 Objectives of Inclusivity and Equity ([English](#))

Blogs (cross-published)

How the SDG 4.1.1 Framework and Learning Poverty Can Help Countries Focus Their Education Policy Response ([Arabic](#), [English](#), [French](#), [Portuguese](#), [Russian](#), [Spanish](#))

Building Back Better After COVID-19: The Importance of Tracking Learning Inequality ([English](#), [French](#), [Spanish](#)) – (World Bank Group)

Visualizing Education Systems around the World ([English](#)) (GEM Report)

Gender Equality in the Global Return to School (Think Global Health) ([English](#))

Will Every Child be Able to Read by 2030? (World Bank) ([English](#))

Have we Underestimated the Number of Students Affected by School Closures? (GEM Report) ([English](#))

Recognizing the Power of Foundational Learning Data (Center for Global Development) ([English](#))