



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization



UNESCO
INSTITUTE
FOR
STATISTICS



TECHNICAL
COOPERATION
GROUP



Report on indicator 4.7.1

TCG6/REF/2



1. Introduction

The document presents a comparison of instruments for collection of data for SDG indicators 4.7.1, 12.8.1 and 13.3.1

- **SDG indicator 4.7.1:** Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed in (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment.
- **SDG indicator 12.8.1:** Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development (including climate change education) are mainstreamed in (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment.
- **SDG indicator 13.3.1:** Number of countries that have integrated mitigation, adaptation, impact reduction and early warning into primary, secondary and tertiary curricula.

Criteria	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5	Option 6	Option 7	Option 8
Description	UNESCO questionnaire to monitor implementation of 1974 Recommendation	UIS questionnaire to collect information on dimensions of indicator 4.7.1, based on coding scheme developed by IBE and GEM Report	Proposal for measurement of indicator 4.7.1 based on ICCS questionnaire	Council of Europe: Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education	Human Rights Education Indicator Framework (draft)	Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development	International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS)	Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)
Type of instrument	Intergovernmental process	Intergovernmental process, document review	Intergovernmental process, document review	Intergovernmental process	Intergovernmental process	Intergovernmental process	Learning assessment	Learning assessment
Data collection partners	UNESCO	UIS, UNESCO	UIS	Council of Europe	OHCHR, Danish Institute for Human Rights	UN Economic Commission for Europe	IEA	OECD
Website				https://www.coe.int/en/web/edc/2016-report-analysis https://www.coe.int/en/web/edc/report-on-the-state-of-citizenship-and-human-rights-in-europe	https://www.humanrights.dk/projects/n-o-quality-education-without-human-rights	http://www.unece.org/env/esd/implementation.html	https://www.iea.nl/studies/iea/iccs https://www.iea.nl/sites/default/files/2019-05/ICCS2016_IDB_Usa_Guide.pdf	https://www.oecd.org/pisa/ https://www.oecd.org/pisa/PISA-2018-Global-Competence-Questionnaire.pdf
Frequency of data collection	Every 4 years, next in 2020	To be determined	To be determined	Every 5 years, next in 2021		Every 3-5 years, last in 2018, next in 2022 or 2023	Every 6-7 years, next in 2022	One-time cognitive assessment in 2018
Questionnaire format	Word and online	Online	Online	Online	Excel		Online	Computer-based
Testing of questionnaire	Planned for pilot countries	Planned pilot of online questionnaire	Planned pilot of online questionnaire for primary education		Tested with staff from national human rights institutions			Assessment conducted in 2018



Criteria	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5	Option 6	Option 7	Option 8
Number of questions	About 14 for indicators 4.7.1, 12.8.1 and 13.3.1. About 25 for full questionnaire	6 full questionnaire	7 full questionnaire	7 for GCED part of 4.7.1. 26 full questionnaire	27 full questionnaire	14 to 15 for ESD part of 4.7.1 and 12.8.1. 52 full questionnaire	17 for GCED part of 4.7.1. 29 full questionnaire	8 for ESD part of 4.7.1. 39 full questionnaire (15 students, 6 schools, 11 teachers, 7 parents)
Respondent	Ministries of Education or other government agencies responsible for education	Option 1: Government agencies complete questionnaire. Option 2: UIS assessment of government documents	Government officials or experts in countries as in ICCS	Ministries of Education, other government agencies responsible for education or National Coordinators for ECD/HRE. Separate questionnaire for NGOs.	National human rights institutions, Ministries of Education (to be determined)	Ministries of Environment or of Education or other government bodies responsible for environment, sustainability or education	ICCS National Research Coordinators	Students, school principals, teachers, parents.
Objectivity, potential bias	Self-reported by government officials	Option 1: Self-reported by government officials. Option 2: Assessment by UIS.	Option 1: Self-reported by government officials. Option 2: Assessment by UIS.	Self-reported by government officials, NGO representatives	Self-reported by officials from national human rights institutions, Ministries of Education (to be determined)	Self-reported by government officials	Self-reported, not by government officials	Self-reported by students, school principals, teachers, parents.
Supporting evidence for answers	Reference documents, website links	Reference documents, website links	Reference documents, website links	Reference documents, website links	Reference documents, website links	Reference documents, website links	Reference documents, website links	None
Levels and types of education	Pre-primary, primary, secondary, tertiary; non-formal	Primary, secondary	Primary, secondary	Pre-primary, primary, secondary, higher	Primary and secondary	Pre-primary, primary, secondary, post-secondary non-tertiary, tertiary; non-formal	Some primary and secondary. Mainly grade targeted by study.	Secondary (15-year-old students and their schools, teachers, parents).

Criteria	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5	Option 6	Option 7	Option 8
Topics								
Definition of Global Citizenship Education	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes
Definition of Education for Sustainable Development	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	No
Gender equality	Yes (A2-3, B2, B3b, C3, D2)	Yes (Q2)	Yes (Q4b)	No	Yes (policy Q4, 5, 7)	Yes (partly, Q2.1.1)	No	Yes (students Q2, 6; schools Q4; teachers Q2, 3, 5, 7; parents Q6)
Human rights education	Yes (A2-3, B2, B3a, C3, D2)	Yes (Q1)	Yes (Q4)	Yes	Yes	Yes (partly, Q2.1.1)	Yes (partly, Q16-17)	Yes (students Q1, 2, 6-8; schools Q1-4; teachers Q2, 3, Q5-7, 9-10; parents Q3, 5-6)
Climate change education	Yes (A2-3, B2, B3a, C3, D2)	Yes (Q5)	No	No	No	Yes (partly, Q2.1.1)	No	Yes (partly; students Q1, 2; schools Q4; teachers Q6; parents Q6)
Domains								
National education policies	Yes (A2-4, E1(a))	Yes (Q1-6)	Yes (Q1)	Yes (Q11, 15)	Yes	Yes (Q1.2.1, 1.2.2(a), 1.2.3, 1.2.4, 1.3.1)	Yes (Q9, 11)	No
Curricula	Yes (4.7.1 and 12.8.1: B2, B4-5, E1(b); 13.3.1: B2-5, E1(b))	Yes (Q1-6)	Yes (Q2-4)	Yes (Q12, 14)	Yes	Yes (Q1.2.2(b), 2.1.1, 2.1.2, 2.1.3, 4.2.2, 5.1.3)	Yes (Q10, 12-18)	Yes (students Q13; schools Q1, 3, 4; teachers Q5, 6)
Teacher education	Yes (C2-5, E1(c))	Yes (Q1-6)	Yes (Q5-6)	Yes (Q16)	Yes	Yes (Q3.1.1, 3.1.2, 3.1.3)	Yes (Q23-26)	Yes (teachers Q2, 3)
Student assessments	Yes (D2-3, E1(d))	Yes (Q1-6)	Yes (Q7)	Yes (partly, Q18, 20)	Yes	Yes (partly, Q2.5.3)	Yes (Q27-29)	No

Criteria	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5	Option 6	Option 7	Option 8
Ease of responding	Easy (questions related to indicators 4.7.1, 12.8.1, 13.3.1)	Easy	Easy	Medium	Medium	Medium	Medium	Easy
Indicator calculation method	Documented and easy to understand	Documented and easy to understand	Documented and easy to understand		Documented	Documented (but not for SDG indicators)		Not yet documented
Reporting format	Word, PDF, online	Indicator dashboard	Indicator dashboard					
Number of countries with data	Previous consultations (57 countries in 2012 round, 85 countries in 2016 round) do not meet requirements for calculation of indicator 4.7.1.	Not started	ICCS: 38 in 2009, 24 in 2016.	41 in 2012 round. 40 in 2016 round.	Not started	38 in 2014 round. 30 in 2018 round.	38 in 2009. 24 in 2016.	56 in 2018.
Other comments			Health and well-being not covered		Information above refers to a draft questionnaire of June 2019. The questionnaire is subject to further revision.		GCED questions are in National Contexts Survey, p. 147-170 of User Guide.	Information above refers to assessment of global competences in questionnaires for students, schools, teachers and parents.



2. Questions for TCG consultation on measurement of SDG indicators 4.7.1, 12.8.1 and 13.3.1

1. Which type of instrument should be used? (select one option)

- (a) Self-reported by government officials
- (b) Review of official documents by non-government respondents
- (c) Both

2. How often should data be collected? (select one option)

- (a) Every year
- (b) Every 2 years
- (c) Every 3-4 years
- (d) Every 5 years or less frequently

3. For which levels and types of education should data be collected? (select all that apply)

- (a) Pre-primary
- (b) Primary
- (c) Secondary
- (d) Post-secondary non-tertiary
- (e) Tertiary
- (f) Non-formal education

4. Should climate change education be included in the data collection (for indicator 13.3.1)?

- (a) Yes
- (b) No

5. Should data from various sources be used to collect data for indicators 4.7.1 and 12.8.1?

- (a) Yes
- (b) No

6. Which instrument is most suitable for collection of data for indicators 4.7.1 and 12.8.1? (select one option)

- (a) UNESCO questionnaire to monitor implementation of 1974 Recommendation
- (b) UIS questionnaire to collect information on dimensions of indicator 4.7.1, based on coding scheme developed by IBE and GEM Report
- (c) Proposal for measurement of indicator 4.7.1 based on ICCS questionnaire



- (d) Council of Europe: Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education
- (e) Human Rights Education Indicator Framework
- (f) Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development
- (g) International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS)
- (h) Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)

7. Which other instruments should be used to collect data for indicators 4.7.1 and 12.8.1? (select all that apply)

- (a) UNESCO questionnaire to monitor implementation of 1974 Recommendation
- (b) UIS questionnaire to collect information on dimensions of indicator 4.7.1, based on coding scheme developed by IBE and GEM Report
- (c) Proposal for measurement of indicator 4.7.1 based on ICCS questionnaire
- (d) Council of Europe: Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education
- (e) Human Rights Education Indicator Framework
- (f) Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development
- (g) International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS)
- (h) Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)
- (i) No other instrument