SDG indicator 4.7.1: Proposal for monitoring

TCG6/REF/3

Prepared by Daniel Capistrano

Goal 4: Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

Target 4.7: By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

Indicator 4.7.1: Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in: (a) national education policies (b) curricula (c) teacher education and (d) student assessments

Objective

A proposal for data collection based on a minimal conceptualization of Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) for SDG indicator 4.7.1.

Concepts and definitions

Rationale

Indicator 4.7.1 measures the extent to which countries mainstream Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD). Among the concepts included are gender equality and human rights. In the Human Rights aspect there is a well-established country reporting system managed by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) associated to the World Programme on Human Rights Education (an outcome of the UN Decade for Human Rights Education, 1995-2004).

The indicator requires as inputs an operational definition of each of the main constructs, GCED and ESD. They currently have no universal definition, but it has been identified that there is set of desirable sub-constructs for each of two main domains that are operationalized in countries. As the implementation is not uniform and varies according to the relevance for each particular reality, the different areas could have different degrees of implementation.

The indicator is not dichotomous for each component but instead is a dashboard of four components. The interpretation is rather simple: the higher the value, the more concepts related to GCED and ESD are incorporated into educational practices, and therefore, the higher the potential to fulfil the transformational potential for change in a given education system. This will serve to guide policy-makers as they could incorporate different dimensions according to needs without following a one-fits-all model.

Concepts

Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) empowers learners to take informed decisions and responsible actions for environmental integrity, economic viability and a just society, for present

and future generations, while respecting cultural diversity. ESD is about lifelong learning, and is an integral part of quality education.[1]

Global Citizenship Education (GCED) nurtures respect for all, building a sense of belonging to a common humanity and helping learners become responsible and active global citizens. GCED aims to empower learners to assume active roles to face and resolve global challenges and to become proactive contributors to a more peaceful, tolerant, and inclusive and secure world.[2]

Operationalization

A research team from the International Bureau of Education and the Global Education Monitoring Report team developed a coding scheme (IBE, 2019) to analyze the presence of GCED and ESD in national curricula. The resulting scheme is comprised of six categories in the knowledge dimension (Annex I):

Human Rights; Gender Equality; Peace, Non-violence and Human Security; Health and Well-being; Sustainable Development; Interconnectedness and Global Citizenship;

Each of these categories is divided into sub-categories, which range in number from three to eleven and are based on UNESCO's recommendations (UNESCO, 2012a, 2012b, 2013, 2014, 2015). All of them have associated terms and concepts that can facilitate the operationalization of the GCED and ESD concepts. The same categories and subcategories will be used for all components of the indicator.

Methodology

The computation method is rather simple. A closed-ended questionnaire will be used to calculate the four components of the dashboard: (a) national education policy, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment (see Annex I). All components have the same categories and subcategories.

Countries' responses have a value 1 or 0 for a given category in a given component if any of the key words in the category is mentioned in the national curriculum. For example, in the category "human rights" it will be enough to mention any of the subcategories in the table below (human rights, freedom of expression, social justice, democracy, or human rights education) for the category to have a 1.

---

[1] UNESCO, "What is Education for Sustainable Development?", https://en.unesco.org/themes/education-sustainable-development/what-is-esd.
[2] UN Academic Impact, "Global Citizenship Education", https://academicimpact.un.org/content/global-citizenship-education.

Table 1. Proposed questionnaire

Please reply yes or no for each cell (yes = 1, no = 0)

1) **HUMAN RIGHTS**

	National education policy	Curricula	Teacher education	Student assessment
Human rights, rights and responsibilities	1			
Freedom of expression	0			
Social justice	1			
Democracy/democratic values/democratic rules/principles	1			
Human rights education	1			
Indicator category "Human rights" (1 if 1 or more, 0 otherwise)	**1**			

Please upload the national documents

2) **GENDER EQUALITY**

	National education policy	Curricula	Teacher education	Student assessment
Gender equality	0			
Gender equity	0			
Empowerment of women/girls (female empowerment, encouraging female participation)	0			
Gender sensitive	0			
Gender parity	0			
Indicator category "Gender equality" (1 if 1 or more, 0 otherwise)	**0**			

Please upload national documents

3) **PEACE**

	National education policy	Curricula	Teacher education	Student assessment
Peace, peace-building	1			
Awareness of forms of abuse, harassment, violence (school based violence/bullying, household-based violence, gender-biased violence, child abuse/harassment, sexual abuse/harassment)	0			
Peace education	0			
Indicator category "Peace" (1 if 1 or more, 0 otherwise)	1			

Please upload national documents

4) HEALTH AND WELL-BEING

	National education policy	Curricula	Teacher education	Student assessment
Physical health/activity/fitness	1			
Mental, emotional health, psychological health	0			
Healthy lifestyles (nutrition, diet, cleanliness/hygiene/sanitation/clean water, being-staying healthy)	0			
Awareness of addictions (smoking, drugs, alcohol)	0			
Sexual and/or reproductive health	0			
Health education	0			
Sexual and/or reproductive health education/sexual education/HIV aids education	0			
Indicator category "Health and well-being" (1 if 1 or more, 0 otherwise)	1			

Please upload national documents

5) SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

	National education policy	Curricula	Teacher education	Student assessment
Sustainable, sustainability, sustainable development	1			
Economic sustainability, sustainable growth, sustainable production/consumption/green economy	1			
Social sustainability (social cohesion re sustainability)	1			
Environmental sustainability/environmentally sustainable	1			
Climate change (global warming, carbon emission/footprint)	1			
Renewable energy, alternative energy (sources) (solar, tidal, wind, wave, geothermal, biomass…)	1			
Ecology, ecological sustainability (ecosystems)	0			
Waste management, recycling	0			
Education for sustainable development, sustainability education, education for sustainability	0			
Environmental education/studies, education for the environment	1			
Indicator category "Sustainable development" (1 if 1 or more, 0 otherwise)	1			

Please upload national documents

6) Interconnectedness and global citizenship

	National education policy	Curricula	Teacher education	Student assessment
Globalization	0			
Global/international citizenship, global culture/identity/community	0			
Global-local thinking, local-global, thinking global act local, glocal	0			
Multicultural(ism), intercultural(ism)	1			
Migration	1			
Global competition/competitiveness, globally competitive, international competitiveness	0			
Global inequalities/disparities	1			
National/local citizenship/identity(ies)/culture(s)/heritage	1			
Global citizenship education, global education, education for global citizenship	0			
Indicator category "Interconnectedness and global citizenship" (1 if 1 or more, 0 otherwise)	1			

Please upload national documents

The indicator dashboard

Based on the above questionnaire, the indicator will be derived from the combined presence of each of the six categories in national education policy, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment.

Table 2 – Example SDG 4.7.1 Matrix

Category	NEP	C	TE	SA
Human Rights	1	1	1	0
Gender Equality	0	1	0	0
Peace, Non-violence and Human Security	1	1	1	0
Health and Well-being	1	1	0	1
Sustainable Development	1	0	1	0
Interconnectedness and Global Citizenship	1	0	0	0
Indicator	**5/6**	**4/6**	**3/6**	**1/6**

NEP: National education policies; C: Curricula; TE: Teacher Education; SA: Student Assessment.

Note: *assumes a 1 in the category is enough. An alternative is to standardize.*

Countries will be grouped in three categories according to the value of the score with a simple interpretation that could be facilitated by converting the indicator to percentages. The higher the value the larger the extent of implementation.

Strategies for data collection

Data collection for this indicator may be organized in two ways:

1. Decentralized: A questionnaire with main definitions is sent to countries. National agencies assess whether the GCED and ESD categories are present in each of the national frameworks (national education policy, curricula, teacher education, student assessment), providing evidence for the presence of these categories (short description and reference document, e.g. legislation, curricula, national programme). This data collection can be combined with the global consultation for the quadrennial reporting on the implementation of the *1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms*.

2. Centralized: Countries provide the main pieces of national education policy, curricula, guidelines for teacher education and student assessment relevant to GCED and ESD. The UIS assesses these documents based on similar criteria adopted by IBE to assess national curricula frameworks.

Tasks for the project

1. Approval of conceptual framework by the Technical Cooperation Group on the Indicators for SDG 4 – Education 2030 (TCG).

2. Consultation on questionnaire.

3. Definition of different levels of coverage for the concepts (minimal and complete).

4. Definition of the criteria for what should be considered as source documents for national education policy, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment.

5. Draft of guidelines and instrument for the pilot data collection.

6. Pilot online questionnaire in a few countries.

7. Analysis and report with draft conclusions.

8. Design of final instrument for data collection.

Bibliography

International Bureau of Education (2016). "Global Monitoring of Target 4.7: Themes in National Curriculum Frameworks." Background paper prepared for the 2016 Global Education Monitoring Report. Paris: UNESCO. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000246382

UNESCO (2012a). Education for Sustainable Development Sourcebook. Paris: UNESCO. http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002163/216383e.pdf

UNESCO (2012b). Exploring Sustainable Development: A Multiple-Perspective Approach. Paris: UNESCO. http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002154/215431E.pdf

UNESCO (2013). Global Citizenship Education: An Emerging Perspective. Outcome document of the Technical Consultation on Global Citizenship Education. Paris: UNESCO. http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002241/224115E.pdf

UNESCO (2014). Global Citizenship Education, Preparing Learners for the 21st Century. Paris: UNESCO. http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002277/227729e.pdf

UNESCO. (2015). Global Citizenship Education, Topics and Learning Objectives. Paris: UNESCO. http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0023/002329/232993e.pdf

Annex I

Operational categories and sub-categories of GCED and ESD (IBE, 2016, p. 38-39)

Category	Sub-categories	Excel dataset	Sample Quotes
Human Rights	Human rights, rights and responsibilities (children's rights, cultural rights, indigenous rights, women's rights, disability rights)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Freedom (of expression, of speech, of press, of association/organisation), civil liberties	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Social justice	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Democracy/democratic rule, democratic values/principles	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Human rights education	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*

Category	Sub-categories	Excel dataset	Sample Quotes
Gender Equality	Gender equality	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Gender equity	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Empower(ment of) women/girls (female empowerment, encouraging female participation)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Gender Sensitive	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Gender Parity	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*

Category	Sub-categories	Excel dataset	Sample Quotes
Peace, Non-violence and Human Security	Peace, peace-building	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Awareness of forms of abuse/harassment/violence (school-based violence/bullying, household-based violence, gender-based violence, child abuse/harassment, sexual abuse/harassment)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Peace education	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*

Category	Sub-categories	Excel dataset	Sample Quotes
Health and Well-being	Physical health/activity/fitness	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Mental, emotional health, psychological health	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Healthy lifestyle (nutrition, diet, cleanliness, hygiene, sanitation, *clean water, being/staying healthy)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Awareness of addictions (smoking, drugs, alcohol)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Sexual and/or reproductive health	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Health education	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Sexual and reproductive health education, sexuality education, HIV/AIDS education	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*

Category	Sub-categories	Excel dataset	Sample Quotes
Sustainable Development	Sustainable, sustainability, sustainable development,	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Economic sustainability, sustainable growth, sustainable production/consumption, green economy	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Social sustainability, (social cohesion re sustainability)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Environmental sustainability/environmentally sustainable	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Climate change (global warming, carbon emissions/footprint)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Renewable energy, alternative energy (sources) (solar, tidal, wind, wave, geothermal,biomass…)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Ecology, ecological sustainability (ecosystems, biodiversity, biosphere, ecology, loss of diversity)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Waste management, recycling	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Education for sustainable development, sustainability education, education for sustainability	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Environmental education/studies, Education for the environment	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*

Category	Sub-categories	Excel dataset	Sample Quotes
Intercon-nectedness and Global Citizenship	Globalization (globalisation)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Global/international citizen(ship), global culture/identity/community	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Global-local thinking, local-global, think global act local, glocal	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Multicultural(ism)/intercultural(ism)	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Migration, immigration, mobility, movement of people	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Global Competition/competitiveness/globally competitive/international competitiveness	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Global Inequalities/disparities	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	National/local citizenship/ identity(ies)/culture(s)/heritage *(include a note if the overall feeling is one of precedence of the national over the international, eg maybe find terms such as 'nationalism,' 'patriotism,' 'motherland')*	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*
	Global citizenship education, global education, education for global citizenship	1 = included; 0 = not included	*Copy and paste the statement in the documents*