Results of the TCG survey of thematic indicators

Technical Cooperation Group (TCG) meeting

26-28 October 2016

Madrid, Spain

Overall results

- ❏ **Nearly 60 respondents**
  - ■ 28 TCG-affiliated (Members, Observers, organizations)
  - ■ 30 others (including countries, civil society, academia and non-TCG affiliated organizations)
- ❏ **Regional representation**
  - ■ 43% developed regions
  - ■ 25% global (i.e. organizations, civil society, etc)
  - ■ 14% Latin America and the Caribbean
  - ■ 11% Africa
  - ■ 8% Asia

Overall results by target

Target	% support (all respondents)	% support (TCG only)
4.6 Literacy and numeracy	89	85
4.1 Primary and secondary	86	**93**
4.c Teachers	86	81
4.a School environment	85	79
4.b Scholarships	84	74
4.2 Early childhood	78	67
4.7 Global citizenship	74	61
4.5 Equity	70	**52**
4.3 TVET and tertiary	67	**56**
4.4 Skills for work	65	**52**

Overall results by thematic indicators

Target	% support (all respondents)	% support (TCG only)
4.6 Literacy and numeracy	75	73
4.1 Primary and secondary	66	68
4.c Teachers	75	69
4.a School environment	**50**	**46**
4.b Scholarships	**37**	**30**
4.2 Early childhood	65	58
4.7 Global citizenship	50	**38**
4.5 Equity	58	52
4.3 TVET and tertiary	61	58
4.4 Skills for work	52	**42**

4

% support

By target	By thematic indicators	Change in ranking
4.6 Literacy and numeracy	4.6 Literacy and numeracy	=
4.1 Primary and secondary	4.c Teachers	+1
4.c Teachers	4.1 Primary and secondary	-1
4.a School environment	4.2 Early childhood	+2
4.b Scholarships	**4.3 TVET and tertiary**	**+4**
4.2 Early childhood	4.5 Equity	+2
4.7 Global citizenship	**4.4 Skills for work**	**+3**
4.5 Equity	**4.a School environment**	**-4**
4.3 TVET and tertiary	Global citizenship	-2
4.4 Skills for work	**4.b Scholarships**	**-5**

Preliminary conclusions

- Indicators for **Targets 4.1, 4.6 and 4.c** are well supported

- Indicators for **Targets 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 4.5, 4.7, 4.a and 4.b** require further consideration either because

  - As a group they **do not represent well** the ambitions of the targets; or

  - Individually, they require further **conceptualisation** and/or **methodological development**

Cross-cutting issues

☐ **Disaggregation:** by sex, disability, migratory status, conflict-affected and others should be made explicit indicator by indicator

☐ **Periodicity:** should be defined for each indicator

☐ **Vulnerable groups:** Disaggregation of indicators is not sufficient. Specific indicators need to be developed reflecting the specific challenges of such groups

7

Summary results by target

4.1 Primary and secondary education

- Indicators **very well-supported**.

- **4.1.2 should compliment global indicator 4.1.1**

- Further **methodological work required on 4.1.1** being led by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning

- Possible **additional indicators**

  - Out-of-school numbers

  - Household expenditures on education

  - Transition rates –primary/lower secondary, lower/upper secondary)

- Could consider **dropping**

  - 4.1.3 (gross intake ratio to the last grade of primary) which is a proxy completion rate. 4.1.4 (completion rate) is now relatively widely available

4.2 Early childhood

□ Indicators **moderately well-supported**.

□ Further **methodological work required on 4.2.1** being led by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning

□ Concerns regarding **4.2.3** (positive/stimulating home environment). Further methodological work would be required.

□ Possible **additional indicators**

  ■ Net enrolment rate in early childhood education (ISCED 01+02)

  ■ Household expenditures on education

  ■ % of new entrants to primary with early childhood education experience

□ Could consider **dropping**

  ■ 4.2.4 (gross pre-primary enrolment ratio) which is similar to global indicator 4.2.4 which is available for 150 countries

4.3 TVET and higher education

□ Indicator set **does not capture** quality, affordability or equal access for men and women

□ Further **development work required on 4.3.1** to increase country coverage

□ Possible **additional indicators**

▪ Net enrolment rate or new entrants rate to tertiary (instead of 4.3.2)

▪ Move 4.4.3 (educational attainment) to 4.3

▪ Gender parity indices to measure equality of access

▪ An outcome indicator (eg transition to work, graduation or completion)

□ Could consider **dropping**

▪ 4.3.2 (gross tertiary enrolment ratio) if replaced by a net rate

□ May need to **develop**

▪ Measures of quality and affordability

4.4 Skills for work

- Indicator set **does not capture** the broad range of skills needed for decent work

- Further **methodological and development work required on 4.4.1 and 4.4.2** being led by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning

- Possible **additional indicators**

  - An employment-related indicator such as youth/adult employment rate
  - Literacy and numeracy indicators (eg from 4.6)

- Could consider **dropping**

  - One of the ICT skills indicators
  - 4.4.3 (educational attainment) and move to 4.3

- May need to **develop**

  - Measures of other relevant work-related skills

4.5 Equity

- Questions regarding the **relevance** of some indicators to target
- Further **methodological and development work required on 4.5.2** (language of instruction) and **4.5.3** (funding formula)
- Possible **additional indicators**
  - Expand 4.5.4 to separately identify household expenditures on education
  - Expand 4.5.5 to cover at least lower middle income countries
- Could consider **dropping**
  - Indicators only loosely related to the target
- May need to **develop**
  - Equity measures of relevance to specific vulnerable groups (conflict-affected, disabled etc)

4.6 Literacy and numeracy

- Indicators **very well-supported**.

- Further **developmental work required on 4.6.1** being led by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning

- Possible **additional indicators**
  - Numeracy rates (similar to 4.6.2 for literacy)
  - Existence of legal frameworks guaranteeing access to literacy and numeracy programmes

- Could consider **modifying**
  - 4.6.3 to refer to participation of illiterate youth/adults in literacy programmes

- May need to **develop**
  - Measures of completion of literacy/numeracy programmes

4.7 Global citizenship and sustainability

- ❑ Indicator set is **very ambitious** and not easy to implement.

- ❑ Further **methodological work required on most indicators**

- ❑ Possible **additional indicators**
  - ■ Existence of legal frameworks concerning key concepts of the target (eg human rights, gender equality, peace and non-violence etc)

- ❑ Could consider **dropping**
  - ■ 1-2 indicators to simplify the set

- ❑ May need to **develop**
  - ■ **4.7.4** and **4.7.5** (knowledge of citizenship and ecoscience)
  - ■ **4.7.3** (human rights)
  - ■ Measures of peace and non-violence
  - ■ Measures of values and attitudes as opposed to knowledge

4.a School environment

- Indicator set contains some **challenging indicators**.

- Further **conceptualisation and methodological work required**

- Possible **additional indicators**

  - Existence of **mechanisms for reporting** violence including bullying in schools

- May need to **develop**

  - **4.a.3** (attacks) and **4.a.1 (d)** (adapted infrastructure) need further conceptualisation and methodological development

  - Data sources for **4.a.2** (violence) beyond the Global School-based Student Health Survey

  - Measures of the structural safety of buildings and equipment

  - Measures regarding codes of conduct in schools (both staff and students)

4.b Scholarships

- Only one thematic indicator which requires substantial further **developmental work** to identify suitable sources of data

- Possible **additional indicators**
    - None that can be implemented without further methodological development

- May need to **develop**
    - **4.b.2** (scholarships) needs further work to identify suitable sources
    - Measures of expenditure on and scholarships for students from disadvantaged backgrounds or marginalised communities

4.c Teachers

- Indicators **very well-supported**.
- Possible **additional indicators**
  - Expand indicators to cover **post-secondary** education
  - Existence of **national teaching councils** or **regulatory frameworks** for teachers
- Could consider **dropping**
  - Indicators only loosely related to the target (eg 4.c.5 on salaries) or those similar to other indicators (eg 4.c.7 on training)
- May need to **develop**
  - **International minimum standards** for teacher training and qualifications to improve cross-national comparability
  - **4.c.7** (in-service training) needs further conceptualisation and methodological development

Next steps

Working groups

☐ Four groups covering different clusters of targets

- **Group 1**: Targets 4.1, 4.2 and 4.6

- **Group 2**: Targets 4.3, 4.4 and 4.7

- **Group 3**: Targets 4.5 and 4.b

- **Group 4**: Targets 4.a and 4.c

Tasks to accomplish

❑ For each target under review:

❑ Establish a set of indicators which has **broad agreement** including the global indicator(s) for reporting in 2017

❑ Identify indicators which need **further conceptualisation or methodological development**