

Improving Work-Based Learning (WBL) Programmes

for Young People in the South Mediterranean Region

Regional Guidelines



Improving Work-Based Learning (WBL) Programmes for Young People in the South Mediterranean Region

Regional Guidelines

Practical guidelines for policymakers, social partners, and TVET professionals and providers in South Mediterranean countries

UNESCO - a global leader in education

Education is UNESCO's top priority because it is a basic human right and the foundation for peace and sustainable development. UNESCO is the United Nations' specialized agency for education, providing global and regional leadership to drive progress, strengthening the resilience and capacity of national systems to serve all learners and responding to contemporary global challenges through transformative learning, with special focus on gender equality and Africa across all actions.



The Global Education 2030 Agenda

UNESCO, as the United Nations' specialized agency for education, is entrusted to lead and coordinate the Education 2030 Agenda, which is part of a global movement to eradicate poverty through 17 Sustainable Development Goals by 2030. Education, essential to achieve all of these goals, has its own dedicated Goal 4, which aims to "ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all". The Education 2030 Framework for Action provides guidance for the implementation of this ambitious goal and commitments.



Published in 2021 by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
Regional Bureau for Education in the Arab States - Beirut
Sports City Avenue, Bir Hassan, P. O Box 11-5244

© UNESCO 2021



This publication is available in Open Access under the Attribution-ShareAlike 3.0 IGO (CC-BY-SA 3.0 IGO) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/igo/>). By using the content of this publication, the users accept to be bound by the terms of use of the UNESCO Open Access Repository (<http://www.unesco.org/open-access/terms-use-ccbysa-en>).

The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The ideas and opinions expressed in this publication are those of the authors; they are not necessarily those of UNESCO and do not commit the Organization.

Cover Photo: Eugenio Marongiu/Shutterstock.com; and illustration elements: ©UNESCO/Marie Bastille

Author: Stephen Billett, Griffith University, Australia

Designed by UNESCO Beirut

Printed in Lebanon

Acknowledgements

These practical guidelines have been produced to inform policymakers, employers and practitioners in the Arab region, about how to design quality and effective work-based learning systems to increase youth employment.

The guidelines have been developed under the Youth Employment in the Mediterranean project (YEM) which is a three-year regional initiative launched by UNESCO and implemented in collaboration with eight Member States in the period of 2018 to 2020.

The project is funded by the European Union and aims to improve skills anticipation systems and promote technical and vocational education and training (TVET) to strengthen youth employment and encourage entrepreneurship in the Mediterranean region.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	3
Executive Summary	7
Introduction	10
WBL Experiences: Actors, Roles, and Actions	11
Guidelines for Legal and Institutional Frameworks	13
Guidelines for Funding Mechanisms and Disbursements	15
Guidelines for Engagement with Social Partners	17
Guidelines for Enhancing the Standing, Status and Occupations of TVET	19
Guidelines for Developing the Capacity of Workplaces to Provide Effective Learning Experiences	20
Guidelines for Recognising and Enhancing "Traditional Apprenticeships"	22
Guidelines for Aligning TVET Provisions with Employment Opportunities	23
Guidelines for Promoting Localised Engagement between TVET Institutions and Workplaces	24
Guidelines for Implementing Strategies to Improve TVET Workforce Capacity and Provision	26
References	28

Executive Summary

This set of practical guidelines aims to inform policymakers, social partners and practitioners in the Southern Mediterranean countries about organizing, implementing, managing, and evaluating effective work-based learning (WBL) programs for young people, including making it inclusive of young women. It proposes guidelines for government, social partners, TVET institutions, workplaces, and individuals to achieve this goal.

The guidelines are informed by country reports from Algeria, Egypt (El-ASHmawi, 2017), Jordan (Rawashdeh, 2017), Lebanon (Ghneim, 2017), Palestine (Jweiles, 2017), Morocco (Sennou, 2017), Oman (Al-Mujaini, 2017), Tunisia (Chelbi, 2017) and Algeria (Bedou 2018) initial meeting of country representatives in Beirut in June 2018 and in Rabat in October 2019. Additional sources were also drawn on.

Effective and inclusive work-based learning arrangements

Six sets of factors were found to influence and shape the provision of WBL experiences, their organization, accessibility and implementation:

- legal and institutional **governance** arrangements (i.e., government mandates, laws and regulations etc);
- **social partnerships** (i.e., the engagement of employers, unions, and professional bodies, locally, regionally and nationally);
- **kinds and scale of workplaces**; (i.e. the predominance of small-to-medium and micro-businesses comprising workplaces in these countries);
- **funding** arrangements (e.g. sharing of costs and access to reimbursements);
- **TVET provisions** (i.e., relevance of curriculum, quality of educators, links with industry, attractiveness of qualifications, alignment with enterprise needs); and
- **societal views** shaping how young people, their parents, and employers come to value and participate in TVET.

1. Legal and institutional governance arrangements

Laws and administrative frameworks that provide governance arrangements at i) national, ii) regional and iii) local levels are required to optimize WBL and secure their social and economic benefits. These arrangements demonstrate government leadership and provide mechanisms to engage social partners, workplaces, students, and their parents. They can also establish working

relations for vocational training institutions to engage with the community to provide an effective TVET system that includes productive WBL provisions that are accessible to young women.

2. Social partners

To be effective, WBL programs for young people require the engagement of social partners on a national, regional and local level. Nationally, they can provide advice and inform TVET programs to improve their efficiency. Regionally, they can address sector-wide or specific institutional arrangements, such as interactions between TVET institutions and workplaces, including being inclusive of young males and females, and of those who are disadvantaged due to their remote locations. Locally, TVET institutions need to engage with enterprises that are providing WBL experiences for young people. Regular reviews of how these enterprises can effectively engage with and support WBL and secure mutual benefits can be undertaken by social partners, such as chambers of commerce.

3. Kinds and scale of workplaces

Most enterprises in Southern Mediterranean countries are small and micro businesses. These workplaces are not those that are predominantly featured in models of WBL models in European countries. An example is Germany with their in-house training ability and trained 'meisters' (i.e., masters in English). Instead, these small workplaces are more likely to favour the 'traditional' model of apprenticeship, to meet their needs and capacities, which leads to a broad set of considerations for WBL. Firstly, the fit between structured models of WBL and the capacities of these workplaces to provide the extent and quality of WBL experiences is limited. Models such as group apprenticeship schemes may be required to minimize the administrative burden on small business and offer apprentices a wider range of experiences. Secondly, these kinds of businesses may lack the capacity to effectively engage with TVET institutions. Therefore, these institutions need to reach out, engage with and support these enterprises to realize effective WBL. Thirdly, the range and extent of accessibility of in these workplaces may not fulfil the requirements of the courses in which students are participating. So, consideration needs to be given to how these small workplaces can best be engaged and contribute to WBL and be supported by TVET institutions.

4. Funding mechanisms and disbursements

Central to engaging enterprises in implementing WBL provisions is a sharing of financial burden in ways that

encourages wide participation. This includes supporting workplace participation in WBL programs such as alternance (i. e., work-linked training) and apprenticeship. This requires allocating budgets based on contributions, performance and impact in terms of processes (i.e., the WBL experiences provided) and outcomes (i.e., measures of skill development and employability). Those programs with WBL experiences need to respond and adapt locally and modify TVET provisions, albeit within a nationally consistent framework. Local arrangements could include developing workplace capacity to provide effective learning experiences for students/apprentices. The source of funding could be derived from cost-sharing, including use of a national training fund (e.g., Algerian training levy), direct funding or enterprises deferring taxation payments through their engagement in support for WBL. Therefore, institutional frameworks with financial and non-financial incentives for employers to support WBL are required here.

5. TVET provisions

TVET provisions that more effectively support WBL for young people, particularly young women, are required. The findings point to the actions required to achieve these goals. Some are quite country or locale-specific, but they are listed as follows:

- improving structural arrangements and mechanisms;
- further professionalising the TVET workforce;
- supporting in-house/enterprise capacities;
- enhancing traditional apprenticeship systems;
- workplace-based approaches to supporting learning;
- extending engagement beyond training institutions;
- strategies to promote gender inclusion.

6. Societal views (sentiments)

In these countries, TVET and the relevant occupations are undervalued. This may even be exacerbated when WBL components are included. These sentiments position TVET, the occupations it serves and WBL as a low level of education, unworthy forms of work and demeaning ways of learning. Consequently, corrective initiatives need to be enacted and informed, and more positive advice about TVET and the occupations it serves should be provided to parents, young people and employers to counter such views. If TVET is primarily seen as a pathway to higher education and more prestigious occupations, the contributions of TVET to individuals, enterprises and national economies will not be realized. Hence, strategies are needed to change these societal views.

Recommendations for guidelines

The guidelines for progressing are informed by ten broad recommendations:

- **Enact legal and institutional frameworks** – Establish, enact, develop further, and sustain legal and institutional frameworks under which TVET, including

that associated with partners and specifically with WBL arrangements, can effectively be implemented and progressed. This includes mandating the duration of these experiences, roles and responsibilities of various actors and shared funding mechanisms to support WBL.

- **Enact localised engagements and initiatives** – Either in the absence of, or to further augment national legal and institutional frameworks supporting WBL experiences for young people, there is a need to act regionally and locally to engage workplaces and young people, and provide effective TVET. These engagements can include sharing of costs, kinds and duration of workplace experiences and how they can be supported.
- **Enhance the standing and status of TVET and the occupations it serves** – Action is required by the government, training institutions, social partners and communities to enhance the status of TVET and the occupations it serves. This includes promoting the view that learning experiences in workplaces are legitimate, worthwhile, and a key element of preparation for working life.
- **Develop workplaces' capacity to provide effective WBL** – Given workplaces' key role in WBL and the unpreparedness of many workplaces to provide and support WBL, it is necessary to develop their capacities. This includes identifying and enacting support for learning that is appropriate for work settings and providing recognition and rewards for those enterprises undertaking this task.
- **Embrace and enhance the traditional model of apprenticeship** – The central role played by traditional apprenticeships in many of these countries deserves acknowledgement and this model of apprenticeship being embraced and enhanced in the TVET system. This requires accepting this model of learning is different from that with alternance and modern apprenticeships, and supporting, offering enhancements and providing recognition on completion.
- **Aligning TVET provisions with employment opportunities** – A close alignment between TVET provisions and employment opportunities is required. This might be achieved by enacting employment-enhancing initiatives within TVET programs and secure a balance between young people's aspirations and workplaces that might employ them. This includes developing the skills of TVET teachers in pedagogy, occupational currency, and designing and enacting responsive local initiatives.

- **Build and sustain social partnerships at national, regional and local levels** – Social partnerships, including representatives of employers and employees at national, regional and local levels are essential to securing alignments amongst models of WBL, local enterprise needs for skill development, and strategies to promote engagement in TVET, including sharing the costs of WBL experiences across government, enterprises and individuals who benefit from them.
- **Secure localised engagement between TVET institutions and workplaces** – Securing strong links between TVET institutions and local enterprises, including small and micro businesses, can realise shared understandings and mutual benefits for young people’s skill development and employability.
- **Improving TVET workforce capacity** – For both short-term and long-term goals, there is a need to develop further the occupational expertise, and pedagogic skills of TVET teachers, including their familiarity with and ability to support WBL in local workplaces.
- **Promoting gender inclusivity** - Effective mechanisms should be developed, improved, and used to assist greater inclusion of young women in WBL to promote their range of career choices and employability.

Introduction

Countries in the South Mediterranean region are subject to diverse social and economic challenges that, among other things, result in high youth unemployment, especially for young women, a lower quality and relevance of education, and insufficient skilled job opportunities. All of this fails to meet the aspirations and needs of young people. In addition, workplace experience, entrepreneurship and digital skills are increasingly required for employment. All this represents significant challenges for educational provisions.

The UNESCO 2015 Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) encourages Member States to consider establishing or strengthening governance models for TVET institutions involving relevant local stakeholders and cooperating, when relevant, with business associations to support work-based learning (WBL). WBL, in its various forms, including in-service training, attachments, apprenticeships and internships, should be promoted. When required, WBL should be enhanced and, where relevant, complemented by institution-based education or other forms of learning. WBL provisions also need to support young women's participation.

Given the growing importance of WBL in TVET, Member States need to systematically support and acknowledge the emerging roles and learning needs of workplace trainers, tutors and other facilitators. This includes developing or strengthening policies and frameworks concerning their status, recruitment and professional development.

In this context, WBL is often seen as a powerful driver for expanding and improving the relevance of TVET and being more gender-inclusive. However, realising the potential of work-based learning requires policymakers and social partners to engage in partnerships and close cooperation. Since 2015, UNESCO has worked with the Inter-Agency Working Group on Work-Based Learning's members¹ on a common and wide understanding of WBL schemes:

Work-based learning refers to all forms of learning in a real work environment. It provides individuals with the skills needed to successfully obtain and keep jobs and progress in their professional development.

Apprenticeships, internships/traineeships and on-the-job training are the most common forms of WBL. They all, usually, – but not always – combine elements of learning in the workplace with classroom-based learning.

Indeed, understanding the dynamics of WBL and ensuring that those are reflected in the design of effective TVET programs can ensure that enterprises, including those in informal sectors and rural areas, are engaged, receive incentives and are supported to provide high-quality WBL, and the trainees perceive WBL as an attractive learning opportunity.

After more than 10 years since the launch of the European Training Foundation (ETF)'s report on 'Work-Based Learning Programmes for Young People in the Mediterranean Region', by UNESCO and ETF, it is timely to update it in light of the new international skills agenda and TVET reforms in the region.

Here, practical guidelines arising from the six factors mentioned above are presented to influence and shape the provision of WBL. Meanwhile, young women are taken into consideration for their participation in these arrangements to optimize their career choices and prepare them effectively for working life.

¹ The Working Group currently consists of UNESCO, ILO, World Bank, OECD, ETF, CEDEFOP, European Commission, Asiatic Development Bank.

WBL Experiences: Actors, Roles, and Actions

Effective WBL cannot be realized through TVET institutions and teachers alone. Instead, the contributions of various actors are required. Table 2 below sets out a list of these actors, the roles they play, and the actions they need to take to promote greater engagement in TVET and WBL experiences by young people. The set of roles and actions is drawn from the country studies and technical workshops

organized by UNESCO Beirut (2018) and Rabat (2019), which are intended to guide considerations for policy and practice initiatives that promote greater participation in WBL experiences in the countries beyond. This list sets out imperatives that could be used as benchmarks for the different actors' roles and actions.

Table 2. WBL Experiences: Actors, Roles, and Actions

Actors	Roles	Actions
National government	Organizing legislation and institutional frameworks that support the provision of WBL experiences at the national and local levels, adequately funded training organizations and social partners, providing frameworks for responsive TVET provisions, and encouraging greater participation in TVET and workplace learning arrangements	Develop, enact, implement, monitor, evaluate and refine effective legal and institutional frameworks that support inclusive WBL provisions. These include: i) providing adequate and shared funding arrangements for training institutions, support for workplaces, and young people; ii) organizing and enact effective TVET provision, including the quality of content, equipment, and teaching, and the ongoing evaluation and improvement of that provision; iii) Initiate, build, and sustain effective social partnerships at the national and local level and engage them in organizing and evaluating TVET provisions locally; iv) and enact processes to inform the community, business, parents, and young people about the benefits of WBL, TVET and the occupation it serves
Government departments	Working collaboratively and interdependently to realize positive outcomes across areas such as schooling, post-school education, industry development, and employment	Establish and enact collaborative practices across departments with responsibilities for education and industry to coordinate the provision of TVET, including WBL experiences. Enact those practices at both national and local levels
Social partners	Working collaboratively at national and local levels to realize collective outcomes that include sector-specific imperatives and needs, but also addressing broader social goals such as young people's (skill development, unemployment, enterprise, and economic development)	Industry and professional bodies engaging with TVET systems in ways that enable demonstrate a collective commitment to the purpose for which the social partnerships have been established. This includes being willing to engage effectively with other partners while being respectful of their needs, contributions, and imperatives. It can extend to making concessions and even sacrifice some of their own needs in the interests of broader outcomes and collective good

TVET institutions	Providing experiences for young people from which they will develop worklife capacities including specific occupational skills, providing and integrating those experiences in work settings, being inclusive of young women and engaging with industry and employers in the design and enactment of their programs	Organize and implement purposeful, planned, and effective learning experiences for young people, including those in workplaces, and in ways that are inclusive of access for young women. Provide, monitor, and refine or augment experiences to achieve outcomes of occupational competence and workplace employability. Demonstrate the capacity to respond to the local student and workplace needs by adapting the national curricula to meet those needs, including providing educational experiences for young women that will promote their employability. Provide experiences to maintain the competence of teaching staff.
TVET teachers	Being occupationally competent and workplace oriented as a basis for effective teaching that arises from engagement in workplaces outside of educational institutions	Be open and responsive to developing further skills associated with occupational competence and workplace familiarity Adopt and effectively enact a broad range of curriculum roles and instructional skills to meet the need of national prescription and local requirements Work collaboratively with local enterprises.
Workplaces	Providing experiences for young people that deliver quality learning outcomes for them and benefits for the workplace	Be open and responsive to developing the capacity of the workplace to provide effective learning experiences for young people and the ongoing development of its workforce by engaging with local training institutions and social partners.
Community/ Parents	Informing young people about post-school options and the potential of TVET as a viable form of occupational preparation	Be open and informed about the advice given to young people about post-school options, the potential of TVET, and the occupations it serves.
Young people	Being informed about post-school pathways and engagement in post-school education and workplace learning	Be active and critical in making informed decisions about post-school pathways, the prospects of TVET, and the occupations it serves

Achieving the important outcomes of sound and comprehensive occupational preparation needs to be realized by shared efforts across government agencies, stakeholder, TVET institutions and teachers, local public and private sector workplaces, as well as commitment from parents and young people.

Guidelines for Legal and Institutional Frameworks

Guidelines for legal and institutional frameworks include

Establishing, enacting, developing further, and sustaining legal and institutional frameworks under which TVET, including those associated with partners and WBL arrangements need to be effectively developed and implemented.

Rationale

Legal frameworks are those addressing qualifications, certifications, advice by industry/professional bodies; conditions of employment; work-related activities; remuneration/expenses for students/apprentices; duration of indenture; incentives for employers and support provided by local training organizations.

Institutional frameworks are arrangements for consultation, development, and maintenance of social partnerships, locally and nationally; protocols for engagement between training institutions and workplaces; arrangements for developing workplace capacity to support and can extend to mandated requirements.

Appropriate laws and administrative frameworks provide the governance arrangements at national, regional and local levels required to optimize WBL experiences and secure their benefits (e.g. **Algeria, Morocco & Tunisia**). These frameworks demonstrate government leadership and can provide mechanisms to engage social partners, workplaces, students, and their parents. They also can be used to establish and support-working relations for TVET institutions for engage with the local community (e.g. advisor committees) to provide relevant TVET provisions including accessible and productive WBL arrangements. This extends to the kinds of legal arrangements used in **Germany** that underpin these partnerships (ILO 2013), and those adopted in Kentucky in **America** (Kentucky 2015). It is noteworthy that in **Algeria**, arrangements have been enacted that have seen high levels of participation by young women in apprenticeship programs.

Governance - The important part here is who is granted leadership in this governance. When national responsibilities reside within a ministry for schooling and/or higher education, there is a risk that the focus on TVET and work-based experiences will be downplayed or even ignored. Noteworthy is that those countries with well-developed TVET system also have dedicated ministries (e.g. Algeria, Morocco). **Algeria** even has statements about apprenticeships represented in its Constitution. Therefore, national leadership can exercise a strong commitment to developing an effective TVET system incorporating WBL experiences and establish arrangements to realize those commitments.

Effective governance includes an openness to and mechanisms for engaging social partners, such as employer and employee representatives at national, regional and local levels. This need was consistently supported across all country studies. Where such social partnerships are absent or not effectively engaged, the government has a crucial role in initiating and sustaining them at these three levels.

The decision-making about TVET that includes WBL and seeks to be more gender-inclusive requires commitments from local enterprises, as reported in the **Palestine** study. A commonly referred to model is the **German** Bipartite Chamber of Commerce representing both employers and employees, particularly at the local level (Deissinger & Hellwig, 2005). These organizations can mediate across competing interests of employers and employees, of TVET training institutions and workplaces, and provide a voice that is independent of partite concerns when addressing localized concerns. The arrangements represent mature TVET systems evident in countries with enduring TVET systems (Billett, 2013).

Coordination across government agencies - Securing coordination across government departments with responsibilities for TVET, and with WBL elements is recommended in country studies (i.e. **Egypt, Palestine, Lebanon**), as WBL arrangements require input and administration across a range of government jurisdictions/portfolios (e.g. education, labour, regional development). Likely, the most effective coordination is when a ministry with responsibilities for TVET is responsible for it (**Algeria**). So, more than having dedicated ministries for TVET, they need authority to coordinate activities to promote TVET and WBL experiences across government.

Overall, based on the insights from the country studies and technical workshops, the kinds of legal and institutional framing required to support WBL arrangements is comprised of:

- a national qualification framework articulating from schooling to TVET and higher education;
- accreditation and quality assurance systems to ensure quality experiences for young people in TVET institutions and workplaces;
- engaging social partners, educators and workplaces in processes that identify the educational purposes (i.e., aims, goals, and objectives) of TVET programs, including the required content and means (i.e. experiences) to achievement at the regional and local levels, whilst maintaining national coherence;
- recognition of prior learning processes to support those young people learning in ‘traditional apprenticeship’ models that sit outside of accredited TVET programs, including the certification of what is learnt;
- mandated professional development for TVET teachers to maintain and develop further their occupational and educational capacities;
- nationally-recognised train-the-trainer programs for those who are supervising and mentoring students/apprentices in workplaces;
- shared funding arrangements that distribute the cost of young people’s WBL across government, community, workplaces and young people, with local means of decision-making and access to those funds; and
- provision of labour laws that establish pay and conditions associated with training, allowances and rewards for enhanced skill acquisition.

Promoting gender inclusivity

It is noteworthy that these mechanisms can be used to assist greater inclusion of young women in WBL programs. A **national qualification system** provides a mechanism whereby achievement in education is the basis for personal progression, regardless of the individual’s gender or ethnicity.

Accreditation arrangements can ensure that equity of access to participation in programs is an element of program and institutional accreditation. **Engaging with social partners** to assist WBL provisions is available to young women and men, and that responsibility associated with duty of care to young women are understood and can be exercised. The ability for young women to have **existing competence recognized**, particularly for that which has been acquired outside of educational programs can be particularly helpful for those who have been denied or had difficulty accessing educational programs and certification.

Professional development of TVET staff can extend to assisting them with offering and implementing gender-inclusive experiences for students and transforming gendered societal views of the kinds of work in which young men and women are expected to participate. Similarly, **train-the-trainer programs** for workplace staff can emphasize the importance of gender inclusivity and the enactment of strategies to secure successful WBL experiences by young women.

The Government can use funding leverage to encourage and support workplaces provide WBL experiences for young women, thereby directly supporting achieving equity goals. The same governments can introduce laws that attempt to limit discrimination and encourage equity and access to opportunities in educational institutions and workplaces.

Guidelines for Funding Mechanisms and Disbursements

Key guiding principles:

- there are costs and benefits for government, workplaces and students;
- WBL provisions are not necessarily cheaper options than TVET programs based wholly within training institutes;
- encouraging participation in WBL programs and securing greater gender inclusivity requires government support and sponsorship; and
- a range of mechanisms exist for directly and indirectly organising funding.

Sharing of costs and benefits

A key factor for WBL program is how the costs and the benefits are distributed across i) government, ii) enterprises and iii) individuals. There are the **costs for government** associated with TVET programs such as having TVET institutions, including teachers and administrators' salaries, the cost of professional development, equipment, materials, etc., and **costs to enterprises** for hosting students, supervision of students in the workplace, insurance for students, social welfare, wage subsidies and also **costs to students** from travelling to workplaces and those associated with uniforms, tools or materials. The **benefits** are similarly distributed: students' developing employable skills, thereby helping the state, and workplaces and for individuals' prospects to be employed. So, guidelines for funding need to accommodate these three sets of costs/benefits.

Not necessarily a cheaper option

It is probably wrong to consider WBL arrangements as less expensive or lower in cost than those wholly based within TVET institutions. As noted above, there is a range of costs associated with engaging social partners, including workplaces for students to participate in WBL programs. Then, there are costs of supervision and support for students within workplaces. Additionally, insurance costs for those students and considerations of wage subsidies or expenses for travel and the cost base grows. So, perspectives that suggest work-based learning provisions are a low-cost option are unlikely to be correct. Certainly, crude approximations that if, for instance, a program is only 60% in the TVET institution the costs will be 60% lower than a program wholly based in institutions are very erroneous. It is important to be realistic about the costs and funding appropriately, particularly support for enterprises and bases for students to engage.

Encouraging participation and gender inclusivity

Encouraging participation in WBL and making it gender-inclusive is likely to require a higher level of contribution by government to achieve these policy goals. It was noted that in all these countries, TVET is seen as being lower in status than higher education, so there is a need to encourage participation. Hence, placing too much cost on students is likely to be counter-productive and not providing enough support for enterprises is likely to work against their participation.

Mechanisms for distributing funding

There is a range of means for raising funds and distributing costs, and the suitability of these mechanisms are situation and country dependent. These mechanisms include: training funds, training levies, contracted schemes, levels of support, direct grants and subsidies, cost-benefit analysis.

- **Training funds** – nationwide or industry sector training funds are used to provide financial resources to support the development of occupational skills, including WBL provisions. These can be secured through taxation, direct payments and those that are linked to size enterprise and can be voluntary or mandated. National training funds are sometimes directed towards target groups such as low skilled workers or addressing social goals such as greater female participation.
- **Training levies** – usually a national form of securing training funds gathered through taxation mechanisms and are sometimes gathered as a percentage of payroll either as a payment or amount enterprises are required to expend on training. Can be based an exemption from the levy or through demonstrated training activities or direct levy. Usually more directed towards large enterprises.
- **Contracted schemes** – publicly funded projects (e.g. construction) can have a requirement for training personnel or provisions of training.
- **Level of support** (e.g. training wage) – the level of payment to alternative or apprentices engaged in WBL programs and how these are funded vary according to policy goals. Training wages are usually at a low level of adult equivalent

wages and increase as a percentage across the duration of an apprenticeship or alternatives program. The lower the level of payment of an adult equivalent, the greater the expectation that the WBL will be of a very high quality. So, for instance, in the **German** apprenticeship system, the apprentices receive a low level of adult equivalent salary, but, the expectation on the extent and quality of the in-house training is commensurately high.

- **Direct grants and subsidies** – these mechanisms can be used to achieve specific outcomes such as encouraging enterprises to engage in WBL, and for taking students or apprentices from target groups (i.e. disadvantaged, disabled, young women, et cetera). Likely, these subsidies are paid directly to enterprises as an incentive and reward for participation in WBL and providing experiences for students/apprentices from target groups.
- **Cost-benefit analysis** - there is little evidence that enterprises engage in detailed cost-benefit analysis to make decisions about their participation in WBL programs. Instead, the evidence is that they act on beliefs about what is reasonable and practicable but are likely driven by specific initiatives such as introducing new technologies, production processes and achieving specific goals.

Conclusion

So, central to enacting TVET, which includes WBL provisions, is a sharing their financial burden. This includes supporting WBL arrangements in alternance programs and apprenticeships. The action here necessitates allocating budgets within public TVET providers based on performance and impact in terms of processes (i.e., the kind of experiences that are provided) and outcomes (i.e., measures of skill development and employability). Those programs with WBL experiences, need to respond and adapt locally and modify TVET provisions, albeit within a nationally consistent framework. Local arrangements could include developing workplace capacity to provide effective learning experiences for students/apprentices. The source of funding could be derived from cost-sharing, including use of a national training fund (i.e., Algerian training levy), direct funding or enterprises deferring making taxation contributions through their commitment to and engagement in supporting WBL. So, institutional frameworks with financial and non-financial incentives for employers to support WBL are required here.

When the government is seeking to bring about change such as greater inclusivity for young women in WBL, it is likely that some mechanisms will be required to be enacted that will encourage workplaces and TVET institutions to accommodate their needs and promote their engagement. Yet, as mentioned above, to achieve this kind of outcome requires engagement with actors at several levels and, alone, funding arrangements will not be sufficient. There are needs to be adequate encouragement, opportunities, support and guidance for young women to engage effectively in WBL and benefit from the opportunities it affords.

Guidelines for Engagement with Social Partners

Workplace-based learning arrangements with young people are inevitably founded on engagement with a range of partners and the enterprises in which young people will engage in WBL. Hence, some guidelines for that engagement are advanced.

Rationale

The provision of WBL is very much premised on having effective partnerships with the public and private enterprises that provide these experiences for TVET students. Therefore, having guidelines on how those enterprises can effectively engage with, support, and mutually benefit from their participation in WBL programs for young people is important to their success. In most country studies, it was suggested that the engagement with workplaces needs to be improved, which can best come from understanding their needs and encouraging their participation in WBL.

The purposes for such an engagement by TVET institutions extends to i) understanding these enterprises capacities and ability to provide WBL experiences, ii) identifying what kinds of incentives or support are most likely to be effective for them, iii) identifying how their interests can best be articulated and engaged with both nationally and at the local level, and iv) determining the optimum kind of interactions with local training institutions.

All of these do not necessarily involve burdensome administrative infrastructure. Indeed, it may be better without it. However, local processes of engagement that are empowered and supported by central agencies who generate legislative and administrative guidelines that are themselves responsive to feedback from localities may be an effective way of i) engaging local businesses, ii) enhancing their participation with the TVET system, and iii) being responsive to their needs as they assist young people to develop occupational skills.

These arrangements extend to the conditions under which students can engage in workplaces and the implications for their work and employment in programs such as apprenticeship. Guidelines about these issues have been addressed by governments in **America** (Kentucky 2015) and agencies such as the International Labour Organization proposed arrangements in **Jordan** (ILO 2015).

Strong social partnership

Strengthening the engagement of social partners is likely premised upon the (a) kinds of roles that they are allocated and their skills to undertake those roles effectively, and (b) means by which these partnerships will be formed and sustained.

Realizing these partnership arrangements is likely to require reciprocity in the form of shared commitment and engagement, and demonstrable benefits for all parties including, of course, young people. The nature and form of sustainable social partnerships are likely to be associated with meeting specific workplace needs to some degree. Therefore, the form and delineation of these partnerships will be important. For instance, it is likely that national partnerships will need to be formed around particular occupational groupings or industry sectors. It is these partners who will be able to advise about national curricula, mandatory content, and the mix of experiences required for those occupations or industries. At the local level, there may be replication of those national bodies (i.e., industry sector or occupational based). Alternatively, they might seek to achieve different kinds of purposes, such as local development, and addressing issues such as greater gender inclusivity and entrenched unemployment in rural areas. So, the shape and form of these social partnerships are likely influenced by imperatives that attract partners and sustain their interest and participation. A key element here will be the degree by which resources are distributed within and across these partnerships, their composition, and the degree by which their contributions are recognized and enacted.

Social partnerships are likely to be at their most enduring when there are clear imperatives to participate, and accepted and acknowledged roles by government, and when these partnerships can achieve goals that warrant continuing participation.

Country Experience and Promising Practices

*Partnerships at the national and local level that support TVET and initiatives such as WBL are hallmarks of effective and mature TVET systems. Sometimes, the local arrangements are the product of states, regions, or local governments that function within a national government framework but are well placed to respond to localized needs. Noteworthy here are models such as the Chambers of Commerce in **Germany** that represent the interests of organized labour and employees at national and local levels. These local partnerships can comprise advisory processes such as those in the state of Victoria in **Australia** (i.e. Local Learning and Employment Networks) and those that are actively engaged with local employers and TVET institutions such as those in Germany (Chambers of Commerce), or those in Scandinavia that together represent the interests of workers.*

*The presence of national institutional frameworks seems important for establishing, engaging and sustaining such partnerships. The tripartite arrangements adopted in many Scandinavian countries (i.e. government, unions and employers) are replicated in **Germany** and countries such as **Australia**, albeit in different forms. In some instances, tensions in competing interests and might overwhelm the purpose of these institutions. However, it seems that where there are recognizable imperatives and each of the partners is able to contribute to discussions and outcomes this may well support the effective enactment of such arrangements. However, it is likely that government policy, broadly writ, it is necessary to build and sustain effective partnerships. The European Training Foundation (ETF) handbook provides suggestions for how these partnerships might work.*

The evidence suggests that localized social partnerships, such as is required for WBL initiatives, need effort and commitment in their formation, development and continuity (Billett & Seddon, 2004). This includes social partners being willing to moderate some of their interests to achieve collective outcomes: i.e., to realize the goals of the communities and young people within them. In one such partnerships, it was noted that partners relinquishing some of their interests were central to the demonstration of shared concerns and commitments.

Guidelines for Enhancing the Standing, Status and Occupations of TVET

Actions are required by the government, training institutions, and social partners and communities to enhance the status and standing of TVET and the occupations it serves. This includes promoting the view that WBL experiences are legitimate, worthwhile, and an essential element of post-school education for specific occupations.

Rationale

Engaging in action at the national and local level to communicate about TVET, its qualities and outcomes, and promoting the worth of the occupations it serves through schemes directed at employers, young people, and their parents; activities at the local level through partnerships between training institutions and enterprises to enhance the worth of specific TVET programs and their relationship to occupations and employment; securing articulation arrangements between these programs and higher technical and higher education programs.

Country experience and promising practices

Some countries are acting to elevate the standing of vocational education. **Denmark** has trialed the raising of the entry requirements of TVET programs and having improved educational facilities and institutions that are modern and attractive to young people (Aarkrog) (see (Nägele & Stalder, 2018)). The success of the first measure is not yet clear, but the second reflects a concern to respond to the relative unattractiveness of TVET institutions, when compared with university campuses. In England, it is reported that young people who have engaged in trade-related occupations - Ambassadors - are being recruited to speak at local schools to encourage young people to consider TVET. In addition, more pathways are being directed to higher education (Unwin). In the **Netherlands**, some elements of vocational education leading to high-level qualifications already have high status, but programs with lower qualification levels have low status. Fourth level MBOs can lead to either good jobs or to universities of applied sciences. In **Germany**, some vocational technical courses are now offered through universities of applied sciences to make them more attractive than the dual system approach. Moreover, the Chambers of Commerce and large employers in Germany are advertising to make a range of occupations more

attractive to young people (Deissinger). In **Switzerland**, it is being suggested that the standing of VET is improving as a reaction to societal concerns (expressed in newspapers and television) about the number of young people enrolling in university courses with no link to the labour market (Stadler). In **Finland** - the rise of applied universities assists elevate the standing of VET and the occupation it serves (Nokelainen). In **Norway**, it is proposed that preparing VET teachers in specialized institutions that offer Masters programs and pathways through to PhD has elevated its standing (Hiim) (see Nägele & Stalder, 2018).

Global agencies are also working to enhance the status of achievement through conference BiBB/Cedefop conference (2017), and reports (Clement 2014) identifying issues that inhibit the standing of TVET and how this can be addressed Improving the image of TVET: Making TVET attractive to youth (UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2018).

There are also nationally-based initiatives that seek to address the issues of the relatively low standing of TVET. In **Australia**, the federal government has the National Centre for Vocational Education Research to identify strategies for enhancing the status of TVET.

www.ncver.edu.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0029/5241809/NCVERWebinar_EnhancingTheStatusOfVET_SlidesForDistribution.pdf, there is the 'Get VET' campaign from Victoria (<https://www.vcaa.vic.edu.au/Pages/vet/GetVET/index.aspx>) and work of foundations, such as the Skilling Australia Foundation (<https://saf.org.au>).

Guidelines for Developing the Capacity of Workplaces to Provide Effective Learning Experiences

The preparedness of workplaces to provide and support effective WBL experiences is a key concern by countries in the Southern Mediterranean countries. At the recent technical workshops in Rabat (October 2019), this was one of the most frequently made requests.

Rationale

Organizing and enacting arrangements to develop the capacities of workplaces to support young people's learning. This includes consideration of the readiness of the workplaces to provide workplace experiences and developing staff skills to support learning. This can comprise preparing and enacting national programs for developing mentors (i.e. train the trainer), supervisors and co-workers' skills to assist the development of skills through using workplace pedagogic practices, and engaging learners in effective processes of learning that require effort and agency on their part.

Developing workplaces' capacities to provide effective work-based learning experiences

At the Rabat workshop, some practical strategies were proposed to assist workplaces in providing effective WBL.

Manuals – It was suggested that preparing and widely distributing practical manuals about how to implement WBL arrangements would be helpful to support its implementation by workplaces as well as TVET institutions and staff. These manuals could refer to; i) principles associated with learning through work, ii) sets of practices for enacting and improving learning in the workplace, and iii) advice about how those arrangements could best be enacted in workplaces.

These manuals could include how workplace supervisors, trainers and managers can utilize work activities to support students' WBL. Importantly, to be successful, these strategies need to be embedded in work activities and not seen as being separate from those everyday work activities and interactions, except when it is essential to do so. For instance, if something needs to be learnt before being applied in practice (e.g. some medical procedures).

Hence, these manuals would need to set out a range of procedures such as coaching, modelling and scaffolding, and the use of specific strategies to develop specific kinds of learning. It is also suggested that these manuals should provide bases by which effectiveness of these learning experiences could be evaluated.

Necessarily, these manuals would need to be short in length, plain and clear in language and have an engaging format and be useful for both TVET teachers and those assisting learning in workplaces (i.e. experienced workers, supervisors, managers). They might also be available in online formats and those that can be engaged with through smart phones.

Technical expertise to assist workplace implement WBL. Having available expertise to assist both TVET institutions and workplaces in implementing WBL would be helpful. That expert role would extend from:

- analysing the needs and potentials of workplaces to provide rich learning experiences to students,
- preparing both TVET staff and workplace trainers to support that learning,
- identifying specific strategies to be used in the workplace to achieve the kind of learning outcomes that students and the workplaces want, and
- assisting in evaluating the outcomes of those learning experiences.

Consequently, this role requires the ability to conduct training needs analysis within the framework of WBL, preparing teachers and workplace practitioners to use curriculum and pedagogic strategies and approaches to support WBL, having a range of strategies available to address different kinds of learning needs and learners; and being able to monitor, evaluate and arrive at judgements about the effectiveness of the approaches and strategies in achieving the kinds of outcomes that workplaces want and students need.

Country experience and promising practices

Some countries (e.g. Australia and Singapore) have implemented wide-scale training programs to develop capacities for supporting learning in the workplace. In **Australia**, a well-established short certificate focused on

providing educational foundation part-time teachers in the VET system, was converted to a program for improving quality of learning experiences in Australian workplaces (Certificate IV in Training and Assessment) <https://tafeqld.edu.au/courses/17694/certificate-iv-in-training-and-assessment>. In **Singapore**, the Advanced Certificate of Training and Assessment was developed by the Workforce Development Agency, within the Ministry of Manpower to perform similar purposes. <https://www.ial.edu.sg/learn-at-ial/ial-programmes/certificate/training-assessment-acta.html>

Elsewhere, initiatives associated with developing and preparing the workplace as an effective learning environment have arisen from programs of research (Billett 2016) and have generated resources that can be used for these purposes, and are available in English, French, Chinese and Portuguese. https://vocationsandlearning.files.wordpress.com/2018/12/Leaflet_English.pdf

Gender inclusivity

The manuals and the practices mentioned above would also need to consider how gender inclusivity can be realised so as access to workplace experiences for young women can be increased, and the kinds of support needed to ensure that they have opportunities to successfully learn through these workplace experiences are likely to be central here.

Instances of success and examples of practices in ways that young women can be involved in aspects of workplace activities are likely to be a welcomed feature of such support.

Guidelines for Recognising and Enhancing

"Traditional Apprenticeships"

The central role of traditional apprenticeships in many Southern Mediterranean countries needs to be acknowledged and embraced as an effective model within the TVET system. Yet this model of WBL can be enhanced in ways that respects and builds on its effective qualities and seeks to build upon it. This includes providing recognition of the skills that young people will have developed in completing them, and in ways that make this certification as legitimate and worthwhile as that obtained through programs based in TVET institutions. Therefore, guidelines here are associated with acknowledging the effectiveness of this model of WBL and its long-standing role as an effective model for developing young people's skills.

Rationale

Given their enduring and long-standing existence and ongoing contribution to the development of skills, understanding how traditional apprenticeships work and how they can be improved and augmented to achieve better learning outcomes and, perhaps, have wider applications makes them worthy of careful consideration.

Some guidelines

Acknowledging the worth and contributions of the traditional model of apprenticeship work to young people's learning is important. This includes, identifying and championing its processes of instruction and learning, and enterprise commitment to it as a model of learning and seeking how to enhance it without disrupting or destroying these qualities. In addition, identifying the purpose for and how any off-job learning experiences might best be organized, and how the recognition of learning in and through this form of apprenticeship can be credentialed. Given that this is a fully workplace-based model of learning, it would be important to identify curriculum considerations and pedagogic practices. That is, to examine these traditional apprenticeships as Lave (1988) did much earlier provides a powerful base for knowing what kind of curriculum and pedagogic practices are likely to be effective for this model of apprenticeship. Moreover, understanding how learners can most effectively engage through these processes, bases by which apprentices might be prepared for their roles as interdependent learners can progress, are also necessarily important qualities.

In addition, means by which this model can be extended to other occupations, including higher technical skills, can be explored. Beyond the establishment of frameworks to provide this support, its enactment would be required to occur at the local level, and in ways that are sensitive to this existing model and the abilities of those in training institutes to provide support in workplaces, this model of learning, and the apprentices.

Country experience and promising practices

The International Labour Organization (ILO) (2015) undertook a study to identify how traditional apprenticeships in **Jordan** could be engaged with more effectively and become part of a more systematic approach to TVET. The report identifies issues to be addressed to utilize these forms of young people's workplace learning - https://www.iyfnet.org/sites/default/files/library/ILO-IYF_EquipYouth_Pilot_Study_Report.pdf

Guidelines for Aligning TVET Provisions with Employment Opportunities

TVET provisions and employment opportunities need to be closely aligned by initiatives that secure a balance amongst young people's aspirations and workplace needs and occupational requirements.

Rationale

To promote young people's employment might require a review of TVET programs and courses to identify their alignment between potential employment opportunities in terms of the needs of industry sectors and occupational fields. In addition, a review of curriculum models, course objectives, and content, as well as approaches to teaching and supporting learning to more readily align the outcomes of these courses to graduates' employability. This initiative includes informing and advising young people about potential employment opportunities and the prospects of different educational pathways leading to employment.

Country experience and promising practices

There are good examples from across the globe of effective practice for these kinds of alignments from organizations such as **Global Apprentice Network** (GAN), although based in **Switzerland**, has a global reach. GAN seeks to build alignments between TVET WBL programs by engaging large employers in programs of recruitment and supporting apprentices. (see <https://www.gan-global.org>). Similar practices are being enacted in **America** through work on 'new apprenticeships' there through the Institute for Workplace Skills and Innovation (see - www.iwsiamerica.org). Attempts to align the provision of TVET with employment opportunities also necessarily involve close coordination across government departments and social partners. This will always be a difficult and potentially imprecise process because it is all is difficult to predict the demand for occupations in years to come.

However, countries that have effective tripartite arrangements (i.e. government, employers' representatives and unions) and when working together towards common goals are likely to get as close to the supply-demand requirements as possible. In countries that have quite small populations, such as the **Scandinavian** countries achieving those outcomes may be able to be addressed by single national processes. However, countries with large populations and greater regional or geographical spread (e.g. **Australia, Germany, Netherlands, Morocco**) will most likely need processes that operate both at the national and local levels.

Guidelines for Promoting Localised Engagement between TVET Institutions and Workplaces

Engaged social partnerships, including employers and employees' representatives, need to be generated locally and are essential for alignments amongst models of WBL, local enterprise needs for skill development, and strategies promoting the image of and participation in TVET. Localized engagements between TVET institutions and workplaces are essential for effective WBL.

Rationale

A national strategy to build and sustain social partnerships supporting TVET and WBL experiences requires the engagement of key industry and professional bodies. Yet, these arrangements need to be enacted at the local level in ways that secure reciprocal benefits for both the educational provision (i.e., students' learning) and secure, productive outcomes for workplaces.

At the national and local levels, the quality of the partnership is likely to be premised on reciprocity, and the long-term sustainability of the partnership is likely to lie in its ability to deliver results for all parties. That is, evidence that workplaces support and provide rich learning experiences for young people, and that tangible benefits accrue to enterprises from that engagement. These benefits extend to the selection of new employees and their contributions to sustaining the viability of the enterprise, will be essential.

Some guidelines for achieving these outcomes are as follows.

Having 'brokers' working across workplaces and TVET institutions

Across all six countries represented at the Rabat technical workshop, it offered a consistent message about the needs of local enterprises to be provided with support by TVET institutions to implement and secure quality outcomes through WBL. Concurrently, concerns were expressed that both these enterprises and many TVET institutions were not ready or prepared to fulfill this role and responsibility.

Consequently, given the need to develop capacities in both TVET institutions and workplaces, developing and piloting a process of brokerage might be helpful. That is, having suitably qualified and experienced individuals ('orientation

officers') performing bridging role between TVET institutions and workplaces, and any local industry or professional bodies.

In prospect, this role could comprise:

- 'boundary riding' (i.e. engaging with local enterprises), understanding their needs, capacities and aspirations)
- finding ways of brokering arrangements whereby the workplaces are informed about the available TVET programs and assisted become ready to engage productively with WBL students and to meet both students and the enterprise needs.
- ensuring students are suitably briefed and prepared before their workplace experiences, including being guided in how to have productive experiences in workplaces.
- after the completion of their work experiences when students return to TVET institutions, that they have opportunities to debrief, and then share and compare their learning experience with peers and teachers. This is a role that brokers could enact in facilitating these discussions and modelling processes that, subsequently, teachers could adopt.
- assist inform teachers further about contemporary work requirements and identify how teachers can already respond to their students' needs, and those of workplaces; and
- play a role in engaging with workplaces in following up to evaluate what has happened and assist further develop shared understandings, identify how processes can best proceed to sustain working relationships between TVET institutions and workplaces.

All of this constitutes a demanding role, and there may be a shortage of suitably qualified and experienced staff to fulfil it. Even those broadly qualified for this role would likely need some specific preparation and then on-going support to perform it effectively. Hence, a developmental process would be required for these brokers.

Country experience and promising practices

Some countries have processes that build and sustain partnerships at the local level between enterprises and TVET providers. In some instances, these arrangements are based around significant institutional provisions, such as the Regional Education and Training Centres (ROCs) in the **Netherlands** (<https://www.rocmn.nl/over-roc-midden-nederland/corporate-information-central-netherlands-regional-education-and-training>) or Chambers of Commerce in **Germany**. The ROCs have a very specific regional focus in a country that, albeit is small in geographical terms, has diverse regions and industry sectors within those regions.

Hence, the need to build localised arrangements between TVET institutions and local enterprises to achieve these outcomes. A key strength of the German Chambers of Commerce is that they act locally/regionally and do much to build working relationships between local industries and enterprises with TVET institutions. As noted, these chambers are bipartite – representing the interests of both employers and employees – at the local level and are accepted as having key roles in assisting the provisions of key that meet local needs and provide effective educational experiences. For instance, in Germany for the Chambers of Commerce conduct the examinations of students from TVET programs and thereby provide external verification of the outcomes of these programs.

As noted above, a different model is available in the state of Victoria in **Australia** that has formed Local Learning and Employment Networks (LLENS) that bring together representatives of the local community, employers and also tertiary education institutions and their key mandate is to assist young people to move smoothly from schooling and tertiary education into paid employment. These arrangements operate very much locally/regionally, albeit shaped by the needs of local communities. However, they do so within national frameworks for TVET and meeting State-based education and training priorities - <https://www.education.vic.gov.au/about/programs/Pages/llens.aspx>.

Guidelines for Implementing Strategies to Improve TVET Workforce Capacity and Provision

It requires long-term planning to develop industry and occupational expertise, the skills of TVET teachers, including their familiarity with workplace practices and engagements with social partners to generate mature TVET systems.

Rationale

The kind and extent of activities and outcomes being proposed here can only be achieved over the longer term and through careful planning and implementation of effective strategies to develop capacities within training institutions, social partners, workplaces, and communities. This includes promoting the standing and status of TVET and the occupations it serves, but also the engagement with young people to position them as active and focused learners.

Developing the capacities of TVET institutions/training centres and their staff to:

Engage effectively with workplaces - Many teachers within TVET institutions and training centres are not well aligned or familiar with local workplaces and their requirements for work performance. Hence, it is necessary to prepare these staff to engage effectively with local workplaces, through either visits, secondments, placements or other kinds of interactions for TVET staff to come to understand local workplaces' capacities, goals and potentials to support WBL.

This development likely includes enhancing these staff's communication capacities to effectively engage in dialogue with local workplaces to build up effective and enduring relationships. It is often the case that staff who have taught within TVET institutions for considerable periods of time have lost some of their occupational competence and familiarity with contemporary workplaces and work requirements.

For some TVET staff, these processes can be quite challenging and assist them incrementally engaging with local workplaces, perhaps as part of the brokerage role set out above. This may well be an effective model of developing their professional capacities when engaging with workplaces. More than interactions, the aim here is to develop effective partnerships between TVET institutions and local workplaces and as with any partnership, these would need to be developed and sustained through mutual engagement and securing outcomes that have shared benefits.

Integrate WBL experiences - TVET teachers need to assist students to reconcile the experiences they have in workplaces with their program of study. Students may not always be aware of the different kinds of learning arising through workplace experiences and what is being taught within the TVET institution, and how these relate to occupational requirements.

Therefore, deliberate educational interventions are required to integrate the two sets of experiences effectively. There are actions that TVET teachers can take **before students engage in work practice** to prepare them for workplace experiences. This includes being sensitive to how they should participate, engaging purposefully in learning and identifying and engaging with sources of support and guidance.

Whilst in workplaces, TVET students are encouraged to engage with other students and workers to assist their development. Once students have **completed WBL experiences**, TVET teachers and institutions should find opportunities for students to come together to share, compare, contrast their experiences. This is most likely realised through an organized process that allows them to understand the different kind of goals that workplaces have. Through such an experience, some of the variations of occupational practices that occur across workplaces and an understanding of what constitutes effective occupational performance in that workplace.

This kind of debrief or post-workplace intervention can be particularly helpful for students who are having difficulty accessing workplace experience because of barriers such as distance, disability or gender. In short, these experiences can vicariously permit students are far broader engagement than through their own direct experience of workplaces.

Ultimately, the integration of the workplace experiences is premised on how TVET students come to engage with these experiences, and those associated with integrating practice and work-based experiences. So, the TVET educational provision includes preparing students to be effective and proactive learners in their workplace experiences, and when reconciling and integrating two sets of learnings that arise from the workplace and educational settings.

Provide students with authentic experiences/projects

The experiences provided for students in TVET institutions should be as occupationally authentic as possible. That is, activities that replicate what occurs in workplaces and engage students in the kinds of thinking and acting roles they would when engaged in work activities. These kinds of experiences will more likely develop capacities that can transfer or adapt to their application in workplace settings.

So, considerations of project work, authentic task-based activities, projects all assist in providing experiences of these kind and assist them prepare that they would encounter in workplaces when practicing the occupations for which they are being prepared.

Countries that do not have a tradition of work-based elements in their TVET programs (e.g. the Netherlands and Singapore) often provide tertiary students with task-based authentic project-based activities as part of the institutional-based curriculum.

Providing effective learning experiences in TVET institutions is particularly important for students who have difficulty securing workplace experiences, because of issues of location, gender or disability. Then, authentic work-based learning experiences undertaken within TVET institutions become crucial. For instance, if young women are restricted in the workplaces they can engage and learn, this approach is a potential for back to provide WBL experiences for them in TVET institutions.

Country experience and promising practices

Countries with advanced vocational education systems often have specialized teacher education programs and ongoing professional development of teachers in TVET. Usually, those programs require applicants to have extensive industry experience and focus on developing their professional education capacities. These arrangements differ across countries and focuses. For instance, in **Germany**, there are specialist universities preparing vocational educators for specific disciplines (e.g. engineering). That teacher education can occur allied to or associated with faculty within the University that has an occupational focus (e.g. engineering).

However, in many other countries, such as the **United Kingdom** and **Australia**, the practice has been for a specific preparation of vocational educators. Entrance into these programs included possessing relevant industry qualifications and experiences, and the program is largely focused on professional education preparation. It is reported

that in both **Norway** (Hiim) and **Finland** (Nokelainen) the use of higher education institutions for TVET teacher development and professional development programs is an important step in elevating their competence and standing. (see (Nägele & Stalder, 2018)

The ongoing development of these teachers' skills is often complex and vexed. To remain current and competent in content requires extensive engagement with the occupational field, and most likely through periods of industry release. However, these requirements are often quite difficult to accommodate within the funding parameters of vocational education institutions.

References

- Al-Mujaini, A. O. (2017). *Investigation of work-based learning programs for young people in Oman*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- Bedou, A. (2018). *Work-based learning for young people in Algeria*. Retrieved from Turin:
- Billett, S. (2013). Towards a mature provision of vocational education. *International Journal of Training Research*, 11(2), 184-194.
- Billett, S., & Seddon, T. (2004). Building community through social partnerships around vocational education and training. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 56(1), 51- 67.
- Business Europe. (2018). *A European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships*. Retrieved from Brussels:
- Chelbi, A. (2017). *Work Based Learning in Tunisia*: Eropcan Training Foundation.
- Clement, U. (2014). *Improving the image of technical and vocational education and training* Retrieved from Bonn, Germany:
- Deissinger, T., & Hellwig, S. (2005). Apprenticeships in Germany: modernising the Dual System. *Education and Training* 47(4/5), 312-324.
- El-ASHmawi, A. (2017). *Reviewing work-based learning programs for young people: Republic of Egypt*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- European Training Foundation. (2009). *Work-based learning programs for young people in the Mediterranean region*. Turin, Italy: European Training Foundation.
- Ghneim, O. (2017). *Reviewing work-based learning programs for young people: Lebanon*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- International Labour Organisation. (2015). *Upgrading informal apprenticeships: A bottom up approach*. Retrieved from Beirut, Lebanon:
- Jweiles, Z. (2017). *Studies for reviewing work-based learning programs for young people: Palestine*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- Kentucky Department of Education. (2015). *Work-based Learning Manua*. In Kentucky Department of Education (Ed.).
- Nägele, C., & Stalder, B. E. (2018). *Trends in vocational education and training research. Proceedings of the European Conference on Educational Research (ECER)*, Vocational Education and Training Network (VETNET). Paper presented at the Proceedings of the European Conference on Educational Research (ECER, Bolzano).
- UNESCO-UNEVOC. (2018). *Short summary of the Virtual Conference on improving the image of TVET: Making TVET attractive to youth*. Retrieved from Bonn, Germany:
- UNESCO. (2018). *Work-based learning programmes for young people in the Arab region: A comparative and longitudinal analysis - Full report*. Retrieved from Paris:
- Rawashdeh, H. (2017). *Work-based learning in Jordan*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- Sennou, S. S. (2017). *Work-based training systems in the Maghreb countries*. Turino, Italy: European Training Foundation.
- The European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network. (2014). *Work based Learning and Lifelong Guidance Policies*. Jyvaskala, Finland: University of Jyvaskala.



unesco

United Nations
Educational, Scientific
and Cultural Organization

Stay in touch

UNESCO Regional Bureau for Education in the Arab States
Sports City Avenue, Bir Hassan
P. O. Box 11-5244
Beirut - Lebanon
Tel: 961.1.850013/4/5
Fax: 961.1.824854

 beirut@unesco.org

 www.unesco.org/new/beirut
<https://unevoc.unesco.org/yem/YEM+Home>

 UNESCO Office in Beirut

 @UNESCOBEIRUT

With the support of:



European Union

