



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

World Heritage

42 COM

WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add

Paris, 28 May 2018

Original: English / French

**UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC
AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION**

**CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF
THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE**

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Forty-second session

**Manama, Bahrain
24 June - 4 July 2018**

**Item 7A of the Provisional Agenda: State of conservation of the properties
inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger**

SUMMARY

In accordance with Section IV B, paragraphs 190-191 of the *Operational Guidelines*, the Committee shall review annually the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger. This review shall include such monitoring procedures and expert missions as might be determined necessary by the Committee.

This document contains information on the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger. The World Heritage Committee is requested to review the reports on the state of conservation of properties contained in this document. The full reports of Reactive Monitoring missions requested by the World Heritage Committee are available at the following Web address in their original language:
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/42COM/documents>

All state of conservation reports are also available through the World Heritage State of conservation Information System at the following Web address:
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc>

Decision required: The Committee is requested to review the following state of conservation reports. The Committee may wish to adopt the draft Decision presented at the end of each state of conservation report.

TABLE OF CONTENT

CULTURAL PROPERTIES	3
ASIA AND PACIFIC	3
3. Nan Madol: Ceremonial Centre of Eastern Micronesia (Micronesia, Federated States of) (C 1503)	3
EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA	4
7. Liverpool – Maritime Mercantile City (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 1150)	4
AFRICA	8
16. Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda) (C 1022)	8
ARAB STATES	12
17. Abu Mena (Egypt) (C 90)	12
21. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)	15
22. Archaeological Site of Cyrene (Libya) (C 190)	15
23. Archaeological Site of Leptis Magna (Libya) (C 183)	19
24. Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Libya) (C 184)	22
25. Old Town of Ghadamès (Libya) (C 362)	25
26. Rock-Art Sites of Tadrart Acacus (Libya) (C 287)	28
27. Birthplace of Jesus: Church of the Nativity and the Pilgrimage Route, Bethlehem (Palestine) (C 1433)	31
28. Hebron/Al-Khalil Old Town (Palestine) (C 1565)	33
29. Palestine: Land of Olives and Vines – Cultural Landscape of Southern Jerusalem, Battir (Palestine) (C 1492)	34
30. Ancient City of Aleppo (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 21)	37
31. Ancient City of Bosra (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 22bis)	41
32. Ancient City of Damascus (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 20bis)	43
33. Ancient villages of Northern Syria (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 1348)	46
34. Crac des chevaliers and Qal’at Salah El-Din (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 1229)	48
35. Site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 23bis)	51
36. General Decision on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic	53
37. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) (C 611)	57
38. Old City of Sana’a (Yemen) (C 385)	60
39. Old Walled City of Shibam (Yemen) (C 192)	63
NATURAL PROPERTIES	66
ASIA-PACIFIC	66
40. Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Indonesia) (N 1167)	66
41. East Rennell (Solomon Islands) (N 854)	66
LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN	67
43. Belize Barrier Reef Reserve System (Belize) (N 764)	67
AFRICA	71
45. Manovo Gounda St. Floris National Park (Central African Republic) (N 475)	71
46. Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d’Ivoire, Guinea) (N 155bis)	74
50. Salonga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 280)	78
51. Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 63)	82

52.	General Decision on the properties of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC).....	86
53.	Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) (N 1257).....	88
56.	Selous Game Reserve (United Republic of Tanzania) (N 199bis).....	91

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

ASIA AND PACIFIC

3. Nan Madol: Ceremonial Centre of Eastern Micronesia (Micronesia, Federated States of) (C 1503)

See Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add.2

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

7. Liverpool – Maritime Mercantile City (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 1150)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2004

Criteria (ii)(iii)(iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2012-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
The proposed development of "Liverpool Waters"

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
In progress

Corrective measures identified
In progress

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures
In progress

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1150/documents/>

International Assistance
Requests approved: 0
Total amount approved: USD 0
For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1150/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds
N/A

Previous monitoring missions
October 2006: joint World Heritage Centre / ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission; November 2011: joint World Heritage Centre / ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission; February 2015: joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Governance: Lack of overall management of new developments
- High impact research/monitoring activities: Lack of analysis and description of the townscape characteristics relevant to the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and important views related to the property and its buffer zone
- Legal framework: Lack of established maximum heights for new developments along the waterfront and for the backdrops of the World Heritage property
- Social/cultural uses of heritage
- Buildings and development: Commercial development, housing, interpretative and visitor facilities
- Lack of adequate management system/management plan

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1150/>

Current conservation issues

On 31 January 2018, the State Party transmitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1150/documents/>, as well as a proposed Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and a set of corrective measures.

Following dialogue with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, the State Party transmitted on 26 April 2018 a revised draft DSOCR and set of corrective measures. The report and the revised draft DSOCR provide information on the following issues:

- A proposed interpretation and communication strategy focused on positive stories of heritage-led regeneration and on raising awareness of the benefits of World Heritage status on tourism, the economy and well-being;
- Adoption of the Management Plan by the Mayor's Cabinet in 2017;
- Development of a height ('skyline') policy and proposed review in 2018-2019 of the Supplementary Planning Document (SPD) for inclusion in the draft Local Plan;
- A draft of the Local Plan expected to be submitted for public examination in May 2018;
- Continued efforts by the State Party to work in partnership with Liverpool City Council (LCC), Historic England, and developers to ensure that planning decisions are informed by Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA);
- Creation of a Mayoral Task Force of independent experts to provide advice that will assist in avoiding the removal of the property from the World Heritage List;
- Commitment of all stakeholders and increasing engagement of civil society, in particular Engage Liverpool and Merseyside Civic Society;
- Additional measures taken to reinforce planning permission procedure, including required neighbourhood masterplans detailing development briefs that re-set maximum heights for individual plots and measures to ensure the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and heritage assets are protected and enhanced including views from, within and to the property;
- The neighbourhood masterplan for Princes Dock submitted to LCC for approval and the masterplan for Central Dock currently under preparation and being guided by the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) approach.

The report indicates also that in the opinion of the State Party, the developments within Liverpool Waters to date have not caused harm to the OUV and that Peel Holdings (the Liverpool Waters developer) will not fully implement the illustrative masterplan that accompanied the 2013 planning consent. The report further underlines that no planning permissions for developments that may have a negative impact have been allowed other than the outline consent for Liverpool Waters, which have been guided by the 2009 SPD to be revised in 2018. The DSOCR seeks to ensure that corrective measures that prevent potential harm in the future to OUV are put in place.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The January 2018 DSOCR and its revision (April 2018) following ICOMOS Technical review (March 2018) offer a significant improvement in approach and direction relative to previous draft DSOCR iterations. The DSOCR outlines overall attributes of the property, which contribute to its OUV, and acknowledges the importance of their protection, as well as the significance of the context of the property and its Buffer Zone. Seven objectives are set out as the 'Desired state of conservation for removal', followed by 10 proposed corrective measures, together with a timeline for their implementation and proposed progress indicators.

It is promising that Peel Holdings (Liverpool Waters developer) has recently confirmed to LCC that there is no likelihood of the scheme coming forward in the same form of the Outline Planning Consent (2013-2042), and a new master planning process has started taking heritage considerations into account including HUL approach.

The proposed DSOCR provides a clear indication of intent by the State Party; however, as the State Party has itself foreshadowed, the DSOCR and corrective measures are not yet complete and therefore not in a form that might be considered for adoption by the Committee, as requested in Decision **41 COM 7A.22**. Specifically, the current draft DSOCR does not yet incorporate sufficient specific commitment regarding development controls (including specific view line and skyline controls) and reduction to the existing outline planning permission to remove the threats to the authenticity and integrity (and therefore to the OUV) of the property. The DSOCR, as currently proposed, relies heavily on future guideline documents, which are still in preparation, namely, the Local Plan, the Neighbourhood Masterplans, the height ('skyline') policy, and the proposed revision to the SPD. Therefore, in order to carry out a full assessment of the adequacy of the proposed DSOCR, it is necessary to assess the content of these documents and to establish a clear commitment by the State Party to limit the quantity, location and size of allowable built form, as specifically requested in Decision **41 COM 7A.22**.

In order for the World Heritage Committee to consider approving a final DSOCR, the State Party should consider an alternative process that involves: 1) defining first the specific desired outcome to which the Local Plan, the height ('skyline') policy, the SPD and neighbourhood masterplans could then be aligned and, 2) that these documents be then reviewed together with the proposed DSOCR. Those documents would need to be reviewed and agreed by the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS before they are endorsed by the relevant State Party agencies and adopted by LCC. Furthermore, it is recommended that the Committee reiterate its previous request to the State Party to adopt a moratorium for new buildings within the property and its buffer zone, until the DSOCR is completely finalized and approved.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.7

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decisions **37 COM 7A.35**, **38 COM 7A.19**, **39 COM 7A.43**, **40 COM 7A.31**, and **41 COM 7A.22**, adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 38th (Doha, 2014), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and 41st (Krakow, 2017) sessions respectively,*
3. *Recalls that it has repeatedly expressed its serious concerns over the impact of the proposed Liverpool Waters developments in the form presented in the approved Outline Planning Consent (2013-2042);*
4. *Acknowledges the increasing engagement of civil society in the care of the World Heritage property and its status, in particular the organization "Engage Liverpool";*
5. *Although noting that the State Party has proposed a draft Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), including a set of corrective measures, a timeframe for implementation, as well as indicators; also notes that comprehensive assessment of the proposed DSOCR by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies is not feasible at this stage, as the DSOCR is not yet complete and relies on the content of additional documents, which are yet to be prepared by the State Party, including the Local Plan, the revised Supplementary Planning Document, the neighbourhood masterplans, and the height ('skyline') policy;*
6. *Further notes that Peel Holdings (Liverpool Waters developer) has recently confirmed to Liverpool City Council that there is no likelihood of the scheme coming forward in the same form of the Outline Planning Consent, and that Peel Holdings is undertaking a comprehensive review of the scheme and drawing up new neighbourhood masterplans taking full account of heritage considerations and recorded commentary by the World Heritage Committee;*
7. *Reiterates its previous request to the State Party to adopt a moratorium for new buildings within the property and its buffer zone, until the Local Plan, the revised Supplementary Planning Document, the neighbourhood masterplans, and the height ('skyline') policy are all carefully reviewed and endorsed by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and the DSOCR is completely finalized and approved by the World Heritage Committee;*
8. *Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, the Local Plan, the revised Supplementary Planning Document, the neighbourhood masterplans, and the*

height (skyline) policy, or any other relevant document, for preliminary examination by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;

9. ***Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by 1 February 2019 a revised DSOCR and a report on the state of conservation of the property for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019 and, in this context, recalls its position expressed in Decision 41 COM 7A.22 - Paragraph 11, in case the State Party does not:***
 - a) *Provide substantive commitments to limitation on the quantity, location and size of allowable built form,*
 - b) *Link the strategic city development vision to a regulatory planning document,*
 - c) *Submit a fully-complete DSOCR and corrective measures in a form that might be considered for adoption by the Committee;*

10. ***Decides to retain Liverpool – Maritime Mercantile City (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.***

AFRICA

16. Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda) (C 1022)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2001

Criteria (i)(iii)(iv)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2010-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Fire that resulted in the destruction of part of the property

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4351>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4351>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4351>

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1022/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 4 (from 1998-2018)

Total amount approved: USD 135,363

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1022/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: 2011-2012: USD 68,365 from the Japanese FIT for an Expert Appraisal Mission; 2013-2016 (project on hold pending completion of the Master Plan): USD 650,000 from the Japanese FIT for the project: Technical and financial assistance for the reconstruction of Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga, architectural masterpiece of the Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi, Uganda, World Heritage property in Danger; 2017: USD 5,400 from the World Heritage Fund for ICOMOS Advisory consultancy for the finalization of the elaboration of the Master Plan

Previous monitoring missions

April 2010, August 2011, November 2011 and August 2013: World Heritage Centre mission; November 2010: Joint UNESCO/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission; April 2012: Joint ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission; February 2015: Joint UNESCO/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission. Since 2014, regular missions by UNESCO Office in Nairobi

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Destruction by fire of the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga
- Ground transport infrastructure: Proposed widening of Masiro and Hoima Roads
- Management systems/management plan: lack of a Master Plan and a complete Management Plan with detailed disaster risk management plan and a tourism management plan.
- Management activities: Management structure

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1022/>

Current conservation issues

On 28 February 2018, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1022/documents/> and reports the following:

- The reconstruction of Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga (main tomb building) has progressed, with the ceiling installation underway. The reconstruction process is on track according to the timeline

submitted with the State Party's 2017 state of conservation report. Critical to this process is the implementation of the firefighting installation, which is dependent on the Japanese Funds-in-Trust (JFiT) extrabudgetary project funding being released;

- The preparation of the disaster risk management plan is in process. The fire prevention installation design was adapted after review by the Advisory Bodies and awaits the approval of the Master Plan and the releasing of the JFiT extrabudgetary funds before it can be implemented;
- A Master Plan (2018-2028) is under development by the State Party in cooperation with the Buganda Kingdom, the Kampala Capital City Authority (KCCA), the tomb custodians, the neighbourhood community, and Makerere University researchers. The development of the plan has advanced under the guidance of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies. The draft plan encompasses various components: a reconstruction, restoration and recovery plan, disaster and risk management plan, tourism and education plan, custodian needs and the physical development of the property. In anticipation of the plan and in line with Decision **41 COM 7A.31**, all new developments, except the reconstruction of the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga, have been halted;
- The State Party has submitted an organizational chart presenting the amended management structure, including the newly-constituted Buganda Heritage Tourism Board. The temporary National Technical Committee, convened to oversee the reconstruction of the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga, has become a permanent management team and includes members representing traditional custodians, the Buganda Kingdom, the Ministry of Tourism, Wildlife and Antiquities, the National Commission for UNESCO and Makerere University. This committee will be responsible for supervisory, advisory and coordination activities;
- The timelines submitted with the State Party's 2017 report on the state of conservation are achievable, conditional to funding availability;
- The state of conservation of the Bujjabukula (gatehouse) is rapidly deteriorating. The State Party notes that stabilization and restoration works must commence, in parallel with the further reconstruction of the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga. For this reason, an International Assistance Request was submitted by the State Party to the World Heritage Centre for the restoration of the Bujjabukula,

In April 2018, the State Party also submitted a matrix for the corrective measures and timeframe for implementation of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) as well as a workplan.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The State Party has addressed many factors affecting the property, including the reconstruction of the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga, the development of a functioning managing system and a Master Plan for the property. The State Party has also been in constant contact with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies with regard to the firefighting installation and the development of disaster risk management plan and a Master Plan. In relation to the latter, progress has been sufficient to expect the Master Plan to be completed in 2018.

The revision of the management structure now accommodates the various important role-players, including the traditional custodians and craftspersons, and includes the Buganda Kingdom and university researchers as an essential part of the management team. The decision to extend the life of the National Technical Committee indefinitely in the monitoring and management structure is welcome and will fortify the management of the property. While the State Party does not explicitly report on the progress to date in achieving the DSOCR, the new management structure and draft management plan will improve the role and profile of custodians and craftspersons in relation to their knowledge of traditional practices. The new plan includes a disaster risk management strategy and capacity-building strategy and aims to embed the values of the property locally. The UNESCO Regional Office for Eastern Africa has played a crucial and constant supporting and guiding role in the development of these plans and strategies.

The timeframes for the completion of the reconstruction of the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga as submitted in 2017 remain feasible. However, the deterioration of the Bujjabukula is of grave concern. The Advisory Bodies share the State Party's sense of urgency regarding the stabilization and restoration of this highly significant structure. The World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies discussed the International Assistance Request at the panel meeting. After ascertaining that sufficient material and skills were

available to work on both the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga and the Bujjabukula contemporaneously, it received a positive recommendation and was approved in April 2018.

The Master Plan process has led to a number of inappropriate proposals for the property being modified or cancelled, and has helped to sensitise the Kampala Capital City Authority to the importance of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV). The Master Plan, once completed, needs to be embedded in the city's own policies and plans. Many questions on the urban scale remain, especially with regard to the management of the buffer zone, its urban densities, and the development of Masiro and Hoima roads. The research conducted on traditional Ganda materials and techniques should continue unabated, and further efforts should be made to document and disseminate the results of this research.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.16

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.31**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Welcomes the progress made in the reconstruction of the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga and that the work is on track to be completed in 2019, and notes the importance of funds being released from the Japanese extrabudgetary project as a matter of urgency in order to implement the disaster management system;*
4. *Also welcomes the progress made in developing a disaster risk strategy, appropriate management structure, draft management plan and draft Master Plan, in cooperation with the Buganda Kingdom Heritage and Tourism Board, the traditional custodians, the architects with knowledge of traditional building practices, and representatives of the Ministry of Tourism, Wildlife, and Antiquities, and commends the State Party for the collaborative nature in which these plans, strategies and systems have been developed;*
5. *Further welcomes the progress made to submit a matrix with the corrective measures and a timeframe for implementation of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) as well as a workplan;*
6. *Acknowledges the constructive contribution of all parties, including state and non-state agents, in achieving the progress to date;*
7. *Encourages the State Party and all of the stakeholders involved in the management and use of the property to continue this active engagement, with support and guidance from the Advisory Bodies, with a view to implementing these strategies and plans at the earliest possible time, thereby achieving as soon as possible the DSOCR;*
8. *Expresses its concern however at the rapid deterioration of the Bujjabukula, and also acknowledges the State Party's willingness to address the state of conservation of this highly significant structure;*
9. *Requests the State Party to:*
 - a) *Urgently research and document the Bujjabukula, its construction and the individual elements that compose it,*
 - b) *Urgently develop plans for its stabilization and restoration for submission to the Advisory Bodies,*

- c) *Implement the stabilization and restoration of the Bujjabukula as soon as possible and in parallel with the continuing process of the reconstruction of the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga;*
10. *Also requests the State Party to further develop guidelines for the buffer zone of the property and reassess and align the development of Masiro and Hoima roads with the values for which the property was inscribed on the World Heritage List, and to duly reflect the urban dimension of the property and its OUV in the policies, measures and tools adopted by the State Party and the Kampala Capital City Authority, to ensure adequate conservation, using, if necessary, the approach carried by the Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (2011);*
11. *Further requests the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed of any change to the 2017 timeline for reaching the DSOCR;*
12. *Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;*
13. ***Decides to retain Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.***

ARAB STATES

17. Abu Mena (Egypt) (C 90)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1979

Criteria (iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2001-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- A land-reclamation programme and irrigation scheme with no appropriate drainage mechanism for the agricultural development of the region has caused a dramatic rise in the water table;
- The destruction of numerous cisterns, disseminated around the property, has entailed the collapse of several overlying structures. Huge underground cavities have opened in the north-western region of the property;
- A large, banked road has been built to enable movement within the property.

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/1279>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/1279>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/1279> but outdated and needs to be revised

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/90/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 1 (from 2001-2014)

Total amount approved: USD 7,000

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/90/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

N/A

Previous monitoring missions

2002: Expert mission; 2005, 2009 and 2012: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring missions

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Rise of the water table, and ensuing damage arising from changes to water table level
- Impact on structures due to earth trembling and other forms of damage likely to result from the use of heavy earth-moving equipment (works completed)
- Lack of conservation plan, defining short-, medium-, and long-term objectives and establishing technical parameters (materials, techniques, etc.)
- Need for a management plan, to include research, presentation and interpretation, the role of stakeholders (e.g. the Mar Mena community), staffing, sponsorship, visitor facilities, access, etc.
- Encroachments within the property and inappropriate recent constructions
- Lack of engagement with local communities and other stakeholders
- Management activities
- Management systems/ management plan
- Failure to implement corrective measures

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/90/>

Current conservation issues

On 2 February 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/90/documents/>, in which the following activities are reported:

- The Ministry of Antiquities (MoA) has undertaken a series of measures for the protection and conservation of the property and is working on finding solutions to the threats affecting the archaeological area and the obstacles to the implementation of the first phase of the recommended corrective measures;
- The MoA has established a scientific committee to study the threats to the property resulting from the rise of the groundwater level, to identify its sources and solutions to protect the archaeological area. Other studies are proceeding, including a geophysical/geothermal survey to explore the paths and dimensions of sub-surface water, while an architectural survey of the area has occurred using three-dimensional laser technology;
- The MoA, in cooperation with the Ministry of Agriculture and the Ministry of Irrigation, envisage to devise an action plan to maintain and clean water discharge lines, plant hydrophilic plants to reuse, and decrease the underground water;
- Encroachments have been removed from the buffer zone and a 'Board of Trustees' has been formed from the ministries and stakeholders involved in the management of the property to discuss the removal of the new constructions with local populations;
- The proposed visitors' centre project has been placed on hold, owing to lack of funding and pending resolution of the underground water problem at the property;
- The Great Basilica continues to suffer from cracks and other damage resulting from the high level of underground water and from rain. The Great Basilica's burial chamber and some walls of the visitor's courtyard, amongst other areas, remain in need of physical conservation. The MoA has prepared a condition assessment report for objects discovered in the Great Basilica;
- A project for the conservation and rehabilitation of the Archaeological Site of Abu Mena, which includes conservation and capacity building activities, is under preparation by the MoA and EU funding has been sought for its implementation;
- The MoA has proposed a minor boundary modification, involving the removal of two areas, which do not contain archaeological features;

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The property has been inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger since 2001; corrective measures were identified in 2006; the Desired State of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) was adopted in 2007 and, in the same year, the State Party was requested to implement the corrective measures by 2010. Since then, the attributes that contribute to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property have deteriorated; the corrective measures have not been completed and the property has not yet achieved its DSOCR.

The establishment of a scientific committee to study the threats to the property resulting from the rise of the groundwater level is a positive step in addressing a longstanding and substantial threat to the OUV of the property and will contribute to the implementation of corrective measures. The findings of the 2012 Reactive Monitoring mission that electrical pumping was unsustainable in the long term, and the associated analysis of ways to address the underlying causes of the rising water table, need to be urgently addressed as part of this process.

In agreement with the State Party, in the framework of ongoing technical consultations related to the rise of the water table, the UNESCO Cairo Office' Science and Culture specialists will undertake a mission to the property with the involvement of the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) in May 2018. There is a need for mitigation measures, such as a controlled process to lower the water table and its stabilization, to be identified and implemented. Mitigation measures need to include an efficient system for monitoring the water table in the archaeological site and in the surrounding zones, and to avoid rapid masonry deterioration from salts.

The removal of some encroachments is also welcome, but inappropriate new constructions, including wooden kiosks, which are inconsistent with OUV, remain within the property. It is recommended that the Committee take note of the State Party's measures to remove illegally built constructions within the property and its decision to put on hold the construction of the visitors centre until the water table level is stabilized. However, it is also recommended that the Committee request the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, detailed information, including Heritage

Impact Assessments, for projects foreseen for construction within the property or its buffer zone, such as the visitors' centre, before commencement, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

Although the preparation of a condition assessment report for objects discovered in the Great Basilica is welcome, the State Party has not yet submitted details of all on-going or planned restoration interventions at the property, particularly at the Great Basilica, nor the reburial strategy, nor initiatives arising from the project for the restoration and rehabilitation of the property, for review prior to implementation, as requested in Decisions **40 COM 7A.9** and **41 COM 7A.32**.

A comprehensive Conservation Plan addressing all of the significant components of the property is still required. Moreover, the Committee has been requesting the completion of a Management Plan for the property for more than a decade. A specific request to prepare a comprehensive Integrated Management Plan for the property was made in Decision **41 COM 7A.32**, but the State Party has not provided any progress report on the preparation of such a Management Plan.

The State Party submitted a proposal for a minor boundary modification to the World Heritage Centre in 2016. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to continue the consultation process with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS and formally submit a revised modification of the boundaries of both the property and buffer zone, in accordance with Paragraphs 163-165 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.17

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.32**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Continues to express great concern regarding the state of conservation of the property and the low level of implementation of the recommended corrective measures;
4. Notes that a scientific committee to study the threats to the property arising from the rise of the groundwater level and elaborate a project to address them, has been established, and urgently requests the State Party to:
 - a) Devise an action plan to address the rise of the groundwater level,
 - b) Establish an efficient system for monitoring the water table in the archaeological site and in the surrounding zones,
 - c) Devise mitigation measures for the archaeological remains, during the process of lowering and stabilizing the water table;
5. Also notes that, with the agreement of the State Party, an Advisory mission involving UNESCO and the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) is to visit the property to provide advice on appropriate irrigation and water management technologies;
6. Also requests the State Party to submit, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*, details for all on-going or planned restoration interventions at the property, particularly at the Great Basilica, the reburial strategy, and initiatives arising from the project for restoration and rehabilitation of the property, or any new envisaged constructions such as a visitors' centre, for review prior to implementation, noting that a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) should be prepared for rehabilitation and construction projects in accordance with the 2011 ICOMOS Guidance on HIAs for Cultural World Heritage properties;

7. Urges the State Party to proceed with comprehensive implementation of the corrective measures, to protect and conserve the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, with particular attention to the following issues:
 - a) Preparation of a comprehensive Integrated Management Plan,
 - b) Preparation of a conservation plan, which includes a condition survey and the identification of priority interventions to ensure stabilization of archaeological remains,
 - c) Removal of inadequate new constructions, and the creation of facilities to allow for religious uses in areas outside the boundaries of the property and its buffer zone, if need be;
8. Further requests the State Party to finalize the minor boundary modification request in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and in line with Paragraphs 163-165 of the Operational Guidelines, for examination by the World Heritage Committee;
9. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
10. **Decides to retain Abu Mena (Egypt) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

21. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)

See Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add.2

22. Archaeological Site of Cyrene (Libya) (C 190)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1982

Criteria (ii)(iii)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2016-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet established

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/190/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 0

Total amount approved: USD 0

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/190/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

European Project "Protection of Cultural Heritage and Diversity in Complex Emergencies for Peace and Stability" USD 15,000

Previous monitoring missions

March 2003: World Heritage Centre mission; May 2006: World Heritage Centre Reactive Monitoring mission; January 2007: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission; August 2008: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Deliberate destruction of heritage (Inadequate protection leading to threat to rock-hewn monumental tombs, vandalism and the development of agricultural activities in the rural zone)
- Governance
- Housing (Urban encroachment and uncontrolled building construction leading to destruction of archaeological areas)
- Interpretative and visitation facilities (Need for a presentation and interpretation system for visitors and the local population)
- Livestock farming / grazing of domesticated animals
- Crop production
- Management activities (Inappropriate earlier restoration work)
- Management systems / management plan (Need to complete the Conservation and Management Plan in order to co-ordinate actions in the short- and medium-term; Need to provide a detailed map at the appropriate scale showing the boundaries of the property and buffer zone, as well as regulatory measures foreseen to ensure the protection of the property; Inadequate on-site security and control systems)
- Surface water pollution (Problem of discharge of sewage from the modern town into the Wadi Bel Ghadir)
- Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/190/>

Current conservation issues

On 30 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/190/documents/>. Progress in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- The Department of Antiquities of Cyrene (DOAC) has undertaken an administrative restructuring to address the problems that the property is facing. The DOAC has also addressed the excessive growth of vegetation in different parts of the property (the Odeon, the Apollo Sacred Area, the Eastern Church Cathedral and the Four Seasons mosaic) by undertaking participatory site cleaning activities, and has held workshops on documenting and inventorying archaeological artefacts;
- On 1 July 2017 the Municipal Council issued Municipal Resolution No. 4.11.242, stopping construction works near the archaeological property, forbidding the entry of construction machinery into the property, and entrusting the police agencies, antiquities authorities, municipal guards and criminal investigation staff to enforce the Resolution;
- Despite the difficulties faced, a map of the property showing the boundaries and the buffer zone has been submitted. The process of elaborating the map was based on field surveys, satellite images and consultations with the local population, which led to devising an action plan for protecting the property;
- The DOAC considers that, in addition to its efforts and those of the local authorities and communities, the effective long-term conservation and management of the property will require stronger support from the international community to address infrastructure and services – in particular the sewage issue – and the housing needs in the urban area around the property;

- A strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, based on Presidential Decree No. 1355/2017, is currently being implemented by the Engineering Consulting Office of Utilities (ECOU) under the supervision of the DOA. Funds have been allocated for the elaboration of the studies and plans needed to implement the strategy, which is based on eight pillars: protection from human encroachment; protection from natural factors; tourism; attracting and developing human resources; strengthening infrastructure and environment; recording and monitoring archaeological sites; supporting the environment; and administration.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The information provided by the State Party demonstrates its commitment for the conservation of the Archaeological Site of Cyrene despite the prevailing conflict in the country, and constitutes substantial progress in the analysis of the situation at the property and of the remedial actions taken so far. Despite this commitment, urban encroachment remains a major concern, having a considerable impact on the property's integrity.

The efforts made to elaborate the maps, including the boundaries and the buffer zone, are recognized as an indispensable step forward for the protection and management of the property. The ongoing close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS in this regard is highly appreciated. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to continue the close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS, and submit a Boundary Clarification followed by a Minor Boundary Modification, in line with Paragraph 164 of the *Operational Guidelines* for review by the Advisory Bodies.

The report does not mention whether it was possible to evaluate the existence of new settlements affecting the archaeological site. However, Municipal Resolution No 4.11.242 dated 1 July 2017, which is aimed at stopping construction work within the property, provides a legal protective framework that needs to be enforced. The coordination and dialogue with local communities on establishing an Action Plan on this issue and on delineating the boundary and buffer zone of the property is commendable, and its continuation is to be strongly encouraged.

The report is also silent on the request made by the Committee in 2017 to organize as soon as possible a technical workshop to explore ways for the monitoring and management of the property.

The current condition related to the lack of funds and human resources is regrettable, as it prevents the State Party from solving urban encroachment, addressing the sewage issue or undertaking substantial conservation works. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to submit an International Assistance request to address the pressing issues currently facing the property.

It is also recommended that the important efforts made by the State Party for the elaboration of a strategy for the protection of Libyan World Heritage properties build on the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage held in Tunis in May 2016. The report is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1496>.

Other sources report that there is an increasing awareness at the level of the civil society and local authorities about the necessity to protect cultural heritage in Libya, including the properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. The meeting of the five-member Union of Libyan World Heritage Municipalities (Sabratha, March 2018) called for government measures to protect Libyan properties and stressed the need for coordination and coherence between the relevant authorities in this matter.

The continuous looting of Libyan cultural goods, especially from the Archaeological Site of Cyrene, is of great concern. It is therefore recommended that the Committee request the States Parties to the Convention to cooperate in the fight against illicit traffic and the protection of Libyan heritage.

It remains essential that the joint mission requested by the Committee at its 38th, 39th, 40th and 41st sessions (Doha, 2014; Bonn, 2015; Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016; Krakow, 2017) be sent to the property as soon as the security conditions permit. In the meantime, it is important that the State Party pursue its efforts to keep the World Heritage Centre updated on the situation on the ground, as well as on the further implementation of the measures it has launched, while addressing, to the extent possible, the comments and requests made by the Committee.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.22

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A,
2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.37** and **41 COM 8C.2** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Commends the State Party for the important efforts made to elaborate the strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, despite the prevailing unstable situation and difficult working conditions on the ground;
4. Notes with appreciation the issuing of a Municipal Resolution in 2017 to address urban encroachment at the property and requests the State Party to continue its efforts to eliminate encroachment;
5. Also commends the State Party for the important advances in the definition of the buffer zone of the property, and encourages it to pursue the finalization of the boundary clarification and the minor boundary modification in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
6. Also encourages the State Party to submit an International Assistance request to address the pressing conservation and management issues, lack of funds and inadequate human resources that the property is currently facing;
7. Reiterates its request to the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre regularly informed of the evolution of the situation at the property and of any new measures undertaken to ensure its protection and conservation, and to continue to provide detailed information on the works carried out, including technical explanations justifying the interventions;
8. Also reiterates its request to the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, as soon as the security conditions permit;
9. Calls for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide more financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, to implement the short and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage (Tunis, May 2016);
10. Launches an appeal to all Member States of UNESCO to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural heritage coming from Libya, in engaging in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Heritage during times of Armed Conflict and the 1970 Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property, and further encourages the State Party to consider ratifying the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention on stolen or illegally exported cultural objects;
11. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the

implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;

12. **Decides to retain Archaeological Site of Cyrene (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

23. Archaeological Site of Leptis Magna (Libya) (C 183)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1982

Criteria (i)(ii)(iii)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2016-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified
Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures
Not yet established

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/183/documents/>

International Assistance
Requests approved: 3 (from 1988-1990)
Total amount approved: USD 45,500
For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/183/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds
European Project "Protection of Cultural Heritage and Diversity in Complex Emergencies for Peace and Stability" USD 24,543

Previous monitoring missions
1988: UNESCO mission; March 2003: World Heritage Centre mission; May 2006: World Heritage Centre mission; January 2007: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Flooding (issue resolved)
- Conflict situation

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/183/>

Current conservation issues

On 30 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/183/documents/>. Progress in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- The Department of Antiquities (DOA) reports the increased number of trained staff working at the property during the past two years have been able to undertake actions to reduce excessive vegetation growth and to address animal grazing, vandalism and inventorying of cultural objects. However, expert advice and more funding is needed to address the deterioration of the stone

masonry. The effects of sand covering certain areas of the property (Hunting Baths and the Harbour) cannot be properly addressed due to the lack of specialized machinery;

- The DOA considers that human activities have had a negative impact on the property, and more security measures and vigilance are required. Graffiti and fires are also difficult to control due to the large size of the property. The discharge of domestic wastewater on the Wadi Erassaf polluted the west end of Leptis Magna. This issue is nevertheless in the process of being addressed in cooperation with the local population;
- The DOA in coordination with the Tourist Police and representatives from the local community make regular visits to monitor the property and its setting. It is indicated that, despite the security and economic problems faced by the country since 2011,;
- The DOA reports that the property remains open to the public; however, the site museums are secured and remain closed, with collections stored in safer locations;
- Despite the difficulties faced, a map of the property showing the boundaries and the buffer zone has been submitted. The process of elaborating the map was based on a field survey, assessment work and satellite images;
- A strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, based on Presidential Decree No. 1355/2017, is currently being implemented by the Engineering Consulting Office of Utilities (ECOU) under the supervision of the DOA. Funds have been allocated for the elaboration of the studies and plans needed to implement the strategy, which is based on eight pillars: protection from human encroachment; protection from natural factors; tourism; attracting and developing human resources; strengthening infrastructure and environment; recording and monitoring archaeological sites; supporting the environment; and administration.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The information provided by the State Party demonstrates its commitment for the conservation of the Archaeological Site of Leptis Magna despite the prevailing conflict in the country. Despite the efforts in undertaking these actions, the lack of funding and human resources is preventing the State Party from carrying out major conservation works. Notwithstanding the increase in training staff and vigilance, the size of the property remains a challenge in terms of the DOA's capacity to prevent human-related threats.

The efforts made to elaborate the maps, including the boundaries and the buffer zone, are recognized as an indispensable step forward for the protection and management of the property. The ongoing close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS in this regard is highly appreciated. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to continue the close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS, and submit a Boundary Clarification followed by a Minor Boundary Modification, in line with Paragraph 164 of the *Operational Guidelines* for review by the Advisory Bodies.

Concerning the urban encroachment issue raised in the previous state of conservation report, which referenced satellite images taken in 2011 and 2016 showing 580 new constructions in Leptis Magna, the State Party contends that there are in fact no new constructions within the proposed boundaries of the property and 85 within the buffer zone. This discrepancy should be addressed in the context of the mapping of the boundaries and buffer zone that is currently underway. It is therefore recommended that finalizing this map be given priority by the State Party.

The current conditions related to the lack of funds and human resources is regrettable, as it prevents the State Party from ensuring the protection of the property and undertaking substantial conservation works. It is recommended that the Committee call for support from the international community in order to support the State Party in its conservation efforts.

It is also recommended that the important efforts made by the State Party for the elaboration of a strategy for the protection of Libyan World Heritage properties build on the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage held in Tunis in May 2016. The report is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1496>.

Other sources report that there is an increasing awareness at the level of the civil society and local authorities about the necessity to protect cultural heritage in Libya, including the properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. The meeting of the five-member Union of Libyan World Heritage Municipalities (Sabratha, March 2018) called for government measures to protect Libyan properties and stressed the need for coordination and coherence between the relevant authorities in this matter.

It remains essential that the joint mission requested by the Committee at its 40th and 41st sessions (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016; Krakow, 2017) be sent to the property as soon as the security conditions permit. In the meantime, it is important that the State Party pursue its efforts to keep the World Heritage Centre updated on the situation on the ground, as well as on the further implementation of the measures it has launched, while addressing, to the extent possible, the comments and requests made by the Committee.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.23

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.38** and **41 COM 8C.2** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Commends the State Party for the important efforts made to elaborate the strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, despite the prevailing unstable situation and difficult working conditions on the ground;
4. Notes with appreciation the activities undertaken by the State Party to address the conservation threats in the property despite the numerous difficulties faced;
5. Also commends the State Party for the important advances in the definition of the buffer zone of the property, and encourages it to pursue the finalization of the boundary clarification and the minor boundary modification in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre regularly informed of the evolution of the situation at the property and of any new measures undertaken to ensure its protection and conservation, and to continue to provide detailed information on the works carried out, including technical explanations justifying the interventions;
7. Also reiterates its request to the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, as soon as the security conditions permit;
8. Calls for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide more financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, to implement the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage (Tunis, May 2016);
9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
10. **Decides to retain Archaeological Site of Leptis Magna (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

24. Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Libya) (C 184)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1982

Criteria (iii)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2016-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified
Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures
Not yet established

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/184/documents/>

International Assistance
Requests approved: 0
Total amount approved: USD 0
For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/184/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds
European Project "Protection of Cultural Heritage and Diversity in Complex Emergencies for Peace and Stability" USD 25,000

Previous monitoring missions
March 2003: World Heritage Centre mission; January 2007: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/184/>

Current conservation issues

On 30 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/184/documents/>. Progress in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- Due to the armed conflict and as a result of the use of firearms within the property, the theatre façade and other architectural monuments were damaged and the roof of the storeroom collapsed in September 2017. Consequently, the Department of Antiquities (DOA) undertook maintenance and restoration works at the theatre. It is stated that full restorations works could easily be undertaken once funds are available;
- The property is being protected by the Tourist Police and the DOA, with the help of the local authorities and civil society organizations. The site museum remains closed and its collections have been documented and moved to safer locations;
- The DOA in collaboration with the local authorities is addressing urban encroachment within its boundaries in the southern and eastern areas of the property, where local residents claim ownership of the land;
- The DOA has undertaken actions to control the excessive vegetation growth and has carried out emergency conservation works on the mosaic floors. Nevertheless, it reports that the impact of



seawater, humidity and salt is causing erosion, fragmentation and cracking in the stone masonry, especially in areas close to the coast. Vegetation growth and vandalism have also caused damage to a number of structures and mosaic floors;

- Despite the difficulties faced, a map of the property showing the boundaries and the buffer zone has been submitted. The process of elaborating the map was based on a field survey, assessment work and satellite images;
- A strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, based on Presidential Decree No. 1355/2017, is currently being implemented by the Engineering Consulting Office of Utilities (ECOU) under the supervision of the DOA. Funds have been allocated for the elaboration of the studies and plans needed to implement the strategy, which is based on eight pillars: protection from human encroachment; protection from natural factors; tourism; attracting and developing human resources; strengthening infrastructure and environment; recording and monitoring archaeological sites; supporting the environment; and administration.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The information provided by the State Party demonstrates its commitment for the conservation of the Archaeological Site of Sabratha despite the prevailing conflict in the country and the lack of funds.

The efforts made to elaborate the maps, including the boundaries and the buffer zone, are recognized as an indispensable step forward for the protection and management of the property. The ongoing close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS in this regard is highly appreciated. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to continue the close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS, and submit a Boundary Clarification followed by a Minor Boundary Modification, in line with Paragraph 164 of the *Operational Guidelines* for review by the Advisory Bodies.

The damages incurred at the property due to the armed conflict, in conjunction with the difficulties to improve the situation and undertake appropriate protection and conservation measures, are of great concern. The property needs a comprehensive strategy for its management and conservation in order to better address the effects of the armed conflict, vandalism, urban encroachment, weathering (humidity, salt, sea water), and vegetation growth, among others. It is therefore recommended that the Committee call for the support of the international community for the conservation and protection of the property.

Concerning the urban encroachment issue raised in the previous state of conservation report, which referenced satellite images taken in 2012 and 2016 showing 620 new constructions in Sabratha, the State Party contends that there are in fact 2 new constructions within the proposed boundaries of the property and 31 within the buffer zone. This discrepancy should be addressed in the context of the State Party's current efforts to elaborate a map of the property's boundaries and buffer zone. It is therefore recommended that finalizing this map be given priority by the State Party.

It is also recommended that the important efforts made by the State Party for the elaboration of a strategy for the protection of Libyan World Heritage properties build on the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage, held in Tunis in May 2016. The report is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1496>.

Other sources report that there is an increasing awareness at the level of the civil society and the local authorities about the necessity to protect cultural heritage in Libya, including the properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. The meeting of the five-member Union of Libyan World Heritage Municipalities (Sabratha, March 2018) called for government measures to protect Libyan properties and stressed the need for coordination and coherence between the relevant authorities in this matter.

It remains essential that the joint mission requested by the Committee at its 40th and 41st sessions (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016; Krakow, 2017) be sent to the property as soon as the security conditions permit. In the meantime, it is important that the State Party pursue its efforts to keep the World Heritage Centre updated on the situation on the ground, as well as on the further implementation of the measures it has launched, while addressing, to the extent possible, the comments and requests made by the Committee.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.24

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.39** and **41 COM 8C.2** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Commends the State Party for the important efforts made to elaborate the strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, despite the prevailing unstable situation and difficult working conditions on the ground;
4. Expresses great concern over the damages incurred at the property due to the armed conflict, in particular to the theatre, urban encroachment, vandalism and weathering, in conjunction with the technical and financial difficulties to undertake appropriate protection and conservation measures;
5. Notes with appreciation the activities undertaken by the State Party to address the conservation threats in the property despite the numerous difficulties faced;
6. Also commends the State Party for the important advances in the definition of the buffer zone of the property, and encourages it to pursue the finalization of the boundary clarification and the minor boundary modification in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
7. Reiterates its request to the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre regularly informed of the evolution of the situation at the property and of any new measures undertaken to ensure its protection and conservation, and to continue to provide detailed information on the works carried out, including technical explanations justifying the interventions;
8. Also reiterates its request to the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, as soon as the security conditions permit;
9. Calls for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide more financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, to implement the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage (Tunis, May 2016);
10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
11. **Decides to retain Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

25. Old Town of Ghadamès (Libya) (C 362)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1986

Criteria (v)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2016-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified
Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures
Not yet established

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/362/documents/>

International Assistance
Requests approved: 0
Total amount approved: USD 0
For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/362/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds
N/A

Previous monitoring missions
January 1998: UNESCO mission; March 2003: World Heritage Centre mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports
• Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/362/>

Current conservation issues

On 30 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/362/documents/>. Progress in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- The Department of Antiquities (DOA) reports that, owing to the fragile earthen construction materials in the property, eleven locations were damaged because of the heavy rain that fell during December 2017. The damage caused the collapse of walls, roofs, and in some cases entire houses, while other houses are threatened by collapse due to a “domino” effect. The town as a whole was affected, including streets and public facilities. It is expected that during summer months the rise in temperature will cause walls that had been saturated by rain to fragment and collapse. The DOA undertook a general assessment of the town and reported that the general conditions of houses, alleys and public facilities are good;
- According to the DOA, the last conservation works carried out in the property date from 2013 and were undertaken by the local community, but lacked sufficient drainage systems. The interventions resulted in walls and roofs collapsing from excessive rainfall. The local authorities estimate the funds needed for urgent maintenance and conservation interventions at 750,000 euros, which these authorities are urgently trying to secure;
- The Old Town general plan (2014 to 2016) listed priority buildings that needed maintenance and conservation actions. Due to the lack of funds, however, not all works could be undertaken;



- According to the DOA, there is no damage resulting from human activity: the house owners within the property are aware of its historical and cultural importance and contribute to its conservation. Awareness-raising campaigns are planned for house owners in the property, in addition to routine checks to monitor the state of conservation of the houses;
- The DOA considers that, in addition to its efforts and to those of the local authorities and communities, there is a need for support and funding in order to create an ongoing maintenance and conservation strategy. Research related to the buildings is also required;
- Despite the difficulties faced, a map of the property showing the boundaries and the buffer zone has been submitted. The process of elaborating the map was based on field surveys, satellite images and assessment work carried out in consultation with the local communities;
- A strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, based on Presidential Decree No. 1355/2017, is currently being implemented by the Engineering Consulting Office of Utilities (ECOU) under the supervision of the DOA. Funds have been allocated for the elaboration of the studies and plans needed to implement the strategy, which is based on eight pillars: protection from human encroachment; protection from natural factors; tourism; attracting and developing human resources; strengthening infrastructure and environment; recording and monitoring archaeological sites; supporting the environment; and administration.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The information provided by the State Party demonstrates its commitment for the conservation of the property despite the prevailing conflict in the country, and constitutes progress in the analysis of the situation at the property. Despite this commitment, there is a need for planned and comprehensive conservation and restoration actions to ensure the property's integrity and authenticity.

The current conditions related to the lack of funds and human resources is regrettable, as it prevents the State Party from undertaking continued conservation actions. It should be recalled that the Old Town of Ghadames was inhabited when it was inscribed on the World Heritage list, but is not inhabited today. This fact hinders the day-to-day maintenance and conservation of the property. It is recommended that the Committee request the international community to support the State Party's efforts to undertake the necessary management and conservation plans and measures for the property, and to envisage a mid- and long-term strategy to see the property inhabited once again.

The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies welcome the commitment and interest of the local communities and owners in maintaining and conserving the property. It is recommended that the Committee encourage the local communities and owners in the property to continue their efforts to maintain its Outstanding Universal Value.

The efforts made to elaborate the maps, including the boundaries and the buffer zone, are recognized as an indispensable step forward for the protection and management of the property. The ongoing close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS in this regard is highly appreciated. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to continue the close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS, and submit a Boundary Clarification followed by a Minor Boundary Modification, in line with Paragraph 164 of the *Operational Guidelines* for review by the Advisory Bodies.

It is also recommended that the important efforts made by the State Party for the elaboration of a strategy for the protection of Libyan World Heritage properties build on the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage held in Tunis in May 2016. The report is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1496>.

Other sources report that there is an increasing awareness at the level of the civil society and local authorities about the necessity to protect cultural heritage in Libya, including the properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. The meeting of the five-member Union of Libyan World Heritage Municipalities (Sabratha, March 2018) called for government measures to protect Libyan properties and stressed the need for coordination and coherence between the relevant authorities in this matter.

It remains essential that the joint mission requested by the Committee at its 40th and 41st sessions (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016; Krakow, 2017) be sent to the property as soon as the security conditions permit. In the meantime, it is important that the State Party pursue its efforts to keep the World Heritage Centre updated on the situation on the ground, as well as on the further implementation of the measures it has launched, while addressing, to the extent possible, the comments and requests made by the Committee.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.25

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.40** and **41 COM 8C.2** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Commends the State Party for the important efforts made to elaborate the strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, despite the prevailing unstable situation and difficult working conditions on the ground;
4. Notes with appreciation the commitment and efforts of the Department of Antiquities (DOA) and the local authorities in undertaking maintenance and conservation measures at the property, and the engagement of the local communities in contributing to maintaining the property's Outstanding Universal Value;
5. Also commends the State Party for the important advances in the definition of the buffer zone of the property, and encourages it to pursue the finalization of the boundary clarification and the minor boundary modification in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre regularly informed of the evolution of the situation at the property and of any new measures undertaken to ensure its protection and conservation, and to continue to provide detailed information on the works carried out, including technical explanations justifying the interventions;
7. Also reiterates its request to the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, as soon as the security conditions permit;
8. Calls for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide more financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, to implement the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage (Tunis, May 2016), and in particular the urgent maintenance and conservation measures following heavy rain that damaged the property;
9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
10. **Decides to retain Old Town of Ghadamès (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

26. Rock-Art Sites of Tadrart Acacus (Libya) (C 287)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1985

Criteria (iii)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2016-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified
Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures
Not yet established

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/287/documents/>

International Assistance
Requests approved: 0
Total amount approved: USD 0
For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/287/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds
N/A

Previous monitoring missions
January 2011: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Vandalism
- Deliberate destruction of heritage
- Human resources
- Conflict situation prevailing in the country
- Illegal activities

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/287/>

Current conservation issues

On 30 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/287/documents/>. Progress in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- The Department of Antiquities (DOA) has undertaken monitoring activities on the state of conservation of the property, restored protection fences and established and maintained contact with active civil society organizations;
- The main threats to the property are related to uncontrolled human activities and environmental threats. Water flow, humidity and salt affect the microclimate in the caves, causing erosion and pigment loss, but the major damage is caused by graffiti, vandalism, looting and theft. The lack of effective management, inadequate security conditions, difficult access and the large size of the property have resulted in 95 percent of the paintings being damaged in some areas. In addition, entire fragments of rock art have been cut from the rock and looted;
- Despite the difficulties faced, a map of the property showing the boundaries and the buffer zone has been submitted. The process of elaborating the map was based on satellite images and field assessment work;



- Based on studies made by the Sapienza University in Rome, the DOA is considering declaring the area an archaeological natural reserve in order to improve its protection. The DOA intends to coordinate with the Libyan-Italian mission in Acacus to define the steps necessary for the protection of the property;
- A strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, based on Presidential Decree No. 1355/2017, is currently being implemented by the Engineering Consulting Office of Utilities (ECOU) under the supervision of the DOA. Funds have been allocated for the elaboration of the studies and plans needed to implement the strategy, which is based on eight pillars: protection from human encroachment; protection from natural factors; tourism; attracting and developing human resources; strengthening infrastructure and environment; recording and monitoring archaeological sites; supporting the environment; and administration.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The information provided by the State Party demonstrates its commitment for the conservation of the Rock-Art Sites of Tadrart Acacus, despite the prevailing conflict in the country. Notwithstanding its efforts, the lack of effective management, the security conditions and the size of the property remain challenges in terms of vigilance to prevent vandalism and thus ensure the state of conservation of the property and its Outstanding Universal Value.

The current state of conservation of the property, especially the widespread damage caused by graffiti and the looting of cultural goods, is of great concern. It is recommended that the Committee request the States Parties to the World Heritage Convention to support the Libyan authorities by providing funds and specialized assistance to undertake urgent conservation activities, and to cooperate in the fight against illicit trafficking and the protection of Libyan cultural heritage.

The efforts made, despite the difficult situation, to elaborate maps showing the boundaries and the buffer zone are recognized as an indispensable step forward for the protection and management of the property. The ongoing close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS in this regard is highly appreciated. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to continue the close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS, and submit a Boundary Clarification followed by a Minor Boundary Modification, in line with Paragraph 164 of the *Operational Guidelines* for review by the Advisory Bodies.

It is also recommended that the important efforts made by the State Party for the elaboration of a strategy for the protection of Libyan World Heritage properties build on the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage, held in Tunis in May 2016. The report is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1496>.

Other sources report that there is an increasing awareness at the level of the civil society and local authorities about the necessity to protect cultural heritage in Libya, including the properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. The meeting of the five-member Union of Libyan World Heritage Municipalities (Sabratha, March 2018) called for government measures to protect Libyan properties and stressed the need for coordination and coherence between the relevant authorities in this matter.

The prevailing situation continues to raise high concern, as it prevents the State Party from undertaking substantial actions to ensure the protection and conservation of the property. It remains essential that the joint mission requested by the Committee at its 40th and 41st sessions (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016; Krakow, 2017) be sent to the property as soon as the security conditions permit. In the meantime, it is important that the State Party pursue its efforts to keep the World Heritage Centre updated on the situation on the ground, as well as on the further implementation of the measures it has launched, while addressing, to the extent possible, the comments and requests made by the Committee.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.26

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decisions 41 COM 7A.41 and 41 COM 8C.2 adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*

3. Commends the State Party for the important efforts made to elaborate the strategy to protect Libyan World Heritage properties, despite the prevailing unstable situation and difficult working conditions on the ground;
4. Notes the activities undertaken by the State Party to address the conservation threats in the property despite the numerous difficulties faced, and requests it to continue its efforts in this regard;
5. Expresses deep concern over the increase in vandalism at the property and the looting of entire fragments of rock art;
6. Also commends the State Party for the important advances in the definition of the buffer zone of the property, and encourages it to pursue the finalization of the boundary clarification and the minor boundary modification in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
7. Reiterates its request to the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre regularly informed of the evolution of the situation at the property and of any new measures undertaken to ensure its protection and conservation, and to continue to provide detailed information on the works carried out, including technical explanations justifying the interventions;
8. Also reiterates its request to the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, as soon as the security conditions permit;
9. Calls for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide more financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, to implement the short- and medium-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage (Tunis, May 2016);
10. Launches an appeal to all Member States of UNESCO to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural heritage coming from Libya in engaging in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Heritage during times of Armed Conflict and the 1970 Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property, and also encourages the State Party to consider ratifying the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention on stolen or illegally exported cultural objects;
11. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
12. Decides to retain Rock-Art Sites of Tadrart Acacus (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

27. Birthplace of Jesus: Church of the Nativity and the Pilgrimage Route, Bethlehem (Palestine) (C 1433)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2012

Criteria (iv)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2012-present



Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Degradation of the architectural complex of the Church of the Nativity
- Development pressure
- Tourism pressure

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/6244>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/6244>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

To be submitted according to <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/6244>

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1433/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 1 (from 2014-2016)

Total amount approved: USD 30,000

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1433/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 723,000 from Italy (Emergency Action Plan 1997-1998; Conservation and Management Plan 2006-2010); USD 205,000 from the Government of Sweden for building rehabilitation.

Previous monitoring missions

N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Degradation of the architectural complex of the Church of the Nativity
- Development pressure
- Tourism pressure
- Housing
- Impacts of tourism / visitor / recreation
- Management activities
- Management systems/ management plan
- Water (rain/water table)

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1433/>

Current conservation issues

In January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1433/documents> and which notes progress with corrective measures towards the achievement of the Desired state of conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and responds to decisions of the Committee as follows:

- Repair of the roof trusses and the replacement of the roof coverings and rainwater goods of the Church of the Nativity were completed in April 2016. Further completed works include restoration and consolidation of the narthex cross vaults and the narthex eastern wooden door, restoration

of all external stone facades, consolidation of internal wall plastering, wall mosaics, metal doors, and wooden architraves, and installation of the lighting and smoke detection system. Future works include restoration of an additional nineteen columns in the central nave, expected to be completed during 2018, as well as conservation of a mosaic, paintings and stone floors, subject to available funding;

- As requested by the Committee (Decision **41 COM 7A.42**), the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, Bethlehem Municipality, The Presidential Committee for the Restoration of the Church of the Nativity and the Centre for Cultural Heritage Preservation have focused efforts to complete the draft Conservation Management Plan (CMP) for the property, which was submitted in February 2018 to the World Heritage Centre for review;
- Progress has been made in finalizing designs and traffic management arrangements to facilitate revival of Star Street and branches, by attracting the inhabitants and the shop owners to reopen and activate abandoned properties;
- The 'Manger Square Tunnel' project has been postponed pending completion of the second phase of the 'Transport and Mobility Master Plan for the Bethlehem Governorate', expected in 2019. The 'Manger Square Village' has been cancelled owing to its potential adverse impact on the property's authenticity and integrity;

The State Party considers that the four agreed corrective measures have been completed and that the property has achieved the DSCOR, and requests that the property be removed from the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The conservation work at the Church of the Nativity and of the narthex is of a high technical standard, but details of the completed works to mosaics, plaster, architraves, and stone pillars, and proposed future works, should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre.

The need remains for a single synthetic document summarising analysis of the historical research and physical evidence revealed during conservation work, and the conclusions reached regarding the dates of particular building components, the justifications for the decisions made, and the precise work undertaken to minimize interventions to the historic fabric, especially the very earliest fabric. In view of the importance of the Church in relation to the early history of Christianity, a clear understanding of how its fabric relates to this history, and especially which parts are from the 6th century and which reflect later alterations, is crucial.

The integrated CMP submitted by the State Party has been reviewed by ICOMOS and is considered to be well organized and to demonstrate commitment to conservation of the property. However, some revisions and additions are required before the CMP can be finalized, including analysis of all values and attributes of OUV, planned projects and provisions for disaster risk management, in particular risks related to fire.

The proposed revival of Star Street and its branches is welcome, and it would be appropriate for information about this programme to be submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies. The postponement of the Manger Square Tunnel and cancellation of the Manger Square Village project are welcome, given their potential impact on the property's OUV. Should the Manger Square Tunnel project be re-activated, it would require further justification in relation to traffic management and urban mobility, as well as independent Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) coupled with thorough archaeological investigations.

The DSOCR is close to being achieved, as the roof of the Church of the Nativity has been conserved, and the corrective measures are nearly fully complete. However, the CMP should be completely finalized before the property is considered for removal from the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.27

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decision 41 COM 7A.42, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*

3. Commends the State Party on the implementation of high-standard conservation works which have occurred at the Church of the Nativity;
4. Requests the State Party to submit details of the completed works to mosaics, plaster, architraves, and stone pillars, and proposed future works, including works to a sub-floor mosaic, paintings and stone floors, as well as proposals for the revival of Star Street and its branches, to the World Heritage Centre;
5. Also reiterates its previous request to the State Party to submit a resume and analysis of all evidence revealed during the conservation work in order that there is a better understanding as to whether any material survives from the 6th century AD and, if not, to provide the dates of the surviving fabric;
6. Notes that the 'Manger Square Tunnel' project has been postponed and that the 'Manger Square Village' has been cancelled and, should the 'Manger Square Tunnel' project proceed and also requests the State Party to prepare an independent Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) and submit this to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, in line with the requirements of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before any irreversible commitments are made;
7. Commends the State Party for submitting the draft Conservation Management Plan (CMP) for the property in February 2018 and requests that it be revised in accordance with the comments and advice provided by ICOMOS, particularly to incorporate analysis of the values of the property, planned projects and provisions for disaster risk management in particular fire hazards;
8. Also notes that, following finalization of the CMP for the property, it would be appropriate to consider the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger;
9. Further requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
10. Decides to retain the **Birthplace of Jesus: Church of the Nativity and the Pilgrimage Route, Bethlehem (Palestine) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

28. Hebron/AI-Khalil Old Town (Palestine) (C 1565)

See Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add.2

29. Palestine: Land of Olives and Vines – Cultural Landscape of Southern Jerusalem, Battir (Palestine) (C 1492)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2014

Criteria (iv)(v)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2014-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Potential construction of a separation fence (wall)
- Abandonment of terraces and afforestation
- Impact of socio-cultural and geo-political transformations

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Adopted; see page <https://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/6245>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted; see page <https://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/6245>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Adopted; see page <https://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/6989>, but must be updated by the State Party

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1492/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 1 (from 2016-2016)

Total amount approved: USD 30,000

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1492/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

N/A

Previous monitoring missions

N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Potential construction of a separation fence (wall)
- Abandonment of terraces and afforestation
- Impact of socio-cultural and geo-political transformations
- Changes in traditional ways of life and knowledge system
- Identity, social cohesion, changes in local population and community
- Invasive/alien terrestrial species
- New constructions within the property's boundaries

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1492/>

Current conservation issues

In March 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1492/documents>. Progress in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- A draft comprehensive Management and Conservation Plan (MCP) prepared by the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities with the cooperation of key stakeholders was submitted to the World Heritage Centre in January 2018 and has been appended to the present state of conservation report. The final document is scheduled to be completed by the end of April 2018. It takes into account the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in danger (DSOCR) and the related corrective measures set out for the property. The State Party has committed to put an effective interim management system for the property in place until the MCP is established and operational;

- Due to the lack of funds and resources allocated to the property, the key stakeholders recommend keeping a 10-year timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures, rather than attempting an accelerated pace. This 10-year timeframe is integrated within the draft MCP's objectives, strategies, and Action Plan;
- The Battir municipality's strategic plan for 2018-2021 is being prepared in close collaboration with the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities to ensure its consistency with the MCP;
- In 2017, the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities and other key stakeholders implemented three projects aimed at addressing some of the corrective measures concerning the rehabilitation of agricultural drystone walls and irrigation canals, the reclamation and repair of agricultural land, and the enhancement of the local socio-economic situation as well as public awareness. About a dozen other rehabilitation and community projects undertaken by various individuals and agencies in 2017 are also highlighted;
- The State Party considers that the Israeli High Court's January 2015 dismissal of the case for the construction of a "wall" in or around the Battir site does not yet represent a binding decision stipulating that no wall shall ever be constructed in or around the site, and additionally that construction of settlements on surrounding hills is negatively affecting the visual and ecological quality of the landscape;
- The project to protect water quality by means of a proposed environmental sewage system is still unfunded.

The State Party requests that the property be retained on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The State Party continues to make efforts on a number of fronts to improve the state of conservation of the property. The draft MCP, which, thanks to the efforts of its authors, is at an advanced stage of development should be noted. A preliminary analysis by ICOMOS (with detailed recommendations forthcoming) includes advice that should further improve the MCP: the structure of the document should be clarified; the key components should be linked together more clearly, such as the significance, the attributes, the objectives, and the measures for improving the property; the legal and institutional framework section should be more informative; the Action Plan should set out priorities and discuss funding, particularly when related to achieving the DSOCR; and a risk-management strategy should be integrated into the MCP. It is recommended that the Committee encourage the State Party to complete and implement the MCP, taking into account the preliminary analysis and forthcoming detailed recommendations by ICOMOS.

Some progress has also been made in achieving the DSOCR:

- *Dismissal of plans to build a "Wall" along the property, or within its setting:* This element of the DSOCR being essentially beyond the State Party's control is noted;
- *Adequate conservation in place of the agricultural terraces and their associated components, including watchtowers and drystone walls throughout the property:* The initial progress reported by the State Party on the rehabilitation of agricultural drystone walls and the reclamation and repair of agricultural land is welcomed;
- *Adequate restoration in place of the irrigation system and the development of an adequate sewage system to protect water quality in the property:* The progress reported by the State Party on the rehabilitation of irrigation canals is also welcomed, but the lack of progress on a sewage system, mainly due to lack of funds, remains of concern;
- *Protection in place for the property and its buffer zone:* The drafting of a new law for the Protection and Conservation of Tangible Cultural Heritage Resources, which is considered for ratification, is noted;
- *Management plan and monitoring systems adopted and sustainable management system in place:* The completion of a draft MCP, which includes references to a sustainable management structure and a chapter on implementation and monitoring, is also noted.

The State Party is actively working on the implementation of corrective measures adopted in 2015 to achieve the DSOCR; progress needs to be made to put in place an adequate sewage system (measure iv).

It is recommended that the Committee urge the State Party to continue its efforts to implement the key corrective measures, with additional attention paid to allocate adequate funds to repair the sewage system that has thus far witnessed no progress since 2015.

Finally, it is recommended that the Committee invite the State Party to inform it, through the World Heritage Centre, of any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the OUV of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse.

Considering the above-mentioned information, it is recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.29

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.43** and **41 COM 8C.2** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Acknowledges the efforts made by the State Party to improve the state of conservation of the property;*
4. *Notes that the State Party has achieved good progress in preparing the comprehensive Management and Conservation Plan (MCP) for the property and encourages it to complete and implement the MCP, taking into account the preliminary analysis by ICOMOS and its forthcoming detailed recommendations;*
5. *Welcoming the efforts being made by the State Party to implement the corrective measures to achieve the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), urges the State Party to pay additional attention to measure (iv) through allocating funds to put in place an adequate sewage system, which has thus far witnessed no progress;*
6. *Invites the State Party to inform it, through the World Heritage Centre, of any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse;*
7. *Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;*
8. ***Decides to retain Palestine: Land of Olives and Vines – Cultural Landscape of Southern Jerusalem, Battir (Palestine) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.***

Note : the following reports on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic need to be read in conjunction with Item 36 below.

30. Ancient City of Aleppo (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 21)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1986

Criteria (iii)(iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2013-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Destruction as well as ascertained and potential threats consequent to the armed conflict in Syria started in March 2011

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/21/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 2 (from 1986-2001)

Total amount approved: USD 5,250

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/21/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount provided: USD 95,255 by the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund

Total amount provided to the six Syrian World Heritage properties for World Heritage, movable and intangible heritage: 2.46 million Euros by the European Union, USD 170,000 by the Flemish Government, 63,000 Euros by the Austrian Government, USD 200,000 by the German Government ; for cultural heritage under conflict: USD 200,000 by the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage in Bahrain

Previous monitoring missions

January 2017: UNESCO Rapid Assessment mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

Before the conflict:

- Lack of definition of the limits of the property and of the buffer zone
- Lack of conservation and/or management plans
- Inappropriate restoration works
- Urban encroachment

Since 2013:

- Destruction and damage due to the armed conflict

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/21/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report for the six Syrian World Heritage properties, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/21/documents/>, refers to the activities reported upon last year and includes updated information, progress and difficulties in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee, as follows:

- The inhabitants returning to Aleppo started restoring and reconstructing houses and shops. Since the traditional construction materials are scarce and expensive, available materials are being used, which leads to breaches deteriorating the urban fabric. The Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) is unable to control all restorations works due to the lack of local staff and the difficult coordination with other stakeholders;
- A National Steering Committee for the Restoration of the Ancient City of Aleppo headed by the Ministry of Culture and represented by the DGAM, has been established. It is composed of the Ministry of Public Works, the Ministry of Housing, the Ministry of Tourism, experts in the field of archeology and restoration, the Aga Khan Trust for Culture (AKTC), the Syrian Trust for Development and representatives from the local communities; it meets periodically to assess progress and new developments. At its first meeting on 30 July 2017, this committee discussed logistical and financial details related to restoration works and identified priorities and needs;
- Nine staff members from the DGAM Aleppo Branch coordinated with the City Council of Aleppo, the Directorate of Religious Endowments and the Directorate of Tourism for the Aleppo province a detailed damages assessment and oversaw the sorting and safeguarding of historic and archaeological debris. In this framework, the DGAM assessed 170 historic buildings within the property, and categorized damages in five levels, ranking from completely destroyed (8.8%), to mostly destroyed (24.1%), to heavily damaged (34.7%), to lightly damaged (26.5%), to good condition (5.9%);
- A first Aid support meeting was organized by UNESCO on traditional materials and techniques in Aleppo (Aleppo, August 2017);
- A “A Vocational Training Workshop in Stone Masonry Carving/Cutting” was organized by UNESCO in collaboration with the AKTC (Aleppo, September 2017 to April 2018); it provided practical training and theory to 30 builders and stonemasons in view of involving them in future restoration works;
- The DGAM carried out the emergency consolidation of the stair-step bridge leading to the main gate of the Citadel;
- The DGAM, in collaboration with AKTC is planning to carry out the restoration of Suq al-Saqatiyya, located on the main axis between Bab Antakya and Suq al-Zarb. In view of developing the required studies and plans for the restoration project, the area was cleaned, a detailed survey carried out using advanced technology and 3D photogrammetry, and infrastructure plans gathered;
- The DGAM is preparing a minor boundary modification for the property to be adopted by relevant stakeholders prior to its submission to the World Heritage Centre and reports progress in the development of the Master Plan that will be discussed with stakeholders and UNESCO during the next months.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

See General Decision **42 COM 36** of this Document on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic.

The UNESCO Beirut Office reported daily collapses of stones and structures due to the lack of emergency consolidation measures and reported additional information related to restoration works:

- The shop and house owners that started to come back are getting restoration permits from the Municipality (Directorate of the Old City) according to the building code of the Old City;
- Local authorities started to restore the Great Umayyad Mosque thanks to a USD 16 million funding;
- The State Party is pursuing efforts to rehabilitate several schools in the Ancient City;
- The Ministry of Awqaf (endowments) is restoring some religious buildings (churches and mosques), with the support of local and international donors;

- Conservation and restoration works are carried out at Bab al-Faraj Clock Tower, at the initiative of local NGOs, including some archaeological excavations around the site;
- Work continues for the opening of secondary streets and the market area while debris management is being carried out;
- Tourism services are being rehabilitated in the surroundings of the Citadel;
- The local authority has carried out cultural activities in the Citadel;

In addition to the activities reported last year, UNESCO carried out the following:

- The documentation and structural analysis of Beit Ghazaleh and Beit Ajiqbash (Museum of Folks Arts), with the support of a team specialized 3D scanning technologies,
- A publication on traditional metal crafts and the preparation of another publication on stone masonry in Aleppo,
- A publication on damage assessment in the Ancient City of Aleppo, jointly prepared with UNITAR/UNOSAT.

Considering all of the above information, the property faces the following key challenges

- The lack of an agreed work plan that embodies a vision and identifies priorities, tools, and adequate human and financial resources;
- The absence of an emergency intervention plan to prevent further damages to historical buildings;
- The instability of the security situation in Syria in general and in the western and northern suburbs of Aleppo in particular;
- The lack of a documentation database required for the development of work plans;
- The lack of an effective coordination mechanism between parties involved in the recovery of the city.

The lack of strategic planning and risk management at the property, and the generalization of *ad-hoc* decision making in relation with restoration works, raise great concern.

It is recommended that the State Party continue assessing and documenting damages and that a recovery approach and strategy be adopted in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before any restoration works are undertaken at the property, and that the Committee call on the State Party to implement the actions agreed upon during the 2017 technical coordination meeting.

It is also recommended that the Committee encourage the State Party to finalize and submit to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies the minor boundary modification proposal for the property that is being prepared to enhance the protection of the property and preserves it from extensive private developments in its setting. .

Finally, it is urgent that the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property be carried out, as soon as the situation allows.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.30

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.44** and **41 COM 7A.50**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Taking into account Decision **42 COM 7A.36** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,*

4. Expresses its great concern at the impact of the armed conflict and resulting humanitarian crisis and irreversible destruction within the property, including of whole neighborhoods;
5. Recalls its request that humanitarian and security actions be done in coordination with cultural heritage stakeholders, to avoid further irreversible damages to the property, and allow for undertaking of first aid measures on its cultural heritage;
6. Reiterates its deep concern about the instability of buildings within the property and urges the State Party to undertake a detailed risk assessment and emergency consolidation works for the concerned structures in order to guarantee the safety of the inhabitants;
7. Notes the efforts mobilized by the State Party for the recovery of Aleppo since December 2016 and encourages it to continue its efforts in documenting and assessing damages and carrying out emergency interventions, despite the extremely difficult situation;
8. Also encourages the State Party to implement the actions agreed upon at the technical coordination meeting organized by UNESCO in March 2017, and to allow sufficient time for the development of integrated strategic plans for the rehabilitation and revitalization of the property in its broader urban context, in line with the Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (UNESCO, 2011) and in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
9. Calls on all UNESCO Member States to support emergency safeguarding measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
10. Requests that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission be carried to proceed to a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property and identify measures needed to reverse the decay and ensure the conservation and protection of the property, as soon as the security situation allows;
11. Further encourages the State Party to finalize the minor boundary modification proposal for the property and to submit it to the World Heritage Centre by **1 February 2019**, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
12. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
13. **Decides to retain the Ancient City of Aleppo (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

31. Ancient City of Bosra (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 22bis)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1980

Criteria (i)(iii)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2013-present



Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Destruction as well as ascertained and potential threats consequent to the armed conflict in Syria started in March 2011

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified;

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/22/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 3 (from 1995-2001)

Total amount approved: USD 51,250

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/22/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount provided to the six Syrian World Heritage properties for World Heritage, movable and intangible heritage: 2.46 million Euros by the European Union, USD 170,000 by the Flemish Government, 63,000 Euros by the Austrian Government, USD 200,000 by the German Government ; for cultural heritage under conflict: USD 200,000 by the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage in Bahrain

Previous monitoring missions

Since the start of the conflict in March 2011, the security situation has not allowed any missions to be undertaken at this World Heritage property

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

Since March 2011:

- Damage of historic buildings due to the conflict
- Illegal constructions following the start of the conflict

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/22/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report for the six Syrian World Heritage properties, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/22/documents>.

The report submitted by the State Party indicates that no damage was recorded this year and no new information was provided. The webpage of the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) indicates that four looters died while conducting illegal excavations at the Palace of Saint Sergios located at the East of the Basilica of the martyrs Sergios, Bacchos and Leontios, due to the collapse of stones inside the Palace.

Reliable scientific sources informed UNESCO that restoration works have been carried out at the western wall of al-Omari Mosque and on the eastern façade of the Koranic school annexed to al-Mabrak Mosque, where basalt stones impacted by shelling have been replaced by similar ones. They also indicated that at the end of 2016, the Bosra Department of Antiquities rehabilitated the storage rooms

of the French archaeological mission located within the South Tower of the Theatre, by sorting out and protecting the contents of 400 vandalized crates of archeological material.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

See General decision **42 COM 36** of this Document on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic.

The lack of access to the property does not allow a full understanding of the damage incurred, nor an assessment of the restoration works carried out. It is recommended that the Committee express its concern about the situation at the property and the threats that it faces from the armed conflict, and acknowledge the efforts of the local communities to monitor and protect the property despite very difficult circumstances.

It is recommended that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property be carried out to examine the state of conservation of the property, as soon as the situation allows.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.31

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.45**, **41 COM 7A.50** and **41 COM 8B.39**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Taking into account Decision **42 COM 7A.36** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,
4. Expresses its concern about the situation at the property and the lack of detailed information on damages and restoration works undertaken;
5. Acknowledges the efforts of the local communities to monitor and protect the property despite very difficult circumstances;
6. Calls on all UNESCO Member States to support emergency safeguarding measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
7. Requests that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission be carried out to proceed to a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property and identify measures needed to reverse the decay and ensure the conservation and protection of the property, as soon as the security situation allows;
8. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
9. Decides to retain the Ancient City of Bosra (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

32. Ancient City of Damascus (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 20bis)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1979

Criteria (i)(ii)(iii)(iv)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2013-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Destruction as well as ascertained and potential threats consequent to the armed conflict in Syria started in March 2011

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/20/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 6 (from 1981-2001)

Total amount approved: USD 156,050

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/20/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted to the property: USD 10,000 from the Italian Funds-in-Trust.

Total amount provided to the six Syrian World Heritage properties for World Heritage, movable and intangible heritage: 2.46 million Euros by the European Union, USD 170,000 by the Flemish Government, 63,000 Euros by the Austrian Government, USD 200,000 by the German Government ; for cultural heritage under conflict: USD 200,000 by the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage in Bahrain

Previous monitoring missions

March and December 2007: World Heritage Centre missions for the King Faisal Street project; April 2008: Joint World Heritage Centre / ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission. April 2016: World Heritage Centre Rapid Assessment mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

Before the conflict:

- Poor state of conservation
- Inappropriate restoration techniques
- Lack of a buffer zone
- Lack of a management plan
- Development projects threatening the significant historic fabric

Since March 2011:

- Damage due to the armed conflict
- Fire due to an electrical incident at al-Asrooniya and elsewhere in the property

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/20/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report for the six Syrian World Heritage properties, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/20/documents> and includes

updated information, progress and difficulties in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee, as follows:

- In addition to the fires reported in 2017, several fires broke within the property and its buffer zone between July and November 2017. Within the property, several traditional houses have been severely damaged by fire in al-Amara neighborhood (1 October and 16 November 2017) and by an explosion in Mazanet al-Shahm neighborhood (11 October 2017). In the buffer zone, several shops were severely damaged by fire at Bab al-Jabiyah Suq (27 July 2017), on King Faisal street between Saroujah Suq and al-Manakhilah Suq (10 September 2017), and at Saroujah Suq (12 September 2017);
- The damage assessment has been carried out in collaboration with the Damascus Governorate and the owners; despite the intention to preserve the historic and traditional urban fabric, the construction techniques and materials used to rebuild the shops are not those historically used in the property because of their lack of availability;
- The Directorate of the Old City (Damascus Governorate) continues implementing an underground electric network;
- Following the fire that erupted in al-Asrooniyah neighborhood in April 2016, and in line with the recommendations of the UNESCO Technical Assistance Workshop organized in December 2016, the owners of the shops located in the 'Ottoman Bank' building decided to abandon the reconstruction scheme that was initially proposed and opted for a restoration project that respects the original structural design of the building. Consequently, it was decided to replace the pillars, all weakened by fire, by squared metal columns, similar to the original ones that will be able to withstand the weight of the roof;
- The Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) finalized the first phase of the Anqa project (a joint ICOMOS/CyArk initiative) by 3D modelling seven landmark monuments and a number of artifacts of the National Museum of Damascus.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

See General Decision **42 COM 36** of this Document on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic.

The damages regularly caused by fire in the property are of growing concern. It is crucial to analyze the reasons behind these fires and implement all necessary risk-prevention and mitigation measures outlined in the Emergency Response Plan of December 2013, as requested by the Committee since 2015. In terms of the response, it is also important that the main recommendations agreed upon during the 2016 UNESCO First Aid Support Meeting be implemented as requested by the Committee Decision **41 COM 7A.46**. In particular, the strict use of traditional construction techniques and materials is required for all restoration works to avoid the deterioration of the urban fabric and the gradual loss of its authenticity. Although restoration works at the shops were urgent, it is regrettable that the project was not submitted to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies, before any works were implemented, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

Finally, it becomes crucial to develop an integrated management plan for the property along with a database of documentation and archives to inform restoration decisions.

The State Party's decision to replace the initial restoration project for the Ottoman Bank in al-Asrooniya neighborhood with a revised one, in line with the recommendations of the 2016 UNESCO Technical Assistance Workshop is a welcomed decision. It is recommended that the Committee commend the State Party for this decision, request it to provide the detailed designs for the revised project, and encourage it to continue implementing all the recommendations of the Workshop.

It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to examine the restoration works that have been undertaken and the foreseen ones, and the management and risk prevention measures taken, as soon as the situation allows.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.32

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.46** and **41 COM 7A.50** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Taking into account Decision **42 COM 7A.36** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,
4. Expresses its great concern over the damage regularly caused by fire within the property and its buffer zone, and urges the State Party to analyze reasons behind fires, continue implementing all necessary risk-prevention and mitigation actions outlined in the Emergency Response Plan of December 2013, and to report back to the World Heritage Centre on the progress made thereon;
5. Regrets that the restoration works undertaken in the property and its buffer zone are not based on historical archives and documentation, and do not use traditional materials, thus impacting the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;
6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to:
 - a) Limit conservation or restoration works to first aid interventions until the security situation improves,
 - b) Take immediate action to save the remaining structures through adequate shoring and temporary consolidation measures,
 - c) Submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by ICOMOS, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, any reconstruction and restoration project within property, of all damaged structures, including the “Ottoman Bank”, prior to the commencement of any works,
 - d) Implement the recommendations of the 2016 UNESCO First Aid Support Meeting,
 - e) Develop an integrated management plan for the property along with a database of documentation and archives to inform restoration decisions;
7. Welcomes the State Party’s decision to revise the restoration project for the Ottoman Bank in al-Asrooniya neighborhood in line with the recommendations of the 2016 UNESCO Technical Assistance Workshop, further requests it to provide the detailed designs for the revised project, and encourages it to continue implementing all the recommendations of the workshop
8. Also urges all parties associated with the situation in Syria to refrain from any action that could cause further damage to the Ancient City of Damascus, including preventing the use of cultural property and prominent architectural elements for military purposes;
9. Calls on all UNESCO Member States to support emergency safeguarding measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
10. Requests that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission be carried to proceed to a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property and identify measures needed to reverse the decay and ensure the conservation and protection of the property, as soon as the security situation allows;

11. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
12. **Decides to retain the Ancient City of Damascus (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

33. Ancient villages of Northern Syria (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 1348)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2011

Criteria (iii)(iv)(v)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2013-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Destruction as well as ascertained and potential threats consequent to the armed conflict in Syria started in March 2011

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1348/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 1 (2007)

Total amount approved: USD 30,000

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1348/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount provided to the six Syrian World Heritage properties for World Heritage, movable and intangible heritage: 2.46 million Euros by the European Union, USD 170,000 by the Flemish Government, 63,000 Euros by the Austrian Government, USD 200,000 by the German Government ; for cultural heritage under conflict: USD 200,000 by the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage in Bahrain

Previous monitoring missions

Since the start of the conflict in March 2011, the security situation has not allowed any missions to be undertaken to this World Heritage property

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

Before the conflict:

- Protection Policy does not adequately integrate cultural landscapes
- Lack of human and financial resources
- Development or infrastructure projects that may affect the integrity of the property
- Management Plan still incomplete and lack of an Action Plan

Since March 2011:

- Destruction and damage due to the armed conflict

- Damage of historic buildings due to the use of ancient stones as building material
- Illegal constructions
- Use of the sites by internally displaced persons and by armed groups
- Quarrying

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1348/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report for the six Syrian World Heritage properties, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1348/documents>.

The State Party reports that the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) is still unable to access the site and mostly relies on the cooperation with the local communities and the DGAM teams in Aleppo for monitoring and protecting the property. It reports illegal constructions, illegal excavations, and the use of stones from the archaeological sites as building material in Jebel Zawiye at the villages of al-Bara, Mujleya, Bshilla, Ba'uda and Serjilla, and in Jebel Barisha at Baqirha. It also reports that, according to a video posted in the media, the Deir Sunbul Monastery in Jebel Barisha have been intentionally destroyed by extremist armed groups, adding up to the numerous intentional destructions in the area.

On the satellite image of Brad (Jebel Semaan) dating 17 and 22 March 2018, UNITAR/UNOSAT identified damage at the Monumental Tomb and adjacent building and several possible crater holes visible on the immediate vicinity of the Monumental Tomb area.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

See General Decision **42 COM 36** of this Document on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic.

The effects of the conflict on the property remain preoccupying; these include illegal excavations and the re-use of archaeological material for illegal constructions. Access to the serial site would enable a better understanding of the damage and the undertaking of first aid measures. In view of the escalation of the conflict in the area, it is recommended that the Committee express its deep concern about the situation at the property, call on all concerned parties to refrain from any action that could cause further damage to the property, including preventing using it for military purposes, and acknowledge the efforts of the local communities to monitor and protect the property despite the very difficult circumstances.

It is also recommended that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property be carried out to proceed to a comprehensive assessment of its state of conservation and identify measures needed to reverse the decay and ensure the conservation and protection of the property, as soon as the security situation allows.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.33

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decisions 41 COM 7A.47 and 41COM 7A.50, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Taking into account Decision 42 COM 7A.36 on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,*
4. *Expresses its concern about the situation at the property, in particular following the escalation of the conflict, and the lack of detailed information on damages;*
5. *Calls on all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any action that could cause further damage to the property, including preventing using it for military purposes;*

6. *Acknowledges the efforts of the local communities to monitor and protect the property despite the very difficult circumstances;*
7. *Calls on all UNESCO Member States to support emergency safeguarding measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;*
8. *Requests that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission be carried to proceed to a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property and identify measures needed to reverse the decay and ensure the conservation and protection of the property, as soon as the security situation allows;*
9. *Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;*
10. ***Decides to retain the Ancient Villages of Northern Syria (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.***

34. Crac des chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 1229)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2006

Criteria (ii)(iv)



Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2013-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Destruction as well as ascertained and potential threats consequent to the armed conflict in Syria started in March 2011

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1229/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 2 (from 1998-2003)

Total amount approved: USD 35,000

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1229/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount provided to the six Syrian World Heritage properties for World Heritage, movable and intangible heritage: 2.46 million Euros by the European Union, USD 170,000 by the Flemish Government, 63,000 Euros by the Austrian Government, USD 200,000 by the German Government ; for cultural heritage under conflict: USD 200,000 by the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage in Bahrain

Previous monitoring missions

Since the start of the conflict in March 2011, the security situation has not allowed any missions to be undertaken to this World Heritage property

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

Before the conflict:

- Lack of definition of the limits of the properties and of their buffer zones
- Lack of conservation and/or management plans
- Inappropriate restoration works
- Urban encroachment
- Exploitation of quarries within the perimeter of World Heritage properties

Since 2011:

- Destruction and damage due to the armed conflict

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1229/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report for the six Syrian World Heritage properties, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1229/documents>, and includes updated information, progress and difficulties in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee, as follows:

Restoration works and documentation have been carried out by the Syrian-Hungarian archaeological mission at the Chapel of the Crac des Chevaliers and adjacent courtyard. The mission removed the concrete layer on the roof, which allowed documenting stones, and replaced the isolation. It conducted studies for the roof drain water drain system of the Chapel as well as excavations for the draining system of the courtyard, and documented the frescos inside the Chapel. The report also indicates that consolidation and restoration works have started at the southwestern corner of Chapel.

On 27 March 2018, the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) submitted to the World Heritage Centre a preliminary project that foresees the implementation of tourism facilities and a cable car at Qal'at Salah El-Din.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

See General Decision **42 COM 36** of this Document on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic.

The works carried out at the Chapel are part of the 'Urgent restoration works of simple to medium complexity' recommended by the Committee (Decision **41 COM 7A.48**). These works are carried out despite the difficult situation, including reduced human and financial resources. On the images provided in the report, it is noticed that the stones used to build the parapet on the Chapel's roof in preparation of the isolation works are newly-cut stone blocks that are incompatible with the historic building. The State Party is encouraged to continue implementing the recommendations of the Technical Assistance Workshop organized by the World Heritage Centre, and in particular, to reuse the original stones as much as possible, and supplement them, as much as the current circumstances allow it, with identical newly- extracted one from the quarry of origin.

The detailed 3D modeling of the Crac des Chevaliers has been completed with the support of UNESCO.

The implementation of a cable car at the World Heritage site would represent a threat to the Outstanding Universal Value of the site. It is recommended that the Committee urge the State Party to abandon the project of a cable car, to limit interventions to emergency measures and urgent conservation activities until the situation improves and to submit to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies, a detailed project on the tourism facilities foreseen at the property accompanied by a Heritage Impact Assessment, before any work is implemented, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

It is recommended that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property be carried out to examine the restoration works that have been undertaken and the foreseen ones, as soon as the situation allows.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.34

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.48** and **41 COM 7A.50** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Taking into account Decision **42 COM 7A.36** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,
4. Takes note of the restoration works undertaken at the Chapel despite difficult conditions;
5. Encourages the State Party to continue implementing the recommendations of the Technical Assistance Workshop organized by the World Heritage Centre, and in particular, while undertaking urgent restoration works, to reuse as much as possible the original stones, and supplement them with identical newly- extracted ones from the quarry of origin, as much as the current circumstances allow it;
6. Urges the State Party to:
 - a) Abandon the project of a cable car at Qal'at Salah El-Din,
 - b) Limit interventions to emergency measures and urgent conservation activities until the situation improves,
 - c) Submit to the World Heritage Centre, for examination by the Advisory Bodies, a detailed project on the tourism facilities foreseen at the property accompanied by a Heritage Impact Assessment, before any work is implemented, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
7. Calls on all UNESCO Member States to support emergency safeguarding measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
8. Requests that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission be carried to proceed to a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property and identify measures needed to reverse the decay and ensure the conservation and protection of the property, as soon as the security situation allows;
9. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
10. Decides to retain **Crac des Chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din (Syrian Arab Republic)** on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

35. Site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 23bis)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1980

Criteria (i)(ii)(iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2013-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Destruction as well as ascertained and potential threats consequent to the armed conflict in Syria started in March 2011

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/23/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 5 (from 1989-2005)

Total amount approved: USD 81,250

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/23/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount provided: USD 100 000 by the Flemish Government, 18 560 USD from the UNESCO Emergency Fund

Total amount provided to the six Syrian World Heritage properties for World Heritage, movable and intangible heritage: 2.46 million Euros by the European Union, USD 170,000 by the Flemish Government, 63,000 Euros by the Austrian Government, USD 200,000 by the German Government ; for cultural heritage under conflict: USD 200,000 by the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage in Bahrain

Previous monitoring missions

April 2016: World Heritage Centre Rapid Assessment mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

Before the conflict:

- Serious weathering of many stone blocks due to capillary rising and variations in humidity and temperature
- Urban growth of the neighbouring agglomeration
- International tarmac road crosses the site
- Heavy automobile and truck traffic (vibrations, pollution, risk of accidents...)
- Pipeline crossing the southern necropolis
- Brightly-coloured antenna on hill
- Construction of an hotel close to the thermal springs
- Lack of a management plan

Since March 2011:

- Destruction, damage, illegal excavations, looting and military activities due to the armed conflict

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/23/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report for the six Syrian World Heritage properties, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/23/documents> and includes updated information, progress and difficulties in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee, as follows:

- The Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) undertook a mission to the property following its retaking for the second time on 2 March 2017. The mission assessed the destructions by extremist armed groups to the Tetrapylon and to the central part of the Theatre proscenium wall. The base of the Tetrapylon is still intact, as well as four columns but other parts are destroyed. The report underlines that both monuments had been previously restored. In particular, fifteen of the sixteen columns of the Tetrapylon are copies;
- The restoration of the statue of the Lion of Athena/Lion of Al-lāt, funded by UNESCO and carried out with the support of the Polish archaeological mission, is completed. The Statue has been installed outside at the southeastern corner of the National Museum of Damascus;
- The DGAM website indicates that the Russian Foundation for the Protection of the Cultural Heritage "Palmyra" and the DGAM signed a Memorandum of Understanding that aims at providing the necessary support in the field of restoration and rehabilitation of Syrian archaeological sites through financial, technical and scientific assistance in particular for the city of Palmyra.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

See General Decision **42 COM 36** of this Document on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic.

In the framework of the project entitled 'Implementation of the World Heritage Committee Decisions for the Site of Palmyra', implemented by UNESCO, an international expert mission to the site is planned to support the DGAM in planning emergency consolidation works in Palmyra. However, the mission could not be undertaken yet, due to the security situation on the ground.

It is recommended that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property be carried out to examine the state of conservation of the property, as soon as the situation allows.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.35

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7A.49**, **41 COM 7A.50** and **41 COM 8B.51**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Taking into account Decision **42 COM 7A.36** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,*
4. *Reiterates its request to the State Party to limit restoration works to first aid interventions until the security situation improves and allows conducting detailed studies and extensive field work, and also discussions on defining optimal approaches;*
5. *Reiterates its encouragement to the State Party to implement the recommendations of the UNESCO technical assistance workshop of 2016, and in particular the emergency consolidation measures;*

6. *Calls on all UNESCO Member States to support emergency safeguarding measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;*
7. *Requests that the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission be carried out to proceed to a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property and identify measures needed to reverse the decay and ensure the conservation and protection of the property, as soon as the security situation allows;*
8. *Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;*
9. ***Decides to retain the Site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.***

36. General Decision on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic

Current conservation issues

The armed conflict in Syria started in March 2011 and has constantly escalated leading to significant violence and degradation of humanitarian conditions. It continues to inflict damage on the inscribed properties as well as on the 12 sites inscribed on the Tentative List. Sites continue to be damaged by shelling, fires, extensive illegal excavations, military use, construction violations, in addition to intentional destructions and inappropriate use of archaeological sites by internally displaced populations.

On 15 January 2017, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, available at http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/42COM/documents/#state_of_conservation_reports, with detailed information on the destruction and damage at the six World Heritage properties. This report represents an official statement from the Syrian authorities and collates available information from the branches of the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) and from the local communities up to 31 December 2017. The State Party notes that as ground access in Syria for heritage experts is limited, the full extent of the damage to World Heritage properties cannot be assessed in detail. In particular, the report does not provide first-hand information on the Ancient Villages of Northern Syria and the Ancient City of Bosra that are exposed to the armed conflict, and thus does not allow a full understanding of the extent of damage at these properties.

The State Party reported on the actions carried out by the DGAM, despite the difficult working conditions, to monitor the World Heritage properties and cultural heritage in general, assess damages, undertake emergency conservation and risk mitigation actions whenever possible, and inventory built and movable heritage. The report also stressed the DGAM efforts in maintaining salaries for its staff in the inaccessible Ancient Villages of Northern Syria, and highlighted the positive role played by local communities in some cases to safeguard heritage and limit illegal excavations.

On 21 January 2018, the State Party provided updated information on the conservation of the sites inscribed on the Tentative List, which indicates the following:

- In 'Mari (Tell Hariri) and Dura Europos', images of the sites sent by local communities confirm illegal excavations at both sites and damages at the Royal Palace in Mari. The DGAM is planning an emergency mission to these sites that are currently back under governmental control and guarded by local communities;
- In 'Maaloula', the Municipality and the United Nations Programme for Development (UNDP) have completed the rehabilitation of infrastructures;
- 'Raqqa-Rafiq: the Abassid City' is under the control of armed groups;

- No further damages are reported at the sites of 'Ebla (Tell Mardikh)', 'Apamea (Afamia)', 'Qasr al-Hayr ach-Charqi, a desert Castle';
- No information is given for the sites of 'Arwad Island', 'Noreas of Hama', 'Tartus: the Crusaders Citadel-City' and 'Ugrarit (Tell Shamra).

Activities undertaken by UNESCO

- Since the 41st session of the Committee (Krakow, 2017), UNESCO has pursued its actions to assist the State Party in its continuous and sustained efforts to safeguard cultural heritage;
- At the international level, UNESCO continues to raise the awareness of the international community on the destruction of cultural heritage in Syria, notably through the #Unite4Heritage campaign and in the framework of the implementation of the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) Resolution 2199 (February 2015) and Resolution 2347 (March 2017) recognizing for the first time the importance of heritage protection for peace and security;
- At the national level, UNESCO has pursued its activities to monitor the situation of Syrian cultural heritage, raise awareness on its protection, undertake short, medium and long-term actions to safeguard it, and coordinate the work of national and international entities working on its safeguarding;
- In the framework of the European Union-funded project "Emergency Safeguarding of Syrian Cultural Heritage" (2.46 million euros), co-financed by Flanders and Austria, started in March 2014 and implemented in partnership with ICOMOS and ICCROM, the following activities were undertaken:
 - From 26 February to 2 March 2018, a training workshop was organized in Beirut on emergency and preventive conservation techniques for museums and collections,
 - From September 2017 to April 2018, a "Vocational Training in Stone Carving/Cutting and Stone Masonry" workshop was organized in Aleppo in collaboration with the Aga Khan Trust for Culture (AKTC) to provide practical training and theory to 30 builders and stone masons in view of involving them in future restoration works (Aleppo),
 - In November and December 2017, workshops, a round table and exhibition entitled "Archaeology for a Young Future" were organized in Beirut (Lebanon), in collaboration with the Society of the Friends of the American University of Beirut, on local communities' involvement in the archaeological preservation of the Qamishli area (Syria),
 - In September 2017, a First Aid Support Meeting was organized in Rieti (Italy) in collaboration with the Centro di Conservazione Archeologica (CCA) for the conservation of the mosaics of the Maarat al-Nu'man Museum, which mostly originate from the Ancient Villages of Northern Syria
 - On 10 and 11 August 2017, a first Aid Support Meeting was organized on on traditional materials and techniques in Aleppo
 - The 3D documentation and structural analysis of the Crac des Chevaliers, Beit Ghazaleh and Beit Ajiqbash (Museum of Folks Arts) in Aleppo have been completed by the DGAM with the technical support of professional teams,
 - A 52-minute "Documentary on the Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage" in Arabic, English and French, on the actions implemented for the protection of cultural heritage in Syria is being produced and foreseen to be launched by August 2018;
- In the framework of the project funded by Germany entitled "Capacity Building, Technical and Media Support for the Protection of Syrian Cultural Heritage" (USD 200,000) implemented in collaboration with the German Archaeological Institute (DAI), between November and December 2017, three workshops were organized in Beirut and one was organized in Berlin to enhance the Syrian professionals capacities in recording, storing and analyzing cultural heritage research data;
- The UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund provided financial support for the following activities:
 - The emergency consolidation of the stair-step bridge leading to the main gate of the Aleppo Citadel; debris management and damage assessment for 170 historic buildings in the property, by the DGAM.

- A publication on damage assessment in the Ancient City of Aleppo, jointly prepared by the World Heritage Centre and the United Nations Institute for Training and Research's Operational Satellite Applications Programme (UNITAR/UNOSAT);
- The restoration of the statue of the Lion of Athena/Lion of Al-lāt of Palmyra, by the DGAM with the support of the Polish archaeological mission.
- In the framework of the Flemish Funds-in-Trust project entitled 'Implementation of the Committee Decisions for the Site of Palmyra' (USD 100 000), an international expert mission to the site is foreseen to support the DGAM in planning emergency consolidation works in Palmyra, but could not be undertaken yet, due to the security situation on the ground.
- The joint World Heritage Centre/ICCROM/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission, which was foreseen to be carried out to Damascus and Aleppo in March 2017, could not take place under the United Nations security and safety rules.
- The UNESCO Culture and Education national officers in Aleppo continue to ensure coordination with local and national authorities for the implementation of activities for the recovery of the property.

Activities undertaken by the Advisory Bodies

- Capacity building for six Syrian professionals has taken place through their participation in a number of ICCROM activities such as the short course series organized by the ICCROM-Sharjah Office on the conservation and documentation of built cultural heritage, and also ICCROM's International Course on Stone Conservation. In addition, active participation of senior officials took place in the Arab Cultural Heritage Forum as well as the colloquia organized by ICCROM on post-conflict reconstruction at Louvre-Lens and in Rome.
- ICOMOS has closely followed the situation in Syria, maintaining contact with the cultural heritage community in the country, and working to provide advice and raise awareness. Through its Project Anqa, run in cooperation with Cyark, and funded by the Arcadia Foundation, ICOMOS contributed to the 3D recording of six at-risk heritage sites in Syria and capacity building of Syrian professionals – with the aim of fostering the creation of a sustainable 3D architectural inventory. It is also a partner in the AMAL in Heritage project (mobile and web application for rapid damage assessment of cultural heritage in conflict zones) launched by the Global Heritage Fund (GHF) in partnership with ICCROM, the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage (ARC-WH), and the Prince Claus Fund, which has also provided training to Syrian professionals.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The armed conflict situation in Syria and its continued escalation has affected the six World Heritage properties and has substantially limited capacities to adequately sustain and protect their Outstanding Universal Value. The properties have been increasingly threatened by ascertained and potential dangers, in particular the Ancient City of Aleppo, which has been extensively and increasingly destroyed, and which runs the risk of further irreversible destructions during the challenging recovery phase.

The illegal excavations across archaeological sites and tells in Syria are a major source for the illicit trafficking of cultural objects and are causing extensive and irreversible damages to those sites, many of which are on Syria's Tentative List, as well as providing looted artifacts for sale in regional and international black markets.

It is recommended that the Committee commend the DGAM, heritage professionals in Syria and local communities who have made sustained efforts to protect cultural heritage and to monitor it closely.

The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies will continue to support the State Party in the identification of the necessary corrective measures and in the development of a Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), for all six properties, as soon as the situation allows.

It is important that humanitarian and security actions be done in coordination with cultural heritage stakeholders, to avoid further irreversible damages to the properties, and allow for undertaking first aid measures for its cultural heritage. Furthermore, it is recommended that systematic documentation of all damage incurred at the World Heritage properties be duly pursued, whenever the situation allows, and that the Committee reiterate its call to the State Party to safeguard damaged properties through minimal first aid interventions to prevent theft, further collapse and natural degradation, and refrain from

undertaking other measures until the situation allows for the development of a comprehensive strategy and action plan that respond to international standards and high-quality scientific methods.

With regard to post-conflict interventions, it is recommended that the Committee call on the State Party to plan the future of the World Heritage properties according to international conservation charters and standards, in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies.

It is recommended that the Committee call for international and national heritage professionals to continue to unite for the safeguarding of Syria's cultural heritage; and to further support its safeguarding through earmarked funds and to contributions to the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund.

Until conditions improve, it is also recommended that the Committee urge all parties associated with the conflict in Syria to refrain from any action that can further damage the heritage of the country, in particular World Heritage properties and all sites included on the Tentative List, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, and in particular the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, in part by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage including the evacuation of World Heritage properties used for military purposes, and the halting of all damages that result from targeting World Heritage properties. It is also recommended that the Committee reiterate its suggestion that the State Party consider ratifying the Second Protocol (1999) of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Heritage during times of Armed Conflict.

It is further recommended that the Committee also call upon all parties associated with the conflict in Syria and the international community, in particular the neighboring countries to Syria, to ensure effective measures for the fight against illicit trafficking of cultural objects, in line with the UN Security Council Resolution 2199.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.36

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.50**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Deplores the conflict situation prevailing in the country, the loss of human life and the degradation of humanitarian conditions;*
4. *Taking note of the reports provided by the State Party regarding the state of conservation of the six Syrian World Heritage properties and of the sites inscribed on the Syrian Tentative List, commends the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) and all the heritage professionals and the local communities in Syria who are working on monitoring and protecting cultural heritage for their sustained efforts amidst extremely difficult conditions, but expresses its utmost concern at the damage occurred and the threats facing these properties and cultural heritage in general;*
5. *Urges all parties associated with the situation in Syria to refrain from any action that would cause further damage to cultural heritage of the country and to fulfil their obligations under international law, and in particular the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, including the halting of all damages that result from targeting World Heritage properties, sites included in the Tentative List and other cultural heritage sites;*
6. *Also urges the State Party to adopt measures for the evacuation of World Heritage properties being used for military purposes;*
7. *Further urges the State Party and the international community to include recovery actions within the properties to the overall humanitarian, security and peace building response;*

8. Urges furthermore the State Party to safeguard damaged properties through minimal first aid interventions to prevent theft, further collapse and natural degradation, and to refrain from undertaking conservation and restoration work until the situation allows, for the development of comprehensive conservation strategies and actions that respond to international standards in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
9. Launches an appeal to all Member States of UNESCO to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural heritage coming from Syria as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2199 of February 2015, and in engaging in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, and reiterates its suggestion to the State Party to consider ratifying the Second Protocol (1999) of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Heritage during times of Armed Conflict;
10. Requests the State Party to pursue the systematic documentation of all damage incurred by the World Heritage properties, whenever conditions allow, and to implement all possible risk mitigation measures, to inform on the development of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the properties from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and the identification of corrective measures for all six properties;
11. Calls upon the international community to further support the safeguarding of Syrian cultural heritage through earmarked funds or through contribution to the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
12. Also calls upon the international and national cultural heritage professionals to unite for the safeguarding of Syria's cultural heritage, and pursue their ongoing initiatives in coordination with UNESCO;
13. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the properties and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019.

37. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) (C 611)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1993

Criteria (ii)(iv)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2000-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Serious deterioration of the built heritage (a high percentage of the residential houses being replaced by concrete and multi-storey buildings);
- The remaining houses in the city are rapidly deteriorating, due to the prevailing low income of the inhabitants;
- Since the souk activities have been transferred outside the city, the ancient souk is almost empty and free from any type of activity and the shops are falling apart;
- The traditional economic role of the city has vanished;
- The city in general, is lacking any conservation and rehabilitation strategies;
- Threats arising from the armed conflict in Yemen.

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4357>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted; see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/1282>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Identified; see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4357>

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/611/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 9 (from 1994-2014)

Total amount approved: USD 188,997

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/611/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 14,000 from the Italian Funds-in-Trust and the France-UNESCO Co-operation Agreement

Total amount granted to Yemeni cultural properties: USD 194,836 from the European Union for damage assessments, capacity development and emergency stabilization of damaged buildings and protection of archaeological sites

Total amount of USD 35,000 from UNESCO Regular Programme for the Sustainable Management of Tangible Heritage in the GCC and Yemen

Previous monitoring missions

2002 and 2003: international expertise; December 2004: World Heritage Centre mission; January 2007: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission; January 2009: World Heritage Centre mission; January 2011: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Serious degradation of the city's heritage (many houses and the ancient souq are in an alarming state of deterioration)
- A number of houses replaced by inappropriate concrete buildings
- Sections of the city's open spaces have been privatized, either illegally or informally and more than 30% of these built-up
- Reduction in support and resources arising from political and socio-economic disturbances

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/611/>

Current conservation issues

Local sources provided a report on the property's state of conservation, which contains the following information:

- The property remains threatened by armed conflict, adverse economic conditions and lack of resources for conservation. Even provision of basic needs for inhabitants has become challenging. A particular emerging issue is that high prices and lack of traditional building materials result in the use of unsuitable building materials. The majority of the traditional buildings in the Old Town of Zabid need urgent interventions for maintenance, restoration and rehabilitation;
- Despite such challenges, some projects aimed at raising awareness among youth groups, women and traditional builders, as well as activities such as collecting garbage and building remnants have been undertaken. Other current projects and initiatives include paving the southern gate area of the old city, improvements to shop facades and passage roofs in the souk, and a heritage and environmental awareness program for the local community;
- The report underlines the urgent need for technical and financial support to implement urgent preventive measures that would protect and conserve the property and address the current deterioration.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The security situation in Yemen, in combination with a lack of organisational support and resources, continues to obstruct both effective heritage management and physical conservation works within the property. However, the efforts of technical actors and local communities, in damage assessment, documentation, first-aid interventions and awareness raising are commendable.

Recent information in the media reported an escalation of the conflict near Hodeida region, where Zabid is located. It is recommended that the Committee urge all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage.

Support from the international community remains essential for technical and financial resources, and capacity building to conduct adequate preventive and restoration measures at the property. Owing to the security situation, there has been no progress with the preparation of a management plan, nor with finalising the draft National Strategy for the Preservation of the Historic Cities, Sites and Monuments 2016 – 2020, nor with the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, adopted at the UNESCO expert meeting in July 2015. Prospects for practical and/or financial assistance within Yemen are necessarily constrained until the security situation improves. However, it would be appropriate for the international community to continue to express its support and where possible to offer technical assistance.

It remains necessary for a Reactive Monitoring mission to visit the property in order to advise on short-term repair works and to assist with the identification of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and associated corrective measures, as soon as the security situation allows.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.37

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.51**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017);
3. Expresses its continuing concern at the recent damage caused to the cultural heritage of the Historic Town of Zabid as a result of ongoing armed conflict, and that the property continues to be threatened by the current security situation, ongoing social change and continuing lack of organisational support and resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;
4. Commends the local actors and the communities of Zabid for efforts to protect and conserve the property despite the very difficult conditions;
5. Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on short-term repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the development of a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), as soon as the security situation in Yemen has improved;
6. Urges all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, in particular the safeguarding of properties on the World Heritage List and those included in the Tentative List of Yemen, and encourages all concerned stakeholders to unite for the preservation of cultural heritage in Yemen;

7. Reiterates its previous calls for the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, adopted at the UNESCO expert meeting in July 2015, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures, and calls on the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to continue providing technical assistance and support;
8. Reiterates its request to the State Party to submit details of the buffer zone and other technical requirements for a minor boundary modification proposal as soon as the conditions allow it, for adoption by the World Heritage Committee;
9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
10. **Decides to retain Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

38. Old City of Sana'a (Yemen) (C 385)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1986

Criteria (iv)(v)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2015-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Damages and threats related to the armed conflict in Yemen

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/385/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 6 (from 1990-2014)

Total amount approved: USD 101,997

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/385/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: 1988: USD 374,800, UNDP/UNESCO project in support of local staff training and fund-raising. 2004-2006: USD 60,000 for the Inventory of the historic city (Italian Funds-in-Trust); USD 12,000 for technical assistance in support of the reconstruction of the al-Qasimi neighborhood (Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage (ARC-WH)

Total amount granted to Yemeni cultural properties: USD 194,836 from the European Union for damage assessments, capacity development and emergency stabilization of damaged buildings and protection of archaeological sites. Total amount of USD 35,000 from UNESCO Regular Programme for the Sustainable Management of Tangible Heritage in the GCC and Yemen

Previous monitoring missions

1998, 1999, 2003: World Heritage Centre monitoring missions; 2003 to 2005 and 2010: World Heritage Centre and experts missions

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Modern constructions and uncontrolled expansion of commercial activities (issue resolved)
- Lack of a Safeguarding Plan (issue resolved)
- Fly-over bridge project (issue resolved)
- Uncontrolled vertical and horizontal additions
- Management activities (Use of inappropriate building materials and techniques)
- Densification of the historic fabric through occupation of green areas
- Functional decay of the residential neighbourhoods
- Continuing vulnerability of the property, as a result of extreme conditions since 2011
- Threats arising from the armed conflict in Yemen
- Physical damage and instability of buildings
- Urgent need for shelter for displaced residents

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/385/>

Current conservation issues

Local sources provided a report on the property's state of conservation, which contains the following information:

- The Old City of Sana'a continues to be severely affected by armed conflict and socio-economic decline. The Al-Qasimi, Al-Alfolihi, Almadrasah, Salah Al-Din and Al-Bukairia neighbourhoods in the Old City of Sana'a were previously severely damaged while additional damage occurred at Salah Al-Din and Bukairia in November 2017;
- Despite the inventory and assessment project for the damage incurred to the historic buildings that the General Authority for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen (GOPHCY) had undertaken, emergency interventions could not be completed owing to the security situation and lack of funds, except for construction of bearing walls to severely damaged buildings in the Al-Qasimi area;
- Technical actors have taken action to prevent or remedy inappropriate constructions within the historic city. However, a number of interventions have arisen through actions by individuals responding to the economic and social pressures facing local residents and amid a lack of adequate governance.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The armed conflict in Yemen continues to severely affect and further threaten the OUV of the property.

GOPHCY's involvement in damage assessment, documentation, first-aid interventions, preparatory training and communication with the World Heritage Centre, UNESCO Office in Doha and the Advisory Bodies is highly appreciated. However, the exchanges of information and consultation on the state of conservation of the property and first-aid measures need to be backed-up with resources that allow implementation of physical conservation actions.

The situation within the property for both residents and historic buildings remains dire. The World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS have supported reconstruction plans to sustain shelter for the inhabitants, and provided detailed technical restoration and reconstruction guidelines that reconcile the provision of housing and basic shelter and services needs for the inhabitants, with the necessity of restoring damaged buildings based on surveys and documentation, and using traditional construction techniques and materials as much as possible. Indeed, unregulated new constructions and inadequate restorations will incrementally affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property. It is therefore recommended that the Committee request the State Party to consult the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in order to ensure that restoration and reconstruction works at the property abide by basic technical requirements.

Support from the international community remains essential for capacity building to conduct adequate preventive and conservation measures at the property, in relation to the armed conflict, within the framework of the July 2015 Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage. Financial support is necessarily constrained until the security situation improves, emergency interventions for the reconstruction of destroyed houses still require immediate financial and technical

support, to sustain people's livelihoods and ensure that these interventions include due consideration of the property's OUV.

Owing to the security conditions prevailing in the country, it remains challenging for the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to provide further support to the State Party on first-aid measures and restoration/reconstruction of damaged structures, nor is it currently possible to arrange a joint Reactive Monitoring mission, despite the State Party's repeated invitations.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.38

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.52**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Expresses its continuing concern at the damage caused to the cultural heritage of Yemen as a result of armed conflict, and that the Old City of Sana'a has incurred irreversible destruction, and continues to be vulnerable, owing to the current security situation, ongoing social change and continuing lack of organisational support and resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;
4. Commends the local technical actors and other parties involved in damage assessment, documentation and emergency interventions at the property, and requests that they restore damaged buildings based on surveys and documentation, and using traditional construction techniques and materials, as much as possible, to avoid incrementally affecting the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
5. Notes the actions taken to address unauthorized construction of new buildings within the property without prior consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies and reiterates its previous request that the State Party submit to the World Heritage Centre, for examination by the Advisory Bodies, further information on these new buildings and on new projects prior to initiating any construction works;
6. Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on short-term repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the development of a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), as soon as the security situation in Yemen has improved;
7. Urges all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, in particular the safeguarding of properties on the World Heritage List and those included in the Tentative List of Yemen, and encourages all concerned stakeholders to unite for the preservation of cultural heritage in Yemen;
8. Reiterates its previous call to the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, adopted at the UNESCO expert meeting in July 2015, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures; and also calls on the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to continue providing technical assistance and support where needed;

9. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
10. **Decides to retain the Old City of Sana'a (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

39. Old Walled City of Shibam (Yemen) (C 192)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1982

Criteria (iii)(iv)(v)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2015-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Threats from natural elements
- Lack of organizational support and material resources for conservation
- Threats related to the armed conflict

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/192/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 6 (from 1982-1999)

Total amount approved: USD 121,966

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/192/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted to Yemeni cultural properties: USD 194,836 from the European Union for damage assessments, capacity development and emergency stabilization of damaged buildings and protection of archaeological sites. Total amount of USD 35,000 from UNESCO Regular Programme for the Sustainable Management of Tangible Heritage in the GCC and Yemen

Previous monitoring missions

N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Floods (issue previously reported as being resolved – but again current)
- Poor maintenance (issue previously reported as being resolved)
- Damage to historic buildings
- Reduction in support and resources arising from political and socio-economic disturbances
- Armed conflict situation since 2015
- Threats from rain and floods

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/192/>

Current conservation issues

Local sources provided a report on the property's state of conservation, which contains the following information:

- The Old City of Shibam, being built of mud and located in a flood prone area, remains at severe risk of major damage, unless necessary preventive measures are taken. The effects of climate change are exacerbating this problem. Therefore, the proposed 'Shibam Oases Development Project' is essential for long-term conservation. This project, which is part of a sustainable food security program, involves preparation of a comprehensive developmental plan for the conservation and use of Shibam oases, which are considered as the buffer zone of the property. Shibam is also at risk from armed conflict, and other threats including limited institutional capacity, impact of inappropriate new development, diminishing traditional activities and lack of resources for both economic activity and conservation;
- Despite the deteriorating economic, social and security situation and scarce resources, local technical actors have taken action to prevent the deterioration of historic buildings and have implemented a number of emergency measures to ensure their stability, thereby enabling some displaced families to return home. Other buildings have been repaired using local funds. There has been dialogue with UNESCO regarding these works;
- Yemeni specialists have participated in workshops and events organized by UNESCO and ICCROM, leading to improved communication and requests for resources to support further participation, networking and training to build capacity. The ICCROM Centre in Sharjah, using funding from the British Council's Cultural Protection Fund, is co-ordinating a project ('Recovery and Skills Sharing in Yemen and Sudan'), which includes the rehabilitation and reconstruction of some historic buildings in Shibam-Hadramout;
- Financial support is requested to implement corrective measures, which will enable the property to be removed from the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The security situation in Yemen, in combination with the physical circumstances of the property, and lack of organizational support and resources, continues to thwart effective heritage management and physical conservation works within the property. However, the efforts of both local technical actors and the Shibam community in damage assessment, documentation, first-aid interventions, capacity building and continuous communication with the World Heritage Centre, UNESCO Doha and the Advisory Bodies, are commendable.

Support from the international community, through projects such as the proposed 'Shibam Oases Development Project' and 'Recovery and Skills Sharing in Yemen and Sudan', remains essential for capacity building and adequate preventive and conservation measures at the property. It would be appropriate that further information about these programmes be submitted by the State Party to the World Heritage Centre, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

Although future financial or practical support is necessarily constrained unless and until the security situation improves, the international community can and should continue to express its support for the local technical actors and communities, and where possible offer technical assistance.

It remains desirable for a Reactive Monitoring mission to visit the property in order to advise on short-term repair works and to identify, both the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and associated corrective measures, as soon as the security situation allows.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.39

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.53**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),

3. *Expresses its continuing concern at the recent damage caused to the cultural heritage of the property as a result of natural elements and ongoing armed conflict, and that the property continues to be vulnerable, owing to the residual impact of previous flooding, as well as the current security situation, ongoing social change and continuing lack of organisational support and resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;*
4. *Commends the local technical actors and other parties involved in damage assessment, documentation and emergency interventions, and for its communication with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies and acknowledges the efforts of the General Organization for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen (GOPHCY), the community and the other concerned stakeholders of Shibam to protect and conserve the property despite the very difficult conditions;*
5. *Requests the State Party to submit, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, details for the ‘Shibam Oases Development Project’;*
6. *Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the development of a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), as soon as the security situation in Yemen has improved;*
7. *Urges all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, in particular the safeguarding of properties on the World Heritage List and those included in the Tentative List of Yemen, and encourages all concerned stakeholders to unite for the preservation of cultural heritage in Yemen;*
8. *Reiterates its previous calls for the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen’s Cultural heritage, adopted at the UNESCO Expert meeting in July 2015, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures, and calls on the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to continue providing the State Party with technical assistance and support where needed;*
9. *Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;*
10. ***Decides to retain Old Walled City of Shibam (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.***

NATURAL PROPERTIES

ASIA-PACIFIC

40. Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Indonesia) (N 1167)

See Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add.2

41. East Rennell (Solomon Islands) (N 854)

See Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add.2

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

43. Belize Barrier Reef Reserve System (Belize) (N 764)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1996

Criteria (vii)(ix)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2009-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Sale and lease of public lands for the purposes of development within the property leading to the destruction of mangrove and marine ecosystems

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/6208>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/1825>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Adopted, see page <https://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/6208>

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/764/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 0

Total amount approved: USD 0

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/764/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 140,000: i) USD 30,000 from the Rapid Response Facility for the monitoring of unauthorized activities in the Bladen Nature Reserves which were impacting the property; ii) USD 30,000 for emergency conservation actions in favour of the critically endangered wide sawfish (2010); iii) USD 80,000 in support of public use planning and site financing strategy development for the Blue Hole Natural Monument (2008-2009)

Previous monitoring missions

March 2009: joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission; February 2013: IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission; January 2015: joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Technical mission; December 2017 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Advisory mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Housing and Major visitor accommodation and associated infrastructure (Destruction of fragile ecosystems due to resort / housing development)
- Invasive / alien marine species (Introduced species)
- Land conversion (Sale and lease of public lands within the property)
- Oil and gas (Oil concessions within the marine area)

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/764/>

Current conservation issues

On 29 March 2018, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1138/documents/> and additional information on 15 April and 15 May 2018, reporting the following progress towards achieving the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR):

- In December 2017, a Petroleum Operations (Maritime Zone Moratorium) Act was enacted, establishing a moratorium on oil exploration and other petroleum operations in the entire maritime zone of Belize;
- The revised Forests (Protection of Mangroves) Regulations were adopted by the government. They include stricter control mechanisms for protection of “priority mangrove areas” and specifically establish that impacts on and proximity to the property should be considered in the requirements for granting permits for mangrove alteration. An assessment of mangrove cover within the property shows that current cover is 95.3% of 1996 mangrove coverage and that almost no mangrove clearing has occurred within the property since 2009;
- The Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Checklist has been amended to include consideration of potential impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and revision of the EIA Regulations is ongoing to reflect this change;
- The Coastal Zone Management Authority and Institute (CZMAI) has continued to work on the operationalization of the Integrated Coastal Zone Management Plan (ICZMP), including through the reactivation of Coastal Advisory Committees (CACs) and development of a road map of activities;
- The voluntary moratorium on sale and lease of public lands within the property continues to be upheld. However, in order to develop a legally binding instrument, a comprehensive assessment of land tenure within the property is required, following which the remaining public lands can be declared reserves. While due to the size of the property, this process will require additional time, the Ministry of Natural Resources and the Ministry of Fisheries, Forestry and the Environment have agreed to complete land tenure verification in 2018. A preliminary study of land tenure within the property has already been undertaken by WWF and, although the State Party notes that its results might not be fully accurate, indicates that about 85% of the land area of the property is national lands, but within marine reserves, where land areas have no protected status, it is only about 15%.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The significant progress made by the State Party towards achieving the DSOCR is commendable, particularly the enactment of a moratorium on oil exploration and other petroleum operations within the entire maritime zone of Belize, whereby Indicator 3 of the DSOCR, related to protection of the property from possible oil operations, has been fully met and exceeded.

Further revision and amendment of the EIA Checklist and the corresponding ongoing revision of the EIA Regulations to include specific consideration of potential impacts on the OUV of the property are also welcomed. However, it appears that the provisions to specifically consider potential impacts on the OUV of the property were only included in the checklist for mining projects, but not tourism or other types of projects. It is recommended that the Committee urge the State Party to ensure that the EIA Checklist includes these provisions for all types of projects and to finalize the remaining steps in the legal adoption of the revised EIA Regulations. Provided that the State Party assures full implementation of these measures, including in the short term, the inclusion of these specific provisions, together with other instruments discussed below, can be considered to provide an adequate framework for ensuring that no development occurs within the property and in its vicinity that would negatively impact its OUV. Together with the progress reported in the further implementation of the ICZMP which also includes specific guidelines defining appropriate types of development, this therefore addresses Indicators 2 and 4 of the DSOCR, which relate to protection of the property from development which might have negative impacts on its OUV, and integrated management of the property, respectively. However, it will be important to secure sufficient resources for the implementation of the ICZMP in the longer term.

Further progress achieved by the State Party in the revision and official adoption of the Forests (Protection of Mangroves) Regulations, and the findings of the study on mangrove cover, should also be welcomed. With the adoption of the Mangroves Regulation and the confirmation of the current extent of mangrove cover within the property, significant progress has been achieved towards meeting Indicator 1 of the DSOCR, related to the maintenance of the mangrove cover within the property. Protection of mangroves should be strengthened further through the development of a legally binding moratorium on sales and lease of public lands within the property. However, the State Party notes that, while a voluntary moratorium on sales and leases of lands within the property remains in force, development of a legally binding instrument can only be undertaken following a detailed assessment of land tenure which will require additional time. Initiation of such a process and a methodology have

already been agreed, with the proposal to declare remaining public lands as reserves once the land tenure has been officially verified. Under these circumstances, taking into account the State Party's commitment to finalize the process in 2018, it can be concluded that the objective of DSOCR Indicator 1 has been met. However, given the fact that a significant proportion of lands within the property which have no protection status has already been sold or leased, further efforts should be focused on ensuring that revised regulations on development, such as the Mangroves and the EIA Regulations, are efficiently implemented and enforced in order to ensure that no development occurs on these private lands that would have any negative impacts on the OUV of the property.

Overall, it can be concluded that the DSOCR has been achieved and it is therefore recommended that the Committee remove the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger, and request the State Party to continue reporting on further progress achieved on the outstanding matters outlined above, and in the draft decision below.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.43

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.2**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Commends the State Party for the progress made in achieving the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and particularly welcomes the legal enactment of a moratorium on oil exploration and other petroleum operations in the entire maritime zone of Belize;*
4. *Considers that Indicators 2, 3 and 4 of the DSOCR have been fully achieved, and that Indicator 1 can be considered as achieved given the confirmation by the State Party that official verification of land tenure and subsequent declaration as mangrove reserves of the remaining public lands within marine reserves comprising the property has been officially agreed and initiated by the relevant ministries, and is expected to be completed in 2018;*
5. ***Decides to remove Belize Barrier Reef Reserve System (Belize) from the List of World Heritage in Danger;***
6. *Requests the State Party to ensure that the process of official land tenure verification within the property is completed in due course and no later than by the end of 2018, and that the remaining public lands within the property are designated as strict reserves, in line with the commitment expressed by the State Party;*
7. *Urges the State Party to address the pending issues related to the revised regulatory instruments, in particular to ensure that specific provisions for consideration of potential impacts on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) are included in the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Checklist for all types of projects, and that the ongoing revision of the EIA Regulations reflects this and is completed as a matter of priority;*
8. *Strongly encourages the State Party to continue to ensure that the resources required for the long-term implementation of the Integrated Coastal Zone Management Plan are secured;*
9. *Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the*

implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019.

AFRICA

45. Manovo Gounda St. Floris National Park (Central African Republic) (N 475)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1988

Criteria (ix)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 1997-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Illegal grazing
- Poaching by heavily armed groups subsequent loss of up to 80% of the Park's wildlife and the deteriorating security situation
- Halt to tourism

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/1761>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/1761>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/475/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 4 (from 2001-2012)

Total amount approved: USD 225,488

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/475/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

N/A

Previous monitoring missions

May 2001 and April 2009: Joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring missions

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Insecurity
- Poaching
- Mining
- Transhumance and illegal grazing
- Illegal fishing
- Illegal occupation of the property

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/475/>

Current conservation issues

On 31 January 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, available at <http://whc.org/en/list/475/documents/>, providing the following information:

- The Wildlife Ecosystem Project of North-eastern part of the Central African Republic (CAR) (ECOFAUNE+), funded by the BEKOU European funds and the Central Africa Biodiversity Conservation Programme – Protecting Central Africa's Elephants (PCBAC-SEAC), funded by the African Development Bank continues. Their objectives are to improve the governance and sustainable management of the natural resources of CAR and to preserve the Outstanding

Universal Value (OUV) of the property and its periphery. Several activities, such as: the rehabilitation of infrastructures, the acquisition of equipment, the training of personnel and field activities are implemented in this framework;

- A management agreement (Public-Private Partnership) between the CAR government and the international conservation NGO Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) is currently being negotiated. An administrative, technical and operational system will be implemented by the WCS that could benefit, among others, from a grant of 7 million Euros from the European Development Fund (11th EDF). The WCS would be responsible, among others, for the management, surveillance and ecological monitoring of the property. For 2018, the priority is to train and deploy guards in the property and its surroundings and provide them with equipment to ensure its surveillance and be able to act rapidly in some areas of the property. The Ministry of Defence hopes to formalize a cooperative framework with the WCS for the successful implementation of these operations;
- An aerial census was carried out in March and April 2017, highlighting the catastrophic decline of wildlife. The elephant, the population of which was estimated at approximately 5,000 individuals at the time of inscription, appears to have totally disappeared from the property. All populations of large species of mammal appear once again greatly declined in comparison to the data collected in 2005 and 2010. The Derby eland and the buffalo have been observed in some limited areas, but are totally absent in the vast plains where, historically, they were abundant. The presence of a small population of the Kordofan giraffe, sub-species in danger of extinction, was confirmed. Otherwise, different illegal activities have been observed, notably the presence of cattle and transhumance, poachers' camps, moto trails and artisanal mining quarries;
- This census enabled the gathering of information, which will enable to: establish zoning and determine the priority conservation zones as well as measures to combat threats. The priorities are: reduce transhumance and pastoralism, open roads and trails to access the property, relocate outside the Park the illegal habitations identified in the extreme north, and close down the illegal diamond mines located on the periphery of the property;
- A strategy for threat management is being prepared in the framework of the Transborder Tripartite Anti-Poaching Agreement signed between the CAR, Cameroon and Chad. It will enable harmonization at the regional level of the measures to be undertaken to contain poaching and transhumance and reestablish security in the area. The CAR envisages the creation of a transboundary complex of protected areas, that would include the north-eastern sites of the country and Chad's Zakouma National Park.

Further, the World Heritage Centre was informed, last April, of the rehabilitation project for the National Road 8 that crosses the Manovo-Gounda Saint-Floris Park. The Centre wrote to the State Party on 9 April 2018 to request the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) of this project. The World Bank, one of the donors with the French Development Agency (AFD), transmitted to UNESCO on 19 April, the documents relating to the project, including the "Environmental and Social Safeguard Action Plan" and the "Terms of Reference for the Environmental and Social Impact Studies".

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The results of the census again confirm the critical situation of this property: the decimation of large wildlife continues endlessly and has resulted in the disappearance of the elephant in the property. The pressure of poaching, notably by national and foreign armed groups, remains strong, to which is added the presence of large transhumant groups and their cattle in search of pasturage as well as artisanal mining exploitation. The progressive degradation of wildlife has compromised since several years the OUV of the property.

The mobilization by the State Party, through the different ECOFAUNE+ and PCBAC-SEAC projects, to improve the state of conservation of the property is warmly welcomed. The efforts of the CAR and its partners concentrate on the major threats, notably transborder transhumance; artisanal mining exploitation and insecurity. These threats remain worrying, taking into account the insecurity context that prevails in the region and which can limit the extent of interventions in the field of conservation. The signature of a Transborder Tripartite Anti-Poaching Agreement signed between the CAR, Cameroon and Chad, and the establishment of a strategy for threat management are commendable achievements. It is therefore recommended that the Committee notes with concern the serious threats weighing on the OUV of the property and congratulates the three States Parties of the CAR, Cameroon and Chad for the establishment of a transboundary anti-poaching strategy. It is also recommended that the Committee request the State Party, in concertation with the neighboring States, to undertake all necessary

measures to combat transboundary transhumance and poaching and to obtain the technical and financial means to achieve this.

The negotiations for the establishment of a partnership between CAR and the WCS for the management of the property are also favorably welcomed. It is recommended that the Committee encourage the State Party to continue its cooperation with WCS through the implementation of management and surveillance activities to enable the ecological restoration process of the property to begin, and that it launches an appeal to donors to support this initiative and avoid the probable and imminent loss of the OUV of the property.

The rehabilitation project of National Road 8 that crosses the Park also raises concern, given that this road risks facilitating access to the property and reinforces illicit exploitation of its natural resources. The documents received concerning the ESIA have been transmitted to the IUCN for evaluation. It is noted with utmost concern that neither the Environmental and Social Safeguard Action Plan, nor the Terms of Reference for the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) make any reference to Manovo-Gounda St Floris National Park and its status as a World Heritage property. The evaluation of the impacts of the project on the OUV of the property, already greatly degraded, must obligatorily be part of the ESIE. In May 2018, the State Party invited a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN mission requested by the Committee in its Decision **38 COM 7A.34**. For security reasons, the mission did not take place and was rescheduled for autumn 2018, security conditions permitting. It is recommended that the joint mission evaluates the state of conservation of the property and determines whether there remain perspectives for regeneration of the characteristics of the property justifying its OUV. Finally, it is recommended that the Committee maintain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger and continue to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.45

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.4**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Notes with utmost concern the results of the census that reveal that the decimation of large wildlife continues endlessly and has already resulted in the disappearance of the elephant and that the progressive degradation of wildlife has, for several years, compromised the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;*
4. *Expresses its concern as regards the persistent threats from poaching by armed groups, transboundary transhumance, artisanal mining exploitation and insecurity and congratulates the States Parties of the Central African Republic, Cameroon and Chad for the signature of the transboundary Tripartite Anti-Poaching Agreement and the development of a regional strategy to combat transhumance and poaching and requests these States Parties to secure the technical and financial means to urgently implement this strategy;*
5. *Warmly welcomes the continued efforts of the State Party, with support from the ECOFAUNE+ (Wildlife Ecosystem of north-eastern CAR) and PCBAC-SEAC (Central Africa Biodiversity Conservation Programme – Protecting Central Africa’s Elephants) projects and technical partners, including the Wildlife Conservation Society, to improve the management and protection of the property and its surroundings and launches an appeal to donors to support the ecological restoration process of the property, to avoid the probable and imminent loss of its OUV;*
6. *Regrets that the State Party did not inform the World Heritage Centre in advance of the rehabilitation of the National Road 8, recalls that the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) of the project must take into account the “IUCN Advisory Note on*

World Heritage: Environmental Evaluation” to assess eventual impacts on the OUV of the property and also recalls the importance of avoiding acceptance of any new project that could aggravate the existing threats and could compromise the progress achieved in the management of the project;

7. *Takes note of the invitation of the State Party for a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN reactive monitoring mission, for autumn 2018, security situation permitting, to evaluate the state of conservation of the property and determine whether there remain perspectives for the regeneration of the characteristics of the property justifying its OUV;*
8. *Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;*
9. *Decides to continue to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism to this property;*
10. *Also decides to retain **Manovo-Gounda St Floris National Park (Central African Republic)** on the List of World Heritage in Danger.*

46. Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d’Ivoire, Guinea) (N 155bis)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1981

Criteria (ix)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 1992-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Iron-ore mining concession inside the property in Guinea
- Arrival of large numbers of refugees from Liberia to areas in and around the Reserve
- Insufficient institutional structure

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4982>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

In progress

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/155/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 20 (from 1981-2015)

Total amount approved: USD 482,588

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/155/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 25,282 from the Rapid Response Facility in January 2012 (see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/830/>)

Previous monitoring missions

October/November 1988: World Heritage Centre mission; 1993: Joint World Heritage Centre / IUCN mission; 1994: IUCN mission; 2000: World Heritage Centre mission; 2007: Joint World Heritage Centre / IUCN mission to Guinea; 2008: Joint World Heritage Centre / IUCN mission to Côte d'Ivoire; 2013: Joint World Heritage Centre / IUCN mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Mining
- Influx of refugees
- Agricultural encroachment
- Deforestation
- Poaching
- Weak management capacity
- Lack of resources
- Unsatisfactory transboundary cooperation

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/155/>

Current conservation issues

On 3 March 2018, the State Party of Côte d'Ivoire submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property, available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/155/documents>, providing the following information:

- To date, no joint monitoring system exists since the occurrence of the Ebola virus disease in 2014. Contacts between the two countries remain informal due to a lack of finances. An exchange mission between Guinea and Côte d'Ivoire, foreseen in 2017, with a view to extending the protocol for the collaboration of managers between Guinea and Liberia with the aim of including the Côte d'Ivoire, was cancelled for diverse reasons;
- The application of the SMART tool (Spatial Monitoring and Reporting Tool) has enabled the monitoring of certain species of wildlife as well as anthropogenic activities;
- The Ivorian Office for Parks and Reserves (OIPR) foresees, in 2018, the reactivation of the transboundary project for Monts Nimba, prepared during a reflection workshop held in 2013 at Danané, in the framework of the second phase of the Nimba Project, in association with the UNDP and the Global Environment Facility (GEF);
- The redefinition of the boundaries of the property, of which the Committee was informed during its 41st session, does not exclude any degraded areas of the property;
- A proposal for the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) has not yet been prepared, but the State Party expresses its willingness to launch this process in partnership with Guinea, UNESCO and IUCN;
- Funding has been obtained for the next five years in the framework of the Sustainable Agriculture Network of Côte d'Ivoire (FADCI) that will ensure the implementation of the management functions for the property. Certain offices of the OIPR at Danané and Yaleu are being rehabilitated. The state of degradation of the surveillance posts and the access trails of the property remain problematic for the implementation of the corrective measures.

On 2 March 2018, the State Party of Guinea submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property, also available at the above-mentioned Internet address, referring in particular to the activities implemented by the State Party in 2012 and do not highlight the efforts taken since the 41st session of the Committee. With regard to the mining exploration permits, this report confirms that the West Africa Exploration Society (WAE) has prepared an Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA), a copy of which was sent to the World Heritage Centre in 2015. It is indicated that all the field activities of the Society have been halted following the complaint by the Director-General of the national committee of the UNESCO Man and Biosphere Programme (MAB) because of the negative impacts noted at the site. The Société des Mines de Fer de Guinée (SMFG) has not yet carried out an ESIA. Its field activities are currently halted. The permit attributed to the SAMA Resources Company was withdrawn in 2014. The report mentions that the Ministry of Environment, Water and Forests has given firm instructions to the Centre for Environmental Management of Mount Nimba and Simandou (CEGENS) to prevent all the above-mentioned mining companies from continuing their activities in the property.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The continued efforts of the OIPR to conduct anti-poaching patrols and to ensure ecological monitoring are warmly welcomed. However, the State Party of Côte d'Ivoire has not provided updated data on tendencies observed of the populations of key species of the property, and the data provided on the anthropogenic activities allow no assessment of the global tendency of poaching, although they suggest a decline in hunting in 2017. It is recommended that the Committee request the two States Parties to provide fuller information on the analysis of data gathered to enable an evaluation of the tendencies of anthropogenic activities, including poaching, as well as the populations of key species in the property.

The funding obtained in the framework of the FADCI programme enabling the implementation of the management functions of the Ivorian component of the property is favourably welcomed. Noting the importance of developing trans-border management of the property and in particular the necessary harmonization of ecological monitoring and the establishment of joint surveillance operations, it is recommended that the Committee reiterate its request to the two States Parties to develop a follow-up to the Nimba Project on the property as a whole. The confirmation of the State Party of Côte d'Ivoire that no degraded area is excluded from the Ivorian component of the property during the redefinition of the boundaries is noted. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party of Côte d'Ivoire to submit a high-resolution map of the updated boundaries.

It is regrettable that the report of the State Party of Guinea contains information that concerns the situation as it was in 2012. The information provided is very ambiguous. The information, according to which all mining activities of the WAE and SMFG Companies are now suspended and that the permit granted to the SAMA Company has been withdrawn since 2014, is noted. However, the World Heritage Centre has received information according to which the suspension of the activities in the WAE concession is more likely linked to financial difficulties of the mother company, Sable Mining. It must also be recalled that the examination by IUCN of the ESIA undertaken by WAE and submitted by the State Party in 2015, noted that the assessment has not been carried out in conformity with international standards as requested by the Committee in its Decision **37 COM 7A.3**.

With regard to the SMFG concession, one of the responsible agents confirmed to the World Heritage Centre that the preparations for the ESIA of the project continues but that the mining project was in a state of 'd'entretien et maintenance' ("care and maintenance") awaiting a decision of the Government concerning the disposal route for the minerals.

It should be noted that the World Heritage Centre and IUCN have received information concerning a road development project to facilitate transportation to The Mano River Union, that would comprise the tarmacking of the Lola route (Guinea) – Danané (Côte d'Ivoire) passing by Mount Nimba. The ESIA summary of the project, dated August 2014 and available at the website of the African Development Bank (ADB), does not take into account the presence of a World Heritage property in the areas concerned by the project, but recognizes that the Mount Nimba Reserve would be affected by indirect impacts, notably pollution by visitors' garbage, poaching and illegal logging. It is regrettable that the States Parties have not informed the World Heritage Centre of this project, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*. On 14 May 2018, a letter was sent by the World Heritage Centre requesting the State Party of Guinea to provide additional information, and it is recommended that the Committee request the States Parties to also provide a full ESIA, assessing the potential impacts of this project on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in accordance with the IUCN World Heritage Advice Note on Environmental Assessment.

It is also appropriate that the Committee reiterate its request to the two States Parties to establish, in close cooperation with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, the proposal for the DSOCR and all the corresponding indicators.

Considering the mining issue, the issue of the road, the need to develop a DSOCR and that the last Reactive Monitoring mission dates from 2012, it is recommended that the Committee request the States Parties to invite a joint World Heritage Centre / IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission.

Finally, it is recommended that the Committee maintain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.46

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.6**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Warmly welcomes the continued efforts of the State Party of Côte d'Ivoire to conduct anti-poaching patrols as well as ecological monitoring and requests the States Parties of Côte d'Ivoire and Guinea to provide additional information on the analysis of the data gathered during the surveillance patrols and the ecological monitoring, to enable an evaluation of the tendencies of anthropogenic activities, including poaching, and that of the populations of the key species in the property;
4. Also warmly welcomes the funding obtained to enable the implementation of the management functions of the Ivorian component of the property, expresses its concern as regards the level of formal trans-border collaboration and reiterates its request to the States Parties to develop trans-border management for the property and notably the necessary harmonization of ecological monitoring and the establishment of joint surveillance operations, and to prepare a follow-up of the Nimba Project on the entire property to promote the implementation of the corrective measures;
5. Takes note of the confirmation by the State Party of Côte d'Ivoire that no degraded area would be excluded from the Ivorian component of the property during the redefinition of the boundaries of the Reserve and also requests the State Party of Côte d'Ivoire to submit to the World Heritage Centre a high-resolution map of the updated boundaries.
6. Regrets that the report of the State Party of Guinea does not clearly distinguish the obsolete information from the current information concerning the implementation of the corrective measures;
7. Takes note of the information provided by the State Party of Guinea that all mining activities of the WAE and SMFG Companies have now been suspended and that the permit granted to the SAMA Resources Company has been withdrawn since 2014 and also reiterates its request that no new mining exploration and exploitation permits located around the property be granted without a Strategic Environmental Impact Assessment (SEIA) being carried out to evaluate the impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, including the accumulative effects of these projects;
8. Also regrets that the States Parties have provided no information concerning the road development project to facilitate transport within the Mano River Union, that would include tarmacking the Lola route (Guinea) – Danané (Côte d'Ivoire) passing by Mount Nimba, and further requests the States Parties:
 - a) to provide additional information concerning this project,
 - b) to ensure that the impacts of the project on the OUV of the property are assessed in the framework of an Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA), in conformity with the IUCN World Heritage Advice Note on Environmental Assessment,
 - c) to submit, as soon as possible, a copy of this ESIA to the World Heritage Centre for examination by IUCN ;

9. Further reiterates its request the States Parties to develop, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, a proposed Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and all the corresponding indicators;
10. Moreover requests the States Parties to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, to assess the state of conservation of the property, to update the corrective measures, propose a timetable for their implementation, develop a proposed DSOOCR, and evaluate the current state of the different mining projects surrounding the property;
11. Finally requests the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
12. **Decides to retain Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d'Ivoire/Guinea) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

Note : the following reports on the World Heritage properties of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) need to be read in conjunction with Item 52 below.

50. Salonga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 280)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1984

Criteria (vii)(ix)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 1999-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Impact due to conflict
- Increased poaching and illegal encroachment affecting the integrity of the site

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Proposed in the 2012 mission report. However, core indicators of the results of the inventory of flagship species still needs to be quantified in view of the adoption of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) by the Committee

Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4575>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/280/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 9 (from 1985-2000)

Total amount approved: USD 149,900

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/280/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 320,000 from the United Nations Foundation and the Governments of Italy and Belgium

Previous monitoring missions

2007 and 2012: Joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring missions

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Armed conflict, lack of security and political instability
- Poaching by the army and armed groups
- Conflicts with local communities concerning Park boundaries
- Impact of villages located within the property

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/280/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 February 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report of the property, available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/136/documents/>, which provides the following information:

- Improvement in the security situation has enabled the resumption of surveillance activities. Some elements of the Armed Forces of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (FARDC), having participated in the 'Operation Bonobo', support the Park and participate in the mixed patrols. A military training for 140 guards is foreseen in 2018;
- The meetings of the Site Coordination Committee (CoCoSi) continue to involve the provincial authorities and other stakeholders in the management of the property. Awareness-raising campaigns have been carried out in the different provinces to involve authorities in the anti-poaching combat (LAB), agricultural development, breeding and tourism;
- A participatory Development and Management Plan (PAG) was developed and approved, as well as a surveillance strategy and a triennial action plan (2017-2019), that define the priority activities for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger. Surveillance has been strengthened thanks to the acquisition of equipment and the construction of infrastructures. The area covered represents 56.2% of the property, demonstrating progress since 2015 (42%) and 2016 (52%). The LAB has led to the arrest of 81 persons, the destruction of 513 camps and 8,144 traps, the seizure of eleven fire arms, 20 spears and 114 machetes, as well as 20 pirogues and 86 nets. In 2017, ten guards were sworn in as police officers;
- The biological inventory for the northern block was terminated in 2017; those for the southern block and the corridor are ongoing. The bonobo populations in the northern block are provisionally estimated at 8,746 and those of the elephants at 767;
- The demarcation of the boundaries will resume in 2018. A Memorandum of Understanding must be signed in 2018 with the fishermen to guarantee the sustainable management of the activity. 172,807 hectares of communal forests have been created in the south-east part of the property, acting as a buffer zone;
- Although there has not been an official census for several years, the demographic data available at Monkoto indicates an increase in the population of 130,610 inhabitants in 2017, 80% of which live in the biological corridor. This increase has caused the slight increase in deforestation, fishing and strong pressure on bush meat poaching. Several economic development programmes are being implemented to reduce pressure on the property;
- The participatory process for the clarification of customary land has enabled the preparation of proposed boundaries for the ecological continuum of the corridor;
- The managers of the property, with support from the Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS), have begun a process for the voluntary relocation of the Yaelima communities outside the Park ;
- The ecological monitoring of the baïa, and the placing of cameras have enabled sighting of most of the flagship species, including the buffalo and the elephant.

The State Party notes that on 1 February 2018, oil exploration permits were attributed in the Central Basin by Presidential decree.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The efforts of the State Party to ensure the involvement of the different stakeholders in the management of the property and the increase in level of coverage are warmly welcomed. However, it should be noted that during the 41st session of the Committee in 2017, the State Party had reported a 60% level of surveillance coverage in 2016, while it is now 56.2%. The implementation of the surveillance strategy and the triennial action plan are positive signs of progress.

The attribution of three petroleum exploration concessions in the Central Basin is extremely worrying. Other blocks could also be attributed which would mean that the property would be covered by petroleum concessions. It is therefore recommended that the Committee express its utmost concern with regard to this matter and that it reiterates its position regarding the incompatibility of oil exploration and exploitation with World Heritage status. It is also recommended that the Committee urgently request the State Party to cancel these licenses and not to attribute new ones within the property and its periphery, as it could cause negative and irreversible impacts on its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV).

The preliminary results of the biological inventories in the northern block are encouraging. However, it is clear that the elephant population has been greatly reduced, the potential population of the property being estimated at 14,000. As the inventories are still ongoing, it is not possible to draw definite conclusions. Therefore, it is recommended that the Committee reiterate its request to the State Party to submit the final results of the inventories, as and when they are available, and also to submit a Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) that quantifies the indicators.

The clarification provided by the State Party as regards the demographic explosion in the biological corridor of the property is noted. The State Party notes that in the region of Kasai, the arrival of outside poachers has increased bush meat traffic. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to continue the local development programmes to reduce this pressure and strengthen surveillance at Kasai, notably by installing a permanent patrol post.

The proposed boundaries for the ecological continuum in the corridor, respecting the customary land, reflect positive progress. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party, as soon as these boundaries have been legally determined, to undertake the necessary measures to protect the ecological corridor. It is also recommended that the Committee reiterate its request to the State Party to study other possibilities to improve the connectivity between the “sustainable conservation zones” and the southern components of the property.

The efforts of the State Party and the WCS to initiate a displacement process of the Yaelima communities outside of the Park are noted. It is important that it ensures that this process is voluntary and in accordance with the provisions of the *Convention* and the relative international standards, including the principles of prior consent, given freely and with full knowledge of the facts (CPLCC), fair compensation, access to social services and the preservation of cultural rights.

It is recommended that the Committee reiterates its request to the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to assess the state of conservation of the property, update the corrective measures, establish a timetable for their implementation and finalize the DSOCR. It is recommended that the Committee maintain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger and continue to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.50

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.10**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Warmly welcomes the efforts of the State Party in implementing the corrective measures, in particular the involvement of the stakeholders in the management of the property and the implementation of a surveillance strategy and a triennial action plan and requests the State Party to continue these efforts;

4. Expresses its utmost concern as regards the attribution of three oil concessions within the property and the possible attribution of other blocks that would cover the entire property, reiterates its established position that oil exploration and exploitation are incompatible with World Heritage status;
5. Urges the State Party to cancel the current oil concessions that encroach part of the property and to prohibit the attribution of new concessions within the property and its periphery that could have negative and irreversible impacts on its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to submit all the inventory results for all the flagship species to the World Heritage Centre, as soon as they are available;
7. Takes note of the information provided by the State Party concerning demographic explosion in the biological corridor of the property and also requests the State Party to:
 - a) continue to implement the local development programmes to reduce pressure on the natural resources of the property,
 - b) strengthen surveillance at Kasai, notably by installing a permanent patrol post, to halt poaching and bush meat trafficking;
8. Also takes note of the proposed boundaries for the ecological continuum in the corridor and further requests the States Party, once the boundaries have been legally determined, to undertake the necessary measures to ensure the protection of this ecological continuum and also reiterates its request to the State Party to study other possibilities to improve the connectivity between the “sustainable conservation zones” and the southern components of the property;
9. Further takes note of the efforts of the State Party to initiate a voluntary relocation of the Yaelima communities outside the Park, and requests furthermore the State Party to ensure that this process is voluntary and in accordance with the provisions of the Convention and the pertinent international standards, including the principles of prior consent, given freely and with full knowledge of the facts (CPLCC), fair compensation, access to social services and the preservation of cultural rights;
10. Requests moreover the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to assess the state of conservation of the property, update the corrective measures and prepare a timetable for their implementation and finalize the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR);
11. Finally, requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
12. Decides to continue to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism to the property;
13. Also decides to retain Salonga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

51. Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 63)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1979

Criteria (vii)(viii)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 1994-present



Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Increased poaching of wildlife
- Incapability of staff to patrol the 650 km long boundary of the Park
- Massive influx of 1 million refugees occupying adjacent parts of the Park
- Widespread depletion of forests in the lowlands

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4338>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted in 2011, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4338>

Revised in 2014, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/5979>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Proposed for adoption in the draft Decision below

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/63/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 10 (from 1980-2005)

Total amount approved: USD 268,560

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/63/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 1,802,300 from the United Nations Foundation and the Governments of Italy, Belgium and Spain as well as the Rapid Response Facility (RRF)

Previous monitoring missions

April 1996 - March 2006 - December 2010: World Heritage Centre Reactive Monitoring mission; August 2007: joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reinforced Monitoring mission; March 2014: joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN/Ramsar Reactive Monitoring mission; April 2018: joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Armed conflict, lack of security and political instability
- Attribution of a petroleum exploration permit inside the property
- Poaching by the army (issue resolved) and armed groups
- Encroachment
- Extension of illegal fishing areas
- Deforestation, charcoal production and cattle grazing

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/63/>

Current conservation issues

On 15 February 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report. A joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring Mission visited the property from 23 to 27 April 2018. These reports are available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/63/documents>. The State Party reports the following:

- Cooperation between the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN) and the Armed Forces of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (FARDC) continues and joint patrols, under the command of ICCN, ensure the protection of civilians;

- The property is facing serious security problems, despite this, guards are deployed in all sectors of the Park, with the exception of the northern part occupied by the militia. Several rebel groups have attacked different sectors of the property (southern and western shores of Lake Edward, north and south sectors). To thwart these threats, the Park employs 740 guards. Since July 2017, 11 guards and one ICCN driver have been killed during attacks carried out at the property;
- The level of coverage by ground patrols is about 30.5% of the entire property. It concentrates on biodiversity “hot spots” and tourist areas. Aerial surveillance is daily and covers the whole property. These efforts have enabled ICCN to arrest about 1,500 persons who were carrying out illegal activities (charcoal production, fishing, etc.) and to bring to justice 318 cases of illegal activities;
- The percentage of occupied zones of the property is 20.9% (against 25% in 2016). This ratio remains high, but slightly reduced thanks to awareness raising efforts by ICCN, that multiplies the economic development projects with the aid of Alliance Virunga;
- ICCN continues its efforts to control fishing at Lake Edward and ensure the management of fish resources. The Park has begun the construction of electric fencing to protect the “ecological corridor” between the property and the Queen Elizabeth National Park, in Uganda. The objective is to protect wildlife in this area and to limit new encroachments;
- The development of economic activities around the Park enables pacifying relations with the communities. The Park invests in three sectors: agriculture, tourism and hydro-electricity that has enabled the creation of several thousand direct and indirect jobs;
- Despite a decrease, the illegal exploitation of wood continues and remains of major concern;
- The population of different species in the property that has experienced an increase in recent years, is once again under pressure because of fast-growing poaching by armed groups. Between 200 to 300 elephants, of which 9 were poached in 2017. The population of hippopotamus, that increased from 1,450 in 2013 to 2,400 in 2015, has diminished again to 1,850. The Mountain gorilla population appears to be on the increase. The last international census in the three countries of the Virunga massif was carried out in February 2016 and the results should have been available in February-March 2018. The population of the DRC is estimated of 300 individuals. The habituated gorilla population numbers 126 individuals and experiences an average annual increase rate of 4-5%;
- No petroleum activity has been reported.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

Insecurity caused by the presence of armed groups continues to threaten the functioning of the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV). Despite ICCN efforts, armed groups regularly attack the property and its staff and carry out various illegal activities (poaching, illicit fishing and charcoal production). A joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring Mission visited the Park following the attack of 9 April 2018 that claimed 9 victims. It noted the considerable efforts deployed by ICCN during special operations carried out after this ambush to re-establish order around Lake Edward and repel the militia.

However, the issue of security remains a major concern, because it continues to affect most of the Democratic Republic of the Congo’s (DRC) properties (see General Decision **42 COM 7A.52**). A new attack took place, on 13 May 2018, where armed assailants targeted an ICCN car with tourists: a guard died of her injuries, the tourists were kidnapped and were released safely two days later. Following this dramatic incident, the Park decided to halt tourism as a precaution until early June. It is recommended that the Committee address its sincere condolences to the families of the guards who have lost their lives. It is also recommended that it reiterates its utmost concern as regards the involvement of armed bands in the illegal exploitation of natural resources of the property and as regards the interruption of tourism that could impact the Park’s revenue. It could also call upon international community to provide financial support to the property.

In spite of this context, surveillance activities continue thanks to the presence of the guards and management efforts. However, the guards cannot be deployed in all the sectors, thus the evacuation of the rebel groups and the re-establishment of order are the conditions *sine qua non* to ensure an adequate surveillance of the property and fully protect its OUV.

Encroachment remains a major concern, even if it remains stable, thanks to the continued efforts of the Park authorities in rebuffing all new installation initiatives. The mission further noted that the methodology to calculate encroachment of the area for agricultural activities had changed and data was more precise than previously. Encroachment of such a large area of the property affects its integrity. It is hoped that

the efforts of the State Party in delimiting the borders and the gain of control of certain sectors by ICCN will enable the relocation of these populations outside the Park, whilst proposing alternative subsistence means thanks to the activities of the Alliance Virunga.

Illegal exploitation of wood and illegal fishing still represent important threats to the natural resources of the property. A specific action plan for charcoal will be prepared in 2018 and ICCN continues the establishment of alternative energy.

Innovative activities for the economic and social development of north Kivu initiated by Alliance Virunga are greatly appreciated and are a model to be followed, combining nature conservation and sustainable development. The State Party should be congratulated for the progress achieved to improve the level of living standards of the populations, by promoting economic development that respects the property.

The increase in poaching that has had an impact on the elephants and hippopotamus is worrying. It is hoped that evacuation activities of the armed groups and the establishment of electric fencing on an axe of 100 km can have positive results on the increase of these populations. Biological inventories will be carried out in 2018 to enable the assessment of biological tendencies of the flagship species.

With regard to the petroleum exploration project, the State Party notes that no petroleum activity has been observed. However, the World Heritage Centre has received information that a proposal from the Ministry of Hydrocarbon to review the boundaries of the Park in order to allow petroleum exploitation has been submitted for study by the Government (cf. General Decision **42 COM 7A.52**). For this reason, it is also recommended that the Committee reiterates its position according to which petroleum exploration and exploitation are incompatible with World Heritage status. The World Heritage Centre and IUCN emphasise that modifications to the boundaries of the property should not be proposed in order to facilitate an extractive activity.

It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to implement the corrective measures and the timetable (by 2023) established by the 2018 April mission. As soon as the results of the wildlife inventories are available, the State Party must assess the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) adopted in its Decision **36 COM 7A.4**. It is recommended that the Committee maintain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger and continue the application of the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.51

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.11**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),*
3. *Addresses its most sincere condolences to the families of the guards killed in the exercise of their functions and to all the staff of the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN);*
4. *Commends the efforts of ICCN in reinforcing surveillance, notably through the increase in the number of guards, but expresses its utmost concern as to persistent insecurity in certain sectors of the property that has led to continuing illegal activities by armed groups (poaching, illegal fishing and production of charcoal) threatening the safety of staff that resulted to halt tourism and call upon the international community to provide financial support to the property;*
5. *Expresses its concern in the face of serious threats that continue to affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in particular encroachment by illegal implantations, illegal fishing, exploitation of wood and poaching, and requests the State Party to continue these efforts in the implementation of the corrective measures;*

6. *Recalls that the re-establishment of law and order and ICCN authority is the sine qua non to improve security conditions, regain control of the occupied areas and call a halt to illegal exploitation of the natural resources of the property;*
7. *Congratulates the State Party for the sustainable development activities established in the framework of the Alliance Virunga to improve the life of local communities and encourages it to continue this innovative model combining nature conservation and sustainable development;*
8. *Expresses its deepest concern as regards the proposal of the Ministry of Hydrocarbons to modify the boundaries of the property to authorize petroleum exploitation activities, reiterates its request to the State Party not to attribute petroleum exploration permits in Virunga National Park and reiterates again its position according to which all mining, petroleum and gas exploration and exploitation is incompatible with World Heritage status, policy supported by the commitments undertaken by the leaders of industry, such as Shell and Total, not to engage in such activities in World Heritage properties;*
9. *Takes note of the recommendations done by the 2018 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, and also requests the State Party to implement the corrective measures, as updated by the mission, by 2023, as follows:*
 - a) *Reaffirm and re-establish ICCN authority as the principal national authority within the Park territory and ensure cooperation with the other competent authorities, including the Armed Forces and legal authorities, to guarantee the efficacy of its actions,*
 - b) *Continue to re-establish law and order enforcement by neutralizing the action of armed groups and contain their hold on the civilian populations and the illegal exploitation of natural resources,*
 - c) *Encourage transborder operational activities with Uganda to ensure the protection and circulation of itinerant species, such as the elephant,*
 - d) *Fight against the illegal traffic of charcoal organized from the Park, and promote alternative energies to satisfy the domestic and economic needs of the local populations,*
 - e) *Combat illegal encroachment by reaffirming the Park boundaries, halting agricultural activities inside the Park, and promoting economic development in its periphery,*
 - f) *Ensure protection of the fishery resources and the ecosystems of Lake Edward by combating illegal fishing, re-establishing governance of the property and promoting sustainable fish exploitation beneficial to the local communities,*
 - g) *Continue the anti-poaching combat that feeds international traffickers and the local bush meat commerce,*
 - h) *No attribution of petroleum exploitation concessions to be granted within the property,*
 - i) *Pursue and strengthen implementation of the “Alliance Virunga” programme as a leverage for development and pacification for the benefit of local populations through eco-tourism, renewable energy and sustainable agriculture,*
 - j) *Pursue efforts to ensure the professional and long-term management of the property by providing technical and financial means to the management authority to attain this objective;*

10. *Further requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2019, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;*
11. *Decides to continue to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism for the property;*
12. *Also decides to maintain Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.*

52. General Decision on the properties of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC)

Current conservation issues

On 15 February 2018, the State Party submitted a report on the state of implementation of Decision **41 COM 7A.12**. This report is available at the address: http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/42COM/documents/#state_of_conservationreports and provides the following information:

- Progress accomplished in the implementation of the 2011 Kinshasa Declaration and the corrective measures for each property are described in the individual reports (see Documents WHC/18/42.COM/7A and WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add);
- Collaboration between the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN) and the Armed Forces of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (FARDC) has been strengthened in order to increase security in the protected areas. Moreover, numerous measures have been undertaken by the Chief of State or other state institutions to reinforce ICCN's institutional capacities, such as the revision of salary scales for the guards or the transfer of responsibility for the implementation of CITES (Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species and Wild Fauna and Flora) to improve combat against the illegal traffic of wild species;
- A large quantity of law-enforcement equipment have been provided to ICCN to strengthen the operational capacities of the Park guards ;
- No petroleum activity is envisaged in Virunga National Park and the SOCO Society has closed down its office in the DRC. However, on 1 February 2018, the President of the Republic has approved, by presidential decree, petroleum exploration permits in the Salonga National Park; the three blocks concerned cover a part of the property;
- In December 2017, the Prime Minister approved authorization to activate the Trust Fund « Okapi Funds for Conservation – FOCON » for sustainable funding of the protected areas in the DRC;
- The Corps responsible for security of the National Parks (CorPPN) and the related natural reserves, created in June 2015, is not operational due to lack of financial resources, thus delaying approval of the presidential decree for its creation. The Ministry of Defence and ICCN have, nevertheless, appointed their representatives.

Analysis and conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The efforts of ICCN to implement the Kinshasa Declaration and the corrective measures in each of the properties as well as strengthening its collaboration with the FARDC and the different state institutions are favourably welcomed. Commendable progress has also been made with the law-enforcement equipment made available to improve security for the guards.

Insecurity caused by the presence of armed groups and various militia continue to threaten the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of most of the properties located in eastern DRC. In particular, it has a heavy human impact and in this respect, it is relevant to recall that the year 2017 was extremely tragic for ICCN staff. Twenty-one guards and a driver were killed in the Okapi Wildlife Reserve and in the Virunga National Park and many others were seriously injured. They were killed during attacks and ambushes deliberately targeting the ICCN staff. At the Kahuzi-Biega National Park, a team of 27 ICCN

agents were kidnapped last March for more than a month by a group of militia. It is recommended that the Committee strongly condemn this violence, address its condolences to the families of the victims and ICCN staff and that it expresses its utmost concern as regards the continuing insecurity in and around most of the properties located in eastern DRC.

The delay engendered in the deployment of the CorPPN contingent is regrettable. It is recommended that the Committee reiterates its request to the State Party to provide human and financial means to enable it to become operational, and that it also requests the State Party to implement, in conformity with the Kinshasa Declaration, all means to establish security conditions for the ICCN staff to fulfil their mission under adequate conditions and without risk of life.

Concerning the issue of petroleum exploration, the State Party has informed the World Heritage Centre of the attribution of the three blocks that encroach a part of Salonga National Park. Other blocks should soon be attributed; if they were attributed, they would cover the total area of the property. Furthermore, the World Heritage Centre was informed in May of a proposal made in March 2018 by the Ministry of Hydrocarbons to its government of degazettement, at the national level of one or several zones of the Virunga and Salonga National Parks, to carry out petroleum explorations. It is noted that a partial reclassification of these Parks unilaterally decided by the State Party would question the legal protection of the properties. This legal protection is one of the three components of the OUV. Moreover, modifications to the boundaries of the World Heritage properties linked to extractive industries must be treated through the procedure applied for major modifications to boundaries, in conformity with Paragraph 165 of the *Operational Guidelines*, taking into account the potential impact of these projects on the OUV. Furthermore, this proposal is in contradiction to the Kinshasa Declaration that is committed to maintaining the protection status of the properties. It is therefore recommended that the Committee expresses its utmost concern regarding this issue and that it reiterates its position concerning the incompatibility of oil exploration and exploitation with World Heritage status. It is also recommended that the Committee urge the State Party to cancel these concessions and to attribute no new ones in Salonga National Park and its periphery. It is recommended that the Committee reiterates its deep concern as regards the proposal of degazettement one or several zones of the Salonga and Virunga National Parks to authorize petroleum exploration and that it recalls that modifications made to the boundaries of the World Heritage properties must be made in conformity with the provisions of the *Operational Guidelines* and must be based on strengthening the OUV of the properties, rather than facilitating extractive activities.

The efforts of the State Party to render the FOCON Trust Fund operational are warmly welcomed. It is recommended that the Committee congratulate the State Party for this important progress and encourages it, as well as the donors, to provide this Fund with adequate financial means to respond to the needs of the protected areas and the DRC World Heritage properties.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.52

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 7A.12**, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017) and reaffirming the need to implement the Kinshasa Declaration adopted in 2011,
3. Expresses its concern regarding continued insecurity in and around the properties located in the eastern part of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), condemns the violence perpetrated against the guards and the staff of the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN), killed in the line of duty, and addresses its most sincere condolences to their families and all the ICCN staff;
4. Regrets the delay experienced in the establishment of the Corps responsible for the security of the National Parks and relevant protected areas (CorPPN) and requests the State Party to provide, without delay, financial means to enable the deployment of contingents in the sites to render them secure and combat the different armed groups;

5. Expresses its utmost concern as regards the attribution of blocks for oil exploration in the Central Basin of the DRC, that covers several sectors of Salonga National Park, reiterates with insistence its request to the State Party to cancel these concessions and to undertake a commitment not to authorize any new oil exploration and exploitation within the boundaries of the property, and reiterates its position according to which all oil and gas exploration and exploitation is incompatible with World Heritage status;
6. Expresses its deep concern again as to the proposal by the Ministry of Hydrocarbons of degazettement at the national level of one or several zones of Salonga and Virunga National Parks to authorize petroleum exploration activities and recalls that modifications made to the boundaries of World Heritage properties relating to extractive industries must be carried out in conformity with the procedures applied to major modifications of boundaries set out in Paragraph 165 of the Operational Guidelines, taking account of the potential impact of such projects on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
7. Also recalls that any proposal for modification to the boundaries of a World Heritage property must be based on strengthening its OUV and should not be proposed with the aim of facilitating extractive activities;
8. Commends the efforts of the State Party to make operational the Trust Fund for protected areas in the DRC, namely the « Okapi Funds for Conservation – FOCON », and also requests the State Party, as well as the donor community, to provide it with adequate financial means to respond to the needs of the protected areas and the World Heritage properties of the DRC;
9. Further requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, a detailed report on the implementation of the Kinshasa Declaration, the security situation in the properties, and the status of the oil exploration and exploitation concessions that encroach on World Heritage properties, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019.



53. Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) (N 1257)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2007

Criteria (ix)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2010-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Illegal logging of precious wood species (ebony and rosewood) and its secondary impacts, and poaching of endangered lemurs were identified as threats for the site's integrity

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4344>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4344>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Adopted, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4344>

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1257/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 3 (from 2000-2016)

Total amount approved: USD 155,000

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1257/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 1,890,000 from the United Nations Foundation and the Nordic World Heritage Foundation; USD 1,039,000 from the Government of Norway

Previous monitoring missions

May 2011, September-October 2015: Joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring missions

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Encroachment
- Fire
- Hunting and poaching
- Artisanal mining
- Illegal logging
- Governance
- Engagement of local communities

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1257/>

Current conservation issues

On 13 February 2018, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, a summary of which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1257/documents/>. On 10 April 2018, the State Party submitted additional information on the implementation of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) recommendations, including a stock audit and business plan, and on 23 April 2018, a summary of its activities in implementing the corrective measures. The State Party reports the following:

- Implementation of the CITES Action Plan and the Biodiversity Management Plan is continuing, with over 50 filed court cases of traffickers and seizures of over 600 palissandre logs. Members of the Special Court have been nominated;
- A partnership agreement was signed between the Ministry of Environment, Ecology and Forests and the Regional Maritime Information Fusion Center (CRFIM) for satellite surveillance of illegal exports of precious woods by sea, leading to the arrests of 12 suspects and the seizure of 363 rosewood logs;
- A stock audit of rosewoods and ebonies declared since November 2017 identified over 30,000 logs of precious wood. An identification guide for 20 *Dalbergia*, 20 *Diospyros*, and 10 similar species has been published;
- In 2017, more than 98% of the property was covered by patrols for surveillance and ecological monitoring, in part supported by International Assistance. The use of SMART (Spatial Monitoring and Reporting Tool) is reported to have led to a decrease in forest clearance in Andohahela National Park;
- In 2017, 131 ha of forest have been restored. Two projects under the Forest Ecosystem Restoration Initiative (FERI) and the Global Environment Facility (GEF) aim for further forest restoration, and to increase local community engagement;
- Illegal logging of precious woods decreased in 2017 (78 cases) compared to 2016 (99 cases). Pressure is shifting from rosewoods to palissandres, but remains far below the 2009 level;
- Signs of poaching are decreasing, with 44 new lemur traps found in 2017 compared to 65 in 2016;
- Illegal gold mining in Ranomafana National Park is reported to have increased in 2016 compared to 2015;

- In addition to the existing mechanisms for shared governance and monitoring, a number of community-based education and livelihood activities have been initiated, and communities impacted by the creation or extension of protected areas within the ecological corridors between the components of the property will be compensated.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The continued efforts by the State Party to implement the corrective measures are appreciated. The surveillance, ecological monitoring and restoration of degraded areas within the property have been continued, and the new FERI and GEF projects are welcome additions to enhance these efforts and increase community involvement. In addition to the priority areas for restoration, the State Party should also report on the total area remaining to be restored. The cases of illegal logging and lemur poaching are reported to have decreased since 2016, but no major changes can be detected to the overall fluctuating trend since 2009. Limited information is available on the results of ecological monitoring to assess the status of the species impacted by illegal logging and poaching. It is unclear whether the shift from rosewoods to palissandres is linked to a reduction in illegal rosewood logging or rather a reflection of the fact that rosewood has become extremely rare within the property.

While the reported decrease in forest clearance in the property, notably in Andohahela National Park is noted, the State Party does not provide clear data to support this finding. Recalling that in its previous report, the State Party noted an increase in forest clearance in 2016 in Masoala and Andohahela National Parks, it is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to provide further information on the deforestation rates for each component of the property since 2009, including an analysis of satellite imagery.

The continued implementation of the CITES Action Plan and the Biodiversity Management Plan is noted. The publication of an identification guide for *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* species is a welcome development that should support capacity building of customs officers and other authorities to identify illegal exports of these species. The partnership agreement between the Ministry of Environment, Ecology and Forests and the CRFIM is likewise a welcome development. During its 69th meeting in November 2017, the CITES Standing Committee decided to maintain the embargo on the trade and exports of the CITES-listed species. The finalization by the State Party of a stock audit plan of *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* species is positive progress, and its implementation remains critical to prevent any illegal exports and trade. It needs to be stipulated that the CITES Standing Committee also noted that Madagascar did not provide an audited inventory of at least a third of the stockpiles of logs, sawn wood and veneer sheets of the species of *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* in Madagascar, as was requested in CITES Decision 17.204. The numbers of court cases and logs seized and the volume of stockpiles audited since November 2017 demonstrate that the illegal trade of precious wood species from Madagascar remains a persistent threat to the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and will likely remain as long as the issue of illegal stockpiles is not addressed. At the same time the operational efficiency of the regulatory framework to act against illegal logging and export has been limited, as reported by the 2017 CITES mission. It is therefore recommended that the Committee urge the State Party to strengthen its control and enforcement measures, and strongly encourage it to implement the CITES Decision 17.204 and all recommendations of the CITES Standing Committee.

The increasing threat from illegal gold mining at Ranomafana National Park is of significant concern. Recalling that the State Party in its previous report to the Committee noted that a five-year Action Plan on illegal mining at Ranomafana National park was being developed, it is recommended that the Committee request an update on the status of the Action Plan and its implementation.

Considering that further efforts are still required to meet the indicators for the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), it is recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.53

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A.Add,
2. Recalling Decision 41 COM 7A.14 adopted at its 41st session (Kraków, 2017),

3. Appreciates the State Party's continued efforts to implement the corrective measures, including for surveillance, ecological monitoring and restoration of degraded areas, welcomes the new Forest Ecosystem Restoration Initiative (FERI) and Global Environment Facility (GEF) projects on forest restoration and strengthening local community involvement, and requests the State Party to continue implementing the corrective measures, and to report on the results of ecological monitoring and remaining sites to be rehabilitated;
4. Noting the reported decrease in the 2017 deforestation rate, notably in Andohahela National Park, and also recalling the increase in the 2016 deforestation rates of Andohahela and Masoala National Parks, also requests the State Party to provide further information on deforestation rates for each component of the property since 2009, including an analysis of satellite imagery;
5. Also noting the State Party's efforts to implement the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) Action Plan and Biodiversity Management Plan, considers that the numbers of court cases and logs seized and the volume of stocks audited since November 2017 demonstrate that the illegal trade of precious wood species from Madagascar remains a persistent threat to the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), urges the State Party to strengthen its control and enforcement measures against illegal logging and export, and strongly encourages it to implement the CITES Decision 17.204 and all recommendations of the CITES Standing Committee;
6. Notes with significant concern that gold mining is becoming an increasingly severe threat to Ranomafana National Park, and further requests the State Party to provide an update on the status of the five-year Action Plan on illegal mining and its implementation;
7. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
8. **Decides to retain Rainforest of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

56. Selous Game Reserve (United Republic of Tanzania) (N 199bis)



Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1982

Criteria (ix)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2014-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Poaching and the ensuing dramatic declines in elephant populations, and the effects thereof on the ecosystem

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

In progress

Corrective measures identified

In progress

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

In progress

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/199/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 3 (from 1984-1999)

Total amount approved: USD 67,980

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/199/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

N/A

Previous monitoring missions

June 2007, November 2008 and December 2013: Joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring missions. February 2017: IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Significant decline of wildlife populations due to poaching
- Insufficient funding and management
- Mineral and hydrocarbon prospecting and mining
- Tourism management and development
- Proposed dam development
- Operationalizing the uranium mining project
- Lack of disaster preparedness
- Need for buffer zone
- Need for increased involvement of local communities
- Alien invasive species

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/199/>

Current conservation issues

On 31 January 2018, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property, available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/199/documents/> with the following information:

- The Selous Ecosystem Conservation and Development (SECAD) project, implemented by the State Party with the Frankfurt Zoological Society (FZS), WWF and funded by the German Development Bank (KfW), was launched on 17 June 2017. To date, it has mainly focused on law enforcement. Its five-year plan, still under development, will prioritize the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan (EAP) and review of the 2005–2015 General Management Plan;
- The Government of China will support capacity-building to strengthen anti-poaching efforts;
- Poaching has been significantly reduced, with the State Party reporting only five elephant carcasses in 2017 (compared to more than 100 in 2012/13);
- While the aerial census of large mammals had to be postponed until 2018, the preliminary findings of the 2017 elephant demographic study show that 90% of the counted individuals were in cow-calf groups, with 25% in the 0-5 age group. An elephant collaring programme was started as part of the SECAD project;
- The rhino monitoring launched in July 2017 indicates the presence of small numbers of rhinos;
- A draft five-year action plan developed by Tanzania and Mozambique to protect the Selous-Niassa corridor is still awaiting approval and funding;
- The State Party has confirmed its decision to develop the Stiegler's Gorge hydropower project to address increasing energy demands;
- The implementation of the Mkuju River Uranium Mining Project has been suspended for two years as a result of the low prices for the commodity on the world market;

- A study on the flooding regime for the Kidunda dam was conducted and will be integrated in the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) and sent to the World Heritage Centre when it is available;
- The potential impacts of the Kito-1 oil and gas prospection project in the Kilombero Valley floodplain, a Ramsar site adjacent to the property, are acknowledged but test drilling did not start in 2017 because the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) had not been approved. The EIA will include a study on the hydrological regime of the floodplain.
- The draft Desired state of conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) will be submitted after the baseline data for the elephant population is in place;
- Stakeholder consultations are underway to extend the boundaries of the property to the Mbarika Mountains in line with Decision **36 COM 8B.43**.

The World Heritage Centre sent two letters to the State Party: one dated 8 August 2017 regarding its decision to move ahead with the Stiegler's Gorge dam despite the Committee's concern, and one dated 11 September 2017 to request further information on the public bidding process to construct the dam. On 26 January 2018, the UNESCO Director-General sent a letter to the President of the United Republic of Tanzania to express concern about the dam project. On 9 May 2018, the World Heritage Centre and IUCN were informed about the tender document published by Tanzania Forest Service Agency on 25 April 2018 for the sale of standing trees equivalent to 143 638 ha within the property (see <http://www.tfs.go.tz/en/resources/category/tenders-and-vacancies>).

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

Recalling the Committee's position that the construction of dams with large reservoirs within the boundaries of World Heritage properties is incompatible with World Heritage status (Decision **40 COM 7**), the recent developments related to the Stiegler's Gorge project, and in particular the tendering of logging rights for 143 638 ha at the proposed location of the hydropower dam within the property, are of utmost concern. There is little doubt that the complete deforestation of such a large area within the property will lead to irreversible damage to its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV). In addition, various studies indicate the dam could threaten the long-term availability of water resources and have detrimental impacts on the downstream Rufiji–Mafia–Kilwa Marine Ramsar Site and the livelihoods of up to 200,000 people. In spite of a previous commitment by the State Party (Decision **38 COM 7B.95**), there is no information that a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) is being conducted, even though the bidding processes to identify a contractor for the dam and for the logging are underway. It is noted that Tanzanian environmental legislation also specifically requires an SEA to be undertaken for any hydropower or mining development. As part of the approval of the boundary modification in 2012, the State Party explicitly committed to not undertake any development activities within Selous and its buffer zone without prior approval of the Committee (Decision **36 COM 8B.43**).

It is therefore recommended that the Committee urge the State Party not to proceed with the planned logging and any other activities related to the Stiegler's Gorge hydropower project, which will affect the property's OUV and whose impacts will be difficult to reverse, prior to undertaking a comprehensive SEA to the highest international standards. The SEA should identify the cumulative impacts of the project on the property and its wider landscape, and to consider alternative options to meet Tanzania's power generation needs. Large-scale deforestation within the property clearly represents a potential danger to the property in accordance with Paragraph 180 of the *Operational Guidelines*. It is therefore recommended that the Committee add this issue to the justification for the continued inclusion of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger. It is further recommended that the Committee request the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring Mission to the property to review the status of the Stiegler's Gorge hydropower project, assess the state of conservation of the property and assist the State Party in finalizing the DSOCR.

The launch of the SECAD project and its contribution to the implementation of the EAP are welcomed. As it is unclear which activities are currently underway and which remain unfunded, a detailed progress report on implementation is required. The support from China is also welcomed, and it is recommended that these efforts be aligned with the EAP.

Law enforcement efforts appear to have reduced poaching, but this would have to be confirmed through detailed information on the data collection and an aerial census. Whilst the preliminary results of the elephant demographic survey show a positive reproduction rate, caution is needed to extrapolate such

findings for the entire property. Details of the study and its methodology should be provided (e.g. information on the selection of the surveyed groups, comparison to previous demographic studies, and the classification used to explain why all individuals within the 0-5 age group were counted as female). As recommended by the 2017 mission, it is advisable to count the individuals younger than 1 year old as a separate age group due to their higher mortality rates. The State Party should be requested to develop a population model with the currently available data to estimate the recovery of the elephant population, assuming poaching can be reduced drastically, and to finalize the DSOCR for the Committee's adoption. The indications that black rhino are still present in the property are encouraging, although the remaining numbers may be very low. It is urgent to collect more data to evaluate existing population size and viability, and to develop a strategy to ensure the survival of the species in the property.

Recent reports of legal hunting concessions being surrendered are noted. As trophy hunting has been generating much revenue for the property, it is critical that alternative sustainable sources of funding be identified to support anti-poaching and other conservation efforts.

It is of concern that the five-year action plan to protect the Selous-Niassa corridor is still not approved, lacks funding and has not yet been submitted to the World Heritage Centre. Urgent action is needed to secure this ecological corridor in light of the area's demographic growth and rapid development.

It is also recommended that the Committee urge the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre the revised ESIA for the Kidunda dam, including a model for the flooding regime, as well as the ESIA for the Kito-1 oil and gas prospection project in the Kilombero valley floodplain, including a study on its hydrological regime, impacts on groundwater resources, and an assessment of potential downstream impacts on the OUV, for review by IUCN before any decisions to move forward with these projects are taken.

While the Mkuju Uranium mining project is suspended, a comprehensive ESIA should be conducted if the design of the mining project is altered and In Situ Leaching technology is applied.

The efforts to include an area in the Mbarika Mountains into the property to fulfill the commitment made by the State Party when the boundary modification was approved are noted, but no information is provided on the ecological importance of this area and how it will enhance the property's OUV.

Finally, it is recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 42 COM 7A.56

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7A,*
2. *Recalling Decisions **36 COM 7B.5**, **36 COM 8B.43**, **40 COM 7**, **40 COM 7A.47** and **41 COM 7A.17**, adopted at its 36th (Saint-Petersburg, 2012), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and 41st (Krakow, 2017) sessions respectively,*
3. *Expresses its grave concern about the State Party's decision to develop the Stiegler's Gorge hydropower project, and in particular the tendering of logging rights for 143,638 ha within the property, considers that the resulting large-scale deforestation represents a clear potential danger to the property in accordance with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines, and decides to add this issue to the justification for the continued inclusion of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger;*
4. *Also recalling the Committee's position that the construction of dams with large reservoirs within the boundaries of World Heritage properties is incompatible with their World Heritage status, as well as the commitment made by the State Party when the boundary modification was approved in 2012 not to undertake any development activities within Selous Game Reserve and its buffer zone without prior approval of the World Heritage Committee, reiterates its requests to the State Party to fully assess the*

cumulative impacts of the Stiegler's Gorge hydropower project on the property and its wider landscape through a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA), undertaken to the highest international standards, and to consider alternative options to meet its power generation needs;

5. *Urges the State Party to ensure that the planned logging and all other activities related to the Stiegler's Gorge hydropower project, which will affect the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and will be difficult to reverse, do not proceed prior to the completion of the SEA and its review by IUCN, and requests the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to review the status of the project, assess the state of conservation of the property and to assist the State Party in finalizing the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR);*
6. *Welcomes the launch of the Selous Ecosystem Conservation and Development (SECAD) project, funded by the German Development Bank, and its contribution to the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan (EAP), and also urges the State Party to ensure that the EAP is fully carried out and to report on progress made;*
7. *Noting that the efforts to improve law enforcement in the property appear to have reduced poaching, also requests the State Party to provide details on the data collection and to confirm these positive trends through an aerial census of the elephant population;*
8. *Also noting the indications that black rhinos are still present in the property, further requests the State Party to collect more data to evaluate the size and viability of the population, and to develop a strategy to ensure the long-term survival of the species;*
9. *Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, details of the elephant demographic survey and its methodology, including information on the selection of the surveyed elephant groups, comparisons with other demographic studies and classification of males and females;*
10. *Requests moreover the State Party to finalize the Desired state of conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) based on currently available data on elephants and the advice provided by the 2017 mission, and to submit it the World Heritage Centre for the Committee's adoption;*
11. *Notes with concern that the five-year Action Plan to protect the Selous-Niassa corridor is still not approved, lacks funding and has not been submitted to the World Heritage Centre, and further urges the State Party to take action to secure this important ecological corridor, and continue to report on progress made;*
12. *Urges furthermore the State Party to submit as soon as possible to the World Heritage Centre the revised Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) for the Kidunda dam, including a model for the flooding regime, as well the ESIA for the Kito-1 oil and gas prospection project, including a study on the hydrological regime of the Kilombero floodplain and a specific assessment of potential downstream impacts on the OUV of the property;*
13. *Whilst noting the suspension of the Mkuju River Uranium Mining project, also reiterates its request to the State Party to conduct a full new ESIA and submit it to the World Heritage Centre if the design of the project is altered and In Situ Leaching technology (ISL) is applied;*

14. Requests moreover the State Party to submit the new General Management Plan of the property as soon as it is available, as well as detailed information on the ecological importance of the area in the Mbarika mountains, which is proposed to be included within the property, in accordance with Decision **36 COM 8B.43**;
15. Finally requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2019**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd session in 2019;
16. Also decides to retain Selous Game Reserve (United Republic of Tanzania) on the **List of World Heritage in Danger**.