

# Report on the 2020 ATP Outcome Review

## / Part 1

### Executive report

---

## Introduction

The monitoring and evaluation (M&E) plan of the 10th Medium-Term Strategy (MTS) mandates IIEP to evaluate systematically the outcomes of its training offers in all three offices, using the four-level Kirkpatrick model:

- Level 1: immediate results: relevance, trainee satisfaction;
- Level 2: learning and skills acquisition;
- Level 3: behavioural changes when back on the job; and
- Level 4: positive change at organizational level resulting at least partly from IIEP's training.

In 2020, IIEP conducted an Outcome Review of its Advanced Training Programme in Educational Planning and Management (ATP). The review focused on Kirkpatrick Levels 3 and 4. It collected quantitative data with a questionnaire, and qualitative data with individual interviews. The 'qualitative' component aimed to complement the results of the quantitative survey to ensure a better understanding of the quantitative results and deepen the knowledge on the outcomes of ATP programme at individual and organizational levels as well as to further investigate key areas on career development.

Also, as the Outcome review was launched in May 2020, i.e. in the midst of the Covid-19 crisis, the interviews became the opportunity to address the learning issues provoked by distance learning and crisis management, as well as the new learning needs revealed by the crisis.

The ATP Outcome Review focused on ATP alumni from four cohorts (2013/2014 to 2017/2018), as well as their supervisors (including heads of planning). Overall, 41 alumni (12 female, 29 male) and 12 supervisors (1 female, 11 male) from 29 countries participated in the quantitative component. In the qualitative component, 22 alumni (15 female, 7 male) and 16 supervisors (4 female, 12 male) from 15 countries participated.

# Key results

## Level 3

### Relevance in retrospect

More than 97% of the respondents agreed that the ATP was **fully relevant** to their professional practice today. Alumni specifically highlighted the bi-dimensional **impact of the training, at the individual and institutional level**. Supervisors confirmed these benefits, as alumni become a resource for the organization both at **national and sub-national levels**.

*« The course content is really relevant to education planning in our countries and policy making. » (Sri Lanka, female, supervisor)*

*« It is one of the main programme that the ministry as a whole is looking at to fill capacities within the ministry in terms of planning and policy analysis. Benefits are both individual and institutional. » (Vanuatu, male, alumni)*

*« Colleagues who graduate from the IIEP become a resource for the organization. » (Cambodge, male, combined<sup>1</sup>)*

*“The training helped us to improve the planning system in Cambodia, and the linkage from national to regional level. » (Cambodge, male, combined)*

Respondents specifically highlighted the added value of the ATP, as an international programme that promotes **peer learning**, providing operational tools and contributing to **capacity building** while conveying a **holistic understanding of educational challenges**.

*“The most important that we get from the IIEP is the way you can think and solve problems.” (Mozambique, male, combined)*

*“The extensive and diverse number of participants, professors, people with different background: the whole thing is an education opportunity (...). It gives you more understanding of the education overall” (Afghanistan, male, combined)*

*« The interactive aspect of the training is probably one of the most beneficial, because you get to see different perspectives and to understand different realities around education (...). That is the strength of the IIEP. » (Liberia, male, alumni)*

### Application (Impact on professional practices)

---

<sup>1</sup> There are three types of interviewees: 1) alumni (who enrolled in the ATP), 2) supervisors (of the alumni), 3) combined (alumni who became supervisors after training).

All supervisors agree that the ATP is effective in helping staff member(s) to perform their jobs better, especially in terms of technical and analytical skills, as well as soft skills. More than 95% of alumni apply the skills they acquired from the training into their daily work. Technical skills that they find the most useful are the **education sector diagnosis**, statistical analysis of data, identification of educational strategies and preparation and implementation of plans (all rated as “useful” by more than 85% respondents). Alumni find themselves more capable of identifying policy objectives and articulating planning processes; they are also more autonomous, efficient and confident in their work, as they develop an advanced personality as planner. Thanks to the ATP, their division/department can **emancipate from the need to recruit an external consultant** (for instance during ESP preparation).

*« The modules that are prepared are step-by-step taking a planner to become a specialised planner for education sector. (...) After coming to Paris, the whole programme is more of an education package than a module.»*  
(Afghanistan, male, alumni)

*« I see the improvement in management, autonomy, teamwork. All people who trained at the IIEP, (...) they have a personality developed, professionalism (...).»*  
(Sri Lanka, female, supervisor)

*“ I recall when I joined the ministry I didn’t have the necessary knowledge and skills to do the sector analysis and diagnosis and developing the sector plan, but after attending the programme at the IIEP, to be honest, I brought a lot in those areas, undertaking sector diagnosis and moving on to develop education sector plans.”* (Vanuatu, male, alumni)

*“I learned a lot of things to apply in my work. I remember at the time, we had a consultant who used to do many of the tasks here; we were completely blind (...) We don’t have another consultant, I have much more responsibility.”*  
(Mozambique, female, combined)

*« When I came back I was more confident to take certain issues I felt I was looking, especially with policy development and project management. »*  
(Seychelles, male, combined)

More than 87% frequently **share the ATP course resources and tools among their peers**. Most of the alumni have been encouraged by their hierarchy or took the initiative to share their knowledge with colleagues from their division, division from other departments, **both at national and regional levels**, as well as **partner institutions** (such as national training centers or international organizations and donors) — either in a **formal** (through training sessions, workshops, and technical meetings) or **informal way** (peer learning, learning on the job).

*“Lorsque je suis revenu, j’ai organisé une grande réunion où j’ai invité toutes les directions centrales, les cabinets, les parties prenantes (syndicats, ONG, les bailleurs de fond: Banque mondiale, Unicef) pour présenter ce que j’ai acquis à l’IIEP.”* (Côte d’Ivoire, male, alumni)

*« I have been able to use my skills from the training not only in my role for the ministry but also at local level as treasurer of St Patrick’s association and make projections.”* (Montserrat, female, alumni)

*« We organized several trainings with peers in the division and staff at the decentralized level. (...). (Liberia, male, alumni)*

In general, the alumni agree that the ATP has significant impact on both **individual and collective professional practices**, to implement qualitative change in the perception of planning challenges and take a new approach to planning with new working practices and processes. Since the end of the ATP, more than 87% alumni have frequently contributed to the preparation, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of education policy diagnosis analysis, whilst most of them **did not have the required knowledge to take responsibilities in planning before the training**.

*“There are improvements in the individual work but also collective work”  
(Afghanistan, male, supervisor)*

*“When I entered the ministry, we didn’t really understand what was monitoring, what was planning, but now almost every team has a monitoring plan. We have changed the culture in the ministry, thanks to the few people who were trained at the IIEP.” (Liberia, male, combined)*

*“For some divisions and sections within the department of education, there has been a turnaround on how they do things, how they conduct their day-to-day business. (...) Looking at performance monitoring and evaluation plans, we didn’t do that at all. Now we have taken a new approach. » (Seychelles, male, combined)*

## Level 4

### Impact on individual career

All alumni agree that the ATP has a significant impact on their career : it has led to an increase in **professional responsibilities** for 97% of them, and to a **promotion** for 89% — when promoted, alumni often become head of division, deputy director or director of planning, statistics, or M&E divisions.

*« When I came back, my portfolio increased with more responsibilities, other levels were given to me, I became a technical advisor to the minister.”  
(Liberia, male, alumni)*

*« The ministry of Education started to give me more responsibilities to coordinate the teams and issues of planning (...). I am sure my responsibilities improved thanks to the training. » (Mozambique, male, combined)*

*« Dès que j’ai fait la formation je suis devenu directeur de la programmation et de la prospective du ministère. J’ai pu avoir un poste plus stratégique, cela m’a permis d’apporter toute mon expérience en matière de planification stratégique, d’analyse des systèmes éducatifs, de voir les problèmes, défis et enjeux et les adresser. » (Bénin, male, Combined)*

*After coming back from the ATP, after some time, I was appointed head of the policy unit. I feel that the training gave me more potential to work in a more complex and more detailed environment (...) I was representing the ministry of education at the government level, working collaboration with ministries at those levels. » (Afghanistan, male, alumni)*

Alumni agree that the ATP training will have a long-term impact on their career, both as a **label** contributing to their professional advancement within national and international institutions, and as a support for their own **life-long learning** and personal advancement. Some also specifically highlight the positive impact to increase their **visibility** and opportunity on the international job market, beyond their ministry.

*« The training will have more impact in the future, I will never stop learning. (...) I believe the training has taught us to learn by ourselves » (Cambodge, male, combined)*

*« Cette formation est déjà bénéfique pour ma carrière. Je suis dans un processus de recrutement pour un projet de la Banque Mondiale. » (Sénégal, male, alumni)*

*« Bien sûr la formation va continuer de bénéficier ma carrière sur le long terme, (...) ces compétences ne doivent pas se dégrader mais se bonifier avec le temps (...), au-delà même de l'administration publique. » (Burkina Faso, male, alumni)*

*« Dès que je présente ma carte de visite de l'IPE, les gens n'hésitent pas à m'embaucher. Oui, c'est vraiment un label, c'est une porte d'entrée dans des instances de coopération. » (Niger, male, combined)*

For supervisors/HoPs, **promotion** in status and adequate **allocation** of ATP graduates is strategic to **disseminate knowledge** and capacity in planning divisions, both at national and regional level. Alumni often become a **resource** to train other planners across the country and in other ministries; they have a role of **advocacy** and representation of the planning policy of the ministry.

*“Après la formation, on avait le bagage minimal pour être plus impliqué dans l'élaboration des documents de politiques éducatives. On a été plus sollicités par d'autres services chaque fois qu'il y avait des besoins relatifs à la planification. Nous avons aussi travaillé avec d'autres ministères chaque fois qu'il y avait des besoins de planification plus globale, nationale, notamment dans les documents d'orientation du développement global du pays. » (Burundi, female, combined)*

*“I entrusted him to be a senior member of the SACMEQ committee. I sent him on overseas missions, representing the country, be it in policy management, statistics, SACMEC, etc.” (Seychelles, male, combined)*

*“Son accession à un poste est un effet de levier pour tirer les profits de sa formation.” (Burkina Faso, male, supervisor)*

## Impact on institutional performance

Both alumni and supervisor confirmed that ATP benefits at the individual level turns into benefits at the **structural** level : it highly contributes to improve the **performance** of the department and the **quality** of the planning documents. It can lead to a restructuration (or even creation) of the planning department or to the development of a new **culture** and vision of planning, for instance with the introduction of new **guidelines** and canevases, both at national and regional levels.

*“The ATP influenced two major policy decisions: 1) the institutionalization of school quality assessment framework, 2) the institutionalization of the school leadership programme. There is now an ongoing national training programme in those areas.*

*And another important point in terms of passing on the capacity: I came back from the IIEP with one vision, to replicate IIEP in Liberia.” (Liberia, male, alumni)*

*« La productivité des cadres a changé, on est passé à la vitesse supérieure et les partenaires sentent que nous avons le langage. Aujourd’hui, beaucoup de cadres de l’AFD ont travaillé à Niamey, on se comprend. Nous pensons que le PFA a apporté beaucoup de choses pour la fonctionnalité, pour la productivité, pour atteindre les résultats que nous nous sommes fixés. » (Niger, male, combined)*

*“D’année en année on se rend compte de la qualité des rapports, de l’innovation, de comment il présente les réformes pour que les acteurs puissent mieux les comprendre et apporter leur contribution. La culture de planification a pris.” (Bénin, male, Combined)*

*« I try to change the culture of planning; within the division it has changed with the help of my supervisor who also participated in the training at the IIEP. » (Vanuatu, male, alumni)*

The IIEP is a branded institution: beyond improving performance, supervisors highlight the importance of a critical mass joining the ATP to help increasing the credibility and visibility of the department’s work.

*« This training can bring more visibility and credibility not only to my department but to others as well. » (Afghanistan, male, alumni)*

*« IIEP has a very high reputation, if you study in the IIEP, people respect you. » (Mozambique, male, combined)*

## Key recommendations for improvement

The 2020 outcome review and its qualitative component has revealed heterogeneous context of participation, resources and support across countries. The interviews revealed that the ATP has an impact beyond individual level and institutional level in the department of planning of the alumni’s country. After coming back, alumni and supervisors can initiate a strategy to further transfer the knowledge and disseminate locally the expertise acquired in the ATP, at a larger scale in the country.

Participants highlighted the need to build on the ATP experience and to increase capacity development at central and regional levels, while there has been a lack of resources to send more staff for training in Paris and/or a lack of staff with sufficient ability to follow a training abroad in a foreign language.

Several strategies are developed at country level to respond to these needs, to develop training in the central department or in the region, in partnership with local institutions or foreign organizations.

Participants from diverse countries (including Liberia, Sri Lanka, Niger, and Burkina Faso in particular) highlighted the need to replicate training similar to the ATP at regional level, beyond central administration, to build planning capacities in provincial offices.

The qualitative component revealed several endogenous and exogenous obstacles to the valorisation of the impact of the ATP:

Obstacles (endogenous and exogenous)	Target	Recommendations suggested by the researcher based on the interviewees' feedback
1. <b>Political will and resistance to change:</b> supervisors do not support the work and innovations of returning participant.	Countries	Supervisors could systematically organize a debriefing after the IIEP training; have more sharing moments with the other colleagues (informal or formal training sessions, seminars, peer sharing, etc.)
	IIEP	Communicate on the added value for the overall education system to have a functioning planning department, advise the country on the need to nominate alumni at strategic position
2. <b>Challenge of finishing the final project:</b> difficulties to combine returning to the country and taking time to finish the project.	Countries	Adapt the workload for the time the alumni finish the project, possibly adapt it to match the subject of the final project to ensure cross-fertilization and the long-term impact of the final project. Alumni could also present their final project to colleagues to build institutional support.
	IIEP	Better support the alumni in finishing the project once back in the country (more iterations, feedback; Ensure the main part is done in Paris, before returning to the country; Extend the presential time to finish the project in Paris/change the format of the final project.
3. <b>Challenge of retaining alumni in the country:</b> generations of alumni are migrating to other countries and international organisations, loss of resources and capacities at the country level.	Countries	Develop incentives to retain alumni in the institution and in the country (nomination, salary, institutional recognition, peer training, etc).
	IIEP	Advise the country on the need to retain alumni in strategic positions at the ministry level or regional level, to build on the long-term benefits of the training.
4. <b>Lack of female participants</b>	Countries	Facilitate travelling and accommodation for women who wish to participate, encourage women to participate and visibility of the training for women officials, develop specific incentives for women (nomination, salary, institutional recognition, peer training, etc).
	IIEP	Assist countries to facilitate travelling and accommodation for women who wish to participate, encourage women to participate
5. <b>Language barrier:</b> hampers group work and peer learning. Some non-anglophone countries (francophone and others) highlight that it reduces the ability to learn and to send more people from their country.	Countries	Develop training modules in the administration prior to the training and mock language assessment to ensure sufficient level of the future alumni. This could benefit other officials and develop a long-term dynamic to consolidate English/French fluency within the service/department.
	IIEP	Ensure participants master a sufficient level of English/French prior to the selection; Offer language intensive workshops prior to the training; Diversify languages, provide training materials in other languages (including Portuguese).

6. <b>Heterogeneity in participants profile and professional experience (responsibility/seniority):</b> hinders the potential for peer learning and group work.	Countries	Communicate with the IIEP on the precise level of seniority and responsibility of the future alumni, clearly identify the training needs.
	IIEP	Communicate with the countries on the precise training needs/seniority/responsibility of the future alumni, ensure a sufficient level of experience and homogeneity in seniority among the promotion, and the ability to adapt to the general level of the group.
7. <b>Lack of valorisation of returning participants</b>	Countries	Develop institutional support, develop/create tools to share and build on the returning alumni's skills and knowledge (nomination to higher responsibility position, training modules, etc). Be open to new approaches to planning, etc.
	IIEP	Communicate to governments the importance to build on returning participants, and nominate alumni to strategic positions where they will be able to mobilize the acquired knowledge and diffuse it in the service/department/ministry/region, etc.
8. <b>Lack of financial resources</b>	Countries	Anticipate an allocation of budget to the training of high responsibility officials, young officials, etc. Better articulate training needs with budget allocation.
	IIEP	Facilitate pairing between countries and sponsors, reduce the fees of the programme.

#### Strategic recommendations

- Increase the outreach of the ATP : Both alumni and supervisor/HoP strongly request the quantitative development of the ATP to **reach out more ministry officials**. Opening the training to **more participants** appears as a crucial factor to heighten and accelerate the structural impact in the country. As the issue of costs needs to be addressed, some countries suggest **welcoming IIEP consultants in their country** (instead of moving a cohort to Paris), to provide **specialised courses on-site** in areas responding to identified needs, to a larger number of country officials. They also call for the development of **online modules**, which enables increased training at lower cost and wider scale.
- Improve the format and content of the ATP: The interviews revealed the need to adapt 1) the content of the ATP to **respond to the changing nature of planning** in face of new challenges; and 2) the format of the ATP in face of **new structural constraints** (including security constraints and limited ability to travel in times of the Covid-19), but also to **financial constraints** of the countries.

<b>Content of the course</b>	1. Increase practice-based learning
	2. Give increased priority to formative assessment rather than summative assessment
	3. Strengthen and enrich certain existing modules
	4. Update the curriculum and develop new modules (potentially online)
<b>Format of the course</b>	5. Enable more flexibility in the curriculum, with tailor-made and more areas of specialization
	6. Strengthen the mentoring of participants, from the online phase to the final project
	7. Extend the duration of the training, especially the time in residence
	8. Provide more online resources to take back in the country
	9. Organize more team-building and extra-curricular activities

- Strengthen the long-term impact of the ATP: New initiatives to be taken by the IIEP:



- To carry **analysis on planning capacity** of each country, to better understand their needs in training and draft **country-specific training strategies**;
  - To be more responsive and **support countries' initiatives** stemming from the ATP, for instance the creation of the NIEP in Afghanistan;
  - To support alumni who seek to pursue higher studies after the ATP and **increase the recognition of the certificate** to access PhD;
  - To engage more and **follow up with previous generations** of alumni: 1) to provide more advanced modules and 2) to update the missing competencies that were not part of the curriculum when they joined the ATP;
  - To have a more **assertive communication with the governments** to encourage them to 1) capitalize on alumni skills and advocate for the importance of planning expertise, and to 2) facilitate life-long learning and pursue further training for alumni.
- Strengthen alumni networks: The qualitative component revealed that alumni are very demanding of valorisation of the network of alumni, with more formal tools to keep exchanging on their issues and best practices. They suggest creating a **more formal mechanism to connect alumni at a larger scale**, feed an international network and/or dynamize the existing informal one; and **gather promotions** a few years after during interactive workshops, to share feedback on their country's experience.
  - Take stock of the countries' new expectations in times of Covid: Alumni and supervisors shared strategic visions on the impact of the Covid for the future of the ATP, to develop **tools and resources on school management in emergency, monitoring, quality assessment; guidelines and processes for education continuity and equity, local planning, new collaboration practices, data collection and communication, information system**; add to the ATP **modules on health crisis and learning continuity**, and develop a more comprehensive definition of "crisis"; create new and more flexible **online training modules: education in emergency, innovative learning and parental engagement, quality assessment, disaster cost reduction, resilience in the education sector**. Countries have high expectations to receive inputs and innovative planning and management strategies from the IIEP, especially regarding the issue of communication.
  - Better address the articulation of the ATP with the training in Dakar: Some alumni completed their training in Dakar after following the ATP, to acquire **more practical experience**. Also, while some countries can carry strategic planning with no external help, certain countries still are not autonomous to elaborate planning documents and **rely on IIEP's expertise, mostly from the Dakar office**. For some countries, training officials in Dakar is an alternative to Paris, due to the high cost of the ATP.

### *Conclusion*

As the 2020-2021 ATP cohort has been postponed, in the context of the Covid crisis, the coming year could be an opportunity to take distance on the ATP and take stock of the strategic recommendations that emerged. Within the IIEP and TEP department, a series of workshop/commissions could be launched to work on the following topics:

- **Content and format of the ATP**: Rethink and adjust the format and content of the ATP;
- **Strategy**: Lead a strategic reflection on better articulating the training offer of the IIEP, beyond the ATP, with countries' needs, and widen the outreach (in terms of cohorts and price);
- **Communication**: Develop tools to consolidate the network of alumni; improve/strengthen the communication around the programme.